განათლების ხარისხის განვითარების ეროვნული ცენტრი
NATIONAL CENTER FOR EDUCATIONAL QUALITY ENHANCEMENT

Final Report on Batumi Navigation Teaching University Authorization

Expert Panel Members

Chair: Janusz Uriasz, Maritime University of Szczecin, Poland
Members:
Ia Mosashvili, LEPL Georgian Technical University
Giga Khositashvili, LEPL Ilia State University
Nino Amiranashvili, LEPL Ilia State University
Nino Oragvelidze, LELP Maritime Transport Agency, Labour Market Expert
Davit Tepnadze, Georgian Aviation University, Student Expert

Tbilisi

2019

Authorization Report Resume

The objective of this report is to present main findings after Authorisation evaluation of the Batumi Navigation Teaching University (BNTU). The evaluation of the quality of education at BNTU was carried out on the request of BNTU by the National Centre for Educational Quality Enhancement (NCEQE) as part of the work schedule. For the third time, NCEQE carried out the Authorisation evaluation of the University. The BNTU was evaluated according to new standards and procedures for the first time.

General information on the educational institution

Batumi Navigation Teaching University is a non-public Higher Educational Institution providing maritime education in the city of Batumi for just one decade. In 2008 the University was created while since 2013 it has been authorized to provide education in higher education system in Georgia.

Nowadays the University consists of two faculties: Faculty of Maritime Engineering and Faculty of Logistics. They offer 5 programmes: 4 bachelor's educational programmes – "Ship Mechanics", "Marine Navigation", "Organization and management of international transportation", joint (Georgia-Ukraine) programme "Ship's main machinery" and 1 master's educational programme – "Transport Logistics". Most of students are studding on Maritime programmes which are subject to fulfil the International Convention for Standards of Training, Certification and Watchkeeping for Seafarers

Brief overview of the authorization site visit

The site visit was prepared and carried out in accordance with the applicable procedure. The visit took place on 29-30 of November 2018 in accordance with the applicable procedure. The Visiting Team reviewed the self-assessment report provided by the University. The visit started with BNTU Management meeting.

The subsequent visit took place in accordance with the prearranged agenda. During the visit following meetings were held with 1) Self-Evaluation and strategic Development team 2) The academic board; 3) the representative board 4) the deans of BNTU faculties 5) the dean's offices and Students registration, Evaluation and Monitoring Service 6) Legal Service and Financial Service 7) public relations service and practice and Employment service and Human resource Management Service 8) the Library, Security Service and Maintenance/logistics Service 9) Department of Vocational education, Language learning school, Entrants training center, Culture and sports center and International Maritime Training Center 10) heads of the programs 11) the Academic Staff 12) the invited teaching staff 13) with the students 14) students self-governance 15) the Alumni 16) the Employers, other relevant stakeholders. In addition, selected diploma theses were reviewed, the didactic and social database used in the didactic process were reviewed. Finally, evaluation team reviewed material resources of the BNTU, including training ship "Elita". The visit ended with closing meeting during which the Chair of the Expert Team overviewed and briefly presented the fulfilments of the Authorization Standards for Higher Education, pretend comments, recommendations and suggestion.

Overview of the HEI's compliance with standards

National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement carried out the Authorisation evaluation of the Batumi Navigation Teaching University in accordance with the new seven standards for the first time. The panel evaluated compliance of the HEI with the established standards' evaluation criteria using provided documentation and interviews with internal and external stakeholders during the site-visit as evidences.

In general, the Authorization evaluation justified that BNTU is able to deliver intended programmes. BNTU is able to maintain proper culture of education, quality of education, it has got enough resources in scope of academic staff, infrastructure, teaching aids. University was instructed to pay great attention to joint programmes. BNTU had prepared and provided all necessary documentation and procedures for expert members, university staff, students, and partners were aware of the importance of Authorization. Most of them were involved in the process of drafting the self-evaluation report and were actively involved in side visit. From the seven assessed standards three were assessed as "complies with requirements", three as "substantially complies with requirements" and one as "partially complies with requirements".

Summary of Recommendations

Visiting team acting on behalf of the National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement formulated recommendations in area of general activity Batumi Navigation Teaching University. University is recommended to:

1. Standard 1:
    a. Strengthen internationalization of mission according to declared aims.
    b. Action plan shall be reduced to realistic measures being in line with available resources.
2. Standard 2:
    a. Batumi Navigation Teaching University shall establish structural unit with a sufficient number of employees working only in the direction of internationalization.
    b. Batumi Navigation Teaching University shall add another employee who will be engaged in the practice and employment of non-recruiting students or the existing employee of this service shall fulfil all obligations assigned by the provision of the unit.
    c. Level of English should be improved throughout the BNTU.
    d. Further development of the performance evaluation system for academic, scientific, invited, administrative, support staff according PDCA cycle.
    e. Further development of the student body planning methodology, taking into consideration different specifications/needs of higher education programs according to their level (BA, MA) and field of study.
    f. BNTU needs to allocate sufficient human and information resources for the effective implementation of internal quality assurance mechanisms.
    g. BNTU needs to review regulatory documents of QA and QSM services to prevent overlapping in responsibilities of their staff.
    h. Mechanisms of detecting plagiarism should be implemented by the University.
    i. All students should be given clear guidance on plagiarism during their instruction. The BNTU should also adopt a variety of alternative mechanisms for increasing students' awareness of the institution's policy on plagiarism and its consequences.
    j. The BNTU's plagiarism procedures should be closely monitored to ensure that they constitute an active and effective means of detecting and preventing plagiarism.
3. Standard 3:
    a. Use the effective and varied methods to develop the specifically defined assessment system for the cognitive and practical skills.
    b. Write the evaluation criteria with more details, where the activities and their relevant assessments will be indicated.
4. Standard 4:
    a. HR Service should perform the necessary activities to evaluate staff and present the result to the QAS to discuss it with the management who will take needed decisions.
    b. In order have student opinion towards pedagogical staff BNTU should collect feedback from students at the end of the academic year;
    c. University should invite the active seafarers to share their experience, challenges and devices with the students. It would be a good motivator for students.
    d. At least one employee should be hired in HR service.
5. Standard 5:
    a. Practice and Employment Service should be available for all students of every programme offered by BNTU.
    b. BNTU should create data base of alumni and trace their careers.
6. Standard 6:
    a. To take part in international scientific research activities.
    b. To use the research results in educational programs development and teaching activities;
    c. To establish collaboration with economic agents in order to share the research achievements with these agents;

      d. To do research works actively.
      e. To take part in professional forums and blogs.
      f. To involve the students in their research works.
      g. To involve in international scientific and research communities.
      h. Take care of the development of international and local grants and their management.
      i. To take part in international mobility programs.
      j. Support and develop the effective systems of research in international level.
      k. To increase the scientific-research interests of academic staff and support them.
      l. Practice effective system for attracting and supporting new staff in research activities.
      m. To use the antiplagiarism program.
      n. To involve the students in the research works and activities;
      o. Publish the reports on implemented research activities.
      p. Reflect the evaluation results in further development plan of research activities.
7. Standard 7:
      a. The scientific databases should be subscribed considering the profile of the university.
      b. The library staff should offer regular trainings both to faculty members and students to promote the usage of the databases.
      c. The library staff should identify their role in providing student support services in terms of academic integrity.
      d. The books should be arranged according to international standards, so that accessibility will be increased.
      e. The library staff should provide support to faculty members in preparing readers, to explain the main rules of citation and referencing.
      f. The librarians should update their professional skills regularly that can be done under the mobility programs that university aims to develop in the coming years.
      g. The budget should be planned in accordance with developing research activities, prioritized to academic and administrative staff development programs.

Summary of Suggestions

Visiting team formulated suggestions for Batumi Navigation Teaching University aiming for its improvement. University is suggested to:

1. Standard 1:
      a. increase mobility of students and teachers.
      b. keep in place active involvement of available stakeholders in the process of preparation of strategic development plan.
      c. monitor external benchmarks because their achievements may depend on close cooperation with employers.
2. Standard 2: increase the area of target countries.
3. Standard 3: use the international approaches during the implementation of the programs.
4. Standard 4: ensure sustainability BNTU shall extend/develop research activities.
5. Standard 7: consider arrangement of toilet for people with special needs.

Summary of the Best Practices
-

Summary Table

	Standard	Complies with Requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
1.	**Mission and strategic development of HEI**	☐	☒	☐	☐
1.1	Mission of HEI	☐	☒	☐	☐
1.2	Strategic development	☐	☒	☐	☐
2.	**Organizational structure and management of HEI**	☐	☒	☐	☐
2.1	Organizational structure and management	☐	☐	☒	☐
2.2	Internal quality assurance mechanisms	☐	☒	☐	☐
2.3	Observing principles of ethics and integrity	☐	☒	☐	☐
3.	**Educational Programmes**	☒	☐	☐	☐
3.1	Design and development of educational programmes	☒	☐	☐	☐
3.2	Structure and content of educational programmes	☒	☐	☐	☐
3.3	Assessment of learning outcomes	☐	☒	☐	☐
4	**Staff of the HEI**	☒	☐	☐	☐
4.1	Staff management	☐	☒	☐	☐
4.2	Academic/Scientific and invited Staff workload	☒	☐	☐	☐
5	**Students and their support services**	☒	☐	☐	☐
5.1	The Rule for obtaining and changing student status, the recognition of education, and student rights	☒	☐	☐	☐
5.2	Student support services	☐	☒	☐	☐
6	**Research, development and/or other creative work**	☐	☐	☒	☐
6.1	Research activities	☐	☐	☒	☐
6.2	Research support and internationalization	☐	☐	☒	☐
6.3	Evaluation of research activities	☐	☐	☒	☐
7	**Material, information and financial resources**	☐	☒	☐	☐
7.1	Material resources	☒	☐	☐	☐
7.2	Library resources	☐	☐	☒	☐
7.3	Information resources	☒	☐	☐	☐
7.4	Financial resources	☐	☒	☐	☐

Signature of expert panel members

1. Janusz Uriasz (Chair)
2. Ia Mosashvili (Member)
3. Giga Khositashvili (Member)
4. Nino Amiranashvili (Member)
5. Nino Oragvelidze (Labor Market expert)
6. Davit Tepnadze (Student expert)

Compliance of the Authorization Applicant HEI with the Authorization Standard Components

1. Mission and strategic development of HEI

Mission statement of a HEI defines its role and place within higher education area and broader society. Strategic development plan of HEI corresponds with the mission of an institution, is based on the goals of the institution and describe means for achieving these goals.

1.1 Mission of HEI
Mission Statement of the HEI corresponds to Georgia's and European higher education goals, defines its role and place within higher education area and society, both locally and internationally.
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements Batumi Navigation Teaching University has assumed its mission. The mission is published and internal and external stakeholders are aware of it. Main aims of the mission are specified. In fact, University focuses mainly on education, trying to provide an education in line with International Quality Standards and in accordance with the Law of Georgia. It shall be obtained by offering programs, professional training centre, vocational education. To strengthen Education the University is aiming to develop its infrastructure, implementing educand support policy, creating dedicated education environment. As University acts mainly in maritime domain the maritime aspects should be much more highlighted in the mission. One could recognize the field of activity just by the name of the University – Navigation Teaching University. In the mission it is hard to find maritime aspects. If University stays just at the education the mission shall be considered as not too ambitious. However, on the other hand University aims to support the social, economic and cultural development of the region of its location and enter international educational space. Finally, just one ambitious goal is assumed - obtaining an image of leader in maritime education field internationally, in particular, Black Sea and Caucasus region. It seems that University has enough capabilities in terms of resources human, technical to play well the role of education supplier on bachelor level. In such perspective the plan to go beyond region and country borders seems at this stage too artificial. The plan of obtaining the status of competitive higher education institution integrated in international education industry and specific space would need to strengthen research component, international cooperation, introduce demand of external stockholders (employers, alumni) or implementation of foreign language into education (mainly English), reduce relatively high ratio of suspended students, develop reasonably the undertaken initiative of join programmes, increase sustainability in longer perspective of human resources, increase mobility of students and teachers, revive international contacts and formal agreements, look for recognition of its programmes in region of its activity (Black Sea) instead of being asleep by overseas recognition. In fact, most of the graduates from BNTU find their jobs on international maritime market. Due to that reason internationalization and fulfilments of international standards (like STCW) in BNTU mission shall be a main point of University concern.

Evidences
    1. Mission of BNTU
    2. University web page
    3. Meeting with internal and external stockholders.

Recommendations: Strengthen internationalization of mission according to declared aims.
Suggestions: Increase mobility of students and teachers.
Best Practices (if applicable):
Evaluation   ☐ Complies with requirements

☒ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

1.2 Strategic Development
o HEI has a strategic development (7-year) and an action plans (3-year) in place.   o HEI contributes to the development of the society, shares with the society the knowledge gathered in the institution, and facilitates lifelong learning   o HEI evaluates implementation of strategic and action plans, and duly acts on evaluation results.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

Batumi Navigation Teaching University assumed its strategic development plan. The plan was assumed for the period 2019-2024. Previous plan is about to expire still in 2018. That plan was divided into two stages 2013-2015 and 2016-2018.

Strategic development plan was elaborated with consideration resources and potential of the University. The plan is mainly a demonstration of the intentions of the Management. While preparing the strategic development plan an coherent approach had been applied, however active involvement of available stakeholders is crucial and University should always look for this advantage. A platform of good cooperation between University and stockholders could be helpful. It is unknown if experience or reflection from current ending plan were introduced in new one. University assumed some benchmarks to be achieved connected with students' enrolment, ratio of academic staff, ratio of administrative staff, ratio of invited teachers, ratio of scientific teachers, index of alumni employment etc. We can recognize two groups of benchmarks: internal and external ones. Internal benchmarks could be achieved by university own action.

However, it is not clearly assumed how these benchmarks shall be achieved, for instance by decreasing the denominator or by increasing the counter. Still focusing just on fractions, ratios, numbers is not enough in case of staff because quality, competences, sustainability, ability to perform at least small researches could be lost in mean time and declared goals would not be achieved.

Especially when none of academic has been planned to obtain PhD degree by 2024. Looking at external benchmarks, the University may monitor them like employment of its graduates. In order to increase such index the close cooperation with employers shall be extended. Some first steps have been already undertaken however recently appointed Practice and Employment Service doesn't belong to internal structure despite such declaration and it doesn't care about all BNTU students but selected ones. Evaluation team is in opinion that awareness of strategic development plan among internal community of BNTU is rather on poor level.

University evaluated its weak and strong sides using SWOT analysis method. SWOT analysis shall help the successful accomplishment of development plan. This creates a coherent approach. However, presented analysis of strengths, weakness, opportunities and threats consists from list of facts like "insufficient level of internationalization" or "positive environment" University shall rather find the reasons of insufficient level of internationalization and try to overcome that treats. It should be rather assessed and presented the possible achievements, utilization of those (positive) facts or the way of avoiding, prevention (negative) facts.

Therefore, it seems that the methodology of planning the strategy should be amended. University assumed action plan for first stage for period of 2019-2021. This 3 years plan is having 9 main points with indicated goals, tasks, measures to be taken, expected outcomes, benchmarks. This action plan is very ambitious. For instance point 3. International relations and cooperation with goal: sharing of best practices and expertise and improvement of educational programmes, support of internship/work placement of students and academic staff, integration into international scientific, industry and educational space and BNTU popularization. These comprehensive goals will be difficult to obtain in just three years with total number of 22 affiliated academic staff with almost total inability for international mobility due to age, workload, language skills.

Strategic development plan is secured by enough financial resources.

Evidences/indicators

1. Strategic development plan
2. Development Strategy
3. Action plan I stage strategic 2019-2021
4. Meeting with internal stakeholders including management,
5. Financial plan
6. SWOT analysis

Recommendations:
Action plan shall be reduced to realistic measures being in line with available resources.

Suggestions:
1. Active involvement of available stakeholders shall be in place in the process of preparation of strategic development plan.
2. The University shall actively monitor external benchmarks because their achievements may depend on close cooperation with employers.

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation
☐ Complies with requirements
☒ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

2. Organizational Structure and Management of HEI

Organizational structure and management of the HEI is based on best practices of the educational sector, meaning effective use of management and quality assurance mechanisms in the management process. This approach ensures implementation of strategic plan, integration of quality assurance function into management process, and promotes principles of integrity and ethics

2.1 Organizational Structure and Management
o Organizational structure of HEI ensures implementation of goals and activities described in its strategic plan
o Procedures for election/appointment of the management bodies of HEI are transparent, equitable, and in line with legislation
o HEI's Leadership/Management body ensures effective management of the activities of the institution
o Considering the mission and goals of HEI, leadership of the HEI supports international cooperation of the institution and the process of internationalization.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements
The structure of Batumi Navigation Teaching University mainly ensures the implementation of the actions described in the Strategic Plan for achieving the goals set by the University. The structure of the university was renewed in December 2017, where the Practice and Employment Service was introduced, which facilitates internship of students during studying and promoting employment after completing their studies. The university has all the functions of the structural unit defined and approved as provisions and performance of their functions are checked during the annual internal audit. However, an incomplete understanding of its functions and obligations was identified, as head and the only employee of this structural unit considers that the functions and responsibilities of the unit apply only to the students of the Maritime Faculty, but according to the provision, they apply to all students.
The target countries for internationalization of BNTU are the post-soviet and socialistic countries. Anyway the structural unit for achievement such a serious goal, as internationalization and implementation of the mechanism of internationalization defined by the university in the strategic plan, is not considered in the organizational structure of university. Knowledge of English language of students as the academic staff is not sufficient for the purpose of internationalization.

Batumi Navigation Teaching University is a private institution, the governing body of which is the partners' council, which assigns the rector and the chancellor, who are the owners of BNTU, but for the appointment of the managers and heads of other senior positions the selection / appointment procedures and requirements are identified and approved, they are transparent and comply with university regulations and the legislation in force.

Batumi Navigation Teaching University governing body mainly provides the efficient management, for which, among other measures it has established a quality assurance service, which monitors and provides the compliance with education quality management and assurance system, as well as ISO 9001: 2015 standard requirements.

Management of Batumi Navigation Teaching University uses modern technologies, including the electronic system, such as bntu.ini.ge which provides electronic management of process of studying, financial services, library service, document flow system and communication. The university developed the Business Continuity Plan, which includes goals, objectives, measures to be taken, expected results, key target indicators and resources in order to develop every filed of the University. For the effectiveness of business continuity, the University uses an analysis that reflects the BNTU's strengths and weaknesses, opportunities and threats considering the external factors. The University is oriented on attracting foreign citizen students, implementing English and Russian language programs, as well as introduction of students' exchange programs, which will help to take place in the desired international maritime-educational space.

Evidences/indicators

1. BNTU Structure.
2. Internationalization Policy.
3. Management effectiveness mechanisms.
4. Plan of uninterrupted business processes.
5. Interview with BNTU Management and Heads of Structural Units.

Recommendations:

1. Batumi Navigation Teaching University shall establish structural unit with a sufficient number of employees working only in the direction of internationalization.
2. Batumi Navigation Teaching University shall add another employee who will be engaged in the practice and employment of non-recruiting students or the existing employee of this service shall fulfil all obligations assigned by the provision of the unit.
3. Level of English should be improved throughout the BNTU.

Suggestions:

University should increase the area of target countries.

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

☐ Complies with requirements

☐ Substantially complies with requirements

☒ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

2.2 Internal Quality Assurance Mechanisms

o Institution effectively implements internal quality assurance mechanisms. Leadership of the institution constantly works to strengthen quality assurance function and promotes establishment of quality culture in the institution.

o HEI has a mechanism for planning student body, which will give each student an opportunity to get a high quality education.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

BTNU has the Quality Assurance Service for the effective implementation and application of internal quality assurance mechanisms and system development. The head of QA service is responsible for the quality of learning and teaching processes of higher education programs and the quality manager is

responsible for updating the organizational system and maintaining its efficiency according to ISO standard (BTNU holds ISO Quality Management System Compliance Certificates: ISO 9001:2000. IQ-Net ISO 9001:2008. IQ-Net; ISO 9001:2015, IQ-Net). They act according to the Quality Assurance Service Regulations and Quality System Management Service Regulations. In the abovementioned documents the roles and responsibilities of the Head of QA Service and the Quality Manager are clearly defined, but there is some overlapping in responsibilities of their staff. If the BNTU is planning to increase the number of employees in the abovementioned departments, it is recommended to review the regulatory documents with this respect.

Till 2017 the evaluation of organizational management and the quality assurance of educational processes were slightly related to each other. Since 2018 the BNTU has introduced the new rule for "Educational Quality Management and Assurance" in order to form one unified system. The above-mentioned document regulates all the aspects of internal quality assurance and will contribute to the optimization of relevant resources.

However, the panel noticed that some of the recently established units are not involved in implementation of internal quality assurance mechanisms (e.g. practice and recruitment office) and the performance evaluation system for academic, scientific, invited, administrative, support staff needs to be further developed according PDCA cycle. The panel also noticed that for the effective implementation of internal quality assurance mechanisms the BTNU needs to allocate more human and information resources (e.g. to increase number of QA staff and to develop internet-based system for surveys).

The BTNU has developed mechanisms for evaluation and improvement of educational programs. These mechanisms are described in Provision of higher education programs development and implementation. Academic/invited staff, together with students and employers are actively involved in these processes. Recently the QA service has implemented monitoring mechanisms for students' academic performance (Ranking system) and will use its results for the improvement of the teaching process.

The activities and recourses of the Institution are evaluated by quality assurance service. Twice in a year the QA service conducts various surveys based on pre-designed paper based questionnaires. Results of these surveys are described in annual report and communicated with the leadership, staff and students of BTNU at the end of each academic year. On the interviews with students and QA staff revealed that student questionnaires are distributed during the midterm examination. The panel considers that this will affect on the validity of survey results. The evaluation is carried out according PDCA cycle and the leadership of the Institution makes decisions based on the reports of QA Service. However, the most of the actions planned for the 2018 was not implemented by the time of authorization visit.

The BNTU has developed mathematical model for planning student contingent, which will be carried out from 2019. The above-mentioned model is described in the BNTU's Development Strategy (2019-2025) and is part of student body planning methodology, which includes relevant indicators and benchmarks. However, the methodology is more general and does not take into consideration different specifications/needs of higher education programs according to their level (BA, MA) and field of study. This approach shall be evaluated internally and externally in the future.

Evidences/indicators

1. Internal quality assurance instruments and mechanisms.
2. Objectives, tasks and functions of QA Service.
3. Provision of higher education programs development and implementation.
4. Ranking system
5. Survey results.
6. Quality assurance reports.
7. Self-evaluation report.
8. Student body planning methodology.
9. Interview results.

Recommendations:

1. Further development of the performance evaluation system for academic, scientific, invited, administrative, support staff according PDCA cycle.

2. Further development of the student body planning methodology, taking into consideration different specifications/needs of higher education programs according to their level (BA, MA) and field of study

3. BNTU needs to allocate sufficient human and information resources for the effective implementation of internal quality assurance mechanisms (to increase number of QA staff and to develop internet-based system for surveys).

4. BNTU needs to review regulatory documents of QA and QSM services to prevent overlapping in responsibilities of their staff.

Suggestions:

-

Best Practices (if applicable):

-

Evaluation

☐ Complies with requirements

☒ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

2.3. Observing Principles of Ethics and Integrity

o HEI has developed regulations and mechanisms that follow principles of ethics and integrity. Such regulations are publicly accessible.

o Institution has implemented mechanisms for detecting plagiarism and its prevention.

o HEI follows the principles of academic freedom.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

Batumi Navigation Teaching University has developed: internal regulations and rules of ethics and behaviour which regulate the work of the university personnel and students, which facilitates the effective and efficient management of teaching/studying and organizational processes. This document is available for all employees of the University as electronic as printed versions. In addition, according to the quality management procedures established in the university, all the documents related to the work processes are presented to all employees and they confirm it with signature on the appropriate page of the document.

The University has also developed a document reflecting the obligation to protect the academic ethics code and the academic integrity. It is mandatory for all persons engaged in scientific research and / or the evaluation of research work. It contains the actions to be carried out in case of plagiarism facts. However, the university does not have any mechanism for detecting plagiarism, except the fact that researcher receives information about the obligations to be kept according to the Code of Academic Ethics and the academic integrity and confirms it by signature. According to the self-evaluation report of the BTNU, the University is planning to buy and implement the use of plagiarism detection computer program. The panel supports this development.

Discussions with staff and students revealed that the Code of Ethics is not communicated to students during their instruction. Information about cheating and its legal consequences is not incorporated in the syllabi of the academic programmes. Also, it was noted, that among the staff and students of BTNU there are not any cases of plagiarism identified and investigated under its current procedures.

University keeps the academic freedom of the personnel, which is described in the "Staff Management Policies / Regulations", as well as in the Job Descriptions. This was also confirmed by the academic staff and students during the interviews, who identified the help of University leadership in the promotion of academic staff and students.

Evidences/indicators

1. Internal Regulations.

2. Code of Ethics. Code of Academic Ethics

3. Obligations of keeping the rules of ethics and behaviour.

	4. Staff Management Policies / Regulations.
	5. Interview with BNTU personnel and students.

Recommendations:

1. Mechanisms of detecting plagiarism should be implemented by the University (e.g. plagiarism detection computer program).
2. All students should be given clear guidance on plagiarism during their instruction. The BNTU should also adopt a variety of alternative mechanisms for increasing students' awareness of the institution's policy on plagiarism and its consequences.
3. The BNTU's plagiarism procedures should be closely monitored to ensure that they constitute an active and effective means of detecting and preventing plagiarism.

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

☐ Complies with requirements

☒ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

3.   Educational Programmes

HEI has procedures for planning, designing, approving, developing and annulling educational programmes. Programme learning outcomes are clearly defined and are in line with the National Qualifications Framework. A programme ensures achievement of its objectives and intended learning outcomes

3.1 Design and Development of Educational Programmes

HEI has a policy for planning, designing, implementing and developing educational programmes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The educational programs, which BNTU sent to authorization expert panel are well-organized. During the experts visit at BNTU, they checked all the activities for design and development of educational programs, which are developed and implemented by the faculty. BNTU has the procedures for planning, designing, approving, developing and annulling the educational programs. The program goals and learning outcomes are clearly defined and are following the National Qualifications Framework. A program ensures achievement of its objectives and intended learning outcomes.

BNTU has the following programs: Bachelor educational programs – Marine Navigation, Ship's Power Plants, Ship's Power Plants (joint program), Logistics; Master educational program – Logistics. The program head (s) together with the other stakeholders (the academic and invited staff, employers, students and alumni), who are involved in the process of development and implementation of the programs, are leading the educational programs. One of their presented programs is the joint program together with Chernigov National Technical University, Ukraine. Because they have only one international student who has Georgian language skills, the teaching language is Georgian.

During the interview seasons with the program head, academic and invited staffs, it has been identified that they are actively involved in the development and implementation of the program. Head of the program coordinates the program implementation and modification. Last modification of the programs was done in 2018. They are qualified and well experienced staff and their team working skills are also very notable.

The Experts panel had the interview with employers. They noted that they were not perfectly involved in the planning, designing, implementing and developing educational programs. According to their requirements, in existing bachelor program of Logistics, the institution had added the following languages: English, Turkish and Russian. Also, periodically, during last 5 years period, they evaluate the program

content, objectives and learning outcomes via the surveys, which are developed and organized by the quality insurance department of BNTU. Recently, they filled out the survey only once, which was about the relations between their company and University. The employers recognized the mission of University and they were involved in the process of developing University strategic plan, they provide the students with 6-month practice in sea; also the employers have confirmed that graduates' employment rate is high and their contribution is great in this case.

During the experts' panel visit in BNTU, the experts' panel have met to students and their self-governance as well as alumni. All they confirmed that they know University mission and they are taking part in surveys, organized by the quality service of BNTU related to educational programs the student satisfaction survey, which includes the questions for evaluation of educational process, environment, educational quality and library at BNTU.

In cases of amending/annulling of programs, students have opportunity to smoothly complete an educational program. It became clear during the interviews with deans and their offices, as well as meeting with students' registration, evaluation and monitoring service staff.

Evidences/indicators
1. BNTU Mission.   2. High education program development and implementation regulations.   3. Individualized education program development and implementation rules.   4. Program Curriculum and Syllabi.   5. Verification forms of curriculum and syllabi.   6. Questionnaires of students, employers, alumni and implementers and their analysis.   7. Materials reflecting /evidencing participation of potential employers and alumni in program examination.
Recommendations:
Suggestions:
Use the international approaches during the implementation of the programs.
Best Practices (if applicable):
Evaluation
☒ Complies with requirements   ☐ Substantially complies with requirements   ☐ Partially complies with requirements   ☐ Does not comply with requirements

3.2 Structure and Content of Educational Programmes

- o Programme learning outcomes are clearly stated and are in line with higher education level and qualification to be granted
- o With the help of individualized education programmes, HEI takes into consideration various requirements, needs and academic readiness of students, and ensures their unhindered involvement into the educational process.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

BNTU educational programs admission pre-requisites correspond to the Georgian legislation requirements and program specification. According to the Law of Georgia and statutory documents of the International Maritime organization (International convention of standards of training. Certification and watch keeping of seafarers, 1978/95, as amended in 2010), study at marine field programs requires relevant state of health, which is necessary to learn specific program components and achieve planned learning outcomes. BNTU observes this standard for maritime specialties.

Also, according to the Law of Georgia, their bachelor programs are composed of academic components, basic specialty and free components with compulsory and elective parts. The master program is composed for academic and research components, which is the master thesis.

Program learning outcomes are clearly stated and are in line with higher education level and qualification to be granted. Program study is carried out in accordance with curriculum and program component – syllabi. All the syllabi are clearly formulated. The pre-requisites of the subjects are well defined and the subject outcomes are the part of program outcomes as well as the objectives of the subject is taking part in program goals.

Teaching and learning methods are in full compliance with students' educational needs. ICT tools are intensively applied in teaching and learning process, also they used very effective e-learning materials as well.

The students, employers and alumni are involved in the formation of the program outcomes and objectives through the participation in surveys organized by BNTU, though despite this, most of the interviewers note that they do not know what the results of these surveys are.

Information for the educational programs are placed on BNTU web page: http://bntu.edu.ge/en/swavla/saganmanatleblo-programebis-katalogi.

With the help of individualized education programs, BNTU takes into consideration various requirements, needs and academic readiness of students, and ensures their unhindered involvement into the educational process. During the practice period in sea the students need the individual programs and BNTU provides this process.

For the joint program "Ship's Power Plants" the program structure is also well formulated. The total number of ECST credits is 250, for the other educational programs, the credit volume of bachelor programs is 240 (ECTS) and of master program is 120 (ECTS) (including research component).

Maritime programs contain the practical components which should be conducted on teaching ship-board as an approved seagoing service. The mandatory practice that is a part of an educational program contains 30 ECTS (equal to 6 months of seagoing service) and is carried out on the ship. BNTU has their own ship-board "Elita".

Evidences/indicators

1. Programs curriculum and syllabi.
2. BNTU mission.
3. Act of approval of programs.
4. HEI's program developments and implementation regulations.
5. Individualized education program development and implementation rules.
6. Analysis of survey of students, staff, alumni, employers.
7. Materials reflecting/ evidencing public examination of programs.
8. Program catalogues.
9. BNTU web page.

Recommendations:

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

☒ Complies with requirements

☐ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

3.3 Assessment of Learning Outcomes

HEI has law-compliant, transparent and fair system of learning outcomes assessment, which promotes the improvement of students' academic performance.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

According to HEI's program developments and implementation regulations, methods of formation and evaluation of competencies and learning outcomes in BNTU programs are reflected in the assessment of learning outcomes. The presented procedures are regularly updated, for what the results of study process monitoring, students and academic personnel surveys are used.

In BNTU evaluation of students is carried out in accordance with 100- point grading systems effective in BNTU on the basis of #3 order of ministry of education and science of Georgia, on approval of rule of calculation of HE program credits. There are two forms of evaluation of academic components - interim evaluation (max 60 credits) and final evaluation (max 40 credits). Assessment criteria' and their relevant scores are not specifically defined in detail. As for the evaluation system, max points are 100, good grades from 51 to 100 (distributed with excellent, very good, good, sufficient, insufficient evaluations) and failing grades from 0 to 50 (did not pass, fall). If students don't agree to assessment, dissatisfied students spontaneously apply to the Dean, which operates based on established practice and general legislation. According by BNTU internal regulations, the students' claim applications shall be examined by the dean and evaluator. If the claim of a student is considered reasonable, examination paper is re-evaluated. During the interviews with the students, deans, deans' secretaries and professors, the questions were asked by the experts' panel. All of them (the students, dean, deans' secretaries and professors) described the above-mentioned process in detail, though the represented students didn't have these problems before.

BNTU Assessment system of learning outcomes is very typical for each the subject. Identical approaches are used to assess practical and cognitive knowledge.

BNTU has electronic service such as an electronic journal. It contains information on study components, its content, objectives, methods, evaluation rules (through syllabi), program implementers (for instance, academic and invited personals), surveys and other important information on the study process. Students can access the system. The system is accessed individually via personal data and a password. This system allows student to receive information on time and to respond accordingly.

During the period of practice, the students have their special logbook, where the practice supervisor confirms all the activities the students are doing during the practice period. Confirmation is granted only if task is executed properly or the student demonstrates the ability to perform specific task.

Based on special educational needs of students, the relevant forms of evaluation and format are selected, but they are not unreasonable special privileges to students, in particular, when the students the short period sea practice, BNTU provides them with special conditions, for instance, to postpone or pass the exams in advance, but it doesn't have the influence for their tuition fees and/or other issues.

Evidences/indicators

1. Programs curriculum and syllabi.
2. HE program developments and implementation regulations.
3. Individualized education program development and implementation rules.
4. Methods of formation and evaluation of competencies and learning outcomes.
5. BNTU ranking system.
6. Regulations of main educational unit- faculty.
7. BNTU internal regulations.
8. Survey results. Changes made on the basis of analysis.
9. BNTU web page.
10. E-portal.

Recommendations:

1. Use the effective and varied methods to develop the specifically defined assessment system for the cognitive and practical skills.
2. Write the evaluation criteria with more details, where the activities and their relevant assessments will be indicated.

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation
☐ Complies with requirements
☒ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

4. Staff of the HEI

HEI ensures that the staff employed in the institution (academic, scientific, invited, administrative, support) are highly qualified, so that they are able to effectively manage educational, scientific and administrative processes and achieve the goals defined by the strategic plan of the institution. On its hand, the institution constantly provides its staff with professional development opportunities and improved work conditions.

4.1. Staff Management
- HEI has staff management policy and procedures that ensure the implementation of educational process and other activities defined in its strategic plan.   - HEI ensures the employment of qualified academic/scientific/invited/administrative/ support staff.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

Batumi Navigation Teaching University has developed the concept of development staff management system, which represents the Annex N1 of the University Development Strategy (2019-2025).

The document contains the principles of Human Resource Management, priorities and objectives of its development, resources for development, responsibilities, monitoring, and rules of employment, training, internships, motivation and encouragement. Thus activity like evaluation of the staff is not the function of HR service but is performed by Quality Assurance Service. It is also remarkable that there is only one employee in HR service and she is simultaneously performing the chancellery functions.

The governing body of the University is focused on maintaining and developing of the existing staff as well as on attracting of new staff, which is essential for ensuring sustainability.

Lack of staff conducting the specific maritime programs, such as Marine Navigation and Ship Mechanics, is identified. These programs are conducted by the very experienced Master mariners and Chief mechanics with a huge knowledge, but as maritime Industry is developing very fast, it is needed to involve the acting seafarers into programs development and lecturing also.

University has employed the academic personnel in accordance with the rules established by the University and applicable to Georgian legislation. Qualification of the academic personnel is consistent with the qualification requirements set by the University, which is also in compliance with the existing legislation.

During interviews with the invited academic personnel, the affiliated staff of Batumi State University mentioned that the main reason for refusing to join BNTU as affiliated staff is the lack of possibility of conducting research activities. This is a hindering condition for maintaining the sustainability of the university. Thus in the 3 year action plan of the Strategic Development of the BNTU the 4th action is development of scientific-research activities.

In the Staff Management Policy, the university has the priority directions and tasks of the staff management system in which the priority is to develop the system of attraction of new staff, Increasing the motivation of staff, active involvement of new employees in the work processes, etc. Facilitating the development of staff by the management is confirmed by financing the personnel trainings, organizing conferences and facilitating staff and student involvement. In order to establish the weakness and strengths of the university, the huge questionnaire was elaborated and filled out by all employees and on the basis of the results, the University has developed action plan for 2018 to increase staff satisfaction.

BNTU also collects the feedback estimating pedagogical staff from students after the first interim examination, which is not enough to have the full picture of their performance.

The University has established the qualification requirements for all positions in job descriptions and working agreements. The qualification of the university staff meets the qualification requirements set by the university.

Evidences/indicators

1. Staff Management Policies / Regulations.
2. BNTU Strategic Development Plan.
3. First part of BNTU Strategic Development Plan (2019-2021).
4. Methodology of personnel planning.
5. Affiliation rules of academic personnel.
6. Interview with affiliated and academic staff.

Recommendations:

1. HR Service should perform the necessary activities to evaluate staff and present the result to the QAS to discuss it with the management who will take needed decisions.
2. In order have student opinion towards pedagogical staff BNTU should collect feedback from students at the end of the academic year.
3. University should invite the active seafarers to share their experience, challenges and devices with the students. It would be a good motivator for students.
4. At least one employee should be hired in HR service.

Suggestions:

To ensure sustainability BNTU shall extend/develop research activities.

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

☐ Complies with requirements

☒ Substantially complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

4.2. Academic/Scientific and Invited Staff Workload

Number and workload of academic/scientific and invited staff is adequate to HEI's educational programmes and scientific-research activities, and also other functions assigned to them

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

BNTU has 22 affiliated and 34 invited academic personnel. Academic personnel are hired through the transparent open competition. In order to plan affectively the number and workload of the personnel university has the new document - personnel planning methodology. According to this methodology each employee fills out the daily workload, then head of structural unit figures out employee's monthly workload, after which factual workload of the employee is calculated with the special formula and finally the workload of the whole structural unit is performed. This method allows to identify if the workload ensures proper fulfilment of staff's obligations, also need of new staff, etc., and ensures fulfilment of activities assigned to staff.

The main factor determining the number of academic staff is the number of existing and future students, academic year, programs and budgets. With the purpose of accommodating the hiring personnel and workload conditions, the university has the personnel management policy, also developed the staff planning methodology, rules of academic personnel affiliation, also agreements and job descriptions. Right now the invited staff / student ratio is satisfactory and BNTU considers the increasing of the teaching personnel in case of more students' enrolment. It was evidenced through the interviews with the students that the workload of the staff ensures the proper fulfilment of their obligation.

Affiliated academic personnel determine their affiliation only with the Batumi Navigation Teaching University. This provision is confirmed by signed agreements with all 22 affiliated personnel.

Evidences/indicators

1. Staff Management Policies / Regulations.
2. BNTU Strategic Development Plan.
3. Methodology of personnel planning.
4. Affiliation rules of academic personnel.
5. Interview with affiliated and academic staff.

Recommendations:
Suggestions:
Best Practices (if applicable):
Evaluation ☒ Complies with requirements ☐ Substantially complies with requirements ☐ Partially complies with requirements ☐ Does not comply with requirements

5. Students and Their Support Services

HEI ensures the development of student-centred environment, offers appropriate services, including career support mechanisms; it also ensures maximum awareness of students, implements diverse activities and promotes student involvement in these activities. HEI utilizes student survey results to improve student support services

5.1. The Rule for Obtaining and Changing Student Status, the Recognition of Education, and Student Rights
o For each of the educational levels, HEI has developed regulations for assignment, suspension and termination of student status, mobility, qualification granting, issuing educational documents as well as recognition of education received during the learning period. o HEI ensures the protection of student rights and lawful interests.
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements
During visit experts have found out that BNTU has developed and published documentation for obtaining and changing student's status, have tools and procedures for education recognition and policies to protect students' rights. These documentations are published on the BNTU web site (bntu.edu.ge) and all the information is public. During the interview students have indicated that they were informed about the existence of these documents, also students said that they have the opportunity to fill lecturer evaluation form which is online. Also they are able to appeal their grades to their professors if they are not satisfied with grades and in case of negative result faculty is obliged to create council which will discuss the issue again. There is self-government which is conducting meetings with students to discuss their problematic issues which will be discussed with the administration after. Experts have checked contract form for vocational, all level students and they are adopted for supporting student rights and interest. At BNTU students are able to make their own schedule of paying tuition fee and pay it in several instalments. Also bachelor graduates have discounts if they continue on master program at BNTU. Students have right to: be part of any students' selfgovernment, be member of faculty council, use mobility and change faculty or university, get an academic holiday, evaluate academy's academic and management staff, etc.
Evidences/indicators 1. bntu.edu.ge 2. http://bntu.edu.ge/swavla/student/gzamklevi 3. http://bntu.edu.ge/swavla/iuridiuli-cnobari 4. Agreement with student
Recommendations:
Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation
- ☒ Complies with requirements
- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

5.2 Student Support Services

o HEI has student consulting services in order to plan educational process and improve academic performance

o HEI has career support service, which provides students with appropriate counselling and support regarding employment and career development

o HEI ensures students awareness and involvement in various university-level, local and international projects and events, and supports student initiatives

o HEI has mechanisms, including financial mechanisms to support low SES students

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

There are relevant staff at department of student registration, mobility and assessment who are responsible to provide consulting services in order to plan educational process and improve academic performance. They support students to use internal learning management system to make registration on lectures. This system helps students to check their own schedule, status, grades, to get learning materials and information about their lectures. All students confirmed these information on the interview sessions and the panel checked above mentioned learning management system online.

There is a career support service in the structure of BNTU under the name of Practice and Employment Service, but this organizational unit was established this year and it wasn't fully functional during the site visit. For example there wasn't a room for responsible person of the above mentioned structural unit and students weren't informed that University was providing such kind of service to them. There is not data base of alumni and their current employment status, so they BNTU is unable to trace their graduates. But we want to mention that before establishing this unit faculty deans were helping students to make their internship in different companies and helping in writing CV-s to find suitable job. The faculty provides meetings with employers and students and makes communication process easier between two sides. During the interview experts were informed that nowadays Practice and Employment Service is providing help only for maritime faculty students but not for the Logistics faculty students.

Based on the programs there was a practice during the study period and it was supported by faculty. Practice is a part of both faculty programs. Because BNTU educational programs need specific practice, there is some difficulties to find vessel or ship for sea practice, but university staff are making their best to arrange meetings with foreign companies and help students to get appropriate practice. The panel has also visited ship "Elita" which is university's property and suitable for the part of the practice (Second half is provided by different international vessels).

BNTU students are very active at different projects. Main initiator is student self-government which is planning and organizing different kinds of sport activities, excursions, etc. There is a procedure for students to present their projects (sport activities, cultural activities, etc) and get financing for them. Self-government has provided us the list of activities which were financed and performed this year and also plan of sport and cultural activities for the next year.

BNTU has a special document where special offers for SES students are indicated. These offers includes special financial and non-financial benefits for them.

Evidences/indicators

1. http://bntu.edu.ge/swavla/student/gzamklevi
2. http://bntu.edu.ge/swavla/iuridiuli-cnobari
3. Structure of BNTU
4. Low SES students support

Recommendations:
1. Practice and Employment Service should be available for all students of every programme offered by BNTU.
2. BNTU should create data base of alumni and trace their careers.
Suggestions:
Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation
    ☐ Complies with requirements
    ☒ Substantially complies with requirements
    ☐ Partially complies with requirements
    ☐ Does not comply with requirements

6. Research, development and/or other creative work

Higher Education Institution, considering its type and specifics of field(s), works on the strengthening of its research function, ensures proper conditions to support research activities and improve the quality of research activities

6.1 Research Activities
o HEI, based on its type and specifics of its fields, carries out research/creative activities. o Ensuring the effectiveness of doctoral research supervision o HEI has public, transparent and fair procedures for the assessment and defense of dissertations which are relevant to the specifics of the field
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements Because BNTU does not have a PhD program that implies research, the academic staff of BNTU is mainly focused on teaching, but research is at least minimal because they have the graduate programs in which the master's thesis should be done. The academic staff are aimed to prepare the methodological and teaching materials in marine field in Georgian language. Research activities is the potential area of development of BNTU. The academic staff has the research works, but they are don't have high scientific indexes. Only one invited professor has one article, which can be found in google Scholar; almost all of them are published in a local level or not well known journals. Therefore, only a few relevant publications can be find out. However, they have their scientific journal and they are organizing the scientific conferences every year. They are trying to involve the regional and local level participants in this conference. Also, only a few researchers had possibilities to take the part in international conferences abroad. There isn't joint international research works and activities, teachers and researchers do not participate in professional forums and blogs. During the interviews with the students it was mentioned by them, that they never had been involved in research activities, moreover, they didn't know the meaning of research. During the interviews with professors, researchers and employers, it was revealed that even in local level research results aren't integrated in BNTU educational programs as well as the economic, technological and innovative goals of these researches isn't clear. They have memorandums of cooperation with the companies, but no cooperation with economic agents in order to implement the research results. During the experts' panel visits in BNTU Master thesis (last 5 years) were reviewed. The structure of master thesis is well-formed and executed. According to the Master program requirements, in particular, in scientific-research component (Master thesis), the defense of Master thesis is ensured through public, transparent, and fair procedures. Study envisaged within the Master's Educational Program will ensure compliance with the level of theoretical knowledge and research skills of MAs with learning outcomes defined by the Master's Program. Most of their international research activities are planned from 2019 year and these are indicated in the strategic plan of BNTU.

Evidences/indicators

1. BNTU mission.
2. BNTU development strategy 2019-2025.
3. Faculty development concept 2019-2025.
4. Department development concept 2019-2025.
5. Memorandums.
6. Survey results.
7. Materials describing/evidencing involvement of BNTU in research activity.

Recommendations:

1. To take part in international scientific research activities.
2. To use the research results in educational programs development and teaching activities.
3. To establish collaboration with economic agents in order to share the research achievements with these agents.
4. To do research works actively.
5. To take part in professional forums and blogs.
6. To involve the students in their research works.

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

☐ Complies with requirements

☐ Substantially complies with requirements

☒ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

6.2. Research Support and Internationalization

o HEI has an effective system in place for supporting research, development and creative activities
o Attracting new staff and their involvement in research/arts-creative activities.
o University works on internationalization of research, development and creative activities.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

BNTU tries to carry out the scientific research activities of academic staffs, funds for academic, scientific research business trips (the number of which is relatively low), publication of textbooks and maritime materials in Georgian language. However, nowadays their internationalization level is very low. BNTU doesn't have the clear defined procedures for the research activities and internationalization as well as there isn't a public, transparent and fair procedures for funding research. BNTU doesn't have experience to provide the researchers to find funding or research resources, though during the interviews to academic and invited staff were mentioned the readiness of University to use infrastructure freely. BNTU doesn't have the grant projects/programs, accordingly they don't have the research units in this direction. BNTU have a good connection with post-Soviet Union and socialism countries, which is in the frame of participation in conferences. BNTU never had the mobility programs for the students and academic/administrative staff.

In their strategic plan 2019-2025 they are planning to improve these issues for raising the quality of education and research with co-operation (including international) with educational institutions, also to establish and implement English-language and joint education programs (which they already have). More specifically, they are planning: development of international scientific activities, involvement of BNTU academic staff in international scientific conferences and workshops, promotion of staff scientific activities, preparation of students for the participation in conferences, participation in joint project/programs, increase the number of international peer-reviewed magazines.

BNTU doesn't have the mechanism for attracting and supporting new staff in research activities.

Evidences/indicators

1. Research activity covering regulations.
2. Materials of competition of targeted projects. Material evidencing project financing.
3. BNTU web page.

Recommendations:
1. To involve in international scientific and research communities.
2. Take care of the development of international and local grants and their management.
3. To take part in international mobility programs.
4. Support and develop the effective systems of research in international level.
5. To increase the scientific-research interests of academic staff and support them.
6. Practice effective system for attracting and supporting new staff in research activities.

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation
- ☐ Complies with requirements
- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☒ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

6.3. Evaluation of Research Activities

HEI has a system for evaluating and analysing the quality of research/creative-arts activities, and the productivity of scientific-research units and academic/scientific staff.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

BNTU doesn't have the system of plagiarism, but they want to buy and use it from 2019. Institution doesn't have the system for evaluation of staff scientific productivity, accordingly doesn't exists the systems of analysis of implemented research activities. The students aren't well informed about the research activities. BNTU did the analysis of academic staff activity 2013-2018, where are the research activities too. They are planning to increase the level in 2019-2025, but the further development plan of research activities isn't detailed; basically, there are the list of general further steps. The productivity of scientific works are the methodological works, which are reflected in the readers, they are doing for their courses. BNTU has a workload scheme of academic staff; according to this it's obligated to carry out particular research activities.

Evidences/indicators
1. Research Activity Governing Regulations.
2. Workload scheme of academic staff.
3. Analysis of academic staff activity.
4. BNTU development strategy 2019-2025.
5. BNTU web page.

Recommendations:
1. To use the antiplagiarism program.
2. To involve the students in the research works and activities.
3. Publish the reports on implemented research activities.
4. Reflect the evaluation results in further development plan of research activities.

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation
☐ Complies with requirements ☐ Substantially complies with requirements ☒ Partially complies with requirements ☐ Does not comply with requirements

7. Material, Information and Financial Resources

Material, information and financial resources of HEI ensure sustainable, stable, effective and efficient functioning of the institution, and the achievement of goals defined through strategic development plan.

7.1 Material Resources
o The institution possesses or owns material resources (fixed and current assets) that are used for achieving goals stated in the mission statement, adequately responds to the requirements of educational programmes and research activities, and corresponds to the existing number of students and planned enrolment. o HEI offers environment necessary for implementing educational activities: sanitary units, natural light possibilities, and central heating system. o Health and safety of students and staff is protected within the institution. o HEI has adapted environment for people with special needs

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements
The university owns several buildings which are well equipped to serve the teaching process for maximum 1000 students. All the classrooms are renovated recently. Besides the classrooms for theoretical classes there are several laboratories specially designed according to the main field of the university (sea pollution prevention training laboratory; electric navigation; ship handling and manoeuvring laboratory; collective rescue equipment simulator; land-based fire-fighting training facility; electronic chart display and informational system simulator; engine room simulator; bridge team simulator, liquid cargo handling and tanker simulator). There is a small café; space for student self-government and a student dormitory for 64 persons. The university owns training ship "Elita" in Batumi port.

All Buildings are provided with natural and artificial lightening supply. All the campus is provided with central heating system. Buildings are equipped with fire-fighting means: fire hydrants and fire-fighting equipment are on place. For the purpose of the safety in emergency situations evacuation plans are displayed on some visible places at all floors of the building, emergency contact phones of relevant service are displayed in each classroom.

University security service unit is responsible to protect the safety of students and people employed at the organization, prevent illegal acts and guaranty the protection of the material resources. For this reason there are several cameras installed both inside the building and outside it, as well as the people employed in the unit are monitoring the campus 24/7.

First medical aid service is provided locally at the campus, for this reason there is a small room and person employed. All necessary equipment are on place.

The university has adapted environment for people with special needs. Elevator and other facilities guarantee the freely navigation of people with the special needs. Special sanitary facilities for people with limited abilities are provided. However, the elevator isn't accessible in any other building than the main one and the toilet for people with special needs is only one and for only female. Not all the rooms were acquitted with ventilation system that can cause problems in summer time, once the temperature gets hot.

Evidences/indicators
1. Extract from the Public Register
2. Cadastral Survey of building
3. Documents evidencing property rights on movable estate
4. BNTU activity governing main regulations (Internal regulations)
5. Documents confirming payment of utility service fees

Recommendations:

Suggestions:
Toilet for people with special needs can be arranged either in male sections as well, or in a separate room both for male and female.

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation
☒ Complies with requirements
☐ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

7.2. Library Resources

Library environment, resources and service support effective implementation of educational and research activities, and HEI constantly works for its improvement.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The library is an independent structural unit which is running with its own regulations. The library space is divided into reading-hall, space for group work, repository and space for library staff. The reading hall is equipped with personal computers and free WIFI access is also available. The library is open 6 days a week in total 61 hours a week. Copy/printing machine and scanner are accessible in the reading hall. The library has implemented OPAC, and some of the resources are accessible within it.

The library offers the interlibrary loan service, however in the case of some partners it doesn't really works (it's unclear how would it work in case of international partners).

The library is subscribed to international scientific databases, but the majority of the databases are in social sciences and humanities which are not sufficient to the university profile. The usage statistics are extremely low and there is not any service for students and faculty members in using scientific databases. There is not possibility of remote access to the databases. Students can't remember any training delivered by the library staff.

The book order at the repository are in accordance with international standards in library and information science, but the process is ongoing and the majority of the resources are not arranged according to any standards yet, that said, it's not easy even for the library staff member to find a book on the shelf.

There is not a big variety of services library offers to students or to faculty members in terms of information literacy and academic integrity issues.

The readers prepared by the faculty members as a major textbook for students in some cases are just translations and the list of references are missed, that can be against the copy right of the original books. The library with communication to faculty members update the resources available at the reading halls, this include both the textbooks and scientific literature, guides etc. According to student satisfaction survey they get sufficient support from library staff, however, during the interviews it was identified that that the library staff wish to update their professional skills but couldn't find any possibility yet.

Evidences/indicators

1. Regulations of BNTU Library
2. Memorandums
3. License Agreements
4. Concept of development of BNTU common information area
5. BNTU Web-Page
6. Interview results

Recommendations:

1. The scientific databases should be subscribed considering the profile of the university.
2. The library staff should offer regular trainings both to faculty members and students in order to promote the usage of the databases.
3. The library staff should identify their role in providing student support services in terms of academic integrity.

4. The books should be arranged according to international standards, so that accessibility will be increased.
5. The library staff should provide support to faculty members in preparing readers, to explain the main rules of citation and referencing.
6. The librarians should update their professional skills regularly that can be done under the mobility programs that university aims to develop in the coming years.

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation
- ☐ Complies with requirements
- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☒ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

7.3 Information Resources

- o HEI has created infrastructure for information technologies and its administration and accessibility are ensured
- o Electronic services and electronic management systems are implemented and mechanisms for their constant improvement are in place
- o HEI ensures business continuity
- o HEI has a functional web-page in Georgian and English languages.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

University has infrastructure which follows IT service requirements. There is a unit of information technology which is responsible and able to deal with related issues and problems as for web site and internet (WI-FI) as well as computer software and data bases (servers).

IT risk management practice is clear and feasible, the data concerning administrative process is stored online in study information system. The data is backed up on a regular basis. Personal data protection mechanisms are relevant and secured.

Whole perimeter of buildings is covered with Wi-Fi internet which is open for everyone. BNTU has Learning Managements System where the student's registration is done, they can see schedule of lectures (time lecturer's name and room number), see their assessment and progress, evaluate academic staff and administration (in some cases) and get study materials. Academic staff use this software to plan their lectures, in case of need have communication with students and make assessment.

Web-site is fully functional in Georgian and English languages and there is updated information which is needed for students, academy staff and stakeholders (like employers, school graduates etc.)

Evidences/indicators
1. Web-page – bntu.edu.ge
2. Contracts with suppliers
3. Regulations of technology Support and Regulation service
4. Interview results

Recommendations:

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

    ☒ Complies with requirements

    ☐ Substantially complies with requirements

    ☐ Partially complies with requirements

    ☐ Does not comply with requirements

7.4 Financial Resources

- Allocation of financial resources described in the budget of HEI is economically achievable
- Financial standing of HEI ensures performance of activities described in strategic and mid-term action plans
- HEI financial resources are focused on effective implementation of core activities of the institution
- HEI budget provides funding for scientific research and library functioning and development
- HEI has an effective system of accountability, financial management and control

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The main financial plan of the university is consolidated budget which is composed of the two parts – income and expenditure. Budget formation includes preparatory, formation and its approval stages. Allocation of the financial resources is clear and is more or less based on the priorities outlined in the strategic development plan. The main income in the budget is the study fee students have to pay.

The heads of the structural units acting in the academy are involved in the budget formation. They submit information in the financial-economic department, which, on the basis of the information received, determines the budget project according to the priorities. The draft budget will be submitted to the Academic Council.

Budget funds of the Academy are directed towards providing educational functions. However, as it was revealed during the interview, the main part of the budget is used for infrastructure development and administrative functions. Funding of academic activities, internationalization and research is in the budget, but the amount dedicated to this activates are still low compare to others.

According to interviews, financial monitoring is done both by the academic council and financial office. However, there wasn't any document stating the finical audit was done by eligible auditor, in addition to this there is no any audit report available on the university web-page, neither is the budget.

Evidences/indicators

1. BNTU budget of 2013-2017 period
2. Budget of 2018
3. Regulations of financial department
4. Interview results

Recommendations:

The budget should be planned in accordance with developing research activities, prioritized to academic and administrative staff development programs.

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

    ☐ Complies with requirements

    ☒ Substantially complies with requirements

    ☐ Partially complies with requirements

    ☐ Does not comply with requirements