



განათლების ხარისხის განვითარების ეროვნული ცენტრი
NATIONAL CENTER FOR EDUCATIONAL QUALITY ENHANCEMENT

Final Report on the LEPL – Teaching University - Batumi State Maritime Academy Authorization

Expert Panel Members

Chair: Janusz Uriasz, Maritime University of Szczecin, Poland

Members:

Ketevan Kotetishvili, Georgian Technical University

Gocha Tutberidze, European Teaching University

Nino Gorgoshadze, LELP Maritime Transport Agency, Labour Market Expert

Davit Tepnadze, Georgian Aviation University, Student Expert

Tbilisi
2018

Authorization Report Resume

The objective of this report is to present main findings after Authorisation evaluation of the LEPL – Teaching University - Batumi State Maritime Academy (BSMA). The evaluation of the quality of education at BMSA was carried out on the initiative of National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement (NCEQE) as part of the work schedule. For the second time, NCEQE carried out the Authorisation evaluation of the Batumi State Maritime Academy. The university was evaluated according to new standards and procedures for the first time.

General information on the educational institution

Batumi State Maritime Academy is a public Higher Educational Institution providing maritime education in the city of Batumi for more than nine decades. The Academy had different status in former years. In 2005 the academy acquired present legal form of legislation for higher education institutions - a legal entity of public law - Batumi State Maritime Academy (by the decree # 184 of the Government of Georgia from October 9, 2009, - Teaching University - Batumi State Maritime Academy) confirmed by following decree №228 of the Government of Georgia from June 25, 2012: Legal Entity of Public Law - Teaching University of the Ministry of Economy and Sustainable Development of Georgia - Batumi State Maritime Academy.

Nowadays Academy consists of two faculties: Faculty of Maritime Engineering and Faculty of Business and Management. It offers 9 undergraduate and 5 Graduate programs in which 2110 students are studying Academy provides graduates for maritime shipping delivering programs in accordance with STCW convention and from other programmes for maritime and local social and economic environment.

Brief overview of the authorization site visit

The site visit was prepared and carried out in accordance with the applicable procedure. The visit took place on 15-17 of May 2018 in accordance with the applicable procedure. The Visiting Team reviewed the self-assessment report provided by the Academy's authorities. The visit started with BSMA Management meeting. The subsequent visit took place in accordance with the agreed programme. During the visit, meetings were held with 1) Senate members; 2) Self-Evaluation and strategic Development team; 3) Quality Assurance Service and ISO Standard Assurance Service; 4) Legal and HR management department; 5) Deans of BSMA faculties; 6) Heads of the departments; 7) Heads of the programs; 8) Academic staff; 9) Invited teaching staff; 10) students; 11) Financial-economic department and Safety and internal regulation service; 12) Seafarers training and certification centre; 13) Employers and other relevant stakeholders and Alumni. In addition, selected diploma theses were reviewed, the didactic and social database used in the didactic process was reviewed. Finally, evaluation team reviewed material resources of the BSMA. During the close meeting the Chair of the Expert Members overviewed and briefly assessed the Authorization Standards for Higher Education Institutions and main comments and recommendations were presented. Evaluation revealed some recommendations or suggestions for each standard. BSMA keeps its traditions and at the same time tries to be in line with new requirements, however to respond the challenges BSMA needs to be more consistent in designing the strategic plan and financial or resource capability.

Overview of the HEI's compliance with standards

National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement carried out the Authorisation evaluation of the Batumi State Maritime Academy in accordance with the new seven

standards for the first time. Each standard was evaluated on virtue of established criteria using provided documentation and interviews with staff and stakeholders during the site-visit as evidences.

In general, the Authorization evaluation justified that BSMA is able to deliver intended programmes. BSMA is able to maintain proper culture of education, quality of education, has got enough resources in scope of academic staff, infrastructure, teaching aids. BSMA had prepared and provided all necessary documentation and procedures for expert members, staff were aware to the importance of Authorization and most of them were involved in the process of drafting the self-evaluation report. From the seven assessed standards three were assessed as "complies with requirements" and four as "substantially complies with requirements".

Summary of Recommendations

Visiting team acting on behalf of National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement formulated recommendations in area of general activity of Batumi State Maritime Academy. Academy is recommended to:

1. Standard 1:
 - a. Mission of the Academy shall be consistent with its size, offered programmes and real possibilities of action.
 - b. kept all internal stockholders informed about realization of strategic plan.
2. Standard 2:
 - a. divide academic and administrative functions into the organizational structure that would improve the effectiveness of academic, scientific and administrative decisions,
 - b. speed up the elaboration of a comprehensive document on risk management, which would become the basis for the establishment of an effective risk management system,
 - c. ensure that quality assurance service should pay more attention to the evaluation and support mechanisms of the research component.
3. Standard 3:
 - a. involve more students in development of programs and to consider their interests in English language learning.
 - b. develop and an established procedure for practical components of maritime programs which could ensure the development of the necessary skills,
 - c. deepen the work on carrying out educational programs in English or at least chosen or elective subjects,
4. Standard 4:
 - a. electively implement the regulation regarding invited teaching personnel evaluation,
 - b. electively implement the staff evaluation follow-up and analyze system and the feedback reporting procedures to managers.
 - c. use more systematic approach to the planning of the personnel training.
 - d. elaborate the specific rule for evaluation of activities of Head of the programs. Head of the Faculty Quality Assurance, administrative and support personnel.
 - e. review and amend the Rule "Defining workload and reimbursement of Academic personnel and invited teachers" and establish the clear number of students' academic group that is one of the main component for defining the workload,
 - f. review and amend the Rule on "Methodology to define the number of Academic Staff" and define more specific and exact benchmarks for calculation the required number of Academic Personnel based on different type of established ratio,
 - g. elaborate and implement a motivating system for Academic Staff for their encouragement especially in research activities,

- h. elaborate and implement the policy for attraction new young generation in educational and research processes.
- 5. Standard 5:
 - a. prepare a questioner which would be used for research to get more precise picture of employment ratio of their graduates and this department shall have contact with their graduates and asking for feedback shall be an obligation from BSMA, not optional.
- 6. Standard 6:
 - a. develop a strategy to assist MA program students in learning, as they are active seafarers and require individual programs,
 - b. develop a strategy that would be able to engage academic and invited staff research projects in order to reflect effectively on master's papers.
- 7. Standard 7:
 - a. Library Personal should give more information international online libraries and rules how to use them to the students and academy staff and before that it will be better if all library staff will be trained in this field,
 - b. the academic budget should be prioritized to academic and research activities as research activities give bases for BSMA development.

Summary of Suggestions

Visiting team formulated suggestions for Batumi State Maritime Academy aiming for its improvement. Academy is suggested to:

- 1. Standard 1:
 - a. keep all internal stockholders informed about realization of strategic plan,
 - b. ensure that strategic plan is consistent with the mission of the Academy,
 - c. ensure mission published in all documents and versions of language doesn't differ,
 - d. improve policy of planning and reviewing the plans order to maintain the consistency in former and future plans and activities,
 - e. mechanism and policy of planning and reviewing the plans shall be improved in order to maintain the consistency in former and future plans and activities. Academy could benefit from proper SWOT analysis,
 - f. reasons for suspension of students shall be the subject of reflection because its high number could negatively affect the sustainable development of Academy.
- 2. Standard 3:
 - a. consider specifying the titles of the programs and syllabuses both in Georgian, and in English languages.
- 3. Standard 5:
 - a. keep students well informed about education process their obligations, duties, responsibilities, role and rights.
- 4. Standard 7:
 - a. increase number of professional books available in Georgian language.

Summary of the best practices

Visiting team underline the good practice of using physical infrastructure like training ship, simulators, workshops in delivery of learning outcomes what is an example of meeting recommendations and standards established by international organizations – in this case an International Maritime Organization.

Summary table

| | Standard | Complies with requirements | Substantially complies with requirements | Partially complies with requirements | Does not Comply with requirements |
|------|--|-------------------------------------|--|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 1. | Mission and strategic development of HEI | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 1.1 | Mission of HEI | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 1.2 | Strategic development | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 2. | Organizational structure and management of HEI | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 2.1 | Organizational structure and management | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 2.2 | Internal quality assurance mechanisms | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 2.3 | Observing principles of ethics and integrity | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 3. | Educational Programmes | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 3.1 | Design and development of educational programmes | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 3.2 | Structure and content of educational programmes | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 3.3 | Assessment of learning outcomes | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 4 | Staff of the HEI | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 4.1. | Staff management | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 4.2. | Academic/Scientific and invited Staff workload | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 5 | Students and their support services | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 5.1. | The Rule for obtaining and changing student status, the recognition of education, and student rights | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 5.2 | Student support services | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 6 | Research, development and/or other creative work | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 6.1. | Research activities | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 6.2. | Research support and internationalization | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 6.3. | Evaluation of research activities | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 7 | Material, information and financial resources | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 7.1 | Material resources | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 7.2. | Library resources | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 7.3 | Information resources | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 7.4 | Financial resources | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

Janusz Uriasz (chair)

Ketevan Kotetishvili (member)

Gocha Tutberidze (member)

Nino Gorgoshadze (member)

Davit Tepnadze (member)

Janusz Uriasz
Gocha Tutberidze
Nino Gorgoshadze
Davit Tepnadze

Compliance of the Authorization Applicant HEI with the Authorization Standard Components

1. Mission and strategic development of HEI

Mission statement of a HEI defines its role and place within higher education area and broader society. Directions for strategic development of HEI corresponds with the mission of an institution, are based on the goals of the institution and describe means for achieving these goals.

| |
|---|
| 1.1 Mission of HEI |
| Mission Statement of the HEI corresponds to Georgia's and European higher education goals, defines its role and place within higher education area and society, both locally and internationally. |
| <p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>Batumi State Maritime Academy assumed its mission. Main aims of the mission are clearly specified. Mission defines the main characteristics of BSMA in the area of Education, Georgian Marine Economy. It is focused on supporting development of Georgian maritime economy, preparation of the highly-qualified staff and leaders for Maritime industry and adjacent fields, providing educational and training programmes, developing principles of freedom in teaching, learning and researches by establishing and sustaining national and international communication with maritime organizations and bodies.</p> <p>The mission is published, internal and external stakeholders are aware of the BSMA mission. It was created with their support. Mission corresponds to Georgian Higher Education goals. Academy recognizes its essential role for Georgian and regional economic environment. It meets market expectations. However some goals specified in the mission are not realistic. The first aim specified in the mission as supporting integration of the maritime economy of Georgia in European Economic space and formation of Georgia as a leading maritime country seems to be not adjusted to Academy size and real possibility of action. Internationalization is on low level, teachers are rather focused on basic didactic duties and professional maritime practice then on researches, their didactic workload is high, infrastructure and financial resources are restricted. The Academy doesn't possess enough capabilities to support to make Georgia a leading maritime country. The mission should be assumed and shared in such way that all stockholders, whole community of the Academy by the contribution could make its realistic, not artificial goals achievable. The evaluation team noted also dissimilarities in the mission in different language versions, in hard copies and published on website.</p> |
| <p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Mission is available on BSMA webpage http://www.bsma.edu.ge/main/page/2-5/index.html. 2. Interview with BSMA Management, Senate members and Self-Evaluation and strategic Development team. |
| <p>Recommendations:</p> <p>Mission of the Academy shall be consistent with its size, offered programmes and real possibilities of action.</p> |
| <p>Suggestions:</p> <p>Mission published in all documents and versions of language should not differ.</p> |
| Best Practices (if applicable): |
| <p>Evaluation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements |

1.2 Strategic Development

- HEI has a strategic development (7-year) and an action plans (3-year) in place.
- HEI contributes to the social development of the country, shares with the society the knowledge gathered in the institution, and facilitates lifelong learning
- HEI evaluates implementation of strategic and action plans, and duly acts on evaluation results.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

Batumi State Maritime Academy assumed its strategic development plan. Strategic Development Plan was elaborated based on the Georgian Legislation, Statute of BSMA, "Methodology for Drafting of Strategic Plan" of Internal Normative Document and other normative documents. Development plan was assumed for the period of 2018-2024 and was approved by Senate of BSMA on 14 of March 2018. Strategic Development Plan was built upon the priorities, which provides foundation for learning, academic achievement and employment of the students and listeners of BSMA.

The evaluation team advises that the strategic development plan and corresponding acts/documents shall be consistent with the previous one or reflection on amendments shall be presented/justified. Considering details, the vision of the Batumi State Maritime Academy was changed from (former) transforming the Academy into International High Educational Institution to (nowadays) leading educational center of the Black and Caspian Sea Region. It was done in 2018 and this amendment was made without reflection.

The assumed activities in the strategic plan of BSMA contribute not only to the development of Academy but also to the Region and Georgia. The BSMA contribution to the development of the society is acknowledged. It is archived by delivery graduates for maritime industry, bringing high level professional academic staff securing innovative educational services, internationalization of education concepts, sharing its knowledge, experience and competencies.

Recalling the Mission of the BSMA, one of the main aim is to support forming Georgia as a leading maritime country. Strategic development plan shall correspond to the mission and fulfill mentioned goal. Comparing both documents, the consistency of strategic development plan and mission has been found questionable because recalled goal seems to be too ambitious for real possibility of BSMA action.

It is positive that BSMA assumed strategic goals (13) which allow the comprehensive evaluation of implementation of strategic and action plans. For every goal several objectives were defined. Development plan is supported by financial plan – a three years action plan. Action plan has got clear and well-defined objectives and budget.

The process of realization of strategic development plan has been set up. NCEQE visiting team advises that all internal stakeholders shall be aware of the details of the strategic development plan and amendments, their role in the plan, tasks they should undertake and possible impact on them. During the visit the evaluation team met representatives of internal stakeholders. It occurred that not all of them were aware of strategic plan. For instance some assumed factors related to ratio between academic staff and administration personnel planned to be achieved need immediate actions in order to be accomplished according to plan. These (planned) actions should be shared including their impact on personnel to avoid misunderstanding or internal resistance. It shall help the achievement of planned goals. The realization of strategic plan could strengthen the role of internal stockholders. For instance the Plan should take into account reduction of passible future threatens to the Academy. Visiting team noted occurrence of students suspension which due to some reason is considered as specific but normal situation. The figure of about 40% of suspended students seems to be too high for sustainable development of Academy.

The process of realization of strategic development plan is supported by timetable where deadlines of achievements of particular goals and planned spending are specified. SWOT analysis was elaborated which shall help the successful accomplishment of development plan. This creates a coherent approach. However, presented analysis of strengths, weakness, opportunities and threats consists from list of facts. It should be rather assessed and presented the possible achievements, utilization of those (positive) facts or the way

of avoiding, prevention (negative) facts. Therefore it seems that the methodology of planning the strategy shall be amended.

Evidences/indicators

1. Interview with BSMA Management, Senate members and Self-Evaluation and strategic Development team.
2. Strategic development plan is available on BSMA web page: <http://www.bsma.edu.ge/main/page/2-7/index.html>.

Recommendations:

Suggestions:

1. Keep all internal stockholders informed about realization of strategic plan.
2. Ensure that strategic plan is consistent with the mission of the Academy.
3. Mechanism and policy of planning and reviewing the plans shall be improved in order to maintain the consistency in former and future plans and activities. Academy could benefit from proper SWOT analysis.
4. Reasons for suspension of students shall be the subject of reflection because its high number could negatively affect the sustainable development of Academy.

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

- ☒ Complies with requirements
- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

2. Organizational Structure and Management of HEI

Organizational structure and management of the HEI is based on best practices of the educational sector, meaning effective use of management and quality assurance mechanisms in the management process. This approach ensures implementation of strategic plan, integration of quality assurance function into management process, and promotes principles of integrity and ethics

2.1 Organizational structure and management

- Organizational structure of HEI ensures implementation of goals and activities described in its strategic plan
- Procedures for election/appointment of the management bodies of HEI are transparent, equitable, and in line with legislation
- HEI's Leadership/Management body ensures effective management of the activities of the institution
- Considering the mission and goals of HEI, leadership of the HEI supports international cooperation of the institution and the process of internationalization.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The structure of the Batumi State Maritime Academy basically provides for the academy's goals and strategic development plans. Academic managers are: academy rector, senate, academy quality assurance service. The Rector is also the chairman of the Senate. Rector's position in the Academy is not elective. He is appointed and dismissed by the Minister of Economy and Sustainable Development of Georgia. The Senate is a collegial representative and management body composed of the Rector, Rector Deputies, except First Deputy Heads, Heads of Primary Education Units, Head of Quality Assurance Office, Student Self-Government Representative and two representatives of Faculty Councils. The faculty councils are elected by the faculty councils in the Senate for 1 (one) year.

In order to improve the management efficiency of the Academy, the organizational structure of the Academy was renewed, new structural units were created. Accordingly, the provisions of the new structural units (services / departments) have been developed.

Under the new structure, the competences were distinguished and duplicated functions were eliminated.

The Senate's functions include the administrative and academic activities of the charter. Members of the Senate are administrative officials. Consequently, the existing structure does not allow the administrative functions to be distinguished from academic functions. During the interview, the academy management explained that the academy is dual subordinate, it is accountable to the Legal Entity of Public Law - Maritime Transport Agency. The procedures for selection / appointment in the management bodies of Batumi State Maritime Academy have been approved and are transparent and are consistent with the regulations and acting legislation of the Academy.

The Batumi State Maritime Academy operates a dual approach to quality assurance with one department in charge of "academic quality assurance" and one unit in charge of administrative systems and processes. With the purpose of identifying if the activity of the Maritime Academy complies with ISO 9001:2015 standards, on April 21, 2017 a certification audit was conducted. On May 25, 2015 the Maritime Academy was awarded a Certificate of Compliance with the ISO 9001:2015 system by a decision No. 16.0345.0216.

The Academy uses modern technologies in management, including the electronic system. The Academy also has a continuity plan for business processes. The Academy started work towards a full risk management system, but this is not fully implemented. This work should be speeded up.

The Academy recognizes the international/global reach of Maritime and related industries and sectors and that it should be internationally focused skills, knowledge and competencies of an international nature in order to achieve the best possible student outcomes. This is reflected in institutional commitment to: Increase opportunities for students and staff to benefit from an international dimension to education; Develop partnership (along with applied research) with comparable international institutions; Strengthen partnership with leading international institutions and businesses; Increase number of international students. The Academy will promote opportunities for students to participate in international exchanges, study abroad, learn a language and benefit from international experience.

Evidences/indicators

1. Structure of BSMA <http://bsma.edu.ge/main/page/2-40/index.html>;
2. Charter of BSMA http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/wesdeba_.pdf;
3. Strategic Development Plan
http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/ganvitarebis_strategiuli_gegma2018.pdf
4. Interview with BSMA Management, Senate members and Self-Evaluation and strategic Development team

Recommendations:

1. In order to increase the effectiveness of the management, the academy shall divide academic and administrative functions into the organizational structure that would improve the effectiveness of academic, scientific and administrative decisions.
2. The Academy should speed up the elaboration of a comprehensive document on risk management, which would become the basis for the establishment of an effective risk management system.

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

- ☐ Complies with requirements
- ☒ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

2.2 Internal quality assurance mechanisms

- Institution effectively implements internal quality assurance mechanisms. Leadership of the institution constantly works to strengthen quality assurance function and promotes establishment of quality culture in the institution.
- HEI has a mechanism for planning student body, which will give each student an opportunity to get a high quality education.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The Quality Assurance Service is responsible for the effective operation of quality assurance mechanisms and system development. At the same time, the academy as a maritime education institution shall be subject to certification of quality management by taking into consideration the requirements of the Conventions adopted under the auspices of the International Maritime Organization. The ISO 9001 standard has been introduced since 2001 to facilitate the satisfaction of this request. Considering the specificity of the ISO 9001 standard, the ISO standard is responsible for updating the system and maintaining its efficiency. The coordinated work of the Quality Assurance and ISO standard assurance services of the Academy creates a precondition for sustainable development of the academy through the management system PCDA.

Quality Assurance develops educational, training, academic staff assessment methodology, monitoring, develop evaluation indicators, criteria, tools, suggestions and recommendations that facilitate the process of planning, monitoring and evaluation of interim and final analysis, learning And a learning process for monitoring and analysis, development.

The purpose of the ISO standard assurance service in the Academy is to support the implementation of ISO 9001: 2015 standard and improve management quality accordingly.

The main educational institutions - the Faculty have quality assurance services.

The academy is involved in international programs that promote the international experience of the quality system and establish international practices in the academy.

Quality Assurance Service conducts various surveys based on pre-designed and approved questionnaires. The survey forms include areas such as educational programs, satisfaction of learning outcomes, management processes, infrastructure, academic staff, material base, etc. Taking into account the monitoring results, the administration is trying to develop negative evaluated segments.

Until 2017, the Academy did not have the method of planning a student contingent.

The Academy has developed tools for evaluation and improvement of educational programs that are actively engaged in the implementation of academic / invited personnel and students as well as external stakeholders (employers, alumni).

The Quality Assurance Service is more oriented towards the educational component and less attention is paid to the assessment and development of the research component. The Quality Department of the Academy now starts monitoring the research activities of the university academic personnel, as well as the methodology for determining student contingency in the academy. Therefore, it is difficult to evaluate the effectiveness of these mechanisms at the present stage. The gaps in the old assessment system are largely complemented by the new conditions of regulation, such as elaboration of the Action Plan for the academic year and the self-assessment at the end of the academic year. The latter shall be subject to examination and assessment by the authorized commission by the criteria set out in advance. In the rule for determining student contingent particular place is provided to criteria for determination student quota: Specifics of the educational

programs, content, human resources, infrastructure, mobility dynamics, international experience, etc. that makes impact at the educational service quality.

In the Academy beside the formal mechanisms assuring quality, use of informal elements of good practice is also common. In order to evaluation educational work, the Academy regularly invites specialists and experts of various fields, organizes monitoring/audit the results of which are used to analyze current situation and to determine the direction for development.

Evidences/indicators

1. Structural Units Provision;
2018 Decision of the Senate N 5/6 from April 4, „On approval of the Study/Academic Department provision“;
2. Quality Procedures:
 - Decision of the Senate №3/2 from February 27, 2018 "On approval of the Policy in the Quality field of the Batumi State Maritime Academy";
<http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Quality%20Policy%202018%20Geo.PDF>
 - Decision of the Senate №3/2 from February 27, 2018 "Goals and responsibilities in the Quality field of the Batumi State Maritime Academy";
<http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Quality%20Objectives%202018%20Geo.PDF>
 - „Decision of the Senate №3/2 from February 27, 2018 "On approval of the Quality Guidelines of the Batumi State Maritime Academy";
<http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Quality%20Manual%20-%202018.pdf>
 - Risk management procedure, February 8, 2017;
<http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/risk%20management%20O.pdf>
3. Interview with BSMA Management, Senate members and Self-Evaluation and strategic Development team

Recommendations:

The quality assurance service should pay more attention to the evaluation and support mechanisms of the research component.

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

- ☐ Complies with requirements
- ☒ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

2.3. Observing principles of ethics and integrity

- HEI has developed regulations and mechanisms that follow principles of ethics and integrity. Such regulations are publicly accessible.
- Institution has implemented mechanisms for detecting plagiarism and its prevention.
- HEI follows the principles of academic freedom.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

Personnel activities in the Maritime Academy are regulated by the Charter, Internal Regulations, Personnel Management Policy, Ethics Code and Disciplinary Responsibility Regulations. The presented regulations define the rules of adequate behavior for the staff and students' educational institutions, to facilitate the academy's activities and effective management of the learning process.

In regulations, disciplinary liability regulations and the Code of Ethics are the mechanisms for plagiarism, response and responsibilities. At this stage the academy does not use an antiplaggi electronic program, although the National Science Library concludes a

Memorandum of Understanding, which envisages integrating the Academic Fraud Electronic Program in the nearest future. On April 4, 2018, the Senate adopted the Plagiarism Prevention and Response Rules, which summarized the existing practice. In particular, all the conditions were made in the form of established practice. The rule established by the Senate includes responsibilities of the responsible person to conduct information campaign on plagiarism, identify cases, react and analyze results. The rule envisages a significant measure of elderly plagiarism, indicating the outcome of a student's or academic personnel plagiarized. The person responsible for the prevention, detection and response of plagiarism is the Deputy Rector.

This year the Academy has developed approaches to respect, realization and development of academic freedom principles. The principles of academic freedom and the basic conditions for its protection were envisaged in the internal regulation. Information about the Code of Ethics, Ethics Code and Disciplinary Responsibility is publicly available at the Academy website: <http://bsma.edu.ge/>

Evidences/indicators

1. 2018 Decision of the Senate 3/4 from February 27 on approval of the Internal Regulations (House rules). <http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/O02.pdf>
2. 2018 Decision of the Senate 1/3 from January 22 on approval of the Code of Ethics. <http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Ethics.pdf>
3. 2018 Decision of the Senate 1/3 from January 22 on approval of "Provision on Disciplinary Responsibility". http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/disciplinuri_warmoebis_wesi.pdf
4. Protocols of the Commission meetings and order of the Rector on imposing disciplinary responsibility).
5. 2018 Decision of the Senate 5/8 from April 4 on approval of "the Rule of Plagiarism prevention and regulation".
6. 2018 Decision of the Senate 3/3 from February 27 on approval of the study process procedure, Graduate level of study. http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/samagistro_swavlebis_safexuri_2018.pdf
7. 2018 Decision by the Senate N 3/5 from February 2018, on Approval of the rule of the Department of Security and Internal Regulations Control.
8. 2018 Decision of the Senate N 5/5 from April 4 on approval of the Maritime Engineering Faculty Provision.
9. 2018 Decision of the Senate N 1/2 from January 22 on approval of the Business and Management Faculty Provision.
10. Terms of Reference of Deputy Dean, Officer-coordinator and HR and Internal Control Manager.
11. The Order of the Minister of Economy and Sustainable Development of Georgia №1-1/1439 from July 10, 2012 "The Statute of the Batumi State Maritime Academy". <http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/wesdeba .pdf>

Recommendations:

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

- ☒ Complies with requirements
- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

3. Educational Programmes

HEI has procedures for planning, designing, approving, developing and annulling educational programmes. Programmed learning outcomes are clearly defined and are in line with the

National Qualifications Framework. A programme ensures achievement of its objectives and intended learning outcomes

3.1 Design and development of educational programmes

HEI has a policy for planning, designing, implementing and developing educational programmes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

During the visit, the authorization expert's group checked Batumi State Maritime Academy program development and the learning outcomes of the various stakeholders within the taking part. Conducted interviews during the visit and a variety of study results proved that the program is developed by a head of the program where academic staff, employers, students and the Academy alumni is involved. Academy pays great attention on cooperation with potential employers.

During the visit, the authorization expert's group have met with students, alumni and employers. Academy use their surveys for evaluating, planning and developing programs. (<http://graduate.bsma.edu.ge/>, <http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Alumni.pdf>). As can be seen in surveys they need more practice, more English courses, more new modern programs.

Meeting of evaluation team with representative of those groups confirmed their understanding of Academy mission. They are involved in Academy daily life. It seems that all parties are satisfied with the cooperation.

Academy has procedures for planning, designing, approving, developing and annulling educational programs. The program learning outcomes are clearly defined and are in line with the National Qualifications Framework. A program ensures achievement of its objectives and intended learning outcomes.

According to the faculty, currently regulated and unregulated educational programs exist. The Maritime Engineering Faculty has 4 undergraduate (including three regulated: Maritime Navigation, The ship Mechanics and the ship Electro-mechanics) and 2 graduate educational programs. There are 5 undergraduate, 3 graduate educational programs at the faculty of Business and Management and one-year educational program for preparation in Georgian language.

In cases of amending/annulling of programs, students have opportunity smoothly complete an educational program.

Academy follows a consistent approach with regards to the planning, design and development of educational programmes. Learning outcomes are stated and used. However, the focus in lectures and courses varies, with some teaching staff placing greater importance on knowledge than on skills and competences, during assessments.

Evidences/indicators

1. Approved on November 2, 2016 "Undergraduate Educational program structure and rule for development";
2. Approved on November 2, 2016 "Graduate Educational program structure and rule for development";
3. Decision of the Senate № 14/2 from December 8, 2017 on „The rule on planning, elaborating and developing educational programs “;
4. Analysis of graduates' survey; Results of employers' survey analysis; Results of students' survey analysis; Monitoring of students' achievements:
 - <http://graduate.bsma.edu.ge/>
 - <http://employer.bsma.edu.ge/graduate.php>
 - <http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Alumni.pdf>
 - <http://employer.bsma.edu.ge/>
 - <http://employer.bsma.edu.ge/employer.php>
 - <http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Employers.pdf>
 - <http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Academic%20Staff.pdf>
 - <http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Administrative%20Staff.pdf>
 - <http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Students.pdf>
 - <http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Lecturers.pdf>
 - <http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Library-students.pdf>

| |
|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Material%20resources.pdf – http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/2015-2018%20Statistics-%20Business.pdf – http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/2015-2018%20Statistics%20MF.pdf – http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Abroad.pdf – http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Master%20survey.pdf |
| <p>Recommendations:</p> <p>Involve more students in the development of programs and to consider their interests in English language learning.</p> |
| <p>Suggestions:</p> |
| <p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p> |
| <p>Evaluation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements |
| <p>3.2 Structure and content of educational programmes</p> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Programme learning outcomes are clearly stated and are in line with higher education level and qualification to be granted ○ With the help of individualized education programmes, HEI takes into consideration various requirements, needs and academic readiness of students, and ensures their unhindered involvement into the educational process. |
| <p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>Learning outcomes of regulated educational programs are established based on Field specifications approved by the Order of the Director of LEPL National Center for Education Quality Enhancement №371 from June 13, 2017 that are derived from the standards of the International Convention (STCW) 1978, On training, certification and watch-keeping for seafarers. The relevant amendments to the educational programs were made by the Decision of the Senate 12/6 from November 21, 2017. Consequently, learning outcomes of regulated undergraduate educational programs are in full compliance with the qualification framework and field specifications.</p> <p>According to the Rule above, credit volume of undergraduate programs cannot be less than 240 (ECTS) and of graduate programs less than 120 (ECTS) (including research component volume of which cannot be less than 25%).</p> <p>For this to work, it is necessary that teaching staff have the right skills to use innovative teaching, learning and assessment methods. During the audit it became clear that there are variations in the teaching staff's capacity to do this.</p> <p>Academy has 10 foreign students (from Turkey), but the academy has not programs in English language and these students are studying in Georgian language. Academy representatives say, that these students are speaking in Georgian language. Looking for coherence with the mission, the Academy should deepen the work on elaboration of programs available in English language. At least some subject (elective) should be available for students in English language.</p> <p>Maritime programs contain the practical components which should be conducted on board the vessel as an approved seagoing service. The mandatory practice that is a part of an educational program contains 30 ECTS (equal to 6 months of seagoing service) and is carried out on board Academy's training vessel. However, there was not evidenced that the practice is conducted in accordance with a structured and planned syllabi where the achievable learning outcomes and the evaluation methods of it should be stipulated. There are not also the procedures as a guideline for another part of practice that is necessary for certification purposes.</p> |

Depending on the need, the student is entitled to request the individual program, but no student practiced this right throughout the year.

Interested person can get acquainted with the basic information about educational programs of the Academy by web page.

The academy shall change the structure of its programme. For example, the master's programme "Ship Power and Electric systems & Plants" has elective block in 1st semester, where one course "High voltage electrical appliances" is compulsory, and the second course "Technical thermodynamics" is elective, which are the precondition of the subjects for second and third semester: "Theory and analysis of ship turbomachines", "Internal combustion heat processes and their report" and "The theory of steam generators and heat calculation". Therefore, if a student selects a course "High voltage electrical appliances" he/she will not be able to select these three subjects.

Interested person can get acquainted with the basic information about educational programs of the Academy by web page <http://www.bsma.edu.ge>. Information about the programme shall be more comprehensive and more accessible for future students for their better analysis and understanding the competencies and skills that they could obtain because of studying the program/subject. It would help them to choose the right program.

Evidences/indicators

1. Decree №121/N of the Minister of Education and Science of Georgia of 5 December 2007 on Approval of Rules for Calculation of Vocational Education Program Credits;
2. Decision of the Senate № 14/2 from December 8, 2017 on „The rule on planning, elaborating and developing educational programs “;
3. <http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/F-O9.pdf>
4. Study process procedure of September 20, 2016. Undergraduate study level;
5. Study process procedure of September 20, 2016. Graduate study level;
6. Order of the Director of the National Center for Education Quality Enhancement №371 from June 13, 2017 on approval of field Specifications for Maritime Navigation, Maritime Electro-engineering and Maritime Engineering;
7. Decision of the Senate № 7/1 from July 18, 2017 "On approval of study Calendar of the Academy for 2017-2018;
8. http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/2017-2018%20Learning_Year_Calendar.modificirebuli.pdf
9. Educational program, syllabi;
10. Catalogue of educational programs;
 - http://bsma.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_90_1.pdf
 - http://bsma.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_91_1.pdf
 - http://bsma.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_92_1.pdf
 - http://bsma.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_94_1.pdf
 - http://bsma.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_98_1.pdf
 - http://bsma.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_97_1.pdf
 - http://bsma.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_1140_1.pdf
 - http://bsma.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_96_1.pdf
 - http://bsma.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_95_1.pdf
 - http://bsma.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_908_1.pdf
 - http://bsma.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_1042_1.pdf
 - http://bsma.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_101_1.pdf
 - http://bsma.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_102_1.pdf
 - http://bsma.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_1200_1.pdf
 - http://bsma.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_1081_1.pdf;
11. Information booklets <http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/AKADEMIA%20BROSHURA.pdf>
12. Decision of the Senate № 12/6 from November 21, 2017 "On clarification of qualifications to be awarded on several educational programs of the Academy and ensuring their compliance with Qualifications Framework and field Specifications";

Recommendations:

1. Academy needs a systematic and an established procedure for practical components of maritime programs which could ensure the development of the necessary skills.

| |
|--|
| 2. Academy should deepen the work on carrying out educational programs in English or chosen subjects. 3. Academy should consider specifying the titles of the programs and syllabuses both in Georgian, and in English languages. |
| Suggestions: |
| Best Practices (if applicable): |
| Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements |
| 3.3 Assessment of learning outcomes |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ HEI has law-compliant, transparent and fair system of learning outcomes assessment, which promotes the improvement of students' academic performance. |
| Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements <p>The system of evaluation of study outcomes in the Academy is reflected in Rules of "Planning, elaborating and development educational programs", "Examination and evaluation procedures", "Study process procedures, Undergraduate study level", "Study process procedures, Graduate study level". The presented procedures are regularly updated, for what the results of study process monitoring, students and academic personnel surveys are used. The results of academic achievements analysis are also influencing by the development of the assessment system.</p> <p>The evaluation system by its structure consists from two parts - students current (including 3 five week midterm 15+25+20) and final exam (40 points). The sum of which is the final evaluation of the student's academic component and based Georgian legislation.</p> <p>Despite of requirements of the learning outcome evaluation system framework, in the syllabus the author/implemented person is free to define field specificity, adequate forms, components and methods. This is supported by basic elements of evaluation frame system. In particular, student's five-week evaluation scheme, electronic mechanism of summarizing, conducting final exam in mainly written and centralized form, and an anonymous assessment procedure.</p> <p>If students don't agree to assessment, dissatisfied students spontaneously apply to the Dean, which operates based on established practice and general legislation.</p> <p>Academy has electronic service such as an electronic journal. In it an information on study components, its content, objectives, methods, evaluation rules (through syllabi), implementing academic personnel, surveys and other important for the study process factors. Students can access to the system. It is accessed individually via personal data and a password. This system allow student to receive information on time and to respond accordingly (appeal, to apply for consulting to competent person, etc.).</p> <p>Academy has students surveys (http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Students.pdf) and students have feedback about their needs (information about grades, about library, internet, students self-government.).</p> <p>Students undergo practical studies under supervision, which guarantees that they absorb as many skills and information in the process as possible. They must fulfill practice logbook with tasks confirmed by senior officers/supervisors. Confirmation is granted only if task is executed properly or ability to perform specific task demonstrated.</p> |
| Evidences/indicators <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Decision of the Senate № 14/2 from December 8, 2017 on „The rule on planning, elaborating and developing educational programs“ ; |

| |
|---|
| <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. Decision of the Senate № 2/1 from February 8, 2017 „On examination and evaluation procedure”; http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/F-O9.pdf 3. http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/daskvniti_gamocdebis_chatarebis_procedura.pdf 4. Decision of the Senate № 11/3 from September 20, 2016 „The rule for determining a program compatibility and recognition of credits”. 5. Educational programs, syllabi; 6. „The study process procedure. Undergraduate level of study”(Decision of the Senate № 3/3 from February 27, 2018); 7. „Study process procedure. Graduate level of study”(Decision No. 3/3 of the Senate on 27 February 2018) 8. Interviews with Quality Assurance Service |
| Recommendations: |
| Suggestions: |
| Best Practices (if applicable): |
| Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements |

4. Staff of the HEI

HEI ensures that the staff employed in the institution (academic, scientific, invited, administrative, support) are highly qualified, so that they are able to effectively manage educational, scientific and administrative processes and achieve the goals defined by the strategic plan of the institution. On its hand, the institution constantly provides its staff with professional development opportunities and improved work conditions.

4.1. Staff Management

- HEI has staff management policy and procedures that ensure the implementation of educational process and other activities defined in its strategic plan.
- HEI ensures the employment of qualified academic/scientific/invited/administrative/ support staff.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

Academy has elaborated and implemented new regulation in February 2018. The rule establishes the procedures of HR management and defines the policy for it. It incorporates the main principles and requirements for staff management such as staff selection procedures, attraction, recruitment, motivation, encouragement, rotation, staff development, training, evaluation, social politics, internal communication, corporative ethics.

Academy highlights the importance of Academic staff that is ensured with one of the objective missions of the Strategic Plan. Particularly, the Mission 7 considers the promotion and improvement of the mechanisms for attraction, selection, development, evaluation of Academic, Administrative and support personnel that is correspondently distributed in 3-years action plan. It should be mentioned that Academy developed regulated approach and strategy for the professional development of its staff recently, some months ago, that does not allow evaluating of the effectiveness of mentioned strategy. It is not clearly presented how the Academy supports its teaching staff to be involved in research activities or to be kept up-to-dated with technical skills and knowledge.

Academy supports the transparency and equality in staff hiring process, which is ensured with the open competition for entire staff, as for academic as well as for invited teachers and support personnel. Most of administrative positions are elected.

Academy established the specific rules for hiring academic staff and teaching personnel. The selection is conducted through open competition where the invited independent commission is involved; the decision is received by Senate and is published. Decision can be appealed in court.

The qualification requirements are set up by each unit and confirmed by Senate. Each personnel of Administrative and support units is familiar with his/her duties and obligations, which is ensured with Job Descriptions. The form of Job Description clearly defines the functions, obligations, accountability of the personnel. However, the Academic personnel is employed based on the Contract and general duties, obligations, functions, workload and payment terms are defined in the specific rule. Moreover, the workload is categorized (A, B, C) depending if the Academic personnel is appointed on the additional positions of Administrative or support units, but there is not a specific definition on the additional positions, such as Head of the Program and so on. In the presented documentation it is not also evidenced how and where the functions, obligations and duties are defined for Deans, Head of the Program and how their activities are assessed.

The Academic Independence is preserved and protected. Interviews showed that personnel are motivated and dedicated to their activities. Moreover, they are involved in discussion of problematic issues, they are familiar with Strategic Plan and can fix their ideas openly or desire regarding programs, study process etc.

It should be noticed that Academy tries to involve the teaching personnel from the industry; this intention is stipulated in the rule of "HR management procedures and Policy". Active seafarers of management level can bring the valuable innovations and necessary experience needed for students and programs' development. The mentioned practice was witnessed during the interview.

The terms and conditions of affiliation are defined by certain rule that obliges the academic staff to sign the agreement of affiliation and conduct the auditory lecture hours and academic-scientific activities.

There is established specific regulation regarding evaluation of personnel. Academic staff is assessed according to the rule on "Evaluation rule on the effectiveness of the scientific-research and academic activity of the academic staff". The mentioned rule obliges the academic staff to fulfill the self-evaluation report once a year, which is assessed by evaluation committee established based on Rector's order for 3 years. Apart of self-evaluation report other surveys are taken into consideration during the assessment, such as students' survey, Quality Assurance Service, study process monitoring evaluation. The rule defines also some kind of benchmarks for the Academic staff and for their completed work. Nevertheless, the rule exists, it is not clearly defined how the evaluation data is analyzed, how the appropriate feedback is given to the personnel, what are the follow-up actions after evaluation. Moreover, there is not the specific rule for evaluation of the invited teaching personnel that constitutes 77 persons and is more than academic staff. It shall be effectively implemented.

It is not also defined how are evaluated the activities of the Head of Programs, head of the Faculty Quality Assurance Service. Regulation regarding the evaluation administrative and support personnel is insufficient and unclear. It says that the structural unit itself performs the evaluation of its staff and the report is presented to Rector/Senate, but it is not indicated how the feedback is produced, distributed, discussed and analyzed.

Evidences/indicators

1. Personnel management procedure of 2 March 2015;
<http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/2-O09.pdf>
2. Decision of the Senate No. 3/3 of 27 February 2018 on approving of policy and procedure of Human Resources Management;
http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/personalis_martvis_politika.pdf
3. 4/2 decision by the Senate of 28 April 2017, on Approval of the rule of conducting an open competition for the academic position;
http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/acad_wesi.pdf

| |
|--|
| <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 4. 13/1 Decision by the Senate of 21 December 2015, on the approval of the rule for defining workload and reimbursement of the academic personnel and invited teachers; 5. Rules for selection of invited teachers (Decision N7 /10edition of July 18, 2017); 6. 3/4 Decision by the Senate of 27 December 2018, on the approval of the rule for defining workload and reimbursement of the academic personnel and invited teachers; http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/datvirtvisa_da_anazgaurebis_wesi.pdf 7. Decision No.11 / 12 of 18 October 2017, on the assessment of the effectiveness of scientific / research and academic performance of academic personnel; http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Academic%20efficiancy.pdf 8. Decision No. 1/3 by the Senate of 22 January 2018, on the rule of election of the Faculty Council representatives in Senate and approval of the election procedure. http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/O%202-O04-05%20senatishi%20arch.pdf 9. Personal files of the staff; 10. Information on the distribution of academic and scientific personnel by age and gender. |
| Recommendations: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Academy needs to effectively implement the regulation regarding of invited teaching personnel evaluation. 2. Academy needs to effectively implement the staff evaluation follow-up and analyze system and the feedback reporting procedures to managers. 3. Academy needs to elaborate the specific rule for evaluation of activities of Head of the programs, Head of the Faculty Quality Assurance, administrative and support personnel. 4. Academy needs more systematic approach to the planning of the personnel training. |
| Suggestions: |
| Best Practices (if applicable): |
| Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements |
| 4.2. Academic/Scientific and Invited Staff Workload |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Number and workload of academic/scientific and invited staff is adequate to HEI's educational programmes and scientific-research activities, and also other functions assigned to them |
| Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements <p>Aca demy hires 72 Academic affiliated staff and 77 invited teaching personnel. There are two main documents defining the workload and rule of payment to Academic/ scientific and invited staff. One of it is the Methodology to define the number of Academic Staff. According to this methodology the number of academic staff for authorization period is defined by the commission appointed by the Rector's order for 3 years. Commission takes into consideration the number of the students, academic year, and specificity of the educational programs, budget and financial availability. However, the rule is more general and it does not specify the exact benchmarks for defining the required number of the Academic Staff. It does not reflect the required particular ratio between students and academic staff, or ratio of student – administrative staff. It is required to have at least 1 professor and 2 Associated professors for elaboration and delivering Bachelor or Master programs according to the Rule, that takes also into consideration, budget, the specification, needs for research, structure of the program.</p> <p>The main second document regulating the workload of the Academic/Scientific and invited staff is the Rule on «defining the workload and reimbursement of the academic and invited</p> |

personnel». Regulation 3 of the mentioned rule defines that Students' Academic group consists of not less than 16 and no more than 30 students. At the same time the same rule in the regulation 4 says that "the hours conducted in the academic group less than 20 students is not considered in the workload of the Academic personnel" – these two regulations are in conflict with each other. Regulation 8 of the mentioned Rule is also unclear regarding the limitations in payment to invited teaching personnel.

During the interview there was not clearly explained the number of students in the academic group nor by HR staff neither by Academic staff. That means that distribution of the workload can face some unclearness. According to standard the number of workload of staff should ensure implementation of educational programmes and proper fulfillment of research and other activities and duties assigned them. HEI should update workload scheme every semester.

There are regulations defining the workload for lectures and mandatory obligation to carry out the scientific and research activities. Contact hours for full-time affiliated personnel can be 340 hours. However, there can be some exclusions, based on the category of affiliation of the Academic staff.

According to the affiliation rule each personnel should have the contract for affiliation that is evidenced in presented documentation.

Academy elaborated the regulation for retention of the Academic Staff, where are stipulated the possible activities to avoid the high rate of personnel flow. These activities are reflected in 3-years action plan. Academy highlights the importance regarding the involvement of highly professional Academic Staff in the educational process in its strategic plan, however there is not the specific policy for attraction the young staff.

Evidences/indicators

1. 13/7 Decision by the Senate of 30 November 2017, on the approval of methodology for determining the number of academic staff;
<http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Academic%20staff%20quantity%20procedure.pdf>
2. 13/1 Decision by the Senate of 21 December 2015, on the approval of the rule for defining workload and reimbursement of the academic personnel and invited teachers;
3. Decision No.11 / 12 of 18 October 2017, on the assessment of the effectiveness of scientific / research and academic performance of academic personnel;
<http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Academic%20efficiency.pdf>
4. 3/4 Decision by the Senate of 27 December 2018, on the approval of the rule for defining workload and reimbursement of the academic personnel and invited teachers;
http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/datvirtvisa_da_anazgaurebis_wesi.pdf
5. Scheme of Individual work load (valid form)

Recommendations:

1. Academy needs to review and amend the Rule "Defining workload and reimbursement of Academic personnel and invited teachers" and establish the clear number of students' academic group that is one of the main component for defining the workload.
2. Academy needs to review and amend the Rule on "Methodology to define the number of Academic Staff" and define more specific and exact benchmarks for calculation the required number of Academic Personnel based on different type of established ratio.
3. It is suggested to elaborate and implement a motivating system for Academic Staff for their encouragement especially in research activities.
4. Academy need elaborate and implement the policy for attraction new young generation in educational and research processes.

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

- ☐ Complies with requirements
- ☒ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

5. Students and their support services

HEI ensures the development of student-centred environment, offers appropriate services, including career support mechanisms; it also ensures maximum awareness of students, implements diverse activities and promotes student involvement in these activities. HEI utilizes student survey results to improve student support services

5.1. The Rule for obtaining and changing student status, the recognition of education, and student rights

- For each of the educational levels, HEI has developed regulations for assignment, suspension and termination of student status, mobility, qualification granting, issuing educational documents as well as recognition of education received during the learning period.
- HEI ensures the protection of student rights and lawful interests.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

During visit experts have found out that BSMA has developed and published documentation for obtaining and changing student's status, have Tools and procedures for education recognition and policies to protect students right. These documentations are published on the BSMA web site and all information is public. During interview students have indicated that they were informed about existence of these documents during first meeting at the BSMA, also students said that they have opportunity to fill lecturer evaluation form which is online also they are able to appeal their grades to their professors if they are not satisfied with them and in case of negative result faculty is obliged to create council which will discuss the issue again. There is self-government which is conducting meetings with students to discuss their problematic issues which will be discussed on council meeting after.

Experts have checked contract form for vocational, bachelor and master level students and both are adopted for supporting student rights and interest. For example: There is chapter which indicates that student has right to have flexible schedule for payment or he/she has opportunity to get discounts and scholarship at BSMA. Also based on the contract students have right to: be part of any students' self government, to use mobility and change faculty or university, to get an academic holiday, to evaluate academy academic and management staff an etc.

Evidences/indicators

1. http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/studentis_xelshekruleba_profesiuli.pdf
2. http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Studentis_xelshekruleba.pdf
3. <http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Master%20agreement.pdf>
4. <http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/2-%20F13.pdf>
5. <http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/2-F02.pdf>
6. http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/samagistro_swavlebis_safexuri_2018.pdf
7. http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/saswavlo_procesis_procedura._swavlebis_safexuri_frofe_siuli_swavleba.pdf
8. http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/swavlebis_safexuri_bakalavriati_18.pdf
9. Interviews

Recommendations:**Suggestions:**

Students shall be well informed about education process their obligations, duties, responsibilities, role and rights.

| |
|---|
| Best Practices (if applicable): |
| Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements |
| 5.2 Student support services |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ HEI has student consulting services in order to plan educational process and improve academic performance ○ HEI has career support service, which provides students with appropriate counselling and support regarding employment and career development ○ HEI ensures students awareness and involvement in various university-level, local and international projects and events, and supports student initiatives ○ HEI has mechanisms, including financial mechanisms to support low SES students |
| Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements <p>There are relevant staff at department of student registration, mobility and assessment who are responsible to provide consulting services in order to plan educational process and improve academic performance. They support fresh students to use internal learning management system to make registration on lectures. This system helps students to check their own schedule, status, grades, to get learning materials and information about their lectures. All students confirmed these information on interview and our group checked this learning management system at site visit.</p> <p>There is career support service at BSMA, this unit provide meetings with employers and students and to make communication process easier between two sides. The last meeting was at the beginning of the 2018. This event was published on academy's web site and main purpose of this event was to get feedback on BSMA programs and to get information about new demand from employers and Alumni if there is anything new which BSMA should consider for program update. Beside them active students have opportunity to use BSMA learning management system to make assessment of management and academic staff and also to give their opinion about study programs.</p> <p>Career Support Service has database of employers which is also public on their web-page and they have strong connections about vacancies or internships beside this service informs by emails and/or web page students about active and fresh vacancies and/or internships which is relevant for students from another employer which are not in their database and service finds online.</p> <p>Based on the programs there was practice during study period and it was supported by faculty specialist.</p> <p>BSMA has ratio of employed students which is indicated at self-assessment form. At interview Administration members mentioned the have feedback from their students about employment. This process is not mandatory and they are not asking to provide information to BSMA, but this process is not mandatory and there are many graduates who are not participating to this research, so this numbers could be different from real situation.</p> <p>BSMA students are very active at different projects. Main initiator is student self-government which is planning and organizing different kind of sport activities, excursions and etc. also there is procedure of student project presenting and financing which gives students opportunity to organize their projects.</p> <p>Students who have "A Group" academic achievements, siblings, low SES students, students from mountainous regions have discounts on study fee.</p> |
| Evidences/indicators <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. http://bsma.ge/main/page/2-21/index.html 2. http://bsma.ge/main/page/1288/index.html 3. Annex 1 (self-assessment) |

| |
|---|
| 4. http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Student%20Projects.pdf 5. http://bsma.ge/main/page/2-69/index.html 6. Interview with Career support service, Alumni and employers. |
| Recommendations: Career support service should make a questioner which will be used for research to get more precise picture of employment ratio of their graduates and this department shall have contact with their graduates and asking for feedback must be obligation from BSMA, not optional. |
| Suggestions: |
| Best Practices (if applicable): |
| Evaluation <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements |

6. Research, development and/or other creative work

Higher Education Institution, considering its type and specifics of field(s), works on the strengthening of its research function, ensures proper conditions to support research activities and improve the quality of research activities

| |
|---|
| 6.1 Research Activities |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ HEI, based on its type and specifics of its fields, carries out research/creative activities. ○ Ensuring the effectiveness of doctoral research supervision ○ HEI has public, transparent and fair procedures for the assessment and defense of dissertations which are relevant to the specifics of the field |
| Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements Research activities are conducted at the Academy with relevant level of status. In particular, in the form of performance of the research component of Master's programs (Master's thesis) and the academic staff's research activity. Standard, structure and evaluation of Master's thesis performance; Defense and evaluation of Master's thesis; The procedure for the defense of the work. Study envisaged within the Master's Educational Program will ensure compliance with the level of theoretical knowledge and research skills of MAs with learning outcomes defined by the Master's Program. The academy, as a teaching university, participates in research activity in the form of research papers performance of personal interest (2 projects) and master educational programs Academy has got no Doctoral programs. Because the academy does not have a PhD program that implies research, the academic staff of the academy is focused on teaching, but research is at least minimal because the academy has graduate programs in which the master's thesis should be done. However, the Academy plans to initiate PhD programs in the future, as the rapid growth of modern technologies requires more and more qualified personnel, which in itself increases the academic staff motivation more actively involved in the preparation of doctoral students which implies the growth of research component. However, academic personnel still carry out interesting research, but it is still very few and for motivating research activities, the Academy intends to open an appropriate interactive |

field on the website, where the interested public will have the opportunity to state the issues that may be used to initiate research projects.

In SER not indicate Supervisor-MA student ratio, why right now the university has suspended MA students.

Evidences/indicators

1. Internal regulation.
<http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/O02.pdf>
2. Training process procedure, master's level of study.
<http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/O%202-F05.pdf>
3. 3/4 Decision by the Senate of 27 December 2018, on the approval of the rule for defining workload and reimbursement of the academic personnel and invited teachers.
4. Decision No.11 / 12 of 18 October 2017, on the assessment of the effectiveness of scientific / research and academic performance of academic personnel.
5. Funds considered for organizing research activities.
6. Published conference materials.
7. Abstracts of Master' theses.

Recommendations:

The academy shall develop a strategy to assist MA program students in learning, as they are active seafarers and require individual programs

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

- ☐ Complies with requirements
- ☒ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

6.2. Research support and internationalization

- HEI has an effective system in place for supporting research, development and creative activities
- Attracting new staff and their involvement in research/arts-creative activities.
- University works on internationalization of research, development and creative activities.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The Academy systematically carries out by academic personnel facilitating scientific-research activities through targeted funding, allocates budgetary funds for academic, scientific research business trips, publication of textbooks and monographs. However, a systematic normative procedure, except for budget drafting, which provides funding of scientific-research activities with a purpose, is not developed. Although the Academy is a Teaching University it look for upgrading its status. In this direction, the formation of relevant working groups is planned, determining priority research directions by faculties, reviewing the Doctoral Program ideas and planning relevant works. The Academy should engage more academic and invited staff in research and research projects.

At this stage the academy has no clear defined procedures for financial support of research activities and internationalization, which will reflect its achievements in this field, though the Academy's three-year (2018-2020) action plan envisages challenging research activities, raising the quality of education, strengthening co-operation (including international) with educational institutions, the establishment and implementation of English-language and joint education programs.

Evidences/indicators

| |
|--|
| <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The Decision of the Senate № 4/3 from March 14, 2018 „On approval of the strategic plan of the Batumi State Maritime Academy for 2018-2024"; http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/ganvitarebis_strategiuli_gegma2018.pdf 2. Training process procedure, master's level of study; http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/O%202-F05.pdf 3. Project Management and Educational Internationalization Manager's job description (JD); 4. The Decision of the Senate № 3/3 of February 27, 2018 on approval of the Human Resource Management Policy and procedure; 5. 2018 The Decision of the Senate № 3/5 of February 27, 2018 on approval of the Statute of the Legal and Human Resources Management Department 6. Grant Agreement Master in Transport and city logistics (Master in Transport and city logistics); 7. 2017 The Decision of the Senate № 11/12 of October 18, on approval of the Rules for the effectiveness of scientific / research and academic activities of academic personnel; 8. 2018 The Decision of the Senate N 5/1 of April 4, Internationalization policy; 9. 2018 The Decision of the Senate N 5/2 of April 4, Internationalization strategy |
| <p>Recommendations:</p> <p>The academy should develop a strategy that will be able to engage academic and invited staff research projects in order to effectively reflect on master's papers.</p> |
| <p>Suggestions:</p> |
| <p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p> |
| <p>Evaluation</p> <p> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements </p> |
| <p>6.3. Evaluation of Research Activities</p> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ HEI has a system for evaluating and analysing the quality of research/creative-arts activities, and the productivity of scientific-research units and academic/scientific staff. |
| <p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>Assessment of research activities at the Academy is at the initial stage of development. The regulating norms of the personal assessment of research activities are integrated in different procedures (the rule of evaluation of academic performance, the rule of conducting an open competition for the academic position, etc.). According to the current regulations, academic personnel are obliged to plan their research activities annually, and in the end of the academic year the present a self-evaluation report. The mentioned report is subject to analysis and evaluation, which is directly conducted by the Commission created for this purpose. The mentioned rule has been introduced since 2017. Before that, the assessment of research activities was conducted in irregular forms in academic departments (manuals, methodical instructions, conferencing reports, etc.) according to the rule of conducting an open competition for reviewing the results of research and academic position.</p> |
| <p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Decision No.11 / 12 of 18 October 2017, on the assessment of the effectiveness of scientific / research and academic performance of academic personnel; http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/akademiuri_saqmianobis_efeqturobis_shefasebis_wesi_2018.pdf |

| |
|--|
| 2. 4/2 decision by the Senate of 28 April 2017, on Approval of the rule of conducting an open competition for the academic position; http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/acad_wesi.pdf 3. Self-assessment data of academic personnel according to faculties 4. 2 Research projects. |
| Recommendations: The academy should develop a strategy that would be able to make evaluation of Research Activities and Internationalization of research activities. |
| Suggestions: |
| Best Practices (if applicable): |
| Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements |

7. Material, information and financial resources

Material, information and financial resources of HEI ensure sustainable, stable, effective and efficient functioning of the institution, and the achievement of goals defined through strategic development plan.

| |
|--|
| 7.1 Material resources |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The institution possesses or owns material resources (fixed and current assets) that are used for achieving goals stated in the mission statement, adequately responds to the requirements of educational programmes and research activities, and corresponds to the existing number of students and planned enrolment. ○ HEI offers environment necessary for implementing educational activities: sanitary units, natural light possibilities, and central heating system. ○ Health and safety of students and staff is protected within the institution. ○ HEI has adapted environment for people with special needs |
| Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements <p>Academy has quite well-established material resources which can provide the uninterrupted teaching and educational process for 2500 students. The building, classrooms are adapted to conduct modern lectures; laboratories, simulators, workshop classes are well updated with new inventory and equipment. Academy owns its training vessel for practice purposes. Strategic plan considers conducting the repairing works of the building, of the vessel and installing all necessary navigational and engine equipment during 2018. Academy has its own power supply system that can provide enough electricity for whole building.</p> <p>All necessary documents, agreements or/and the acts of ownership on all assets exist.</p> <p>Sanitary system, water supply, heating and cooling systems are in appropriate condition. Sanitary-hygienic condition is in satisfying condition. Academy conducts the video control around the perimeter.</p> <p>Academy established the specific structural unit «Safety and internal regulation Service» providing the safety and security of students and staff within the institution. The main functions of the service are defined in the specific regulation and are stipulated as follow: to control and monitor the fulfillment of internal regulations, to protect material resources of the Academy, maintain a watch keeping, to evacuate all persons from the Academy in case of emergency situation, to conduct an evacuation drill, to make familiar the students with main safety instructions, to control the visitors and entrants into Academy. The service is managed by the Head of the service. A doctor and 12 security officers are working under</p> |

this Service. Doctor has a medical cabinet equipped with the first aid tools. The obligation of the doctor is to check the classrooms, corridors whether the sanitary norms are protected and kept. Academy has firefighting equipment; however, it is planned to renew it during the 2018.

Academy has adapted environment for people with special needs. Elevator and other facilities promote to navigate freely for persons with special needs. Special sanitary facilities for persons with limited abilities are provided.

Evidences/indicators

1. Extract from Public Registry;
2. Measuring drawings;
3. Documents confirming payment of utility service fees;
4. Assessment Acts on condition of building-facilities;
5. Documents certifying possession of liquid assets;
6. Document of possession of diesel generator;
7. Agreement - on Fire Safety;
8. Orders on determining persons responsible for safety (including firefighting);
9. Document of the possession of the boiler equipment;
10. Order of the person responsible for medical assistance;
11. N 3/5 decision by the Senate of 27 February 2018, on Approval of the rule of the department of Security and Internal Regulations Control Service;
12. №5/3 decision by the Senate of 4 April 2018, "Approval of the rules of determining of students, including vocational student contingent";
13. Agreements concluded with practice objects

Recommendations:

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Academy physical infrastructure: Training vessel, laboratories, repairing shops, training apparatus, simulators, workshops etc. are strictly dedicated to deliver desired learning outcomes as a fulfillment of International recommendations (in this case IMO).

Evaluation

- ☒ Complies with requirements
- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

7.2. Library resources

- Library environment, resources and service support effective implementation of educational and research activities, and HEI constantly works for its improvement.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

There is appropriate library resources and they meet demands of learning outcomes. Students have easy access on online library catalogue where everyone can search the book or other learning material. BSMA has agreement with national library and in case they do not have materials at their library, national library is sending it by the post.

However, it seems that available number of dedicated professional books in Georgian Language is limited.

Library is equipped with: computers connected to the internet also with combined scanner and printer machine which was available as well for the staff as for the students.

Also BSMA has got special room for disabled people

Academy has access to different international online library's. All links are on library web-page. But students are not informed about them because they did not confirm ability to

access any international library resources, also not all library staff is trained how to use these internet databases because, there were librarian who were unable to open and use online databases

In the Library Manual there is indicated that, head of the library is responsible to find out which library resources are already outdated and which of them needs to be updated and he/she is preparing report about library resource update to the rector.

Library has statistical data of books, learning materials and students who are registered at the library. Statistical Data also indicates how many books/learning materials were used during certain period.

Evidences/indicators

<http://library.bsma.edu.ge/>

Recommendations:

Library Personal should give more information international online libraries and rules how to use them to the students and academy staff and before that it would be better if all library staff will be trained in this field.

Suggestions:

Increase number of professional books available in Georgian language.

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

- ☐ Complies with requirements
- ☒ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

7.3 Information Resources

- HEI has created infrastructure for information technologies and its administration and accessibility are ensured
- Electronic services and electronic management systems are implemented and mechanisms for their constant improvement are in place
- HEI ensures business continuity
- HEI has a functional web-page in Georgian and English languages.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

BSMA has infrastructure which follows IT service requirements. There is special Information technologies service which is responsible and able to deal with related issues and problems as for web site and internet (WI-FI) as well as computer software and data bases (servers).

Whole perimeter of buildings is covered with Wi-Fi internet which is open for everyone. Contract for internet is with Silknet. BSMA has Learning Managements System where are making students registration, they can see schedule of lectures (time lecturer's name and room number), see their assessment and progress, evaluate academic staff and administration and get study materials. Academic staff use this software to plan their lectures, in case of need have communication with students and to make assessment. During visit experts could check software. Academy has agreement with house of justice for electronic document flow software

Web-site is fully functional in Georgian and English languages and there is updated information which is needed for students, academy staff and stakeholders (like employers, school graduates etc.) Web-page is installed on hosting which is purchased from silknet.

BSMA has servers for data bases which is making mirror back-up, which means in case of emergency academy can recover data from another hard drive and they will not lose all information.

Academy has business continuity plan, where are indicated possible risks and correction action if needed.

Beside BSMA is fully complies with standard requirements, academy management said that during summer repair works are planned for buildings and they have already finished tenders and contracts to make new internal network, Wi-Fi, Antivirus protection for software and servers for data bases.

Evidences/indicators

1. Interview,
2. Agreements with suppliers
3. Business continuity plan
4. <http://bsma.ge/>
5. <http://bsma.ge/main/page/2-21/index.html>

Evaluation

- ☒ Fully complies with requirements
- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

Recommendations:

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

7.4 Financial resources

- Allocation of financial resources described in the budget of HEI is economically achievable
- Financial standing of HEI ensures performance of activities described in strategic and mid-term action plans
- HEI financial resources are focused on effective implementation of core activities of the institution
- HEI budget provides funding for scientific research and library functioning and development
- HEI has an effective system of accountability, financial management and control

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The budget of the Academy is prepared according to the relevant rule, considering the goals and objectives of the Strategic Development Plan and the Action Plan. The budget is formulated from the following sources: its own income, from the state budget (including the budget of the Autonomous Republic of Adjara), funds received from grants and other funds.

The heads of the structural units acting in the academy are involved in the budget formation. They submit information in the financial-economic department, which, on the basis of the information received, determines the budget project according to the priorities. The draft budget is submitted to the Senate.

Budget funds of the Academy are directed towards providing educational functions. However, as it was revealed during the interview, the main part of the budget is used for infrastructure development and administrative functions. Funding of academic activities, internationalization and research is not currently a budget priority. The tendencies of development of the academy are well illustrated by the growing dynamic of the 2013-2017 budget. Since 2013 the budget of the Academy has increased almost twice (from 5 701 879 GEL to 9 326 031 GEL). Proceeding from the Academy's needs of the resources, strategic plan and activities step-by-step has been implemented and planned such infrastructural projects, as rehabilitation and re-equipment and upgrade /re-tool of seafarers training and certification center, pool, dormitory, workshop, sports hall, teaching campus and equipment. In the budget a significant place has financial resources allocated for teaching

| |
|--|
| <p>materials (book fund, electronic libraries). Academy Budget, Accounts and Audit Recommendations are available on the Academy's website.</p> |
| <p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Rule of budgeting - http://bsma.edu.ge/upload/Budget%20procedure.pdf; 2. 2018 budget; 3. Financial data of the reporting period; 4. Presentation of the projects implemented; 5. Academy website www.bsma.edu.ge 6. Tender announcement and results of the results - www.procurement.gov.ge; 7. Procurement plan; Audit reports; 8. Budget execution reports. 9. Interview with BSMA Management, Senate members and Self-Evaluation and strategic Development team |
| <p>Recommendations:</p> <p>The academic budget should be prioritized to academic and research activities as research activities give bases for BSMA development</p> |
| <p>Suggestions:</p> |
| <p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p> |
| <p>Evaluation</p> <p> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements </p> |

Appendixes