



განათლების ხარისხის განვითარების ეროვნული ცენტრი
NATIONAL CENTER FOR EDUCATIONAL QUALITY ENHANCEMENT

Accreditation Expert Group Report on Higher Education Programme

Higher Education Programme

Ship Mechanics

HEI's Name

Batumi Navigation Teaching University

Date(s) of Evaluation

9 of October 2018

Report Submission Date

Tbilisi

2018

HEI's Information Profile

Name of Institution Indicating its Organizational Legal Form	LTD Batumi Navigation Teaching University
HEI's Identification Code	245433623
Type of Institution	Teaching University

Higher Education Programme Information Profile

Name of the Programme	Ship Mechanics
Level of Education	First level of higher education
Qualification Granted Indicating Qualification Code	Bachelor of Engineering in Maritime Engineering 0419
Language of Instruction	Georgian
Number of Credits	240
Programme Status (Authorized/ Accredited/New)	Accredited

Expert Panel Members

Chair (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Janusz Uriasz, Maritime University of Szczecin, Poland
Member (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Otar Jijavadze Batumi State Maritime Academy, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Manana Moistsrapishvili, Georgia Georgian Technical University, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Nino Gorgoshadze (Employer representative), Maritime Transport Agency of Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Irma Makharadze (Student expert), Georgia Tbilisi State University, Georgia

Accreditation Report Executive Summary

▪ **General information on the education programme**

The programme of Ship Mechanics is run by the Batumi Navigation Teaching University since 2013. In that year the programme was granted with the accreditation by National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement. Programme is delivered on the Bachelor level. It shall fulfil corresponding requirements of the International Maritime Organisation Convention on Standards of Training Certification and Watchkeeping (STCW) as well the Law of Georgia on "Seafarers' Education and Certification". The programme is subject to meet also benchmark of Maritime Engineering (Study area code of ISCED-F: 0716) as Ship's Engineer profession (code of ISCO-08: 3151) is regulated in Georgia. The program last 4 years and has volume of 240 ECTS including 180 ECTS of the component of the specialization. An integrated part of the programme is professional practice. Programme shall ensure granting qualification of Engineer's Bachelor in Naval Engineering.

▪ **Brief overview of the accreditation site-visit**

The site visit at LTD Batumi Navigation Teaching University was prepared and carried out in accordance with the applicable procedure. The visit took place on 9 of October 2018. The Visiting Team reviewed the self-assessment report provided by the University. The visit started with the University Senior Administration meeting. The subsequent visit took place in accordance with the agreed programme. During the visit, meetings were held with 1) University Self-Evaluation team; 2) head of the programme; 3) faculty teachers; 4) invited lecturers 5) employers and internship supervisors; 6) Students; 7) Alumni. The team visited the University didactic infrastructure including training ship, library, workshops, simulators. In addition, selected diploma thesis was reviewed. During the close meeting the Chair of the Expert Members overviewed and briefly presented first findings, main comments and recommendations.

Summary of education programme's compliance with the standards

National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement carried out the programme evaluation of the Batumi Navigation Teaching University in accordance with the new five standards for the first time. Each standard was evaluated on virtue of established criteria using provided documentation and interviews with staff and stakeholders during the site-visit as evidences.

In general, the programme evaluation showed that Batumi Navigation Teaching University is able to deliver intended programme. However, University needs improvement and amendments in order to meet all required Field Characteristic of Maritime Engineering. From the 5 assessed standards three were assessed as "complies with requirements" namely: 1. Programme objectives are clearly defined and achievable; they are consistent with the mission of the HEI and take into consideration labour market demands, 3. Student achievements and individual work with them, 5. Teaching quality enhancement opportunities, one as "substantially complies with requirements" namely 4. Providing teaching resources and one as Partially Complies with Requirements namely: 2. Teaching methodology and organization, adequate evaluation of programme mastering.

▪ **Summary of Recommendations**

Visiting team acting formulated recommendations in area of general activity of Batumi Navigation Teaching University. University is recommended to:

1. Standard 1:
 - a. to amend the rule on elaboration, modification and creation of the program defining that students and alumni always participate in the process and try to involve more Alumni and Students in elaboration or modification of the Curricula and in formation of learning outcomes.
 - b. to reduce number of programme learning outcomes by extraction and generalization of currently assumed learning outcome set.
 - c. to modify Map of Learning Outcomes in Curricula and identify programme specific learning outcomes for elaboration of explicit plan of their assessment.
2. Standard 2:
 - a. to the check content in academic courses and clarify the admission requirements where is necessary or missing.
 - b. to check the content of academic courses and update literature to the recent editions.
 - c. to ensure that students receive required practice on ships with parametres meeting established Field requirements.
 - d. to indicate in the contracts concluded between the Teaching University and the partner organizations implementing the seagoing practice the number of students and duration of the practice.
 - e. to select, according to the content and learning outcomes of the academic courses of the educational program, the forms and methods of learning and teaching and clearly and specifically describe them in the syllabus of each academic course.
3. Standard 4:
 - a. to provide the seagoing practice on the vessel(s) satisfying legislation's requirements whenever practice is to be counted as seagoing professional practice.
 - b. to renew the workshops required by field specification for practical trainings.
 - c. to elaborate unified regulations or procedures for evaluation of academic and invited staff, incorporating analyze criteria and feedback mechanisms.
4. Standard 5:
 - a. to create more detailed mechanism for monitoring of educational program and involve the persons with qualification able to evaluate the program.

▪ **Summary of Suggestions**

Visiting team formulated suggestions for Batumi Navigation Teaching University aiming for its improvement. University is suggested to:

1. Standard 1:
 - a. to reflect internationalization issues in programme objectives in order to ensure programme consistence with the Mission, Vision, Goals and Strategy set up by the University.
 - b. to involve shipping companies or operators from the employment side in the programme elaboration and modification process except of crewing companies and conduct surveys from shipping companies.
2. Standard 2:
 - a. to make agreement with other maritime universities worldwide, so students will have the opportunity to study abroad.

- b. to hold more meetings with the students about job opportunities, so they have more information about open vacancies.
- 3. Standard 4:
 - a. to establish defined criteria in relation with the election of academic staff by professional sign, stating the professor's skills, related with research and teaching process management.
 - b. to increase affiliated academic staff for keeping balance and sustainability of the programme.
 - c. to elaborate specific norms and regulations for defining the workload of academic staff and invited personnel and establish unified approach.
 - d. to encourage academic staff for international activity.
- 4. Standard 5:
 - b. to amend and modify the structure chart and identify the place for ISO Quality management unit in order to avoid some confusion in duties and responsibilities.
 - c. to add questions regarding occupied position and period needed for carrier development in alumni evaluation form in order to have a better picture of employment.
 - d. to study and analyze why student's achievement is low and has decreasing tendency while alumni and students' satisfaction is high according to conducted surveys.
 - e. to use external evaluation as real tool for program improvement.
 - f. to compare the program with the programs offered by foreign leading maritime institutes for benchmarking.

- **Summary of best practices (If Applicable)**

- **In case of accredited programme, summary of significant accomplishments and/or progress (If Applicable)**

In standard 2 visiting team identified improvement. Within the program, the number of hours assigned for the practice component have been increased and inaccuracies in the admission requirements for the academic programs have been eliminated

Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards

1. Educational programme objectives, learning outcomes and their compliance with the programme

A programme has clearly established objectives and learning outcomes, which are logically connected to each other. Programme objectives are consistent with the mission, objectives and strategic plan of the institution. Programme learning outcomes are assessed on a regular basis in order to improve the programme.

1.1 Programme Objectives

Programme objectives define the set of knowledge, skills and competences the programme aims to develop in graduate students. They also illustrate the contribution to the development of the field and the society.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

Ship mechanics educational programme is a regulated programme, for which national Filed Specification benchmark was established in 2017. Programme objectives are in compliance with the objectives set up by the Filed Specification. It stipulates all necessary requirements regarding knowledge and skills which should be developed in Maritime Engineer to perform their duties and functions defined by the International or National standards. Objectives are clear, realistic and it is available on the web-page.

Program Objectives involve the components, which contribute to the development of society and give the student chance of carrier development and possibility to continue studies on the next level of higher education.

BNTU plans to be integrated in international maritime education system that is correspondently reflected in Strategic plan. One of the missions of the University sets "Obtaining image of leader in maritime education field internationally, in particular, Black Sea and Caucasus region". However, University does not consider any elements of internationally offered experience and practice in the programme objectives, which would ensure the consistence of the programme with the mission and strategy and would improve the program internationalization issues.

Program objectives are shared by the people involved in the programme, objectives are familiar to faculty members, academic staff, invited personnel, administration.

Evidences/indicators

1. Programme description (curriculum).
2. Mission of BNTU.
3. Analysis of requirements of employers, alumni, students.
4. Approach to internationalization.
5. Site visit interviews.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

- to reflect internationalization issues in programme objectives in order to ensure programme consistence with the Mission, Vision, Goals and Strategy set up by the University.

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

1.2. Programme Learning Outcomes

- Programme learning outcomes describe knowledge, skills, and/or the sense of responsibility and autonomy, students gain upon completion of the programme;
- Programme learning outcomes assessment cycle consists of defining, collecting and analysing data;
- Programme learning outcomes assessment results are utilized for the improvement of the programme.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

Programme learning outcome has been developed on the virtue of the Field Specification, taking into consideration requirements of the STCW Convention. Different stakeholders were involved in elaboration process of Learning outcome and various data (employment rate, certifying exam results, and alumni continuing their studies) were collected and analyzed. Employment surveys evidence the assessment of learning outcomes from their side.

University proposed detailed set of learning outcomes which seems to be to numerous. An extract and generalization should be made. In this way a simplified picture of learning outcomes could be proposed for potential programme takers. Presented by University table so called “Map of Learning Outcomes” is useless because it doesn’t contain learning outcomes.

Elaboration of the programme is conducted in accordance with the normative document of BNTU on “elaboration and conducting high educational programmes”. The document stipulates that the working group is created for the purposes of elaboration or modification of the program, which is led by head of the program or one of the members from the Faculty Council. Document stipulates that Working Group consists of the potential employers, partner organizations and partner institutions may be involved. It can be considered, that student as a faculty member participates in working group, but there is not a direct indication regarding the Alumni or Students’ involvement in working group. As it is described in the document the working group drafts the program and provides it to the Quality Assurance Service for revision. After revision Programme is approved by Academic Council. BNTU uses the method to learn and analyze students’ and alumni’s satisfaction or expectations, but in the document establishing the rules for modification or creation the programme there is no indication that they can be directly involved in elaboration, modification or improvement processes of the program learning outcome, that can lead to the fact that learning outcomes would not be established with participation of all programme stakeholders. Moreover

during the interviews there was evidenced that students and alumni were not familiar with the changes in the programme.

Knowledge and skills defined by the programme are in compliance with program objectives as well as with Field Specification and are grouped as learning outcomes in accordance with the following criteria: knowledge and understanding, applying the knowledge; Making judgment; Communication skills; Learning skills; Values.

Correspondence between the developed criteria and each subject rather than learning outcomes is reflected in the Map of the learning outcomes of curricula.

BNTU regulates the assessment and formulation of learning outcome and competencies by established methodology, where students' learning outcome evaluation methods is described, such as summative, formative methods, interim and final exams, forms of assessment (oral exam, test, essay, role game, presentation), criteria and benchmarks for learning outcome evaluation are given.

BNTU conducts evaluation and analyzes of students' achievement by established normative document that promotes to utilize the learning outcomes assessment result for program improvement.

Evidences/indicators

1. Programme description - curriculum, syllabuses.
2. Analysis of requirements of employers, alumni, students.
3. Graduates & employment rate, results of certificate examinations.
4. Evaluation of the quality of the programme implementation, mechanisms for the evaluation of learning outcomes.
5. Analysis of academic performance according to the years 2013-2018.
6. web-site <http://bntu.edu.ge/swavla/saganmanatleblo-programebis-katalogi>.
7. Site visit interviews.

Recommendations:

- to amend the rule on elaboration, modification and creation of the program defining that students and alumni always participate in the process and try to involve more Alumni and Students in elaboration or modification of the Curricula and in formation of learning outcomes,
- to reduce number of programme learning outcomes by extraction and generalization of currently assumed learning outcome set,
- to modify Map of learning Outcomes in Curricula and identify programme specific learning outcomes for elaboration of explicit plan of their assessment.

Suggestions for programme development:

- to involve shipping companies or operators from the employment side in the programme elaboration and modification process except of crewing companies and conduct surveys from shipping companies

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

Programme’s Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Educational programme objectives, learning outcomes and their compliance with the programme	X			

2. Teaching methodology and organization, adequate evaluation of programme mastering

Programme admission preconditions, programme structure, content, teaching and learning methods, and student assessment ensure the achievement of programme objectives and intended learning outcomes.

2.1. Programme Admission Preconditions

Higher education institution has relevant, transparent, fair, public and accessible programme admission preconditions.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

Admission requirements for the Bachelor’s educational program ‘Ship Mechanics’ have been defined according to the applicable legislation of Georgia- full general education. Enrollment in the program is based on the results of the unified national exams (ranking document), except for cases considered by the Law of Georgia on Higher Education, where enrollment without taking the unified national exams is done in the manner prescribed by law). Also, studies at the Bachelor’s educational program may be continued by the internal and/or external mobility taking into account the regulations for recognition of credits for the students of the Bachelor’s educational programs of BNTU and other HEIs.

In addition to the above, the admission requirements for the Bachelor’s program ‘Ship Mechanics’ take an account of the sectoral descriptors of maritime engineering and the requirements of the normative documents of the International Maritime Organization (International Convention on Standards of Training, Certification and Watchkeeping for Seafarers, 1978/95, as amended in 2010) for relevant health condition that is necessary for studying specific components and achievement the planned learning outcomes of the program. A health condition is reflected in respective

medical certificate issued, in a prescribed manner, by a medical facility selected by the Agency (the list is provided on the website of the Agency www.mta.gov.ge).

Thus, the admission requirements for the program take an account of its specifics that ensures the involvement, in the program, of individuals which hold the knowledge, skills and competence necessary for acquiring the program, to overcome the program.

The catalog of the educational program is provided on the web-site <http://bntu.edu.ge/swavla/saganmanatleblo-programebis-katalogi> that allows the interested individuals to obtain information on the admission requirements for the program. The web-site of the institution also includes an information banner providing for prospective students of Batumi Navigation Teaching University an easy access to all the required information.

Ultimately, the admission requirements for the program are relevant to the applicable legislation, taken an account of its specifics, are fair, public and accessible to the interested individuals.

Evidences /indicators

- Educational program "Ship Mechanics",
- Web-site <http://bntu.edu.ge/swavla/saganmanatleblo-programebis-katalogi>.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

2.2 Educational Programme Structure and Content

Programme is designed according to HEI's methodology for planning, designing and developing of educational programmes. Programme content takes programme admission preconditions and programme learning outcomes into account. Programme structure is consistent and logical. Programme content and structure ensure the achievement of programme learning outcomes. Qualification to be granted is consistent with programme content and learning outcomes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The Bachelor's educational program `Ship Mechanics` has been modified according to the document `Rule of Elaboration of Programs and Requirements for a Curriculum and Syllabus` applicable at the HEI. According to the above rule and by the order N01-15 (11.12.2017) of the Rector of Batumi Navigation Teaching University, a working group is established led by the Head of Administration. The program has been modified in stages. In particular: 1. For the purpose of taking into account the recommendations of the accreditation experts; 2. For the purpose of

improvement of the student evaluation system; 3. For the purpose of program development (increase of the number of the optional academic courses offered, Etc.); 4. For the purpose of taking an account of the amendments made to the Decree #3 (05.01.2007) of the Minister of Education and Science of Georgia on the Approval of Rules for Calculation of Credits of Higher Education Program, and of program development (enhancement of the selection opportunity: taking into account the principle of selection, etc. in the specialty component); 5. For the purpose of including in the curriculum information on undertaking an international sectoral expertise of the program resources. 6. For the purpose of including information on undertaking an international sectoral examination, and 7. For the purpose of including in the education program the requirements of the higher education sectoral descriptor `Maritime Engineering, and of program development (increase of the practical working hours in the academic course of the specialty).

In addition to the above, the HEI has studied the opinion of the employers and provided its summary analysis (2013-2018) on the importance of competences of the graduates and on the satisfaction of the employers with the level of competences of the graduates.

The program presented for the purpose of accreditation, in the manner prescribed by the legislation of Georgia and according to the European Credit Transfer System, consists of 240 credits that includes: 60 credits- for acquiring general mandatory and optional academic courses and 180 credits- for sectoral mandatory and optional academic courses which, in total, assign 35 credits for the training and seagoing practice.

The sequence of acquisition of the academic courses is logical, directed from the general to the particular and from the simple to the complex that ensures the stage-by-stage development of the knowledge and skills acquired within the program.

It must be noted that the content, volume and complexity of the program comply with the cycle of education, sectoral descriptor of the maritime engineering, and its content takes an account of respective admission requirements for the program.

The content and structure of the program follow the sectoral descriptor of the maritime engineering that confirms its compatibility with the qualification to be awarded, and the achievability of the learning outcomes provided for by the program.

Publicity and availability of information on the Bachelor's educational program `Ship Mechanics` are ensured through the web-site, Facebook page and the open door days.

Evidences /indicators

- Rule of Elaboration of Programs, Requirements for a Curriculum and Syllabus` ,
- Order N01-15 (11.12.2017) of the Rector of Batumi Navigation Teaching University on the establishment of a working group for the provision of the process of re-accreditation at Batumi Navigation Teaching University,
- Syllabuses of the academic course,
- Document `Survey of the Opinion of Employers` . Summary analysis (2013-2018) (importance of competences of the graduates and employers' satisfaction with competences of the graduates),
- Document `Employment Rates. Higher Educational Programs (2013-2018),
- Bachelor's educational program: "Ship Mechanics"
- Web-site <http://bntu.edu.ge/swavla/saganmanatleblo-programebis-katalogi>
- Facebook page <https://www.facebook.com/pg/ბათუმის-ნავიგაციის-სასწავლო-უნივერსიტეტი>
- Results of the interview.

Recommendations:
Suggestions for programme development:
Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Within the program, the number of hours assigned for the practice component have been increased and inaccuracies in the admission requirements for the academic programs have been eliminated.
Evaluation
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

2.3 Course
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Student learning outcomes of each compulsory course are in line with programme learning outcomes; Moreover, each course content and number of credits correspond to course learning outcomes; ➤ Teaching materials listed in syllabi are based on the core achievements in the field and ensure the achievement of intended programme learning outcomes.
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements
The syllabuses of the academic courses are provided with mandatory literature and appropriate study materials which take an account of the recent achievements of the field and ensure the achievement of learning outcomes; however, in a number of syllabuses (for instance, the Basics of Automatics and Automatization of Power Supply Installations- the mandatory literature is in Russian; supervision and working in a group- part of the mandatory literature in English); the summary of lectures is referred to in Georgian in the mandatory literature and literature in Russian or English. In that case, it is necessary to determine the language (with the adequate degree of proficiency) necessary for the study of the literature as a pre-condition of the syllabus of the academic course. Also, it would be desirable to indicate in the academic course- Computer Graphics (AutoCAD) the edition of 2013 instead of the main literature that has been indicated as the supporting literature and that is available for students at the library of the institution.
Evidences /indicators
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Bachelor's educational program "Ship Mechanics", - Syllabuses of the academic course, - Results of the interview.
Recommendations:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - to the check content in academic courses and clarify the admission requirements where is necessary or missing.

– to check the content of academic courses and update literature to the recent editions.
Suggestions for programme development
Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

2.4 The Development of practical, scientific/research/creative/performance and transferable skills
Programme ensures the development of students' practical, scientific/research/creative/performance and transferable skills and/or their involvement in research projects, in accordance with the programme learning outcomes.
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements <p>The academic and invited personnel of the institution assist the students in obtaining the information relating to the specialty. Using the logistic and library resources of the Teaching University, the students have the opportunity to independently search for the information they are interested in, study the interesting and topical issues, draft small-scale research or practical works by the support of their supervisors and subsequently, present them at the scientific conferences organized by the Teaching University.</p> <p>There is a student's self-government at the Teaching University that ensures the involvement of students in various events. The material reflecting their involvement is provided in the news column of the institution's web-site.</p> <p>For the purpose of development of practical skills for the students, the practical component of the program has been organized and planned according to the learning outcomes of the program and it includes both the on-the job training (5 credits) and seagoing practice (30 credits) for 6 months that allowed the Bachelor's students to improve and apply the theoretical knowledge;</p> <p>During the on-the-job training and practice and/or when drafting a research/practical work, students are provided a supervision by individuals holding an academic/scientific degree of appropriate competence, practical experience or specially trained.</p> <p>In the period of learning and drafting small-scale research works, the students will develop practical skills in the laboratories, workshops and on the simulators at the university. The university's logistic base allows the use of simulation.</p> <p>Batumi Navigation Teaching University has contractual relations with potential employers in the maritime field. According to the information found on the web-site, 'the partner cruising companies not only provide the students of BNTU with the on-the-job training and seagoing practice, but also actively participate in the discussion of the academic programs, are actively involved in the annual surveys, make their contribution to the enhancement of the quality of the academic process at BNTU and to the training of competitive graduates'. The following are the</p>

university's partner crewing companies: „Baltic Group Internationalgeorgia“; „Iberian Navigation+“; „Jamine“; „Fregat“; „Elseri“; „Queensway Services“; „Geo Bridge“ „Poseidon“; „Geo Crewing“; „Valmars Georgia“; „Eurostar Marine“; „International Maritime Group“; „Globalmarine Co.“; „Ialkani“; „Aries“; „Nitc – National Iranian Tanker Com“.

The institution has concluded contracts with the companies undertaking the on-the-job training and they take an account of the goal of the on-the-job training, however, it does not indicate the number of students and duration of the on-the-job training. This aspect becomes especially important as the training ship `Elite` fails to comply with the power required by the sectoral descriptor of the maritime engineering, and in order to necessarily ensure the participation in the 6-month seagoing practice established for all students according to the sectoral descriptor of the maritime engineering, it is necessary to indicate the number of students and length of the on-the-job training in the contracts concluded between the institution and the partner organizations.

Evidences /indicators

- Contracts with the companies implementing the on-the-job training,
- Web-site <http://bntu.edu.ge/swavla/saganmanatleblo-programebis-katalogi>,
- Interview results.

Recommendations:

- to ensure that students receive required practice on ships with parametres meeting established Field requirements,
- to indicate in the contracts concluded between the Teaching University and the partner organizations implementing the seagoing practice the number of students and duration of the practice.

Suggestions for programme development

- to make agreement with other maritime universities worldwide, so students will have the opportunity to study abroad.
- to hold more meetings with the students about job opportunities, so they have more information about open vacancies.

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

2.5 Teaching and learning methods

Program is implemented using student centered teaching and learning (SCL) methods. Teaching and learning methods correspond to the level of education, course content, student learning

outcomes and ensure their achievement.

Descriptive overview and analysis of compliance with the standard's requirements

The learning and teaching methods are generally described in the program presented for accreditation in the following manner: In the process of teaching and learning, considering the specificity of the program component, different methods of transferring the knowledge, e.g. lecture, work in the working group, practical work, electronic learning training, etc.), which, in turn, involves various activities (e.g. a discussion, demonstration, presentation etc.). Their selection and application is directed towards both transferring the knowledge to the student and stimulation of the participation of a student in the learning process as well as establishing and development of various skills (operating knowledge, information analysis, discussion, establishing-reasoning conclusion, managing discussion and etc.) The methods applied ensure the achievement of sectoral and/or general, transferable competences planned by the program component, unity of all methods applied in all components of the program - development of sectoral and general (transferable) competence planned by the program. They are represented within each syllabus according to the topic that shall be studied, taking into account the specifics of the academic course.

The competencies described in the learning outcomes of the program are based on the sectoral descriptors of the maritime engineering and their achievement depends on the learning and teaching methods of the academic course(s), their contents and selection of proper methods for the achievement of the planned learning outcomes.

For instance, the following is described in the learning outcomes of the program: `effectively operate ship's auxiliaries, technical service, detect and eliminate faults, perform works related to exploitation and technical services; effectively operate and service, detect and eliminate faults of steam boilers and their systems, steam and gas turbines, general control of work parameters and mechanisms of ship's internal combustion engines, detection and elimination of faults; effectively operate refrigerators and air conditioning systems, optimally manage thermodynamic processes in heat machines. Also, rational use of thermal power resources; proper completion and keeping of documents in the machine space; operation and management of the devices and equipment in the system of power supply installations of the ship. Use of hydraulic and pneumatic systems; safe operation of electrical equipment and their systems, use of measuring and

Controlling instruments`. This competence and the competences with other similar contents can be achieved only through the forms of intensive practical and laboratory training.

Although, none of the syllabuses of the academic course provide a distinct separation of assignment of contact hours among the theoretical, practical, laboratory, seminar and other forms of training. The review of the syllabuses of the academic course demonstrates that often, the number of hours assigned to the practical works is small. As an example: In the academic courses „Equipment and Systems of the Ship Deck and Their Operation“, „Basics of the Automatics and Automatization of Power Supply Installations“, for the practical training are assigned only 4 hours (for each course) out of 56 contact hours; in the academic course „Technical Operation of the Diesel Engines of Ships“- 2 hours out of 43 contact hours; in the academic course „Operation of Ships and Their Technical Means“ - 4 hours out of 108 contact hours, etc. whereas the remaining contact hours are assigned for the discussion and analysis of the topics studied, working on the lecture topics, discussion of a home work and other similar forms of teaching. It must be noted that in the

syllabuses of this academic course are indicated both the application of knowledge and the acquisition of competencies relating to making judgment, i.e. the competences similar to those provided above,

Working on the lecture topics, analysis of the home work, etc. may also be directed towards the development of practical skills, however, it is necessary to provide in the syllabus of the academic course a clear description of those forms of teaching which serve the development of the above skills; the syllabus shall also indicate the method and/or combination of methods preliminarily selected in accordance with the forms of teaching.

Respectively, despite the fact that the teaching and learning methods described in the presented documents comply with the cycle of education, in order to confirm whether they are relevant to the content of the academic course, learning outcomes and whether they ensure their achievement, it is necessary to provide their clearer, more specific description according to the specifics of each academic course.

Evidences /indicators

- Bachelor's educational program „Ship Mechanics“,
- Syllabuses of the academic course.

Recommendations:

- to select, according to the content and learning outcomes of the academic courses of the educational program, the forms and methods of learning and teaching and clearly and specifically describe them in the syllabus of each academic course.

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

- Compliance with the requirements.
- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

2.6. Student Evaluation

Student evaluation is conducted in accordance with established procedures. It is transparent and complies with existing legislation.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

According to the evaluation of learning outcomes described in the educational program, the `level of achievement of a student's learning outcomes is evaluated by a 100-point (max 100 points)

system. A Bachelor's educational program is composed of educational components; their evaluation includes two forms - a midterm evaluation (maximum of 60 points) and a final evaluation (maximum of 40 points); a minimum competence threshold is determined for both forms (they are indicated in the syllabuses of the program components). It shall be impermissible to assign a credit using only one form of evaluation (midterm or final evaluation). The final evaluation (point) of the academic course represents the sum of the points received in the midterm and final evaluation forms (the point received in the way of a fraction is rounded in accordance with the rounding rule: 4 and less - to the least, 5 and more - to the most). In accordance with the existing legislation of Georgia, the 100-point system of student's evaluation at BNTU provides for 5 positive and 2 negative evaluation.

Fx evaluation means that a student needs more work and is given a chance to take the exam one more time; in the case of Fx evaluation, an additional exam will be ordered in not less than 5 days after the announcement of the results of the final exam. The evaluation received during the additional exam is a final evaluation and it will be reflected in the final evaluation of the teaching component of the educational program. Taking into account the evaluation at the additional exam, if a student gets 0-50 points in the final evaluation of the component, a student will have F (0 point) assigned. The evaluation F means that the work carried out by a student is not sufficient and he/she has to re-study the program components. A credit can be obtained only in the event of receiving one of the positive evaluations as provided for by the legislation.

The evaluation of the learning outcomes of a student provided in the program is specified in the columns in the syllabuses of each academic course with the titles `Organization of a Semester at BNTU` and `Student Evaluation. General Rule, Forms, Components, Methods and Criteria of Evaluation` according to each specific, and detailed information is provided on the system, criteria, frequency of evaluation of learning outcomes, etc.

The midterm evaluation is performed by the `Ongoing Evaluations` that, according to the rule applicable at BNTU, may be performed 8 times during a semester, at the most, and be awarded maximum 40 points, and by one midterm exam with the maximum evaluation of 20 points.

During the ongoing evaluation, each evaluation (point) may include the evaluations of one or several components (for example, theoretical/practical work (assignment) and a quiz and/or etc.) evaluations, and detailed information on them is provided in the syllabuses of the academic course.

For all components of evaluation of a student's knowledge, the forms, methods and transparent criteria of evaluation provide in the syllabuses of the academic courses comply with the regulations established by the institution, and comply with the legislation.

The syllabuses of the academic course provide information on the availability of feedback (review and analysis of the evaluations received and the mistakes made, review of the home work, etc.) with the students. The institution provides, in a timely and detailed manner, the students with information on the evaluations received, including the results of midterm examinations. The analysis of the evaluations received, and additional consultations allow them to consider the mistakes made, eliminate the deficiencies and improve the outcomes.

Information about evaluation is public for everyone, it is available on online portal where students and academic staff can enter and see the results, as well as the documents on which the evaluation was made.

Students have the opportunity give feedback on their evaluation. If the students disagrees with the evaluation received he/she may request the review of the paper and apply to the Dean with a

written claim letter.

In case they need they have the opportunity to consult again with the lecturer and explain why they got the score.

The institution holds surveys of the students, analyzes the outcomes and applies it for the improvement of the program.

Evidences/indicators

- Bachelor's educational program "Ship Mechanics",
- Syllabuses of the academic course,
- Rule of Elaboration of Programs, Requirements for a Curriculum and Syllabus`,
- Document of the Quality Assurance Office `Summary Analysis 2013-2018`,
- Web-site <http://bntu.edu.ge>
- Description of the evaluation system, evaluation forms, components and methods.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

- Compliance with the requirements.
- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Teaching methodology and organization, adequate evaluation of programme mastering			X	

Student achievements and individual work with them

HEI creates student-centered environment by providing students with relevant services; programme staff ensures students' familiarity with the named services, organizes various events and fosters students' involvement in local and/or international projects.

3.1. Student support services

Students receive appropriate consultations and support regarding the planning of learning process, improvement of academic achievement, employment and professional development.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

Visiting team noticed following students support indicators:

- on the university level, as soon as, the student enrolls in the university he/she has curator who is guiding him/her through the teaching process.
- through the learning process students get additional hours to work with their lecturer which do not belong to the credit of the programme component;
- students have scheduled days when they can get individual consultation.
- Student are helped with the further career development process.
- Students get the information about open vacancies through the board, where they have list of the companies which have job opportunities. This helps them understand labor market needs and prepare themselves to take their career into the next level.
- students have the opportunity to Cooperate with the Quality Assurance Office of BNTU. This organ helps them to make their learning process easier and ensure that all their needs are met.
- In the university feedback system is functioning. Students can send feedback on lecturer if they think that is necessary. They can give feedback on any issue that they are concerned about. They are given Questionnaire to evaluate the lecturer and the lecture itself. then those documents are collected by Quality Assurance Office and taken for analysis .

Evidences/indicators

1. Document of the Quality Assurance Office
2. Disunions during visit

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Substantially complies with requirements

<input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student supervision

Master's and Doctoral students have qualified thesis supervisors.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

Batumi Navigation Teaching University doesn't carry out master or doctoral programmes. Standard is not taken into account for evaluation.

Evidences/indicators

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Student achievements and individual work with them	X			

4. Providing teaching resources

Programme human, material, information and financial resources ensure programme sustainability, its effective and efficient functioning, and achievement of intended objectives.

4.1 Human Resources

- Programme staff consists of qualified people who have necessary competences in order to help students achieve programme learning outcomes;
- The number and workload of programme academic/scientific and invited staff ensures the sustainable running of the educational process and also, proper execution of their research/creative/performance activities and other assigned duties. Balance between academic and invited staff ensures programme sustainability;
- The Head of the Programme possesses necessary knowledge and experience required for programme elaboration. He/she is personally involved in programme implementation;
- Programme students are provided with an adequate number of administrative and support staff of appropriate competence.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The persons implementing the programme possess competences, necessary to achieve learning outcomes, which is proved by practical experience, professional diplomas and certificates (engineers, chief engineers) or scientific like Msc or Phd degree.

The programme is provided by qualified academic and invited staff, having necessary competence for the gaining results of studies.

It is admissible to held academic position through professional competence. 6 full, 4 associate and 1 assistant professor represents affiliated academic staff of the program, from which 5 are elected by professional sign and do not possess the Doctor Academic Degree. It is useful to have the lecturers with practical experience, however it is necessary to establish specific criteria in relation with the requirements, stating the professor's skills, related with research and teaching process management. 22 invited lecturers are involved in program delivery process. Totally academic staff for the program consists of 33 persons. Taking into account that there are 85 active students on the programme the number of academic staff is considered sufficient for delivery the program. However for sustainability of the program it is preferable to increase the number of affiliated personnel and preserve more balance.

The personal files of the academic staff (proving their competence) were checked during the visit.

The workload of the academic staff, type of activity, attestation conditions and the terms of affiliation are regulated by the governing rules/provisions for the mentioned issues active at BNTU, by the contracts and agreements of affiliation. Workload components (type of activity) are determined by the individual workload scheme and the workload rule of the academic staff, which says that the maximum possible workload is 11 months a year and 40 hours a week, which implies both academic and research/scientific activity of an individual, as well as other activity to be performed at BNTU and the minimum possible workload (including the academic activity in other HEIs). For invited (those implementing a particular academic course(s)) staff, their workload (academic and consulting activity) is determined by the employment agreement and the individual workload scheme of the invited staff. Nevertheless, University have some mechanisms for defining the workload of academic staff it is more general and not specifying concrete division between teaching, scientific or research activities.

In the process of the annual self-evaluation of BNTU, while examining the provision of the programme with the resources, the information about the human resources (composition, qualification, sufficiency of the number) of the programme is collected and analyzed.

The Head of the programme coordinates the activity of those implementing the programme, performs a regular analysis of the programme and formulates recommendations, provides assistance and consultations to the students and other stakeholders, etc. The Head of the programme coordinates the process of modification/development of the programme, development of an individual plan/schedule of a student and controls its fulfillment. In the cases of students with special educational needs, the Head of the programme is obliged to ensure feedback with the student and study his/her educational needs.

Programme students are provided with an adequate number of administrative and support staff of appropriate competence.

Evidences/indicators :

1. Provisions of the structural units, job descriptions (functions, qualification requirements);
2. Personal files of the academic and invited staff;
3. Contract forms;
4. Rule for conducting a competition for being appointed to an academic position;
5. Academic staff workload (form);
6. Invited staff workload (form);
7. The list of staff implementing the education programme with the indication of an academic course.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

- to establish defined criteria in relation with the election of academic staff by professional sign, stating the professor's skills, related with research and teaching process management.
- to increase affiliated academic staff for keeping balance and sustainability of the programme
- to elaborate specific norms and regulations for defining the workload of academic staff and invited personnel and establish unified approach

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

4.2 Professional development of academic, scientific and invited staff

- HEI conducts the evaluation of programme academic, scientific and invited staff and analysis evaluation results on a regular basis;
- HEI fosters professional development of the academic, scientific and invited staff. Moreover,

it fosters their scientific and research work.
<p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements</p> <p>BNTU conducts evaluation of the academic and invited staff annually within the scope of self-evaluation of BNTU. It includes the analysis of the performance of their individual workload and evaluation of different types of activities of academic staff. The Dean of the Faculty and the Faculty Council study the performance of the individual workload, the distribution of the workload of the academic staff of BNTU among separate components, the workload components are: teaching and pedagogical activity, scientific and research activity, participation in the events facilitating the enhancement of the education quality at BNTU and supporting the students of BNTU. The listed above is considered by the individual workload scheme of the academic staff. The academic staff is obliged to not only perform the activities required by the scheme, but also to present a report on the performed work. In the case of academic and invited staff, both the performed work as well as the facts of violation of the workload and the reasons causing them are studied. There exists some mechanism of evaluation academic and invited staff performance, however it has been evidenced how the evaluation is analyzed and how the feedbacks are distributed to the addressers. There is not also clear how quality assurance is involved in staff evaluation process and how the appropriate actions are planned.</p> <p>BNTU arranged some trainings for the staff involved in the programme, such as train the trainer, train the simulator, training for some specific simulators for engine, cargo and ballast handling, that is good and useful for staff to understand and how train and develop practical components in learning outcomes. It is preferable to increase participation of Academic staff in international maritime conferences and projects or research. Academic staff could be involved in international activity by having membership of maritime associations such as IAMU (International Association of Maritime Universities), IMLA (International Maritime Lecturers Association) that would promote integration in international maritime education system.</p> <p>BNTU uses encourage method for staff involvement in research and scientific activities.</p>
<p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Individual workload scheme (form) of the academic staff; 2. Individual workload performance report (form) of the academic staff; 3. Analysis (form) of the performed activity; 4. Education quality management and support system of BNTU; 5. Individual workload scheme (form) of the invited staff; 6. Analysis (form) of the performed activity by the invited staff;
<p>Recommendations:</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">to elaborate unified regulations or procedures for evaluation of academic and invited staff, incorporating analyze criteria and feedback mechanisms</p>
<p>Suggestions for programme development:</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">to encourage academic staff for international activity</p>
<p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p>
<p>In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress</p>
<p>Evaluation</p>

- Complies with requirements
- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

4.3. Material Resources

Programme is provided by necessary infrastructure and technical equipment required for achieving programme learning outcomes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The Batumi Navigation Teaching University poses its own infrastructure capable to accommodate all enrolled students. It consists of didactic infrastructure, training infrastructure, administration compartments, sport facilities, training ship, student's dormitory.

Because the program is regulated there are established the required material resources necessary for program delivery.

For the implementation of the programme, the following resources are used:

1. Laboratories: Chemistry; Physics.
2. Workshops and specialized centers:
 - Mechanical workshop (metal workshop, lathe-turning workshop, welding workshop);
 - electric-technical laboratory, training laboratory: hydraulic, pneumatic, refrigerating units and automatic stands,
 - self-access center,
 - computer centers,
 - training facility center,
 - Engine Room - (real Shipboard Equipment Hall: active stands of pneumatic, hydraulic, automatic, refrigeration units),
3. Study-training vessel "Elita"
4. Training Facilities:
 - Collective Lifeguard Means Training Facility,
 - On Land Fire-Fighting Training Facility,
 - On Coast Fire-Fighting Training Facility,
4. Facility Center which is composed of the following technical means:
 - Engine Room Simulator,
 - Liquid Cargo Handling Simulator (LCHS 4000/5000) – cargo-ballasting operations management simulator),
 - a high voltage laboratory equipped with modern, high voltage dacitic device,
 - Lifeboat Simulator.

Library, functioning at Navigation Teaching University is equipped with electronic and printed books stock. During the evaluation of the educational programme it was detected that the major and additional literature, as well as the teachers readers of some syllabi were in other language then Georgian. Since Georgian is declared as programme language. During the library review it was detected that the university has the modern literature (2013 edition) provided in Georgian and English languages, the same language ensured readers and electronic resources.

Batumi Navigation Teaching University is equipped with the library, providing the whole set of

appropriate conditions: reading hall (for 30 persons), working places are equipped with appropriate equipment (scanner, printer, xero), 14 personal computers. Library informational portal is put into operation, ensuring the students with distant access to appropriate information resources, giving them possibility to subscribe literature, use electronic libraries. Training simulation center is equipped with 52 computers; labs with 14 computers; departments and cycles with 29 computers. Concluding BNTU has up-to-dated simulators, however it need to renew workshops and some laboratories. Training vessel which is used for seagoing practice is not in compliance with legislation and field specification's requirements (ship is too small in term of size and engine power).

BNTU offers comfortable infrastructure or working conditions for students and staff. Building complies with sanitary and hygiene standards. It is provided with special equipment for people with restricted ability, with firefighting equipment, first aid.

Evidences/indicators

- Infrastructure, library, material and technical resources (documents confirming the ownership);
- Sufficiency of technical resources (tables of sessions);
- Visit on board of training ship

Recommendations:

- to provide the seagoing practice on the vessel(s) satisfying legislation's requirements whenever practice is to be counted as seagoing professional practice,
- to renew the workshops required by field specification for practical trainings.

Suggestions for programme development

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

4.4.Programme/faculty/school budget and programme financial sustainability

The allocation of financial resources stipulated in programme/faculty/school budget is economically feasible and corresponds to programme needs.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements
The programme needs are financed from the BNTU, including the purchase and renewal of material technical resources, equipment of the cabinets of special preparation with computer programs and devices, technical service of the study-training vessel "Elita", translation of the foreign specific literature by the academic and invited staff, preparation and publishing of guidebooks and teaching and methodological materials, events, conferences supporting the cognitive and research work of the students, supporting the enhancement of professional qualification of the persons implementing the programme (training sessions, certification courses, etc.), scientific conferences, etc.
Evidences/indicators
Program budget.
Recommendations:
Suggestions for programme development:
Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Providing teaching resources		X		

5. Teaching quality enhancement opportunities

In order to enhance teaching quality, programme utilizes internal and external quality assurance services and also periodically conducts programme monitoring and programme review. Relevant data is collected, analysed and utilized for informed decision making and programme development on a regular basis.

5.1 Internal quality
Programme staff collaborates with internal quality assurance service(s) available at the higher

education institution when planning the process of programme quality assurance, creating assessment instruments, and analysing assessment results. Programme staff utilizes quality assurance results for programme improvement.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

BNTU provides education quality management and assurance system by two structural units, as it was evidenced during the interview. One is Quality Management System based on ISO 9001-2015 standards, covering all necessary procedures for administration and management purposes of BNTU, defining politics, structure, interested parties, customer satisfaction. It has been implemented since 2003. Another is a Quality assurance service providing quality in education processes based on the national standards. They have functional relationship to each other as it is established by Regulation of the BNTU. However, ISO quality management system is not reflected as a separate unit on the structural chart that can lead to some confusion in distribution of functions and duties.

BNTU strives to establish quality culture within university. For programme quality assurance different assessment instruments were established. Different kinds of questioner for students, employers, alumni, personnel were elaborated (academic and administrative). Collected data are analyzed by Quality management service.

BNTU provides annual self-evaluation in the following directions: evaluation compliance of the programme with National Educational standards, quality of educational programs, compliance with STCW International convention, with ISO standards. Self-evaluation final results are analyzed and presented in summery document, which describes existing situation of BNTU. All assessed indicators are high and have growing tendency as it is evidenced in the presented document. Even though students' academic achievement and evaluation rate of learning outcome have the decreasing tendency, alumni, students and employments satisfaction rate is growing.

Rector's order was issued to create the working group for preparation of self-evaluation report. Working group was formed with academic, administrative staff, students and employers. Quality assurance uses the PDCA principle.

Evidences/indicators

1. Main goals, objectives and strategic priorities of the quality assurance office.
2. System of the quality assurance of education.
3. Concept of the Quality Management of Education (2019-2025).
4. The statistical data related to the programme (students' progress, rate of suspension and termination of the status, analysis of satisfaction of the students, employment rate of graduates).
5. Site-visit interview.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development

- to amend and modify the structure chart and identify the place for ISO Quality management unit in order to avoid some confusion in duties and responsibilities
- to add questions regarding occupied position and period needed for carrier development in alumni evaluation form in order to have a better picture of employment,
- to study and analyze why student's achievement is low and has decreasing tendency while alumni and students' satisfaction is high according to conducted surveys.

Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements
5.2 External quality
Programme utilizes the results of external quality assurance on a regular basis.
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements <p>BNTU uses external quality assurance and tries to conduct external quality audits at a regular basis. Seafarers' Training center of Institute is audited regularly by Maritime transport Agency. Institute is certified by ISO quality standard system and is audited also on a regular basis. BNTU was assessed by European Maritime Safety Agency (EMSA) in 2013, given observations and findings were corrected and taken into consideration.</p> <p>Training center of Institute has been recognized by Panama and Honduras maritime Authorities to conduct STCW training courses for seafarers. Mostly external evaluation is focused on training center and not on educational programs. However comparing mission of BNTU (focusing on Black Sea and Caucasus region) it is not known why University is looking for overseas recognition instead of neighboring or EU countries.</p>
Evidences/indicators <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Results of the external quality evaluation (certificates); 2. Site-visit interviews
Recommendations:
Suggestions for programme development: <p>to use external evaluation as real tool for program improvement.</p>
Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements

Partially complies with requirements

Does not comply with requirements

5.3. Programme monitoring and periodic review

Programme monitoring and periodic review is conducted with the involvement of academic, scientific, invited, administrative staff, students, graduates, employers and other stakeholders through systematically collecting and analysing information. Assessment results are utilized for programme improvement.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

BNTU conducts program monitoring in accordance with the rules of Education quality management and assurance system annually. The components of monitoring system are grouped in 4 main categories and include different directions such as monitoring of knowledge, skills' developments, material-technical resources, staff performance, monitoring learning outcomes by comparing the starting condition to the final results, monitoring the processes carried out in the University. BNTU uses different kind of surveys and check-lists to monitor and analyze the program delivery processes. BNTU created electronic system for lecturers' evaluation from students. The conducted analyzes are presented in report to the Academic Council, where discovered failures are discussed and appropriate actions are taken or planned. Taken decisions on Academic Council are utilized for program modification and improvement.

BNTU elaborated table of monitoring system incorporating all required objects, methods and directions.

One of the objects is educational programmes which are monitored against the compliance with legislations, field specification requirements, transparency of students' evaluation. Nevertheless the evaluation system exists, practice components of the program are not in full compliance with required standards of field specifications and legislation, as legislation requires 6 months of seagoing service as a part of educational program conducted on the vessel with main engine not less than 750 KW.

University concluded agreements and memorandums on cooperation, conducting mutual projects, training/retraining academic staff, exchange students and so on with different foreign institutes (from Turkey, Ukraine, Azerbaijan, Latvia). However, there has not been evidenced that BNTU conducted some kind of comparison or assessment of other similar programs offered by leading maritime universities.

Evidences/indicators

1. System of monitoring;
2. Results of monitoring and periodic evaluation of the programme;
3. Applicable forms of monitoring of the academic process and of surveys;
4. Results of students' surveys
5. Site-visit interviews

Recommendations:

to create more detailed mechanism for monitoring of educational program and involve the persons with qualification able to evaluate the program

Suggestions for programme development:

to compare the program with the programs offered by foreign leading maritime institutes for benchmarking.

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Teaching quality enhancement opportunities	X			

Enclosed Documentation (If Applicable)

HEI's Name: Batumi Navigation Teaching University

Higher Education Programme Name: Ship Mechanics

Number of Pages of the Report: 32

Programme's Compliance with the Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
1. Programme objectives are clearly defined and achievable; they are consistent with the mission of the HEI and take into consideration labour market demands	X			
2. Teaching methodology and organization, adequate evaluation of programme mastering			X	
3. Student achievements and individual work with them	X			
4. Providing teaching resources		X		
5. Teaching quality enhancement opportunities	X			

Expert Panel Chair's

Prof. Janusz Uriasz



Expert Panel Members'

Prof. Manana Moistsrapishvili



Prof. Otar Jjavadze



Ms. Nino Gorgoshadze



Mr. Irma Makharadze

