



**NATIONAL CENTER FOR
EDUCATIONAL QUALITY
ENHANCEMENT**

Accreditation Expert Group Report on Cluster of Higher Education Programmes

Educational Programmes (Bachelor-Master integrated educational program of teacher training, Primary studies of general education, level I and Educational program of teacher training)

St. Tbel Abuseridze Teaching University of Patriarchate of Georgia

Evaluation Dates: September 28-29, 2022

Final Report Submission Date: October 17, 2022

Tbilisi

Contents

I. Information on the Cluster of Education Programmes	4
II. Accreditation Report Executive Summary	7
III. Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards	12
1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme	12
2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering	26
3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with Them	39
4. Providing Teaching Resources	45
5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities	59

Information on the Higher Educational Institution¹

Name of Institution Indicating its Organizational Legal Form	N(N)LE St. Tbel Abuserisdze Teaching University of Patriarchate of Georgia, Non-entrepreneurial (Non-commercial) Legal Entity
Identification Code of Institution	247865289
Type of the Institution	Teaching University

Expert Panel Members

Chair (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Milan Pol, Masaryk University, Czech Republic
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Diana Mtchedlishvili, Caucasus University, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Ketevan Todadze, Ilia State University, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Kristine Chikhladze, Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Jovana Ablotia, Caucasus International University LLC, Georgia

¹ In the case of joint education programme: The institutions implementing the joint higher education programme are indicated; the indication of an identification code and type of institution is not obligatory if the HEI is recognized in accordance with the legislation of a foreign country.

I. Information on the Cluster of Education Programmes

	Programme 1	Programme 2	Programme 3	Programme 4	Programme 5	Programme 6	Programme 7	Programme 8
Name of the educational programme	Integrated Teacher Bachelor's and Master's Programme Primary studies of general Education, level 1	teacher education training programme						
Level of higher education	Integrated Teacher Bachelor's and Master's Programme	Teacher Training	Select Appropriate	Select Appropriate	Select Appropriate	Select Appropriate	Select Appropriate	Select Appropriate
Qualification to be awarded²	Level VII of the NQF; Master of Education with the right to teach subjects: Georgian, Mathematics, Natural Science at the primary level	Level VI of the NQF						

² In case of implementing a joint higher education programme with a higher education institution recognized in accordance with the legislation of a foreign country, if the title of the qualification to be awarded differs, it shall be indicated separately for each institution.

	of general education							
Name and code of the detailed field	0114 – Teacher training with subject specialization	0114 – Teacher training with subject specialization						
Indication of the right to provide teaching of subject/subjects/group of subjects of the relevant level of general education³	Subject/group of subjects of basic and secondary level of general education: I-IV Grade – Georgian language, Mathematics, Natural sciences (main); Elective (choose one): Grades V-VI: Me and society, Georgian language and literature, mathematics, natural	Subject/group of subjects of basic and secondary level of general education (choose one) 1 Georgian language and literature 2 Mathematics 3 Foreign languages (English) 4 Social Sciences (History) 5 Natural Sciences 6 Ethical Education 7 Sports						

³ In case of Integrated Bachelor's-Master's Teacher Training Educational Programme and Teacher Training Educational Programme

	science, "Our Georgia".							
Language of instruction	Georgian	Georgian						
Number of ECTS credits	300	60						
Programme Status (Accredited/Non-accredited/Conditionally Accredited/New/International Accreditation) Indicating Relevant Decision (number, date)	Conditionally accredited	Conditionally accredited						

II. Accreditation Report Executive Summary

- **General Information on the Cluster of Education Programmes⁴**

The cluster consists of two programmes, (1) Integrated primary teacher bachelor's and master's education training programme (300 ECTS), and (2) Educational programme of teacher training (60 ECTS). While the first programme has been implemented since 2021, the Educational Programme for Teacher Training (60 credits) has been already provided since 2015 at the St. Tbel Abuseridze Teaching University of Patriarchate of Georgia. Both clustered programmes belong to the National Classifications Framework Classifier Field 0114. Both programmes provide the opportunity to obtain senior teacher status.

Both programmes include pedagogical-psychological, pedagogical practice, and subject methodology modules. There can be seen a logical connection between the programmes, both programmes seem to have a potential to help students to cope with the challenges of the teaching profession.

It appears, the university made the effort to work with all recommendations formulated during the previous accreditation process (which resulted to conditional accreditation), and improvements can be seen now.

- **Overview of the Accreditation Site Visit**

Prior to the site visit, on September 26, 2022, the panel has the preparatory meeting with the LEPL National Centre for Educational Quality Enhancement representatives, named Mr Nikoloz Parjanadze, Ms Lali Odishvili and Ms Nino Sarjveladze. During this meeting the necessary issues related to the evaluation were discussed and sufficiently clarified. The very site visit took place on September 28-29, 2022. It had a hybrid form, with the chair and the student representative participating online, and all the other panel members being physically present at the university providing the programmes (cluster of programmes) under the evaluation. The work of the panel went well, and it was effectively supported by Ms Lali Odishvili and Ms Nino Nino Sarjveladze, who were also physically present at the university. The interpretation service was efficient.

- **Brief Overview of Education Programme Compliance with the Standards**

Standard 1 Complies with the requirements

Standard 2 Complies with the requirements

⁴ When providing general information related to the programme, it is appropriate to also present the quantitative data analysis of the educational programme.

Standard 3 Complies with the requirements

Standard 4 Substantially complies with the requirements

Standard 5 Substantially complies with the requirements

• **Recommendations**

- The HEI should include Research planning and implementation into the set of learning outcomes of the programme, as it plans. (Educational Programme for Teacher Training)
- Learning outcomes of the courses need to be formulated in a way that ensures their measurability.
- The HEI should ensure the promotion of internationalization, In particular, opening up to partnerships and collaborations with international partners, investing in student mobility to give them opportunities to participate in International mobility activities, exchange programmes, international projects etc.
- The HEI should support its staff to improve the English language competence that would be highly beneficial for the further development of these programmes, for enhancing scientific achievements of academic personnel, for strengthening the international collaboration.
- The HEI should elaborate a mechanism to control the workload of the academic and invited staff of the programmes considering their workload in other HEIs as well.
- The HEI should support its academic personnel to enhance their scientific productivity, especially for publishing papers in high-ranking scientific journals and participating in scientific grant projects.
- The HEI should regularly support professional development of the academic, scientific and invited staff.
- The HEI should conduct the evaluation of programme staff performance and analyse evaluation results on a regular basis. The evaluation should consider their teaching workload and research output.
- The HEI should ensure that the available scientific databases are systematically accessible for staff and students.
- The quality assurance service should activate its work (trainings or working meetings) so that invited and academic staff can better formulate teaching/learning evaluation outcomes (measurable proper active verbs to be used expressing actions); it will make easier to monitor and evaluate teaching/learning processes at later stage.
- It is recommended to carry out in-depth study of the labor market and needs of the programmes meant for training teachers for the programmes grouped in the cluster. And, to develop effective interrogation tools for the same reason.
- It is recommended to have analysis of students' academic achievements done every semester as it can serve as a basis for essential changes to be made such as, change of the teaching course content, change of teaching and evaluating methods or evaluation forms etc.

- **Suggestions for the Programme Development**
 - Consider a possibility to strengthen interlinks among individual objectives of the programme.
 - Some obligatory literature should be updated with the recent versions.
 - The university should prepare memoranda with other schools in the region to provide its students with more diverse possibilities for their school practice. Apparently, it would be better for students to have more schools for implementing their practice activities.
 - Some of the assessment rubrics included in the syllabi are overly detailed. Some rubrics even specify 0.5 points assigned for several criteria. These rubrics appear to be overly detailed and complicated to understand. It is suggested to make the rubrics simpler and less detailed.
 - It is reasonable for both programmes that all potential sources of income and all components of expenses should be clearly written in the budget.
 - It is reasonable the quality assurance service to carry out trainings for the academic and invited staff on planning process of the programmeme evaluation, development of evaluation tools and their involvement in the evaluation process.
 - It is desirable the quality assurance service to conduct training for the programme leaders and academic staff to develop more effective and easier comprehend direct tool to evaluate results of the programmes and their teaching/learning.

- **Brief Overview of the Best Practices (if applicable)⁵**

N/A

- **Information on Sharing or Not Sharing the Argumentative Position of the HEI**

- **In case of re-accreditation, it is important to provide a brief overview of the achievements and/or the progress (if applicable)**

This can be confirmed that St. Tbel Abuseridze Teaching University of Patriarchate of Georgia made a sufficient effort to respond to recommendation formulated by the evaluation panel during the previous accreditation. This can be said about all standards.

⁵ A practice that is exceptionally effective and that can serve as a benchmark or example for other educational programme/programmes.

Evaluation approaches for the accreditation experts:

The components of the accreditation standards are evaluated using the following two approaches:

1. Cluster and individual evaluation⁶
2. Cluster evaluation⁷

Standard/Component	Assessment approaches:
1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme	
1.1. Programme Objectives	Cluster and individual
1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes	Cluster and individual
1.3. Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes	Cluster
1.4 Structure and Content of Educational Programme	Cluster and individual
1.5 Academic Course/Subject	Cluster and individual
2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequate Evaluation of Programme Mastering	
2.1. Programme Admission Preconditions	Cluster and individual
2.2. The Development of Practical, Scientific/Research/Creative/Performing and Transferable Skills	Cluster
2.3. Teaching and Learning Methods	Cluster
2.4. Student Evaluation	Cluster
3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them	
3.1. Student Consulting and Support Services	Cluster
3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision	Cluster
4. Providing Teaching Resources	
4.1. Human Resources	Cluster and individual

⁶ **Evaluation Approaches:** Describe, analyse, and evaluate the compliance of each educational programme grouped in the cluster with the requirements of the corresponding component of the standard. Also, you can specify information about an educational programme that is different from the common and basic characteristics of educational programmes grouped in the cluster.

⁷ **Assessment approaches: In case of necessity,** describe, analyse and evaluate compliance of each education programme in the cluster with the requirements of this component of the standard. Also, you can indicate the information on the education programme, distinguished from the general and major characteristics of the education programmes in a cluster.

4.2. Qualification of Supervisors of Master's and Doctoral Students Cluster and individual

4.3. Professional Development of Academic, Scientific and Invited Staff Cluster

4.4. Material Resources Cluster and individual

4.5. Programme/Faculty/School Budget and Programme Financial Sustainability Cluster and individual

5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities

5.1. Internal Quality Evaluation Cluster

5.2. External Quality Evaluation Cluster

5.3. Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review Cluster

III. Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards

1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme

A programme has clearly established objectives and learning outcomes, which are logically connected to each other. Programme objectives are consistent with the mission, objectives and strategic plan of the institution. Programme learning outcomes are assessed on a regular basis to improve the programme. The content and consistent structure of the programme ensure the achievement of the set goals and expected learning outcomes.

Educational programmes grouped in a cluster are logically interrelated to each other in line with the study fields and evolve according to the respective levels of higher education.

1.1 Programme Objectives

Programme objectives consider the specificity of the field of study, level and an educational programme, and define the set of knowledge, skills and competences a programme aims to develop in graduate students. They also illustrate the contribution of the programme to the development of the field and society.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Both programmes have quite clearly formulated objectives and learning outcomes. And these seem to have a logical interconnectedness. Also, they are consistent with the mission, objectives and plans of the whole institution which intends significantly contribute to the development of the region and the country by training qualified specialists. Training of teachers, undoubtedly, is in line with such a mission. It is also evident that programme learning outcomes are a subject of monitoring and evaluation in case of these two programmes, and this is a relatively firm basis for possible improvements of the programmes. The roadmap indicating the development of objectives and learning outcomes is a very helpful instrument, programme learning outcome development methodology is clear and well acceptable.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 credits))

The programme Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 ECTS) is in its goals consistent with the university's mission. Also, it reflects the teacher education sectoral benchmarks, and it envisages teaching of main subjects: Georgian, Mathematics, Natural Science as well as additional classes of V-VI grades – Georgian Language and Literature, Mathematics, Natural Science, "Our Georgia" "Me and the Society" (student chooses one of the selections of additional subjects). It rightly puts emphasis on the combination of theoretical knowledge, practical skills and experience, and also on the awareness of the professional obligations and the responsibilities. The

correspondence between programme goals and programme learning outcomes is visible. Next phase of the development of the programme objectives could perhaps stress more the interlinks among the individual parts and lead to the concept of professional competence, and open more space for measurability.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 (Educational Programme for Teacher Training (60 credits))

In case of the Educational Programme for Teacher Training (60 ECTS), the objectives clearly point at the student's ability to "fulfill the professional obligations and responsibilities defined by the scheme of activity and career advancement of the senior teacher" (SER, p. 12) in the given subjects. Similarly, to the first programme, more focus on interlinks of individual objectives could be beneficial to this programme, as well as more space to measurability. The current version is well serving for possible work with learning outcomes of the programme under the evaluation, though.

Evidences/Indicators

- Self-evaluation report
- Interviews
- Documentation of the programmes

Recommendations - should be considered by the HEI in order to comply the programme with the requirements of the standard

Suggestions - non-binding advice for the programme development

General recommendations of the cluster:

General suggestions of the cluster: Consider a possibility to strengthen interlinks among individual objectives of the programme.

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 ECTS))

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (Educational Programme for Teacher Training (60 ECTS))

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Evaluation ⁸

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component	1.1	-	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1	Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 ECTS)	x			<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2	Educational Programme for Teacher Training (60 ECTS)	x			<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes

- The learning outcomes of the programme are logically related to the programme objectives and the specifics of the field of study.
- Programme learning outcomes describe knowledge, skills, and/or responsibility and autonomy, students gain upon completion of the programme.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

⁸ Evaluation is performed for each programme separately.

For the Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 ECTS), the set of six learning outcomes has been formulated. This consists of Generalized learning outcomes, Study subject competences, Creation of a positive learning environment, Planning, implementation and evaluation of student and outcome-oriented learning process, Care for professional development, and Research planning and implementation through research skills. This can be said such a set of outcomes creates a relative complexity and well serves the purpose.

The Educational Programme for Teacher Training (60 ECTS) operates with four learning outcomes and especially Research planning and implementation through research skills would be desirable to have there, too. According to the information in the SER, such a move is planned.

Description and Analysis – Programme 1 (Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 credits); **Programme 2** (Educational Programme for Teacher Training (60 credits)

Overall, this can be said, that the learning outcomes of both programmes which include into the programme cluster are logically related to the programme objectives, and also to the specifics of the field of study. Programme learning outcomes in both programmes describe knowledge, skills, and/or responsibility and autonomy, students gain upon completion of the programmes. They are relevant and can serve as a solid basis for the programmes' realization, their evaluation and also possible further improvements.

Evidences/Indicators

- Self-evaluation report
- Documentation of the programmes
- Interviews

General recommendations of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed suggestions that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 credits)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (Educational Programme for Teacher Training (60 ECTS)

Recommendation(s):

- The HEI should include Research planning and implementation into the set of learning outcomes of the programme, as it plans. (Educational Programme for Teacher Training)

Suggestion(s):

.....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1 (Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 ECTS))	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (Educational Programme for Teacher Training (60 ECTS))	X		<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

1.3 Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes

- Evaluation mechanisms of the programme learning outcomes are defined; the programme learning outcomes evaluation cycle consists of defining, collecting and analyzing data necessary to measure learning outcomes.
 - Programme learning outcomes assessment results are utilized for the improvement of the programme.
-

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

In case of both programmes (the cluster) there are mechanisms in place for evaluation of learning outcomes. They include both external, and internal evaluation (self-evaluation) measures, among them the evaluation of the public data, evaluation rubrics, outcome evaluation plan are involved. Altogether, these measures create a relative whole that has a potential to serve well for the evaluation purposes related to the learning outcomes.

If necessary, description and analysis according to the education programmes

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 credits))

The evaluation seems to be a positive and relatively strong aspect within the programme, and it has been developing well recent times.

The evaluation forms include tests, case studies, quizzes, research essays, presentations, projects, teaching essays, portfolios, and more. Also, data on the employment rate, student engagements in training conferences and more are a part of the evaluation process related to the learning outcomes. Student evaluation is also a part of the evaluations in the programme cluster, and this is a positive sign that students are getting involved in the evaluation processes, too. Formative as well as some elements of summative evaluation are used. The periodicity of evaluation is set.

Target benchmarks have been defined against all learning outcomes formulated within the programmes.

Data received from evaluation are used for improvement purposes – towards the content of the course(s), possible changes in characteristics of learning outcomes, changes in forms and methods of evaluation, and changes in study and learning resources.

It was stated in the Self-evaluation report, but also proved during the interviews that the evaluation has been developing within the programmes recent years thus positively contributing to the programmes' development and to the involvement of the staff and also students in it.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 (Educational Programme for Teacher Training (60 credits))

In this programme, formative as well as summative evaluation is used in relation to evaluation of learning outcomes. On-going assessment, mid-term assessment and final exam are main forms of evaluation used in the programme, methods of evaluation used are similar to the programme Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 credits))

Similarly to the programme 1 (300 credits), the data from employers as well as from graduates are collected and worked with, too, to evaluate how learning outcomes are met.

Learning outcomes are also compared with the target benchmarks. Also, in case of this programme, it seems the evaluation has been developing well in recent years.

Evidences/Indicators

- Self-evaluation report
- Documentation of the programmes
- Interviews

General recommendations of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

.....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 1.3 Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1 (title, level)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (title, level)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

1.4. Educational Programme Structure and Content

- The programme is designed according to HEI's methodology for planning, designing and developing of educational programmes.
 - The programme structure is consistent and logical. Content and structure ensure the achievement of the programme learning outcomes. The qualification to be awarded is corresponding to the programme content and learning outcomes.
-

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The programmes which are a part of the programme cluster under the evaluation, are designed according to the HEI's methodology for planning, designing and developing educational programmes. In this process, internal possibilities and needs as well as external circumstances are reflected, too, such as the national curriculum of the general education development (incl. so-called consolidated curriculum), sectoral benchmarks, and other measures.

The 300 credits programme includes also free components, a subject/subject group component, and a research component which enables more flexibility.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 credits))

The programme is developed in line with university rules for planning, development, implementation, evaluation and development of the first and second level higher education programmes – these rules have been gradually amended.

The structure of the programme is logically built with a subject/subject group component having 90 credits (10 of them optional), teacher training module having 110 credits (20 electives), school internship (30 credits, out of it 2 lectives), internship research module (30 credits), and free component having 40 credits (5 of them electives). The structure covers all main areas and can be found as solid basis for the programme realisation.

The programme structure and possibilities of its slight modifications have also been discussed in different groups, incl. students.

Among the new and progressive elements within the programme, joint research work of students and the staff shall be mentioned – according to the data from Self-evaluation report and to the information provided by some people participating in the interviews.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 (Education Programme for Teacher Training (60 credits))

The programme is built regarding normative requirements applied at the university. Sectoral benchmarks and also external reforms in education have been considered, too.

Within the programme, 35 credits are allocated to theories of teaching, 10 to pedagogical practice, 15 to elective modules of the programme. Elective modules are in line with the subject/subject groups of the National Curriculum of the General Education School, and there is a total of 8 modules available. Each student can choose one module out of the whole offer.

The whole program takes one year and it is divided into two semesters (30 credits each). Each course is linked to the learning outcome(s) on the so-called outcomes map which the university developed for both programmes.

The research element within the programme is in the planning process, according to the SER.

This can be said the courses are logically built within the programme, and consequently, the programme itself has a logical structure which corresponds positively to the learning outcomes of the programme.

Staff, students, as well as external stakeholders seem to be in some extent involved in the development of the programme.

Evidences/Indicators

- Self-evaluation report
- Documents of the programmes under the evaluation
- Interviews

General recommendations of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

General suggestion of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

.....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 1.4 Structure and Content of an Educational Programme	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1 (title, level)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Programme 2 (title, level) x □ □ □

1.5. Academic Course/Subject

- The content of the academic course / subject and the number of credits ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes defined by this course / subject.
- The content and the learning outcomes of the academic course/subject of the main field of study ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme.
- The study materials indicated in the syllabus ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

For both educational programmes, the content of courses and the number of credits ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes defined by the corresponding course. The content and the learning outcomes of the courses of the main field of study ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the corresponding programme. The study materials indicated in the syllabus ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme, but some of them needs to be updated. Learning outcomes of the courses needs to be formulated in a way that ensures their measurability.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 ((Bachelor Master Integrated Educational Programme of Teacher Training for Primary Studies of General Education (300 ECTS))

Student learning outcomes of compulsory courses are in line with program learning outcomes for both educational programmes. The content of courses corresponds to the course learning outcomes. Number of credits allocated for each course considering the number of contact and independent study hours correspond to the content and learning outcomes of the course. The ratio between contact and independent hours is logical. The number of contact hours and teaching and learning methods (lecture, seminar, practical work, etc.) corresponds to the content and learning outcomes of the course.

Learning outcomes of courses are assessed through indicated in the syllabi teaching methods, assessment criteria and rubrics. For each learning outcome there is given in the table the information showing the relevant chosen method through which it is evaluated. It is indicated how many courses help the student

to achieve the learning outcome. The evaluation of the learning outcomes of the courses are analyzed by the head of the programme: by analyzing statistical data, surveys, reflection, self-evaluation. Learning outcomes of courses are grouped through three competencies: knowledge and understanding, skill, responsibility and autonomy. However, the formulation of learning outcomes lacks expression by measurable verbs.

Compulsory literature and other reading materials listed in the syllabi correspond to course learning outcomes. However, there are cases when the part of obligatory literature should be updated with the recent versions. It should be mentioned that the literature connected with the teaching methodology, e.g., textbooks, training materials, national regulatory documents are the latest versions and ensure both programmes' compliance with modern requirements.

For both educational programmes there is given the map showing the link between the programme and corresponding courses learning outcomes.

Especially it is worth mentioning that the institution has implemented student self-assessment practice. At the end of the semester students are self-evaluating themselves the knowledge they gained through each course and topics they learned. As feedback, the teacher fills that form with his/her remarks and recommendations.

Description and Analysis – Programme 2 (Programme of Teacher Training (60 ECTS))

Student learning outcomes of compulsory courses are in line with program learning outcomes for both educational programmes. The content of courses corresponds to the course learning outcomes. Number of credits allocated for each course considering the number of contact and independent study hours correspond to the content and learning outcomes of the course. The ratio between contact and independent hours is logical. The number of contact hours and teaching and learning methods (lecture, seminar, practical work, etc.) corresponds to the content and learning outcomes of the course.

Learning outcomes of courses are assessed through indicated in the syllabi teaching methods, assessment criteria and rubrics. For each learning outcome there is given in the table the information showing the relevant chosen method through which it is evaluated. It is indicated how many courses help the student to achieve the learning outcome. The evaluation of the learning outcomes of the courses are analyzed by the head of the programme: by analyzing statistical data, surveys, reflection, self-evaluation. As the programme covers one academic year, the achievement of the learning outcomes of the course is checked both at the end of the educational course itself and at the end of the academic year as a whole.

Learning outcomes of courses are grouped through three competencies: knowledge and understanding, skill, responsibility and autonomy. However, the formulation of learning outcomes lacks expression by measurable verbs.

Compulsory literature and other reading materials listed in the syllabi correspond to course learning outcomes. However, there are cases when the part of obligatory literature should be updated with the recent versions. It should be mentioned that the literature connected with the teaching methodology, e.g., textbooks, training materials, national regulatory documents are the latest versions and ensure both programmes' compliance with modern requirements.

For both educational programmes there is given the map showing the link between the programme and corresponding courses learning outcomes.

Especially it is worth mentioning that the institution has implemented student self-assessment practice. At the end of the semester students are self-evaluating themselves the knowledge they gained through each course and topics they learned. As feedback, the teacher fills that form with his/her remarks and recommendations.

Evidences/Indicators

- Bachelor Master Integrated Educational Programme of Teacher Training for Primary Studies of General Education (300 ECTS) and syllabi;
- Educational Programme of Teacher Training (60 ECTS and syllabi);
- Map of learning outcomes;
- Self-evaluation forms for courses filled by students;
- Self-evaluation report;
- Library resources;
- Interview results.

General recommendations of the cluster:

- Learning outcomes of the courses need to be formulated in a way that ensures their measurability.

General suggestions of the cluster:

- Some obligatory literature should be updated with the recent versions.

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

.....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 1.5 Academic Course/Subject	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1 (title, level)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (title, level)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1 (Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 credits)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (Educational Programme for Teacher Training	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering

Prerequisites for admission to the programme, teaching-learning methods and student assessment consider the specificity of the study field, level requirements, student needs, and ensure the achievement of the objectives and expected learning outcomes of the programme.

2.1 Programme Admission Preconditions

The HEI has relevant, transparent, fair, public and accessible programme admission preconditions and procedures that ensure the engagement of individuals with relevant knowledge and skills in the programme to achieve learning outcomes.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Admission to the programs is carried out according to the rules established by the legislation of Georgia and The students/professional students contingent planning mechanism, methodology, and target benchmarks at the Tbel Abuserisdze Teaching University of Georgian Patriarchate.

The number of students contingent is determined annually according to educational programs. The university has defined the methodology for planning the student quota. The criteria for determining the student quota are a) human resources, e. g. the number of academic/scientific/guest staff is adequate to the student quota limit, and their ratio does not exceed one staff member per 15 students, b) material resources, c) educational facilities, d) financial resources.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Integrated Bachelor/Master's Program for Primary Teacher Training)

Prerequisites for admission to the Integrated Bachelor/Master's Program for General Education Primary Teacher Training (300 credits) are defined according to the legislation of Georgia and "The regulatory rule of the educational process of Tbel Abuserisdze Teaching University".

Applicants to the program must pass the unified national exam in 3 compulsory subjects and the 4th exam in one of the optional subjects specified by the university. For citizens of foreign countries, the right to obtain student status without the unified national exams is possible based on the rules established by the Ministry of Education and Science of Georgia.

The student of another higher education institution can be admitted to the program based on mobility rules following the legislation of Georgia and the regulatory rule of the educational process of Tbel Abuserisdze Teaching University.

Prerequisites and procedures for admission to the program are under the legislation. They are public and accessible on the university website <https://tbeli.ge>.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 (The Educational Program for Teacher Training)

Prerequisites for admission to the Educational Program for Teacher Training (60 credits) are determined by the Sectoral Benchmarks and the “Law of Georgia on Higher Education”, Article 472 – Teacher’s training programme.

According to the aforementioned law, persons with a bachelor’s/master’s degree in a subject/group of subjects determined by the national curriculum, or an academic degree equivalent to it, or a corresponding artistic/sports/military/professional education, who have successfully confirmed their subject competence by an exam organized by the National Center for Evaluation and Examinations, can be enrolled in the Teacher Training program.

All the successful applicants who have passed the subject competence exams, should also pass the written exam organized by the university. The exam format is a "Pedagogical essay", which is designed to reveal the applicant's knowledge, skills, attitude, and vision.

Thus, the prerequisite for admission to the program is logical and corresponds to the content and expected learning outcomes of the program.

Information about prerequisites for admission to the program is public and available on the university website <https://tbeli.ge>. The information about the form and evaluation criteria of the written exam organized by the university is made public one month in advance.

Evidences/Indicators

- The Educational Program for Teacher Training
- Integrated Bachelor/Master’s Program for General Education Primary Teacher Training
- The regulatory rule of the educational process of Tbel Abuserisdze Teaching University of Georgian Patriarchate.
- The students/professional students contingent planning mechanism, methodology, and target benchmarks at the Tbel Abuserisdze Teaching University of Georgian Patriarchate.
- University website <https://tbeli.ge/>
- Self-assessment report of accreditation of educational programs grouped in a cluster

General recommendations of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

.....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 2.1 Programme admission preconditions	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1 (title, level)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (title, level)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

2.2. The Development of Practical, Scientific/Research/Creative/Performing and Transferable Skills

Programme ensures the development of students' practical, scientific/research/creative/performing and transferable skills and/or their involvement in research projects, in accordance with the programme learning outcomes.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The development of students' practical, research, and transfer skills is crucial for both programs.

In order to develop practical skills in accordance with the learning outcomes of the courses, a meaningful ratio of theoretical learning and practical work is provided in the course syllabi. Each course provides appropriate methods and activities to achieve these practical skills.

School practice has a mandatory status in the program. Within the practice, it is possible to develop practical and transferable skills. The procedure for implementing practice in schools is common in both programs. The relevant syllabi describe the activities that the student must perform in the school intended for practice. Students write reflections based on their activities and make a presentation at the student conference at the end of the course. For school practice, two heads of practice should be chosen: a) from the academic staff of the educational program. In addition to the academic degree, he/she must possess the teacher status, b) from the site of implementation of pedagogical practice - school. He/she must have teacher status and at least three years of teaching experience.

The university has signed a memorandum with two schools. These schools are Saint Grigol Khandzteli School of Georgian Patriarchate in Khichauri and Saint Abuserisdze Tbeli School in Khulo. The memoranda detail the obligations of the parties and the perspectives of their cooperation. According to paragraph 1 of Article 1 of the memorandum: students will undergo the practical component provided by the program. The third school providing student practice is located in the university yard. It was accredited in April 2022.

As it was made clear during the interviews, there are 4-student groups per teacher at the practice sites. Apparently, it would be better for students to have more schools ready to accept students for practice activities. The university should prepare memoranda with other schools in the region to provide its students with more diverse possibilities for their school practice.

It should be noted that research activities and student scientific conferences are included in the syllabi of both programs. Participation of students in teacher conferences enhances the development of research skills of students involved in the program. Student conferences are held at the university each year, and students' participation in these conferences has become a tradition. Articles reflecting their activity are published in the pedagogical newspaper "Akhali Ganatleba", which contributes to the development of scientific-practical skills among students.

From the new academic year, it is planned to implement research projects and prepare articles co-authored by students and mentors.

If necessary, description and analysis according to the education programmes

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Integrated Bachelor Master's Program for Primary Teacher Training)

The integrated bachelor's/master's program of general education primary level teacher training (300 credits) ensures the creation of conditions for the development of students' research, creative, and scientific skills in accordance with the program learning outcomes.

The scientific research component of the program is 30 credits. It includes the courses "Pedagogical Research Methods", 5 credits, "Latest Studies in Education", 5 credits, and "Master's Thesis", 20 credits.

During the school practice period, students are guided by a qualified person. The teachers leading their practice are all leaders and mentors.

The amount of pedagogical practice in the program is 30 credits, among which 28 credits are mandatory, and 2 credits are optional.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 (The Educational Program for Teacher Training)

To achieve the learning outcomes of the Teacher training educational program (60 credits), various educational activities are planned in the course syllabi, among which practical activities compile much more than half. It is planned to develop research and creative skills, both in school practice courses and in the course "Research of personal pedagogical practice".

The emphasis is on the development of "hands-on learning", and students have the opportunity to develop practical skills.

During the period of pedagogical practice, the students are guided by the subject methodology lecturer, professor/mentor teacher on the one hand, and the leading teacher at the school site on the other hand.

Pedagogical practice is organized. During the practice, students are introduced to the process of planning, performing, and presenting educational and social projects. The student learns to manage the teaching and learning process, both in face-to-face classroom conditions and in remote teaching conditions.

The development of the student's practical skills along with the practice is facilitated by the course "Personal Pedagogical Practice Research", which along with the practice, also develops the student's research skills. The aim of this course is for the student to carry out personal pedagogical research, which will help to perfect the school practice, identify their own professional needs and plan the orientation of continuous professional development.

Evidences/Indicators

- School practice organization plans for educational programs.
- Syllabi of school practice courses and Personal Pedagogical Practice Research course;
- The procedure for choosing the head of the pedagogical practice.
- Memorandum with the Saint Grigol Khandzteli School of Georgian Patriarchate in Khichauri.
- Memorandum with the Saint Abuserisdze Tbeli School in Khulo.
- Articles published by the students in the newspaper "Akhali Ganatleba"
- program self-evaluation document;
- interview with people involved in the development and implementation of the program;

General recommendations of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

General suggestions of the cluster: The university should prepare memoranda with other schools in the region to provide its students with more diverse possibilities for their school practice. Apparently, it would be better for students to have more schools for implementing their practice activities.

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

.....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component 2.2. The Development of practical, scientific/research/creative/performing and transferable Skills	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1 (title, level)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Programme 2 (title, level)



2.3. Teaching and Learning Methods

The programme is implemented by using student-centered teaching and learning methods. Teaching and learning methods correspond to the level of education, course/subject content, learning outcomes and ensure their achievement.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The process of implementing the programs in the cluster is carried out using student-oriented teaching and learning methods. The program provides a pre-defined list of various teaching/learning and research methods. It also provides explanations of these teaching-learning methods. Depending on the specifics of the course, the lecturer chooses from these methods and indicates them in the syllabus. Most syllabi include the definitions of the teaching methods to make them easier for the student to understand. Teaching methods are chosen in courses taking into account the purpose, learning outcomes, and content. The lecturer has the academic freedom to determine the methods and activities necessary to achieve the learning outcomes. Therefore, teaching and learning methods are not uniform in the syllabi.

The following methods and activities are mainly used in various courses: lecture, group work, seminar, verbal method, written work method, discussion/debate and cooperative teaching methods, case, situation analysis method, pedagogical invariant, demonstration method, socio-emotional exercises, induction, deduction, analysis, synthesis method, matching columns, explanatory method, action-oriented learning, problem-oriented learning, holistic charts, rubrics, presentations, assessment tasks appropriate for cognitive levels, display of samples, Modeling complex tasks, focused task, interview, three chairs of thinking and others that will help to achieve learning outcomes. It is also permissible to use methods not included in the list, especially during distance learning. The above-mentioned methods are student-

oriented and correspond to the content of the courses and the learning outcomes. Most of the course syllabi show the use of interactive teaching methods, which ensure student engagement.

The methods specified in the syllabi may change according to the demands and needs of the students. They also take into consideration modern trends. For example, the students asked for more practical exercises on complex assignments, which was a difficult topic for the majority. The university complied, and, in addition, a guide was created on how to write a complex assignment.

The programs specify not only teaching methods but also the forms of independent work, such as working in a library, using an electronic library and reader, reading, creating a bibliography, reading classic monographs and the latest scientific-methodical articles, reading church literature, preparing oral and written reports, and searching Internet resources.

In order to improve the quality of teaching, the training "Active teaching-learning methods in the university" was conducted for the academic staff of both programs.

If necessary, description and analysis according to the education programmes

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Integrated Bachelor Master's Program for Primary Teacher Training)

The Integrated bachelor/master's program of general education primary level teacher training (300 credits) is implemented using student-centered teaching-learning and research methods.

In the syllabi, the contact hours and hours for independent work are listed for each topic. It is envisaged to monitor the working time spent by the student and make appropriate changes.

As enrollment of students from abroad, from Saingilo, is expected, there is a readiness to take into account their cultural characteristics and to modify the teaching-learning methods accordingly.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 (The Educational Program for Teacher Training)

The teacher training educational program (60 credits) defines teaching/learning and research forms and methods that contribute to the achievement of learning outcomes.

For the effective use of teaching/learning and research methods, training was conducted for academic staff.

As a result of the training, a list of teaching/learning research assessment methods with definitions was determined. This training introduced the use of socio-emotional assessment rubrics. Also, specific seminars on the topic of "Digital tools" were held to master distance teaching and learning methods. The aim of the seminar was to introduce teaching-learning methods appropriate for distance learning.

Evidences/Indicators

- Teacher training educational program;
- Integrated bachelor/master's educational program for general education primary level teacher training;
- Syllabi;
- program self-evaluation document;
- Training materials: 1) Results-oriented learning/active teaching methods in high school. 2) Forms and methods of evaluating student learning results.
- interviews with academic staff, students, graduates;

General recommendations of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

.....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component 2.3. Teaching and learning methods	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1 (title, level)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (title, level)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

2.4. Student Evaluation

Student evaluation is conducted in accordance with the established procedures. It is transparent, reliable and complies with existing legislation.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

In programs grouped in a cluster, special attention is paid to student evaluation. student evaluation is carried out per Order 3, January 5, 2007, of the Minister of Education and Science of Georgia "On approval of the rules for calculating credits for higher education programs", and The regulatory rule of the educational process of Tbel Abuserisdze Teaching University of Georgian Patriarchate (assessment, procedure for appeal of assessment results). The ESTS evaluation system is defined in the programs, and the detailed assessment components, forms, and methods are included in the syllabi.

Regulatory Rules of the educational process Article 20 describes the rules for student assessment and conducting exams.

The following assessment components are used within the program's courses: various activities in classes, participation in seminar/practical work, reports, presentations, research components, mid-term evaluations, final exams, and other assessments made during the course. The final evaluation of the course is divided into two parts and implies the sum of intermediate and final evaluations. Out of the 100-point evaluation of the course, 60 points are assigned to the intermediate evaluation, and 40 points to the final exam. Midterm and final assessments consist of assessment components that combine oral and/or written questionnaires, exams, practical and theoretical work, etc. A student cannot be assessed using only one assessment component.

Special emphasis is placed on formative assessment so that the student can use the comment for improvement. As we were told during the interviews, students are informed about the evaluation results promptly.

Students are provided with a course syllabus at the start of their studies, so they are well acquainted with the evaluation methods used in each course.

During the interviews, the quality assurance representative stated that there are challenges in adjusting the current and mid-term evaluations because syllabus authors put more emphasis on the final exam. However, all the assessment rubrics included in the syllabi are quite detailed. Some of the rubrics even specify 0.5 points assigned for several criteria. The syllabus authors stated in the interviews that transparency of the rubric is necessary so that students do not have additional questions. However, these rubrics appear to be overly detailed and complicated to understand.

Through the interviews, it was established that the lecturers actively use the formative assessments, inform students about the strengths and weaknesses of the received assessment, provide counseling, etc. The students mentioned that they often received verbal comments individually. This was the case even during the distance learning period when they received their assessments through Facebook messenger.

Regulatory Rules of the educational process Article 27 is about rules for holding exams. At the exam, the student is obliged to appear at the appointed time, protect silence and order, act on the exam according to the announced instructions, and leave the audience silently after completing the exam task. During the exam, the student is prohibited from leaving the auditorium, using a mobile phone, using supporting records, conversations, and information exchange.

Regulatory Rules of the educational process also define the deadlines for sharing the exam results with the student: immediately after the completion of the oral exam, and 4 workdays after the completion of the written exam.

"Forms and methods of student learning assessment" training was conducted.

The University operates an assessment appeals mechanism that is familiar to program students and academic staff but is rarely used. The procedure for appealing evaluation results is introduced to students at the beginning of the academic year. During the interviews, students and alumni were asked about the examples of assessment appealing but no one could remember even a single case.

The university is planning to use a student evaluation data collection form for both programs. This form is an interesting novelty. It was already tested on one student, and they believe it is an efficient tool for a

student to perceive the clear picture of his/her academic achievements and allows them to plan their professional development.

The university has Plagiarism prevention, detection, and response rules.

They have already purchased a plagiarism detection program. Until the purchase of this program, the university had a contract with the Academy of Sciences, and they got the master's thesis plagiarism checked there.

According to the Plagiarism prevention, detection, and response rules, if plagiarism is found in a written assignment created within the educational or research components at all levels of academic education, the course lecturer is entitled to reject the written assignment without evaluation and to inform the dean of the faculty about it.

If necessary, description and analysis according to the education programmes

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Integrated Bachelor Master's Program for Primary Teacher Training)

In the integrated bachelor/master's program of general education primary level teacher training (300 credits) students' assessment is carried out by the ESTS system, according to the university's assessment regulation.

Student assessment includes the rules and procedures for the assessment of master's theses, which are regulated by the "Regulations of the Master's Degree".

Master's thesis and oral master's exam/thesis defense are evaluated with a 100-point system. The assessment of the oral final exam/defense is carried out by the members of the special commission/examiners in a closed session immediately after the exam/defense. The oral final exam is evaluated within 40 points. The oral final exam will be considered passed if the graduate student gets at least 21 points.

The master's thesis and the oral master's examination/defense are considered passed if the sum of the points of the completion of the master's thesis and the oral master's examination/defense is more than 50% of the maximum grade.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 (The Educational Program for Teacher Training)

In the teacher training educational program (60 credits) the final activity of the school practicum course is the debriefing conference. It is a joint conference of teachers, lecturers, and students, where each student practitioner and the head of the practice present the analysis and evaluation of the work done during the practice period. The conference makes a decision on the quality of conducting pedagogical practice by the

student-practitioner and assigns points. The decision of the conference is discussed and approved at the joint meeting of the subject department and faculty council.

Evidences/Indicators

- The regulatory rule of the educational process of Tbel Abuserisdze Teaching University of Georgian Patriarchate;
- Student assessment data collection form;
- program self-evaluation document;
- Syllabi;
- Regulations of the Master’s Degree of Tbel Abuserisdze Teaching University of Georgian Patriarchate;
- Memorandum with Hosti.Ge group on the use of e-services;
- Plagiarism prevention, detection, and response rules;
- Interviews with academic staff, students, graduates;
- Student Guide: <https://tbeli.ge/files/2222%20.%20Tbeli- -Studentis-cnobari- -2021.pdf>

General recommendations of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

General suggestions of the cluster: Some of the assessment rubrics included in the syllabi are overly detailed. Some rubrics even specify 0.5 points assigned for several criteria. These rubrics appear to be overly detailed and complicated to understand. It is suggested to make the rubrics simpler and less detailed.

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

.....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component 2.4 - Student evaluation	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1 (title, level)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (title, level)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

2. Teaching Methodology and Organization, Adequate Evaluation of Programme Mastering	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1 (Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education, level VII)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (Educational programme of teacher training title, level VI)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with Them

The programme ensures the creation of a student-centered environment by providing students with relevant services; promotes maximum student awareness, implements a variety of activities and facilitates student engagement in local and / or international projects; proper quality of scientific guidance is provided for master's and doctoral students.

3.1 Student Consulting and Support Services

Students receive consultation and support regarding the planning of learning process, improvement of academic achievement, and career development from the people involved in the programme and/or structural units of the HEI. A student has an opportunity to have a diverse learning process and receive relevant information and recommendations from those involved in the programme.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The Expert Panel on the basic information collected through cluster programs Self-evaluation Report, relevant enclosed documents, and the Site Visit discovered that all necessary students support services mostly are in place.

Student support services at the university are the same for both programs students. Mainly, the programs grouped in the cluster have in common the "Student Support Service Regulation", which describes the workload, functions, and duties of the persons involved in the counseling service. Students receive appropriate consultations and support regarding the planning of the learning process, improvement of academic achievement, employment, and professional development.

In the framework of the cluster programmes, students have an opportunity to participate in various activities, like local projects and local conferences. Those activities are regulated by the university with documents: "Regulation of the Grant Competition for Targeted Scientific-Research Project of the University" and "Student initiatives, project presentation and university decision-making procedure".

University administrative and academic staff provide students with relevant information about available programs at the university. Students are informed about various local projects and events. However, University does not work actively to improve internationalization. Students have not possibilities to get involved in exchange programs that combine with international education and the experience of cultural diversity.

The description of the (Bachelor-Master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 credits) and the Educational Program for Teacher Training (60 credits) at St. Tbel Abuseridze Teaching University is available on the university's official web-site (<https://tbeli.ge/>). It contains detailed information about the university program, study goals and outcomes, qualifications awarded, credits, and assessments. However, detailed information can be obtained at orientation meetings attended by program representatives. These facilities provide students with information on issues of interest. Also students from the curator receives advices and assistance about study process.

Within the framework of the Cluster programmes the university has signed memorandums with two public schools to provide internships for students. That's really important part for improving skills but if they want Teaching and learning to be more relevant University must offer students multiple opportunities to practice and master as they go.

If necessary, description and analysis according to the education programmes

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 credits)

The student counseling and support services of the programme combined in the cluster overlap in a number of respects. The difference is the experience accumulated during the long period of operation of the programme (II programme - Educational Program for Teacher Training (60 credits)) and one year of operation (I programme - Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 credits), while the experience of the II programme includes

the process of classroom and distance learning, and the I programme - only the process of distance learning.

Evidences/Indicators

- Student Support Service Regulation
- Plan of students' consulting services.
- "Regulation of the Grant Competition for Targeted Scientific-Research Project of the University".
- Student initiatives, project presentation and university decision-making procedure
- Self-evaluation Report
- Results of the interview conducted during the experts' visit

General recommendations of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

The HEI should ensure the promotion of internationalization, In particular, opening up to partnerships and collaborations with international partners, investing in student mobility to give them opportunities to participate in International mobility activities, exchange programmes, international projects etc.

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

.....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component	3.1	Student consulting and support services	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1 (title, level)			<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (title, level)			<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision

- A scientific supervisor provides proper support to master's and doctorate students to perform the scientific-research component successfully.
- Within master's and doctoral programmes, ratio of students and supervisors enables to perform scientific supervision properly.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

If necessary, description and analysis according to the education programmes

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Bachelor-Master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 credits)

The Expert Panel on the basis information collected through programme Self-evaluation Report, relevant enclosed documents and the Site Visit discovered that the Programme meets the accreditation standards in this regard.

The university has developed the "Regulations of Master's Degree", which outlines the rights and duties of the supervisor of the Master's degree student and other procedures. A supervisor conducts consultations with Master's students on a regular basis. The frequency of consultations depends on the specifications of the programme and research topic.

Master's thesis is the work performed by the student individually. It should reflect the deep and systematic theoretical and practical knowledge acquired during the study period. The title of the Master's thesis should be coordinated with the Master's Degree Program Supervisor at the beginning of the third semester.

Also, The Master's Thesis Supervisor may be a member of the academic personal or an invited professor with a PhD or equivalent degree. Master's supervisors must have an academic background as well as professional experience in supervising Master's studies. Institution have approved the document about master's student's potential supervisors, where is written only the field of research interest of the academic staff (potential supervisors of master's students). Other detailed information is presented in the academic staff Curriculum Vitae. Therefore curenly ratio - supervisors of master's theses/master's students may be 10/24.

Data related to the supervision of master's/doctoral students Programme 1 (title, level)⁹	
Number of master's/doctoral theses supervisors	10
//Number of doctoral thesis supervisors	N/A
Number of master's students	24
//Number of doctoral students	N/A
Ratio - supervisors of master's theses/master's students	10/24
Ratio - supervisors of doctoral theses/doctoral students	N/A

Evidences/Indicators

- Regulation of St. Tbel Abuseridze Teaching University;
- Regulatory Rules on the learning process;
- Syllabus №64 "Master's Thesis";
- Academic staff's curriculum vitae
- The evaluation form for the activity of the supervisor of the master's topic.
- Self-evaluation Report
- Results of the interview conducted during the experts' visit

General recommendations of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

⁹ In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes

Programme 1 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

.....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component	3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1	(Bachelor-Master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 credits))	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1 (Bachelor-Master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 credits))	x		<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (Educational Program for Teacher Training (60 credits))		x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

4. Providing Teaching Resources

Human, material, information and financial resources of educational programme/educational programmes grouped in a cluster ensure the sustainable, stable, efficient and effective functioning of the programme and the achievement of the defined objectives.

4.1 Human Resources

- Programme staff consists of qualified persons who have necessary competences in order to help students to achieve the programme learning outcomes.
- The number and workload of programme academic/scientific and invited staff ensures the sustainable running of the educational process and also, proper execution of their research/creative/performance activities and other assigned duties. Quantitative indicators related to academic/scientific/invited staff ensure programme sustainability.
- The Head of the Programme possesses necessary knowledge and experience required for programme elaboration, and also the appropriate competences in the field of study of the programme. He/she is personally involved in programme implementation.
- Programme students are provided with an adequate number of administrative and support staff of appropriate competence.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Both programmes' staff consists of qualified persons who have necessary competences to deliver study courses and help students to achieve the programme and course learning outcomes. The number and workload of programme academic/scientific and invited staff ensures the sustainable running of the educational process. Quantitative indicators related to academic/scientific/invited staff ensure programme sustainability. Students are provided with an adequate number of administrative and support staff as well. The heads of both programmes possess necessary knowledge and experience required for programme elaboration and delivery, and also the appropriate competences in the field of study of the programmes. They are personally involved in programme implementation.

The academic resources of both programmes are mostly common. The function of the heads of both programmes are regulated by HEI regulation "Personnel Management Policy Document" and "The rule for planning, designing, implementing and development of education programmes".

Qualification requirements, contract forms, workload requirements are also the same for both programmes. They are in line with the HEI internal regulations. However, the HEI do not have any mechanism to control academic workload of the staff considering their workload in other HEIs as well. In the “Methodology for determining the number of academic and invited staff of the university” is stated that HEI considers the workload of the personnel in other organizations, but the approach is not implemented in practice.

It should be mentioned that HEI academic/invited/administrative staff do not show the English language competence that would be highly beneficial for the further development of these programmes, for enhancing scientific achievements of academic personnel, for strengthening the international collaboration.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Bachelor Master Integrated Educational Programme of Teacher Training for Primary Studies of General Education (300 ECTS))

Programme staff is hired in accordance with the legislation and internal regulations of HEI. Programme staff qualification is in compliance with the qualification requirements set for their positions. The qualification of academic/scientific staff is proved by their qualifications, practical experience and scientific papers/monograph/textbooks. The qualification of invited staff is proved by relevant knowledge, practical experience and competencies. However, as the statistical information submitted by HEI shows that it would be beneficial for the programme if the academic personnel published more scientific papers, especially in high-ranking scientific journals. Participation in scientific grant projects would also a benefit. There is no information in the self-evaluation report of HEI about supervisors of Master thesis. During the interviews this fact was explained by not having students for this level as only freshmen and sophomores are studying at this moment. They suppose that the same academic personnel will be supervisors as well. During the visit the experts panel asked to submit information about potential supervisors. HEI submitted the required information declaring that 10 academic personnel is proposed to supervise Master theses. Their CV proves their relevance and competence to help students to achieve learning outcomes of Master thesis.

Programme has academic/scientific and invited staff workload scheme, which is updated every semester. But this information is not clear as there are no concrete hours indicated in the corresponding table. As it was mentioned during the interviews, the academic and invited staff do not have much workload and it is about maximum 8 hours a day, working for 4 days a week. Based on interview results, the workload of academic and invited personnel can be proposed as logical to accomplish their duties.

The number of academic/scientific/invited staff is adequate to the number of students. Balance between academic and invited staff ensures programme sustainability. The turnover of academic/scientific and invited staff ensures programme sustainability. Besides the academic personnel, there are four mentor, 1 leader and 3 senior teachers involved in the delivery of the programme. All academic staff are affiliated. Apart from teaching process, academic/scientific/invited staff is involved in student advising, the development of the programme.

The head of the programme possesses necessary knowledge and experience required for programme elaboration. The qualification of the head of the programme is certified by relevant education in the field, practical experience and scientific papers. During the interviews it was revealed that the head of the

program is personally involved in programme assessment and development, programme implementation, student advising, etc.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 (Educational Programme of Teacher Training (60 ECTS))

Programme staff is hired in accordance with the legislation and internal regulations of HEI. Programme staff qualification is in compliance with the qualification requirements set for their positions. The qualification of academic/scientific staff is proved by their qualifications, practical experience and scientific papers/monograph/textbooks. The qualification of invited staff is proved by relevant knowledge, practical experience and competencies. However, as the statistical information submitted by HEI shows that it would be beneficial for the programme if the academic personnel published more scientific papers, especially in high-ranking scientific journals. Participation in scientific grant projects would also a benefit. Programme has academic/scientific and invited staff workload scheme, which is updated every semester. But this information is not clear as there are no concrete hours indicated in the corresponding table. As it was mentioned during the interviews, the academic and invited staff do not have much workload and it is about maximum 8 hours a day, working for 4 days a week. Based on interview results, the workload of academic and invited personnel can be proposed as logical to accomplish their duties.

The number of academic/scientific/invited staff is adequate to the number of students. Balance between academic and invited staff ensures programme sustainability. The turnover of academic/scientific and invited staff ensures programme sustainability. Apart from teaching process, academic/scientific/invited staff is involved in student advising, the development of the programme. All academic staff are affiliated. Four professors from the academic staff are mentor teachers, one is a leading teacher and three senior teachers. The internship is led by the school teachers, among them there are 2 senior teachers and one leading certified teacher.

The head of the programme possesses necessary knowledge and experience required for programme elaboration. The qualification of the head of the programme is certified by relevant education in the field, practical experience and scientific papers. During the interviews it was revealed that the head of the program is personally involved in programme assessment and development, programme implementation, student advising, etc.

Programme 1 (Bachelor Master Integrated Educational Programme of Teacher Training for Primary Studies of General Education (300 ECTS))¹⁰				
Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Programme Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise ¹¹	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction ¹²	Among them, the affiliated academic staff

¹⁰ In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

¹¹ Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

¹² Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

Total number of academic staff	15	15	15	15
- Professor	8	8	8	8
- Associate Professor	7	7	7	7
- Assistant-Professor	0	0	0	0
- Assistant	0	0	0	0
Invited Staff	5	0	0	–
Scientific Staff	6	6	6	–
Programme 2 (Educational Programme of Teacher Training (60 ECTS))¹³				
Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Programme Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise ¹⁴	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction ¹⁵	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Total number of academic staff	9	9	9	9
- Professor	5	5	5	5
- Associate Professor	4	4	4	4
- Assistant-Professor	0	0	0	0
- Assistant	0	0	0	0
Invited Staff	4	0	0	–
Scientific Staff	6	6	6	–

Evidences/Indicators

- Bachelor Master Integrated Educational Programme of Teacher Training for Primary Studies of General Education (300 ECTS) and syllabi;
- Educational Programme of Teacher Training (60 ECTS and syllabi);
- Personal files of staff;
- Personnel Management Policy Document;
- The rule for planning, designing, implementing and development of education programmes;
- Methodology for determining the number of academic and invited staff of the university;
- Self-evaluation report;
- Interview results.

¹³ In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

¹⁴ Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

¹⁵ Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

General recommendations of the cluster:

- The HEI should support its staff to improve the English language competence that would be highly beneficial for the further development of these programmes, for enhancing scientific achievements of academic personnel, for strengthening the international collaboration.
- The HEI should elaborate a mechanism to control the workload of the academic and invited staff of the programmes considering their workload in other HEIs as well.
- The HEI should support its academic personnel to enhance their scientific productivity, especially for publishing papers in high-ranking scientific journals and participating in scientific grant projects.

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

.....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component	4.1	Human resources	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1 (title, level)			<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (title, level)			<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

4.2 Qualification of Supervisors of Master's and Doctoral Students

The Master's and Doctoral students have qualified supervisor/supervisors and, if necessary, co-supervisor/co-supervisors who have relevant scientific-research experience in the field of research.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

This component applies only to the Bachelor Master Integrated Educational Programme of Teacher Training for Primary Studies of General Education (300 ECTS).

The qualification requirements of Master thesis supervisors and other procedural issues related to the defense are regulated by the "Provision of the Master's Studies". The academic staff has years of experience in supervising master's students.

The conditions for the fulfilling the research component, specificities of evaluation, defense and other requirements are written in the regulation of the educational process.

Programme 1 (Bachelor Master Integrated Educational Programme of Teacher Training for Primary Studies of General Education (300 ECTS))¹⁶			
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	These supervisors	Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction ¹⁷	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	10	10	10
- Professor	7	7	7
- Associate Professor	3	3	3
- Assistant-Professor	0	0	0
Invited Staff	0	0	–
Scientific Staff	0	0	–

¹⁶ In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

¹⁷ Theses supervisors having a PhD degree relevant to the qualification awarded by the educational programme.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Bachelor Master Integrated Educational Programme of Teacher Training for Primary Studies of General Education (300 ECTS))

There was no information given in the Appendix of the self-evaluation report of HEI about supervisors of Master thesis of Bachelor Master Integrated Educational Programme of Teacher Training for Primary Studies of General Education (300 ECTS). During the interviews this fact was explained by not having students for this level as only freshmen and sophomores are studying at this moment. They suppose that the same academic personnel will be supervisors as well. During the visit the experts panel asked to submit information about potential supervisors. HEI submitted the required information declaring that 10 academic personnel is proposed to supervise Master theses. Their CV proves their relevance and competence to help students to achieve learning outcomes of Master thesis.

Function of Master thesis supervisor are clearly described in the Master thesis syllabus.

Evidences/Indicators

- Bachelor Master Integrated Educational Programme of Teacher Training for Primary Studies of General Education (300 ECTS);
- Master thesis syllabus;
- Functions of the Master thesis supervisor;
- Regulatory Rule on the Study Process of St. Tbel Abuseridze Teaching University;
- Master thesis proposed supervisors' personal files;
- Self-evaluation report;
- Interview results.

General recommendations of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

.....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component	4.2	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Qualification of supervisors of master's and doctoral students					
Programme 1 (title, level)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (title, level)		<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

4.3 Professional Development of Academic, Scientific and Invited Staff

- The HEI conducts the evaluation of programme staff and analyses evaluation results on a regular basis.
- The HEI fosters professional development of the academic, scientific and invited staff. Moreover, it fosters their scientific and research work.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

HEI states that it regularly conducts surveys and evaluations of these programmes' staff to identify the needs for their development. However, the analysis of the results is not given. The only information included in the submitted documentation shows that the survey was conducted recently, in the spring

semester of 2021-2022 academic year. It was identified that the academic staff needs some support to participate in international conferences. Based on this survey, it was decided to organize seminars and conferences for the staff. The plan was agreed to hold 10 seminars starting from September 2022 to December 2022. Some of the seminars are already conducted. There is high need to foster professional development of the academic, scientific and invited staff, including their scientific and research work. The HEI should conduct the evaluation of programme staff performance and analyse evaluation results on a regular basis.

During the interviews it was revealed that the academic staff is supported financially to publish books, participate in the international scientific conferences, but only a few cases were mentioned that is not enough to enhance the academic, scientific and invited staff scientific performance. Invited lectures are not financed.

Evidences/Indicators

- Development plan of the academic and invited personnel;
- The information about conducted trainings;
- The academic staff's participation statistics in conferences, trainings, workshops, etc.;
- Self-evaluation report;
- Interview results.

General recommendations of the cluster:

- The HEI should regularly support professional development of the academic, scientific and invited staff.
- The HEI should conduct the evaluation of programme staff performance and analyse evaluation results on a regular basis. The evaluation should consider their teaching workload and research output.

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the education programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any): Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes

Programme 1 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

.....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 4.3 Professional development of academic, scientific and invited staff	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1 (title, level)	<input type="checkbox"/>	x		<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (title, level)	<input type="checkbox"/>	x		<input type="checkbox"/>

4.4. Material Resources

Programme is provided by necessary infrastructure, information resources relevant to the field of study and technical equipment required for achieving programme learning outcomes.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Both programmes are provided with equipped classrooms, computer labs, field specific laboratories, gym and other necessary equipment to deliver educational process. The material resources of the programmes are basically the same. Material and information resources are accessible for students and staff. However, the internet speed was slow and worked with interruptions.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Bachelor Master Integrated Educational Programme of Teacher Training for Primary Studies of General Education (300 ECTS))

All obligatory literature indicated in the training courses is available in the library in printed form, with the possibility of using electronic resources as well. The expert panel randomly checked the books indicated in syllabi and the HEI presented all of them. There are 7 computers in the library connected with the internet. The internet connection was periodically interrupted, because of this the expert panel was not able to check the accessibility of scientific databases available for staff and students, g.e. Cambridge Journals Online, e-Duke Journals Scholarly Collection, etc.

At the interviews it was mentioned that during the pandemic, the educational process was conducted in online format without any troubles. The students and academic staff were provided with all necessary study resources.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 (Educational Programme of Teacher Training (60 ECTS))

All obligatory literature indicated in the training courses is available in the library in printed form, with the possibility of using electronic resources as well. The expert panel randomly checked the books indicated in syllabi and the HEI presented all of them. There are 7 computers in the library connected with the internet. The internet connection was periodically interrupted, because of this the expert panel was not able to check the accessibility of scientific databases available for staff and students, g.e. Cambridge Journals Online, e-Duke Journals Scholarly Collection, etc.

At the interviews it was mentioned that during the pandemic, the educational process was conducted in online format without any troubles. The students and academic staff were provided with all necessary study resources.

Evidences/Indicators

- Bachelor Master Integrated Educational Programme of Teacher Training for Primary Studies of General Education (300 ECTS) and syllabi;
- Educational Programme of Teacher Training (60 ECTS and syllabi);
- HEI material and information resources;
- Self-evaluation report;
- Interview results.

General recommendations of the cluster:

- The HEI should ensure that the available scientific databases are systematically accessible for staff and students.

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

.....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 4.4	Material resources	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1	(title, level)	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2	(title, level)	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

4.5. Programme/Faculty/School Budget and Programme Financial Sustainability

The allocation of financial resources stipulated in programme/faculty/school budget is economically feasible and corresponds to the programme needs.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The programmes grouped in the cluster are provided with corresponding budgets approved by the rector of the university. Tuition for both programmes is free. In particular, the teacher training programme (60 ECTS) is funded by the state, and the integrated bachelor-master educational programme of teacher training (300 ECTS) is fully funded by the university.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 - Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training primary studies of general education (300 ECTS).

The program is fully financed by the Patriarchate of Georgia. The income of the programme is 55 thousand GEL per year. The budget document provides for the following expenses: the remuneration of the academic and invited staff, the expenses of the administrative staff, maintenance and improvement of the scientific-technical base of the programme, expenses for professional and scientific development, expenses for staff incentives, etc. It should be mentioned that the budget document does not allocate funds for student conferences and support services, however, during the interview with the administration, the willingness to provide the program with additional funds and resources from the university budget was confirmed.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 - Educational Programme for Teacher Training (60 ECTS).

The teacher training programme is fully funded by the Government of Georgia. The income of the programme is 30 thousand GEL per year. The budget document provides for the following expenses: the remuneration of the academic and invited staff, the expenses of the administrative staff, maintenance and improvement of the scientific-technical base of the programme, expenses for professional and scientific development, expenses for staff incentives, etc. It should be mentioned that the budget document does not allocate funds for student conferences and support services, however, during the interview with the administration, the willingness to provide the program with additional funds and resources from the university budget was confirmed.

It is reasonable for both programmes that all potential sources of income and all components of expenses should be clearly written in the budget.

Evidences/Indicators

- Budget of Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (Rector's order №01-03/35. 27.12.2021);
- Budget of Teacher training educational programme (60 credits). (By the Rector's order №01-03/35. 27.12.2021);
- Self-evaluation Report;
- Results of the interview.
-

General recommendations of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

General suggestions of the cluster:

- It is reasonable for both programmes that all potential sources of income and all components of expenses should be clearly written in the budget.

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes: Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

Programme 1 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

.....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component	4.5	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme/faculty/school budget and programme financial sustainability					
Programme 1 (Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training primary studies of general education)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (Educational Programme for Teacher Training)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

4. Providing Teaching Resources	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1 (Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training primary studies of general education)		x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (Educational Programme for Teacher Training)		x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities

In order to enhance teaching quality, programme utilizes internal and external quality assurance services and also periodically conducts programme monitoring and programme review. Relevant data is collected, analysed and utilized for informed decision making and programme development.

5.1. Internal Quality Evaluation

Programme staff collaborates with internal quality assurance department(s)/staff available at the HEI when planning the process of programme quality assurance, developing assessment instruments, and implementing assessment process. Programme staff utilizes quality assurance results for programme improvement.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The quality assurance service is responsible for quality provision processes at the University, functions and working rules of which are defined by the legislation of Georgia, University charter, decree of the service and University internal regulations. Objectives and work of the service refer to: development of university internal policy for quality provision; participation in the process of development of a new educational programme; support to raise teaching/learning and scientific study quality; provision of compliance with authorization and accreditation standards; evaluation of educational programmes and university services; organization of development of questionnaires and interviews, analysis of the results and development of corresponding recommendations etc.

The quality assurance tools created at the University work based on the principles of the quality assurance system “Plan, Do, Check, Act”. Internal quality Evaluation of the programmes grouped in clusters is done based on the same principles.

The self-evaluation of the programmes presented and the documents attached confirm that leaders of the programmes and administration staff were actively involved in the process of development of the evaluation tools and in the evaluation provided. To evaluate both programmes the University has

developed an evaluation methodology for learning outcomes. It provides for both methods, direct (e.g. analysis of academic learning outcomes) and indirect (e.g. reports provided by students, academic and invited staff, graduates and interviews with employers). For the same reason data has been collected making use of a learning outcome evaluation form and data collection form for evaluation of a student to test the forms. Both will be fully introduced for evaluation of university programmes beginning next academic year. Noteworthy, the leaders of the programmes making the clusters have clear understanding of the internal quality provision tools while the academic and especially invited staff invited have not. It is reasonable the quality assurance service to carry out trainings for the academic and invited staff on planning process of the programme evaluation, development of evaluation tools and their involvement in the evaluation process.

Based on the self-evaluation reports and interviews outcomes, it is evident that parties concerned were engaged in the process of development and evaluation of programme targets, teaching/learning outcomes, curriculums and syllabuses in the framework of the working groups as well as by interviews with the academic staff, students and employers in prospect. Despite involvement of the parties concerned, teaching/learning outcomes of the cluster programmes require improvement and precision. It is important to describe the teaching/learning outcomes simply and clearly to make it possible to evaluate them objectively. It should be easy and clear to understand what a student is able to fulfill, words used should be not ambiguous and unclear like, “will comprehend”, “knows”, “is aware”, “has” etc. Based what has been said, it is recommended the quality assurance service to activate its work (trainings or working meetings) for invited and academic staff to better formulate teaching/learning evaluation outcomes (measurable proper active verbs to be used expressing actions); it will make easier to monitor and evaluate teaching/learning processes at later stage.

Worth of mentioning that outcomes of the interviews show reasonability to have the self-evaluation group actively involved in the process of development and updating educational programmes. The group includes administration, academic staff, students and employers. The self-evaluation group had a number of meetings in the framework of which they discussed programme targets, teaching/learning outcomes, issues related to self-evaluation reports like, data collecting and processing needed etc.

Evidences/Indicators

- Self-evaluation Report
- Reflections on evaluating programme outcomes
- Students' satisfaction survey
- Internal quality assurance tools
- Provision of Quality assurance service
- Evaluation of the distance learning process
- Results of the student survey about the programmes – 2021
- Evaluation of pedagogical activities of the staff_2021
- Results of the interview

General recommendations of the cluster:

- The quality assurance service should activate its work (trainings or working meetings) so that invited and academic staff can better formulate teaching/learning evaluation outcomes (measurable proper active verbs to be used expressing actions); it will make easier to monitor and evaluate teaching/learning processes at later stage.

General suggestions of the cluster:

- The quality assurance service should carry out trainings for the academic and invited staff on planning process of the programme evaluation, development of evaluation tools and their involvement in the evaluation process.

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any): Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes

Programme 1 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

.....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component	5.1 Internal Quality Evaluation	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1 (Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training primary studies of general education)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	

Programme 2 (Educational Programme for Teacher Training)

5.2. External Quality Evaluation

Programme utilizes the results of external quality assurance on a regular basis.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

External evaluation of the educational programmes represented in the cluster was done by the accreditation experts of the National Center for education quality development. The programmes have been given conditional accreditation. For the purpose of the external evaluation, the University intends to introduce peer review practice with participation of partner universities, graduates and parties concerned.

If necessary, description and analysis according to the education programmes

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training primary studies of general education (300 ECTS))

The institution has submitted a report of giving consideration to the experts' recommendations. According to the reports, a number of changes has been introduced into the programme, which touched upon both, programme targets and teaching/learning outcomes and curriculum and individual syllabuses. Consequently, the programme provides for content, volume and structure defined by the framework document of the field characteristics. According to the field characteristics teaching/learning outcome 3,4 and 5 of the programme have been modified. The outcome 6 "to complete and defend a master's degree work" has been replaced by "by developing research skills to plan complete research". Based on the external experts' recommendations, courses "academic writing", "recent researches in education" and "research methods in education" have been revised; the course "History of Georgia II" from elective subject of study was moved to the compulsory subjects' block, without changing its title. And, the rule of defending master's degree work was brought into line with the order N3 of the Minister of Education and Sciences.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 (Educational Programme for Teacher Training (60 ECTS))

The institution has represented report related to consideration of experts' recommendations, according to which the programme targets and teaching/learning outcomes have been modified and clarified. The teaching/learning outcomes have been brought into line with corresponding level description in the national qualifications framework and requirements of the field characteristics in the high education programme for preparation of teachers. To achieve teaching/learning outcomes content of teaching courses have been altered, which required revision of the course "current challenges in the education of a teacher", and the teaching course "theory of development of a person" has been replaced by the course

“teaching and development theories”. Besides, or the purpose of involvement of graduates and employers working meeting were arranged; they were interviewed and results obtained were reflected in the programme.

Evidences/Indicators

- Self-evaluation Repor
- Educational programmes
- External quality assessment and recommendation implementation report for 60 ECTS programme
- External quality assessment and recommendation implementation report for 300 ECTS programme
- Results of the interview

General recommendations of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

General suggestions of the cluster: Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any): Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes

Programme 1 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

.....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 5.2 External Quality Evaluation	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
---	--------------------------------	--	--	---------------------------------------

Programme 1 (Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training primary studies of general education)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (Educational Programme for Teacher Training)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

5.3. Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review

Programme monitoring and periodic evaluation is conducted with the involvement of academic, scientific, invited, administrative, supporting staff, students, graduates, employers and other stakeholders through systematic data collection, study and analysis. Evaluation results are applied for the programme improvement.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Programme monitoring and periodic evaluation is done in the University according to the rule and procedures established, which are described in the documents “Tools of evaluation of teaching quality development capacity”, “Monitoring and periodic evaluation panning” and “Rules and terms of developing, evaluating and developing academic high educational programmes”. Educational programmes monitoring and periodic evaluation aims at evaluating their implementation quality, teaching/learning and research processes, university services.

As evident from the self-evaluation reports, documents attached and results of the interviews, the most active form of programme monitoring and evaluation is interrogation of the parties concerned. According to the practice established in the institution, semester survey was completed of the students for the programmes presented; concerning material resources, remote learning and internationalization issues interrogation was carried out among students, academic and administration staff for the general university purposes. It has to be mentioned that with participation of students, academic staff, employers and graduates teaching/learning results of the programmes grouped in the cluster were studied. At a time, to evaluate and monitor programmes, needs study of the employers in prospect and employment market was carried out. However, the documents submitted reveal not much of the needs of employers and requirements of the market. They mostly cover age distribution of the primary school teachers started in the region and do not reflect needs of the education programmes for training teachers. The survey tool (e.g. the questionnaire submitted) requires improvement. It is recommended to carry out in-depth study of the labor market and needs of the programmes meant for training teachers for the programmes grouped in the cluster. And, to develop effective interrogation tools for the same reason.

To monitor the programmes, the University implements different activities every year and each semester, among them direct and indirect methods are used to evaluate teaching/learning results. During the interviews it became clear that the major tool used to evaluate teaching/learning results was monitoring of students’ academic success; during monitoring programme teaching/learning results of the number of students defined by target markers are supervised. We have to mention that the University has not

submitted an analysis of the academic achievements completed in the programme framework. In the process of the teaching/learning monitoring it is important and consequently recommended to have analysis of students' academic achievements done every semester as it can serve as a basis for essential changes to be made such as, change of the teaching course content, change of teaching and evaluating methods or evaluation forms etc.

It is important to mention that for the purpose of evaluating and monitoring the clustered programmes a map of compliance, curriculum map, a tool for evaluating teaching/learning outcomes and a data collection form have been developed for the programme targets and teaching/learning outcomes. The latter has been used to collect and analyze data of a student as an example in a pilot regime. Both programmes curriculum maps and teaching/learning outcomes evaluation tools are difficult to comprehend at a certain extent - the curriculum map which shows compliance of the programme teaching/learning outcomes and the compulsory course; to make it clear, it is advisable to indicate at what level result can be achieved each teaching/learning (familiarization, deepening, strengthening). Besides, it is desirable to develop one direct tool for evaluation of the teaching/learning outcomes for each programme, where results of the programme teaching/learning will be gathered along with compulsory teaching courses with corresponding activities, target markers, persons responsible for monitoring periodicity and monitoring teaching/learning outcome. Currently the mentioned data are scattered in a number of documents. Based on the aforesaid, it is desirable the quality assurance service to conduct training for the programme leaders and academic staff to develop more effective and easier comprehend direct tool to evaluate results of the programmes and their teaching/learning.

Evidences/Indicators

- Self-evaluation Report
- Educational programmes
- Internal quality assurance tools
- Provision of Quality assurance service
- Programme monitoring and periodic evaluation forms
- Results of the interview

General recommendations of the cluster:

- It is recommended to carry out in-depth study of the labor market and needs of the programmes meant for training teachers for the programmes grouped in the cluster. And, to develop effective interrogation tools for the same reason.
- It is recommended to have analysis of students' academic achievements done every semester as it can serve as a basis for essential changes to be made such as, change of the teaching course content, change of teaching and evaluating methods or evaluation forms etc.

General suggestions of the cluster:

- It is desirable the quality assurance service to conduct training for the programme leaders and academic staff to develop more effective and easier comprehend direct tool to evaluate results of the programmes and their teaching/learning.

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any): Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes

Programme 1 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

Programme 2 (title, level)

Recommendation(s):

Suggestion(s):

.....

Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 5.3. Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
Programme 1 (Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training primary studies of general education)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (Educational Programme for Teacher Training)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities	Complies with the requirements	Substantially complies with the requirements	Partially complies with the requirements	Does not comply with the requirements
---	--------------------------------	--	--	---------------------------------------

Programme 1 (Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training primary studies of general education)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (Educational Programme for Teacher Training)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Attached documentation (if applicable):

Name of the higher education institution: St. Tbel Abuseridze Teaching Unibversity of Patriarchate of Georgia

Title of Higher Educational Programmes, Levels: Bachelor master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education, level VII; Educational programme of teacher training, level VI

Compliance of the programmes with the standards

Contents Standard	1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme	2. Teaching Methodology and Organization, Adequate Evaluation of Programme Mastering	3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them	4. Providing Teaching Resources	5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities
Programme 1 Bachelor-Master integrated educational programme of teacher training Primary studies of general education (300 credits)	Is in compliance with the requirements	Is in compliance with the requirements	Is in compliance with the requirements	Is substantially in compliance with the requirements	Is substantially in compliance with the requirements
Programme 2 (Educational Program for Teacher Training (60 credits)	Is in compliance with the requirements	Is in compliance with the requirements	Is substantially in compliance with the requirements	Is substantially in compliance with the requirements	Is substantially in compliance with the requirements

Signatures

Chairperson of Accreditation Experts Panel

Full name, signature Milan Pol

Of the member(s) of the Accreditation Experts Panel

Full name, signature Diana Mtchedlishvili



Full name, signature Ketevan Todadze



Full name, signature Kristine Chikhladze



Full name, signature Jovana Ablotia

