Final Report of Authorization experts` on
LLC David Tvildiani Medical University

Expert Panel Members

Chair: Denekens Josette (Joke), University of Antwerp, Belgium

Members:

Abiatari Ivane, Ilia State University, Georgia

Chilingarasvhili Giorgi, Tbilisi State Medical University , Georgia

Lebanidze Sofia, Ilia State University, Georgia

Manjavidze Irma, Tbilisi State Medical University, Georgia

Zarnadze Maia (Maka), Tbilisi Medical Academy. Georgia

Report Resume

General information on the educational institution

David Tvildiani Medical University has been founded by David Tvildiani in 1992 as a private university. Till 2011 the university was known as higher medical school "Aieti". The first mission statement was already to construct society based on knowledge, to integrate into the international community and to work out a new type of approach of the educational system. The first program was quite innovative for the country because not only the question of "what to teach" but also the question "how to teach" was on the basis of the development of the new medical program. In fact the main didactical concept is 'assessment drives learning" and as a tool DTMU uses the USML test. There is also an experiment with e-PBL, but unfortunately this methodology is not used in the MD programs (Georgian end English).

DTMU runs 3 accredited programs, MD in Georgian, MD in English and a doctoral program in Biomedical and Public Health Sciences. Total enrollment is 884 students of which 134 are suspended. 501 are foreign students of which 64 are suspended. There are 31 students in the doctoral program. There are no students with special needs. The university has delivered 476 graduates.

Staff consists of 271 members of which 68 academic staff, 64 affiliated staff, 116 invited staff, 82 administrative staff. The total budget is 7.403.439, with 345.000 for research and 32.000 for library functioning- development. Next to the teaching tasks, DTMU is also involved in research. 37 research projects were implemented during the last authorization period.

Brief overview of the evaluation process for authorization: SER and Site visit

A self - evaluation process coordination group was established at DTMU, which consisted of the heads of the University's educational programs, as well as representatives of the major departments and services. For each standard a thematic working group has gathered relevant information and data and has written in collaboration with the Quality Assurance Service the different chapters of the self evaluation report (SER). Next to the SER a fair number of related documents was at the disposal of the expert commission. These documents were well organized and were available in English and/or in Georgian.

The SER gives good descriptive information about regulations and documents for each standard (past and present situation) and is especially describing results of the work and the efforts that have been done. However an analysis of policies, strategies, management, performance and practices was not enough elaborated.

The site visit was well organized and the expert panel had the opportunity to discuss with 21 groups to get more insight in the way DTMU is functioning and steering and implementing quality assurance processes.

Overview of the HEI's compliance with standards

As for now the institution has not a culture of explicit strategies, policies, benchmarking, indicators etc… They are working rather on an "at hoc" basis and the corporate culture is "doing my best".

The new mission statement of DTMU is very general and not really future oriented. Most students and teachers are not familiar with the mission statement.

DTMU has written a comprehensive Strategic Development Plan. The described strategies are not really strategies, but broader goals. Not enough elaborated to steer in an efficient and effective way the different aims. Therefor the substandard is only partially compliant and standard 1 complies substantially.

Leadership is weak and should be strengthened to realize the 3 and 7 years aims.

The organizational structure has changed and new structural units are created. It is too early to judge weather these structures are functioning properly. The management should be strengthened and more IT support is needed. Standard 2 complies substantially

Standard 3 complies substantially because program renewal is only reactive to the evaluation of the students and not proactive according to the changing needs of society, health care system and evolution in biomedical sciences. 3.3 is partially compliant because assessment and learning outcomes and teaching and learning activities are not aligned.

Standard 4 complies only substantially because human resources management is weak, and a new strategy for evaluation and rewarding academic staff is elaborated but not yet implemented.

Standard 5 complies substantially because more can be done to support students and especially the integration between Georgian and foreign students should be ameliorated. Involvement of students in policy making and steering university should be ameliorated.

Standard 6 complies partially because research is very weak. Also the research component in the MD programs is very weak and has to be strengthened.

Standard 7 complies substantially. The resources are enough (material, IT, Library, finances) but there is not a comprehensive long term plan in place.

Summary of Recommendations

- It is recommended that DTMU engage in processes to ensure that the values, the vision and the new mission become part of daily live, known and shared by all the members of the university.
- It is recommended that DTMU develop a realistic strategic planning methodology.
- It is recommended that DTMU prioritize the many actions defined in the action plan 2018-2024.
- It is recommended that DTMU modernize its organizational structure and management and set up an efficient system of performance monitoring processes (IT support) in order to make all processes more effective, efficient and transparent.
- It is recommended that DTMU stimulate student's engagement in all university's activities.

- It is recommended to make more promotion for the Code of Ethics, for the principles of academic freedom, for prevention of violation of the ethical rules and conduct, with specific attention for plagiarism.
- It is recommended to use the new Benchmark Document of 2018 to renew the MD programs into competence-based and community-based programs and to install vertical as well as horizontal integration not only in the structure of the programs but also in the teaching and learning methods and in the assessment methods (see 3.3).
- It is recommended to focus on competences-based learning and not only knowledge-based learning. This means that the program has to create teaching and learning activities where students can exercise with integration of knowledge, skills and attitudes to learn on a competence level.
- It is recommended to use PBL also in the English as well as in the Georgian MD program.
- It is recommended to program and create social activities in the way students can learn to be social agents, transforming society and to be able to learn to be fit for purpose in the health care sector. So more contacts, surveys and collaboration with various employers and scientific and professional organizations of medical doctors, different health care settings and policy making bodies are necessary.
- It is recommended to involve students more in the renewal of the programs
- It is recommended to focus more on the changing needs in society and in the health care system and on the new evalutions in biomedical sciences to develop a contemporary curriculum with for example more family medicine, more interprofessionel education, more prevention and chronic diseases, more aspects of sustainability.
- It is recommended that DTMU align assessment methods with learning outcomes and teaching and learning activities.
- It is recommended that DTMU assess on a competence- based level, OSCE with integration of clinical reasoning
- It is recommended that DTMU give feedback to students in a systematical way after each exam
- It is recommended that DTMU confirm the regulations of DTMU with the different staff members (academic, invited, affiliated and administrative) in the different contracts.
- It is recommended that DTMU elaborate a strategy for academic succession planning
- It is recommended that DTMU develop a strategy to enhance the collaboration between academic staff and HR department
- It is recommended to ensure different approaches for rewarding the academic and the invited staff in accordance with their responsabilities and appropriate salaries.
- It is recommended to measure student workload (1 ECTS credit is 25 to 30 hours work). The student workload is too heavy. The best students are enrolled and yet 15% of the students don't pass the exams in the first year.
- It is recommended to organize in a systematic way communication with students and teachers to inform them about regulations and procedures and to make sure they get the information quite well
- It is recommended to increase the integration between foreign students and Georgian students and society using different social projects (such as "culture day" where every student from different countries can reflect its own cultural differences).
- It is recommended to implement consulting services from the Carreer Development Department. This department should have tight connection with alumni and employers. Alumni tracer study regarding carreers has to be elaborated and a monitoring system for following the alumni during their carreers has to be implemented
- It is recommended to build and equip research laboratories to facilitate and stabilize scientific activities of undergraduate and PhD students in DTMU.

- It is recommended to prioritize more relevant fields of research (e.g. based on productivity of particular researchers, or social or community needs, etc.) and support their development predominantly to create high quality and continuous expertise and new knowledge.
- It is recommended to actively recruit research professors.
- It is recommended to prioritize the strategies under chapter II Research in the Strategic Development Plan with special attention for:
    - allocation of money internally with prioritizing the strong groups and interdisciplinary research but also allocate money for small groups with high impact on Georgian society with introduction of better structured and categorized internal grant programs;
    - optimization of writing grants proposals national and international with support of the Research Department;
    - professionalization of research staff (regular research qualification courses for academic staff of the university);
    - maximal care for the PhD students;
    - deepening the international collaboration;
    - creating a pleasant research and teaching environment.
- It is recommended to introduce of well-defined system for the evaluation of research of staff and institutional units.
- It is recommended to make a comprehensive infrastructure and facilities development plan.
- It is recommended to build the new hospital as a "modern teaching" hospital, that perhaps in the future can serve also other MD programs in Tbilisi.
- It is recommended to build a clinical skills lab in the new hospital building regarding demands of the new medical Education Benchmarks.
- It is recommended to develop a pleasant physical learning environment in the library. Perhaps this is not possible in the current library, because more space is needed, especially in accordance with an increased number of students in the future
- It is recommended to develop appropriate IT Software to diminish the paper work and to optimize the monitoring processes
- It is recommended to develop the web-page
- It is recommended to develop a comprehensive development plan with concrete action plans and allocated financial support for IT resources
- It is recommended to strengthen the Financial Department
- It is recommended to develop monitoring and evaluation tools for follow-up of financial resources and to steer in a more pro-active way the Financial Department
- It is recommended to put in place a mid-term and long-term budgeting process
- It is recommended to institutionalize the budgeting process

Summary of Suggestions

1. It is suggested that the Quality Assurance Service should have more staff to fulfill the great amount of tasks to realize a real quality culture embedded in daily work at DTMU.
2. It is suggested to program and create social activities in the way students can learn to be social agents, transforming society and to be able to learn to be fit for purpose in the health care sector. So more contacts, surveys and collaboration with various employers and scientific and professional organizations of medical doctors, different health care settings and policy making bodies are necessary.

3. It is suggested to incorporate in an updated curriculum courses on interprofessional learning and topics on sustainability in collaboration with various organizations in society and in the community of Tbilisi (social work, schools, municipality, governance etc…)
4. It is suggested that the Center for Medical Education takes the lead to innovate the MD programs (content and didactical methods). Times are changing, problems are more and more interdisciplinary, society is changing and needs and demands of patients are different. This means that a new curriculum has to be created to deliver doctors fit for purpose in the future (next 60 years!) To do this in an effective and efficient way the expertise of the Center for Medical Education is much needed.
5. It is suggested to provide students with more information about different research scholarships, internships and workshops and to arrange meetings for planning future residency programs.
6. It is suggested to make an accepted scientific journal list (e.g. according to scope) for the publications of PhD students.
7. It is suggested to offer more on job trainings and practical support in using data bases for teachers and students by the staff of the library.

Summary of the Best Practices

1. The disciplinary commission in which half of the members must be students.
2. New residency programs in general internal medicine and in family medicine
3. Continuous professional education programs.
4. E-PBL program.
5. DTMU is identifying students at risk and provides them help based mainly on their volunteer "peer teachers" (mostly students from year 3 and 4). This is pretty helpful, because peers can explain materials in different way, much more understandable.

Summary Table of Compliance of HEI with Standards and Standard Components

	Standard	Complies with Requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
1.	Mission and strategic development of HEI	☐	x	☐	☐
1.1	Mission of HEI	☐	x	☐	☐
1.2	Strategic development	☐	☐	x	☐
2.	Organizational structure and management of HEI	☐	x	☐	☐
2.1	Organisational structure and management	☐	x	☐	☐
2.2	Internal quality assurance mechanisms		x	☐	☐
2.3	Observing principles of ethics and integrity	☐	☐	x	☐
3.	Educational Programmes	☐	x	☐	☐
3.1	Design and development of educational programmes		x	☐	☐
3.2	Structure and content of educational programmes	☐	X	☐	☐
3.3	Assessment of learning outcomes		☐	x	☐
4	Staff of the HEI	☐	x	☐	☐
4.1	Staff management	☐	x	☐	☐
4.2	Academic/Scientific and invited Staff workload	☐	x	☐	☐
5	Students and their support services	x	☐	☐	☐
5.1	The Rule for obtaining and changing student status, the recognition of education, and student rights	x	☐	☐	☐
5.2	Student support services	☐	x	☐	☐
6	Research, development and/or other creative work	☐	☐	x	☐
6.1	Research activities	☐	☐	x	☐
6.2	Research support and internationalisation	☐	☐	x	☐
6.3	Evaluation of research activities	☐	☐	x	☐
7	Material, information and financial resources	☐	☐	x	☐
7.1	Material resources	☐	x	☐	☐
7.2	Library resources	☐	x	☐	☐
7.3	Information resources	☐	☐	x	☐
7.4	Financial resources	☐	☐	x	☐

Signature of expert panel members

1. Denekens Josette
2. Abiatari Ivane
3. Chilingarasvhili Giorgi
4. Lebanidze Sofia

5. Manjavidze Irma

6. Zarnadze Maia

Compliance of the Applicant HEI with the Authorization Standard Components

1. Mission and strategic development of HEI

Mission statement of a HEI defines its role and place within higher education area and broader society. Strategic development plan of HEI corresponds with the mission of an institution, is based on the goals of the institution and describe means for achieving these goals.

1.1 Mission of HEI
Mission Statement of the HEI corresponds to Georgia's and European higher education goals, defines its role and place within higher education area and society, both locally and internationally.
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements
The mission statement of DTMU is to provide higher education based on science and the best international experience in medicine.   According to DTMU it is necessary to construct a society based on knowledge, to strive for integration into the international community and to implement a new type of approach for the educational system.   DTMU wants to train and develop professionals who succesfully accomplish all the functions of a future physician, locally as well as internationally.   DTMU strives for a student centered learning environment. Autonomy, independence and "be the best" on the labor market are the mean values to realize the mission.   During the interviews it became clear that most students and teachers are not familiar with the mission statement.
Evidences/indicators   Website   SER   Interviews   Appendix 1: University Mission and Strategic Plan   Appendix 3: Davd Tvildiani Medical University Charter
Recommendations: It is recommended that DTMU engage in processes to ensure that the values, the vision and the new mission become part of daily live, known and shared by all the members of the university.
Suggestions:
Best Practices
Evaluation   ☐ Complies with requirements   ☒ Substantially complies with requirements   ☐ Partially complies with requirements   ☐ Does not comply with requirements
1.2 Strategic Development
o HEI has a strategic development (7-year) and an action plans (3-year) in place.   o HEI contributes to the development of the society, shares with the society the knowledge gathered in the institution, and facilitates lifelong learning   o HEI evaluates implementation of strategic and action plans, and duly acts on evaluation results.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The Strategic Development Plan is a comprehensive document that reflects the mission of the university. The introduction part of the document describes and evaluates the university's social, economic and political environment. The mission is broadly worked out in 12 goals, quality of teaching, research quality, quality of human resources, quality of leadership and management, collaboration, effective use of financial resources, infrastructure and environment, students involvement and participation, internationalization of experience, public relations, establishing positions on national and international level, culture of quality. For each goal strategies are defined. Also an evaluation of the reporting period (2011-2016) is given, the present situation is described and the seven and thirth year action plans are defined.

The whole is not very specific and not "explicitly" connected with the mission statement. The above mentioned strategies are in fact not real strategies, but rather broad defined actions. No performance indicators are defined. There is a table with rough timelines, monitoring methodology for implementation of processes and evaluation is not elaborated. Prioritizing of the huge amount of actions is not in place.

Strenghts and some areas for improvement are described in the SER but a real SWOT analysis is not presented.

According to the SER all structures, self governing bodies and representatives of the academic community are involved in the development of the strategic development plan and its implementation. During the interviews the expert panel has been able to determine that the new mission and the strategical development plan were not already steering into new directions.

In fact, in some groups it was mentioned that there is no new mission and that they do what they have always done. In the opinion of the expert panel this is true and the mission of the starting period is according to the panel still in force but the strategical development plan is not elaborated yet as a steering strategy. There are lots of actions defined in the 12 aims, but these actions are not been worked out sufficiently precisely because the policy and the strategy is not well enough defined.

DTMU has to work out a good strategic planning and monitoring methodology to create a real compass that sufficiently gives direction to the mission statement and to the variety of actions.

DTMU contributes to the development of society, disseminates knowledge through a variety of actions and tries to implement programs for residency training and life long learning.

Evidences/indicators

SER

Interviews

Appendices 1, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9

Recommendations:

It is recommended that DTMU develop a realistic and effective strategic planning methodology.

It is recommended that DTMU prioritize the many actions defined in the action plan 2018-2024.

It is recommended that DTMU modernize its organizational structure and management and set up an efficient system of performance monitoring processes (IT support) in order to make all processes more effective, efficient and transparent.

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

☐ Complies with requirements
☐ Substantially complies with requirements

x⊠ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

2. Organisational Structure and Management of HEI

Organisational structure and management of the HEI is based on best practices of the educational sector, meaning effective use of management and quality assurance mechanisms in the management process. This approach ensures implementation of strategic plan, integration of quality assurance function into management process, and promotes principles of integrity and ethics

2.1 Organisational Structure and Management

- o Organisational structure of HEI ensures implementation of goals and activities described in its strategic plan
- o Procedures for election/appointment of the management bodies of HEI are transparent, equitable, and in line with legislation
- o HEI's Leadership/Management body ensures effective management of the activities of the institution
- o Considering the mission and goals of HEI, leadership of the HEI supports international cooperation of the institution and the process of internationalization.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

In the SER DTMU gives the reflection that they have chosen as much as possible for decentralization, cooperation and mutual support within the organizational structures with clearly defined tasks, duties and responsibilities. The SER and various appendices give an overview of the different structural units and leadership positions in the university with respective functions and responsibilities. During the interviews the expert committee has seen indeed a rather horizontal organization. However he Department of Finances and the Legal Department are under direct steering and control of the rector. It seems that only the results of the surveys of the quality assurance service are steering the university in a kind of ad hoc policy, day by day. Leadership must be strengthened.

All structural units of the University have their own functions which is clearly and distinctly specified in the relevant department or service provision. The principles are relevant to the Higher Education Law, the University Charter and recognized by the Statute stated by the Great Charter of European Universities; to serve the performance of the mission of the university and the strategic plan.

During the authorization period DTMU has created new structures according to the goals of the strategic development plan, which has to be praised: Career Development and Alumni Collaboration Department, the Center for Post-Diploma Education and Continuous Professional Development, the Scientific Research Department. With those new structures more efficiency and quality is intended to be realized the set goals for 2018-2024. The university management group was established, which will be operating in the new structure of strategic management and development. During the reporting period a new Statue of University was elaborated.

Regulations for document processing are in place as well as an electronic document processing system. Mechanisms for monitoring need to be more effective and efficient in the future. In this respect the strategy 3 under chapter IV quality of leadership and management in the Strategic Development Plan is very important: "we need to make significant improvements in the performance and effectiveness of existing services (functionality of administration). DTMU is aware of this weakness. In the opinion of the expert committee the optimization of the monitoring mechanisms with IT support has to be prioritized.

According to the SER students should be/ are involved in policy making. Students are well organized (with elections for each study year). They have representatives in the different councils and some self-governing bodies. During the interviews it became clear that students have many opportunities to have a say in the policy/steering of the university, but that they often do not make use of this opportunities/possibilities.

In this respect chapter VIII of the Strategic Development Plan is very valuable because DTMU recognizes the importance of student's engagement in all university's activities, not only education and research, but

also in policy making, in social and professional activities. Support for self - government of various student organizations and creation of appropriate condition for student's work are important targets for DTMU. A good practice is the disciplinary commission in which half of the members must be students.

Procedures for election/appointment of staff at management bodies are transparent, equitable and in line with legislation (appendix 13). Decisions are made in time and in an effective manner.
The Documentation and HR Department is responsible for the execution of the regulations for document processing according to the established legislation.

Monitoring mechanisms and evaluation system is based on aims, functions and objectives and is seen as self-regulating feedback mechanism. (appendix16)

Monitoring and evaluation tools are: action plan execution monitoring existing mechanism (also see annex. "action plan"), internal self-evaluation mechanisms used by the quality assurance service , strategic development committee reports, human resources development plan and performance reports , comparative analysis of results and plans based on normative documents, control system: data on discipline, initiatives and work features, existing mechanisms for research management effectiveness monitoring (involved structures, monitoring and evaluation tools)

Business continuity plan is in place but has to be implemented (appendix 15). It deals with 3 key-issues:
1.planning and reassuring organization's business processes
2.planning to restore business processes from an accident
3.crisis management.
Roles and responsibilities are defined. The quality of the plan is monitored. Training of the coordinators is foreseen. The university will review the plan on a yearly basis.

Internationalization is one of the most important goals of the Mission Statement and the Strategic Development Plan (DTMU promotes internationalization from the foundation in 1992). DTMU has cooperation for education and research with a variety of international partners (AMEE, WFME, AMSE, EBMA, ORPHEUS, UEMS, EUA, PACT, ePBL-net, INTEGRITY, TASK, BIOTUNE, CDMED, DREAM HERD. Students, teachers and young doctors are also involved in international projects (IFMSA/GMSA, UEMS). Foreign consultants and opponents are invited to facilitate doctoral readiness and research. DTMU corporates with graduates in Europe and the United States of America to facilitate the future career growth of university students. Graduates who are living and working abroad are asked as invited teachers to support teaching and research within DTMU. The internationalization policy is elaborated on the program level and on the personal level for students and teachers. (appendix 17, not really a policy document, but an overview of the variety of actions on internationalization).

Program level: elaboration and development of university programs based on international best experience, measures to facilitate harmonization with European standards in Doctoral Studies, collaboration in Doctoral Teaching (Expert Cooperation, Joint Leadership)
Individual support: supporting students involvement in international cultural dialogue: Joint participation of Georgian and foreign students in DTMU student organizations, in interest groups, in preparation and involvement of student conferences, workshops and other activities organized by them.
Facilitate students to participate in training courses and conferences in certain courses within the chosen course abroad.
Compulsory course of Georgian language for foreigners
Educational and research collaboration with DTMU alumni working abroad
Providing Maastricht Progress Tests for Students, including delivering feedback to University Students
Facilitate university teachers and students to participate and deliver
presentations at scientific conferences.

University teachers, student collaboration with organizations with similar European goals (education, research).

Evidences/indicators
SER
Interviews
Appendices 3, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 43, 88

Recommendations:
It is recommended that the DTMU modernize its organizational structure and management and monitoring processes (IT support) in order to make all processes more effective, efficient and transparent.
It is recommended that DTMU stimulate student's engagement   in all university's activities

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):
A good practice is the disciplinary commission in which half of the members must be students.

Evaluation
☐ Complies with requirements
☒ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

2.2 Internal Quality Assurance Mechanisms

- o Institution effectively implements internal quality assurance mechanisms. Leadership of the institution constantly works to strengthen quality assurance function and promotes establishment of quality culture in the institution.
- o HEI has a mechanism for planning student body, which will give each student an opportunity to get a high quality education.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The Quality Assurance team has the responsibility for evaluation, development and accreditation of the educational programs as well as for the institutional development and authorization processes.

To do so the team uses a wide variety of methods, general surveys, focus groups, specific questionnaires, in different gremia (official structures, staff and students). The Quality Assessment group organizes the annual self- assessment planning, monitoring and evaluation by compulsory engagement of administrative staff as well as academic staff and students. The results are used to steer policy and management. As model for Quality Assurance the Spiral model of Harden is used. Appendix 19 gives a description of the quality assurance mechanisms but gives not an assessment of their efficiency.

This variant of the PDCA cycle guarantees the use of the results of the different questionnaires to give feedback in the various gremia and to steer the institution to better performance in the future.

In the strategic development plan chapter 13 is dedicated to the quality culture with 4 so called strategies, 7 aims for the next 7 years and 8 aims for the next 3 years. DTMU shows in this way that university community will try to integrate quality assurance processes with the strategic planning.

In appendix 24 DTMU describes the mechanisms for students contingent planning. This is not really a procedure but a variety of mechanisms as assessment of human resources and materials, possibilities of

distributing the students at the courses in accordance with student progress, possibility to start semester in spring and in autumn, modular organization of the program, pre- enrollment modules etc..;

There are not concrete indicators in place.

Leadership is making decisions on the basis of the results of QA. There is no system for evaluation of the effectiveness of the QA mechanisms,

For the students a progress management system is used, in which each individual student can see his /her progress. Also the coordinators can see the progress of the students and can detect students at risk and can search for causes and find solutions for the existing problems. Students are satisfied with the services offered by the coordinators. They are responding very fast and problems are solved in an easy way according to the students. Nevertheless more can be done to ameliorate the IT support for managing the study progress of students and to diminish the paper work for the coordinators.

Monitoring for the administrative staff is organized on a yearly basis with questionnaires and interviews. For the heads of the structural units by the rector, for the members of the structural units by the direct supervisor.

Monitoring for the teaching of the academic staff is organized by the Quality Assurance unit on a yearly basis with satisfaction questionnaires (student), and with the DREEM methodology.

Evidences/indicators

  SER

  Interviews

  Appendices 19,23

Recommendations:

Suggestions:

It is suggested that the Quality Assurance Service should have more staff to fulfill the great amount of tasks to realize a real quality culture embedded in daily work at DTMU

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

  ☒ Complies with requirements
  ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
  ☐ Partially complies with requirements
  ☐ Does not comply with requirements

2.3. Observing Principles of Ethics and Integrity

  o HEI has developed regulations and mechanisms that follow principles of ethics and integrity. Such regulations are publicly accessible.
  o Institution has implemented mechanisms for detecting plagiarism and its prevention.
  o HEI follows the principles of academic freedom.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

DTMU has elaborated a Code of Ethics and conduct for staff and students. According to the SER DTMU is constantly working to establish the "norm" and the selection of new methods and means for prevention of plagiarism. DTMU has acquired an institutional license of the "Turnitin" technology

against plagiarism. The implementation is under way. The instructions for teachers and students to use this resource have been created.

Although these efforts, and even when the Code of Ethics is available on the website and is promoted by the start of the academic year, most of the students and even some teachers are not aware of the Code of Ethics.

The disciplinary commission in which half of the members must be students is in place. Procedures are in place in case of violation. Till now no cases are reported.

DTMU follows the principles of academic freedom as is stipulated in the relevant regulatory acts of the institution. It is not really an issue according to the teachers. They feel free at work in this institution. The university is involved in the development of academic honesty in the European project in the framework of Erasmus+.

Evidences/indicators
SER
Interviews
Appendix 3, 25,26,27,28,39

Recommendations:
It is recommended to make more promotion for the Code of Ethics, for the principles of academic freedom, for prevention of violation of the ethical rules and conduct, with special attention for plagiarism.

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation
☐ Complies with requirements
☐ Substantially complies with requirements
☒ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

3. Educational Programmes

HEI has procedures for planning, designing, approving, developing and annulling educational programmes. Programme learning outcomes are clearly defined and are in line with the National Qualifications Framework. A programme ensures achievement of its objectives and intended learning outcomes

3.1 Design and Development of Educational Programmes
HEI has a policy for planning, designing, implementing and developing educational programmes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements
DTMU has a methodology, based on the Tuning Project Curriculum Planning, implementation and transmission model in place for planning, designing and development of educational programs Appendix29 gives a theoretical description, but gives not insight in the way this theory is implemented and elaborated on the floor. .On page 30 of the SER is stipulated that students have opportunities to change or cancel their participation in the program if they so wish to. Students have the opportunity to transfer to MD programs at other universities, for which they receive uninterrupted access to the transcript of Academic Excellence and all necessary documents at DTMU, which is envisaged by Georgian legislation. In the development of the program with the Rectors Board, Academic Council, Quality Assurance Service, Curriculum and Assessment Committee are involved. Analysis of labor market,

employers demands, students, alumni and employers satisfaction surveys, alumni tracer study regarding career, student academic performance monitoring results are used by DTMU for planning and development of the programs. Nevertheless students are not really involved in the renewal of the educational programs and in the Strategic Development Plan DTMU sets itself the goal to facilitate involvement of students in the life of the institution and their active participation especially the role of students in organizing and managing their own study process is highlighted.

DTMU elaborated a new elective course in clinical immunology, revised 10 different courses (example-syllabus in Respiratory System, syllabus in Gastro-intestinal system) and elaborated 2 training courses for the teachers. These improvements show a well-functioning quality assurance system but are not enough to speak from curriculum innovation. DTMU can focus more on the changing needs in society and in the health care system and on new evolutions in biomedical sciences to develop a contemporary curriculum with for example more family medicine, more interprofessional education, more prevention and chronic diseases, more aspects of sustainability etc.

According to the expert committee the use of the USML questionnaire as the leading force behind the didactical concept "assessment drives learning" is outdated. Curriculum innovation has to focus on competences-based learning (Harden) and not only on knowledge-based learning. This means that the program has to create teaching and learning activities where students can exercise with integration of knowledge, skills and attitudes to learn on a competence level (Miller).

The mission statement of DTMU stipulates that university has an important role in offering new knowledge for the development of society. According to this statement the curriculum has to program and create social activities in the way students can learn to be social agents, transforming society and to be able to learn to be fit for purpose in the health care sector. So more contacts, surveys and collaboration with various employers and scientific and professional organizations of medical doctors, different health care settings and policy making bodies are necessary.

DTMU has established a Center for Medical Education at the University, which is the facilitator of the process of updating existing curricula and promotes new curriculum development. University also provides a training course "Modern Medical Curriculum", but it would be better if more teachers and students should be involved in this course. It is suggested that the Center for Medical Education takes the lead to innovate the MD programs (content and didactical methods). Times are changing, problems are more and more interdisciplinary, society is changing and needs and demands of patients are different. This means that a new curriculum has to be created to deliver doctors fit for purpose in the future (next 60 years!) To do this in an effective and efficient way the expertise of the Center for Medical Education is much needed.

.DTMU students participate in the so-called online Progress-Test (provided by Maastricht University), which measure the progress of the student over the whole curriculum and identifies the problematic areas of programs where groups of students are not performing well (example - such problem has arisen in anatomy). In conclusion DTMU works on the amelioration of the programs and has procedures for this process , which is clearly described in appendix 29.

In line with current legislation , DTMU has developed regulations and procedures for approving amending and annulment of educational programs. DTMU operates two MD programs, (one with a possibility of EPBL track), which enables students to choose among them, as well as to change or cancel their participation in the program if they so wish (Appendix 38).

DTMU has started two new residency programs: Family Medicine and General Internal Medicine. The expert committee is very pleased with these new initiatives, because the changing health care needs in society are demanding more family medicine practitioners/general practitioners to select patients who have to be referred to a hospital or not.

At the door of the hospital general internal medicine becomes more and more important because many patients are suffering from multimorbidity and a general internal specialist has to manage these patients in an effective and efficient way to the right subspecialisation or to the interprofessional care departments that will be established more and more in the future.

An other good practice is the installation of Continuous Professional Education. Continuous professional education is very important to guarantee the quality of health care. An attractive needs - based program can be established for especially family physicians to update the competences in the first line.

Evidences/indicators

Appendix, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, 38

SER

interviews

Recommendations:

It is recommended to focus on competences-based learning and not only knowledge-based learning. This means that the program has to create teaching and learning activities where students can exercise with integration of knowledge, skills and attitudes to learn on a competence level. I

It is recommended to program and create social activities in the way students can learn to be social agents, transforming society and to be able to learn to be fit for purpose in the health care sector. So more contacts, surveys and collaboration with various employers and scientific and professional organizations of medical doctors, different health care settings and policy making bodies are necessary.

It is recommended to involve students more in the renewal of the programs

It is recommended to focus more on the changing needs in society and in the health care system and on the new evalutions in biomedical sciences to develop a contemporary curriculum with for example more family medicine, moere interprofessionel education, more prevention and chronic diseases, more aspects of sustainability

Suggestions:

It is suggested to incorporate in an updated curriculum courses on interprofessional learning and topics on sustainability in collaboration with various organizations in society and in the community of Tbilisi (social work, schools, municipality, governance etc…

It is suggested that the Center for Medical Education takes the lead to innovate the MD programs (content and didactical methods). Times are changing, problems are more and more interdisciplinary, society is changing and needs and demands of patients are different. This means that a new curriculum has to be created to deliver doctors fit for purpose in the future (next 60 years!) To do this in an effective and efficient way the expertise of the Center for Medical Education is much needed.

Best Practices (if applicable):
New residency programs in general internal medicine and in family medicine
Continuous professional education programs

Evaluation
☐ Complies with requirements
☒ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

3.2 Structure and Content of Educational Programmes
o Programme learning outcomes are clearly stated and are in line with higher education level and qualification to be granted
o With the help of individualized education programmes, HEI takes into consideration various requirements, needs and academic readiness of students, and ensures their unhindered involvement into the educational process.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements
"DTMU currently operates 3 accredited academic programs - 2 medical doctor, one in Georgian and one in English and also a doctoral program in biomedical and public health sciences. The volume (ECTS points) of the program components is defined by the content, the learning outcomes and the specifics of the field. The possibility exists to follow an e-PBL track in English since 2014 (in the frame of the Tempus project „Establishment of the Supra-Regional Network of the National Centers in Medical Education, focused on PBL and Virtual Patients".   Elective courses exist and in the 6th year a 1 month elective apprenticeship is possible for every student.   University follows current legislation and European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System guidelines. Learning outcomes of the programs are clearly stated and are in line with the level of higher education and qualification to be granted. Learning outcomes are not in line with the new benchmark document of 2018.   For the MD programs the 6-year period of teaching includes 3 stages: I - basic medical and clinical scientific course; II - clinical medical course; III - general specialization course.   The program is an integrated learning course (at the basic level horizontal integration with elements of vertical integration (appendix 31), Program structure and content ensure logical connection between all of its components and achievement of learning outcomes.   Although the idea of horizontal integration has been shaped by bringing together the different courses together around an organ system in a variety of modules, there is not really integration realized neither in the teaching and learning methods, neither in the assessment methods. It is recommended to work out the recommendations of the Benchmark Document of 2018. This document should be the basis for curriculum construction from January 2019 on in Georgia. This document is also very important in implementing outcome-based curricula instead of knowledge-based curricula.   In the e-PBL track learning is student centered. Students work in PBL sessions on various patient cases. Students have to solve the problems of the patients themselves and learn step by step to be a real doctor. Students are very enthusiastic about this method.

In the other programs the PBL sessions are case-based small group learning sessions with the teacher in a more classical way of operating.

Teaching and learning methods used within the educational programs reflect specifics of the field and ensure achievement of learning outcomes of the program.

The program provides students with opportunities to elect non-compulsory components of an educational program. The possibility of an elective 1 month course in the 6th-year program can be considered as the strongest part of the program. It gives the opportunity to students to plan the course of study in accordance with their wish / choice for further study and pass the transparency of the choice of clinical training bases.

The students of DTMU are able to ask the Dean about the development of an individual curriculum and the study courses that he/she wants to study additionally. Students also can ask to plan a scientific research component for them. The PhD student, in consultation with the Chief Scientific Officer and Doctorate Committee sets out the plan of fulfillment of the general training courses that are available for PhD students (Appendix 39; 40).

DTMU has methodology in place for the planning and development of individualized educational programs.

The information on the programs is available on the web-site. Website is under construction (during site visit several items were elaborated, but optimization is under way). We could not find a catalogue of programs on the website.

Evidences/indicators

SER

Interviews

Appendix 31,39,40

Recommendations:

It is recommended to use the new Benchmark Document of 2018 to renew the MD programs into outcome-based and community-based programs and to install vertical as well as horizontal integration not only in the structure of the programs but also in the teaching and learning methods and in the assessment (see 3.3)

It is recommended to focus on competences-based learning and not only knowledge-based learning. This means that the program has to create teaching and learning activities where students can exercise with integration of knowledge, skills and attitudes to learn on a competence level.

Suggestions:

It is suggested to incorporate in an updated curriculum courses on interprofessional learning and topics on sustainability in collaboration with various organizations in society and in the community of Tbilisi (social work, schools, municipality, governance etc…

Best Practices (if applicable):

e-PBL program

Evaluation

☐ Complies with requirements

☒ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

3.3 Assessment of Learning Outcomes

HEI has law-compliant, transparent and fair system of learning outcomes assessment, which promotes the improvement of students' academic performance.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

After each module in basic as well as in clinical subjects, DTMU students performs complex exams with tests (MCQ) –Quiz , in the exam center. The total amount of questions is 180. These questions cover all topics that have been treated in a module. During the quiz ,the number of the questions in different topics are distributed according the ECTS credits of the topic. (appendix 44) - This is a very good method for evaluation of the knowledge of the students. But learning outcomes given in the DTMU programs and syllabi can not be assessed only by MCQ and Oral exams. MCQ is able to assess knowledge and not competences (the last ones are quite clearly described in the learning outcomes of the syllabi). So there is no alignment between learning outcomes and assessment methods (Biggs).

Widely used today to evaluate the clinical competences of students and residents in many higher education medical schools around the world is OSCE. During the OSCE examination students demonstrate clinical skills with the use of simulators or patient performers (WFME, WHO).

DTMU has OSCE only in Pharmacology (4 stations) - During the 6th year of education pharmacotherapy problem-oriented learning cycle is introduced offered by Groningen University (Groningen Method). The aim of the cycle is to learn practical skills in choosing pharmacological treatment for a specific patient. At the end of the cycle an objective examination test is performed – OSCE, but this exam is not well described in the syllabus.

During the interviews the MiniCEX- (Mini clinical evaluation exercise) in Gynecology was also mentioned, but we cannot see appropriate evidence in the syllabus.

The assessment system and the related regulations are clearly described in the syllabi and are in line with legal acts of Georgia.

Learning outcomes assessment system in DTMU not always takes into consideration specifics of the field and not always includes adequate assessment formats, components and methods , which enable identifying whether students have achieved learning outcomes attributed to the specific program or not.

Transparent criteria are used to assess student knowledge, but during the interviews it became clear that there is not an efficient system of feedback for the students after the exams.

Students of DTMU are informed about the assessment system used within the institution as well as related regulations.

DTMU has an effective assessment appellation system in place and students are informed about this system. There were no appeals from students.

Conclusion

Although there are multiple exams (oral and MCQ) the system gives not enough evidence of testing on a competence-based level. (Not enough integration of knowledge, skills and attitude, even not really OSCE examinations).

Evidences/indicators

Appendices 42,31,44
SER
Interviews.

Recommendations:

It is recommended that DTMU align assessment methods with learning outcomes and teaching and learning activities.

It is recommended that DTMU assess on a competence- based level, OSCE with integration of clinical reasoning

It is recommended that DTMU give feedback to students in a systematical way after each exam

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

☐ Complies with requirements
☐ Substantially complies with requirements
☒ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

4. Staff of the HEI

HEI ensures that the staff employed in the institution (academic, scientific, invited, administrative, support) are highly qualified, so that they are able to effectively manage educational, scientific and administrative processes and achieve the goals defined by the strategic plan of the institution. On its hand, the institution constantly provides its staff with professional development opportunities and improved work conditions.

4.1. Staff Management

- HEI has staff management policy and procedures that ensure the implementation of educational process and other activities defined in its strategic plan.
- HEI ensures the employment of qualified academic/scientific/invited/administrative/ support staff.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

DTMU has regulations and procedures in place for human resources management.

DTMU has elaborated different documents about staff management policy and procedures that ensure the implementation of the educational processes and other activities in the Strategic Development Plan: the procedures for staff recruitment; rule and provisions of academic staff affiliation; qualification frameworks and jobs description. Statute: On Teaching Staff workload at the DTMU; Regulation: on Academic Load of Academic Staff at DTMU.

In the labor regulation are the principles for remuneration and encouragement elaborated, but staff members are not familiar with these documents. Remuneration is till now only based on working hours not on performance evaluation results. Only teaching is remunerated, not research. From September 2018 research will be remunerated as well as teaching.

The individual files of academic staff members are in line with the qualifications to the subject in which field they are delivering lectures;

Academic staff consists of 68 persons (professor 17, associate professor 39, assistant professor 12), From them most majority 64 (professor-17, associated 36, assistant 11) are affiliated; Invited staff are approximately twice more than academic staff -116.

For the scope of target benchmarks, DTMU will improve for 2021 the indicators by increasing the number of academic and research staff; Ratio of academic and scientific staff to number of invited staff is 0,56 and for 2021 should be 1,38. Academic staff retention indicator - 0, 92, invited staff –0, 81, for 2021 planed to increase to 1.

DTMU has defined the rule of staff recruitment. This document describes different responsibilities and obligations of academic and invited staff and for special position as PBL tutor as well; but the contracts show no differences in content for academic and invited positions. Interview results revealed the same.

For the affiliated academic staff agreements are in the personal files.

In the Strategic Development Plan and the action plans about human resources management there is no strategy for academic succession planning. In the 3 year aims there is a statement about elaborating a development concept in human resources management.

DTMU has a mechanism for encouraging employees in labor regulation document. During our visit we saw decisions of DTMU regarding encouragement with financial and non-financial means. QA department of University provided different kinds of staff assessment and satisfaction surveys (included DREEM), bonus system, teacher prices. Regarding the interview results there is no close collaboration between academic staff and the HR Department.

Distribution of Academic Staff according to the age and gender: preferable females are associated and assistant professors, and by the age more than 50 years and older. 43 % of academic staff is female.

Interview results with PhD students defined that a greater part of them are DTMU graduates and are involved already in teaching activities in DTMU. Most of them have close collaboration and great willingness to become academic staff in this university. That will be a great opportunity for rejuvenation of the academic staff.

DTMU has a special department of Education Methodology. 8 programs are developed: TOT for tutors or Journal Club" (3days training); TOT for e-PBL sessions (3 days training);Technical support for academics and invited staff for delivering lectures and practical sessions DTMU (2 hours); Basics in management (16 hours); Curriculum development training course (16 hours); Main principles for medical education teaching, learning and evaluation (10 HOURS); Project writing (18 hours) and scientific research writing-basic principles (duration 10 weeks, weekly 6-8 hours).

Evidences/indicators

SER
Interviews
Appendices 45, 46, 28, 48, 49, 50,52,53,55
Contracts samples with the persons;
Reports of academic council;
Advertisement for academic positions;

Recommendations:

It is recommended that DTMU confirm the regulations of DTMU with the different staff members (academic, invited, affiliated and administrative) in the different contracts.

It is recommended that DTMU elaborate a strategy for academic succession planning

It is recommended that DTMU develop a strategy to enhance the collaboration between academic staff and HR department
Suggestions:
Best Practices (if applicable):
Evaluation ☐ Complies with requirements ☒ Substantially complies with requirements ☐ Partially complies with requirements ☐ Does not comply with requirements

4.2. Academic/Scientific and Invited Staff Workload

Number and workload of academic/scientific and invited staff is adequate to HEI's educational programmes and scientific-research activities, and also other functions assigned to them

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The workload of the pedagogical staff in DTMU is defined by the provision (developed by the Educational Department, reviewed and accepted by the academic council and approved by the Rector's Council). The document reflects the norms of calculation and use of workload of professors and teachers in DTMU.

Teachers' annual working period is considered to be the academic year, including annual winter and summer holidays, which do not coincide with the planned vocation. The total time-budget allocated for all types of pedagogic activities is defined by 1500 hours in a year. The document about workload provided by DTMU defines workload by semester, so it is difficult to identify workload by week.

During the interviews academic staff of DTMU mentioned that the workload is approximately 20 hours in a week. Based on real loading workload for academic and invited staff varies between 4-35 hours for academic and scientific activities. In reality Professor, Associate Professor/ Assistant Professor and invited teacher have one contract type, without obligatory hours and fixed salary. DTMU has one remuneration policy: for lecturing 30 GEL/hour, for practical trainings 20 GEL/hour; This policy is not motivating academic staff for research and professional development. But during our visit leadership of university noted that new benchmarks of workload are underway and that in the new regulations research and teaching will be remunerated and that from September on there will be a fixed salary for academic staff.

Staff mobility is provided in different ways: in the framework of TEMPUS project" ePBLnet"-totally 23 mobility of academic staff were performed during 2013-2015; In the framework TEMPUS Project 'PACT" -13 mobility of academic staff were performed in 2015-2016; in the framework of "Pride Training Course' 3 mobility in 2016 and academic mobility for one month to Karagada Medical University, Kazakhstan (in 2013). During the interviews academic and invited express great will to take part in mobility programs for enhancement of their professional development.

Evidences/indicators

SER
Interviews
Appendices: 56,57 # 56
Materials for staff mobility
Professional development and medical education training programs

Recommendations:
It is recommended to ensure different approaches for rewarding the academic and invited staff in accordance with their responsibilites and appropriate salaries

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation
☐ Complies with requirements ☒ Substantially complies with requirements ☐ Partially complies with requirements ☐ Does not comply with requirements

5. Students and Their Support Services

HEI ensures the development of student-centred environment, offers appropriate services, including career support mechanisms; it also ensures maximum awareness of students, implements diverse activities and promotes student involvement in these activities. HEI utilizes student survey results to improve student support services

5.1. The Rule for Obtaining and Changing Student Status, the Recognition of Education, and Student Rights
o   For each of the educational levels, HEI has developed regulations for assignment, suspension and termination of student status, mobility, qualification granting, issuing educational documents as well as recognition of education received during the learning period. o   HEI ensures the protection of student rights and lawful interests.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements
The regulations for assignment, suspension and termination of student status, mobility, qualification granting and recognition of education are described by the Rule of Recognition, Suspension, Termination, Restoration, Mobility and Study of Student Status. This document is publicly available in both Georgian and English on the official website of DTMU and is accessible for students and other stakeholders. These above mentioned rules are based on the "Law of Georgia on Higher Education". According to a sample of contracts seen by the experts of the authorization commission and according to the information gathered during the site visit the processes and procedures are transparent and fair. The contract between DTMU and a student protects student rights and lawful interests. During the site-visit, it has been confirmed that the students were able to receive more clarifications or additional information regarding any records of the contract in prior to sign it. As in many universities students are not always (fully) aware of the information they might need. The SER and the Strategic Development Plan show that DTMU continuously works on further enhancement. There is a system for appeals. During the interviews it was mentioned it happens quite rare.

Evidences/indicators:
Appendices 58,59,39,60,38,62,27,61,63 SER Strategic Development Plan Interview

Recommendations:

Suggestions:
Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation
    ☒ Complies with requirements
    ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
    ☐ Partially complies with requirements
    ☐ Does not comply with requirements

5.2 Student Support Services

- o HEI has student consulting services in order to plan educational process and improve academic performance
- o HEI has career support service, which provides students with appropriate counselling and support regarding employment and career development
- o HEI ensures students awareness and involvement in various university-level, local and international projects and events, and supports student initiatives
- o HEI has mechanisms, including financial mechanisms to support low SES students

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The student's assistance from academic personnel is regulated in the document about pedagogical workload, which gives a calculation of pedagogical norms.

According to the SER and the interviews all staff members of the dean are involved in student support as coordinator for the different study years. These coordinators observe students' performance, identify students at risk and provide them help (such as additional classes by peers or teacher). In DTMU there exist special additional classes for those students who wants to pass USMLE and those classes are free for local students.

The students are assisted by the deputy-dean in the field for research and consulting in scientific activities. The scientific research department is providing individual counseling services to PhD students.

The first day of the academic year students are informed about Rules, Regulations and Student Support Services. According to the students themselves the information is available on the website and they use also intensively social media. Direct communication with the teachers is a valuable source of information. However students are not aware of the Code of Ethics, but they know about a system for plagiarism

DTMU creates opportunities for students' international mobility and participation in various projects, ensures students awareness on various international projects and events carried out outside of the institution.

For the renewal of the program the student surveys are very important. Students get feedback about the survey results. Students nominate teachers for bonus and teacher prices.

Every year students choose student representatives in the Rectors Council and Quality Assurance Department. Academic Council meetings are open for students to attend and students are informed about upcoming meetings by e-mails. The possibility to be involved in educational methodology planning exists but according to the Strategical Development Plan and to the interviews in reality students are not really involved.

DTMU ensures transport of students from Rustavi campus to and from, even lunch is provided for those students who live in Rustavi campus and who are during daytime in university for lectures.

DTMU has a number of memoranda with other universities and organizations for organizing students' internships (DTMU covers all material fees (including accommodation, plane ticket fee etc.).

DTMU covers USMLE Step 1 fees if student passes internal special USMLE based exam. DTMU employs DTMU graduated students as invited teachers who create a friendly environment and motivation for students.

According to the students the workload is heavy but most of them feel it as "positive pressure"!

Students from year 3 and 4 are tutoring the first year student who are at risk for delay in study progress to help them through the first year.

In the opinion of the expert panel workload for students is too heavy, especially in the first year. Although students are selected at the door according to their grades in secondary school 15 to 20% of the students don't pass the first year in both MD programs.

In DTMU, there are several interest groups (in surgery, in gynecology-obstetrics), which organize extracurricular workshops to provide for DTMU students possibilities to increase their clinical skills in distinct disciplines, because as they mentioned during interview students lack clinical experience and it would be better to have more and better developed clinical skills.

In addition, there is Students Youth Scientists` Scientific Association (SYSSA), which arranges different conferences in different fields. Material resources are covered by university, because as representatives mentioned they don't have distinct budget. All these interest groups (SIGA, GIGA, SYSSA and ect.) use informational banners, social network, e-mails to spread information among students. Also, they always have annual meeting for 1st year students.

Beside scientific activities, students also start up hiking interest group and football championship.

During the site-visit it has been confirmed that student support mechanisms are in place, procedures are transparent, objective and effective and information is accessible for students.

 The Career Development Department is new in DTMU. The coordinators (Dean's office) with help of the Career Development Department provide information about professional orientation and other information events regarding employment and career development (different residency programs and extracurricular activities).

It is recommended that the Career Development Department create an employer database and constantly inform students and alumni on employment opportunities /vacancies.

The Career Development Department can support the involvement of employers in the renewal and creation of educational programs and stimulate the internships in the labor market

The Public Relations and Marketing Department promote student's involvement in a variety of events (sports, arts, cognition, social activities) in cooperation with different employers.

DTMU takes into consideration student socio-economic status and implements flexible payment mechanisms of tuition fees. DTMU provides with scholarships based on student`s academic activity. University exempts successful students from semester tuition fee according to their academic performance.   DTMU provides health insurance for 1st year foreign students only for one year, and arranges meeting of insurance companies for other foreign students.

Evidences/indicators

SER

Interviews

Appendices 56, 55, 39, 68, 65, 2, 3, 69

Recommendations:

It is recommended to measure student workload (1 ECTS credit is 25 to 30 hours work). The student workload is too heavy. The best students are enrolled and yet 20 to 30 students don't pass the exams in the first year.

It is recommended to organize in a systematic way communication with students and teachers to inform them about regulations and procedures and to make sure they get the information quite well , especially the information about the Code of Ethics and the Academic freedom rules.

It is recommended to increase the integration between foreign students and Georgian students and society using different social projects (such as "culture day" where every student from different countries can reflect its own cultural differences).

It is recommended to implement consulting services from the Carreer Development Department. This department should have tight connection with alumni and employers. Alumni tracer study regarding carreers has to be elaborated and a monitoring system for following the alumni during their carreers has to be implemented

Suggestions:

It is suggested to provide students with more information about different research scholarships, internships and workshops and to arrange meetings for planning future residency programs.

Best Practices (if applicable):

Best practice for DTMU is identifying students at risk and provide them help based mainly on their volunteer "peer teachers" (mostly students from year 3 and 4). This is pretty helpful, because peers can explain materials in different way, much more understandable. Another great practice is employment of graduated students in university as teachers.

Evaluation

☐ Complies with requirements
☒ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

6. Research, development and/or other creative work

Higher Education Institution, considering its type and specifics of field(s), works on the strengthening of its research function, ensures proper conditions to support research activities and improve the quality of research activities

6.1 Research Activities

- HEI, based on its type and specifics of its fields, carries out research/creative activities.
- Ensuring the effectiveness of doctoral research supervision
- HEI has public, transparent and fair procedures for the assessment and defense of dissertations which are relevant to the specifics of the field

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

University openly sets priority of PhD research and all research activities are mainly associated with PhD projects. Appendix 76 describes the regulations for assessing and defensing the doctoral thesis, guarantees high standard for the evaluation and defense of the dissertations and ensures public, transparent and fair procedures. The functions for supervisors are well defined. Currently there are 33 PhD research projects running in 3 different directions, which are: Bio-medicine, Clinical medicine and Medical education. Doctoral (PhD) program of the university is implemented 7 years ago and for this moment there are 5 doctoral dissertations defended. University does not have own research facilities, however there are contracts with different economic agents (clinical and research institutions) and PhD research performance (for basic and clinical medicine) is completely outsourced. Stated research interests (including doctoral program itself) cover wide medical area and university does not have clear policy of prioritization of research in specific fields. Regulations and procedures of PhD supervision, assessment and defense are transparent. PhD students are required to publish 5 works during their study – including 3 in peer reviewed journals, however this is not always translated to quality. For basic and clinical medicine research, students should focus on less but higher quality publications.

There are many actions in the strategic plan for amelioration of the research activities and there have been already implemented several research supporting measures (establishment of research department, introduction of internal grants). Nevertheless, research output of DTMU academic personnel is low (68 professors made 105 PubMed enlisted papers in last 5 years). Actual contracts of academic personnel consider payment of only teaching hours and not the research work, which did not stimulate research in previous years.

DTMU supports several student organizations (such as SYSSA for instance) which are research oriented groups and student involvement in research activities and research exchange programs are evident. University supports student conferences two times per year. However, university does not have own functional research laboratory, which is important for the development of essential research skills for students.

Evidences/indicators

SER

Appendices: 71, 72, 84, 80, 76, 82, 86, 85, 81, 88, 73, 84, 79, 77, 78, 83,

Interviews with:

Academic personnel, Top management, Research department, Students/PhD students.

Recommendations:

It is recommended to build and equip research laboratories to facilitate and stabilize scientific activities of undergraduate and PhD students in DTMU.

It is recommended to prioritize more relevant fields of research (e.g. based on productivity of particular researchers, or social or community needs, etc.) and support their development predominantly to create high quality and continuous expertise and new knowledge.

It is recommended to actively recruit research professors.

Suggestions:
It is suggested to make an accepted scientific journal list (e.g. according to Scopus)) for the publications of PhD students.

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation
☐ Complies with requirements
☐ Substantially complies with requirements
☒ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

6.2. Research support and internationalization
- HEI has an effective system in place for supporting research, development and creative activities   - Attracting new staff and their involvement in research/arts-creative activities.   - University works on internationalization of research, development and creative activities.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

Management and academic staff of DTMU understands the importance of research development. During the last 2 years DTMU has implemented several research supporting measures, such as: allocation of budget for internal research grants with transparent and fair procedures and establishment of a research department in recent year. University allocates 4 to 6% of total budget to research activities, however overall only about 0.4% was used for research last year. Which means this resource was not used properly. There is not an effective system for attracting and supporting new staff in research. PhD and post doctoral students re involved in teaching activities. DTMU fosters the PhD students and most of them want to start an academic career. This is a good situation to rejuvenate the staff. It is a pity that there is not really a systematic strategy to do so.

University must work out the strategies defined in the Strategic Development Plan under chapter II to stimulate research. The Research Department should introduce regular requalification of academic personal in research methodology, proposal drafting and other supporting measures. University must introduce standardized application form for internal research grant concourse. Grant calls must be structured for different categories, for instance: basic research grant, research travel grant, research infrastructure development grant, etc. Important prerequisite for application should be involvement of students in the projects.

During the interview with employers it was revealed, that most of the hospitals are participating in international clinical trials. Thus doctors are required to have good research skills and competences. DTMU recently introduced 2 study courses within curriculum which are oriented for development of research skills of students. University supports involvement of students in research activities and even finances participation in international scientific conferences. If students would like to do research as extracurricular possibility, research department facilitates their interaction with particular professors. University should think about introduction of master thesis in study program.

From September DTMU introduces new contracts for academic personnel. New workload requirements consider research activities apart from teaching. This strategy will increase research output of university and DTMU should continue work in this track. University supports career development activities among them academic mobility for researchers. DTMU cooperates with many international organizations and is involved in joint projects but mainly in the field of medical

education and management. No clear evidence exists of internationalization of basic medical research.

DTMU has to increase internationalization on the level of academic personnel and PhD programs, e.g. introduction of joint PhD programs, involvement of international scientists in PhD research/supervision etc.

Evidences/indicators

SER

Interviews with: Academic stuff, Students, Research department, Employers

Appendices 71, 88, 72, 74,75,80, 84, 76, 82,83, 81, 85,86

Recommendations:

It is recommended to prioritize the strategies under chapter II in the Strategic Development Plan with special attention for

allocation of money internally with prioritizing the strong groups and interdisciplinary research but also allocate money for small groups with high impact on Georgian society with Introduction of better structured and categorized internal grant programs
optimization of writing grants proposals national and international with support of the Research Department
professionalization of research staff (regular research qualification courses for academic staff of the university)
maximal care for the PhD students
deepening the international collaboration
creating a pleasant research and teaching environment

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

       ☐ Complies with requirements
       ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
       ☒ Partially complies with requirements
       ☐ Does not comply with requirements

6.3. Evaluation of Research Activities

- o   HEI has a system for evaluating and analysing the quality of research/creative-arts activities, and the productivity of scientific-research units and academic/scientific staff.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

Research performance quality assessment mechanisms describes the system how university launches doctoral research projects. University evaluated PhD student performance, but academic staff performance is not evaluated. There are plans to do so in the near future (from September 2018)

The system of evaluation of scientific productivity of staff is also in place but it is not reflected or linked to the career development of the academic staff. There is no mechanism in place that will be used for the evaluation and assessment of general research performance.

University should introduce well defined actions to resolve the problems and enhance quality.

Evidences/indicators

Component evidences/indicators including the relevant documents, interview results, etc.

SER

Appendix 85,

Appendix 86

Interviews with: Quality assurance, Research department, Academic and invited staff
Recommendations:
Introduction of well-defined system for the evaluation of research of staff and institutional units.
Suggestions:
Best Practices (if applicable):
Evaluation ☐ Complies with requirements ☐ Substantially complies with requirements ☒ Partially complies with requirements ☐ Does not comply with requirements

7. Material, information and financial resources

Material, information and financial resources of HEI ensure sustainable, stable, effective and efficient functioning of the institution, and the achievement of goals defined through strategic development plan.

7.1 Material resources
o The institution possesses or owns material resources (fixed and current assets) that are used for achieving goals stated in the mission statement, adequately responds to the requirements of educational programmes and research activities, and corresponds to the existing number of students and planned enrolment. o HEI offers environment necessary for implementing educational activities: sanitary units, natural light possibilities, and central heating system. o Health and safety of students and staff is protected within the institution. o HEI has adapted environment for people with special needs
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements DTMU has sufficient material resources to run the educational programs. Sanitary units, natural light possibilities, and central heating system are in place. The number of auditors is sufficient for the number of students at this stage. Study rooms, conference hall, library, examination center, group work spaces and administrative units are also in place. For students with special needs there are adapted sanitary units and access to the buildings is guaranteed by elevators. Till now there are no students with special needs. Measurements drawings are prepared, in which the study and the supporting spaces are separated from each other (appendices 87,98). Laboratories (microbiology and biochemistry) are in construction and will be operational in September 2018. There are signed agreements with clinical and scientific research organizations to ensure accommodation for students' learning research and professional skills. There is an approved project for a new hospital building at the Rustavi campus (appendix 90) IT and media facilities are in place to support the learning processes. First aid and security staff is in place as well as video recording to guarantee safety.

Infrastructure needs renovation and current ongoing renewal. Both education and research facilities need good quality infrastructure. On the basis of the surveys with teachers and students DTMU does every year renovation works (PBL classes) and also builds new facilities (laboratories in microbiology and biochemistry on demand of the teachers).

The apparent problem is that there isn't a concrete vision and an elaborated action plan and budgeting plan for a systematically updating/renovating process of the physical infrastructure.

As is stipulated in the Strategic Development Plan DTMU should "develop and introduce processes, which will improve material and technical base of the institution through effective and maximal use of limited finances and resources".

This means the creation of a comprehensive infrastructure and facilities development plan that should include a long term restructuring and renovation scheme in combination with an assessment of the present asset portfolio.

Evidences/indicators

SER

Interviews

Appendices 87,90,93,89,88,99,92,91,70,94,97,98,95

Recommendations:

It is recommended to make a comprehensive infrastructure and facilities development plan.

It is recommended to build the new hospital as a "modern teaching" hospital, that perhaps in the future can serve also other MD programs in Tbilisi.

Suggestions:

It is suggested to build a clinical skills lab in the new hospital building.

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

☐ Complies with requirements
☒ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

7.2. Library resources

o   Library environment, resources and service support effective implementation of educational and research activities, and HEI constantly works for its improvement.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The library is rather small, but is equipped with all essential rooms, facilities and materials (book archive, reading hall, library staff space, meeting and group workspace, IT equipment, electronic catalogue on the website, modern and updated books and core literature needed in the educational programs. The correlation between syllabus references and library stock is quite high. It is easy to go to various digital databases with a student password and to search for relevant data. Although the library is available 6 days a week according to the surveys students make little use of the library.

The library is member of the international library association.

Library team is well organized and has good understanding about needs assessment and planning activities on a short time basis. The library renews and upgrades on a continuous basis the resources and services based on the requirements of the students and academic staff (appendix 105)

What is lacking is a comprehensive development and renewal plan for the 6 coming years, with transparent allocation of budgets as is stipulated in the strategic development plan.

On job training and assistance is provided for students and staff. Access for e-resources exists from university and dormitory infrastructure. Physical infrastructure for reading and copy/printing exists but should be more developed. Reading space and infrastructure should be developed as far as capacity and student number is increasing in the future.

Evidences/indicators
SER
Interviews
Appendices 100, 102,103,105, 106

Recommendations:

It is recommended to develop a pleasant physical learning environment. Perhaps this is not possible in the current library , because more space is needed, especially in accordance with an increased number of students in the future

Suggestions:

It is suggested to offer more on job trainings and practical support in using data bases for teachers and students by the staff of the library

Best Practices (if applicable):

Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions

Evaluation

☐ Complies with requirements
☒ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

7.3 Information Resources

- o HEI has created infrastructure for information technologies and its administration and accessibility are ensured
- o Electronic services and electronic management systems are implemented and mechanisms for their constant improvement are in place
- o HEI ensures business continuity
- o HEI has a functional web-page in Georgian and English languages.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

Strategy and vision regarding IT and program development exist, but still there isn't a long term vision , strategy and an action plan with budget allocation for further development are in place. Financial support should be in place and should be developed gradually.

A lot of daily work is paper based which is not time and resource efficient in mid/long time perspective. There is a limited functionality in the software, currently students have excess only for grades. There isn't software where staff (administration and/or academic) would have excess. Modern technology capacity for information exchange, process management, chain management and etc. is poorly developed.

Web-page isn't user friendly and a lot of information needs permanent update.

Evidences/indicators

SER
Interviews
Appendices 109,111

Recommendations:
It is recommended to develop appropriate IT Software to diminish the paper work and to optimize the monitoring processes
It is recommended to develop further the web-page, both in Georgian and in English version
It is recommended to develop a comprehensive development plan with concrete action plans and allocated financial support

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation
☐ Complies with requirements
☐ Substantially complies with requirements
☒ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

7.4 Financial resources
o Allocation of financial resources described in the budget of HEI is economically achievable
o Financial standing of HEI ensures performance of activities described in strategic and mid-term action plans
o HEI financial resources are focused on effective implementation of core activities of the institution
o HEI budget provides funding for scientific research and library functioning and development
o HEI has an effective system of accountability, financial management and control

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements
Should be underlined, that according to provided financial information university has adequate income and expenditure balance sheet for development and investment activities.
University has quiet ambitious development plan, which isn't prioritized and doesn't have financial resource allocation action plan, which can be determined as a weakness. During the site visit and interview Chancellor mentioned that he isn't in charge with financial issues, it was difficult to define how financial resource allocation issues are determined. It was apparent that university doesn't have a financial action plan with planning activities and only accountant issues are covered. There is no institutionalizes budgeting process and fund allocation issues are resolved based on ad hoc decisions. Mid-term financial action plan was requested but not provided, that means that planning activities should be in place. University is getting bigger annually and main target is attraction of foreign students, which is business and profit oriented decision. Thus, financial planning action plan should be in place, which will cover infrastructure development, action plan implementation and sustainability vision.
University should develop/define mid-term and/or long-term budgeting vision, additionally define fund allocation strategy based on development plan to meet targets and verify financial sustainability.
As is stipulated in the Strategic development Plan DTMU has to modernize their business processes for creating a correct, cost –effective financial environment.

Evidences/indicators
SER
Interviews
Appendices 112, 113, 114, 115, 116

Recommendations:
It is recommended to strenghten the Financial Department.
It is recommended to put in place a mid-term and long-term budgeting process.
It is recommended to develop monitoring and evaluation tools for follow-up of financial resources and to steer in a more pro-active way the Financial Department
It is recommended to institutionalize the budgeting process.
Suggestions:
It is suggested to develop monitoring and evaluation tools and to steer more in a pro-active way the Financial Department
Best Practices (if applicable):
Practices, which prove to be exceptionally effective and which may become a benchmark or a model for other higher education institutions
Evaluation

☐ Complies with requirements
       ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
       ☒ Partially complies with requirements
       ☐ Does not comply with requirements