



განათლების ხარისხის განვითარების ეროვნული ცენტრი  
NATIONAL CENTER FOR EDUCATIONAL QUALITY ENHANCEMENT

## **Report on LEPL - TelavilakobGogebashvili State University (TESAU) Authorization**

### **Expert Panel Members**

Chair: Kevin Kendall, Independent Quality Assurance Expert, United Kingdom.

Members:

Giorgi Chakvetadze, Tbilisi State University, Georgia.

Irakli Khvtisiashvili, Vice President Association, STAB.

Ekaterine Bakaradze, International Black Sea University, Georgia.

Nana Dikhaminjia, Ilia State University, Georgia.

Natia Andguladze, Ilia State University, Georgia.

Tbilisi  
2018

## Authorization Report Resume

### General information on the educational institution

Telavi University, which is located in the town of Telavi in Georgia, is an autonomous state higher educational institution that was awarded state university status in 1999. The University offers 30 educational programmes of which 14 are Bachelors, 10 are master's and 4 are Doctoral programmes. The remaining two are teacher training and Georgian language preparation programmes. The programmes are taught in the Georgian language. There are 1,324 active students enrolled at the University and a total of 595 have suspended status. Of the active students, 1,159 are on Bachelors programmes, 90 on Masters programmes and 34 on Doctoral programmes. There are also 14 students enrolled on the 60-credit teacher training programme. The University employs 330 staff of which 104 are academic staff and 96 are affiliated.

The University website ([www.tesau.edu.ge](http://www.tesau.edu.ge)) states that there are five faculties, namely, Humanities, Agricultural Sciences, Educational sciences, Exact and Natural Sciences and Social Sciences, Business and Law. Programmes offered include History, Georgian Language and Literature, English Language and Literature, Food Technology, Agronomy, Viticulture, Primary Education, Biology, Ecology, Climatology, Information Technology, Mathematics, Business Administration, Law, Public Administration, Tourism, Economics and Teacher Training.

The mission of Telavi State University is to:

- *prepare competitive, highly qualified, morally grounded graduates in different fields, who are faithful to democratic values, principles of democracy and humanism;*
- *build, store and share knowledge in the field of Agricultural Sciences providing specific features of the region;*
- *enhance tourism perspective for regional development and improvement of the field of education;*
- *satisfy educational needs of society;*
- *organize lifelong study-promoting events and make internationalization of education.*

The Vision of the University is by 2025, is:

- *to become the most demanded institution for the population of the Region and ethnic minorities living in Kakheti.*
- *to become one of the innovative universities in the fields of Tourism, Education and Agriculture.*
- *to make a significant contribution to the economic, public and social development of Kakheti region and country.*

### Brief overview of the authorization site visit

The authorization activities were organized by the National Centre for Educational Quality Enhancement in Georgia who also appointed the Panel Members. The University compiled a Self-Evaluation Report (SER) and associated evidence for scrutiny by the panel in advance of the visit to the University. The authorization visit to Telavi University took place from 26 – 28 June 2018. During the visit the panel conducted 28 meetings with staff and students of the University plus alumni and other stakeholders. The Panel also participated in a tour of University facilities.

### Overview of the HEI's compliance with standards

The team judged the University against the seven authorization standards for higher education and found that it complies in three standards, substantially complies in two standards and partially complies in the other two.

It complies in standard 1: Mission and the strategic development of the HEI and there is one example of Best Practice on cooperation with local government, companies and schools to support the development of the Kalketi region and no recommendations in this standard.

The University substantially complies in standard 2: Organisational Structure and Management of the HEI. There are 6 recommendations in this area including internationalisation, the AEMS system, modern survey technologies, plagiarism detection and prevention, increasing awareness of the code of ethics and two suggestions on incorporating the PDCA cycle into the implementation of processes and on academic freedom.

It substantially complies in standard 3: Educational Programmes. There are 6 recommendations in this area including communication with employers, market research, course design, the catalogue of programmes, and preparing graduates for employment. There is one suggestion regarding reviewing the assessment system for some courses.

The University complies in standard 4: Staff of the HEI. There are 2 recommendations in this area including the interrelationship between theory and practice staff training activities. There are also two suggestions on a motivation plan and increasing the number of invited lecturers.

It complies in Standard 5: Students and their support services. There are 3 recommendations in this area including creating an independent student services centre, the functionality of the AEMS system and promoting more student involvement in international activities.

The University partially complies in standard 6: Research, development or other creative work. There are 9 recommendations including research strategy, research productivity, research standards, evaluation criteria, support, attracting young researchers and dissemination of research findings. There is one example of best practice on the communication and shared understanding of the university vision with local businesses and local government.

The University partially complies in Standard 7: Material, information and financial resources. There are 8 recommendations including the infrastructure, building renovation, fire safety and electrical systems, disabled access, library resources, website access and a Learning Management System.

## Summary of Recommendations

1. Develop a detailed plan for optimization of organizational structure and incorporate it into the 3 year Action Plan (2.1).
2. Increase effectiveness of the International Relations unit to ensure successful internationalization (2.1).
3. Develop a detailed plan and timeline for adding necessary functionalities to AEMS system (2.1).
4. Implement modern survey technologies to improve the effectiveness of survey systems and ensure more participation of students and academic staff (2.2).
5. Develop clear mechanisms for plagiarism detection and prevention and ensure increased awareness by students and academic staff (2.3).
6. Increase awareness of Code of Ethics among students and staff. (2.3).
7. Improve the communication with employers to effectively consider and put their proposals into practice (3.1).
8. Conduct market research of the educational programs more frequently and adapt programs to the changing needs of the market, e.g. add more practice-oriented and updated study courses in the programs (3.1).
9. Update the catalogue of educational programmes on the website to ensure accuracy (3.2).
10. Increase the practice component in Bachelor and in Master programmes in order to effectively prepare graduates for employment (3.2).
11. Elaborate methodology for students with different needs, offer individualized programs, study material and facilities for them (3.2).
12. Proficiency level of foreign language should be strengthened in admission preconditions of the all programs, especially for PhD programs so that the students will conduct the research without restraints (3.2).

13. Invite professionals from the regional private and public sector to increase the practical component within the lectures and improve interrelationship between theory and practice (4.1).
14. Consider increasing the budget to enable more comprehensive staff training activities (4.1).
15. Fully implement the student facing functionality of the AEMS system (5.2).
16. Create an independent Student Services Centre to support student activities, advice and career development (5.2).
17. Promote more involvement of students in international activities such as exchange programmes (5.2).
18. Strengthen the capacity to increase research productivity and publication of research papers (6.1).
19. Set standards on university publications and other dissemination activities to avoid the dissemination of scientific work that deviates from commonly accepted academic standards (6.1).
20. Develop evaluation criteria that help students and staff establish high standards of academic work (6.1).
21. Link the university research support activities to clearly defined research development challenges (6.2).
22. Adopt a strategy that helps the university to effectively compete with rival universities in attracting young researchers (6.2).
23. Link the university international research cooperation activities to the university strategic priorities and development needs (6.2).
24. Establish a system for the internal review of research performance of individual departments in order to develop interventions aimed at improving research performance (6.3).
25. Establish clear indicators for quality and ethical research for the publications of the university (6.3).
26. Enable the information on university research output to be accessible to the wider community (6.3).
27. Renovate the buildings as appropriate to provide a safe and appropriate studying and working environment for students and staff (7.1).
28. Ensure that all buildings have appropriate fire safety and electrical systems (7.1).
29. Ensure that all buildings have suitable access for people with disabilities (7.1).
30. Ensure library staff have sufficient competence in the English language to provide effective support on using electronic databases for students (7.2).
31. Ensure the library has sufficient resources to meet the needs of staff and students (7.2).
32. Develop the regulations for restricting students' access to improper or unsafe websites (7.3).
33. Increase the functionality of the Learning Management System to ensure a more effective education process (7.3).
34. Endeavour to find funds to provide the infrastructure for the future development of the University (7.4).

## Summary of Suggestions

1. Consider incorporating the PDCA cycle into the implementation of processes (2.2).
2. Clearly define the Principles of Academic Freedom and their support mechanisms in the Code of Ethics (2.3).
3. Review the assessment system for some courses based on the specifications of the course (3.3)
4. Implement a financial motivation plan for administrative and academic staff to improve commitment from the employees (4.1).
5. Consider increasing the number of invited lecturers from both Georgia and abroad (4.2).

## Summary of the best practices







1. The cooperation with local government, companies and schools to support the development of the Kalketi region (1.1).
2. The communication and shared understanding of the university vision with local businesses and local government (6.1).

## Summary table

	Standard	Complies with Requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
1.	<b>Mission and strategic development of HEI</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
1.1	Mission of HEI	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
1.2	Strategic development	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2.	<b>Organizational structure and management of HEI</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2.1	Organizational structure and management		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2.2	Internal quality assurance mechanisms	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2.3	Observing principles of ethics and integrity	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
3.	<b>Educational Programmes</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
3.1	Design and development of educational programmes	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
3.2	Structure and content of educational programmes	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
3.3	Assessment of learning outcomes	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
4	<b>Staff of the HEI</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
4.1.	Staff management	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
4.2.	Academic/Scientific and invited Staff workload	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
5	<b>Students and their support services</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
5.1.	The Rule for obtaining and changing student status, the recognition of education, and student rights	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
5.2	Student support services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
6	<b>Research, development and/or other creative work</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
6.1.	Research activities	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
6.2.	Research support and internationalization	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
6.3.	Evaluation of research activities	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

7	<b>Material, information and financial resources</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
7.1	Material resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
7.2.	Library resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
7.3	Information resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
7.4	Financial resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### Signature of expert panel members:

1. Kevin Kendall (Chair) 
2. Ekaterine Bakaradze (Member) 
3. Nana Dikhaminjia (Member) 
4. Natia Andguladze (Member) 
5. Irakli Khvtisiashvili (Member) 
6. Giorgi Chakvetadze (Member) 

# Compliance of the Authorization Applicant HEI with the Authorization Standard Components

## 1. Mission and strategic development of HEI

Mission statement of a HEI defines its role and place within higher education area and broader society. Directions for strategic development of HEI corresponds with the mission of an institution, are based on the goals of the institution and describe means for achieving these goals.

### 1.1 Mission of HEI

Mission Statement of the HEI corresponds to Georgia's and European higher education goals, defines its role and place within higher education area and society, both locally and internationally.

#### **Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements**

The University Mission Statement defines its role locally and internationally. According to the interviews with staff, graduates and employers, the Mission Statement responds to the Kakheti region challenges, the priorities have changed within the region during recent years and the university flexibly responds to the new opportunities. Within the University, based on the information collected from staff, students, society, employers and other stakeholders through the intensive interviews the panel identified three main priorities: agricultural sector, tourism and the education field. As stated by the Rector during meetings, the working plan was delivered, and a monitoring group was created to support data analysis and collection process.

Based on the collected information the Academic Council established the Mission statement and the strategic development plan, through that process the three priorities are implemented within the university and shared by all staff.

The University is planning new research developments particularly in wine making, grain analysis, agricultural map plotting, soil and microbiological analysis, and regional and village history research. Currently most of the work is analysis but the University plans to develop more research activity in the future.

For the reason of strategic geographical location in Kakheti region, cultural tourism and agro business are the major challenges for the University on the country level development perspective. Accordingly, these are directly emphasized in the mission statement. The mission is based on Georgian and European higher education goals; it defines the role and place of the University. Also, provides specificity of the region and is based on University goals, objectives that are shared by the society. The mission of the university is fully shared by different stakeholders like students, staff, employees and local municipality. At the same time, the University delivers qualified teachers for the whole region and fulfills its third priority. It is strategic supplier of the teachers for the entire region.

The Personal development of the Student and the Academic staff is indicated in the strategic goals. At the same time, the University has signed memorandums of understanding with potential employers and collaborates in the job fairs that support potential employment opportunities for the students. However the career development department was created recently and needs further improvements and growth.

The University arranges different social activities in environmental protection, conducts public lectures, and educates local stakeholders regarding eco/Bio agricultural production processes.

#### **Evidences/indicators**

Interviews with Rector, Vice Rector, Quality Assurance office, Heads of Program, Deans, Faculty representatives, Academic Council and Employers, Career Growth and development manager.  
Mission statement (CD 2 attached file 1.1.).

<p>Memorandums of understanding.</p> <p>List of conducted activities presented in the self-evaluation report.</p> <p>Website (<a href="http://tesau.edu.ge">tesau.edu.ge</a>).</p>
<p><b>Recommendations:</b></p> <p>None.</p>
<p><b>Suggestions:</b></p> <p>None</p>
<p><b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b></p> <p>The cooperation with local government, companies and schools to support the development of the Kakheti region.</p>
<p><b>Evaluation</b></p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>
<p><b>1.2 Strategic Development</b></p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• HEI has a strategic development (7-year) and an action plans (3-year) in place.</li> <li>• HEI contributes to the social development of the country, shares with the society the knowledge gathered in the institution, and facilitates lifelong learning</li> <li>• HEI evaluates implementation of strategic and action plans, and duly acts on evaluation results.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b></p> <p>The University's strategic plan fully supports the achievement of its goals. It has established a 7-year strategic development plan and 3-year strategic action plan. Goals are achievable, time-bound and their implementation results are measurable and shared by the stakeholders. Strategic development and action plans are worked out in accordance with the strategic planning regulation approved by the Academic Council.</p> <p>According to the strategic planning regulation University monitors and analysis the fulfillment of the strategic plan. Based on the interviews, each department of the university is involved in the evaluation of the goals and its assessment. Goals are formulated on the operational level and controlled by the middle level of the university.</p> <p>Through the collaborative process, different stakeholders are very aware of the main objectives which was very clear during meetings held by the panel. The objectives are targeted at the improvement of the learning environment and further development of social cultural responsibilities. The University has a hierarchical mechanism to control and monitor the strategic implementation process.</p> <p>Academic staff of the University aims to introduce their research findings to the society in the field of cultural tourism, agriculture and education to enhance the development of the Kakheti region. The University collaborates in Career Fairs to improve employment rate and students participate in environmental protection activities.</p> <p>The University strongly depends on state support, the renovation of the first building is planned with changing the electric system and installing an elevator in the main building. According to the budget 2018, the University only has internal budget of 50,000 GEL for infrastructural improvements and developments.</p> <p>Based on interviews conducted with all sectors of the institution, it is evident that the University staff have a clear understanding of their main priorities and their integration in, and contribution to the region.</p> <p>In summary, the strategic plan covers all aspects that are vital for the University's development, quality assurance works reasonably well and supports the performance process, planning and implementation of educational programmes are an ongoing process and different sectors of the university are involved in it, student body planning takes place within the institution, research activities are a part of the process although not yet well developed, material resources are improving over time and student services and infrastructure are undergoing gradual improvement, although additional capital is needed to fully implement their aspirations. However, University has</p>



strong support from Shota Rustaveli foundation and other governmental and non-governmental funds that simultaneously and gradually support the research activities of the University. Based on the interviews different private regional wineries support University with research infrastructure to develop ongoing agricultural research activities.

#### **Evidences/indicators**

Interviews with Quality Assurance office, Heads of Program, Deans, Faculty representatives, Academic Council and Employers, Career Growth and development manager, Material resource manager, Representative council.

Seven year strategic Plan 2018

Three year Action plan 2018

Strategic development and three-year action plans of the University (CD 2 attached file 1.2.);

Strategic planning rule of the University (CD 2 attached file 1.3.);

List of activities implemented and planned by the University regarding contribution in the development of society (CD 2 attached file 1.4.);

Mechanisms of monitoring the realization of the University strategic development action plans (CD 2 attached file 1.5.);

Annual reports of TeSaU activities (considering the action plan) (CD 2 attached file 1.6.).

Website (tesau.edu.ge).

#### **Recommendations:**

None.

#### **Suggestions:**

None.

#### **Best Practices (if applicable):**

None.

#### **Evaluation**

- ☒ Complies with requirements
- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

## **2. Organizational Structure and Management of HEI**

Organizational structure and management of the HEI is based on best practices of the educational sector, meaning effective use of management and quality assurance mechanisms in the management process. This approach ensures implementation of strategic plan, integration of quality assurance function into management process, and promotes principles of integrity and ethics

### **2.1 Organizational structure and management**

- Organizational structure of HEI ensures implementation of goals and activities described in its strategic plan
- Procedures for election/appointment of the management bodies of HEI are transparent, equitable, and in line with legislation
- HEI's Leadership/Management body ensures effective management of the activities of the institution
- Considering the mission and goals of HEI, leadership of the HEI supports international cooperation of the institution and the process of internationalization.

#### **Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements**

The organizational structure of the University mainly ensures implementation of activities described in its strategic plan and achievement of its goals. The functions and responsibilities of the structural units of the institution are divided correctly. The structural units implement their functions in a coordinated

manner.

The University management uses the “Unified Rule of Case Administration” and “Management Efficiency Monitoring Mechanisms and Evaluation System”. Case administration rules and procedures of the University are in line with acting legislation, available for the University employees and presented on the website.

“Management Efficiency Monitoring Mechanisms and Evaluation System” mainly defines the procedures for conducting surveys among students, academic and administrative staff. The stages of monitoring mechanisms are defined as follows:

- Preparation of questionnaires;
- Conducting the survey;
- Processing data gathered through surveys;
- Draw conclusions on the basis of the data processing;
- Preparation of recommendations;
- Carrying out the activities defined by recommendations and/or reacting on problems

This document also defines:

- 1) Procedures for evaluation of academic staff, where every teaching and research activity of the staff is evaluated by points and calculated summary.
- 2) Procedures for evaluation of administrative staff, mainly by their yearly reports.

It is recommended that “Management Efficiency Monitoring Mechanisms and Evaluation System” define clear mechanisms and benchmarks for monitoring management efficiency besides questionnaires and yearly reports.

For the management the University uses the following information technologies: Electronic System of Doc Flow (eflow.emis.ge) and Automated Education Management System (AEMS). Decisions made by the University management bodies are introduced to the addressee via the Electronic Task Management System of Doc Flow. Educational Institution Registry Office exists at the University that includes information about students and staff in accordance with the legislatively mandated regulation. Automated Education Management System (AEMS) is poorly developed (details are given in the Standard 7.3 – Information Resources), with the scarce functionality compared to other Learning Management Systems existing at the market nowadays. The system is being developed by the hired software developer to add other necessary functionalities, that are defined in the “Information on electronic services and electronic systems of management” (CD 8 attached file 7.18), though management did not present clear plan for the system development. Having detailed concept and timeline for the development of AEMS will increase effectiveness and sustainability of the system developing process. It is also necessary to integrate this process in the 3 year action plan.

Effectiveness of some structural units need to be improved, especially of Quality Assurance Unit, International Relations Unit, Library and Information Resources Unit. In order to fully ensure achievement of the strategic goals, it is recommended to address issues referred to under Student Services, Research, Library and Information Services later in this report.

Currently student services are divided between several units:

- 1) Assistants of Faculty Deans serve students' main needs such as coordination of new students, planning of elective courses and associated issues.
- 2) Student Career Growth and Development Manager helps students to find internships and jobs.
- 3) Student self-government conveys needs of students to Management of the University and plans different extracurricular activities of students.
- 4) Culture Coordinator manages cultural activities for students.
- 5) Sports Coordinator manages sports activities for students.

In this way needs of students are not gathered in one unit that makes it hard to see the whole picture of student needs, prioritize between them and plan actions accordingly.

According to the self-evaluation, the University plans the optimization of organizational structure according to current needs and revised mission, though from interviews with University management it was not clear what optimization is planned. Optimization is mentioned in the strategic and action plans of the University, but without any details. If the University plans optimization of the academic and administrative staff, it is necessary to develop a plan and timeline for optimization, as well define the main shortcomings of the existing organizational structure to understand how optimization should be done and what benefits University will get from the process.

The University has transparent and equitable procedures for election and appointment of the management bodies in line with legislation.

Decisions of management related to academic, scientific and administrative issues are made in timely and mostly effective manner, though there were several complaints against decisions related to elections of academic staff that were solved by Ethics Committee or by formal appeals. The University has changed the staff appointment procedures that now involve invitation of external experts to make procedures more reliable. According to management, academic and administrative staff, these changes improved the process and increased the trust of the election results.

The University has recently developed a Business Continuity Plan (BCP) whose functions are:

- Identification of critical events;
- Establishing necessary resources for avoiding business-obstructions;
- Business-process continuity and regaining an ordinary regime in a minimal period of time.

The University has an internationalization policy, that defines support activities for international mobility of students, academic and administrative staff, joint education programmes, development of curricula and international research collaboration. Internationalization policy document is very general, describing beneficial results of the past activities and emphasizing needs of Internationalization of the University, but not giving any clear plan or steps for implementing it. The university does some activities from the list in the , however number of staff and students undertaking mobility is still low. Foreign professor-teachers visiting Telavi State University under the international projects: In 2014-2015 4 professors, in 2015-2016 – 18 professor/teachers; in 2016-2017 – 20 professor/teachers; in 2017-2018 – 26 professor/teachers.

**Academic and administrative staff visiting foreign universities through the mobility under the international projects:** In 2014-2015 13 academic personnel, in 2015-2016 – 8 academic personnel; in 2016-2017 – 16 academic/administrative personnel; in 2017-2018 – 17 academic/administrative personnel.

**Students visiting foreign universities through the mobility (for study purposes/practice):** In 2014-2015 – 4 students; in 2015-2016 – 3 students; in 2016-2017 – 15 students; in 2017-2018 – 16 students.

**Foreign students visiting Telavi University through the mobility (for study purposes/practice):** In 2015-2016 – 1 student; in 2016-2017 – 2 students.

**Academic/administrative staff involved in projects:** In 2014-2015 – there were 16 academic/administrative personnel; in 2015-2016 – 18 academic/administrative personnel; in 2016-2017 – 19 academic/administrative personnel; in 2017-2018 – 21 academic/administrative personnel.

These projects contain very little international research activities and there are no joint programmes.

For internationalization goals it is necessary to increase the effectiveness of the International Relations unit, especially in the direction of research.

#### **Evidences/indicators**

Interviews with University Management, Academic Council, Academic Staff, Administrative Staff and Students.

Structure of the University (file 2.1).

Regulations of Structural Units: Regulation about the Rule of Electing Management Bodies of the University and Faculties (file 2.2; file 2.3).

Rule of Case Administration (file 2.4).

Business Process Continuity Plan (file 2.5).

Management Efficiency Monitoring Mechanisms and Evaluation System (file 2.6).

Internationalization Policy (file 2.7).

International Cooperation and Internationalization Mechanisms and their Efficiency Assessing analysis (file 2.8).

Staff and Students' Survey Findings with the purpose of Promoting International Cooperation and

Internationalization (file 2.10). Website (tesau.edu.ge).
<b>Recommendations:</b> Develop a detailed plan for optimization of organizational structure and incorporate it into the 3 year Action Plan. Increase effectiveness of the International Relations unit to ensure successful internationalization Develop a detailed plan and timeline for adding necessary functionalities to AEMS system.
<b>Suggestions:</b> None.
<b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b> None.
<b>Evaluation</b> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="radio"/> <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements
<b>2.2 Internal quality assurance mechanisms</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>o Institution effectively implements internal quality assurance mechanisms. Leadership of the institution constantly works to strengthen quality assurance function and promotes establishment of quality culture in the institution.</li> <li>o HEI has a mechanism for planning student body, which will give each student an opportunity to get a high-quality education.</li> </ul>
<b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b> <p>The University has a Quality Assurance Department, which coordinates the work of internal quality assurance mechanisms and their compatibility with external quality assurance mechanisms. Besides University administration and academic staff, quality assurance mechanisms involve participation of other stakeholders, such as employees, alumni and students. The University has developed performance evaluation procedures of its academic and administrative staff. Academic staff are evaluated based on student survey results and by research and teaching activities, such as active participation in the ongoing research projects; getting research grants; publishing scientific papers and books; presenting at the seminars, workshops and conferences, etc.</p> <p>Administrative staff are evaluated based on the surveys of other staff, direct assessment by managers and by yearly reports of their fulfilled activities. The University also evaluates academic performance of the students, though formally there are not defined any further steps to increase performance.</p> <p>The University had developed procedures for developing new educational programmes and evaluating existing programmes through questionnaires, direct assessment by quality assurance department, involving students, alumni and employers.</p> <p>The quality assurance system uses the PDCA (Plan, Do, Check, Act) cycle for continuous assessment of University activities and resources, though according to the self-evaluation report the cycle is only used for assessment development and implementation purposes rather than for implementation of real processes.</p> <p>The Quality Assurance department conducts surveys among students and staff and the survey results are used by the University management for assessment and improvement of University processes, such as work environment, communication, decision making, organizational culture, administration, staff development and material resources.</p> <p>. However, participation in the surveys is not mandatory and to ensure higher participation, surveys are mainly conducted through paper questionnaires and direct questioning with the help of student members of Student Self-Governance Unit. This kind of surveys lowers the probability of participants answering honestly, therefore it is recommended to use different approaches to surveys. According to the Quality Assurance department interviews, they are going to implement online surveys, but currently the system is mostly based on paper questionnaires. To increase effectiveness of the surveys, it is recommended to use modern technologies and incorporate surveys into a Learning Management Information System (AEMS).</p> <p>The University has developed mechanisms for student body planning to ensure quality of educational programs and they are defined thoroughly in the document "Methodology for determining the ratio of</p>

staff and students and marginal body of students" The mechanisms take into account several characteristics, such as Material-technical resource/bases of the university (fixed and liquid assets, library resource), Human resource (administrative, academic, invited, support staff and other persons required for the programme implementation) and Specifics of educational programmes.

Besides the definition of minimum number of professors, administrative and support staff necessary for each program and desirable student/staff ration, student body planning is based on the following parameters:

- Maximum class hours possible in the classroom a week
- Number of classrooms
- Hourly and weekly load of the classroom
- Number of groups in the auditorium
- Number of groups
- Weekly teaching load of a group.

#### **Evidences/indicators**

Interviews with Management, Academic Staff, Administrative Staff, Quality Assurance Office and Students.

Internal Evaluation Mechanisms for Quality Assurance (CD3 attached file 2.11).

Surveys and their findings (CD 3 attached file 2.12).

Regulation of Quality Assurance Department (CD 2 attached file 2.2 attached file 2.2.19).

Programme Evaluation Forms (CD 3 attached file 2.11 attached file 1).

Staff Evaluation Forms (CD 3 attached file 2.11 attached file 2).

Strategic Development Plan (CD 2 attached file 1.2).

Methodology for determining the ratio of staff and students and marginal body of students (CD 3 attached file 2.14).

Rule for regulating the learning process (CD 4 attached file 3.11).

Report on using Quality Evaluation Results (CD3 attached file 2.13).

#### **Recommendations:**

Implement modern survey technologies to improve the effectiveness of survey systems and ensure more participation of students and academic staff.

#### **Suggestions:**

Consider incorporating the PDCA cycle into the implementation of processes.

#### **Best Practices (if applicable):**

None.

#### **Evaluation**

- ☐ Complies with requirements
- ☒ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

#### **2.3. Observing principles of ethics and integrity**

- HEI has developed regulations and mechanisms that follow principles of ethics and integrity. Such regulations are publicly accessible.
- Institution has implemented mechanisms for detecting plagiarism and its prevention.
- HEI follows the principles of academic freedom.

#### **Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements**

The University has established a Code of Ethics that is publicly accessible and every student, as well as

administrative and academic staff is obliged to read and adhere to it. Conflict issues are solved through the Ethics Committee. However, in spite of the fact that every student and staff is required to read code of ethics by the contract, interviews reveal that some students and lecturers are not well informed about Code of Ethics, they only know about existence and responsibilities of Ethics Committee. Code of Ethics also defines that the University follows the principles of academic freedom. However, principles in this document are given only generally and lacks the detailed description. Though interviews with academic staff show that the University ensures main principles of academic freedom, such as intellectual freedom in educational and research contexts, and supporting freedoms of belief, expression, discussion, and inquiry.

The University has proper regulations how to react on the cases of plagiarism defined in the document "Rule for detecting plagiarism" but doesn't have clear mechanisms for detecting plagiarism and its prevention. The University plans to implement the computer system for detecting plagiarism within the framework of the project Erasmus + (INTEGRITY). However, having software is not sufficient for detecting and preventing plagiarism, especially with Georgian texts. This kind of software is an additional tool but not the replacement for the system of detecting and preventing plagiarism, that should be based on increasing awareness among professors and students, as well as distinct mechanisms for reaction on the different types of plagiarism. Interviews with students and academic staff shows that some of them are not aware about such mechanisms at the University. It is necessary to develop proper mechanisms for prevention and detection of various kinds of plagiarism and increase awareness related to this issue among students and academic staff.

#### **Evidences/indicators**

Interviews with HEI Management, Ethics Committee Head, Academic Council, Academic Staff, Administrative Staff and Students.

Code of Ethics (file 2.15).

Plagiarism Detection Rule (file 2.16).

Internal Regulation (file 2.17).

#### **Recommendations:**

Develop clear mechanisms for plagiarism detection and prevention and ensure increased awareness by students and academic staff.

Increase awareness of Code of Ethics among students and staff.

#### **Suggestions:**

Clearly define the Principles of Academic Freedom and their support mechanisms in the Code of Ethics.

#### **Best Practices (if applicable):**

None.

#### **Evaluation**

- ☐ Complies with requirements
- ☒ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

### **3. Educational Programmes**

HEI has procedures for planning, designing, approving, developing and annulling educational programmes. Programme learning outcomes are clearly defined and are in line with the National Qualifications Framework. A programme ensures achievement of its objectives and intended learning outcomes

#### **3.1 Design and development of educational programmes**

HEI has a policy for planning, designing, implementing and developing educational programmes.

#### **Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements**

The University has a methodology for planning, designing, implementing and developing educational

programmes. The relevant documents describe this process in particular meaning that there exists policy and mechanism approved by Academic Council. However, no regulation gives information regarding persons entitled to initiate the designing of a new educational programme (e.g. Dean, Head of the programme or any professor) and what factors are provided in the design process. The staff interviews show that they (Academic Council members, Faculty members and Heads of the Departments) are not fully aware about who can initiate the programme and what relevant factors provide for the process of implementation.

During the interview the heads of the program state that they conduct the market research before the elaboration of the program. Academic staff, potential students, alumni, employers are involved. The interviews with the stakeholders evidence that their involvement is mostly formal and they can not recall suggestions made for the improvement of the programmes. There is also no evidence of participation of any international expert of the field in the development of any of the existing programs.

New course initiation also needs a specific methodology to address the market requirements. In certain programmes courses haven't been updated recently and where they are updated, mostly it is done in accordance with the experience of the existing academic personnel (what they can deliver) rather than inviting a new lecturer with the expertise in the specific field.

Among other stakeholders, potential entrants are also participating in research. At the interview with public and private sector representatives the respondents admit that they employ the most part of high achieving graduates and are actively participating in programme evaluation from time to time in order to develop the programmes and outcomes.

If needed, the Academic Council is entitled to decide to close a programme and the students are given the opportunity to continue studying at other programmes at the University or at other higher educational institutions in Georgia. The university has signed a memorandum of cooperation in which the relevant educational programme is implemented jointly. This fact is evidenced through memoranda that the University has signed with different education institutions. Though it is desirable to increase the work in this direction as there is a low number of exchange students from the University to the international partner universities.

In terms of programme development the head of the programme ensures the continuing development and updating of the programme taking into account several factors, among them is monitoring the students' academic performance and learning outcomes to identify which of the courses is the most difficult to pass, to identify the content of the course matches with the allocated credit, though in most of the programs ECTS given to the courses were not corresponding to the contact hours allocated to them.

The credits allocated for each course in all the curricula of the university are determined by the volume specified for them. Consequently, the contact hours in courses are determined accordingly. The author of the course determines how many contact and independent hours will be necessary for delivering and acquiring the material of any volume effectively and makes their allocation in the course. Taking this into consideration, contact hours range from: 30, 45, 60 hours within the semester. Accordingly, the hours for students' independent work are defined.

#### **Evidences/indicators**

Educational Programmes and syllabi.

Labour market analysis.

Various surveys conducted by the University.

Guidance on planning, designing, implementing, developing and annulling educational programmes.

Interviews with staff, students and other stakeholders.

Website ([tesau.edu.ge](http://tesau.edu.ge)).

#### **Recommendations:**

Improve the communication with employers to effectively consider and put their proposals into practice.

Conduct market research of the educational programs more frequently and adapt programs to the

changing needs of the market, e.g. add more practice-oriented and updated study courses in the programs.

**Suggestions:**

None.

**Best Practices (if applicable):**

None.

**Evaluation**

- ☐ Complies with requirements
- ☒ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

**3.2 Structure and content of educational programmes**

- o Programme learning outcomes are clearly stated and are in line with higher education level and qualification to be granted
- o With the help of individualized education programmes, HEI takes into consideration various requirements, needs and academic readiness of students, and ensures their unhindered involvement into the educational process.

**Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements**

In the process of creating a new programme the University follows current legislation and the ECTS system. The learning outcomes of the programme are in line with the higher education standards programme and are clearly defined to achieve learning outcomes by a student with an average academic performance within a reasonable timeframe. Though during the interviews the staff admit that in particular cases this component is not easily achievable. Namely, when a student has verbal communication problems and it is difficult to assess his /her knowledge, the professor uses a written assessment method by giving less attention to verbal skills improvement. This is essential for the development of transferable skills and thus for the achievement of programme learning outcomes in full.

The structure and content of the programs are logically connected with the program components. All study programs presented for the authorization includes elective and free components. The students are given choice of electing the courses according to their preferences. During the interview the students expressed the desire to have the opportunity to create individual study plans.

Achievement of learning outcomes is defined in the logical timeframe, by considering the specificity of the concrete field.

The workload of the students in the programmes thus consists of various components, such as lecture, group work, laboratory, practical and independent work. It is important that each course should be allocated sufficient number of academic hours for achieving the learning outcomes. Some compulsory components of the programmes have the incorrect distribution of contact hours between lecture and seminars /working groups. The panel suggests that in order to achieve the learning outcomes completely, the compulsory courses with two contact hours should be allocated with additional two hours for seminars /group work.

The volume of the programme components (study course, research, practice) at the University are defined by content, learning outcomes and field specificities. The regulated professions follow the legislation requirements. The University conducts various types of surveys and needs assessments to address the changing needs of the society and the students. The panel studied all relevant documents for example satisfaction surveys of the students, alumni and employers. They conducted interviews with stakeholders, students, employers and staff and identified that the University attempts to design the courses in accordance with the field specificity to achieve the relevant learning outcomes. Students' academic achievement monitoring is carried out every semester and the results are discussed at the relevant boards, which is also admitted during the interviews.

According to the Self-Evaluation Report, "Some master programmes also include practice". For better programme outcomes, employability and competitiveness it is recommended that as well as BA, all programs at MA level to include practical components.



Teaching and learning methods which the educational programs are using are relevant to the fields and ensure achievement of the learning outcomes. The staff undergo training organised by local and international organisations and have more expertise to use more modern teaching methods. Though in most of the course syllabi the same teaching / learning methods are used. The panel suggests that all syllabi to be designed in accordance with the specificity of the field and be individual. This would ensure achievement of learning outcomes of the program.

It should be noted that dropout rate at some educational programs is high. The management admits that this is due to increased competition of universities in Tbilisi and some students prefer to get education in capital city rather than in the region.

The University catalog of educational programmes informs stakeholders on the educational activities of the University. The Public Relations Office and faculties are involved in marketing campaigns. During the interviews with various structural units of the University the staff spoke about the various publicity campaigns they conduct regularly in schools and within the university by arranging open days. Public information about programmes is freely available as the programme catalogue is accessible on the University website. Though some programme catalogues provided on the website needs to be updated as there is considerable difference in presented documents and information provided on the website.

There is no student enrolled at the University with special educational needs at the moment though the institution should have methodology elaborated for students with different requirements and offer individualized programs, study material and facilities for them, adapt them to the study environment.

MA and PhD applicants are enrolled in programs in accordance with the Georgian legislation and internal regulations of the University. Each level enrollment comprises with the specific procedures at the University. MA applicants need to pass the specialty exam and also prove the relevant competency of English, PhD applicants need to prove competency of English language, the specific level of foreign language is defined individually by each program. Despite this, most part of the MA and PhD students conduct the interview process in Georgian and it is difficult for them to communicate in English.

#### **Evidences/indicators**

Programmes and course syllabi.

The rule for planning, implementing and evaluating the scientific-research component specified in the Regulation of the Dissertation Board.

Syllabi for the preparation and defense of Master's and Doctoral Theses and related programmes.

Instructions for planning, designing, implementing, developing and annulling the study programmes.

Catalogue of educational programmes.

Website ([tesau.edu.ge](http://tesau.edu.ge)).

#### **Recommendations:**

Update the catalogue of educational programmes on the website to ensure accuracy.

Increase the practice component in Bachelor and in Master programmes in order to effectively prepare graduates for employment.

Elaborate methodology for students with different needs, offer individualized programs, study material and facilities for them.

Proficiency level of foreign language should be strengthened in admission preconditions of the all programs, especially for PhD programs so that the students will conduct the research without restraints.

#### **Suggestions:**

None.

#### **Best Practices (if applicable):**

None.

**Evaluation**

- ☐ Complies with requirements
- ☒ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

**3.3 Assessment of learning outcomes**

HEI has law-compliant, transparent and fair system of learning outcomes assessment, which promotes the improvement of students' academic performance.

**Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements**

The University has law-compliant, transparent and fair system of learning outcomes assessment, which promotes the improvement of students' academic performance. Assessment components and criteria are compiled by the authors of the relevant course by taking into consideration the specifics of study courses. Assessment components are indicated in each syllabus of the course and aimed at achieving the learning outcomes of the syllabus.

Also, despite the fact that internal regulations are under continuous improvement, they are in line with the requirement of current legislation and accessible for any interested person. During the interviews the staff state that they have the freedom of modification of the assessment components, study methods and content of the course in the process of planning the course syllabi and are not bound to follow the syllabi the way it was accredited. However, in most of the courses the lecturers are using the same assessment methods. It would be better to design the syllabi and assessment method according to the course specifics.

The information regarding the course syllabi is available for the student at the beginning of the semester and in the study process the student has the opportunity to monitor his /her assessments, achievements, has contact with the lecturer during the lectures and consultation hours in order to react properly to the achieved results. Though it would be suggested that assessment system for some courses need to be planned according to the individual needs of the students and based on the specifications of the course.

During the interviews students state that the lecturers give them opportunity to improve their results in case of low academic achievement but did not explain exactly how this is implemented. The panel suggests that there should be a mechanism developed, for example, peer teaching (when students teach each other) or any other form for increasing the knowledge and performance of the students to achieve the results needed.

The University has a fair assessment system and are guided by the relevant regulations. During the interviews the students state that they have information on the procedure of how to appeal their assessment results. They are aware of the rules of postponing the examinations, when and how to apply to the exam center (within 2 working days after revealing the results and request to look through the work and revise the results on the basis of the application and/or complaint) and the Faculty. Analysis of students' academic performance is undertaken each semester and are discussed at the faculty board.

**Evidences/indicators**

Instruction for conducting the examinations by the Examination Center.

The Rule on regulating the University study process.

Interviews with staff and students.

**Recommendations:****Suggestions:**

Review the assessment system for some courses based on the specifications of the course.

**Best Practices (if applicable):**

None.

**Evaluation**

- ☒ Complies with requirements  
☐ Substantially complies with requirements  
☐ Partially complies with requirements  
☐ ☐ Does not comply with requirements

**4. Staff of the HEI**

HEI ensures that the staff employed in the institution (academic, scientific, invited, administrative, support) are highly qualified, so that they are able to effectively manage educational, scientific and administrative processes and achieve the goals defined by the strategic plan of the institution. On its hand, the institution constantly provides its staff with professional development opportunities and improved work conditions.

**4.1. Staff Management**

- HEI has staff management policy and procedures that ensure the implementation of educational process and other activities defined in its strategic plan.
- HEI ensures the employment of qualified academic/scientific/invited/administrative/ support staff.

**Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements**

The University has a strongly developed Personal Management system; the main principles are equality, fairness, openness, qualification, attraction and recruiting. The Management policy makes human resources relevant to the university strategy and is aimed at promoting achievement of the university strategy and functional goals. The staff management policy is based on the following principles: merit-based attitude, fairness, equality and transparency. The staff management process involves the following main steps: planning labour resources, recruitment/selection; staff development (defining salary and privileges, adaptation, teaching), evaluating work activities and responding according to the results.

According to the conducted interviews, appointment of academic staff at the university is accomplished in accordance with the regulation on "Integrated Rule for Academic Staff Employment". The process is transparent and fair. The amount of staff changes is in correlation with new challenges and external environment factors. The number of the academic staff at the university is 104. The number of educational programmes at the university higher education stage is 28. Ratio between employees and programmes is about 4/1. Based on the interviews with staff, the University supports professional development of its staff. In particular, procedures of raising staff qualification and training are occasionally held. According to the provided documents and interviews, surveys are conducted at the university in order to define requirements. According to the survey results specific training courses are planned for the target group. University also plans to elaborate and offer various training courses of continuous education mostly delivered by different stakeholders for free. Also, the University has created two types of surveys for staff management, firstly the evaluation from the employees (administrative, support, academic, invited staff), which is anonymous; and secondly evaluating employees from the employer's point of view. At the same time, university plans to use evaluation and satisfaction research results in management process.

Based on personal management system new staff are appointed based on evaluation and competition principles. The University had a legal case, University versus Ana Abashidze and won court of first instance and the Highest instance.

The University has quality assurance system and quality manager is responsible for the quality control mechanisms and performance.

University has clearly defined and organized remuneration system. Nevertheless, like in previous years, the budget does not provide any bonus plan and financial motivation activities. Nevertheless, staff are attending some international/local projects as indicated in the Personal management System. Accordingly, Staff has suitable qualifications to perform the education process at the University. On the other hand, for staff development and training budget is only 5000 GEL annually. The University dedicates 35,000 GEL for library development, for research it presents 35,000 GEL, for scientific costs 25,000 GEL, for international and local projects 23,500 GEL. This does contribute to staff management and development. There is also a low number of invited personnel from the business field to promote

<p>practical application during lectures.</p> <p>University strictly follows the affiliation terms and conditions, supports involvement of academic and scientific staff in education, research and decision-making processes.</p>
<p><b>Evidences/indicators</b></p> <p>Interview with Human Resource Department, Academic staff, invited staff, Alumni and employers.</p> <p>Budget 2018, Personal development system article N16 27/03/2018.</p> <p>Internal and External evaluation quality assurance document.</p> <p>Staff management policy (CD 5 attached file 4.1.).</p> <p>Qualification requirements and job description (CD 5 attached file 4.6 and CD 3 attached file 2.2 (job description is shown in regulations)).</p> <p>Samples of contracts signed with staff (CD 5 attached file 4.7).</p> <p>Staff distribution according to their age and gender (CD 5 attached file 4.3).</p> <p>Documentation proving staff qualification (CD 5 attached file 4.2).</p> <p>Rules and surveys for evaluating staff management efficiency (CD 5 attached file 4.5).</p>
<p><b>Recommendations:</b></p> <p>Invite professionals from the regional private and public sector to increase the practical component within the lectures and improve interrilationship between theory and practice.</p> <p>Consider increasing the budget to enablemore comprehensivestaff training activities.</p>
<p><b>Suggestions:</b></p> <p>Implement financial motivation plan for administrative and academic staff to improve commitment from the employees.</p>
<p><b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b></p> <p>None.</p>
<p><b>Evaluation</b></p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="radio"/> <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>
<p><b>4.2. Academic/Scientific and Invited Staff Workload</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Number and workload of academic/scientific and invited staff is adequate to HEI's educational programmes and scientific-research activities, and also other functions assigned to them</li> </ul>
<p><b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b></p> <p>The University has implemented the annual teaching and scientific-methodological workload scheme of the academic staff, teachers, invited professors and lecturers, that identifies workload criteria for the academic staff, teachers and specialists invited under the contract, more specifically, the amount of their annual workload, hourly standards for each educational activity connected with study process. The workload for the academic staff at the university is 1000 hours.</p> <p>The annual teaching and scientific-methodological workload scheme of the academic staff, teachers, invited professors and lecturers determines workload norms for the academic staff, teachers and specialists invited under the contract, in particular, the amount of their annual workload, hourly standards for each educational activity connected with study process.</p> <p>The University distributes the number of hours based to the semesters and individual workload scheme is filled for every academic employee at the beginning of each semester. At the end of the semester the workload is compared with the fulfilled work. It uses academic workload and scientific work criteria as main components of annual workload for academic staff, teachers, invited professors and lecturers.</p>

Academic positions like the rector, vice rector, head of administration, deputy head of administration, dean, assistant dean, head of the university and faculty quality assurance department, head of support structural units of the university have decreased their annual academic workload by 50 percent and their payment schema is affected accordingly.

In meetings it was stated that the university administration discusses and evaluates the results of academic and scientific annual workload of the academic staff, teachers and specialists invited under the contract. The University has clear presentation of weekly workload for professors, associate professors, assistant professors and assistants.

The affiliation rule for the academic staff of the university is followed, weekly academic workload for the affiliated academic staff does not exceed 22 hours that complies with maximum limit along with the research workload defined by the Labour Code. Most of the academic staff (96 persons) are affiliated to the University.

The number of the academic staff at the university is 104. The number of educational programs at the university higher education stage is 28. Ratio between employees and programs is about 4/1. Given management and workload structure grants the University is able to deliver teaching and research processes successfully.

As indicated in the Self Evaluation Report the University plans to optimize academic staff in accordance with the strategic plan, priorities and the budget of the university, encourage the affiliated academic staff with the purpose of raising efficiency of their scientific work, hold a training course "Modern Teaching Methods" and to offer lecturers free courses of foreign language and information technologies.

According to the interview with the University lawyer, the University had six court cases regarding the employment issues, all of them were won by university. Ana Abashidze case was a challenge for the university and supported staff selection process and clarified standards. Based on the interview, after the court case university clearly and straightforwardly peculiarized academic staff appointment criteria and formalized appointment requirements to very specific details. Accordingly, the entire appointment mechanism became more detailed and controlled.

The University has the motivation system through promotion, certificates, financing conference and publications. For staff training University is supported from the stakeholders and free training is conducted on a regular basis.

Heads of departments support the workload planning and control on every faculty. The process is well organized and supported.

Staff resources are controlled by three-layer system according to the personal monitoring regulation implemented within the university. During the interviews staff presented solid knowledge of the management procedures and entire HRM system, they realize the functional layer of the University and their belongingness to very specific department of the functional structure. From the responsibility side university has well organized and formal authority split procedure between different job positions that are realized by the staff members.

According to the students it is preferable to increase amount of the invited lecturers to share with country wide and international experience and knowledge. Simultaneously, according to the Human Resources department, the University tries to attract invited lecturers from abroad (France) and Tbilisi.

The University employees invited lecturers from Tbilisi, the main workload of the given staff is in other Universities, government and private institutions. However, Telavi State University tries to attract lecturers from Capital city and provides opportunity to the students to share practical and theoretical experience with one class in week involvement.

#### **Evidences/indicators**

Order of the Head of Administration regarding annual workload of the academic staff at LEPL IakobGogebashvili Telavi State University by the head of administration (CD 5 attached file 4.8; order 2/200).

Workload schemes for academic and invited staff in other HEIs as well (CD 5 attached file 4.8).

Documents of academic staff for the competition (orders of competition announcement, election or appointment) (CD 5 attached file 4.4).

Affiliation rule (CD 5 attached file 4.9).

Methodology defining ratio between students and staff members and maximum marginal number of

students (CD 5 attached file 4.10). Instructions for planning, elaborating, fulfilling, developing and cancelling academic educational programmes (CD 4 attached file 3.1).
<b>Recommendations:</b> None.
<b>Suggestions:</b> Considerincreasingthe number of invited lecturers from both Georgia and abroad.
<b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b> None.
<b>Evaluation</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><input checked="" type="checkbox"/>Complies with requirements</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/>Substantially complies with requirements</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</li> <li><input type="radio"/> <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</li> </ul>

## 5. Students and their support services

HEI ensures the development of student-centred environment, offers appropriate services, including career support mechanisms; it also ensures maximum awareness of students, implements diverse activities and promotes student involvement in these activities. HEI utilizes student survey results to improve student support services

<b>5.1. The Rule for obtaining and changing student status, the recognition of education, and student rights</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>For each of the educational levels, HEI has developed regulations for assignment, suspension and termination of student status, mobility, qualification granting, issuing educational documents as well as recognition of education received during the learning period.</li> <li>HEI ensures the protection of student rights and lawful interests.</li> </ul>
<b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b> <p>Regulations regarding to student status, suspension, termination, mobility and recognition of the qualification are in line with current legislation of Georgia. All this information is accessible for students and all interested parties.</p> <p>Students are able to monitor their academic activity and get information regarding their studying process from administration by electronic programme (AEMS). This electronic system is widely used by students. During meetings students stated that they would like the IT department to activate all the functions of AEMS to use it in more relevant way, because now they have only possibility to monitor their academic activity. For example to have possibility to receive administrative-legislation acts concerning student's status by AEMS. Also at AEMS can be added syllabuses and this would more effectively support students learning process. The University cares for students' rights and legal interest protection. After enrolling at the university, students sign a contract, which provides student's rights protection mechanisms. Students are familiarized with the content of the contract before signing it. One copy of the contract is given to the student. Students are aware of the committee of ethics, which is functioning at the university. At interview process administrative representatives presented a case regarding to the conflict with a student and examination center. This case was discussed by the faculty council in which a student also participated. Regarding the transcript of faculty council this issue was solved without contraveningany students' rights. In addition, Students Self-Governance have a department for students' rights protection. Any issues raised are discussed at the Committee of Ethics.</p> <p>Appropriate standards covering all of these are described in the university internal regulation. Students rights are explained to them prior to the procedure. Any step of the procedure concerning</p>

student rights and legal interests, is transparent, fair and relevant to the acting law.

**Evidences/indicators**

Regulation Rule of Teaching Process.

Regulation of Examination Center.

TESAU Internal Regulation.

Interviews with staff and students.

**Recommendations:**

Fully implement the student facing functionality of the AEMS system.

**Suggestions:**

None.

**Best Practices (if applicable):**

None.

**Evaluation**

- ☒ Complies with requirements
- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

**5.2 Student support services**

- HEI has student consulting services in order to plan educational process and improve academic performance
- HEI has career support service, which provides students with appropriate counselling and support regarding employment and career development
- HEI ensures students awareness and involvement in various university-level, local and international projects and events, and supports student initiatives
- HEI has mechanisms, including financial mechanisms to support low SES students

**Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements**

The University provides support for students to inform them about educational programmes and constantly cares for planning educational process. The Dean's assistants regularly monitor students' personal affairs and provide them with relevant information based on their needs. Every Dean has assistants to manage this process. Also, academic staff have assigned additional time for consulting the students, which is described in the syllabi of the academic course.

The University has a career enhancement and development manager who provides all the necessary information for the students to their further professional development. During the interview the career enhancement and development manager stated that they have created this office in January 2018. For this time she is working alone for the whole University. But Rector, Head of the administration and directly this manager stated that they already are working to widen this field of interest and additionally employ 3-4 person to achieve more effective outcomes. In the interview with the above-mentioned manager and employers it's clear that the university is in a very close cooperation with the private and public sector to help ensure the future careers of their students. The services for effective and relevant career support for students are an active ongoing process. In addition the university plans to optimize this service to make it more personal. This office will be more oriented on each

student and will work for them individually. They will provide each student or group of students with the relevant information which is really valuable and informative for them. The Career manager constantly informs students and alumni on employment vacancies. During interviews the University stated that they inform students by sending messages on their mobile phones and by emails. Besides all of these the university conducts different kind of surveys of its students and alumni regarding their personal, professional and academic development. The Alumni state that there is a strong feedback to the university regarding future academic and professional development.

Students have effective support and contribute in social activities. The International relations office provides sufficient information on international ongoing events and projects. The University has different memorandums of cooperation with various foreign universities for educational mobility and scientific research, but these are not yet fully implemented. Such kind of experiences without doubt will help students to gain skills needed for further development of professional and individual skills. But, involvement statistic of students in exchange programmes is very low. In general students are aware that there is a possibility to participate in an exchange programmes but the stated that the details of each of them are not promoted to them very well and they are not really aware of which they can participate in.

It's clear that university is effectively encouraging additional extracurricular activities, such as sports, arts and other student initiatives. For sport activities they have got a football and basketball pitch, gymnasium and different spaces for organizing different kind of sport events. This infrastructure however needs renovation. Also, students' self-government actively participates in supporting students educational and sport activities.

University actively cares about national and ethnic minority students providing them within different social and academic activities. It has conducted the international project ``DARE ``. Within the framework of the project, the university has organized academic courses for national and ethnic minorities. The aim of the courses is support the youth of the national and ethnic minorities and improve their linguistic competence. The panel have not however seen any survey results about learning outcomes of these students.

In the case of socially vulnerable students the University has a practice to determine an individual payment schedule. The University administration helps students to fill in applications for obtaining grants offered from the private or public sector. Also the university solicits socially disadvantaged students with various business organizations for financing tuition fees.

#### **Evidences/indicators**

Regulation of the faculties.

Educational programmes and syllabi.

Regulation on general rules of students' career enhancement and development manager.

Regulations of the international relations office.

Internationalization policy.

The rules of coordinators of sports and culture.

Students implemented and planned initiatives/projects.

The rule of payment of the tuition fees.

Regulation of TESAU students' self-governance.

The results of the graduates' research in connection with their career and the academic development.

Means and results of the support to socially disadvantaged student.

Interviews with staff and students.

#### **Recommendations:**

Create an independent Student Services Centre to support student activities, advice and career development.

Promote more involvement of students in international activities such as exchange programmes.

#### **Suggestions:**

None.



**Best Practices (if applicable):**

None.

**Evaluation**

- ☐ Complies with requirements
- ☒ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

**6. Research, development and/or other creative work**

Higher Education Institution, considering its type and specifics of field(s), works on the strengthening of its research function, ensures proper conditions to support research activities and improve the quality of research activities

**6.1 Research Activities**

- HEI, based on its type and specifics of its fields, carries out research/creative activities.
- Ensuring the effectiveness of doctoral research supervision
- HEI has public, transparent and fair procedures for the assessment and defense of dissertations which are relevant to the specifics of the field

**Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements**

As stated in the Self-Evaluation Report, and in memoranda with local businesses, the university has a clear strategy to focus on agriculture and tourism research. There is some evidence of cooperation with some of the key local wineries. The representatives of the companies acknowledge that the university has some capacity that makes it a worthwhile partner. For example, the company representatives seen by the panel stated that some of the faculty of the university are "renowned wine makers". The companies are supportive of the university. For example, they offer the university master's students their facilities to use for research. The companies express clear expectations about the role of the university in the development of winery in the region: "Kakheti needs a research institution that will help the field develop. For example, we need to come up with the ways of protecting our vine from viruses. We are no longer doing it in Georgia. Georgian winemaking is lagging behind because of the lack of research. In Soviet times, they split wine making and viticulture. But the two fields should be kept together. We need closer engagement with current research and researchers to get back on track". The governor of the region was very enthusiastic about supporting the university's development as a research institution. He has a clear vision of the university's potential role in the region. He expressed his dedication to contributing towards the development of the university particularly emphasizing the university's role in the development of wine making and viticulture. He also emphasized the importance of stronger support from the government and discussed future government plans.

Judging from the interviews with the stakeholders and the staff, all parties have a strong sense of the university's strategy to develop its research capacity that should contribute to the development of economic and social aspects of strategic importance for the region.

There are 10 departments and one research center designated to research activities: Agriculture and chemistry; Economics and tourism; Georgian philology; Foreign languages and literature; History; Education Sciences; Philosophy and Social Sciences; Natural Sciences; Mathematics; informatics, and Physics; as well as Caucasus Research Center within the department of philology. The panel reviewed the curriculum vitae of the professors and their articles, provided by the university during the site visit, to analyze, describe, and evaluate their collective contribution to the research. 10 faculty members publish the 42 articles provided by the university from 2010 to 2018: 1 author with 4 articles on language teaching, 10 articles by 2 authors affiliated to the university on climate change

and weather (usually coauthored by 3 to 7 other authors), 8 articles by one author in the field of medicine, 2 articles by one author on climate and weather, 2 articles by one author in the field of agriculture, 2 articles by one author on the Georgian history, 1 article on winery, one article in the field of history, 3 articles by one author in Georgian philology, 1 article by one author in humanities. The panel was able to access 39 articles. 17 of the articles are published in Russian. The rest are published in English. The majority of articles are published in Russian open access journals (e.g. European Researcher, European Journal of Medicine, European Geographical Studies, Central European Journal of Botany, Russian Journal of Biological Research, Russian Meteorology and Hydrology). The journals cannot be located in Scopus listings and only two of them are listed in Thompson's listings. There are very rare cases of the articles being cited by other authors.

Four of the ten departments have the following 21 ongoing or planned research projects:

Agriculture: planting a vineyard on recently purchased land to conduct experiments and establish optimal growing terms for various grape varieties, descriptive studies on wine varieties in Kakheti region, develop soil agro-chemical cartography of Telavi Municipality, develop a map of crops of Kakheti region.

Humanities: study and publish epistolary works of Georgian historians of 19th and 20th centuries, epistolary works of Georgian writers (funded by the National Research Foundation). Develop a structural doctoral program in Text Linguistics and Publishing. Create an Interactive 3D Map of Culturally Important Sites to the Tsovatush People of the Georgian Highlands using Drone-Mapping and GIS Technology (proposal submitted to the National Geographic Society); Conduct a study on new text linguistics studies and the life of GrigolOrbeliani; Linguistic studies of the works of IosebGrishashvili; Study on miniature prose; study on Georgian fairy tales in libraries abroad; Linguistic and semantic examination of the concept of wine in Georgian and in French; Study of Telavi history; Religious and Ethnic minorities in Kakheti Region; Cities and villages in Kakheti Region.

Exact and Natural Sciences: A science promotion project in schools.

Social Sciences, Business, and Law: A project (funded by the European Commission) aimed at establishing close contacts between universities and businesses.

The university has a strong potential to contribute to the regional and national development. However, at this point the university does not provide sufficient evidence that its staff "carries out research, development, creative activities, which contributes to scientific, social, economic, cultural, etc. development on regional, national, and/or international levels". A prevailing majority of the university academic staff does not have publications in credible peer-reviewed journals. Few faculty members have multiple publications, some of which are published in peer reviewed journals. However, the majority of the publications are published in journals that are generally not recognized in research community. Also, while tourism has been identified as a strategic priority for research, the university has been passive in this field.

The Self-Evaluation Report states that the strategy for integrating research in teaching is "publishing the university research to enable the university academic staff enrich their teaching process with new research". The panel located some of the publications on the university web site. Judging from the quality of the publications (e.g. articles in the Annual Research Collection of 2016 and 2017), using these research papers in teaching process can lead to misguided understanding of research standards.

The university has defined functions for the supervisors of PhD students/researchers. Workload of a professor for supervision is set at 40 hours per year and a professor can supervise up to 3 doctoral students a year. The university regulations meet the standard requirements.

The university has developed regulations for the evaluation and defense of dissertations. However, as sample dissertation papers as well as interviews with doctoral students indicate, there are substantial challenges in setting clear expectations on the quality of research to ensure that high standards are met. There is no evidence that the students have sufficient opportunity to understand what academic research entails. For example interviews with doctoral students show that students are unable to describe their research methodology or research theoretical framework. Another source of evidence on the standard is dissertation abstracts. Some are described in less than 30 words, most abstracts do not contain information on the purpose, methods, thesis, or results of the student's work. The third source of evidence is sample research papers. Some of the doctoral dissertations papers would qualify as master's thesis papers, others for example in agriculture, show that students

did not have sufficient opportunity to use up to date sources, the majority of sources in the literature were published in 50s and 70s. The dissertation papers are provided with their evaluations. Student work is evaluated against set criteria. However, the criteria are general and can be interpreted based on personal perception of for e.g. "how well does the paper present visual material"

#### **Evidences/indicators**

Mission statement.  
Strategic development plan.  
University budget.  
SER and relevant supporting documents.  
Action plan.  
Implemented and ongoing research projects.  
Curriculum Vita of academic staff.  
CD7, 6.16.  
CD7, 6.2.  
The Collection of Research, 2017. Page 32 Retrieved  
from [http://tesau.edu.ge/files/uploads/4/Dakabadonebuli\\_krebuli\\_20171.pdf](http://tesau.edu.ge/files/uploads/4/Dakabadonebuli_krebuli_20171.pdf) [20/06/2018].  
Articles published by the university academic staff.  
CD7, 6.8.  
CD7, 6,5.  
CD5, 4.2.  
CD7, 6.7.  
Sample dissertation papers.  
CD7, 6.8.  
CD7, 6,5.  
CD5, 4.2.  
Sample dissertation papers.

#### **Recommendations:**

Strengthen the capacity to increase research productivity and publication of research papers.  
Set standards on university publications and other dissemination activities to avoid the dissemination of scientific work that deviates from commonly accepted academic standards.  
Develop evaluation criteria that help students and staff establish high standards of academic work.

#### **Suggestions:**

None.

#### **Best Practices (if applicable):**

The communication and shared understanding of the university vision with local businesses and local government.

#### **Evaluation**

- ☐ Complies with requirements
- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☒ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

#### **6.2. Research support and internationalization**

- o HEI has an effective system in place for supporting research, development and creative activities
- o Attracting new staff and their involvement in research/arts-creative activities.
- o University works on internationalization of research, development and creative activities.

**Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements**

The university expresses its commitment to "building, sharing and storing" knowledge as stated in the Mission Statement. Research capacity development is also a part of its strategic development plan. Although the University state that they would like to engage in international research activities, the panel did not see any evidence of any significant activity in this area. To support research, the university states in the SER that it cooperates with business and foundations, regularly organizes international and local conferences. The university has allocated 35,000 GEL from the budget, 1.2% of the total budget, into competitive research grants. There are transparent procedures in place.

The university has demonstrated the capacity to raise funding from external sources, for example the National Research Foundation grant in the budget for 2018 and the President's Foundation.

The university is very underequipped: while agricultural research is a promising prospect for the university, it does not have the equipment to carry out research. It should be noted that the university puts noticeable effort in equipping their laboratory, for example purchasing new equipment from the grant provided by the President's Foundation. There is a strong prospect of major infrastructure development from a bilateral agreement between the government of Georgian and a German agency. However, at this point it is unclear how strongly the investment is going to affect research infrastructure since the investment is targeting strengthening the university's teaching programmes.

The university research development strategy describes the university's strategic objectives and the SER and strategic development plan describe some activities that could be addressing the research capacity issues. As stated in "Activities to support research and artistic work", "the university, with the purpose of popularization and facilitation of research activities, supports the integration of research in teaching. Students participate in research; co-author research projects; syllabi are regularly enriched with up-to-date literature; public lectures and meetings with renowned researchers are held. During site visit interviews, the rector and vice rector, when asked about the strategy for developing research, stated that improvement of library resources and financing publication costs as the strategies that they are going to use to support research development. The panel did not see any evidence of other significant initiatives to support research activity.

The description of the research capacity building activities lacks coherence: neither the written evidence nor interviews provide evidence that there is a clear and shared understanding of challenges that hinder the development of the university's research capacity. Therefore, it remains unclear how the activities are linked to the university's strategic objectives.

The SER and interviews with the staff show that the university's practice for attracting new staff in research is to offer academic positions to its graduate students. The review of the staff CVs supports this claim: there are several young professors who have finished their doctoral studies in the university and shortly after were awarded positions of assistant professors. However, there is a pronounced issue of aging of academic staff in some research areas. For example an average age of the faculty members at the Department of Agriculture is 65. If the university is aiming at making the field of agriculture its research priority, it should consider using some new strategies for attracting new staff.

Some of the departments, for example the Department of Agriculture are engaged in promising research initiatives. However, the activities described above do not provide sufficient information on the nature of the cooperation. This applies to the projects that have been finalized. Moreover, the majority of activities do not imply any research activity.

#### **Evidences/indicators**

Mission statement.

Strategic development plan.

University budget.

Self-Evaluation Report (SER) and relevant supporting documents.

Action plan.

6.10.

6.11.

6.9.

7.22.

6.12.

6.13.
<b>Recommendations:</b> Link the university research support activities to clearly defined research development challenges. Adopt a strategy that helps the university to effectively compete with rival universities in attracting young researchers. Link the university international research cooperation activities to the university strategic priorities and development needs.
<b>Suggestions:</b> None.
<b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b> None.
<b>Evaluation</b> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements
<b>6.3. Evaluation of Research Activities</b>
<input type="checkbox"/> HEI has a system for evaluating and analysing the quality of research/creative-arts activities, and the productivity of scientific-research units and academic/scientific staff.
<b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b> <p>The university has provided a recent evaluation report, which describes feedback provided by an external evaluator, the National Science Academy. The document also states that the university conducts internal evaluation of research performance. However, the panel did not see any written evidence of internal reviews. This suggests that research activity is reviewed informally, perhaps by the managers in each area.</p> <p>The above-mentioned external review results were discussed with the university academic council. However, the university did not provide information on how it is planning on acting on the evaluation results. Therefore, it is unclear how it uses evaluation results to develop its research activities.</p> <p>It is not clear how the staff research performance evaluation system addresses the mission statement of the University and its strategic development plan. The system allows for accumulating credit without publishing a single paper in a peer-reviewed journal. For example, a score assigned to supervising master's thesis papers during the last two years is 9 and publishing a paper in a peer reviewed impact factor journal is 10. The evaluation system implies that internalization of research or publishing is not a priority at this point for the university. However, the evaluation team were unable to get a justification of the strategy.</p>
<b>Evidences/indicators</b> 6.14 6. 15 6. 16 Website (tesau.edu.ge).
<b>Recommendations:</b> Establish a system for the internal review of research performance of individual departments in order to develop interventions aimed at improving research performance. Establish clear indicators for quality and ethical research for the publications of the university. Enable the information on university research output to be accessible to the wider community.

<b>Suggestions:</b>  None.
<b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b>  None.
<b>Evaluation</b>  <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

## 7. Material, information and financial resources

Material, information and financial resources of HEI ensure sustainable, stable, effective and efficient functioning of the institution, and the achievement of goals defined through strategic development plan.

<b>7.1 Material resources</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ The institution possesses or owns material resources (fixed and current assets) that are used for achieving goals stated in the mission statement, adequately responds to the requirements of educational programmes and research activities, and corresponds to the existing number of students and planned enrolment.</li> <li>○ HEI offers environment necessary for implementing educational activities: sanitary units, natural light possibilities, and central heating system.</li> <li>○ Health and safety of students and staff is protected within the institution.</li> <li>○ HEI has adapted environment for people with special needs</li> </ul>
<b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b>  <p>The University has enough material base to support the annual number of enrolled students, it has land totalling 63,000 m<sup>2</sup> with 13 buildings, non-agricultural land of 12,703 m<sup>2</sup> and 160,000 m<sup>2</sup> agricultural land for research and practical work.</p> <p>During the tour it was identified that buildings of the University include lecture halls, seminar rooms, laboratories, rooms for group work, administrative workplaces, conference halls and departments. There is a room dedicated for the University Archive, rooms are allocated for administrative and auxiliary staff in order to maintain working environment. Foyers are presented on each floor of the building. The Library of the University is furnished with a proper inventory and material-technical base. It is located in a separate building. The University also has a recreation area.</p> <p>Study rooms and laboratories are furnished with appropriate furniture and inventory, computers, projectors and other material-technical base considering specific features of the educational programmes. University has partially renovated classrooms and material technical base (part of the building is fully renovated) and at the same time is expecting government grant to accomplish renovation process and improve full infrastructure. According to the students projectors are not enough to conduct presentations and they have to stand in queues to access the projector. The study and research laboratories are equipped with the proper inventory and devices, reagents and materials necessary for carrying out analysis and investigations. Their preservation and usage conditions correspond to the standards established by the law.</p> <p>There are toilets with constant lighting, ventilation and water supply on each floor of the University. According to the contract signed between university and private company. They are permanently disinfected. Disinfection and deratination are done in the buildings as well. Central heating system, natural and artificial lighting are found in all buildings. Anti-fire inventory (with the enclosed instructions) and evacuation plans are displayed on each floor of the building both at the central and evacuation exits. Point 6 in Kakheti Region Fire Management Agency Audit should be fulfilled and Fire extinguishing water system should be checked and equipped properly according to the law Article II chapter 13, point 7.</p> <p>The University has a Health and Safety and evacuation plan, that is regulated by internal article</p>

N2/299, 14/03/2018. Special rules are implemented for ensuring security and discipline at the University. There are security video-cameras (with the function of saving video-recordings), a group of guards is appointed for monitoring the University buildings and outer space, guaranteeing the security and discipline standards, protecting inventory holdings. According to the staff, periodical training regarding anti-fire security standards and correct uses of anti-fire inventory are held at the University as well.

A sanitary unit is located in building N1 room 8 with annual budget of 1,500 GEL. In order to provide first aid, a Medical Center is situated on the first floor of the building. It is equipped with the proper inventory and first aid medicines. It is supplied with natural and artificial lights, ventilation, constant cold and hot water. The standards of the medicine preservation established by the law are complied with at the Medical Center. The University has a professional nurse for delivering first aid to the staff and students and a medical support plan regulated by article N5 14/03/2018.

Based on the tour, it is clear that the buildings and material-technical base of the University need renovation. The University is trying to renovate and maintain the buildings within financial constraints. The financial estimate for complete rehabilitation of Study Building I is made up and agreed with LEPL Educational and Scientific Infrastructure Development Agency and is sent to the Ministry of Education and Science of Georgia demanding financial support. Renovation of the main studying buildings can be accomplished in short term period.

Based on the peculiarities of the Kakheti region, the University has got an agricultural for crops of about 160,000 sq.m. in order to develop the fields of agriculture. Furthermore, it owns appropriate agricultural techniques and equipment for carrying out some basic research and trial work. A demonstration plot of mixed garden (2,500 sq.m.) is situated on the territory of the University (address: #1, Kartuli Universiteti Street, Telavi).

Fixed and current assets are located on the following cadastral codes: 532042052, 532034035, 530934034, As indicated in the Samkharauli Report all buildings on the land do not belong to the University. However in the Note from Public Registry they are on the balance of the University. On the other side staff clarified that it was wording mistake in the Samkharauli's report.

The first floor entrance of all University buildings is equipped with ramps that aid for people who need wheelchair access in the building, although they cannot get access to other floors the University makes provision for resources to be accessed on the first floor if needed. In the first building of the University, there are special sanitary units for them and special parking place for disabled people. In case of having students with special needs, the University administration offers study process implementation on the first floor of the buildings.

Based on the Visual audit, On high voltage building there is no notice of security and life safety, sign is needed for indication.

IT labs are equipped with UPS system. However alternative energy source in every building is switched on manually.

The Human Resources department consumes 50 percent of the total marketing budget of 3,500 GEL accordingly it helps to increase employment rate of the graduates and last year students, On the other hand for marketing and staff training activities University has support from Telavi city council like providing free transportation.

According to Accounting team, the demand and revenue forecast for university courses is calculated by annual weighted average applicants rate that is on average 340 students per year. Also, it will be useful to implement Compound Annual Growth Rate (CAGR) to get more accurate figures.

Renovation of the main building is planned during 2019-2020 with the Support of Ministry of Infrastructure, while the two other buildings can be renewed by the help and support of International German donor organisations. Accordingly, it is possible to achieve strategic goal number 1. budget of the renovation project is submitted to the government bodies and construction process will start soon.

#### **Evidences/indicators**

Interviews with security manager, material resource manager, lawyer, university administrator and quality assurance.

Extract from the Public Register about the fixed assets (CD8 attached file 7.1.).  
 Internal measurement drafts of the constructions (CD9 attached file 1).  
 Contracts certifying purchase of liquid assets and granting, waybills, invoices, acts of delivery-acceptance (CD8 attached file 7.2).  
 Contracts signed with the internship/research units (CD8 attached file 7.3).  
 Student and staff survey findings in relation with the material resources (CD8 attached file 7.4).  
 Contract signed for sanitary services (CD8 attached file 7.6).  
 Expert's statement about the proper condition of central heating and ventilation system (CD8 attached file 7.5).  
 Rules for fire security and medical aid (CD8 attached file 7.7).  
 Consuming electric power and natural gas payment receipts (CD9 attached file 2 and 3).  
 Expert's statement about the security of constructions (CD8 attached file 7.8).  
 Kakheti Emergency Management Division findings about fire security (CD8 attached file 7.9).  
 Contract signed for making ramps within the buildings and the Act of Delivery-Acceptance (CD9 attached file 4).

#### **Recommendations:**

Renovate the buildings as appropriate to provide a safe and appropriate studying and working environment for students and staff.

Ensure that all buildings have appropriate fire safety and electrical systems.

Ensure that all buildings have suitable access for people with disabilities.

#### **Suggestions:**

None.

#### **Best Practices (if applicable):**

None.

#### **Evaluation**

- ☐ Complies with requirements
- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☒ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ ☐ Does not comply with requirements

#### **7.2. Library resources**

- ☐ Library environment, resources and service support effective implementation of educational and research activities, and HEI constantly works for its improvement.

#### **Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements**

The University library is housed in a two floor building situated near to central academic buildings. Inside the library there is book archive, reading hall, library staff office space, meeting and group workspace and IT equipment which provides students and staff with a sufficient working environment. In addition they have equipped library with sixteen internet-connected personal computers for students. However students state that they need more personal computers in the library, because sometimes they have to wait to have access to the computers. Due to this the library has a regulation that limits usage to two hours at a time for each student. Also library has open access to an internet connection (wi-fi).

Statistics show that the use of electronic databases is very low and some electronic databases have zero usage. This situation can be explained by following reasons that last and previous years the University was investing only 5000 GEL in this electronic databases. That's why they have not a wide variety of electronic databases and so there was low usage of this databases. In this year they have increased the budget for this purpose and are planning to buy more electronic databases for their students. Also awareness of students regarding the electronic databases is very low. During the interviews most of them have stated that they generally have information that the library has got electronic databases but in most cases almost no student uses them. It seems that academic staff do not widely promote foreign resources in teaching methodology.

The University needs to invest financial resources in electronic databases and has library staff who are able to inform and help students how to use these electronic databases. In this year they have almost



spent 10,000 GEL for electronic resources. The overall budget for financing electronic databases and for books is 35,000 GEL. Access to electronic databases and books is open to any student. To monitor these processes, the library has an electronic catalog linked to EVERGREEN system. This program has a flexible retrieval system which helps the library to find literature in an integrated electronic catalogue. The library has got electronic versions of many books to satisfy needs of students for achieving their educational programme learning outcomes. Compulsory literature stated in the syllabi are available in the library.

Library is managed by the Head Librarian, three chief specialists and four specialists. During interview the library staff stated that they believe that they are providing sufficient consultation for students about how to use electronic library databases, but they would like to increase their competence in English language to be more helpful for students. Library staff are in close cooperation with all the faculties to provide them with subject specific books and electronic databases. The Library organizes training for its staff but it is not clear to the panel how often this occurs, academic personal and students on how to use electronic databases. Also the Head of the Library stated that different representatives of electronic databases are organizing webinar courses for students.

The Library is provided with proper temperature and lighting according to all seasons. It is open every day except Sunday and is open from 09:00 to 19:00. So, library is available for students and academic personnel for 60 hours per week. The library services for students and academic staff is free of charge.

#### **Evidences/indicators**

Documents confirming books fund possession.

Electronic catalog on the university website.

Documents confirming involvement in international electronic library network.

Statistics of the use of electronic library databases.

Means of developing and updating library resources and services.

Organized meetings, consultations and other events.

Rules and instructions for using library.

The results of the study conducted by Telavi State University.

Interviews with staff and students.

#### **Recommendations:**

Ensure library staff have sufficient competence in the English language to provide effective support on using electronic databases for students.

Ensure the library has sufficient resources to meet the needs of staff and students.

#### **Suggestions:**

None.

#### **Best Practices (if applicable):**

None.

#### **Evaluation**

- ☐ Complies with requirements
- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☒ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

#### **7.3 Information Resources**

- HEI has created infrastructure for information technologies and its administration and accessibility are ensured
- Electronic services and electronic management systems are implemented and mechanisms for their constant improvement are in place
- HEI ensures business continuity

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ HEI has a functional web-page in Georgian and English languages.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b></p> <p>The University has a functional web-page in Georgian and English languages where all the necessary information related to mission, strategy, faculties, educational programmes and extracurricular activities are published.</p> <p>The University has an Information Technologies unit that oversees development of information services necessary for education and library purposes, as well as internet availability throughout the campus and cybersecurity issues. Interviews with staff of Information Technologies unit reveal that the University needs to increase internet and technology safety issues and develop mechanisms to ensure that students' access to various unsafe websites is restricted. Currently students have unrestricted access to all websites.</p> <p>The University has a partially functional Learning Management System that currently only provides to students the main descriptions of their courses and their grades. LMS has two modes: manager and student. Grades are put into the system by managers after lecturers submit them. The system doesn't have effective functions for managing education functions such as having syllabuses or necessary education materials, or providing communication between the lecturer and the student. The University has hired the software developer for developing the system and plans to increase the system functionality in future.</p>
<p><b>Evidences/indicators</b></p> <p>Interviews with Information Technology Unit Staff.</p> <p>University website <a href="http://www.tesau.edu.ge">www.tesau.edu.ge</a>.</p> <p>Procedure for Web Site Production (CD 8 attached file 7.16).</p> <p>Contract with Internet Provider (CD 8 attached file 7.17).</p> <p>Information on electronic services and electronic systems of management (CD 8 attached file 7.18).</p> <p>Mechanisms for the development of electronic services and electronic systems of management (CD 8 attached file 7.19).</p> <p>Document certifying ownership of domain and hosting (CD 8 attached file 7.20).</p> <p>Regulation of information technology service (CD 3 attached file 2.2 file 2.2.7).</p>
<p><b>Evaluation</b></p> <p> <input type="checkbox"/> Fully complies with requirements  <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements  <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements  <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements         </p>
<p><b>Recommendations:</b></p> <p>Develop the regulations for restricting students' access to improper or unsafe websites.</p> <p>Increase the functionality of the Learning Management System to ensure a more effective education process.</p>
<p><b>Suggestions:</b></p> <p>None</p>
<p><b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b></p> <p>None</p>
<p><b>7.4 Financial resources</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Allocation of financial resources described in the budget of HEI is economically achievable</li> <li>○ Financial standing of HEI ensures performance of activities described in strategic and mid-term action plans</li> <li>○ HEI financial resources are focused on effective implementation of core activities of the institution</li> <li>○ HEI budget provides funding for scientific research and library functioning and development</li> <li>○ HEI has an effective system of accountability, financial management and control</li> </ul>

<p><b>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</b></p> <p>The allocation of the financial resources described in the Budget is economically achievable, the average annual revenue from tuition during year 2013 - 2017 is 2,821,625 GEL, the budgeted revenue from tuition for 2018 is 2,785,000 GEL.</p> <p>In total revenue of the University, revenue from tuition fee consists of 72.3 percent. Opening Cash flow is 752,307 GEL that is streamed from governmental or international institutions like: Rustaveli Foundation, Grants from International donors, State agency, tuition fees from the previous year. The University expects grants of 4.6 percent within budgeted total revenue and 1 percent of Government scholarship</p> <p>With the given financial resources and budgeted activities it will be difficult to achieve goal 8 of strategic plan that includes improvement of technical infrastructure and development of material base. The University is not able to dedicate enough financial resources for future building improvement. Accordingly, in the budget for 2018, only 50,000 GEL is dedicated for building maintenance. Based on the Levan Samkharauli National Forensics Bureau conclusion Building N 1, 11, 12, 13 needs construction improvements in future. Also, Health and safety state audit identified issues for improvement, point N 6 of the report is not fulfilled, the University has a budget of only 1,500 GEL for building safety.</p> <p>The University resources are focused on the core activities like education and production practice, scientific research, cultural, sport and education events. The training of staff is one of the core activities, however for 194 person staff only 5,000 GEL is budgeted for training, for education and production practice only 6,000 GEL is budgeted, for cultural, sport and educational events university has the budget of 15,000 GEL for scientific research 25,000 GEL is dedicated. Nevertheless, the University obtains alternative financial sources from local and global stakeholders like the President Fund that supports financial sustainability of the institution.</p> <p>The University budget provides liquid assets for scientific research and library functioning. For library development it has 35,000 GEL dedicated in the budget.</p> <p>The financial resource management is controlled by internal regulation of the university and results are audited by external source. LTD Audit Economics conducted the external audit of the University for year 2017. Based on the conducted audit it is possible to argue that Financial reports certify correctness, fairness and fullness of financial information.</p>
<p><b>Evidences/indicators</b></p> <p>The University Budget (CD 8 attached file 7.22).  Strategic Development Plan (CD 2 attached file 1.2).  Three-year Action Plan (CD 2 attached file 1.2).  Information about TeSaU Funding Sources (CD 8 attached file 7.21).  TeSaU Financial Report 2017 and Dynamics of Financing 2013-2017 (CD 8 attached file 7.23).  Rule and Form for Distribution, Delegation and Accountability of Responsibilities (CD 8 attached file 7.24).  Document on Implementation of Financial Management and Control System (CD 8 attached file 7.25).</p>
<p><b>Recommendations:</b></p> <p>Endeavour to find funds to provide the infrastructure for the future development of the University.</p>
<p><b>Suggestions:</b></p> <p>None.</p>
<p><b>Best Practices (if applicable):</b></p> <p>None.</p>
<p><b>Evaluation</b></p> <p> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements  <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements  <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements  <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements </p>