



განათლების ხარისხის განვითარების ეროვნული ცენტრი
NATIONAL CENTER FOR EDUCATIONAL QUALITY ENHANCEMENT

Final Report on AVRASYA BATUMI INTERNATIONAL UNIVERSITY - ABIU

Authorization

Expert Panel Members

Chair: Ivan Leban, retired, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia.

Members:

Nana Iashvili, Tbilisi State Academy of Arts, Georgia

Nino Taliashvili, Saint Andrew the First called Georgian University of the Patriarchate of Georgia

Ketevan Aptarashvili, East European University, Georgia

Giorgi Makharashvili, Ilia State University, Georgia (Labour Market)

Giorgi Kurdiani, Tbilisi State Academy of Arts, Georgia (Student)

Tbilisi
12 Mar 2019

Authorization Report Resume

General information on the educational institution

Avrasya Batumi International University LTD (hereinafter ABIU) was established in Batumi in 2018. It aims to conduct teaching and research in architecture, construction and law.

ABIU is well positioned in the local region, in the state of Georgia and aims to establish links with society, using European academic education traditions and standards. This is closely related to the recent economic and intellectual revival in the region and can be well mirrored in the educative space.

The newly founded ABIU aims to continuously improve academic programs and continuously develop creative academic processes. It plans to support students' professional training and takes care of their competitiveness in regional, national and international markets. It plans to be closely connected with the potential employers' goals and their experiences.

The institution is going to promote research and development of new technologies, also at international scientific level, as well as mobility of students and teachers.

At the beginning the ABIU is served by 26 academic personnel selected through the competition, 18 invited, 29 administrative and support personnel. International university ABIU plans to enroll 420 students.

The basic educational structural units of the university consist of two faculties - Faculty of Architecture and Engineering and later Faculty of Law. At the initial stage the Teaching University plans to implement the undergraduate and master's educational programs for architecture and construction.

At present land plot of university is about 6000 sqm with three floor renovated building on it plus basement floor. Building is former bank office built with reinforced concrete structure. Visually its structural condition seems fine. Seven different size classrooms are allocated on three floors. ABIU is planning to acquire modern infrastructure with properly equipped classrooms, conference hall, computer center, library, electronic bases that include the bookstore and international lists, student cafe and all the appropriate things necessary for the functioning and development of the modern, European oriented university.

The status of the ABIU university will be a private, for profit, »Teaching university« by Georgian legislation. At the beginning the number of students will be 420. This will be an international university, the language of instruction will be English. It is expected that the teaching staff, students and some staff of the services will be proficient in English.

The university is small and therefore also centralised. The important persons at university are: Founder, General Assembly of Partners, Rector, Academic Council, General Secretary and QA Service together with auxiliary services. At present Academic Council and some other units are not existing. Two important other structural units at university are Library and The Information Technology Provision Service. Also the exact roles of the students in university governing and elsewhere are not yet defined.

As a panel of experts we experienced certain difficulties with this initial evaluation, because at present there were no students at ABIU.

Brief overview of the authorization site visit

The site visit of the panel at ABIU in Batumi took place on 22-24th January 2019. NCEQE provided us with all the documentation well in advance, because the planned site visit for December 2018 was cancelled for technical reasons. We received the revised Self-Evaluation Report (SER) on 28th Dec 2018 with the revised version of SER and amended Appendices 39, 40, 41, 44, 68, 92, 95, 99. During the site visit we obtained some additional data.

This visit was part of the initial authorization procedure for the ABIU university (initial institutional evaluation) together with 3 study programs – 2 Bachelor (Architecture, Construction), and 1 Master (Architecture) (study program evaluations).

This was an example of ex-ante evaluation of university, because one of the most important stakeholders in the academic process was missing – namely the students. Therefore, several operations typical for university life were taken in some cases as predictions, forecasts or promises. So, the panel made evaluation based on the current resources of the HEI and expected outcomes.

At the end of the visit the Key Findings were presented to leadership and representatives of services.

Acknowledgement. The panel of experts would like to sincerely thank all the leadership and the staff of ABIU university for their hospitality, providing us with excellent logistics and thus enabled us to work in a pleasant environment. Chair of the panel would like to thank all colleagues for help and also to skilful translator. The panel of experts would like to thank also to the NCEQE representative for her constant and invaluable support.

Overview of the HEI's compliance with standards

Summary of Recommendations

1.1

- Make the mission statement shorter, more concise and explicit.
- Mission should be revised when there will be students at ABIU and shared with other stakeholders.
- Mission and vision should be displayed on website with plausible explanation.

1.2

- Carefully monitor the implementation of the action plan (C in the abbreviation PDCA and act accordingly if something goes wrong).
- Set priorities in the action (operational) plan and possibly change the plan accordingly.

2.1

- To increase **English proficiency** for teaching/administrative staff and students.
- Information computer system which will have to encompass all necessary data for Rector and General Secretary for decision making.
- To thoroughly check organizational structure and related procedures in order to simplify, rationalize and optimize the work and prevent overlap.
- To keep up-to-date English website.
- To publish small "Facts and Figures" booklet on ABIU.

2.2

- Quality assurance service will be overload with quality assurance activity and academic administration and it should need some optimization.
- The various collected data at QA Service should be properly used for analytical work and forecast trends.
- Further improvement of the data collection could automatically detect irregularities in the university activities and should suggest action.
- Students should also be involved in the internal quality assurance system.

2.3

- Produce effective mechanism to detect plagiarism and theft of intellectual properties.
- The first-year student should have a short introductory course on fraud in higher education.
- Carefully check the ownership of the each study programme at the ABIU and in what way the programme appeared in the list.

3.1

- Revision of the study programmes BA and MA in Architecture is needed.
- More focus in art classes, geometric modelling, free hand drawings, or many other in the programmes of Architecture.

3.2

- Bachelor program "construction" shall be renamed; for example - "civil engineering"
- Following courses shall be moved to specialty mandatory teaching section: "sketch", "architectural perspective", "design for disabled";
- Course about Georgian art and architecture history shall be added in specialty mandatory teaching section;
- Georgian planning legislation shall be integrated in course "basic principles of zoning law";
- Turkish language literature shall be changed to English where applicable;

- It is recommended that the heads of the educational programmes had a leading role while establishing the conformity of the learning outcomes of the programme with the national qualification frameworks;
- It is recommended that catalogue of educational programmes should be published on the web-page of the HEI
- Curriculum needs to be adjusted based on the program objectives and goals
- Connect to institutions or groups, which work on research. Invite them to be part of the program, develop opportunities for MA students to participate and be able to work on research topics
- Invite professors, students and stakeholders in program development phase
- Roadmap milestones (indicators) should be prepared. This will help student to understand his/her sequential steps and needs
- A Master's programme, certainly with international ambitions like this one, should rest on a solid research foundation. That research basis is not present and has to be developed first
- Add more elective courses in MA program.

3.3

- Adapt the procedure of assessment of students in BA and MA study programmes of Architecture.
- Review program content and syllabi; rationalize them in a way that their achievement is measurable and within the framework of the study programme. Consider study load of a student and credits granted.
- Reconsider credits assignment system.
- Improve research opportunities by collaborating with research institutions or groups in this field.
- The offered design courses should concentrate on design as well as on university research. The courses must be relevant to the second cycle of higher education learning outcomes.
- The programme development team must reconsider learning outcomes for each course. Learning outcomes must be relevant to the first and second cycle of higher education.
- Be aware that the profession of Architect is a Regulated Profession with Automatic Recognition within EU - European directive.

4.1

- Develop staff attraction mechanisms.
- Develop criteria concerning to the evaluation of the performance of the heads of administrative units.
- Develop transparent and fair rules for the competition of academic staff.
- Develop transparent criteria for the assessment of staffs' scientific performance.
- Develop transparent and objective criteria for staff encouragement and remuneration.
- Make procedures formal and document based (for example newly appointed staff involvement in working environment).
- Attract qualified academic and administrative staff to ensure students fair evaluation and service and to ensure the operation of learning processes in english language in a proper way.
- Informing stakeholders about HR management policy and other rules.

4.2

- Elaborate accurate workload scheme;
- Develop transparent procedures for financing scientific activities for affiliated staff;
- Develop transparent Methodology of determining the number of academic, scientific, and invited staff;
- Inform academic staff about their workloads.

5.1

- University needs to have a mechanism to support students and answer their questions regarding their rights and lawful interests and support them during the disciplinary committee meeting in case of any violation of rules from the side of a student.
- All documents need to be accessible and published online in English language.
- University needs to have clearly defined mechanisms and criteria for selecting students who are eligible for scholarships. Clearly defined criteria for students who will be selected for disciplinary committee, and students who are capable for supporting students with special economic needs as mentioned in SER.

5.2

- Ensure English proficiency for all personnel.
- Establish a learning management system of any type, (such as Moodle for example).
- Have all computers from ABIU premises accessible for students and interconnected, so that it was possible to search through library books, to be able to see if particular books can be ordered for check out, etc...
- Provide a clear roadmap (Students Guidebook) to help students understand the structure and hierarchy as well as responsibilities of each structural unit of ABIU.

6.1

- To set five priorities in applied research for ABIU.
- To clarify the transfer of the intellectual property from university to university (regarding the study programmes as well) and from university to business.

6.2

- From our experience one of the possibilities to attract well qualified young academic staff is to offer the temporary residence (apartment) in the vicinity of ABIU.
- For the promotion of staff the proper research work is essential.
- The research work should be done in accord with the international ethical standards.

6.3

- The system of evaluation the quality of research results of academic/scientific staff at ABIU should be simplified.
- The annual report of research results of academic/scientific staff should be publicly present (website) and publish.

7.1

- Possible alternate financial resources in order to assure growth and development of the ABIU
- Planning detailed description of possible further infrastructure investment.
- Main entrance shall have doors from both sides and open towards egress.
- Ramps shall satisfy accessibility regulations (6%);
- Toilets shall be re-planned to satisfy accessibility regulations;
- Thresholds shall be removed from opening to guarantee free movement for wheelchair users; maximum 15mm threshold is allowed according to Georgian regulations.

7.2

- To allocate more financial resources and to professionalize library services
- To create a small printing unit within a library.
- To purchase more computers and have them accessible for students.
- To offer availability of international databases to academic staff and students.

7.3

- To establish effective working computer system for internal management system and for the teaching/learning activities, for communication with students and also for controlling research activities
- To re-create web-site of ABIU.

7.4

- Students (they are paying tuition fees) should also be involved in the division of the ABIU budget.
- ABIU should provide more services to society - payable (language courses, workshops) and non-payable.

Summary of Suggestions (they are summarized by the end of each section)

- Continuous education center can already create and run short payable training course for society (not only foreign language teaching) and doing consulting even before authorization and ABIU can also organize conferences. Batumi is the appropriate place for that.
- To include students effectively in various services.
- Panel suggests to move following courses on later semesters: "labor safety and emergency situations", "traditional building materials and elements. 5th-6th semesters would be appropriate.
- Project types and scales shall be defined clearly for Courses "architectural project 1- 7".
- Study programmes should be evaluated by ABET or similar agency.
- The panel of experts suggests ABIU to check and study the EU legislation: In 2013 the PQD (Professional Qualifications Directive) was amended into 2013/55/EU. <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/PDF/?uri=CELEX:32013L0055&from=EN>. It comprises the "famous" 11 points describing the learning outcomes of architects education.
- It should be better if university publish information about planned and realized training courses on the web-page in order to increase staff awareness and involvement in trainings.
- - Extra information which could be added in Student Contract:
 - a) student contract paragraph 4.6 states that it will be signed at the beginning of each year. It would be a suggestion to have one contract for entire study period, rather than having students sign a new contract every year.
 - b) If ABIU makes a single contract for entire study period (8 semesters for BA and 4 Semesters for MA), For international students it would be better to have a clear understanding prescribed in contract whether ABIU is entitled or not to change/increase student fee if annual inflation or national currency devaluation will exceed by X%. (Considering that according Georgian Legislation Contracts are in GEL). It is as well within financial Interests of ABIU.
 - c) It could be better if students will have some parts from Code of Ethics mentioned in the student contract – in particularly an issue regarding plagiarism – which will assist University to have students better informed about the problems that plagiarism could cause.
- - Since there are several universities in Batumi, it would be a good idea to have a common students' ombudsman to take control of students' rights.

Summary Table

	Standard	Complies with Requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
1.	Mission and strategic development of HEI	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
1.1	Mission of HEI	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
1.2	Strategic development	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2.	Organizational structure and management of HEI	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2.1	Organizational structure and management	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2.2	Internal quality assurance mechanisms	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
2.3	Observing principles of ethics and integrity	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>
3.	Educational Programmes	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	x
3.1	Design and development of educational programmes	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>
3.2	Structure and content of educational programmes	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	x
3.3	Assessment of learning outcomes	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>
4	Staff of the HEI	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	x
4.1	Staff management	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	x
4.2	Academic/Scientific and invited Staff workload	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
5	Students and their support services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>
5.1	The Rule for obtaining and changing student status, the recognition of education, and student rights	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>
5.2	Student support services	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	x
6	Research, development and/or other creative work	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>
6.1	Research activities	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>
6.2	Research support and internationalization	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>
6.3	Evaluation of research activities	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	x
7	Material, information and financial resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>
7.1	Material resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
7.2	Library resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	x
7.3	Information resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>
7.4	Financial resources	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Signature of expert panel members

1. Ivan Leban (Chair)
2. Nana Iashvili (Member)
3. Ketevan Aptarashvili (Member)
4. Nino Taliashvili (Member)
5. Giorgi Makharashvili (Member)
6. Giorgi Kurdiani (Member)

Compliance of the Authorization Applicant HEI with the Authorization Standard Components

1. Mission and strategic development of HEI

Mission statement of a HEI defines its role and place within higher education area and broader society. Strategic development plan of HEI corresponds with the mission of an institution, is based on the goals of the institution and describe means for achieving these goals.

1.1 Mission of HEI

Mission Statement of the HEI corresponds to Georgia's and European higher education goals, defines its role and place within higher education area and society, both locally and internationally.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

Mission of ABIU is present in Appendix 2.

-Mission contains main directions of higher education: teaching and learning, research and service to society. In recent years innovation is becoming part of the mission, but not only as innovative method in teaching. There are also other innovative approaches like invention disclosures, producing technical licenses, helping students with startups, transferring intellectual property, short courses on business education and many others. Since this was ex-ante evaluation of the university (without students as very important stakeholder) we could not check students' view on the mission. Mission should be shared by students, by all other stakeholders and preferably should appear on the web-site.

- ABIU has a wish to become international university with English as a language of instruction. And from mission, ABIU wants to ensure integration of Georgian higher education into united European space. Therefore, the mission should be more specific to include specific Georgian/science approach in the study programs as well.

- Missions of the university are usually shorter in one sentence. Mission is very important for a newly-established university and usually reflects the feasible wish of university at present - locally, in the country and globally. While a mission statement describes what a university wants to do now, a vision statement tells us what university wants to achieve in the future. In both cases few priorities have to be set.

Evidences/indicators

Mission is in Appendix 2, together with Goals, View and Values, but evaluation criteria is stating that Mission statement should be shared by the whole community at the university. Therefore, in the future, additionally with students and new employees, the mission statement should be revised.

In the interview with the Founder we learnt that although the university will be "for profit", all eventual profit will go for improvement of the academic life at university, which is very positive. Furthermore we heard that the aim of ABIU is to ensure integration of Georgian higher education into the united European higher education area. Also the intention is to popularize science and involve the students in the social and engineering scientific research projects. It is also important to establish strong collaborative relationships with the private sector, government and NGO groups.

In the interview the potential employers also showed an interest in the graduates of the ABIU, but being unaware that the first graduates will be available in 4-5 years time providing the authorization is approved. We heard that the professions acquired at ABIU architects and construction engineers will be needed in the future - for example as a railway Trabzon-Batumi is planned.

Recommendations:

- Make the mission statement shorter, more concise and explicit.

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mission should be revised when there will be students at ABIU and shared with other stakeholders. • Mission and vision should be displayed on website with plausible explanation.
Suggestions:
Best Practices to be used (if applicable):
Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements
1.2 Strategic Development
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ HEI has a strategic development (7-year) and an action plans (3-year) in place. ○ HEI contributes to the development of the society, shares with the society the knowledge gathered in the institution, and facilitates lifelong learning ○ HEI evaluates implementation of strategic and action plans, and duly acts on evaluation results.
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements <p>Having used mission and vision the ABIU created strategic (7-years) and an action (operational) plan (3-years), which will implement the strategic plan. Again there is an important challenge for the ABIU university because those two important acts - strategic plan and action (operational) plan - were prepared without the students' participation. Although the plans were carefully prepared and cover all academic aspects - university development, quality assurance, planning and revising study programs, with involvement of students, human and material resources. Some areas of weakness has been identified in relation to the teaching staff. , Considering the shortage of teaching staff it would be wise to set few priorities from the whole selection of tasks.</p> <p>In the documents it is stated that for the beginning stage, the ABIU might face the difficulties during recruiting the qualified academic personnel from local and international market. It is true that foreign private-direct investments in higher education in Georgia provides habitat, in which the higher educational institutes can be established and developed. But, without the qualified staff this is difficult to achieve.</p>
Evidences/indicators <p>There are Annex 5 (Mechanisms for monitoring the implementation of the three years Action Plan for 2018-2020 years; Terms of achievement of goals; Responsible persons and indicators), Annex 6 (Methodology of Strategic planning), Annex 8 (Planned activities and activities to be adopted with a view to the development of society by the ABIU), Annex 9 (The center of students service, Continuous education and career development of students) together with Action plan (3-year) and expected results 2018-2020 and Actions to be implemented, implementation deadlines, implementing structures, monitoring mechanisms, performance indicators, expected results (2018-2024).</p> <p>From the documents and through the talks and interviews with academic staff (permanent and invited - look at the timetable of site visit for detail) the main difficulty of ABIU will be to acquire qualified staff with the proficiency in English. The financial investment in ABIU probably will not cause the problems (interview with the Founder). If authorization is granted the idea of campus will be then probably realized.</p>
Recommendations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Carefully monitor the implementation of the action plan (C in the abbreviation PDCA and act accordingly if something goes wrong). • Set priorities in the action (operational) plan and possibly change the plan

accordingly.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Suggestions: Continuous education center can already create and run short payable training course for society (not only foreign language teaching) and doing consulting even before authorization and ABIU can also organize conferences. Batumi is the appropriate place for that.
Best Practices (if applicable):
Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

2. Organizational Structure and Management of HEI

Organizational structure and management of the HEI is based on best practices of the educational sector, meaning effective use of management and quality assurance mechanisms in the management process. This approach ensures implementation of strategic plan, integration of quality assurance function into management process, and promotes principles of integrity and ethics

2.1 Organizational Structure and Management of HEI
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Organizational structure of HEI ensures implementation of goals and activities described in its strategic plan o Procedures for election/appointment of the management bodies of HEI are transparent, equitable, and in line with legislation o HEI's Leadership/Management body ensures effective management of the activities of the institution o Considering the mission and goals of HEI, leadership of the HEI supports international cooperation of the institution and the process of internationalization.
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements <p>The management organs of the ABIU are following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • General Assembly of Partners (non- existent) • The Rector • Academic Board (non-existent at present) • General Secretary • Quality Assurance Service. <p>with other units and services: Faculty, Dean of Faculty, The library, The Financial Service, The Procurement Service Office, The Audit Office, Legal Service, The Academic Process management, The Case Process Management, Human Resources Management, The Scientific Research and Innovation Service, The examination center, Student Services, Continuous Education and Student Career Development Center, The Information Technology Provision Service, The International Relations Service, The Public Relations, The Language Learning Center.</p> <p>In short - ABIU claims that these structural units implement their functions effectively and in a coordinated manner. Functions and responsibilities of structural units are clearly outlined and defined by extensive regulations. Decisions on the academic, scientific and administrative issues in the university are made timely and efficient. The rules of ABIU proceeding is in compliance with the current legislation. Modern technologies are used in management. The registry of educational institutions is ensured in accordance with the applicable legislation.</p> <p>At present Academic Council does not exist and the leadership at university level is with Founder, Rector and General Secretary. University as a small institution is centralized.</p>

However, when a university will be authorized, it will face with some crucial strategic choices from strategic plan and it will have to set just few priorities. Furthermore, the ABIU university is small and some services could be optimized. For example: The Financial Service, The Procurement Service Office, The Audit Office - could be one unit. Also, The Information Technology Provision Service, The International Relations Service, The Public Relations - could be another one. The organization scheme is in hands of university autonomy though.

Because, university is now without students, some of the services for students cannot be checked. Only regulations exist for that. Human Resource Management is now very active for announcing working positions for prospective teaching staff.

Organizational structure of ABIU in general ensures effective implementation of strategic plan, however in some cases the procedures could be well simplified (for example: annual evaluation process for the research activities of the scientific staff, SER p. 88).

However, there are other rules and procedures for election/appointment for the management bodies which have to be in line with Georgian legislation.

The ABIU will be an international university and therefore **the proficiency in English language** is necessary and mandatory for teaching staff, administrative staff and students.

The role of the Language Teaching Center here is very important. The management is aware of that and the Founder of the ABIU in the final interview promised that these actions will take place immediately in the future.

ABIU is an international university. International-student mobility is the most visible aspect of internationalization while students' voices are usually the least heard in internationalization-related discussions. Over the past decades, the internationalization of higher education has attracted also the interest of HE teachers, scholars and policy-makers at different levels: global, national and institutional. The key aspects of internationalization are related to learning in international contexts, inter-culturality and mobility. However, ABIU is a newly established university and at present without students.

Evidences/indicators

Organizational structure and Management of HEI (in SER from p.21-p.30) is covered with the following Appendices:

Appendix 10 - ABIU structure

Appendix 11 - Structural units provisions;

Appendix 12 - Functions of structural units;

Appendix 13 - Functions, responsibilities, qualification requirements, professional knowledge and skills of the personal;

Appendix 14 - Rule of appointment and selection in management bodies;

Appendix 15 - Regulation of the Academic Board

Appendix 16 - Rule of production of the registry;

Appendix 17 - Rule of conduct of the case;

Appendix 18 - Ltd "Avrasia Batumi International University" Mechanisms for Monitoring Management and Evaluation System;

Appendix 19 - Order on Monitoring Group;

Appendix 20 - Unbreakable Business Plan;

Appendix 21 - Action Plan (three years) and expected results 2018-2020;

Appendix 22 - Mechanisms for monitoring the implementation of the three-year 2018-2020 action plan;

Appendix 23 - Strategic Plan of ABIU to achieve the goals set by the strategic development plan, implementation of actions, implementation deadlines, implementing terms, monitoring mechanisms, performance indicators, expected results (2018-2024);

Appendix 24 - Strategic Plan of ABIU, Mechanisms for attracting foreign students.

Additional interviews with Founder, Rector, General Secretary.

Recommendations:

- To increase **English proficiency** for teaching/administrative staff and students.
- Information computer system which will have to encompass all necessary data for Rector and General Secretary for decision making.
- To thoroughly check organizational structure and related procedures in order to

<p>simplify, rationalize and optimize the work and prevent overlap.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To keep up-to-date English website. • To publish small "Facts and Figures" booklet on ABIU.
<p>Suggestions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To include students effectively in various services.
<p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p>
<p>Evaluation</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p>x Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p>o <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>
<p>2.2 Internal Quality Assurance Mechanisms</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Institution effectively implements internal quality assurance mechanisms. Leadership of the institution constantly works to strengthen quality assurance function and promotes establishment of quality culture in the institution. o HEI has a mechanism for planning student body, which will give each student an opportunity to get a high-quality education.
<p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>The quality assurance service is an integral part of planning, management and monitoring which are necessary for the development of the ABIU. It evaluates study and research activities, analyze the results and use results for further development of the teaching / learning processes.</p> <p>Quality Assurance Service of the teaching University is oriented to provide quality education and higher level of teaching, also facilitate research and improve management efficiency.</p> <p>All structural units of ABIU are involved in the implementation of internal quality assurance mechanisms of the university. The university is provided with human, information and material resources. Quality assurance mechanism will provide continuous evaluation and development of the educational activities.</p> <p>ABIU management will thus be able to make appropriate decisions on quality evaluation results.</p> <p>Quality Assurance Service has developed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Performance evaluation system for personnel (academic, scientific, invited, administrative, support); - Monitoring mechanisms for students' academic performance, and using results for the improvement of the teaching process; - Evaluation and improvement mechanisms of educational programs where will be actively involved the academic / invited / scientific personnel and students as well as stakeholders (employers, alumni and others); - Mechanism of planning a student contingency that is carried out in accordance with a certain methodology taking into account the resources, relevant indicators and targets. - Mechanisms for quality evaluation of university services, training and material resources supplied by ABIU. - Systematic assessment mechanisms for training and scientific research, as well as professional quality development of personnel for further response. <p>Results of assessments as well as the recommendations will be submitted to the Academic Council for reaction and approval.</p>

<p>The University Quality Assurance System has begun to work and continue with the PDCA Principle ("Plan - Do - Check - Act"). A letter C is the most important at the beginning.</p> <p>The Quality Assurance Service of the International University was already planned and started in 2018, but some its action could not be checked.</p> <p>The computer system will also check the educational programmes, academic/invited/scientific staff together with data for students and external stakeholders. The data on quality of other services will also be collected and used for improvement.</p> <p>Student body will be formed when students will be enrolled at ABIU. We did not check if there is any contingency plan for the ABIU being prepared for this potential event.</p> <p>The ABIU has a very capable person as a Head of Quality Assurance Service.</p>
<p>Evidences/indicators</p> <p>Annex 25 - Quality Assurance Department provision; Annex 26 - Quality assurance mechanisms and the procedure of using evaluation results. Annex 27 - Survey-questionnaire Annex 28 - Internal mechanisms of quality assurance SER p. 30 Interview with Head of Quality Assurance Service</p>
<p>Recommendations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Quality assurance service will be overload with quality assurance activity and academic administration and it should need some optimization. • The various collected data at QA Service should be properly used for analytical work and forecast trends. • Further improvement of the data collection could automatically detect irregularities in the university activities and should suggest action. • Students should also be involved in the internal quality assurance system.
<p>Suggestions:</p>
<p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p>
<p>Evaluation</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>
<p>2.3. Observing Principles of Ethics and Integrity</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ HEI has developed regulations and mechanisms that follow principles of ethics and integrity. Such regulations are publicly accessible. ○ Institution has implemented mechanisms for detecting plagiarism and its prevention. ○ HEI follows the principles of academic freedom.
<p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>ABIU is a higher education institution of academic education and research, will be a community of students, professors, teachers and researchers following three basic principles: academic freedom, freedom of conscience and freedom of choice.</p> <p>ABIU will play an important role in the development of a democratic and open society. Consequently, the Code of Ethics developed by the ABIU is the formulation of ethical principles, values and behaviour of international university staff and students. It is aimed to facilitate to</p>

<p>solve and identify ethical issues that may arise during their work or learning period.</p> <p>This system also aims at regulating relations with colleagues, students, university and national or international community.</p> <p>The Code of Ethics extends to the students and staff of the ABIU and regulates the rules of their behaviour not only for the entire period of study and work at the university, but also later.</p> <p>According to the basic principles of the Code of Ethics, all students are equally served by Georgian legislation and the provisions of the Teaching University.</p> <p>The student is obliged to accept the values envisaged by the Code of Ethics and follow the rules established by this Code. The Code of Ethics provides what is considered to be inappropriate and unethical behaviour for the student.</p> <p>ABIU will react to all allegations of cheating, plagiarism, fraudulent or fabricated coursework or malpractice in examinations and assessments. A student cannot have a degree conferred or an award presented while any such allegation against him/her remains unresolved.</p> <p>ABIU is committed to provide high quality of teaching / learning and research activities that are recognized and legitimate on the local and international area. This is a significant prerequisite for implementation of this vision - to provide academic integrity, honesty in research and training activities.</p> <p>ABIU will increase the efforts in detecting plagiarism and theft of the intellectual property and also preventing fraud and cheating in the academic process.</p>
<p>Evidences/indicators</p> <p>Annex 30 - Statute of ABIU Code of Ethics and Norms of Disciplinary Responsibility</p> <p>Annex 31 - ABIU Statute Appendix</p> <p>32 - On identifying plagiarism in scientific work</p> <p>Annex 33 - Internal regulations of LTD Avrasya Batumi International University</p> <p>Interview with Founder and Rector.</p>
<p>Recommendations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Produce effective mechanism to detect plagiarism and theft of intellectual properties. • The first-year student should have a short introductory course on fraud in higher education. • Carefully check the ownership of the each study programme at the ABIU and in what way the programme appeared in the list.
<p>Suggestions:</p>
<p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p>
<p>Evaluation</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p>x Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>

3. Educational Programmes

HEI has procedures for planning, designing, approving, developing and annulling educational programmes. Programme learning outcomes are clearly defined and are in line with the National Qualifications Framework. A programme ensures achievement of its objectives and intended learning outcomes

3.1 Design and Development of Educational Programmes

HEI has a policy for planning, designing, implementing and developing educational programmes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The ABIU has developed a document titled: "Methodology for planning, development and improvement of educational programs". This methodology determines the rule and procedures of planning, designing, reviewing, evaluating, amending educational programs. The educational program is a combination of training courses / components necessary to obtain higher education qualifications. The programme should be composed in accordance with the ECTS.

The proposed and accepted regulations covered the whole elaborated procedure regarding the design of some general study programmes, however we had to connect these procedures with the content of the study programmes at ABIU which is explained below. The methodology itself is fine, but the study programme bears some specialities as are described below.

While reading and understanding the content of the programme and its syllabi panel of experts has identified some mismatched notions which give birth to many questions. Mainly addressing objectives and outcomes, as well as the content and the issues regarding academic personnel itself.

In the educational master programme of Architecture (renewed version) the objectives are defined as follows: "...*personnel for international market, who has practical skills of scientific research activity in the field of architecture. Will be able to participate in the process of beautification of the architectural environment and designing*". It has to be outlined that among syllabi presented in the annexes together with educational programme - there is an obvious focus on studies in theory and practice for students of Architecture, which can be seen prescribed in the syllabus: "syllabus N 16 master thesis; and Syllabus N 32 Bachelor Thesis". On the other hand, no clearly defined aspect of creativity is identified in any studies, which according to some preset objectives is meant to improve students three-dimensional perception of the surrounding and is supposed to be part of the educational process. Creativity could be achieved with having more focus in art classes, geometric modelling, free hand drawings, sculpturing or many other and has to be well documented in the same syllabus of the Master thesis.

Syllabus for Master thesis in architecture should have clearly defined criteria for what the final work should resemble, (what type of work should it be besides paper based research and its written counterpart) next to its theoretical part. In the field of architecture a theoretical research cannot exist without actual project. Panel of experts believe that the programme itself is missing key aspects which are mandatory for a creative designer and for a student who should develop dimensional thinking. A master thesis has two components – a research part and a project, these sum up to 30 ECTS. During the interview with the SER team, the panel of experts learned that the research component is in fact, nothing else than the usual analyses that is needed in order to start a design project. That is not what internationally is coined to be research. This component definitely needs further improvement and development.

Syllabus for a thesis (for both BA and MA) need to be amended, and/or programme should have more subjects as mandatory on the emphasis of the improvement in creative thinking.

Within same document of educational Master programme, in the methods for reaching learning outcomes paragraph mentions the following: "*attending lecture, working in the group, practical studying, independent learning, etc.*" - it does not mention any art, free hand drawings or dimensional perception as a methodology. There are no tools included for improving highly mentioned skills. This part is supported as well by the fact that during the site visit there was no space observed for any art classes. When asked - panel was shown single classroom\auditorium which contained 4 drafting tables, and over 20 standard tables

for lecture, which are for architectural drawings but not for art classes. Same class cannot be considered to be used for art and free hand sketches/painting and/or for graphic three dimensional modelling.

Syllabus N 32 which is for BA thesis for architecture, has all detailed criteria described for a research component, which includes type of a paper, font style and etc, (which is a positive aspect on its own) while the criteria for project itself is completely missing from the content. What type of project are they meant to design? Are they required to design a project at all? These issues are not visible in the provided programme and its syllabi. It gives a feeling as if architectural project is not a priority - which should not be the case.

After meeting with invited personnel, and discussing some of the syllabi panel was surprised that for some major parts of programme in architecture, such as fourth syllabus MSC thesis - professor responsible for this syllabus was not aware that he/she was responsible for these parts. Same professor, was responsible for 4 5 26 syllabi - in the MA programme and 4 35 41 44 syllabi in BA programme and has clearly stated together with few other professors that is not sure if one of the professors will move to Batumi at all, because the person was surprised to be in charge of so many programmes and has agreed with the panel that time-wise it would be hard if not impossible to cope with required workload. All of the highly mentioned defines that ABIU lacks internal information exchange, and they have some issues with misunderstanding information from the administration as some professors were surprised to have their names in some of the syllabi. Some examples are shown below. It shows creating this programme was not a collaboration, and if professors are not sure whether they will join this programme or not because of its imbalanced workload, it is logical to doubt the success rate of new programmes for both BA or MA of architecture and consider it in noncompliant.

BA programme architecture syllabus 48 teaches 3D max and V-ray which cannot be a substitute for Autocad and other CAD programmes as it is only a tool for graphical designing but can never be used for detailing architecture and or drawings required in civil engineering. Syllabus 16 - Computer aided design 1 is a syllabus meant for filling the blank and teaching CAD programme and 2d drafting but syllabus is required to define which softwares will be taught. In regard to teaching software at ABIU there is not a single computer which has needed properties to run these software - despite the fact that all computers are new they are not sufficient for these classes. University needs to purchase new computers for teaching softwares or upgrade current PCs. University needs to clearly define which softwares they are teaching and make it clear in syllabi.

During meeting with quality assurance group it was stated that local developer companies were tightly consulting university leadership about their priorities and needs that was reflected in SER and programmes. Assuming that development business in Georgia is on its quite basic level, panel believes that universities with such disciplines as architecture shall promote and establish general values and give students free and independent knowledge based on empirical experience and best practices from different cultures and not reflect interests of any business companies.

The HEI has also developed a document titled: "An Instruction of designing of Educational Programmes" In this document, other university name is mentioned several times. For example: "Other Additional Requirements of evaluation (including Scientific-Research Components) see in the Document of ATSU Student Assessment System (Article 9.5) and also, the same university name is mentioned in article 14 of this document.

Evidences/indicators

Site visit, talkings with invited personnel, other interviews.

Annex 28 – "An Instruction of designing of educational programmes"

Recommendations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Revision of the study programmes BA and MA in Architecture is needed. • More focus in art classes, geometric modelling, free hand drawings, or many other in the programmes of Architecture.
Suggestions:
Best Practices (if applicable):
Evaluation <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements (after revision is done) <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements
3.2 Structure and Content of Educational Programmes
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Programme learning outcomes are clearly stated and are in line with higher education level and qualification to be granted ○ With the help of individualized education programmes, HEI takes into consideration various requirements, needs and academic readiness of students, and ensures their unhindered involvement into the educational process.
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements <p>ABIU offers three programs, two on bachelor level and one on Masters level: bachelor in Architecture, bachelor in construction and master in Architecture.</p> <p>During visit panel stated its viewpoint that term "construction" is not appropriate word for educational program as this is result of certain activities. Head of programs agreed that more appropriate will be to name the programme "Civil Engineering".</p> <p>Bachelor in Architecture Programme consists of mandatory teaching (28 credits), specialty mandatory teaching (188 credits) and elective teaching courses (24 credits). First semester offers several courses, among them are "labour safety and emergency situations", "traditional building materials and elements". Experts' panel considers them very early to be taught. These courses give students information that requires some basic knowledge and understanding. For first semester this kind of knowledge is impossible to have.</p> <p>Bachelor program does not offer students to study any kind of hand drawing/painting. According to program there is course "sketch" that shall offer free hand architectural sketching, that can be some kind of alternative. Although this course is among elective courses. Experts' panel considers, that it would be better to move this course in specialty mandatory teaching section. Same applies for course "architectural perspective" and "design for disabled"; both of them are very important disciplines for contemporary architect.</p> <p>According to SER "architectural programs give students knowledge about Georgian and world culture and values". Panel has not find any course with contents of Georgian history of architecture. (Master's programme offers course "traditional Georgian Housing", although this course does not cover Georgian history of arts and architecture). There are three courses of "architecture and history of art" without mentioning Georgian component. We believe that architect educated and employed in Georgia shall have extensive knowledge about culture and architecture of this country.</p>

Courses "architectural project 1-7" are main professional studio works for bachelor program. Syllabi for these subjects does not show what kind of projects are elaborated during these courses. Type or scale of project are not defined as well. Head of Program explained during site visit, that they will be defined later.

In some courses (Architectural project 5) Turkish language books are used as main literature. This is not acceptable for university with English language teaching.

In following courses inappropriate literature is used: "sketch", "architectural perspective", "architecture and history of art 2", "concepts of architecture", "insulation in buildings"

Course "Urban planning and Urban design principles" has course "computer design 2" as pre-condition, that is not appropriate for this subject.

Course "basic principles of zoning law" aims to provide knowledge about architectural and land use legislation and basic principles. Although there is nothing given about Georgian legal principles of planning. Moreover, there is no course in architectural program that gives knowledge about contemporary fire safety legislation (decree #41) that is mandatory for use in planning and design of buildings in Georgia. If architectural project courses provide this knowledge, this shall be indicated in syllabus.

Course "interior design" –contents in syllabus does not coincide with its name.

The program structure for Master consists of 120 ECTS. It is composed of compulsory and elective modules; internship and master thesis are both compulsory. The compulsory module of 116 ECTS. The elective module sums up to 4 ECTS, and consists of 4 courses of which the student must choose 1 courses. The master thesis, which is required for the completion of the program, counts 30 ECTS, master thesis(M.Sc) 6ECTS and the internship is valued 3 ECTS.

Syllabus for Master thesis in architecture should have clearly defined criteria for what the final work should resemble, (what type of work should it be besides paper based research and its written counterpart) next to its theoretical part. In the field of architecture a theoretical research cannot exist without actual project. Panel of experts believe that the programme itself is missing key aspects which are mandatory for a creative designer and for a student who should develop dimensional thinking.

Syllabus for a thesis (for both BA and MA) need to be amended, and/or programme should have more subjects as mandatory on the emphasis of the improvement in creative thinking.

A master thesis has two components – a research part and a project, these sum up to 30 ECTS. During the interview with the SER team, the assessment committee learned that the research component is in fact, nothing else than the usual analyses that is needed in order to start a design project. That is not what internationally is coined to be research. This component definitely needs further improvement and development

The syllabi of the design courses do not show that students are preparing a project. The student receives theoretical knowledge, without a practical component. This has been confirmed during the interviews. In order to achieve the stated qualifications, the course contents must have design components. This is essential to help student to connect theoretical knowledge with practical skills and this will help him/her to operate in new, unpredictable and multidisciplinary environment.

Courses such as construction engineering, technology, building physics, energy, history and theory of architecture seminars are underrepresented. The panel of experts believes that the curriculum should be more research based and be nurtured by existing research, given the fact that it is a second cycle of higher education (Master Level). Only three courses offered in Urban Planning field (program of MA Architecture). Courses – 1. Squares; 2. Time-Light-Color-Material and Texture in Urban Spaces; 3. Revitalization of Old Urban Spaces and they become the Master in Architecture with the Specialization of Building and Structure Architecture and Urban Planning;

During the site visit a catalogue of educational programmes was not published on the web-

page of the HEI.

During the interview with head of the programs expert panel found out, that they don't have information about Georgian qualification framework.

Since this was primarily a combined institutional/programme evaluation, it would be appropriate for ABIU to have their programmes evaluated by ABET or similar agency.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-evaluation report;
- Educational programs;
- Interviews with university staff during site visit
- <http://avrasyabatumi.ge/>

Recommendations:

- Bachelor program "construction" shall be renamed; for example - "civil engineering"
- Following courses shall be moved to specialty mandatory teaching section: "sketch", "architectural perspective", "design for disabled";
- Course about Georgian art and architecture history shall be added in specialty mandatory teaching section;
- Georgian planning legislation shall be integrated in course "basic principles of zoning law";
- Turkish language literature shall be changed to English where applicable;
- It is recommended that the heads of the educational programmes had a leading role while establishing the conformity of the learning outcomes of the programme with the national qualification frameworks;
- It is recommended that catalogue of educational programmes should be published on the web-page of the HEI
- Curriculum needs to be adjusted based on the program objectives and goals
- Connect to institutions or groups, which work on research. Invite them to be part of the program, develop opportunities for MA students to participate and be able to work on research topics
- Invite professors, students and stakeholders in program development phase
- Roadmap milestones (indicators) should be prepared. This will help student to understand his/her sequential steps and needs
- A Master's programme, certainly with international ambitions like this one, should rest on a solid research foundation. That research basis is not present and has to be developed first
- Add more elective courses in MA program.

Suggestions:

- Panel suggests to move following courses on later semesters: "labor safety and emergency situations", "traditional building materials and elements. 5th-6th semesters would be appropriate.
- Project types and scales shall be defined clearly for Courses "architectural project 1-7".
- Study programmes should be evaluated by ABET or similar agency.

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

- ☐ Complies with requirements
- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☒ x Does not comply with requirements

3.3 Assessment of Learning Outcomes

HEI has law-compliant, transparent and fair system of learning outcomes assessment, which promotes the improvement of students' academic performance.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

Again it was difficult for the panel of experts to have a view on this standard component because we do not have appropriate opinions from the students. Students have not been yet enrolled at the university. The compliance of this standard is usually checked at the re-accreditation procedure after the study programme was active for a few years.

Law-compliant, transparent and fair system of learning outcomes assessment which possibly promotes the improvement of students' academic performance was thus checked only by the available paper work.

According to Georgian Law on Higher Education (Article 45- Students' rights) - A higher education institution shall ensure the fair assessment of the students' knowledge, for which the institution shall develop appropriate procedures.

ABIU explains the whole procedure in detail in SER pp. 57-60. The examination process for educational programs at ABIU **will be conducted** by the Center of Examination. The university has an Examination Center aimed at creating a single internal examination system that provides students with the transparent, objective and fair assessment of the skills, skills and competences that will facilitate the improvement of the quality of learning at the university. The Center is responsible for timely publication of exam results. It is responsible for confidentiality of examination issues and creation of e-banners for examination issues.

Each form of students evaluation shall indicate minimal margin of competence, this shall be indicated in the syllabus of the academic program component. Sum of minimal margin of competence of midterm evaluation and maximum point of the final evaluation shall not be less than 51 points, while minimal margin of competence for the final evaluation shall not exceed 60% of final evaluation.

Main comment of the experts' panel was that the assessment of the students in BA and MA study programme of Architecture could not follow the usual way of assessment which is in the natural and technical educational programmes.

Furthermore, the panel of experts studied the program courses and syllabi, and read that students will receive course name "Time-Light-Color-Material and Texture in Urban Spaces "- knowledge they get - Analyzing and comparing spatial changes in historical process. It is not clear how they will be graded - no project description, only theory and test results; course name -" Squares"- the topic is interesting, but grading is strange - testing again; "Revitalization of Old Urban Spaces" - again not clear about the project assignment; This type of statements leads the panel of experts to the conclusion that this program will not prepare students for the second cycle of higher education learning outcomes. It is never convincingly demonstrated that students after completion will be able to act in a new, unpredictable and multidisciplinary environment, will be able to find new solutions for complex problems, using most research methods and approaches. There is no evidence that students will be able to do qualified research. It is not shown that students can prepare strategic plans at high level, prepare arguments and research methods for the professional community in Georgia and internationally.

<p>Evidences/indicators</p> <p>Georgian Law on Higher Education</p> <p>Appendix 47 - Rule governing the academic process of ABIU</p> <p>Appendix 48 - Provision of the Examination Center</p> <p>ABIU - Methodology for planning, development and improvement of educational programmes</p> <p>ABIU - The instruction for the development of Bachelor's and Master's programmes and the procedure for approval</p>
<p>Recommendations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Adapt the procedure of assessment of students in BA and MA study programmes of Architecture. • Review program content and syllabi; rationalize them in a way that their achievement is measurable and within the framework of the study programme. Consider study load of a student and credits granted. • Reconsider credits assignment system. • Improve research opportunities by collaborating with research institutions or groups in this field. • The offered design courses should concentrate on design as well as on university research. The courses must be relevant to the second cycle of higher education learning outcomes. • The programme development team must reconsider learning outcomes for each course. Learning outcomes must be relevant to the first and second cycle of higher education. • Be aware that the profession of Architect is a Regulated Profession with Automatic Recognition within EU - European directive.
<p>Suggestions:</p> <p>The panel of experts suggests ABIU to check and study the EU legislation: In 2013 the PQD (Professional Qualifications Directive) was amended into 2013/55/EU. http://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/PDF/?uri=CELEX:32013L0055&from=EN. It comprises the "famous" 11 points describing the learning outcomes of architects education.</p>
<p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p>
<p>Evaluation</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p>X Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="radio"/> <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>

4. Staff of the HEI

HEI ensures that the staff employed in the institution (academic, scientific, invited, administrative, support) are highly qualified, so that they are able to effectively manage educational, scientific and administrative processes and achieve the goals defined by the

strategic plan of the institution. On its hand, the institution constantly provides its staff with professional development opportunities and improved work conditions.

4.1. Staff Management

- HEI has staff management policy and procedures that ensure the implementation of educational process and other activities defined in its strategic plan.
- HEI ensures the employment of qualified academic/scientific/invited/administrative/ support staff.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The University is obliged to have staff management policy and procedures that ensure the implementation of educational process and other activities defined in its strategic plan. Staff management policy should include staff attraction, selection, hiring and professional development mechanisms, also principles of remuneration and encouragement, which takes into consideration employees' performance evaluation results. The University should use staff evaluation and satisfaction survey results in the process of staff management. Staff must be involved in decision - making processes.

Personnel Management Policy of the ABIU is very general. This document only includes the following information:

- a) ABIU is oriented to attract qualified staff. But mechanisms how ABIU is going to achieve this goal is missing;
- b) Aims of evaluation of staffs' performance. According to HR management policy ABIU should elaborate mechanisms and procedures for evaluation of staffs' performance.

During the interview it was found that the administrative staff did not have information about the training courses which were conducted for their professional development. Only one of the interviewers noted that several employees were in Trabzon and training was about administrative processes. During the site visit ABIU provided additional documentations about trainings, which were conducted for administrative staff's professional development:

- Development of university programs and syllabi
- Personnel Management and Labor Law
- Necessary skills for writing of projects
- PR Management
- Management Coaching
- General management of the institution

In the descriptions of these trainings there is information about aim of the training, target group, expected results, trainer, duration of the training. According to the "three years action plan (2018-2020)" HEI is planning to support professional and career development of academic personal and support professional training of administrative personnel. More specifically, during the interview, the expert panel found out that the university intends to retrain academic and administrative personnel to improve knowledge of the English language. During the interview with the academic staff, one of interviewer noted that the purpose of teaching at ABIU is to learn English better. Also, after the observation of the electronic base of the educational processes management, the expert panel found out that the manager (who is responsible for managing student's electronic base) could not use the base without the help of a programmer. It is recommended that the trainings were conducted in this direction too.

According to the rule for "Monitoring the effectiveness management of the ABIU" three kind of surveys are conducted by ABIU. Two of them are related to working environment and one of them is linked to staffs' performance. According to the abovementioned document only heads of structural units fill the questionnaires and they assess performance of employees. It should be noted that during Meeting with IT assurance service, Safety assurance service, Financial Service, Audit Service and Purchasing Service none of them was familiar to the evaluation system. Some of them told that they were observing employees during their working process and assessing, but without any kind of criteria. It

should be underlined that there is no procedure and no criteria how the performance of the heads of structural units is evaluated. It should be mentioned that only the head of HR department was familiar to the evaluation system. The head of HR department was not able to respond on the attestation process of academic staff which is regulated upon the statute of ABIU. She told that it was pending process.

According to the document on "Monitoring the effectiveness management of the ABIU" the results of the evaluation of the performance of administrative staff (it should be underlined that panel could not figure out how the heads of structural units are evaluated) partially are linked to encouragement system. Interested parties were not informed on HR management policy and regulations.

ABIU does not have procedures ensuring the integration of new employees into work environment and their efficient involvement into the working process. The head of HR department was not able to describe the process of integration.

The ABIU has approved the terms of the Affiliation of Academic Personnel, Terms of Agreement and Affiliation, Rights and Responsibilities of Academic Personnel and Teaching University related to Affiliation. ABIU's academic personnel will be considered as a person who will sign an agreement with the ABIU. Interview results show that the affiliated personnel knows that they have hourly wages, but according to »Academic personal affiliation agreement«, the employer pays to the employee in exchange of the works executed on a monthly basis.

ABIU has developed rule on evaluation of academic, scientific and invited personnel's pedagogic activity. According to this rule there are similar evaluation questionnaires for academic/scientific and invited staff. Evaluation results are analyzed by QA office which elaborates recommendations which are approved by academic council and afterwards rector decides how to encourage the staff. This procedure is not transparent and It is not clear how evaluation results are linked to encouragement system. It is not defined for example what is sufficient result for encouragement. It should be noted that during interview with the head of Scientific Research and Innovation Service panel could not figure out what kind of mechanisms and criteria were used during evaluation process of academic/scientific/invited staffs' performance. The head of abovementioned unit responded that they were working on this issue and it was pending process. According to the rule on "Quality evaluation mechanism and evaluation results of the research/creative activity of the ABIU" Vice-Rector is involved in evaluation process of academic/scientific/invited staff, but it should be noted that according to the current structure ABIU does not have the position of Vice-Rector.

According to the "Competition holding rule of occupying the academic position in the ABIU" candidate is elected to the position of an assistant-professor and assistant for 1 year (article 2). It should be noted that according to the law on "Higher Education" (article 35) to the position of an assistant-professor may be elected a person holding a Doctoral academic or equivalent degree for 3 or 4 years. To the position of an assistant may be elected a Doctoral student for 3 or 4 years. During interview Lawyer said that he was familiar to the law on "higher education" and he explained that abovementioned provision was not binding for private universities. It should be underlined that according to the law on "Higher Education" (article 12) "article 35 conditions for electing and appointing to academic positions" is binding for private universities. According to the documents provided assistant-professor and assistant was elected for 1 year.

According to the "Competition holding rule of occupying the academic position in the ABIU" the winner of the competition (chosen on academic position) will be considered that applicant who receives more than half of the votes of the members attending. HEI did not define the criteria of assessment of candidates who are taking part into competition. According to the law on higher education (article 34) An academic position may only be held by open competition, based on the principles of transparency, equality and fair competition. Minutes of competition did not include any information about assessment process, scores etc. HEI does not have fair and transparent procedures for selection of academic staff.

It should be underlined that applications of candidates which were taking part into the competition were not registered.

It should be noted that one of the teachers was elected as assistant-professor and the does

not have PhD degree. According to the law on “higher education” a person holding a doctoral academic or equivalent degree could be elected to this position. According to abovementioned law there is also another track which gives opportunity to the person without PhD degree to be elected, but in this case, a person's qualifications may be confirmed by their professional experience, special training and/or publications. According to the order on the announcement of the competition candidate was obliged to provide the document which was certifying person's experience. Panel of experts asked ABIU to provide personal files of academic staff and there was not found such kind of document. It should be noted that during interview with the head of HR management panel asked if there was any person elected without PhD degree. Head of HR department said that no one was elected with no professional experience.

According to the order on the announcement of the competition candidate was obliged to provide the document which certified the knowledge of English language. It should be noted that in the personal files of academic staff there are no certificates, besides panel asked ABIU to provide certificates but they were not provided.

It should be underlined that during interviews most of academic staff was not able to communicate in English language and they said that interviews during competition were conducted in Turkish language. Diplomas of academic staff which were provided by ABIU are in Turkish language, only some of them are in both English and Turkish languages. None of them were translated in Georgian language. It should be underlined that according to Georgian legislation foreign education needs recognition. NCEQE is responsible for recognition of foreign education. Within the scope of recognition NCEQE defines whether the HEI which issued diploma is recognized or not and the foreign qualification is in line or not with Georgian qualifications. Experts' panel asked ABIU to provide the documents on recognition. ABIU provided the agreement between Georgian and Turkish governments (1992 year, was not signed) which was not related to abovementioned issue.

It should be noted that during interviews panel it was figured out that all academic staff currently works at Avrasya University in Trabzon. They responded that if ABIU obtains authorization they will move in Batumi.

According to the rule on “selecting invited staff” the head of the program selects invited staff. It should be underlined that during interview the head of program was not able to provide information about the selection procedure. He was not involved in selection process.

HEI has defined the qualification requirements of academic/ scientific/ invited/ administrative/support staff and is provided job descriptions. According to the document of “Competition holding rule of occupying the academic position in the ABIU” the candidate wishing to occupy the academic position should submit the document confirming the knowledge of English language or the experience of studying English language. The job description of academic staff stipulates that they must know English language. During the interview, the HR department clarified that an applicant must present English language certificate (level C1) or some document, which approves that he/she has experience of teaching in English. Revision of personal files and interview results show that the vast majority of the academic staff has not submitted certificate or was not able to communicate with the experts' panel without a Turkish language translator during the interview. Also, the interviewees (academic staff) mentioned that they do not have an experience in teaching in English and they are teaching in Turkish. Also, the head of the Bachelor programme of construction has a real barrier in communicating in English. It should be noted that invited teaching staff has same problems in this direction as well. Even though, their qualification requirements do not include the knowledge of English language when programs are taught in English.

According to the rule of recruitment of supporting staff, the amount and conditions of remuneration of the ABIU (article 2) administrative staff should know the state language. It should be noted that during interviews panel figured out that some administrative staff did not know the national language (for example the Head of library). The administrative staff, who has an obligation to communicate with foreign students or staff failed to confirm their knowledge of English language as well. Qualification requirements do not include knowledge of English language (for example, it is necessary on paramedic position) in some job descriptions or they state that it is only advisable (because it would be problem to choose

the staff - it was explained by the head of the HR department during the interview). We come across unusual entries of study programmes in the job description of the head of QA and QA manager several times, while the Teaching University does not plan to carry out these programs. Also, it would be better if the job description of the head of the program had determined required professional knowledge and skills for this position in details.

At the beginning the ABIU University may face difficulties during recruitment of qualified academic personnel from local and international markets.

Evidences/indicators

1. HR management policy
2. The rule for "Monitoring the effectiveness management of LTD Avrasya Batumi International University";
3. The rule of activity evaluation of Academic, scientific and invited personnel of Avrasya Batumi International University;
4. "Competition holding rule of occupying the academic position in Avrasya Batumi International University LTD";
5. The rule of recruitment of supporting staff, the amount and conditions of remuneration of LTD Avrasya Batumi International University;
6. Rule on selecting invited staff;
7. "Complex poll of the satisfaction survey (Administration and assistant personnel)";
8. Survey of Academic staff satisfaction;
9. Affiliation rule of the academic personnel;
10. Job Descriptions and Qualification Requirements;
11. Samples of agreements signed with staff;
12. Invited teaching staff selection rule;
13. Personal files;
14. Order on announcement of competition;
15. Minutes;
16. Interviews;
17. Action plan;

Recommendations:

- Develop staff attraction mechanisms.
- Develop criteria concerning to the evaluation of the performance of the heads of administrative units.
- Develop transparent and fair rules for the competition of academic staff.
- Develop transparent criteria for the assessment of staffs' scientific performance.
- Develop transparent and objective criteria for staff encouragement and remuneration.
- Make procedures formal and document based (for example newly appointed staff involvement in working environment).
- Attract qualified academic and administrative staff to ensure students fair evaluation and service and to ensure the operation of learning processes in english language in a proper way.
- Informing stakeholders about HR management policy and other rules.

Suggestions:

- It should be better if university publish information about planned and realized training courses on the web-page in order to increase staff awareness and

involvement in trainings.
Best Practices (if applicable):
Evaluation <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements
4.2. Academic/Scientific and Invited Staff Workload
Number and workload of academic/scientific and invited staff is adequate to HEI's educational programmes and scientific-research activities, and also other functions assigned to them
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements <p>The workload of academic/scientific and invited staff should be adequate for the University's educational programs and scientific-research activities, and also other functions assigned to them. The University should have a workload scheme for academic and invited staff and methodology of determining the number of academic, scientific, and invited staff in relation with academic programs.</p> <p>According to SER "Methodology and principles for determining the number of academic staff have been approved by the order of the Rector of the ABIU. University determines the maximum number of the academic staff considering the total budget of the teaching university, the remuneration of the academic staff and the number of the total academic hours planned within the frames of the educational programme/programmes; the number of academic staff of the educational programme/programmes is determined proportionally to the number of student population, considering the peculiarities of the programme; with the purpose of ensuring the sustainability of the programme, while planning the number of academic, scientific and invited staff, the university and the faculty has taken into account the population of students to be admitted to each programme, as well as the peculiarities of the programme. Thereafter, when the university starts its full functioning, the details to be considered with regard to determining the number of academic staff in the methodology will be clearly visible and the document will be improved with the help of the experience gained in the process of working, where we will also consider the existing number of students and the best international practices."</p> <p>According to abovementioned document ABIU does not have transparent and clear Methodology of determining the number of academic, scientific, and invited staff in relation with academic programmes.</p> <p>According to the SER "The activity and workload of the academic/scientific/invited staff is regulated by the rule for the workload of the academic/scientific/invited staff of the ABIU". In accordance with the rule defined by the teaching university, the academic workload of an affiliated professor includes at least an 8 hour lecture and consultation workload; the academic workload of an affiliated associate professor includes at least a 10 hour lecture and consultation workload; the academic workload of an affiliated assistant professor includes at least a 12 hour lecture and consultation workload; the academic workload of an affiliated assistant include at least a 12 hour seminar/practical and/or other workload.</p> <p>It should be underlined that academic staff was not familiar to abovementioned scheme. during interview they were not able to answer questions related to academic and scientific</p>

<p>workload.</p> <p>According to the SER the teaching university finances the expenses of affiliated academic staff for organizing scientific researches, publishing scientific works, participation in international projects and scientific conferences, publishing scientific works (monographs, guide-books, translations, articles, etc.) not less than once a year. During interview panel asked academic staff and the head of scientific research and innovation service about criteria how ABU was financing abovementioned activities. Staff was not able to answer, they were not informed about criteria.</p> <p>HEI has staffs' workload scheme which includes only academic workload (workload at other universities is missing, it should be mentioned that academic staff currently occupies academic positions at Avrasya University Trabzon), information about scientific/ research/ creative/ performing and other workload according to academic staff's functions and duties is not concluded.</p> <p>Also, after interview with administrative staff and study of documents experts' panel found out that some of the administrative staff at the same time are occupying administrative positions in other institutions.</p>
<p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. SER; 2. Methodology and principles for determining the number of academic staff; 3. The rule for the workload of academic/scientific/invited staff of LTD Avrasya Batumi International University; 4. Interviews; 5. Workload scheme.
<p>Recommendations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Elaborate accurate workload scheme; • Develop transparent procedures for financing scientific activities for affiliated staff; • Develop transparent Methodology of determining the number of academic, scientific, and invited staff; • Inform academic staff about their workloads.
<p>Suggestions:</p>
<p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p>
<p>Evaluation</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>

5. Students and Their Support Services

HEI ensures the development of student-centred environment, offers appropriate services, including career support mechanisms; it also ensures maximum awareness of students, implements diverse activities and promotes student involvement in these activities. HEI utilizes student survey results to improve student support services

5.1. The Rule for Obtaining and Changing Student Status, the Recognition of Education,

and Student Rights

- For each of the educational levels, HEI has developed regulations for assignment, suspension and termination of student status, mobility, qualification granting, issuing educational documents as well as recognition of education received during the learning period.
- HEI ensures the protection of student rights and lawful interests.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

For the objective assessment of the fifth standard, it has to be outlined that there were no students interviewed during the expert site visit, as this was an evaluation for a new University, and it was logical that the target group for the assessment of the fifth standard were not part of the interviews. In order to acquire information required by the authorization criteria – main target for questions were: Members of Internal Quality Assurance office; Student Continuous education and Career development center; Information Technology Support Center; General Secretary; Office of International Relations; Financial Service; Safety Assurance Service; Language Teaching Center; Head of Educational Process management.

Documents provided to the experts' panel prior to the site-visit, contained a vast amount of information as Annexes to the Self Evaluation Report (SER) – which was all checked by the panel of experts. Yet some of these Annexes required by the Subcomponent 5.1 were provided only in Georgian language. Based on the international profile of the ABIU, the following documents: regulations for assignment, suspension and termination of student status, mobility, qualification granting and recognition of education and Code of Ethics – were requested on site in English language. These documents were **promptly provided**. After assessing these documents – it is justified to say that they are in line with current legislation. ABIU has all abovementioned documents available in English and in Georgian languages. Yet, the information regarding these issues **are not public and are not accessible to everyone** - as university Web-page is at present incomplete. (More information regarding web page can be viewed in standard 7.0). **Student Contract:**

After reviewing student contract sample (provided prior to site visit) - it is justified to point out that it is in line with legislation, yet panel of experts would give a suggestion to ABIU to input some extra information in student contract which will benefit both parties.

a) student contract paragraph 4.6 states that it will be signed at the beginning of each year. It would be a suggestion to have one contract for entire study period, rather than having students sign a new contract every year.

b) If ABIU makes a single contract for entire study period (8 semesters for BA and 4 Semesters for MA) for international students, it would be better to have a clear understanding prescribed in contract whether university is entitled or not to change/increase student fee if annual inflation or national currency devaluation will exceed by X%. (Considering that according Georgian Legislation Contracts are in GEL). It is as well within financial interests of ABIU.

c) It would be better if students will have some parts from Code of Ethics mentioned in the student contract – in particularly an issue regarding plagiarism – which will assist ABIU to have students better informed about the problems that plagiarism could cause.

We believe that office of educational office management is meant to give students clear understanding of all information within student contract.

University needs to have a mechanism to support students and answer their questions regarding their rights and lawful interests, and support them during the disciplinary committee meeting in case of any violation of rules from the side of a student.

The Disciplinary committee

As mentioned above, the regulatory documents should be communicated to students. They all should be aware about their rights and lawful interests and they all must be well

informed about plagiarism. In case of any violation of the laws - mainly issues that could be related to plagiarism - it can become a case discussed at the disciplinary committee. According to SER (p.35 subcomponent 2.3) students will be selected to be members of this committee and it is responsibility of this team to discuss a problem at hand and reach a conclusion. Rector has a final say in the decision. It was clarified by Head of Educational Process management that at first, ABIU can give a warning, and in case disciplinary action is recurring then student's status could be suspended and/or terminated. It was a bit unclear, who will be protecting the interest of the student at question. Based on the answer from the ABIU representatives, students who will be part of the Commission are enough to consider students' rights protected. Based on interview results, regarding topic of selecting students in disciplinary committee and selecting students eligible for scholarships, panel of experts asked if ABIU could provide some clearly defined criteria or certain mechanisms by which these particular students would be selected. As stated by head of Educational Process management they are aware that these students would be selected based on higher marks and/or by portfolios or by rector himself, and possibly by other means as well, but they don't have any criteria or mechanisms written or documented. This answer defines that ABIU has no clearly defined mechanisms and this methodology **must not be considered to be transparent and fair**. These mechanisms should be written and made publicly accessible, as it is defined by the fifth standard of the authorization. Abovementioned documents should be in English language.

The Examination center:

The Center for Examination is well equipped. It has approximately 25 computers which are sufficient only for particular type of examination purposes, which excludes students from Architecture using CAD programmes, as these computers are not nearly sufficient to run any CAD program. (The detailed information regarding Computers can be viewed in standard 7.0) Panel of experts have determined, that for the time of visit at ABIU there were no mechanisms to have students duly informed regarding their upcoming exams, expected assessment, assessment feedback, possible job vacancies or for any type of information whatsoever. It was mentioned in SER and as well during the interviews that ABIU will have a type of learning management system (LMS) which they currently don't have yet. More detailed about LMS in subcomponent 5.2.

Evidences/indicators

Interviews with: members of Internal Quality Assurance office; Student Continuous education and Career development center; Information Technology Support Center; General Secretary; Office of International Relations; Financial Service; Safety Assurance Service; Language Teaching Center; Head of Educational Process management.

Site visit. All documents which were provided during the site visit.

SER and annexes provided prior the site visit.

ABIU current webpage.

Recommendations:

- University needs to have a mechanism to support students and answer their questions regarding their rights and lawful interests and support them during the disciplinary committee meeting in case of any violation of rules from the side of a student.
- All documents need to be accessible and published online in English language.
- University needs to have clearly defined mechanisms and criteria for selecting students who are eligible for scholarships. Clearly defined criteria for students who will be selected for disciplinary committee, and students who are capable for supporting students with special economic needs as mentioned in SER.

Suggestions:

- Extra information which could be added in Student Contract:
 - a) student contract paragraph 4.6 states that it will be signed at the beginning of each year. It would be a suggestion to have one contract for entire study period, rather than having students sign a new contract every year.
 - b) If ABIU makes a single contract for entire study period (8 semesters for BA and 4 Semesters for MA), For international students it would be better to have a clear understanding prescribed in contract whether ABIU is entitled or not to change/increase student fee if annual inflation or national currency devaluation will exceed by X%. (Considering that according Georgian Legislation Contracts are in GEL). It is as well within financial Interests of ABIU.
 - c) It could be better if students will have some parts from Code of Ethics mentioned in the student contract – in particularly an issue regarding plagiarism – which will assist University to have students better informed about the problems that plagiarism could cause.
- Since there are several universities in Batumi, it would be a good idea to have a common students' ombudsman to take control of students' rights.

Best Practices (if applicable):**Evaluation**

- ☐ Complies with requirements
- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☒ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

5.2 Student Support Services

- o HEI has student consulting services in order to plan educational process and improve academic performance
- o HEI has career support service, which provides students with appropriate counselling and support regarding employment and career development
- o HEI ensures students awareness and involvement in various university-level, local and international projects and events, and supports student initiatives
- o HEI has mechanisms, including financial mechanisms to support low SES students

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

According to SER and from the information acquired at interviews the panel noted that student support is relied on formal interactions between students and academic staff/administrative staff. ABIU clearly defined who should be addressed if student has particular needs (According to SER)– if they need for example individual learning plan (ILP) they should address Dean of the faculty, and by his/her order the programme supervisor is in charge creating ILP. If students are looking for internship, then they should address an office of Continuous learning and Career development center – if they need a financing for a particular initiative they need to address Rector via Quality assurance office. (yet finances are mainly addressed by General Secretary). The final decision is always with the Rector. – ABIU needs to provide a roadmap for all incoming students to clearly understand this structure and all procedures including financial mechanism to support low SES students. Based on the information acquired during the visit there is no roadmap, a kind of brochure - Students' Guidebook or internal information exchange system currently functioning at the ABIU. It was promised to panel of experts that in case of positive authorization ABIU will invest in the information exchange system similar to the one at Avrasya Trabzon University.

As mentioned above, according to the structure at the ABIU, a lot of responsibilities for

Student support is shared between different Academic or Administrative personnel, which at this stage will be via face to face communication. During the site visit major challenge for the ABIU was observed to be a language problem. In particular Head of Continuous education and Career development centre did not have sufficient skills in English language. (we mainly communicated via support from a professor from Language Learning Center who acted as translator from Turkish language). Head of the Programme of Civil Engineering at the Faculty of Architecture and Civil Engineering (construction) could not speak English at all. Head of Educational Process management and Head of Internal Quality Assurance offices as well could not speak English languages. (We mainly communicated in Georgian in order to understand some particularities in the SER.)

Websites and online educational platforms as support mechanisms are an important source of information for students, ensuring that they can access the range of support services provided by an institution. Web-page for ABIU is in need of updating, and it has been noted already that it does not publish English language versions of key documents. As well it has also majority of documents and information missing or not available.

It was promised to the panel of experts, that using the computers that are available on the institution's premises, students will be able to gain access to all library information and resources, as stated by head of IT department. Despite the fact that none of the computers seen on the premises were part of the shared system, library had only two computers for students plus one computer for the Head of Library administration who could not speak reasonably good English as well. Students will not be able to receive needed information from the department of Library. Library support is missing from this standard yet you can see recommendations in standard 7.0 Library resources.

Evidences/indicators

Interviews with: Members of Internal Quality Assurance office; Student Continuous education and Career development center; Information Technology Support Center; General Secretary; Office of International Relations; Financial Service; Safety Assurance Service; Language Teaching Center; Head of Educational Process management.

Site visit. All documents which were provided during the site visit.

SER with annexes provided prior the site visit.

University Webpage.

Recommendations:

- Ensure English proficiency for all personnel.
- Establish a learning management system of any type, (such as Moodle for example).
- Have all computers from ABIU premises accessible for students and interconnected, so that it was possible to search through library books, to be able to see if particular books can be ordered for check out, etc...
- Provide a clear roadmap (Students Guidebook) to help students understand the structure and hierarchy as well as responsibilities of each structural unit of ABIU.

Suggestions:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Evaluation

- ☐ Complies with requirements
- ☐ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☒ Does not comply with requirements

6. Research, development and/or other creative work

Higher Education Institution, considering its type and specifics of field(s), works on the strengthening of its research function, ensures proper conditions to support research activities and improve the quality of research activities

6.1 Research Activities

- o HEI, based on its type and specifics of its fields, carries out research/creative activities.
- o Ensuring the effectiveness of doctoral research supervision
- o HEI has public, transparent and fair procedures for the assessment and defense of dissertations which are relevant to the specifics of the field

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The status of ABIU will be a Teaching university, therefore the research and scientific work for students is only limited and incorporated only in the Master programme of Architecture.

For an effective integration of research and teaching, it is planned for the future to improve the material and technical base and scientific and research laboratory of the university, so that the involvement of the students of Master's level into the research and arts activities is maximally improved.

The panel heard that the budget of ABIU will enable the financing of the professors' researches in accordance with the specificity of the field. The university also developed a development strategy for applied researches. In the view of the strategic goals, the university will implement the support towards the staff involved in research, organization of scientific researches and events. The university will constantly develop and strengthen the mechanisms supporting the university research activity.

There is no Doctoral programme at ABIU. However, as we heard from academic staff of ABIU the research will be oriented towards the applied research. Since ABIU is newly established university under authorization procedure, the composition of teaching staff is not yet determined. They expect that the staff will be from Georgia, Turkey and Europe.

The research and scientific work is planned for the following proposed study programmes - Architecture and Civil Engineering. A Master's thesis is the only research component of a master's educational program, which is completed at the end of studies, the fourth semester and embraces 30 ECTS credits.

At the visit of the premises the panel of experts did not observe substantial research equipment.

The research work will be financed from budget of ABIU, from possible grants and external sources as referring to SER.

There is a tendency to attract young scholars at ABIU.

Evidences/indicators

Conversation of panel of experts with Rector, Deans, Teaching staff and Invited teaching staff.

The documents are: Annex 91: Statute of the Scientific Researches Development and Innovations Service;

Annex 92 - Development Strategy for Applied Research;

Annex 93 - Rule of planning, implementing and evaluating the scientific-research component;

Recommendations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To set five priorities in applied research for ABIU. • To clarify the transfer of the intellectual property from university to university (regarding the study programmes as well) and from university to business.
Suggestions:
Best Practices (if applicable):
Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements X Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements
6.2. Research Support and Internationalization
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ HEI has an effective system in place for supporting research, development and creative activities ○ Attracting new staff and their involvement in research/arts-creative activities. ○ University works on internationalization of research, development and creative activities.
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements <p>ABIU plans to perform the scientific/ research activities at the separate faculties in accord with the development strategy of applied research of the ABIU. Regular academic and invited staff will perform the scientific and research activities accordingly.</p> <p>Financial support of the research is allocated from different sources: the university budget, amounts allocated from different scientific funds for grant projects, research will be conducted only within the frames of the Master's programmes.</p> <p>The individual scientific and research activity of the academic and invited staff is supported by the university remuneration budget.</p> <p>Also the limited financial support is offered to young scientists for the period of 12 to 36 months.</p> <p>The university has developed annual academic and scientific - methodological workload norms for the academic staff and the invited specialists on the basis of a personal contract, which considers several described activities.</p> <p>ABIU as an international university is going to create such educational and research conditions for the students that will serve as the basis for their competitiveness in the world.</p> <p>Internationalization of education is vital for the development of the political, economic and social progress and success of Georgia and neighbouring countries. However, this is all connected with the proper financial resources.</p> <p>The panel of experts has to point out that this paragraph was written in the future tense. All the regulations are being prepared, but for the panel of experts it is difficult to comment what will happen in future. This can be judged at the re-accreditation evaluation.</p>
Evidences/indicators <p>SER - page 82-86. Annex 94 - University budget;</p>

<p>Annex 95 - Rule for financing and public, transparent, fair procedures of scientific research by internal grants;</p> <p>Annex 96 - Rule of evaluation and a minimal standard of scientific-research activity.</p> <p>Annex 97 - Strategies for attracting young professional into the scientific-research activity and including them into the researches.</p>
<p>Recommendations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • From our experience one of the possibilities to attract well qualified young academic staff is to offer the temporary residence (apartment) in the vicinity of ABIU. • For the promotion of staff the proper research work is essential. • The research work should be done in accord with the international ethical standards.
<p>Suggestions:</p>
<p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p>
<p>Evaluation</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>
<p>6.3. Evaluation of Research Activities</p>
<p>HEI has a system for evaluating and analyzing the quality of research/creative-arts activities, and the productivity of scientific-research units and academic/scientific staff.</p>
<p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>ABIU has a system for evaluating and analyzing the quality of research activities, and the productivity of scientific-research units and academic/scientific staff with the appropriate regulation in place.</p> <p>Looking closely in the system of evaluation we found that the whole system needs to be checked and really simplified.</p> <p>The typical example which has to be simplified is in SER p.88 as follows: "The annual evaluation process defined by this rule for the research activities of the scientific staff shall be carried out no later than March 15 of the subsequent year. Research and Innovations Service of ABIU along with the Dean of the Faculty coordinates the evaluation process of the scientific staff's activity; the information on the evaluation process is presented then to the Rector and the Quality Assurance Service of the Teaching university. Based on the analysis of the evaluation outcomes, the Quality Assurance Service elaborates recommendations and presents them to the Academic Council. On the basis of the evaluation of the activities of scientific staff and the recommendations approved by the Academic Council, the Dean of the Faculty in collaboration with the Head of Quality Assurance Service and the General Secretary of the ABIU, shall present a memorandum to the Rector concerning the incentives for scientific staff envisaged by the internal regulations." Rectors decision is then final, but the whole procedure is very lengthy and time consuming.</p>
<p>Evidences/indicators</p> <p>Interviews with Dean of Faculty, with the teaching and invited staff. SER page 88.</p> <p>Various documents for the structural units mentioned above.</p>

Recommendations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The system of evaluation the quality of research results of academic/scientific staff at ABIU should be simplified. • The annual report of research results of academic/scientific staff should be publicly present (website) and publish.
Suggestions:
Best Practices (if applicable):
Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

7. Material, Information and Financial Resources

Material, information and financial resources of HEI ensure sustainable, stable, effective and efficient functioning of the institution, and the achievement of goals defined through strategic development plan.

7.1 Material Resources
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The institution possesses or owns material resources (fixed and current assets) that are used for achieving goals stated in the mission statement, adequately responds to the requirements of educational programmes and research activities, and corresponds to the existing number of students and planned enrolment. ○ HEI offers environment necessary for implementing educational activities: sanitary units, natural light possibilities, and central heating system. ○ Health and safety of students and staff is protected within the institution. ○ HEI has adapted environment for people with special needs
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements <p>Material resources assessment took place on 24th January 2019 during site visit in Avrasia Batumi International University. Land plot of university is about 6000 sqm with three floor building on it plus basement floor. Building is former bank office built with reinforce concrete structure. Visually its structural condition seems fine.</p> <p>Seven different size classrooms are allocated on three floors. Approximately 250 students are able to present in classes simultaneously. University leadership plans to have about 400 students on first stage and according to them study process will be proceeded in two shifts. Besides, building has other facilities as library, cafeteria (with no kitchen), computer room and bigger lecture hall as well as small laboratory on basement. There is also small doctor's office on basement next to cafeteria. Administration and teachers' rooms are allocated on all floors. Toilets are allocated on floors as well. Accessible toilets are placed on second floor.</p> <p>Building has two staircases, one internal main stair and other fire staircase from outside of the building. One elevator serves for all floors.</p> <p>Building is adapted for persons with movement disabilities although there are some substantial errors that panel has noted during site visit:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Main entrance door opens inside building (not towards egress); - Building entrance ramps do not satisfy accessibility regulations (size, slope); - Toilets (even accessible toilets on second floor) do not satisfy accessibility regulations

<p>(dimensions);</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Number of rooms have high threshold and it is impossible to enter them with wheelchair. (classrooms, toilets, administration office...);
<p>Evidences/indicators</p> <p>Detailed visit to the premises.</p>
<p>Recommendations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Possible alternate financial resources in order to assure growth and development of the ABIU • Planning detailed description of possible further infrastructure investment. • Main entrance shall have doors from both sides and open towards egress. • Ramps shall satisfy accessibility regulations (6%); • Toilets shall be re-planned to satisfy accessibility regulations; • Thresholds shall be removed from opening to guarantee free movement for wheelchair users; maximum 15mm threshold is allowed according to Georgian regulations.
<p>Suggestions:</p>
<p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p>
<p>Evaluation</p> <p> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements </p>
<p>7.2. Library Resources</p>
<p>Library environment, resources and service support effective implementation of educational and research activities, and HEI constantly works for its improvement.</p>
<p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>The Library at new ABIU is not yet well equipped. Only very few books were displayed at the library shelves. None of the books present were documented and/or archived. As explained ABIU had purchased books, but they were not available for viewing because of the Customs Service which caused that delivery of books was delayed. Panel of experts has randomly selected books from different syllabi and hoped to check some of them through Library search system. As none of the books were in the library system, experts had to search by hand. Considering there were not many books it was possible to go through most of them and only out of selected books only one book was possible to identify which was as a single copy – hard cover only - Ching, F.D.K. Architecture: Form, Space, and Order – Rest are some of the books such as for example few books selected from the BA program of Architecture –</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Uraz, T.U., Tasarlama Düşünme Biçimlendirme, ITÜ Mimarlık Fakültesi Baskı Atölyesi, 1993, İstanbul. 2. Ertürk, Z., Mimari Tasarım Teknikleri, K.Ü. Mühendislik Mimarlık Fakültesi, Trabzon, 1987. 3. Bayazıt, N., (1994) Endüstri Ürünlerinde ve Mimarlıkta Tasarlama Metodlarına Giriş, Literatür Yayınları.

<p>4. Arcan, F.A.; Evci, F.,(1992) Mimari Tasarıma Yaklaşım, İstanbul, İki K Yayınevi Temel Bilgi Teknolojileri Kullanımı I-II ECDL V5 / İKMEP MÜFREDATINA UYGUN</p> <p>5. Chudley, R., Greeno, R., 1998, Building Construction Handbook.</p> <p>6. Watts, A., 2009, Modern Construction Handbook, Springer, New York.</p> <p>which could not be found – due to either not having these books at all – or because these books were simply not registered in the system and were not displayed alphabetically.</p> <p>We asked during the site visit at the library for digital copies of the books. Some were shown to be scanned and as PDF in a folder on main computer of the librarian. This could be a breach of plagiarism and copyright regulations. ABIU needs to have these digital copies somehow protected and/or there is a very strict mechanisms in place which will guarantee copyright protection when these documents will be shared among students.</p> <p>Library had only 2 computers available at the library for students and plus one computer for the Head of the Library. It was possible to search through international databases only via main computer. Other two PC's were not part of the system. Panel of experts has no doubt in the skills of IT department that it is very easy to connect all computers via proxy and make other computers as well as a part of the same search system, But Library definitely needs to purchase more computers and have them all accessible for students.</p> <p>No matter if books are at Customs Service, or at the library of ABIU, panel of experts agrees that this substandard is in noncompliance to the requirements.</p> <p>Head of the Library was unable to converse in English and he could not answer most of the questions. Head of IT department acted as a translator being really proficient in English.</p> <p>The working hours of the library should be clearly defined.</p>
<p>Evidences/indicators</p> <p>Visit to ABIU premises, visit to the Library, talking with the Head of library. Discussion with the personnel on the spot.</p>
<p>Recommendations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To allocate more financial resources and to professionalize library services. Te • To create a small printing unit within a library. • To purchase more computers and have then accessible for students. • To offer availability of international databases to academic staff and students.
<p>Suggestions:</p>
<p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p>
<p>Evaluation</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>
<p>7.3 Information Resources</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o HEI has created infrastructure for information technologies and its administration and accessibility are ensured o Electronic services and electronic management systems are implemented and mechanisms for their constant improvement are in place o HEI ensures business continuity o HEI has a functional web-page in Georgian and English languages.
<p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p>

The ABIU is completely missing its information technology for its internal management system, for the teaching/learning and also for research activities. However, wi-fi is available, the plan is for EDUROAM.

During the site visit, computers were observed only in the offices of the administration, examination centre, and very selected few located in the library (2) which are meant for student learning purposes. It is plausible to say that these computers are not connected to the Library Database, as Computers from the library were not connected to the needed proxy server. It was not possible to log in computers from The Examination centre as during the site visit there was a system problem with getting needed ID/Pasw. (student's or Administration's ID/Pasw). These computers are not enough to support student learning activities, as panel of experts believe that computers from the examination centre **should not be accessible** by students at all time for private browsing and they should be cut off from the all network and sharing systems. While students are still required to have other computers for their private research activities, needless to say two computers from the library are not enough. ABIU should acquire more computers and needs to make sure they will all have access to possible internal information system. Internal information system could be used, for all activities, such as: book reservation in the library; interaction between academic and administrative staff; exchange between students and administrative and/or academic staff; learning feedback; examination/deadline information; surveys; etc). From the interviews with the Head of Examination centre and the Head of Educational Process management it was impossible to determine how and if students will be informed about their upcoming examinations and deadlines. Regarding anonymous surveys as clarified by the Head of IT department when the new system will be introduced - speaking from his past experience from the Avrasya Trabzon University – surveys will be connected to same Learning management system and will allow surveys to be conducted anonymously. It will be possible to determine the department from which students have voted, but not the students personal name and his/her information. Yet currently it was not possible to see this system in operation at ABIU.

The web-site of ABIU is available in English on internet, however at present with limited information at

avrasyabatumi.ge/Mission-and-vision

It is also advertised on Turkish web-site

<https://www.avrasya.edu.tr/avrasya-batumi-university/avrasya-batumi-university/>

However, there are two different Missions there, literally written:

a) The **Mission** of Avrasya Batumi University is to produce, apply and promote knowledge, and to educate all international students with that knowledge for the social, cultural, economic, scientific and technological development of our society and humanity. ABU desires to establish a high standart of education by international standarts.

b) **Mission**

- To ensure integration of Georgian higher education into the united European space;
- To implement social and engineering educational programs of international standards;
- To help the students to develop creative, innovative and critical thinking;
- As the result of academic and research activity to deliver them information and create a new knowledge;
- To popularize the science and involve the students in the social ad engineering scientific researches;
- To prepare highly qualified members, having good scientific view, having innovative technology knowledge and liberal values of the society and ensure their competitiveness on Georgian and international labor market.

Evidences/indicators

Visit to ABIU premises, visit to the Library. Discussion with the appropriate personnel on the

spot.
Evaluation <input type="checkbox"/> Fully complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements
Recommendations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To establish effective working computer system for internal management system and for the teaching/learning activities, for communication with students and also for controlling research activities • To recreate web-site of ABIU
Suggestions:
Best Practices (if applicable):
7.4 Financial Resources
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Allocation of financial resources described in the budget of HEI is economically achievable o Financial standing of HEI ensures performance of activities described in strategic and mid-term action plans o HEI financial resources are focused on effective implementation of core activities of the institution o HEI budget provides funding for scientific research and library functioning and development o HEI has an effective system of accountability, financial management and control
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements <p>The new ABIU will be a private, for-profit Teaching university. We heard in the initial interview with the Founder that all eventual profit will be given to university to improve the quality of ABIU.</p> <p>The main sources of financing for ABIU will be: tuition fees, income from grants and amounts raised from other sources.</p> <p>There are plans to invest furthermore in the ABIU after positive authorization. However, the financial resources allocated for accomplishing the objectives set in the budget of ABIU for 2018 were economically feasible.</p> <p>As said previously ABIU has diversified financial sources which ensure also the adequate and efficient risk management. The revenue of the university incorporates the tuition fee, the state grant, financial resources of the founders, financial resources received in another form of revenue and from other economic activity.</p> <p>After 2 years of running ABIU is plan to build students dormitory (campus) and to increase finance for further investments.</p> <p>There exist structural units like The Financial Service, Audit Service, The Procurement Service Office which are closely related to Rector and General Secretary. The General Secretary coordinates the activities of the financial and economic and service units of the administration and staff in connection with the implementation of the budget of the current economic year and is preparing draft budget for the forthcoming year.</p>

<p>ABIU budget will provide enough funding for scientific research and library functioning.</p> <p>However, ABIU already established links with the potential employers and also plan to provide a list of social services oriented to the local Batumi society.</p>
<p>Evidences/indicators</p> <p>Interviews with the Founder, Rector, General Secretary, with heads of various structural units of ABIU and potential employers. SER page 23.</p>
<p>Recommendations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Students (they are paying tuition fees) should also be involved in the division of the ABIU budget. • ABIU should provide more services to society - payable (language courses, workshops) and non-payable.
<p>Suggestions:</p>
<p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p>
<p>Evaluation</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>