



განათლების ხარისხის განვითარების ეროვნული ცენტრი
NATIONAL CENTER FOR EDUCATIONAL QUALITY ENHANCEMENT

Final Report on New Vision University Authorization

Expert Panel Members

Chair: Dr Sokratis Katsikas, Rector, Open University of Cyprus, Nicosia, Cyprus & Professor, Norwegian University of Science and Technology, Norway

Co-Chair: Dr Ivana Oborná, Professor in Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Palacký University Olomouc, Czech Republic

Members:

Dr Maia Bitskinashvili, Associate Professor in Internal Medicine, Tbilisi State University, Faculty of Medicine, Georgia

Dr Elene Jibladze, Associate Professor, Ilia State University, Georgia

Ms Maia Shishniashvili, Managing partner INNOVA, Georgia

Mr Vakhtang Tebidze, Tbilisi State Medical University, Georgia

Tbilisi

2019

Authorization Report Resume

General information on the educational institution

New Vision University (NVU) is a civic, private, non-profit university. It was founded in 2013, and it is located in Tbilisi, Georgia. NVU comprises four academic faculties (Schools): School of Medicine, School of Law, School of Business & IT, and School of Politics & Diplomacy. In addition, the university also houses the New Vision University Hospital and the Blood Bank, which operate as non-profit legal entities for the benefit of the public. NVU is currently housed in two buildings on Bokhua street (one to be renovated until September 2019), one building on Mikeladze street (Housing the Doctoral students and a library), and the Hospital building on Ljubliana St. NVU currently employs 657 members of staff. Of these, 123 are academic staff, 166 are invited staff, and 368 are administrative staff. Of the latter 92 are employed by the University, whereas 276 work at the hospital. It offers 11 educational programmes (5 undergraduate, 3 postgraduate – Master, 1 one-cycle and 2 doctoral), to 1757 active students; 389 students are suspended. The current “marginal number of students” is 3.000; as part of the authorisation process, NVU requests to increase the “marginal number of students” to 5.000. Its total budget for the year 2019 is 16.000.000 GEL, and the budget allocated to research is 5.000.000 GEL, which includes 30.000 GEL for literature and E-resources.

Brief overview of the authorization site visit

The site visit started on the morning of 02.07.2019 with the panel visiting NVU's main site and continued with full day meetings for interviews of the panel with NVU leadership, management, and staff on 03.07.2019, and 04.07.2019. Two MD members of the panel also visited several departments in the NVU Hospital and the Skills Laboratory and Training Center. The last interviews were conducted in the morning of 04.07.2019 and were followed by deliberation of the expert panel, during which the experts agreed on their assessment of the extent of compliance of NVU with the authorization standards and their components. The chair of the panel delivered a brief overview of the panel findings to NVU leadership and a wider audience. The expert panel was accompanied in the site visit by Nino Popkhadze of the NCEOE.

Overview of the HEI's compliance with standards

NVU has been found to be compliant with requirements as regards standard 5; substantially compliant with requirements as regards standards 1,2,3,4 and 6; and partially compliant with requirements as regards standard 7.

Summary of Recommendations

- 1.1. In the mission statement, clearly define the characteristics of the HEI based on its type and profile.
- 1.2. Define strategic planning methodology, including role of management and staff in planning process.
- 1.3. Define strategy and action plan implementation monitoring mechanism.
- 1.4. Define specific, measurable, time bound objectives and activities.
- 1.5. Define measurable indicators.
- 1.6. Define financial resources and material resources necessary for each activity implementation.
- 1.7. Assign responsibilities to the specific organizational units.
- 2.1. Make the NVU's organizational structure more formalized.
- 2.2. Clearly define responsibility and accountability lines, and roles and tasks of the organizational units, and observe these in the day-to-day operation of the university.
- 2.3. Review the mandate of the International Office to correspond with its actual function, which is international student recruitment.
- 2.4. The Quality Culture Committee should elaborate particular steps of activities/procedures to ensure the quality of assessment.
- 2.5. Institutionalise comprehensive performance evaluation system for academic, scientific and administrative staff.
- 2.6. The system of training of relevant staff should be elaborated well in advance for those involved in innovative methods of teaching and evaluation (e.g. PBL, OSCE).
- 2.7. Make the link between the student body planning methodology and the actual calculation of the student numbers clear.
- 3.1. Clearly describe the process and the procedures, including timing and stakeholders involved, for planning, designing, approving, developing and annulling of all educational programmes. Meeting agendas must be made available in advance, and the minutes of the meeting and conclusions must be accessible by those involved.
- 3.2. Increase and formalize the involvement of students, academic staff and of employers in programme designing and development, and in formulating learning outcomes.
- 3.3. The Georgian language cannot be an elective subject in the international MD programme and in any other international programme where contact with patients is required.
- 3.4. Any changes in any educational programme taught in English must be implemented taking into account the ability of all related stakeholders (teachers, scientists, professionals, and administrative staff) to speak English fluently.

- 3.5. The up-to-date local labour market research should be done in relation to existing and planned EPs.
- 3.6. The QA must establish a system for checking and proving the achievement of learning outcomes in programmes held in English where contact with local people (patients) is an integral part of the curriculum, particularly in the MD programme.
- 3.7. The QA must supervise the process of the development/design and running of EPs to ensure the alignment of content with the learning outcomes and the quality of the education in all stages of the programmes. A situation described during clinical training (one accompanying teacher who speaks English is available at the particular department during clinical teaching/bedside training) is unacceptable, it is in direct contradiction with WFME BME standards, and it reveals discrepancies between theory (written material) and practice in the current QA.
- 3.8. The student/teacher ratio must be recorded for each teaching technique in all EPs (e.g. small group discussion, PBL, bedside training).
- 3.9. Carefully consider the number of students admitted with regards to facilities and academic staff.
- 3.10. Put emphasis on promoting programmes other than the MD programme.
- 3.11. Do not increase the number of students in MD programme, and be highly selective in admitting transfer students.
- 3.12. In the MD programme mechanisms ensuring compliance of written learning outcomes and real practice must be introduced.
- 3.13. The in-depth analysis of the involvement of transfer students after bridging semesters in MD programme should be performed to verify their academic readiness and to identify their further real needs.
- 3.14. The Quality Culture Committee should elaborate particular steps of activities/procedures to ensure the quality of assessment.
- 4.1. Formulate a clearly articulated strategy for personnel development, including administrative personnel.
- 4.2. Establish an administrative unit for personnel management.
- 4.3. Set a target value for the administrative and support staff retention ratio and formulate policies for actively pursuing its achievement.
- 4.4. Set improved target values for the ratio of affiliated staff to total number of staff and formulate policies to achieve these target values.
- 4.5. Use full time equivalent (FTE) to measure the workload of part-time and invited staff as well as for measuring the teaching workload of affiliated staff.
- 4.6. Measure the student/teacher ratio for each teaching method (e.g. PBL, bedside training) and observe already stated own rules.
- 4.7. For MD programme – similar but in-depth analyses as performed for the fall semester 2018 in general must be performed individually for each year of study for several semesters to identify main gaps and take remedial action.
- 5.1. Improve communication with the students to ensure that all students receive timely the administrative information requested.
- 5.2. Implement the new and planned exchange programmes into practice to increase the number of students participating in the exchange programmes and in the international activities (conferences, courses, workshops etc.).
- 6.1. Develop a research strategy to prioritize the list of areas of research to be supported.
- 6.2. Reconsider the continuing operation of the research centres associated with the School of Law and the School of Politics and Diplomacy in light of their understaffing.
- 6.3. Include committed resources to activities related to research, commensurate with the research strategy priorities, in the strategic plan and the operational plans.
- 6.4. Expand the mandate of the research office to include administrative support to externally funded research projects, consultation regarding legal issues, evaluation of research results exploitation potential, drafting proposal budget.
- 6.5. Develop a plan for increasing the effectiveness of the research office.
- 6.6. Increase the staff of the research office.
- 6.7. Formulate a strategy and supporting policies for attracting and supporting new staff in research activities.
- 6.8. Re-assess the established relations with research partners and make strategic decisions on which to retain and strengthen.
- 6.9. Develop a plan for implementing joint programmes and joint supervision of PhD theses with international partner institutions (cotutelle).
- 6.10. Regularly publish report on research activities.
- 7.1. Arrange space for the professor offices.
- 7.2. Ensure adequate usage of electronic databases.
- 7.3. Improve library resource planning process.
- 7.4. Develop IT policy.
- 7.5. Evaluate IT risks.
- 7.6. Develop above described software.
- 7.7. Improve the budgeting process; the budgeting process shall be transparent and participatory.
- 7.8. Link budget expense lines and activities in action plan.

- 7.9. Describe and set in motion budget monitoring procedures.
- 7.10. Develop financial policy.
- 7.11. Develop financial analysis and reporting system.

Summary of Suggestions

- 4.1. In view of the anticipated continuing growth of the institution, consider formulating procedures for ensuring the integration of new employees into the NVU environment.
- 4.2. Consider additional performance-based awards, including for administrative and support staff.

Summary of the Best Practices

- 6.1. The issuance of a public call for research proposals to be funded internally.

Summary Table

| | Standard | Compl ies with Requi reme nts | Substa ntially compli es with requir ement s | Partial ly Compli es with Requir ement s | Does not Comply with Require ments |
|-----|--|--|---|---|--|
| 1. | Mission and strategic development of HEI | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 1.1 | Mission of HEI | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 1.2 | Strategic development | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 2. | Organizational structure and management of HEI | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 2.1 | Organizational structure and management | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 2.2 | Internal quality assurance mechanisms | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 2.3 | Observing principles of ethics and integrity | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 3. | Educational Programmes | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 3.1 | Design and development of educational programmes | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 3.2 | Structure and content of educational programmes | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 3.3 | Assessment of learning outcomes | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 4 | Staff of the HEI | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 4.1 | Staff management | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 4.2 | Academic/Scientific and invited Staff workload | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 5 | Students and their support services | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 5.1 | The Rule for obtaining and changing student status, the recognition of education, and student rights | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 5.2 | Student support services | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 6 | Research, development and/or other creative work | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 6.1 | Research activities | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 6.2 | Research support and internationalization | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 6.3 | Evaluation of research activities | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 7 | Material, information and financial resources | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 7.1 | Material resources | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 7.2 | Library resources | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 7.3 | Information resources | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| 7.4 | Financial resources | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> | <input type="checkbox"/> |

Signature of expert panel members

1. Sokratis Katsikas (Chair)
2. Ivana Oborná (Co-chair)
3. Maia Bitskinashvili (Member)
4. Elene Jibladze (Member)
5. Maia Shishniashvili (Member)
6. Vakhtang Tebidze (Member)

Handwritten signatures of the expert panel members, including names like Sokratis Katsikas, Ivana Oborná, Maia Bitskinashvili, Elene Jibladze, Maia Shishniashvili, and Vakhtang Tebidze.

Compliance of the Authorization Applicant HEI with the Authorization Standard Components

1. Mission and strategic development of HEI

Mission statement of a HEI defines its role and place within higher education area and broader society. Strategic development plan of HEI corresponds with the mission of an institution, is based on the goals of the institution and describe means for achieving these goals.

| |
|--|
| <p>1.1 Mission of HEI</p> |
| <p>Mission Statement of the HEI corresponds to Georgia's and European higher education goals, defines its role and place within higher education area and society, both locally and internationally.</p> |
| <p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>The University has a mission statement: "Expand the human vision through the promotion of education, research and innovation. The University inspires individuals to advance and share knowledge, skills and values to contribute to the well-being of society. NVU is committed to social responsibility and promotes equal access to education for students from around the world." The vision statement of the University is "NVU aspires to create an open, innovative and collaborative environment, to ensure student engagement and to serve the society on a national and international scale. Upholding equal access and equity, it adheres to diverse student-centred education and lifelong learning opportunities. By collaborating with stakeholders in civic society, state and industry, NVU strives to spread knowledge and innovation in local and global communities. Committed to the establishment of an eco-friendly environment, NVU supports environmental education to enable people to better understand and act collaboratively for its protection. NVU is committed to the creation and dissemination of knowledge and the preparation of professionals to support economic growth and sustainability." Two statements define NVU role locally and internationally and take into consideration the role of higher education. The mission statement and the vision do not clearly define the characteristics of the HEI based on its type and profile.</p> <p>During the interviews with staff and management, the experts have learned that the HEI has a vision to become one of the best universities locally and internationally. At this stage, it is unknown what will be profile of the university in terms of programmes and student body in the long-term, because its organization is in a stage of development and planning, but it is planned to have more programmes, more international students and academic staff.</p> <p>One of the distinctive characteristics of the HEI is its focus on its civic mission to identify needs of society and develop ways to contribute by providing innovative services, trainings, etc.</p> |
| <p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SER of HEI • Official webpage of the HEI • Mission statement • Vision statement • Interviews with management and staff |
| <p>Recommendations:</p> <p>1. In the mission statement, clearly define the characteristics of the HEI based on its type and profile.</p> |
| <p>Suggestions:</p> <p>None</p> |
| <p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p> <p>None</p> |
| <p>Evaluation</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Complies with requirements</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Does not comply with requirements</p> |
| <p>1.2 Strategic Development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o HEI has a strategic development (7-year) and an action plans (3-year) in place. o HEI contributes to the development of the society, shares with the society the knowledge gathered in the institution, and facilitates lifelong learning o HEI evaluates implementation of strategic and action plans, and duly acts on evaluation results. |

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The HEI has provided its Strategic development plan for 2017-2024, Short- (2017-2020) and Long- (2017-2024) Term Action Plans, and Action plan implementation report for the year 2018.

The HEI has not provided a strategic planning methodology, but this is explained very briefly in the Self Evaluation Report. According to the SER, employees have taken part in a survey to define the mission statement, the vision and the priorities. There is no description in any of the provided documents about the role of the employees in the development of the strategic plan and the action plan, namely specific goals and objectives, activities, measurement, indicators, etc.

10 strategic priorities were identified, and include NVU Quality Culture and International Accreditation, Lifelong learning opportunities, Research Excellence, Diverse Faculty & Student Body, student service improvement, infrastructural development, etc. Priorities are general statements without any specific target.

The action plan provided by the HEI is a consolidated document reflecting the action plan for 2017-2024. The activities are not specific, for instance a planned action is "increase number of accredited international programs" or "Raise Awareness on Quality Culture at a University". Such a definition does not give a clear understanding of what is expected from responsible units. Deadlines in action plan are not specific, for instance many of actions have deadlines "ongoing" or "till year 2024", or "2017-2020".

The action plan identifies responsible units but in most cases, there are several units. HEI representatives have explained that it was planned so to develop teams that will cooperate and achieve results effectively. In practice, the experts have observed that the responsible units do not know about activities assigned to them. It appeared that the responsible unit could not remember an activity that was assigned to it and was accomplished in 2018 (according to the monitoring report 2018).

Also, during the interviews certain plans and activities were described, that are not specifically described in the existing action plan, for instance the development of a student portal, the development of a comprehensive electronic system, the establishment of the Quality Enhancement Centre, the development of new programmes (for instance, Dentistry), etc.

Financial resources are not tied to the action plan; in the action plan it is outlined as budget of the HEI, but specific numbers are not indicated. On the other hand, the budget of the HEI does not show figures by activities. Representatives of the HEI have shown a more detailed budget, but still no linkages between planned activities and budget amounts were observed.

Most of the HEI representatives could not explain the budgeting process; it seems that the HEI chancellor and the head of the academic council are the only responsible persons for budget planning, and others just provide requested information.

The HEI has not provided written description of monitoring mechanisms. Monitoring of the action plan was conducted, and experts have been provided with the monitoring report 2018. Certain adjustments and recommendations were developed, in specific the monitoring team recommends schools to develop specific action plans for the year 2019, and to link the 2019 budget to the planned activities.

During the interview, HEI representatives explained that they plan to implement KPI management system in one year. The strategy and the action plan will be adjusted, and the current strategy plan will be adjusted by September.

Evidences/indicators

- Strategic development plan for 2017-2024,
- Short- (2017-2020) and Long- (2017-2024) Term Action Plans,
- Action plan implementation report for year 2018
- SER
- Interviews with management and staff

Recommendations:

1. Define strategic planning methodology, including role of management and staff in planning process.
2. Define strategy and action plan implementation monitoring mechanism.
3. Define specific, measurable, time bound objectives and activities.
4. Define measurable indicators.
5. Define financial resources and material resources necessary for each activity implementation.
6. Assign responsibilities to the specific organizational units.

Suggestions:

None

Best Practices (if applicable):

None

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

2. Organizational Structure and Management of HEI

Organizational structure and management of the HEI is based on best practices of the educational sector, meaning effective use of management and quality assurance mechanisms in the management process. This approach ensures implementation of strategic plan, integration of quality assurance function into management process, and promotes principles of integrity and ethics

2.1 Organizational Structure and Management

- o Organizational structure of HEI ensures implementation of goals and activities described in its strategic plan
- o Procedures for election/appointment of the management bodies of HEI are transparent, equitable, and in line with legislation
- o HEI's Leadership/Management body ensures effective management of the activities of the institution
- o Considering the mission and goals of HEI, leadership of the HEI supports international cooperation of the institution and the process of internationalization.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The NVU has a flat organizational structure, encouraging participatory decision making. The university is governed by two representative bodies – academic council and representative council – with two main figures, the head of the academic council and the chancellor sharing responsibility over the everyday functioning of the university. Flexibility and informal management style (i.e. minimal bureaucracy) is something the NVU staff (both academic and administrative) have highlighted repeatedly as the university's advantage and an effective way of 'getting things done'. Overall, the working environment is positive in the organization and the NVU representatives seem to be enjoying their time spent at the university. But it is worth highlighting that all of this is due to the fact that the leadership visibly rests in one person's hands – the head of the academic council – who carries forward the culture of 'doing things together'. The interviews have made it clear that the lines of accountability have been blurred in the organization and major part of the responsibility over the effective functioning of the university is comfortably delegated upwards, to the head of the academic council. Put it differently, the 'doing things together' atmosphere is carried forward due to the decision making that is concentrated with a single person/position – head of academic council. While this seems sustainable in a current state of affairs, as the university is still small with a small administrative unit, it will not be sustainable in a long run. Hence, the authorization team urges the NVU leadership to reconsider their management technique in light of upcoming plans to grow substantially.

With the ambitious plans of expanding the campus, adding new programmes and the plans to increase student numbers, the authorization team finds it important for the NVU's organizational structure to become more formalized, responsibility and accountability lines, roles and tasks of the organizational units clearly defined and practiced in day-to-day operation of the university. Few examples to showcase the areas of improvement are provided below:

- Several units have just been created, such as units of Project Management and Research Development. Heads of units in these particular cases have been appointed even later, for instance, the head of the research development unit was appointed a month ago. The same is the case with the heads of schools, for instance a member of staff already at NVU was appointed as new head of the Medical School only a month ago. The interviews showed evidence that newly appointed staff, as enthusiastic they are, lack understanding of the strategic role of their unit within the NVU and thus are not clear about their contribution to the strategic priorities of the university. For instance, while the university representatives mentioned that they have a handing over procedure to ensure policy consistency and continuity of main processes from one unit to the other, it was hard to observe that the handing over procedure is well-practiced, at least in the case of the medical school, which is the largest school at the NVU.

Transparency of electing/appointing representatives of the management bodies is not an issue. The documents governing these processes are in order and in line with the local legislative requirements.

It seems that the main pillar of internationalization in the NVU is attraction of an international student body (which the university considers to be its strong point). The office of international relations is mainly dealing with the recruitment of international students and succeeding in doing so – the NVU has managed to maintain the steady number of about 1500 international students regardless the

| |
|--|
| <p>encountered hurdles of visa restrictions instituted by the government over the course of past several years. This is to say that the NVU management has managed to diversify their student portfolio in a short period of time. University sites are conducive to the international students, the language of programme delivery is English, the supporting documents, information to help international students navigate in the Georgian education system is readily available.</p> <p>While other aspects of internationalization, such as international cooperation, joint projects and/or degrees, student and staff mobility are part of the university's internationalization plans and the office's portfolio, the authorization team learned that the unit is hardly involved in these matters and international cooperation and staff or student mobility are residing within the schools. While it is perfectly fine that the internationalization work is not concentrated under one unit and each school has its own profile and ways to internationalize, it is advisable that the mandate of the International Office is reviewed and revised to correspond with its real function, which is international student recruitment.</p> <p>Exchange/mobility of students, as part of internationalization policy is less evident. NVU also employs international faculty (11 out of 123), which could be considered as a step forward to internationalize learning delivery. However, as there are no specific targets with regard to internationalization in the strategic plan of the NVU, it is hard to assess whether the unit/units responsible for it have proved to be effective in doing so.</p> |
| <p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NVU Charter • Strategic Plan • Regulation on Carrying out Educational and Research Activities • University Structure • Management Efficiency Monitoring Mechanisms and Assessment System • Internationalization Policy • SER • Interviews results |
| <p>Recommendations:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Make the NVU's organizational structure more formalized. 2. Clearly define responsibility and accountability lines, and roles and tasks of the organizational units, and observe these in the day-to-day operation of the university. 3. Review the mandate of the International Office to correspond with its actual function, which is international student recruitment. |
| <p>Suggestions: None</p> |
| <p>Best Practices (if applicable): None</p> |
| <p>Evaluation</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p> |
| <p>2.2 Internal Quality Assurance Mechanisms</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Institution effectively implements internal quality assurance mechanisms. Leadership of the institution constantly works to strengthen quality assurance function and promotes establishment of quality culture in the institution. o HEI has a mechanism for planning student body, which will give each student an opportunity to get a high quality education. |
| <p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>NVU-wide regulations provide grounds to have quality representatives involved in the everyday work of the university and primarily provide the function of the monitors in the organization. At the central level, quality matters are handled by the Centre of Quality Culture, which is then deconcentrated at the school levels. Each school has its individual approach to ensuring quality. Nevertheless, university-wide procedures are adopted by every school. These are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The 'fact-checking' after the students' admission to identify the needs for the bridging courses, which are provided by the university. • Mid-level assessment takes place at the subject/course level, during course delivery. Results are accumulated and used to provide tailored assistance to the students, if needed, or communicated to the academic staff to make further adjustments. • A final assessment is carried out to assess whether the introduced interventions were effective. |

Overall, main input from the QA representatives is provided to further develop or create programmes. Performance evaluation of academic, scientific and/or administrative staff is weakly institutionalised. For instance, academic and invited staff's performance evaluation is incorporated in the student satisfaction surveys. In the same manner, assessment of provision of administrative services indirectly assesses administrative staff performance. However, comprehensive performance evaluation of the academic, scientific and administrative staff is not yet developed. As the experts learned from the interviews, up until now, as the university has been established only few years back, the quality assurance has largely been externally driven, that is - programme accreditation or authorization procedures have been a main drive of the changes. It is yet to see how this will transform into an internal quality culture, which is what the NVU leadership is keen to pursue. In this process, care should be taken so that the culture to be developed encompasses all activities in the university, not only teaching and learning (e.g. research, outreach, etc.)

In the SER it is stated that the Quality Culture Committee ensures many activities, including arrangement of trainings. Assuming that this means the training of relevant staff, in the MD programme such kind of training is missing. This was found during interviews when questions about different kinds of teaching were asked (e.g. PBL). Later, during the site visit in the NVU hospital, an OSCE exam was seen. The design and the structure of this particular OSCE exam was very poor, and not fulfilling standard OSCE requirements.

The NVU has developed a methodology for planning its student body. The document is rather thorough, providing key factors and benchmarks that are taken into account when planning the student body. Separately, the NVU has provided with the Student Body Planning grid 2019-2022, where the number of students per programme per academic year is calculated. However, the link between the two documents is not clear. For instance, it is unclear whether the university representatives accounted for the benchmarks defined in the methodology (for instance, 1/20 Ratio between the academic staff necessary for the implementation of an educational programme and student body) while planning the student body. Authorization team considers it necessary that the link between the two documents is clearer.

Evidences/indicators

- SER
- Interviews with relevant NVU representatives
- On-Site observations
- NVU's internal documents, such as NVU structure, statute, few surveys, student body planning methodology

Recommendations:

1. The Quality Culture Committee should elaborate particular steps of activities/procedures to ensure the quality of assessment.
2. Institutionalise comprehensive performance evaluation system for academic, scientific and administrative staff.
3. The system of training of relevant staff should be elaborated well in advance for those involved in innovative methods of teaching and evaluation (e.g. PBL, OSCE).
4. Make the link between the student body planning methodology and the actual calculation of the student numbers clear.

Suggestions:

None

Best Practices (if applicable):

None

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

2.3. Observing Principles of Ethics and Integrity

- o HEI has developed regulations and mechanisms that follow principles of ethics and integrity. Such regulations are publicly accessible.
- o Institution has implemented mechanisms for detecting plagiarism and its prevention.
- o HEI follows the principles of academic freedom.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

Code of Ethics and the Regulation on Carrying out Educational and Research Activities are two main documents that govern the principles of ethics and academic integrity in the NVU. Areas of academic

| |
|---|
| <p>dishonesty, including plagiarism, are clearly defined and communicated to the students at different occasions, beginning with the orientation days, followed by pre-examination phases as the academic year progresses. If the cases of academic dishonesty are detected, then the special committee discusses the issue. The authorization team has not learned about such cases during the site-visit.</p> <p>Currently, the NVU does not have an anti-plagiarism software, but is part of the initiative led by the National Scientific Library to create an anti-plagiarism platform (language sensitive).</p> |
| <p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SER • Interviews with relevant NVU representatives • Code of Ethics • Regulation on Carrying out Educational and Research Activities |
| <p>Recommendations:</p> <p>None</p> |
| <p>Suggestions:</p> <p>None</p> |
| <p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p> <p>None</p> |
| <p>Evaluation</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/>Complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Does not comply with requirements</p> |

3. Educational Programmes

HEI has procedures for planning, designing, approving, developing and annulling educational programmes. Programme learning outcomes are clearly defined and are in line with the National Qualifications Framework. A programme ensures achievement of its objectives and intended learning outcomes

| |
|--|
| <p>3.1 Design and Development of Educational Programmes</p> |
| <p>HEI has a policy for planning, designing, implementing and developing educational programmes.</p> |
| <p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>The methodology is based on the principle: "Plan–Do–Check–Act" and comprises all the components of standards required. According to the SER, all stakeholders (staff, students and alumni) are involved in different stages of the design and development of educational programmes (EPs). However, during the interviews, goal-directed questions about this involvement were asked to different stakeholders (e.g. students, invited and academic staff). They were not able to describe their involvement in the design/development of different educational programmes. Even more, when the member of NVU administration, the Dean of the School of Medicine was asked, she also was not able to describe a process of design, development and of implementation of changes (when it was discussed, with whom, etc.) in the MD curriculum, when e.g. within the Surgery III course a week block of Ophthalmology was implemented. This implementation is very positive; on the other hand the whole process of those changes in the MD programme is blurred and inability of members of administration to describe the process is worrying. Moreover, there is a missing link between a labour market research, a student body planning /student intake and a design/development of the particular EPs.</p> <p>It is stated that for the development of EPs are relevant stakeholders guided by the University Educational Programme Framework and by the University Syllabus Framework. Description of development and approval of all EPs are in compliance with the Georgian legislation and University Charter. However, when talking to relevant stakeholders (Dean of the School of Medicine, heads of the programmes, affiliated staff) about this issue, blurred descriptions of the methodology and process were provided.</p> <p>One of the principles is to meet the labour market needs. But an up-to-date NVU labour market research is missing.</p> |

In line with current legislation, the institution has developed regulations and procedures for approving, amending, and annulment of educational programmes. However, during the last meeting with leadership (July 4), questions about future plans concerning Medical Rehabilitation and Nursing Care; Business and Information Technology and Business Administration were asked. The main concern was related to the very low number of active students. Two completely different ways of future plans/changes were introduced.

According to the SER 83% of students are international.

The largest programme (almost 86% of students) is the one-cycle Medical Doctor Programme (1508 out of 1757 students of NVU) taught in English. This is why the MD programme was in a spotlight.

A key ability is a communication with patients including examinations. In the spiral curriculum the elements of clinical skills are found from the first semester.

The first semester subject Introduction to Medicine (MD1101) states as generic learning outcomes:

Capacity for applying knowledge in practice

- Listen to patients, ask for and respect their views about their health.

Oral and written communication

- Communicate effectively and empathetically with chronic patients.

In view of the lack of knowledge of the Georgian language, the majority of international students cannot achieve those learning outcomes. As the programme is taught entirely in English, certain doubts might arise between the education that is well described in theory (curriculum, syllabi, SER) and actual education in practice. Some problems could only be assumed by the expert team as the authorization visit was conducted out of the usual operation of the medical school.

Recently, the Georgian language became an extracurricular activity within the Georgian Language Club.

During the site visit, discussions concerning international students' interest in the Georgian language occurred. Only a few of them are interested (the estimate is less than 10 percent). Besides, during the visit of the NVU hospital, it was found that the majority of the present staff (doctors, nurses, other health professionals) do not speak English and that understanding of spoken English is very poor. It was explained that **one accompanying teacher** who speaks English is available at the particular department during clinical teaching/bedside training. The patient's' documentation is entirely in Georgian; thus there is almost no chance for MD students to gain insight. Clinical teaching/training seems to be in these circumstances almost impossible without at least certain knowledge of the Georgian language. Students cannot reach matching their gained competences with practical application as stated in SER at all.

Evidences/indicators

- SER
- Syllabuses of educational programmes
- University Charter
- Student Body Planning
- Interviews
- <http://newvision.ge/ge/content/kartuli-enis-klubi>
- WFME BME

Recommendations:

1. Clearly describe the process and the procedures, including timing and stakeholders involved, for planning, designing, approving, developing and annulling of all educational programmes. Meeting agendas must be made available in advance, and the minutes of the meeting and conclusions must be accessible by those involved.
2. Increase and formalize the involvement of students, academic staff and of employers in programme designing and development, and in formulating learning outcomes
3. The Georgian language cannot be an elective subject in the international MD programme and in any other international programme where contact with patients is required.
4. Any changes in any educational programme taught in English must be implemented taking into account the ability of all related stakeholders (teachers, scientists, professionals, and administrative staff) to speak English fluently.
5. The up-to-date local labour market research should be done in relation to existing and planned EPs.
6. The QA must establish a system for checking and proving the achievement of the learning outcomes in programmes held in English where a contact with local people (patients) is an integral part of the curriculum, particularly in the MD programme.
7. The QA must supervise the process of the development/design and running of EPs to ensure the alignment of content with the learning outcomes and the quality of the education in all stages of the programmes. A situation described during clinical training (one accompanying teacher who speaks English is available at the particular department during clinical teaching/bedside training) is

| |
|--|
| unacceptable, it is in direct contradiction with WFME BME standards, and it reveals discrepancies between theory (written material) and practice in the current QA mechanisms. |
| Suggestions: None |
| Best Practices (if applicable): None |
| Evaluation <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements |
| 3.2 Structure and Content of Educational Programmes |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Programme learning outcomes are clearly stated and are in line with higher education level and qualification to be granted o With the help of individualized education programmes, HEI takes into consideration various requirements, needs and academic readiness of students, and ensures their unhindered involvement into the educational process. |
| Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements |
| <p>EPs are integrated and multidisciplinary focusing on general skills, leadership and common values with very large number of elective subjects – a student creates his/her own profile – for Bachelor and Master programmes.</p> <p>The institution ensures access to information about EPs. A catalogue of EPs serves the purpose of informing interested parties on educational activities of the institution. The catalogue is updated according to the changes in the respective programme. It is accessible to all interested individuals and is published on the web-page of the institution. Individualized education programmes offer students appropriate formats and conditions of teaching-learning and assessment to students with different requirements.</p> <p>In the Bachelor's Program in Law offered since 2014, 76 % of subjects (183 credits) are mandatory and from the remaining elective subjects a student can choose 30 credits out of 57 from different bachelor programmes. The estimated number of students in the Bachelor's Program in Law is 36 per year. The programme was re-accredited in 2018 by NCEQE. In the Master 's Program in Law offered since 2014, only 35% of the subjects (42 credits out of 120) are mandatory. The estimated number of students in the Master 's Program in Law is 50 per year. The programme was re-accredited by NCEQE in 2019. There is a discrepancy between the maximum class size of the compulsory subject e.g. European Union Law (30-40 students) which is recommended for the first semester and the estimated number of enrolled students (up to 50). It is not a current problem, as only 75 students attend the course and 38, out of 75 are suspended. It could be a problem in the future if number of students will increase. The Doctoral Programme in Law is offered since 2013 for a maximum of 20 students. 92% of the subjects (165 credits) are mandatory, and only one is elective (15 credits). The programme was accredited in 2018 by NCEQE. An excellent quality of education in Law in all levels was proven during the site visit at NVU.</p> <p>The Medical Doctor curriculum is a spiral one comprised of four integrated loops referring to knowledge, skills, values, clearly stated objectives and outcomes. The proposed curriculum describes incorporation of modern elements of teaching. The programme was accredited in 2018 by NCEQE. 10 per cent of the subjects (36 credits) are designated as elective. The estimated number of students is 200 per year. Currently, according to the SER 1508 students are enrolled. With regards to the number of students (1508) and the currently ending 10th semester of the MD programme, it seems that there are about 300 hundred students in each year; this is 50 % higher than the estimated number according to SER. During interviews it was found that about 12% of the student body are transferred students from other MD programmes, mainly from abroad (last year more than 50 students were admitted as transfer students to different years of study). It was not possible to obtain exact number of students in each year/semester, because transfer students are admitted twice a year and student admission also takes place twice a year; this makes the process of teaching even more demanding, mainly for academic staff but also for the staff of the Service Development Office.</p> <p>Transfer students and structure of MD programme: it was of particular interest to find out how are these students integrated into a very elaborate spiral curriculum education. There is a bridging semester when students have to attend missing subjects and then they are fully integrated. The question about how</p> |

they can manage clinical training without even elementary knowledge of Georgian and with regards to the above mentioned knowledge of English in the NVU hospital remained unanswered.

Transfer students are also a good example of individualized education programmes. Taking into consideration that in MD programme about 12% are transferred students from other MD programmes mainly from abroad NVU employed several mechanisms to ensure individualized approach to students.

The majority of subjects of the syllabi comprises very elaborate techniques of teaching, including PBL, simulation based learning, etc. These require **small group teaching**.

During the interviews it was found that the staff do not understand what kind of teaching should be provided. When they were asked to describe PBL sessions, it was said that there are about 30 students in 1 group for PBL; this is unacceptable. It seems that staff involved in teaching were not trained properly in the PBL technique but probably in any other proposed techniques of teaching. That is a failure of a current controlling mechanism.

As mentioned in section 3.1, the authorization visit was conducted in a time period when all teaching had finished. At the expert's request, the expert team was provided with the detailed schedule of allocated groups of students. As an example, the analysis of Internal Medicine II (gastroenterology and hepatology) taught in the fall semester 2018 was performed. The maximum class size stated in the syllabus is 15. But in 6 out of 8 groups the number of students was higher (from 17 to 20). Two lecturers were stated for lecturing, the first one for 5 groups (75 hours in total), the other one for 3 groups (45 hours in total). Their workload was not assessed, as their names are not stated in the requested list of academic/affiliated staff workload for the fall semester 2018.

In the learning outcomes it is stated: ...Students are obliged to take history and examine patients with gastroenterological problems, provide provisional diagnosis and differential diagnosis, conduct medical records, elaborate further investigation and management plan. In the subject specific learning outcomes it is stated: ...Demonstrate analysis, synthesis, and integration of pertinent patient data. Incorporate laboratory data into the assessment of a patient with a GI and HB disorder. Correlate radiographic, CT and Echo findings with specific GI and HB. As all patients' documents/reports/results are in Georgian only, it would require a lot of staff involved in clinical teaching just for a particular document translation. With regards to the fact that only one accompanying teacher who speaks English is available at the particular department during clinical teaching/bedside training it would be particularly difficult to achieve the required learning outcomes without sufficient knowledge of the Georgian language.

The **Doctoral Programme in Medicine** is offered since 2015 for a maximum of 12 students. 92% of the subjects (165 credits) are mandatory, and only one is elective (15 credits).

The **Bachelor program in Medical Rehabilitation and Nursing Care** was accredited in 2016 by NCEQE.

Profile composition elements are grouped in General Competence (GC), Common Components for Nursing and Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation (NU/PMR), and in respective available concentration either in Nursing (NU) or in Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation (PMR).

The number of active students on this programme is only 5. It seems that in Georgia demand on this programme is too low. The Head of the programme does not have a clear policy how to increase amount of students; she supposes that some students are going to transfer from MD programme. But the NVU has finalized a new building to house a rehabilitation centre, where some of the alumni could work.

From NU/PMR components all core courses shall be taken to acquire 72 credits and additional elective 18 credits in Research Project either in NU or PMR. For the formation of major - 84 credits either in NU or in PMR core courses shall be acquired shaping the major qualification respectively, i.e. the Bachelor qualification will be granted either in Nursing or in Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation.

The **Master program in Medical Rehabilitation and Healthcare Management** was accredited in 2016 by NCEQE.

The programme gives an opportunity to develop subject specific competencies according to the chosen qualification or Healthcare Management. A student composes his/her own profile through a selection of components from Program Core (ECTS 30), Business Administration Core (ECTS 16), General Skills & Electives (ECTS 26), and Specialization Components (ECTS 18 and 30 for Master's Thesis). The remaining ECTS are allocated for free selection from different modules. The number of active students on this programme is only 10.

Both above mentioned Bachelor and Master programmes in Rehabilitation are a good example of missing proper research of labour market needs.

| |
|---|
| <p>The Bachelor program in Business and Information Technology is not accredited and was offered in 2013 by NCEQE.</p> <p>The programme offers education in Business Management and /or Information Technology.</p> <p>The students can choose from a versatile number of subjects, therefore they do not limit themselves to one specific concentration; this gives them an opportunity to choose a degree.</p> <p>The number of active students on this programme is 13, students with suspended status are 47, alumni are 11.</p> <p>The Bachelor program in Business Administration was accredited in 2016 by NCEQE. Profile composition elements are grouped in General Competence (GC), Business Administration (BA) and minor qualification components. Thus, instead or along with electives in GC and BA, there is a possibility to acquire 60 credits for minor in International Law (IL), Informatics (IT), Politics (PO) or International Relations (IR) upon student's choice. The number of active students on this programme is 13.</p> <p>The Master program in Business Administration was accredited in 2013 by NCEQE. The number of active students on this programme is 6, students at suspended status are 15, alumni are 10.</p> <p>The Bachelor program in Politics and International Relations was accredited in 2013 by NCEQE. Profile composition elements are grouped in General Competence (GC), Politics (PO), International Relations (IR) and minor qualification components. Thus, instead or along with electives in GC, PO and IR, there is a possibility to acquire 60 credits for minor in International Law (IL) or Business Administration (BA) upon student's choice. The number of active students on this programme is 27, students at suspended status are 30, alumni are 25.</p> <p>NVU has policy to generate individualized education programmes based on special needs. Taking account of different requirements, needs and academic achievements of students follows from the University's mission, in particular: a) "Compensating" and "linking" components aim at balancing the different levels of performance - both for the first semester, and higher semester students who encounter problems during the learning process and require tutor's assistance either individually or in the format of working group sessions. b) The University Counselling and Integration Support Centre is the manifestation of accounting for special needs of the students. The psychological service of this centre offers such services and training to students, that aim at achieving their emotional well-being and efficient management of factors, that may interfere with their academic progress. c) In the case of confirmation of specific needs through a medical certificate, the relevant assistance methods are employed - e.g. based on reference in doctor's certificate some students are given additional examination time; d) The approach - "Adapted environment without stigmatization" is manifested in the simplification of movement on the territory of the campus - e.g. substitution of stairs with ramps, arrangement of adapted elevators, arrangement of common for all sanitary units.</p> |
| <p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Sector Benchmarks of Higher Education ● SER ● Syllabi ● Website ● Interview ● HEI Standards |
| <p>Recommendations:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The student/teacher ratio must be recorded for each teaching technique in all EPs (e.g. small group discussion, PBL, bedside training). 2. Carefully consider the number of students admitted with regards to facilities and academic staff. 3. Put emphasis on promoting programmes other than the MD programme. 4. Do not increase the number of students in MD programme, and be highly selective in admitting transfer students. 5. In the MD programme mechanisms ensuring compliance of written learning outcomes and real practice must be introduced. 6. The in-depth analysis of the involvement of transfer students after bridging semesters in MD programme should be performed to verify their academic readiness and to identify their further real needs. |
| <p>Suggestions: None</p> |
| <p>Best Practices (if applicable): None</p> |

| |
|---|
| <p>Evaluation</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Complies with requirements</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/>Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Does not comply with requirements</p> |
| <p>3.3 Assessment of Learning Outcomes</p> |
| <p>HEI has law-compliant, transparent and fair system of learning outcomes assessment, which promotes the improvement of students' academic performance.</p> |
| <p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>The credit system is in place. One ECTS is related to 30 hours. The student workload hours comprise different kind of teaching/learning methods and independent learning.</p> <p>In general, NVU use a multi-component evaluation system of knowledge with interim evaluations and a final examination. NVU has a 100 point (100%) evaluation system with clear rules. According to the SER, examinations are organized and conducted by the Exam Centre including assistance to students in accessing their exam results and getting students feedback. The appeal policy is also clearly stated. Assessment is taken as one of the teaching methods.</p> <p>In some programmes (e.g. physical rehabilitation and nursing programme, MD programme) the assessment system does not clearly describe components and methods of how practical and communication skills are assessed.</p> <p>During the site visit, an "OSCE exam" was seen in the Exam Centre in the NVU hospital. The design and structure of this particular OSCE exam was very poor, and it does not fulfil the standard OSCE requirements. There were only 3 stations in place, without any standardized/ simulated patients. What was seen was only an oral examination, without any valid and reliable assessment of clinical skills and other competencies.</p> <p>On the other hand, the Clinical skills centre is very well structured and equipped and all documents provided ensure the quality of assessment of gained skills.</p> |
| <p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Site visit of the NVU hospital ● Site visit of NVU ● Interviews ● SER ● HEI Standards ● Syllabi |
| <p>Recommendations:</p> <p>1. The Quality Culture Committee should elaborate particular steps of activities/procedures to ensure the quality of assessment.</p> |
| <p>Suggestions:</p> <p>None</p> |
| <p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p> <p>None</p> |
| <p>Evaluation</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Complies with requirements</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/>Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Does not comply with requirements</p> |

4. Staff of the HEI

HEI ensures that the staff employed in the institution (academic, scientific, invited, administrative, support) are highly qualified, so that they are able to effectively manage educational, scientific and administrative processes and achieve the goals defined by the strategic plan of the institution. On its hand, the institution constantly provides its staff with professional development opportunities and improved work conditions.

| |
|---|
| <p>4.1. Staff Management</p> <p>o HEI has staff management policy and procedures that ensure the implementation of educational process and other activities defined in its strategic plan.</p> |
|---|

| |
|---|
| o HEI ensures the employment of qualified academic/scientific/invited/administrative/ support staff. |
| <p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>NVU's strategic plan gives special focus on the "recruitment of diverse academic staff with multiple practical and international experiences". One of the strategic objectives is to maintain the quality and diversity of faculty in strategically important areas by ensuring transparent, clear, and objective recruitment criteria and procedures. These are laid out in the "New Vision University Regulation on Carrying out Educational and Research Activities" and in the "2018 Quality Culture Committee Statement on Employment Policy"; these are indeed transparent and objective. The affiliation terms and conditions are laid out in the document entitled "Affiliation Policy". The principles of involvement of staff in educational, research and decision-making processes are also included in the "New Vision University Regulation on Carrying out Educational and Research Activities". During the interviews, it became apparent that staff participate in an informal consultation and decision-making process, and they tend to delegate final decisions to the management. Professional development of the staff is encouraged through the personal development plan scheme; however, a clearly articulated strategy for personnel development, particularly administrative personnel, is lacking. Such a strategy would also define how staff may be remunerated and encouraged based on their performance, in addition to the already established "excellence award", which is awarded to faculty members based on their performance as evaluated by the received feedback from students and staff. One of the principles governing the operation of NVU is collegiality; accordingly, due also to the current size of the university, new staff are smoothly integrated into the environment, even though formal procedures to this effect have not been communicated. NVU maintains all necessary statistical data regarding its employed staff, and effectively utilizes these data when managing staff. For example, the staff hiring process is informed by such data. However, in the flat and centralized structure of NVU's administration, no specific administrative unit dedicated to personnel (both academic and administrative) management exists; such a unit, with the appropriate mandate should be established.</p> <p>Genders are equally represented among NVU staff, which promotes compliance with the gender equality principle. Age is not a discriminating factor when it comes to staff selection and employment. Almost 90% of the staff are in the age range 31-55, with almost 25% being in the age range 36-40.</p> <p>NVU has clearly defined qualification requirements for academic, scientific, and administrative staff, that consider job descriptions and distribution of functions in accordance with NVU regulations and the legislation.</p> <p>The retention rate of the academic staff is 85%; an increase to 90% is targeted until the year 2024. The retention rate for administration and support staff is 78%, but no target benchmark has been set. These figures are reasonable and the set targets can be achieved in the specified time window. However, a target value for the retention rate of the administrative and support staff higher than the current should be set and actively pursued. The staff that the panel met with, identified themselves with NVU and were happy with their employment there.</p> |
| <p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● NVU strategic plan ● New Vision University Regulation on Carrying out Educational and Research Activities ● 2018 Quality Culture Committee Statement on Employment Policy ● Affiliation policy ● Personal development plan scheme ● Self evaluation report ● Interview results |
| <p>Recommendations:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Formulate a clearly articulated strategy for personnel development, including administrative personnel. 2. Establish an administrative unit for personnel management. 3. Set a target value for the administrative and support staff retention ratio and formulate policies for actively pursuing its achievement. |
| <p>Suggestions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. In view of the anticipated continuing growth of the institution, consider formulating procedures for ensuring the integration of new employees into the NVU environment. 2. Consider additional performance-based awards, including for administrative and support staff. |
| <p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p> <p>None</p> |
| <p>Evaluation</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Complies with requirements</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/>Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Does not comply with requirements</p> |

4.2. Academic/Scientific and Invited Staff Workload

Number and workload of academic/scientific and invited staff is adequate to HEI's educational programmes and scientific-research activities, and also other functions assigned to them

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

NVU currently employs 657 members of staff. Of these, 123 are academic staff, 166 are invited staff, and 368 are administrative staff. Of the latter 92 are employed by the university, whereas 276 work at the hospital.

The ratio of academic staff number to the number of students is 1:7, and the target benchmark is the same; the ratio of the academic staff number to the total number of the administrative and support staff is 1:0.7, and the target benchmark is the same. These figures are reasonable. The ratio of the affiliated staff number to the total number of academic and invited staff is 1:3 and the ratio of the affiliated staff number to the number of students is 1:23. The target values for both ratios remain the same. Effort should be made, through policies to be formulated, to improve these ratios.

NVU has in place a "Workload Framework Scheme" that all academic staff need to comply with. The scheme includes hours for teaching activities (lecturing, preparation for lectures, grading etc.); guidance of students (postgraduate and doctoral); development of new study courses; research activities; publishing activities; outreach activities; management activities; administrative activities. The scheme adds up to 1760 working hours per year or 880 working hours per semester.

The number and workload of academic and scientific staff ensure the smooth implementation of the educational programmes and the carrying out of other activities (research, administrative functions). An exception to this is the MD programme. For this programme, on the request the data about all teaching staff (affiliated and invited) were analysed for the fall semester 2018.

Affiliated staff: 43 academics, out of it 19 without teaching in this particular fall semester, the 24 academics who were involved in teaching taught altogether 2835 hours, one academic on average 118 hours per semester, which is 8 hours a week.

Invited staff: 68 academics were involved in teaching and taught altogether 5797 hours, one academic on average 85.25 hours per semester, which is 6 hours a week.

Based on the provided Tables on Affiliated MD staff Workload in English, and Invited Staff Workload in English, the calculated student (1508)/teacher (92) ratio is 16/1; but in both groups of staff, teaching covers only 20 % or less of their workload (8 or 6 hours a week). If recalculation based on real teaching workload is performed, then the student (1508)/teacher (92) ratio is 63/1. This is not in agreement with syllabi and it is currently solved either by an increased number of students in the majority of classes or by an increased staff workload. As further analysis of the workload revealed, the Dean of the School of Medicine, who is stated in the Administrative staff workload table as Shorena Tchumburidze with a workload of 40 hours weekly is also stated in the Affiliated MD staff workload table as Shorena Chumburidze with workload of 860 hours. This workload is divided into 59 % for research, 21% for teaching and 20 % for administration. Two fulltime jobs for one particular person even more emphasize the necessity of the complex analysis of the evaluation of the workload, ideally using the full time equivalent (FTE) concept.

To ensure the sustainability of educational programmes, the "Methodology of planning New Vision University Student Body" includes benchmarks on the necessary human resources (number of academic, scientific and invited staff).

NVU has in place an "Affiliation policy" that defines the principles governing the commitment of the affiliated staff to their performance, as well as those of the Affiliation Agreement; the latter sets out the terms and conditions of affiliation.

Evidences/indicators

- Statistical data
- Workload Framework Scheme
- Additional material - Affiliated MD staff Workload table in English, Invited Staff Workload in English for the fall semester 2018 and Administrative staff Workload table in English
- Methodology of planning New Vision University Student Body
- Affiliation policy
- Self evaluation report
- Interview results

Recommendations:

1. Set improved target values for the ratio of affiliated staff to total number of staff and formulate policies to achieve these target values.
2. Use full time equivalent (FTE) to measure the workload of part-time and invited staff as well as for measuring the teaching workload of affiliated staff.

| |
|--|
| <p>3. Measure the student/teacher ratio for each teaching method (e.g. PBL, bedside training) and observe already stated own rules.</p> <p>4. For MD programme – similar but in-depth analyses as performed for the fall semester 2018 in general must be performed individually for each year of study for both semesters to identify main gaps and take remedial action.</p> |
| <p>Suggestions: None.</p> |
| <p>Best Practices (if applicable): None.</p> |
| <p>Evaluation</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p> |

5. Students and Their Support Services

HEI ensures the development of student-centred environment, offers appropriate services, including career support mechanisms; it also ensures maximum awareness of students, implements diverse activities and promotes student involvement in these activities. HEI utilizes student survey results to improve student support services

| |
|---|
| <p>5.1. The Rule for Obtaining and Changing Student Status, the Recognition of Education, and Student Rights</p> |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o For each of the educational levels, HEI has developed regulations for assignment, suspension and termination of student status, mobility, qualification granting, issuing educational documents as well as recognition of education received during the learning period. o HEI ensures the protection of student rights and lawful interests. |
| <p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>Rules of obtaining and changing student's status are regulated by "New Vision University Regulation on Carrying out Educational and Research Activities" which includes enrolment preconditions, execution of a contract, renewal of administrative registration, academic registration, transfer to another educational programme, suspension/restitution and termination of student's status. These regulations are in line with current legislation. Information regarding these issues is accessible on the website of NVU. Meetings with the administration and the students showed that NVU has effectively implemented these procedures – the staff uses their informational technologies and the other material resources to ensure timely provision of all the required documents.</p> <p>Enrolment and admission procedures are mostly completed by the International Relations office. The potential students can receive additional support in this process from the Students Self-Government as well. The remaining above-mentioned procedures are mostly carried out by the coordinators of the schools.</p> <p>The university provided the student survey results carried out in 2018-2019 academic year which illustrates that almost 60% of the students stated that the staff members responsible for registration of the students were highly involved in this process.</p> <p>The contract between the student and NVU mentions tuition fees and obligations of the parties. The contract refers to the "NVU Regulation on Carrying out Educational and Research Activities" (as an appendix to the contract) which is considered as an integral part of the arrangements of the Parties. As it was underlined during the visit, the students can directly contact the administration (mainly the coordinators) with regards to any issues related to their rights and lawful interests. For instance, the complaints of the students are received mostly verbally or via email. Actions taken in response to them vary with the specifics of each case. Besides that, the students are able to appeal the exam results by filling a corresponding statement form.</p> <p>Regulatory documents related to obtaining and changing students' status, including "New Vision University Regulation on Carrying out Educational and Research Activities", are public and can be found on the website of the university.</p> <p>It was confirmed by the students that they were informed about the rights and obligations included in the contract prior to signing it.</p> <p>The website of NVU is fully accessible in English and most of the regulatory documents, news, announcements and other important information can be found by the international students.</p> |
| <p>Evidences/indicators</p> |

| |
|--|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Regulation on Carrying out Educational and Research Activities • Regulations for Administration of Examination Process at New Vision University • Sample of an agreement with a student • Student survey results |
| Recommendations: None |
| Suggestions: None |
| Best Practices (if applicable): None |
| Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements |
| 5.2 Student Support Services |
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o HEI has student consulting services in order to plan educational process and improve academic performance o HEI has career support service, which provides students with appropriate counselling and support regarding employment and career development o HEI ensures students awareness and involvement in various university-level, local and international projects and events, and supports student initiatives o HEI has mechanisms, including financial mechanisms to support low SES students |
| <p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>NVU has the Service Development Office which operates according to the single-window principle – this office is in charge of providing all the administrative information that the students may request. More than 80% of the active students of NVU are the international students and most of the staff members speak English fluently, ensuring proper communication with them. However, students survey results provided by the university show that 60% of the students agreed on the statement that all administrative information was provided on time (20% agreed and another 20 stayed neutral). It is mentioned in the survey analysis that the positive feedback can be the outcome of increasing staff members. The question on why there was such a high number of students who did not agree with this statement was asked during the visit – it was also confirmed by the students that there were cases when they experienced the delays in obtaining the information requested by them.</p> <p>There are several student clubs at NVU: photographer’s club, scientific society, culture society and sports society. During the site visit, the student members of these societies listed several examples of their activities that were supported by NVU (e.g. sport tournaments, dance competitions, scientific researches etc.).</p> <p>NVU has Counselling and Integration Support Centre which provides medical and psychological consultation services for students, helps them in achieving emotional well-being and in managing personal demands that may interfere with academic progress. Interviews with the representative of the centre and with the students showed that this service is successfully implemented in the university.</p> <p>NVU has an International Relations Office which mostly carries out the admission process of the international students. Besides that, it was mentioned during the site visit that the office also informs the students regularly about the international activities (conferences, courses, workshops etc.) but the number of students who get interested in these events and decide to participate is still low. NVU is in the process of implementing the exchange programmes in agreement with several universities and expects that the number of students participating in the exchange programmes will increase. The students themselves also advised during the interviews that they would like to be more informed and to have more opportunities to participate in this kind of activities.</p> <p>NVU has the Office of Career Development which supports students and alumni in career planning and decision making, networking, and employment opportunity referrals. Several students and alumni who were employed or had internships with the support of NVU were interviewed during the site visit.</p> <p>The SER states that NVU has the financial support mechanism for the low socio-economic status students. Several students confirmed during the site visit that they had benefited from the flexible payment system. NVU also provided the statistical data on the number of students who applied for financial support – the university supported all such students and offered an individual payment schedule to them (in 2018-2019, 68 students in the fall semester, 74 in the spring semester).</p> |

| |
|--|
| <p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Self-evaluation report. • Interviews with the students and alumni, Service Development Office, Office of Career Development, student clubs, International Relations Office and the Chancellor. • Number of students applied for financial support. |
| <p>Recommendations:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Improve communication with the students to ensure that all students receive timely the administrative information requested. 2. Implement the new and planned exchange programmes to increase the number of students participating in the exchange programmes and in the international activities (conferences, courses, workshops etc.). |
| <p>Suggestions: None</p> |
| <p>Best Practices (if applicable): None</p> |
| <p>Evaluation</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Complies with requirements</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Does not comply with requirements</p> |

6. Research, development and/or other creative work

Higher Education Institution, considering its type and specifics of field(s), works on the strengthening of its research function, ensures proper conditions to support research activities and improve the quality of research activities

| |
|---|
| <p>6.1 Research Activities</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o HEI, based on its type and specifics of its fields, carries out research/creative activities. o Ensuring the effectiveness of doctoral research supervision o HEI has public, transparent and fair procedures for the assessment and defense of dissertations which are relevant to the specifics of the field |
| <p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>The mission statement of NVU includes the promotion of research, and the Learning and Teaching statement makes explicit reference to learning through research. Three centres oriented towards research exist at NVU, two associated with the School of Law and one associated with the School of Politics and Diplomacy. However, the number of staff engaged with these centres is extremely low (two of the centres only have one member of staff). Accordingly, NVU needs to assess the benefits deriving from having such centres operating against its capacity to staff them so as to enable their effective operation. A number of research labs at the School of Medicine exist; these are well equipped and sufficiently staffed, and have well-articulated development plans. Examples of research projects carried out at NVU that contribute to scientific, social, and cultural development have been provided. These include cooperation with the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs of the autonomous Republic of Abkhazia towards identifying the capacity for improving the health, psychological and social status of internally displaced persons. They also include a number of projects targeting the development of a system of charitable donation of blood and of its components that will substitute the current commercial-based system in Georgia. The strategic plan of the university lists excellence in research among the university's strategic priorities. The same plan includes a number of actions intended to achieve the strategic goal for research excellence, but no resources have been committed to these actions, and no research strategy that would identify a prioritized list of areas of research to be supported exists.</p> <p>NVU offers two doctoral level programmes. The current student enrolment is 123 students, but 53 of these are suspended. The number of PhD supervisors is 19, thus resulting in a ratio of 6.47 students per supervisor, or 3.68 active students per supervisor. The current number of PhD students and their distribution per school, along with the number and workload of staff supervising PhDs allow for effective supervision, a prerequisite for high quality research work and dissertations. Four doctorates have been awarded. Doctoral studies are well organized at NVU, particularly at the School of Law. The PhD supervisors that the panel met with had a clear view of their duties and responsibilities in this capacity, and the interviewed PhD students were very satisfied with the relationship with their supervisors and with the effectiveness of the supervision. NVU's Dissertation Board Regulation sets out all the rules and procedures governing doctoral studies at NVU, including the enrolment phase, the study phase and the thesis defence, evaluation and publication phase. These rules and procedures are publicly available, fair, and transparent.</p> |
| <p>Evidences/indicators</p> |

| |
|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● NVU mission statement ● NVU strategic plan ● Current research activities ● Workload scheme of staff ● Supervisor-PhD student ratio ● Student survey results ● NVU Dissertation Board Regulation ● Self evaluation report ● Interviews |
| <p>Recommendations:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Develop a research strategy to prioritize the list of areas of research to be supported. 2. Reconsider the continuing operation of the research centres associated with the School of Law and the School of Politics and Diplomacy in light of their understaffing. 3. Include committed resources to activities related to research, commensurate with the research strategy priorities, in the strategic plan and the operational plans. |
| <p>Suggestions: None</p> |
| <p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The issuance of a public call for research proposals to be funded internally. |
| <p>Evaluation</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Complies with requirements</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/>Does not comply with requirements</p> |
| <p>6.2. Research Support and Internationalization</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ HEI has an effective system in place for supporting research, development and creative activities ○ Attracting new staff and their involvement in research/arts-creative activities. ○ University works on internationalization of research, development and creative activities. |
| <p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>NVU has clear intentions of supporting research and development activities. Almost 20% (5 MGEL out of a total 23.5 MGEL) of NVU's budget is allocated to funding research. This is primarily done through issuing an internal public call for research proposals, to which NVU staff may submit proposals that are funded following successful evaluation. A research office that disseminates information about research funding opportunities, provides assistance in identifying potential research partners and promotes student involvement in research projects has been established. However, the office is understaffed if it is to carry out all its intended functions as described in the University structure. Moreover, a number of additional research support functions (e.g. administrative support to externally funded research projects, consultation regarding legal issues, evaluation of research results exploitation potential, drafting proposal budget, etc.) is not currently included in the mandate of the research office. Concrete plans for increasing the effectiveness of the support provided by the research office have not been communicated. Students are introduced as early as their first semester of study (School of Medicine and Law School) to research methodologies. Students are encouraged to participate in research activities and relevant initiatives of students (e.g. participation in scientific conferences) are supported, including financially, by the university. However, a strategy and supporting policies for attracting and supporting new staff in research activities have not been formulated. NVU has established some international research collaborations (Zeiss, Kyoto College of Medical Science, Cairo October 6 University) within the framework of which research projects are being carried out. However successful these may be, they appear not to have happened as the result of a clearly articulated research strategy, which is missing. This raises some concern over the sustainability of the established relations, particularly with international research partners. Accordingly, NVU should carefully re-assess its established relations and make strategic decisions on which to retain and strengthen and which to let fade out. NVU has also received funding for research activity in the Law School by the UN and the USAID. Joint implementation of programmes and/or joint supervision of PhD theses with international partners has not been reported, nor have concrete plans for doing so been communicated.</p> |
| <p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● NVU budget ● Public call for research funding ● Description of joint international research projects ● Student survey results ● NVU structure ● Self evaluation report ● Interview results |
| <p>Recommendations:</p> |

| |
|--|
| <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Expand the mandate of the research office to include administrative support to externally funded research projects, consultation regarding legal issues, evaluation of research results exploitation potential, drafting proposal budget. 2. Develop a plan for increasing the effectiveness of the research office. 3. Increase the staff of the research office. 4. Formulate a strategy and supporting policies for attracting and supporting new staff in research activities. 5. Re-assess the established relations with research partners and make strategic decisions on which to retain and strengthen. 6. Develop a plan for implementing joint programmes and joint supervision of PhD theses with international partner institutions (cotutelle). |
| Suggestions: None |
| Best Practices (if applicable): None |
| Evaluation <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements |
| 6.3. Evaluation of Research Activities |
| HEI has a system for evaluating and analysing the quality of research/creative-arts activities, and the productivity of scientific-research units and academic/scientific staff. |
| Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements NVU evaluates the research efficiency of its staff based on research output (publications, monographs etc.) and the individual workload scheme and the personal development plan of each member of staff, on a semester basis. The evaluation includes self-evaluation, evaluation by the research office and the academic board. The performance of the research office itself is evaluated by the academic board, by considering a number of indicators. The academic board makes decisions on the implementation of measures to enhance research activities. This decision is then taken to the Quality Culture Committee that develops the necessary mechanisms, in cooperation with the research office. However, a mechanism for evaluating the effectiveness of the research units is not in place, and reports on implemented research activities are not regularly published. |
| Evidences/indicators <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Implemented research activities ● Public call for research funding ● Staff personal development plan ● Self evaluation report ● Interview results |
| Recommendations: 1. Regularly publish report on research activities |
| Suggestions: None |
| Best Practices (if applicable): None |
| Evaluation <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements |

7. Material, Information and Financial Resources

Material, information and financial resources of HEI ensure sustainable, stable, effective and efficient functioning of the institution, and the achievement of goals defined through strategic development plan.

| |
|---|
| 7.1 Material Resources <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The institution possesses or owns material resources (fixed and current assets) that are used for achieving goals stated in the mission statement, adequately responds to the requirements of educational programmes and research activities, and corresponds to the existing number of students and planned enrolment. |
|---|

| |
|--|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ HEI offers environment necessary for implementing educational activities: sanitary units, natural light possibilities, and central heating system. ○ Health and safety of students and staff is protected within the institution. ○ HEI has adapted environment for people with special needs |
| <p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>The HEI owns land and buildings, public registry extracts were provided. The experts have observed 2 buildings on Bokhua street, one of them will be renovated until September 2019, one building on Mikeladze street, and Hospital building on Ljubliana street. There are plans to construct student dormitories on the Bokhua street land plot. All buildings are well renovated and satisfy the requirements of the standard regarding adapted environment for people with special needs, sanitary units, natural light possibilities, heating, ventilation and air conditioning.</p> <p>The HEI building has foyer, recreation spaces, classrooms, space for group work, sanitary/hygienic units, library, laboratories, etc., but it does not have professor offices (where professors provide counselling to students). The buildings are spacious and these spaces can be easily arranged.</p> <p>The HEI has provided a list of fixed assets.</p> <p>HEI buildings, equipment and policies satisfy standard 7.1 requirements regarding safety.</p> |
| <p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Public registry extracts ● List of fixed assets ● Building safety act ● Architectural plan ● Site visit |
| <p>Recommendations:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Arrange space for the professor offices |
| <p>Suggestions:</p> <p>None</p> |
| <p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p> <p>None</p> |
| <p>Evaluation</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p> |
| <p>7.2. Library Resources</p> |
| <p>Library environment, resources and service support effective implementation of educational and research activities, and HEI constantly works for its improvement.</p> |
| <p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>There are two libraries, on Bokhua street and on Mikeladze street.</p> <p>The library on Mikeladze street has space for students and library staff. There are 15 tables for students, but no computers, the students can use computers on the fourth floor, while the library is on the first floor. There is a printer and a copy machine.</p> <p>The library on Bokhua street is bigger, there are several spaces for students to meet and work. Approximately 15 computers were observed by the experts. There is a printer and a copy machine.</p> <p>The HEI has provided the list of books; there are 17203 books indicated. The great majority are in English. There are regulations for using the library, and the electronic catalogue is accessible from the webpage.</p> <p>According to the 2019 budget, 30.000 GEL is allocated to the purchase of literature and E-resources.</p> <p>The HEI has provided statistics of electronic database usage from January 2018 to September 2018. According to the report, there were 7.776 database sessions, 8.219 total searches and 8.483 total requests during this period.</p> <p>Students know about the existence of electronic databases, but they are not using them often, due to the fact that they are not given assignments that require usage of the above-mentioned databases.</p> |

| |
|--|
| <p>There is a document describing enrichment and updating of library resources, but it seems that the library staff is mainly involved in the purchasing of books as requested by the HEI academic board, academic staff, and does not conduct independent research of the library resources and does not provide recommendations for enrichment of the library.</p> |
| <p>Experts selected books indicated in syllabi on random and found them in the library.</p> |
| <p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • List of the library resources • Document describing enrichment and updating of library resources • Statistics of electronic database usage • Regulations for using library • Webpage • Interviews • Site visit |
| <p>Recommendations:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Ensure adequate usage of electronic databases. 2. Improve library resource planning process. |
| <p>Suggestions:</p> <p>None</p> |
| <p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p> <p>None</p> |
| <p>Evaluation</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Substantially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p> |
| <p>7.3 Information Resources</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ HEI has created infrastructure for information technologies and its administration and accessibility are ensured ○ Electronic services and electronic management systems are implemented and mechanisms for their constant improvement are in place ○ HEI ensures business continuity ○ HEI has a functional web-page in Georgian and English languages. |
| <p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements</p> <p>The HEI has adequate number of computers, Internet is accessible in every part of the buildings. The HEI uses outsource services to develop software and to support its IT infrastructure.</p> <p>There is no IT policy. IT risks have not been assessed.</p> <p>The HEI has not introduced electronic services and electronic management systems, but uses the Google platform instead, and finds it quite comfortable for its needs.</p> <p>It has been said during the interviews that IT developers contracted by the HEI will develop a comprehensive system including all aspects of HEI activity, (student platform, KPI management system, financial accounting, budgeting, etc.) using open source software. The new system will be specifically designed for the HEI. The contracted company plans to finish their work in one year.</p> <p>HEI has functional website, in Georgian and English languages and contains information as required by the standard 7.3.</p> |
| <p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Interviews • Site visit |
| <p>Recommendations:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Develop IT policy. 2. Evaluate IT risks. 3. Develop above described software. |
| <p>Suggestions:</p> <p>None</p> |
| <p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p> <p>None</p> |

Evaluation

- Fully complies with requirements
- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

7.4 Financial Resources

- o Allocation of financial resources described in the budget of HEI is economically achievable
- o Financial standing of HEI ensures performance of activities described in strategic and mid-term action plans
- o HEI financial resources are focused on effective implementation of core activities of the institution
- o HEI budget provides funding for scientific research and library functioning and development
- o HEI has an effective system of accountability, financial management and control

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with the standard component requirements

The HEI has provided the budget for the year 2019, the income for the years 2014-2018, and the audit report for the year 2017. The income of the HEI has been increasing impressively, from 755 thousand GEL in 2014 to 14.868 thousand GEL in 2018. Apart from tuition fees, the HEI has other incomes, donor grants, state financing, etc.

In 2019 the total planned income and expenses are 25.350 thousand GEL. This breaks down into 7.960 thousand GEL for maintenance of material resources, 6.665 thousand GEL for human resource expenses, 5.000 thousand GEL for research, 3.550 thousand GEL for medical services, 1.600 thousand GEL for loan repayments, and 575 thousand GEL for miscellaneous. The budget for research includes 30 thousand GEL for literature and E-resources.

According to the audit report for 2017, the HEI had an income of 13.298 thousand GEL and a profit of 7.926 thousand GEL.

The budget does not show details regarding activities reflected in the action plan, therefore it is impossible to evaluate if the funds are adequate and sufficient to effectively perform the activities described in strategic and action plans.

There is no detailed plan for the development of research activities, therefore it is impossible to evaluate if the HEI has adequate resources to support its research activities; the same holds true for the development of library resources.

As already described above, for the purposes of standard 1, the budgeting process is not transparent; most of the HEI representatives have vague knowledge of the budgeting process and of the budget itself. The financial department is responsible for bookkeeping, spending and purchasing. There is no financial director, who would perform financial analysis, monitoring of the budget expenditure, financial planning.

The HEI does not have a financial policy.

The HEI does not have a financial reporting system.

Evidences/indicators

- Audit report for year 2017
- Budget for year 2019
- Income for year 2014-2018
- Interviews

Recommendations:

1. Improve the budgeting process; the budgeting process shall be transparent and participatory.
2. Link budget expense lines and activities in action plan.
3. Describe and set in motion budget monitoring procedures.
4. Develop financial policy.
5. Develop financial analysis and reporting system.

Suggestions:

None

Best Practices (if applicable):

None

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Substantially complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements