Accreditation Expert Group Draft Report on Higher Education Programme

Higher Education Programme Name

Integrated Veterinary Master's Educational Programme

HEI's Name

LEPL, Samtskhe-Javakheti State University

Date(s) of Evaluation 23 – 24 October, 2019

Report Submission Date 18 November, 2019

HEI's Information Profile

Name of Institution Indicating its	Samtskhe-Javakheti State University		
Organizational Legal Form	The University, Legal Entity of Public Law		
HEI's Identification Code	424066977		
Type of Institution	The University		

Higher Education Programme Information Profile

Name of the Programme	Integrated Veterinary Master's
	Educational Programme
Level of Education	Master's programme
Qualification Granted Indicating Qualification	Master of Veterinary - 0841
Code	
Language of Instruction	Georgian
Number of Credits	308
Programme Status (Authorized/	New
Accredited/New)	

Expert Panel Members

Chair (Name, Surname,	Toomas Tiirats, DVM, MSc,		
University/organization/Country)	Director of Institute of Veterinary Medicine		
7. 8	and Animal Sciences,		
	Estonian University of Life Sciences		
Member (Name, Surname,	Levan Tsitskishvili, DVM, PhD		
University/organization/Country)	N(N)LE, International Association "Veterans		
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	Sans Frontiers – Caucasus";		
	LEPL, Iv. Berityashvili Center of		
	Experimental Biomedicine		
Member (Name, Surname,	Lela Gurgenidze		
University/organization/Country)	Georgian Technical University, Georgia		
	Faculty of Agricultural Sciences and Biosystems Engineering		
Member (Name, Surname,	Engineering		
University/organization/Country)			
Member (Name, Surname,			
University/organization/Country)			

Accreditation Report Executive Summary

General information on the education programme

Veterinary medicine is one of the seven regulated professions in the European Union (EU). These requirements are laid down in a single legislative document, the EU Professional Qualifications Directive 2013/55/EU (amending old Directive 2005/36/EC). After completion of the integrated long-cycle veterinary degree programme a graduate will obtain the status of a veterinarian, i.e., the right to practice veterinary medicine. It is common that each country has at least one state/government-funded veterinary faculty or a higher veterinary education establishment. Currently there is no such institution in Georgia.

An Integrated Veterinary Master's Programme is being developed according to the requirements of the Sectoral Characteristics of Veterinary in Higher Education developed by the National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement (order of the Director of the National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement No. 03.01.2018), as well as considering field specifics, labour market and employer requirements, and experience in implementing similar programmes at European leading higher education institutions (Ghent University in Belgium and the Estonian University of Life Sciences).

The programme consists of 308 credits and is presented in the following volume and structure:

General and Basic Courses- 77 credits (25% of total credits);

General education with free elective courses - 34 credits;

Basic education - 43 credits;

Specialty in Veterinary Medicine - 231 credits (75% of total credits).

The standard duration of the programme is five years (10 semesters).

The new programme focuses on meeting the needs of the sector and the society and reflects modern understanding of veterinary medicine that covers an extensive range of issues as vets are trained not only for veterinary practice (i.e., diagnosing and treating diseases), but also for careers in food safety and security, prevention and control of zoonotic diseases, the pharmaceutical industry, market access, veterinary and biomedical research, government service, etc..

The expert committee found that the University has made a great effort preparing a veterinary study programme the structure and format of which meets international standards. The University has demonstrated that implementation of the new veterinary study programme will ensure that teaching will be consistent with the internal quality standards of the university as well as with national quality requirements and agreements.

Brief overview of the accreditation site-visit

The team consisted of 3 members (Dr. Toomas Tiirats – Chair and international expert; Dr. Levan Tsitskishvili – expert representing Georgian veterinary profession; Dr. Lela Gurgenidze – expert representing students).

The site visit took place on 24 October, 2019 and was held at the Samtskhe -Javakheti State University. During the visit meetings and interviews were conducted with: The university administration (attended by 8 representatives); Self-evaluation team (7 representatives present); Programme academic staff (6 representatives); Programme invited staff (5 representatives present); Students and alumni (7 representatives present); Potential employers (8 organizations).

A meeting was also held with the Programme Leader, Faculty Dean, and the Head of Quality Assurance.

A tour of the University facilities (study area, library, museum, laboratories, clinical facilities) and facilities outside the campus was organised.

The expert team would like to express their gratitude to the enthusiastic personnel for the most interesting and informative discussions that took place at a high professional level.

Summary of education programme's compliance with the standards

1. Educational programme objectives, learning outcomes and their compliance with the programme Overall: Substantially complies with the standard requirements

- 1.1 Programme objectives: Substantially complies
- 1.2 Programme learning outcomes: Substantially complies

2. Teaching methodology and organization, adequate evaluation of programme mastering Overall: Substantially complies with the standard requirements

- 2.1 Programme admission requirements: Complies
- 2.2 Educational programme structure and content: Complies
- 2.3 Course: Substantially complies
- 2.4 The development of practical, scientific/research/creative/performance and transferable skills: Complies
- 2.5 Teaching and learning methods: Substantially complies
- 2.6 Student evaluation: Substantially complies

3. Student achievements and individual work with them

Overall: Complies with the standard requirements

- 3.1 Student support services: Complies
- 3.2 Master's and Doctoral student supervision: Complies

4. Provision of teaching resources

Overall: Complies with the standard requirements

- 4.1 Human resources: Complies
- 4.2 Professional development of academic, scientific and invited staff: Complies
- 4.3 Material resources: Complies
- 4.4 Programme/faculty/school budget and programme financial sustainability: Complies

5. Teaching quality enhancement opportunities

Overall: Complies with the standard requirements

- 5.1 Internal quality: Complies
- 5.2 External quality: Complies
- 5.3 Programme monitoring and periodic review: Complies

Summary of Recommendations

- Summary of Suggestions
- The facilities inspected are sufficient for the provision of theoretical and practical training. The experts were impressed with the IT solutions available for teaching, classrooms equipped with computers, and modern presentation possibilities. The clinical facilities are currently under reconstruction. Renovation of the production animal clinic will be completed in 2020. The nearby municipalities are planning to build a shelter for stray dogs and cats which will give the University an opportunity to increase the number of clinical cases in small animals. It would be wise if the shelter facility project comprised veterinary examination and surgery rooms. The University is aware of the importance of developing a comprehensive

- equipment procurement list to ensure that the clinical facilities will be equipped with relevant up-to-date apparatus and tools used in veterinary practice nowadays.
- Developments in the higher education policy (especially related to higher veterinary education) over the past decades have been unsuitable for educating a motivated new generation of veterinary professionals in Georgia. This generation is actually missing in Georgia. It is obviously difficult to recruit qualified academic staff. All possible measures have already introduced by University (e.g., provision of free transportation and accommodation) to attract teaching staff from Tbilisi. Furthermore, the University has to take care of training young teachers to replace the well-trained but elderly professors nearing retirement. International cooperation is an immediate prerequisite for ensuring the sustainability of the veterinary programme.
- The University's administration has already experience with international projects. The expert committee proposes to launch international cooperation projects (Erasmus Plus, etc.) also in the veterinary field. The experts would recommend co-operation with the University of Kars in Turkey for example, the closest veterinary faculty located just 200 km away. The University of Kars is currently undertaking major reorganisation aimed at meeting accreditation requirements and applying for an approval by the evaluation system for higher veterinary educational establishments in the EU.
- Some overlap between the syllabuses of different disciplines was found. For example, "Animal biology" course includes the normal functions of animals (cattle, sheep, cat, dog, birds) and their organs that should actually be taught within the physiology course. "Animal biology" is a somewhat misleading term used in the EU regulatory act describing veterinary undergraduate education, that is meant to deal with the basics of animal ecology, zoology (and cell biology if not taught within other disciplines). The basic principles of animal ecology, the dynamics of population abundance, its regulation and breeding strategies, intraspecific and interspecific relationships in animal communities, and dispersal patterns of species, ecological methods in animal conservation are often the major focus of this course.
- The use of live animals in teaching preclinical sciences has to be considered carefully. Although the use of live animals in teaching and training is not regulated in Georgia, invasive methods and painful manipulations should be avoided (for example, in a pathophysiology practicum). The University has excellent IT facilities (including lecture rooms equipped with computers), so alternative teaching and learning methods should be developed.
- It is also advised to pay more attention on teaching basic principles of private entrepreneurship (i.e. practical knowledge how to establish a company, management of veterinary practices as an entrepreneur, bookkeeping requirements, etc.). It might be taught in format of small separate course for last year students called "Practice management".
- External stakeholders (e.g., farmers and dairy plant owners) firmly support developing and launching a veterinary programme. They demonstrate willingness to cooperate with the University, especially regarding practical training placements. They realise the urgent need for qualified production animal veterinarians in Georgia as the availability of qualified professionals is a vital element of accelerating their businesses. The University has an opportunity to attract business operators to provide practical training placements for students and same time assisting farmers with problem-solving. The provision of paid services by university to business operators should be considered in the long run. Stakeholders have also expressed their interest in related continuing educational programmes to be developed and launched along with the veterinary programme.
- It is most important that relevant state-of-the-art learning resources support the provision of veterinary education. It was found that all staff members and students have full access on site to an academic library, information technology facilities, and an e-learning platform. However, the University has to proceed with the procurement of necessary clinical apparatus and tools to ensure the best teaching and learning standards at the teaching clinics as well as sufficient capacity for hands-on training of the students enrolled to the programme. First of all, this concerns the fourth- and fifth-year clinical disciplines. A new graduate should be capable of independently performing appropriate entry-level tasks and duties of the veterinary profession and confident enough to practice veterinary medicine at a primary care level on their own. In order to increase its clinical practical competence and introduce the best veterinary practices, the

University shall develop international co-operation and exchange programmes for the academic personnel.

- Summary of best practices (if applicable)
- In case of accredited programme, summary of significant accomplishments and/or progress (if applicable)

Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards

1. Educational programme objectives, learning outcomes and their compliance with the programme

A programme has clearly established objectives and learning outcomes, which are logically connected to each other. Programme objectives are consistent with the mission, objectives and strategic plan of the institution. Programme learning outcomes are assessed on a regular basis in order to improve the programme.

1.1 Programme Objectives

Programme objectives define the set of knowledge, skills and competences the programme aims to develop in graduate students. They also illustrate the contribution to the development of the field and the society.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The programme objectives are drawn from the sector benchmarks for Veterinary Higher Education, which define the knowledge, skills and competences required, that have been developed by an independent expert group. The new programme corresponds to the understanding that veterinary medicine covers an extensive range of issues, and vets are trained not only for veterinary practice, but also for careers in food safety and security, prevention and control of zoonotic diseases, the pharmaceutical industry, market access, veterinary and biomedical research, government service, etc.

During the development of the programme the university has consulted frequently and extensively with students and external stakeholders in the veterinary sector. The programme is a product of teamwork, whereas the objectives were clearly understood by the team members. The Samtskhe-Javakheti State University fulfils the requirements necessary for launching a veterinary programme.

Evidences/indicators

- Programme description;
- Mission of the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine;
- Strategic Development Plans of the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine;
- Interview with programme management and administration team;
- Interviews with students and graduates;
- Interview with affiliated academic staff and invited academic staff;
- Interview with representatives of employees;
- Interview with the Head of the Quality Assurance Department.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

- Some overlap between the syllabuses of different disciplines was found. For example, "Animal biology" course includes the normal functions of animals (cattle, sheep, cat, dog, birds) and their organs that should actually be taught within the physiology course. "Animal biology" is a somewhat misleading term used in the EU regulatory act describing veterinary undergraduate education, that is meant to deal with the basics of animal ecology, zoology and cell biology (if not taught within other disciplines). The basic principles of animal ecology, the dynamics of population abundance, its regulation and breeding strategies, intraspecific and interspecific relationships in animal communities, and dispersal patterns of species, ecological methods in animal conservation are often the major focus of this course.
- The use of live animals in teaching preclinical sciences has to be considered carefully. Although the use of live animals in teaching and training is not regulated in Georgia, invasive methods and painful manipulations should be avoided (for example, in a pathophysiology practicum). The University has excellent IT facilities (including lecture tooms equipped with computerss), so alternative teaching and learning methods should be developed.
- It is also advised to pay more attention on teaching basic principles of private entrepreneurship (i.e. practical knowledge how to establish a company, management of veterinary practices as an entrepreneur, bookkeeping requirements, etc.). It might be taught in format of small separate course for last year students called "Practice management".

Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation
☐ Complies with requirements
√ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

1.2. Programme Learning Outcomes

- ➤ Programme learning outcomes describe knowledge, skills, and/or the sense of responsibility and autonomy, students gain upon completion of the programme;
- Programme learning outcomes assessment cycle consists of defining, collecting and analysing data;
- Programme learning outcomes assessment results are utilized for the improvement of the programme.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The Expert Team noted a certain difference between the perception and expectations of the academic staff, students and employers regarding the content and outcomes of the veterinary study programme. Clear distinguishing between the acquired general and specific competences and the expected results would allow the harmonization of programme aims with LO and expected results. It is advisable to decrease the proportion of general subjects that are taught at gymnasium level.

The experts recommend that the programme is aligned to the needs of the labour market but also prepares students to continue doctoral study programmes. The evaluation is conducted by surveys and direct interviews.

The programme covers different areas of competence and learning outcomes, both cognitive and practical. The courses are focused on both academic and professional needs, and their content is clearly defined. The study programme seems to be well structured, comprises benchmarks for student learning and achievements, and clear guidelines on the methods of assessment and marking.

Evidences/indicators

- Programme description;
- Interview with programme management and administration team;
- Interviews with students and graduates;
- Interview with affiliated academic staff and invited academic staff;
- Interview with representatives of employees.

Recommendations:		

Suggestions for programme development:

It is most important that relevant state-of-the-art learning resources support the provision of veterinary education. It was found that all staff members and students have full access on site to an academic library, information technology facilities, and an e-learning platform. However, the University has to proceed with the procurement of necessary clinical apparatus and tools to ensure the best teaching and learning standards at the teaching clinics as well as sufficient capacity for hands-on training of the students enrolled to the programme. First of all, this concerns the fourth- and fifth-year clinical disciplines. It is advised to engage more visiting veterinary practitioners to teach some practical parts of clinical subjects. A graduate should be capable of independently performing appropriate entry-level tasks and duties of the veterinary profession and confident enough to practice veterinary medicine at a primary care level on their own. In order to increase its clinical practical competence and introduce the best veterinary practices, the University shall develop international co-operation and exchange programmes for the academic personnel.

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation
☐ Complies with requirements
√ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with	Partially complies with	Does not comply with requirements
		requirements	requirements	-
Educational		$\sqrt{}$		
programme				
objectives,				
learning outcomes				
and their				
compliance with				
the programme				

2. Teaching methodology and organization, adequate evaluation of programme mastering

Programme admission preconditions, programme structure, content, teaching and learning methods, and student assessment ensure the achievement of programme objectives and intended learning outcomes.

2.1. Programme Admission Preconditions

Higher education institution has relevant, transparent, fair, public and accessible programme admission preconditions.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The University's admission requirements to the veterinary integrated programme are relevant and publicly accessible. Admission requirements are in compliance with the legislation of Georgia. Admission of international students is also regulated.

The University has established special rules and policies for admission: internal exams in the areas of specialization, and exams in a foreign language.

Evidences/indicators

- General admission requirements are published on the University's web page;
- Programme;
- Relevant legal acts of Georgia (Law of Georgia on Higher Education (https://matsne.gov.ge/en/document/download/32830/55/en/pdf);
- Interview during the site visit;

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

There is definitely a national shortage of high-quality production-animal veterinary services in Georgia. However, the University is advised to carefully consider the impact of class size on the performance of students to ensure that the future graduates receive quality training. The reasonable maximum annual intake to the programme is 40-45 students.

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation
✓ Complies with requirements
☐ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
□ Does not comply with requirements

2.2 Educational Programme Structure and Content

Programme is designed according to HEI's methodology for planning, designing and developing of educational programmes. Programme content takes programme admission preconditions and programme learning outcomes into account. Programme structure is consistent and logical. Programme content and structure ensure the achievement of programme learning outcomes. Qualification to be granted is consistent with programme content and learning outcomes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The programme structure is logical, well designed and defined. The Content section contains all necessary information related to programme goals, qualifications, admission requirements, learning outcomes, students' assessment system, teaching methods for achieving learning outcomes, learning plan, learning process organization, financial issues, quality development issues, material resources needed for programme implementation, human resources, etc. The content is in accordance with applicable laws and bylaws in those parts which are prepared by virtue of legal acts. The courses are divided into modules — compulsory, elective, professional practical training, and thesis. Consequently, an effective mix of theoretical, applied, and research-based learning has been outlined. Such an approach gives students the opportunity to gain knowledge in a specific field along with developing practical and research skills.

Master's thesis regulations (supervision, quality control, defence procedure) were thoroughly discussed during the site visit, and found to be well established.

The expert committee found that the University has made a great efforts to prepare a veterinary study programme the basic structure and format of which are internationally comparable. The University has demonstrated the ability to implement a veterinary study programme that is consistent with the quality standards of the University as well as national quality requirements and regulations.

Evidences/indicators

- Program
- HEI's methodology on planning, designing and developing of programs

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

Some overlap between the syllabuses of different disciplines was found. For example, "Animal biology" course includes the normal functions of animals (cattle, sheep, cat, dog, birds) and their organs that should actually be taught within the physiology course. "Animal biology" is a somewhat

misleading term used in the EU regulatory act describing veterinary undergraduate education, that is meant to deal with the basics of animal ecology, zoology (and cell biology if not taught within other disciplines). The basic principles of animal ecology, the dynamics of population abundance, its regulation and breeding strategies, intraspecific and interspecific relationships in animal communities, and dispersal patterns of species, ecological methods in animal conservation are often the major focus of this course.

The use of live animals in teaching preclinical sciences has to be considered carefully. Although the use of live animals in teaching and training is not regulated in Georgia, invasive methods and painful manipulations should be avoided (for example, in a pathophysiology practicum). The University has excellent IT facilities (including lecture tooms equipped with computerss), so alternative teaching and learning methods should be developed.

It is also advised to pay more attention on teaching basic principles of private entrepreneurship (i.e. practical knowledge how to establish a company, management of veterinary practices as an entrepreneur, bookkeeping requirements, etc.). It might be taught in format of small separate course for last year students called "Practice management".

Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation
☐ Complies with requirements
T. T. T. T.
✓ Substantially complies with requirements
• Substantiany compiles with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements
—

2.3 Course

- > Student learning outcomes of each compulsory course are in line with programme learning outcomes; Moreover, each course content and number of credits correspond to course learning outcomes;
- ➤ Teaching materials listed in syllabi are based on the core achievements in the field and ensure the achievement of intended programme learning outcomes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The courses are designed to achieve the programme outcomes, i.e. course learning outcomes are aligned with programme goals and objectives. Relevant schemes are provided in the programme. Teaching materials listed in the syllabuses are available at the library in print and e-version. The library ensures a pleasant and productive environment that can be considered one of the strengths of the university.

Basic teaching/reading materials listed in the syllabuses are mostly from Georgian authors or translated into Georgian. The University is aware of the problem and is planning to encourage students to learn the English language via enhancing the internationalisation of the programme. By the way, during the interviews, all students and alumni showed a good understanding of English whereas some of them were capable of communicating in English.

Evidences/indicators

- Syllabuses of courses;
- Program;
- Interviews with students and alumni;
- Site-visit interview with.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

The University's administration has already experience with international projects. The expert committee proposes to launch international cooperation projects (Erasmus Plus, etc.) also in the veterinary field. The experts would recommend taking the lead from the University of Kars in Turkey, the closest veterinary faculty located just 200 km away. The University of Kars is currently undertaking major reorganisation aimed at meeting accreditation requirements and applying for an approval by the evaluation system for higher veterinary educational establishments in the EU.

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

✓ Complies with requirements
☐ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements

2.4 The Development of practical, scientific/research/creative/performance and transferable skills

Programme ensures the development of students' practical, scientific/research/creative/performance and transferable skills and/or their involvement in research projects, in accordance with the programme learning outcomes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The study programme and the proposed courses provide students with core theoretical and practical knowledge as well as research skills. Memorandums or agreements of cooperation have been concluded with different organisations regarding practical placements and internships. Importantly, such partnerships will enhance employment opportunities for graduates.

Master's students have the possibility to choose the thesis topic as well as the supervisor.

Master's thesis regulations (supervision, quality control, defence procedure) were thoroughly discussed during the site visit, and found to be well established.

Evidences/indicators

- Program
- Agreements and memorandums

- Self-evaluation report
- Interviews with students, employers

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

A new graduate should be capable of independently performing appropriate entry-level tasks and duties of the veterinary profession and confident enough to practice veterinary medicine at a primary care level on their own. In order to increase its clinical practical competence and introduce the best veterinary practices, the University shall develop international co-operation and exchange programmes for the academic personnel.

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

7 0	1 •	• 1			
☐ Comp	lies	with	rea	nnrem	ento
	1100	AAICII	104	un cm	CIILL

- ✓ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- □ Does not comply with requirements

2.5 Teaching and learning methods

Programme is implemented using student centered teaching and learning (SCL) methods. Teaching and learning methods correspond to the level of education, course content, student learning outcomes and ensure their achievement.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The teaching and learning methods are aligned to the learning outcomes. There is flexibility to address the needs of individual students within the context of the requirements of the Veterinary Sector Benchmarks in Higher Education.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-Evaluation Report and course syllabi
- Interviews with staff and students

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

The use of live animals in teaching preclinical sciences has to be considered carefully. Although the use of live animals in teaching and training is not regulated in Georgia, invasive methods and painful manipulations should be avoided (for example, in a pathophysiology practicum). The University has excellent IT facilities (including lecture rooms equipped with computers), so alternative teaching

and learning methods should be developed. Moreover an improvement of chemistry lab has to be
considered.
Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation
\square Complies with requirements
✓ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
☐ Does not comply with requirements
2.6. Student Evaluation
2.0. Statent Dynamicon
Student evaluation is conducted in accordance with established procedures. It is transparent and
complies with existing legislation.
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements
The University's student evaluation system is based on legislative requirements. Course-based
assessment approach has been adopted. Teachers have regular office hours for students, so they can
discuss relevant issues individually and privately. Students consider University evaluation system
fare and transparent. No student complaints were heard regarding evaluation. Students are aware of
their rights and duties, but not the specific procedures. Students feel that University offers not only
profound theoretical education, but also sufficient practical courses. Students from the region believe
that there are lot of motivated young people interested to study veterinary medicine.
Evidences/indicators
- Programme;
- Syllabuses;
- Interview results;
Recommendations:
Suggestions for programme development:
Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation
✓ Complies with requirements
☐ Substantially complies with requirements
_ Jacominani, compress mini requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements	
\square Does not comply with requirements	

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Teaching		✓		
methodology and				
organization,				
adequate				
evaluation of				
programme				
mastering				

3. Student achievements and individual work with them

HEI creates student-centered environment by providing students with relevant services; programme staff ensures students' familiarity with the named services, organizes various events and fosters students' involvement in local and/or international projects.

3.1. Student support services

Students receive appropriate consultations and support regarding the planning of learning process, improvement of academic achievement, employment and professional development.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

Students receive adequate information and support regarding the planning of the learning process, improvement of academic achievement, employment, and professional development. They are aware of the relevant sources of information and support services available to them. The faculty administration, head of the programme, programme tutor, and programme academic staff are always ready to support students in drawing up their individual study plans and answer any questions related to the learning process.

Evidences/indicators

- Integrated Veterinary Master's Programme, course syllabi;
- Provisions regarding auxiliary administrative units;
- LEPL Samtskhe-Javakheti State University's student information service system;
- Career Growth Center documentation (photo material);
- Minutes of the meetings with potential employers.

Recommend	lations:

Recommendations:
Suggestions for programme development:
Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation
✓ Complies with requirements
\square Substantially complies with requirements
\square Partially complies with requirements
\square Does not comply with requirements

3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student supervision

Master's and Doctoral students have qualified thesis supervisors.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

A total of 21 academic (affiliated) staff, including 10 professors, 11 associate professors, and 15 invited specialists are involved in the implementation process of the Integrated Veterinary Master's Educational Programme.

The students of the Master's programme will have qualified supervisors, as evidenced by appropriate documentation (personal files of the programme academic staff). The University has developed a guide for the preparation of Master's theses as well as relevant thesis defense instructions that outline the rights and responsibilities of supervisors and students. A supervisor may simultaneously supervise a maximum of three Master's students. The document outlines the students' rights regarding receipt of general scientific advice, support in finding bibliographic data, research work preparation, integration into the local and the international scientific community, participation in scientific events and presentation of research results, as well as with advice on the publication of articles in peer-reviewed journals.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-evaluation report;
- Interviews with programme leaders, internal/ external academic staff and students.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

External stakeholders (e.g., farmers and dairy plant owners) firmly support developing and launching a veterinary programme. They demonstrate willingness to cooperate with the University, especially regarding practical training placements. They realise the urgent need for qualified production animal veterinarians in Georgia as the availability of qualified professionals is a vital element of accelerating their businesses. The University has an opportunity to attract business operators to provide practical training placements for students and same time assisting farmers with problem-solving. This may also help students to choose thesis topics that produce results of practical value.

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

uation

✓ Complies with requirements	
☐ Substantially complies with requirements	
☐ Partially complies with requirements	
\square Does not comply with requirements	

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Student achievements and individual work with them	✓			

4. Providing teaching resources

Programme human, material, information and financial resources ensure programme sustainability, its effective and efficient functioning, and achievement of intended objectives.

4.1 Human Resources

- ➤ Programme staff consists of qualified people who have necessary competences in order to help students achieve programme learning outcomes;
- ➤ The number and workload of programme academic/scientific and invited staff ensures the sustainable running of the educational process and also, proper execution of their research/creative/performance activities and other assigned duties. Balance between academic and invited staff ensures programme sustainability;
- ➤ The Head of the Programme possesses necessary knowledge and experience required for programme elaboration. He/she is personally involved in programme implementation;
- Programme students are provided with an adequate number of administrative and support staff of appropriate competence.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The number and workload of the academic and invited staff implementing the programme ensure the implementation of the curriculum, as well as performing relevant research and other functions assigned to them. The balance between the academic and invited staff ensures the sustainability of the programme. The number of academic and invited staff on the academic programme is regulated in accordance with the University's "Rules for Determining the Number of Academic Staff."

Evidences/indicators

- Academic staff workload scheme;
- Personal files of academic/invited staff engaged in the programme: CV, publications, conference papers, competition materials, labor contracts;
- Personal file of the Head of the program;
- Agreement form with administrative and support staff, provisions of services

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

Developments in the higher education policy (especially related to higher veterinary education) over the past decades have been unsuitable for educating a motivated new generation of veterinary professionals and academical offspring in Georgia. This generation is actually missing in Georgia. It is obviously difficult to recruit qualified academic staff. All possible measures shall be taken (e.g., provision of free transportation and accommodation) to attract teaching staff from Tbilisi. Furthermore, the University has to take care of training young teachers to replace the well-trained but elderly professors nearing retirement. International cooperation is an immediate prerequisite for ensuring the sustainability of the veterinary programme.

Best Practices (if applicable):

т .	C 11. 1	•	• ^• .	1. 1	. 1	,	
Ι'n	case of accredited	nrogramma gign	ነተነሪያከተ <u>ያ</u> ረረለተነነ	111ch	mente and	/OT 1	ntathece
111	case or accredited	programmic, sign	шісані ассоні	лион	шсию ана	/ OI	DIUEICS

Evaluation

ion
\square Complies with requirements
✓ Substantially complies with requirements
\square Partially complies with requirements
\square Does not comply with requirements

4.2 Professional development of academic, scientific and invited staff

- ➤ HEI conducts the evaluation of programme academic, scientific and invited staff and analysis evaluation results on a regular basis;
- ➤ HEI fosters professional development of the academic, scientific and invited staff. Moreover, it fosters their scientific and research work.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The programme is complemented with different (extracurricular) scientific and educational activities and events for both students and the academic staff. Conferences will be held at the University as well as in collaboration with other universities, and proceedings will be published.

The University has all necessary infrastructure and resources for both research and teaching/learning, including the library that is equipped with computers and an electronic scientific database (catalogue). Currently, only a few members of the academic staff are involved in international projects. The University collaborates with other HEIs within the Erasmus project. However, we noticed that collaboration with foreign HEIs regarding research projects is week.

The University has adopted rules for the assessment of research. According to these rules, the University supports research-related activities, e.g., preparation and publishing of monographs, textbooks, and scientific articles. The academic staff members are expected to be engaged in research

Evidences/indicators

- Personal files of the academic and invited staff;
- Personal development of academic and invited staff members;
- Statistical data on the personnel;

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

The University has to take care of training young teachers to replace the well-trained but elderly professors nearing retirement. International cooperation is an immediate prerequisite for ensuring the sustainability of the veterinary programme.

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

	• . 1	•
I I Complies	with	requirements
	** 1011	requirements

- ✓ Substantially complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- □ Does not comply with requirements

4.3. Material Resources

Programme is provided by necessary infrastructure and technical equipment required for achieving programme learning outcomes.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The facilities inspected are sufficient to provide adequate theoretical and practical teaching. The experts were impressed with the IT solutions available for teaching, the classrooms equipped with computers, and modern presentation possibilities. The clinical facilities are undergoing reconstruction. The production animal clinic will be ready by 2020. The University is aware of the importance of developing a comprehensive equipment procurement list to ensure that the clinical facilities will be equipped with up-to-date apparatus and tools used in veterinary practice nowadays.

Internet is available across the campus. The scientific library is supplied with a complete electronic catalogue (45 000 units).

Since 2017, based on Agreement № 2017/20 with the Integrated Information Network Consortium of Georgian Libraries, the University can use the NAPR electronic resources.

According to Agreement № 2018/25 of 2018, the University can also use the following electronic resources:

Cambridge **Iournals** Online (https://www.cambridge.org/core); BioOne Complete (http://www.bioone.org/); e-Duke Journals Scholarly Collection (https://www.dukeupress.edu/); Edward Elgar **Publishing Journals** and Development Studies e-books (https://www.elgaronline.com/page/70/journals); IMechE Journals (https://us.sagepub.com/en-us/nam/IMeche) New England Journal of Medicine (http://www.nejm.org/); Open edition Journals (http://www.openedition.org/); **Journals** Collection (https://royalsociety.org/journals/); Premier Society **SAGE** https://us.sagepub.com/en-us/nam/sage-premier. In 2015, a branch of the National Science Library was opened at the University's library -Information Center, based on which the University can use Cambridge Dictionaries Online dictionaries. The National Science Library's book fund (4 million copies) as well as electronic resources (120,000 units) are available upon request. Evidences/indicators The existing lecture halls and labs in the University building, Rustaveli 122 The University's current infrastructure situation; University's cooperation agreements; Samtskhe-Javakheti State University's library; Faculty infrastructure; Recommendations: Suggestions for programme development: The nearby municipalities are planning to build a shelter for stray dogs and cats which will give the University an opportunity to increase the number of clinical cases in small animals. It would be wise if the shelter facility project comprised veterinary examination and surgery rooms. Please not that small animals are increasing trend in veterinary medicine nowadays. Best Practices (if applicable): In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress **Evaluation** ☐ Complies with requirements ✓ Substantially complies with requirements ☐ Partially complies with requirements

4.4. Programme/faculty/school budget and programme financial sustainability

The allocation of financial resources stipulated in programme/faculty/school budget is economically feasible and corresponds to programme needs.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

The programme will be financed with funds from the Unified University Budget.

The budgeted expenses include: costs of remuneration, computer and equipment for teaching/learning purposes, inventory, existing infrastructure maintenance, and utilities. They also include 6% of the total programme development costs.

Evidences/indicators

- Educational programme, programme budget
- Programme budgeting rules

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

The University has to proceed with the procurement of necessary clinical apparatus and tools to ensure the best teaching and learning standards at the teaching clinics as well as sufficient capacity for hands-on training of the students enrolled to the programme. First of all, this concerns the fourth-and fifth-year clinical disciplines. The University may incur substantial additional expenses during the implementation phase.

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

- 1		
F.val	luation	

✓	Comp	lies	with	req	uiren	nents

$\overline{}$	Substantially	1.		•	
1 1	Niingranfialiy	COMPLIES	with r	ealltem	ante

	D . 11	1.	• . 1		
11	Parfialls	complies /	with	reallireme	nts
_	I di cidii j	Compiles	AAICII	requireme	-1160

\Box	T		comp	1	* 1		•	
	LIMES	$n \cap r$	comn	137	with	rea	IIIren	nenro

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Providing teaching resources	✓			

5. Teaching quality enhancement opportunities

In order to enhance teaching quality, programme utilizes internal and external quality assurance services and also periodically conducts programme monitoring and programme review. Relevant data is collected, analysed and utilized for informed decision making and programme development on a regular basis.

5.1 Internal quality

Programme staff collaborates with internal quality assurance service(s) available at the higher education institution when planning the process of programme quality assurance, creating assessment instruments, and analysing assessment results. Programme staff utilizes quality assurance results for programme improvement.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The programme staff collaborates with the University's quality assurance services when setting up the programme quality assurance procedures, creating assessment instruments, and analysing assessment results. The programme staff utilizes the results to improve the programme.

The evaluation of the educational programme is carried out annually. Quality assessment is conducted by the faculty's quality assurance service, while monitoring is carried out by the University's QAS.

All stakeholders are involved in programme quality assessment. The academic and invited staff, faculty staff, students, partner organizations (employers), and graduates are also engaged in the process. The results of the assessments performed by different parties are taken into consideration to further develop the programme.

The results are taken into consideration when making programme-related Assessment results are discussed on the faculty board and submitted to the University Quality Assurance Service for recommendations. The University Quality Assurance Service's recommendations are approved by the Rector of the University. Recommendations and comments made by the Faculty or Quality Assurance Service is provided to the persons involved in the programme, as well as the programme elaboration and renewal group that considers these recommendations to modify the programme.

Evidences/indicators

- Mandate proving participation in international projects;
- Provision of the Samtskhe-Javakheti State University Quality Assurance Service

Recommendations: Suggestions for programme development Best Practices (if applicable): In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress **Evaluation** ✓ Complies with requirements

5.2 External quality

Programme utilizes the results of external quality assurance on a regular basis.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The new Integrated Veterinary Master's Education Programme has been submitted to the National Center for Education Quality Enhancement for accreditation. Foreign higher education institutions offering similar programmes were taken as an examples in the preparatory process, in particular Ghent University, Belgium, the Estonian University of Life Sciences, and the University of Kars, Turkey. These programmes were customized for Georgia's specific requirements.

Evidences/indicators

- Self-evaluation of the programme;
- Letter for external evaluation 1;
- Letter for external evaluation 2.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

Once the implementation of the programme has been completed, the University should continue the development process following the standards set by EAEVE (European Association of Establishments for Veterinary Education) together with FVE (Federation of Veterinarians of Europe) for undegraduate veterinary education.

Best Practices (if applicable):

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

☐ Substantially	y complies	s with rec	quirements

✓ Complies with requirements

☐ Partially complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

5.3. Programme monitoring and periodic review

Programme monitoring and periodic review is conducted with the involvement of academic, scientific, invited, administrative staff, students, graduates, employers and other stakeholders through systematically collecting and analysing information. Assessment results are utilized for programme improvement.

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

Following the launch of the Integrated Veterinary Master's Programme in accordance with the existing quality assurance system of SJSU, the Quality Assurance Service together with the Faculty Quality Assurance Specialist will conduct a survey among the programme students on the academic and administrative personnel (Dean, Quality Assurance Service).

Evidences/indicators
- Self-evaluation of the programme
Recommendations:
Suggestions for programme development:
External stakeholders (e.g., farmers and dairy plant owners) firmly support developing and launching a veterinary programme. They demonstrate willingness to cooperate with the University, especially regarding practical training placements. They realise the urgent need for qualified production animal veterinarians in Georgia as the availability of qualified professionals is a vital element of accelerating their businesses Cooperative relationships between the the University and the external stakeholders should be considered in much broader terms than the regular feedback surveys. Best Practices (if applicable):
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation
✓ Complies with requirements
☐ Substantially complies with requirements
☐ Partially complies with requirements
\square Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with	Substantially	Partially	Does not comply
	requirements	complies with	complies with	with requirements
		requirements	requirements	
Teaching quality	✓			
enhancement				
opportunities				

Enclosed Documentation (If Applicable) HEI's Name:

LEPL, Samtskhe-Javakheti State University

Higher Education Programme Name:

Integrated Veterinary Master's Educational Program

Programme's Compliance with the Standard

Standard	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with	Does not comply with requirements
1. Programme objectives are clearly defined and achievable; they are consistent with the mission of the HEI and take into consideration		√	requirements	requirements
labour market demands				
2. Teaching methodology and organization, adequate evaluation of programme mastering		√		
3. Student achievements and individual work with them	√			
4. Providing teaching resources	√			
5. Teaching quality enhancement opportunities	√			

Exp	ert	Pa	<u>nel</u>	CI	<u> 1air</u>	S

Toomas Tiirats

Name, last name, signature

Expert Panel Members'

Levan Tsitskishvili

Lela Gurgenidze