**NATIONAL CENTER FOR
EDUCATIONAL QUALITY
ENHANCEMENT**

Accreditation Expert Group Report on Cluster of Higher Education Programs

Name of the Cluster of Educational Programs according to the Fields of Study of the Classifier

Bachelor Educational Programs:
1. Management (Major), 240 ECTS
2. Management (Major) (English), 240 ECTS
3. Management, 180 ECTS
4. Management (English), 180 ECTS

Master Educational Programs:
5. Management, 120 ECTS
6. Healthcare Policy and Management, 120 ECTS
7. Business Administration (English), 120 ECTS

Doctoral Educational Program:
8. Business Administration, 30 ECTS

Name of Higher Educational Institution

ILIA STATE UNIVERSITY

Evaluation Date(s)
14-17 August 2024

Report Submission Date

25 December 2024

Tbilisi

Contents

Information on the Higher educational Institution

Name of Institution Indicating its Organizational Legal Form	Ilia State University Legal Entity of Public Law
Identification Code of Institution	204861970
Type of the Institution	University

Expert Panel Members

Chair (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Carolina Timco, National Agency for Quality Assurance in Education and Research of Moldova, Republic of Moldova
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Eka Gegeshidze University of Georgia, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Ekaterine Natsvlishvili European University, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Maia Chincharashvili Georgian Railway, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Sandro Tabatadze, Tbilisi Ivane Javakhishvili State University, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, HEI/Organization, Country)	Giorgi Pareshishvili, Caucasus International University, Georgia

I. Information on the Cluster of Educational Programs

	Program 1	Program 2	Program 3	Program 4	Program 5	Program 6	Program 7	Program 8
Name of the educational Program	Management (Major)	Management (Major) (English)	Management	Management (English)	Management	Healthcare Policy and Management	Business Administration (English)	Business Administration
Level of higher education	6th level	6th level	6th level	6th level	7th level	7th level	7th level	8th level
Qualification to be awarded	Bachelor of Business Administration in Management	Bachelor of Business Administration in Management	Bachelor of Business Administration in Management	Bachelor of Business Administration in Management	Master of Business Administration in Management	Master of Business Administration in Healthcare Management	Master of Business Administration	Ph.D. in Business Administration
Name and code of the detailed field	0413 Management and Administration	0413 Management and Administration	0413 Management and Administration	0413 Management and Administration	0413 Management and Administration	0413 Management and Administration	0413 Management and Administration	0413 Management and Administration
Indication of the right to provide teaching of subject/subjects/group of subjects of the relevant level of general education[1]	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Language of instruction	Georgian	English	Georgian	English	Georgian	Georgian	English	Georgian
Number of ECTS credits	240	240	180	180	120	120	120	30
Program Status (Accredited/Non-accredited/Conditionally Accredited/New/International Accreditation)	Accredited	Accredited	New	New	Accredited	Accredited	Accredited	Accredited
Indicating Relevant Decision (number, date)	#07, 31/12/2018	#02, 05/01/2017	N/A	N/A	#08, 31/12/2018	#178 30/11/2018	#130 12/10/2018	#160 22/11/2018

---

[1] In case of Integrated Bachelor's–Master's Teacher Training Educational Program and Teacher Training Educational Program

▪ **General Information on the Cluster of Education Programs**

Accreditation has been conducted for eight study programs at the Ilia State University grouped in the cluster named Management:
- 4 Bachelor Educational Programs, as following:
    1. Management (Major), 240 ECTS
    2. Management (Major) (English), 240 ECTS
    3. Management, 180 ECTS
    4. Management (English), 180 ECTS
- 3 Master Educational Programs, as following:
    5. Management, 120 ECTS
    6. Healthcare Policy and Management, 120 ECTS
    7. Business Administration (English), 120 ECTS
- One Doctoral Educational Program:
    8. Business Administration, 30 ECTS

Ilia State University has been implementing in an accredited mode since 2011, and in a re-accredited mode since 2018: a) Bachelor educational program: Business Administration (Management, Banking and Finance, Tourism Management) (Majors); b) Master educational program: Business Administration (Management, Banking and Finance, Tourism Management); c) Master educational program - Health Care Policy and Management; d) Master educational program - Business Administration (English) and e) Doctoral Education program - Business Administration. In 2017, the faculty of Business, Technology and Education of Ilia State University launched the English Bachelor program Business Administration (Management, Banking and Finance, Tourism Management) (Majors).

Under the influence of external regulations and guiding documents (the Higher Education Sector Benchmarks Indicators for Business Administration and Management, the Law of Georgia on Higher Education, the National Qualifications Framework, and the Classifier of Fields of Study), the existing programs have been modified, leading to the following self-contained programs:
1. Bachelor program - Management (Major), 240 ECTS;
2. Bachelor program - Management (Major) (English), 240 ECTS;
3. Master program - Management, 120 ECTS;
4. Master program - Healthcare Policy and Management, 120 ECTS;
5. Master program - Business Administration (English), 120 ECTS;
6. Doctoral program - Business Administration, 30 ECTS.

Furthermore, in compliance with Order No. 206/N of the Minister of Education, Science and Youth of Georgia dated September 30, 2019, which grants higher educational institutions approval for the development of 180-credit bachelor's programs, Ilia State University created new Bachelor educational programs - Management, taught in Georgian, and Management, taught in English.

The programs grouped in the cluster are united under the detailed field of Management and Administration (0413) and are referring to the 6, 7 and 8 levels of qualification of the field of management and administration.

The volume and distribution of credits are as following:

- Bachelor programs - Management (Major) and Management (Major) (English), cumulate 240 ECTS each, i.e. - 60 ECTS - free component/general modules; 120 ECTS - major modules; 60 ECTS - free component/minor free components; the length of the programs is 4 years (8 semesters);
- Bachelor programs - Management and Management (English), cumulate 180 ECTS each, i.e. 60 ECTS - free component/general modules; 120 ECTS - major modules; the length of the programs is 3 years (6 semesters);
- Master programs - Management, Healthcare Policy and Management and Business Administration (English), cumulate 120 ECTS each, and the duration is 2 years (4 semesters);
- Doctoral program Business Administration, cumulates 30 ECTS, and the duration is 3-5 years.

The implementation of all 8 programs is located at the buildings S at the Kakutsa Cholokashvili Ave ⅗, Tbilisi, Georgia; and the programs are administered by the Faculty of Business, Technology and Education.

▪ **Overview of the Accreditation Site Visit**

Before the accreditation site visit, the members of the Expert Panel get access to the Self-Evaluation Report (SER) and supporting documentation (a detailed specification of the programs including curriculums, study plans, syllabi of the courses, lists and personal data of implementation staff, information on learning outcomes, evaluation, internal quality assurance mechanisms, etc.) in English and Georgian languages.

The Expert Panel conducted a site visit at the Ilia State University on August 14-17, 2024 according to the pre-developed agenda. The Panel performed the interview sessions with the following groups: the university/ faculty administration, the self-evaluation team, the academic and invited staff of all programs, the heads of the programs, the students and the alumni of all programs, the employers, and the QA service representatives. During the visit, the Panel requested additional documents, and the institution submitted them later.

At the end of the first day, the Panel received a tour at the university buildings and was introduced to the material and technical base available for the study process, including the library learning management system, the FabLab, and the lecture and practice rooms.

At the end of the fourth day, the Panel met with university representatives to present the initial findings. The visit was progressing in a collegial and constructive environment.
The Expert Panel would like to note a well-organized communication and collaboration among the departments and offices inside the University, and express its sincere thanks for the cooperation of all participants and their involvement in the discussions during the site visit.

▪ **Brief Overview of Education Program Compliance with the Standards**
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS

Standard 1: Substantially complies with Requirements
Standard 2: Substantially complies with Requirements
Standard 3: Complies with Requirements
Standard 4: Complies with Requirements
Standard 5: Complies with Requirements

Program 2. Management (Major) (English), Bachelor, 240 ECTS

Standard 1: Substantially complies with Requirements
Standard 2: Substantially complies with Requirements

Standard 3: Complies with Requirements
Standard 4: Complies with Requirements
Standard 5: Complies with Requirements

Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS

Standard 1: Substantially complies with Requirements
Standard 2: Substantially complies with Requirements
Standard 3: Complies with Requirements
Standard 4: Complies with Requirements
Standard 5: Complies with Requirements

Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS

Standard 1: Substantially complies with Requirements
Standard 2: Substantially complies with Requirements
Standard 3: Complies with Requirements
Standard 4: Complies with Requirements
Standard 5: Complies with Requirements

Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS

Standard 1: Complies with Requirements
Standard 2: Complies with Requirements
Standard 3: Complies with Requirements
Standard 4: Complies with Requirements
Standard 5: Complies with Requirements

Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS

Standard 1: Substantially complies with Requirements
Standard 2: Complies with Requirements
Standard 3: Complies with Requirements
Standard 4: Complies with Requirements
Standard 5: Complies with Requirements

Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS

Standard 1: Complies with Requirements
Standard 2: Complies with Requirements
Standard 3: Complies with Requirements
Standard 4: Complies with Requirements
Standard 5: Complies with Requirements

Program 8. Business Administration, Doctoral program, 30 ECTS

Standard 1: Substantially complies with Requirements

Standard 2: Complies with Requirements
Standard 3: Complies with Requirements
Standard 4: Complies with Requirements
Standard 5: Complies with Requirement

Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS; Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS; Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS &Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS:

Recommendations:

- 1.1.1. It is recommended the elaboration of the clearly defined objectives of Bachelor's programs in Management aimed to highlight the uniqueness and competitive advantages of each Bachelor program (180 ECTS and 240 ECTS) and clearly identify the key feature that differs the Bachelor programs in Management (Major, 240 ECTS) from Bachelor programs in Management (180 ECTS);
- 1.2.1. It is recommended to revise learning outcomes of the programs Bachelor programs in Management (major) and Bachelor program in Management (180 ECTS) in terms of compliance with the learning outcomes required to acquire a bachelor's degree and deepening graduates' competency (particularly, in area of operations; markets and finance) that are stated in Subject Benchmark for Higher Education in Management;
- 1.4.1. It is recommended to effectively achieve learning outcomes stated in the undergraduate programs, to revise the structure of all educational programs in Management in terms of optimization courses offered in General module and the enrichment of the content of Mandatory Courses namely business management subject-based (some subject-based elective courses can be replaced as mandatory as well). This revision is required to acquire a bachelor's degree and deepening graduates' competency in issues stated in the Subject Benchmark for Higher Education in Management;
- 1.4.2. It is recommended to bring programs into compliance with the Subject Benchmarks, Level I of Higher Education, VI Level of the National Qualification Framework, see https://eqe.ge/en/page/static/1028/biznesi-administrireba-da-samartali.

- 1.5.1. It is recommended to ensure revision of all courses to determine valid volume of credits, based on consideration of the course objectives and learning outcomes to be achieved, the topics to be covered, intensity, scope and complexity of the tasks to be completed, the volume and complexity of resources to be taught, and specifics of achievements' assessment;
- 1.5.2. It is recommended to revise syllabi of courses to define relevant assessment methods/tools for achieving and evaluating the stated learning outcomes of the courses effectively;
- 1.5.3. It is recommended to revise some syllabi (e.g. Foundations of HRM; Project Management Basics; Basics of Statistics; Essentials of Marketing; etc.) in terms of adding more relevant assessment forms (particularly, detail-described rubrics), for developing students' critical thinking, problem-solving and practical decision-making skills, and achieving course as well as program learning outcomes;
- 2.2.1. It is recommended to introduce the final thesis or create some other mechanisms for ensure program outcome achievements in order to fulfill the benchmark requirements.
- 2.3.1. It is recommended to revise syllabi (particularly, where team work/group presentation/project is applied as assessment method) in terms of detailed description of teaching methods and assessment tools / rubrics.

Suggestions:

- 1.4.1. It is suggested to revise curriculum of all undergraduate programs in Management and replace some major elective courses (e.g. - "Management Accounting Fundamentals", "Basics of Sales Management",

"Supply Chain Management", "Corporate Social Responsibility") and offer them as the Major Mandatory courses;

- 1.4.2. It is suggested to update the program and include more contemporary courses (or topics in courses) such as digital transformation of business/organizations, data analytics, strategic innovation and change management, etc.;
- 1.4.3. It is suggested to enhance the elective options that could provide students with more specialized knowledge and skills tailored to emerging industry needs and contemporary issues of modern organizational management;
- 1.4.4. To achieve the stated objectives more effectively and ensure graduates are truly prepared for the rapidly evolving business world, it is suggested to enrich program or relevant courses with the topics/issues related to the organizational development and change management; risk or/and crisis management; quality management; organizational leadership (etc.), that are becoming increasingly crucial in modern business operations and decision-making processes;
- 1.5.1. It is suggested to define basics of operation management as a prerequisite course for project management basics;
- 2.1.1. It is suggested that the University pay more attention to the planning mechanism and methodology operating in the University, to ensure an optimal ratio of students/ academic staff;
- 2.2.1. It is suggested to involve more students in research projects, in accordance with the Program learning outcomes;
- 2.2.2. It is suggested to add as a mandatory component of the assessment a semester project for 1-2 courses of the study programs;
- 2.2.3. It is suggested to introduce as mandatory the internship;
- 4.1.1. It is suggested that university pay attention to the retain of the academic staff;
- 4.1.2. It is suggested that university pay attention to the retain of invited staff;

Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS
Recommendations:

- 1.4.1. It is recommended to introduce courses which cover business legislation and taxation issues;
- 1.4.2. It is recommended that the course "Managerial Economics" has to be mandatory;
- 1.4.3. It is recommended to introduce the course Project Management, followed up by the course Agile IT Project Management;
- 1.4.4. It is recommended to bring programs into compliance with the Subject Benchmarks, Level II of Higher Education, VII Level of the National Qualification Framework, see https://eqe.ge/en/page/static/1028/biznesi-administrireba-da-samartali.

- 4.2.1. It is recommended to assure that all Master thesis supervisors hold a PhD degree.

Suggestions:

- 2.2.1. It is suggested to involve more students in university research projects, in accordance with the Program learning outcomes;
- 4.1.1. It is suggested that university pay attention to the retain of the academic staff;
- 4.1.2. It is suggested that university pay attention to the retain of invited staff.

Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS
Recommendations:

- 1.4.1. It is recommended to update the program results in order to meet the requirements of the Subject Benchmark for Higher Education in Management. In the program should be added the course whose results will be - Independently makes informed strategic decisions, considering ethics and legal regulations;
- 1.4.2. It is recommended to bring programs into compliance with the Subject Benchmarks, Level II of Higher Education, VII Level of the National Qualification Framework, see https://eqe.ge/en/page/static/1028/biznesi-administrireba-da-samartali.
- 1.5.1. It is recommended that the course of the research method pays the same amount of time to quantitative and qualitative research methods;
- 4.2.1. It is recommended to assure that all Master thesis supervisors hold a PhD degree.

Suggestions:

- 2.2.1. It is suggested to involve more students in university research projects, in accordance with the Program learning outcomes;
- 4.1.1. It is suggested that university pay attention to the retain of the academic staff;
- 4.1.2. It is suggested that university pay attention to the retain of invited staff.

Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS

Recommendations:
- 1.4.1 It is recommended to update the program in order to meet the requirements of the Subject Benchmark for Higher Education in Business Administration. In the program should be added the course whose results will be -Independently develops and/or manages projects in an unfamiliar and multidisciplinary environment;
- 1.4.2. It is recommended to bring programs into compliance with the Subject Benchmarks, Level II of Higher Education, VII Level of the National Qualification Framework, see https://eqe.ge/en/page/static/1028/biznesi-administrireba-da-samartali.

- 4.2.1. It is recommended to assure that all Master thesis supervisors hold a PhD degree.

Suggestions:

- 2.2.1. It is suggested to involve more students in university research projects, in accordance with the Program learning outcomes;
- 4.1.1. It is suggested that university pay attention to the retain of the academic staff;
- 4.1.2. It is suggested that university pay attention to the retain of invited staff.

Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS
Recommendations:

- 1.4.1. It is recommended to add courses, having as subjects teaching and assessments methods in higher education;
- 1.4.2. It is recommended to add courses that will assure the achievement of broad versatile business administrative research and knowledge creation competences;
- 1.4.3. It is recommended to assure that PhD students have and follow courses that cover both quantitative and qualitative research methods;

- 1.5.1. It is recommended to introduce some courses or components which create skills in other areas of the business administration, which are not doctoral students' main research directions;
- 2.2.1 It is recommended to introduce as mandatory courses on research methods and advanced teaching and learning methods;
- 2.2.2 It is recommended to introduce compulsory activities in the framework of the PhD program where PhD students have to present their research and to have feedback on their research.

Suggestions:

- 1.4.1. In order to assure a higher visibility of the PhD research it is suggested that before PhD defense, the PhD students have more than one publication and more conference participation as well.

Suggestions for the Program Development

Suggestions For cluster

○

- 1.3.1. It is suggested that the document on the evaluation mechanism of learning outcomes for each education program include clear and effective ways to ensure external stakeholders' engagement;
- 1.3.2. It is suggested that the benchmarks (50% of students achieve more than 50% of the maximum evaluation for a particular component) to be increased to ensure higher quality standards;
- 1.3.3. It is suggested that those overseeing the process ensure that the rubrics of the assessment instrument, as outlined in the syllabus, accurately and reliably measure the intended learning outcomes;
- 2.3.1 It is suggested that Teaching and Learning Methods of the program should be released by invited and local personnel fully;
- 3.1.1 It is suggested to diversify student services based on the study of their wishes to ensure that services cater to the diverse student population rather than adopting a one-size-fits-all approach;
- 3.2.1 It is suggested to strengthen research components on MA, as well as on PhD programs, particularly to enhance the quality of student works;
- 4.3.1 It is suggested that the university ensures its all-academic staff have their scientific profiles on various platforms such as Google Scholar, ResearchGate, ORCID, Scopus, and Clarivate;
- 4.4.1. It is suggested to provide more Georgian study readers to enhance student success, support and promotion;
- 5.1.1 It is suggested that students, graduates, and employers be directly represented as members of the self-evaluation group for the educational programs included in the cluster.

- **Brief Overview of the Best Practices (if applicable)**

1. Introduction of 180 ECTS programs, both in English and Georgian;
2. The concept and working principles of the scientific writing course at the doctoral level;
3. International Advisory Board for the Doctoral Program;
4. Mechanisms in place to promote the internationalization of doctoral program students;
5. Well-developed manual for the learning outcomes assessment mechanism;
6. Fruitful and trust-based collaboration between the university and faculty quality assurance offices;
7. The Business school's department members are not just a team but a community that actively collaborates and shares a common vision of 'quality' inspiring and motivating each other.

- **Information on Sharing or Not Sharing the Argumentative Position of the HEI**

The Expert panel examined the argumentative position of ILIA University on the draft report presented and concluded as following:

- The general evaluation for standard 1, for Doctoral Study program Business Administration is "Substantially Complies with requirements". In the previous report it was a technical error;
- We agree with the opinion of the University that the recommendation 1.4.1 is not apply for all the cluster, as it is not referring to doctoral program. The recommendation was moved to general recommendation for Master and Bachelor degree programs.
- In order to be more explicit for recommendation 2.2.1 for Bachelor programs it was presented in a new redaction "2.2.1 It is recommended to introduce the final thesis or create some other mechanisms for ensure program outcomes achievements in order to fulfill the benchmark requirements";
- We agree with the position of the University regarding the recommendations 4.1.1., 4.1.2 and 4.1.3. It was a technical error. The recommendations 4.1.1. and 4.1.2 was transferred to suggestions for Bachelor and Master programs, the suggestion 4.1.3 was removed;
- Referring to the number of students enrolled and the structure of academic staff analyzed by the expert panel and presented in substandard 2.1, the expert panel adapted to analyzed programs and presented it in a different redaction.
  Referring to the other observation the expert panel is not sharing the argumentative position of the university and made recommendations are maintained.

- **In case of re-accreditation, it is important to provide a brief overview of the achievements and/or the progress (if applicable)**

In the continuous evolution and enhancement of the educational programs of Ilia State University's management cluster, many adjustments and refinements have been implemented, encompassing their objectives, learning outcomes, structure, and substance. These revisions have been chiefly influenced by the National Qualifications Framework, the categorization of the field of study, and the sectoral benchmarks. Moreover, existing courses have undergone adaptation to incorporate the most recent developments and specialized knowledge. Notably, there has been a proliferation of mandatory courses across all levels of study, including Bachelor's, Master's, and Doctoral programs, alongside the introduction of practical and internship courses in certain instances. Furthermore, the enrichment of specific courses with new academic and invited faculty members has diversified the team responsible for program development, bringing in a wealth of diverse backgrounds and expertise.

Evaluation approaches for the accreditation experts:

The components of the accreditation standards are evaluated using the following two approaches:
1. Cluster and individual evaluation[2]
2. Cluster evaluation[3]

Standard/Component	Assessment approaches:
1. Educational Program Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Program	
1.1. Program Objectives	Cluster and individual
1.2 Program Learning Outcomes	Cluster and individual
1.3. Evaluation Mechanism of the Program Learning Outcomes	Cluster
1.4 Structure and Content of Educational Program	Cluster and individual
1.5 Academic Course/Subject	Cluster and individual
2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Program Mastering	
2.1. Program Admission Preconditions	Cluster and individual
2.2. The Development of Practical, Scientific/Research/Creative/Performing and Transferable Skills	Cluster
2.3. Teaching and Learning Methods	Cluster
2.4. Student Evaluation	Cluster
3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them	
3.1. Student Consulting and Support Services	Cluster
3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision	Cluster
4. Providing Teaching Resources	
4.1. Human Resources	Cluster and individual
4.2. Qualification of Supervisors of Master's and Doctoral Students	Cluster and individual
4.3. Professional Development of Academic, Scientific and Invited Staff	Cluster
4.4. Material Resources	Cluster and individual

---

[2] **Evaluation Approaches:** Describe, analyze, and evaluate the compliance of each educational program grouped in the cluster with the requirements of the corresponding component of the standard. Also, you can specify information about an educational program that is different from the common and basic characteristics of educational programs grouped in the cluster.

[3] **Assessment approaches: In case of necessity**, describe, analyze and evaluate compliance of each education program in the cluster with the requirements of this component of the standard. Also, you can indicate the information on the education program, distinguished from the general and major characteristics of the education programs in a cluster.

4.5. Program/Faculty/School Budget and Program Financial Sustainability	Cluster and individual
5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities	
5.1. Internal Quality Evaluation	Cluster
5.2. External Quality Evaluation	Cluster
5.3. Program Monitoring and Periodic Review	Cluster

1.	Educational Program Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Program

A Program has clearly established objectives and learning outcomes, which are logically connected to each other. Program objectives are consistent with the mission, objectives and strategic plan of the institution. Program learning outcomes are assessed on a regular basis to improve the Program. The content and consistent structure of the Program ensure the achievement of the set goals and expected learning outcomes.

Educational Programs grouped in a cluster are logically interrelated to each other in line with the study fields and evolve according to the respective levels of higher education.

1.1 Program Objectives

Program objectives consider the specificity of the field of study, level and an educational Program, and define the set of knowledge, skills and competences a Program aims to develop in graduate students. They also illustrate the contribution of the Program to the development of the field and society.

Cluster and individual evaluation

The cluster includes the following programs: 1. Bachelor Program: "Management (Major)" 2. Bachelor Program: "Management (Major)" (English) 3. Bachelor Program: "Management" 4. Bachelor Program: "Management" (English) 5. Master's Program: "Management" 6. Master's Program: "Healthcare Policy and Management" 7. Master's Program: "Business Administration" (English) 8. Doctoral Program: "Business Administration".

The aims of the cluster programs which are tailored to the unique characteristics and educational levels of each program, are aligned with the primary principles of Ilia State University's mission which is to generate, disseminate, and apply knowledge for the advancement of society and science. Notably, the programs provide a significant contribution to the development of the field and society in general, as they serve to create a solid foundation for public well-being and a groundwork for the management and research of societal processes.

In addition, each program is in line with the strategy of the Faculty of Business, Technology, and Education, which is focused on preparing highly competitive and in-demand professionals equipped with appropriate knowledge and skills for today's rapidly changing dynamic environment and are capable of successfully performing administrative and/or scientific-research activities in the corporate, academic, public or non-governmental sectors.

The objectives of the programs grouped in the cluster are clearly defined, realistic, and plausible. Considering the specificity of each program, both sectoral competencies and transferable skills are clearly defined in the curricula. It is worth noting that bachelor's programs place special emphasis on the acquisition of broad, sectoral knowledge and the development of practical and transferable skills, which are needed both for preparing a competitive workforce in the labor market, and for navigating the academic space and pursuing studies at a higher level. The master's programs focus on specialization in a particular field, acquisition of in-depth knowledge, and development of research skills. The doctoral program focuses on planning and conducting research to generate and disseminate new knowledge in the field while adhering to the principles of academic integrity.

To bring the programs closer to the requirements of the labor market, an external quality evaluation mechanism - the labor market survey - was employed. To ensure this, focus groups were conducted with potential employers, and an updated advisory board composed of individuals holding managerial positions in various companies carried out the evaluation of programs. The feedback provided by the advisory board and employers was used in the development/update of the cluster programs. The evaluators specifically emphasized the need for the promotion of practical and transferable skills and equipping students with modern/up-to-date knowledge in the field.

To synchronize with current teaching trends, and promote the internationalization of programs, the faculty employed the best international practices and peer evaluation from international experts. In addition, during the development process of the Master's program: "Business Administration" (English), the compliance of the program with the qualification requirements of the master's program of the partner Austrian university (Burgenland University of Applied Sciences) was reviewed and determined.

Furthermore, the cluster includes English undergraduate programs: "Management (Major)" and "Management", which admit international students parallel to local ones. The master's program "Business Administration", is developed and implemented in cooperation with the Burgenland University of Applied Sciences (Austria) and provides an opportunity for both local and international students to earn a double degree from both universities.

In addition, within the framework of cooperation with the Austrian University, the partner of the mentioned program, exchange visits of students and academic staff are periodically carried out and academic events are organized, which contribute to the establishment of international connections and sharing of experience.

Additionally, it is important to note that with the support of the Volkswagen Foundation and Georg-August University of Göttingen, an international doctoral school is operating at Ilia State University: https://internationaldoctoralschool.iliauni.edu.ge/. The goal of the school is to develop/implement joint international structured doctoral programs and internationalize existing doctoral programs, which is carried out by promoting the mobility of doctorates and academic staff/researchers to the partner university, as well as by providing international co-supervising and is completed by obtaining a double qualification.

Information related to the programs (objectives, results, course catalog and semester plan, admissions document, etc.) is placed on the official website of Ilia State University www.iliauni.edu.ge so their publicity and accessibility can be ensured. International applicants seeking to enroll in English programs can find the related information on the website: https://iliauni.edu.ge/en/international as well as on social media platforms of Ilia State University. In addition, the information related to the programs is available on various platforms for higher education programs (Times Higher Education, Bachelor Studies, Educations.com, etc.) and also shared with the consultants of external relations services of various institutions/organizations.

Description and Analysis

Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS
&
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS

The objectives of both Bachelor programs in Management are identical as they ensure graduates to be awarded the same qualification (only the language of program implementation is different). The program objectives are defined as realistic and achievable, reflecting the specific requirements of a bachelor's level education in business and management. In general, the objectives reflect on general demands of the labor market (both local and international) and consider the needs for transferable skills and adaptability in a global business environment. Moreover, they are aligned with the university's mission and focus on equipping students with liberal values, essential theoretical knowledge and practical skills needed for effective management and professional careers. In addition, each program strives to contribute to the development of the field by preparing graduates with a broad knowledge base and the ability to tackle business challenges. Thus, both programs aim to prepare competent professionals capable of assuming managerial positions and leadership roles in a rapidly expanding and highly competitive business environment, who will:
● be equipped with fundamental knowledge and skills related to organization management;

- possess a comprehensive grasp of the principles of entrepreneurship;
- demonstrate the capacity to employ critical and innovative thinking to identify and address business challenges.

Both programs lay the foundation for graduates to attain a prosperous professional career and/or pursue further academic endeavors at a more advanced level. Each program ensures students' active involvement in practical activities enabling them to refine and enhance their professional competencies and acquire significant working knowledge of the aspects of business ethics. The program's emphasis on practical and theoretical aspects, combined with its alignment with professional ethics and transferable skills, demonstrates its compliance with accreditation requirements.

In addition, the program allows students to broaden their cognitive and intellectual horizons, and cultivate transferable skills such as argumentation, quantitative reasoning, communication skills in Georgian and English, and academic work-related competencies.

Transparency in program objectives and stakeholder involvement further demonstrate its compliance with accreditation standards, ensuring that graduates are well-prepared for managerial job and management functions in the business sector. Supporting documents, including the self-evaluation report (SER), program descriptions, and stakeholder feedback, validate the program's alignment with accreditation standards.

Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS
&
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS

It should be mentioned that the objectives of the Bachelor's programs in Management (major), 240 ECTS are repeated in objectives of the Bachelor's programs in Management (180 ECTS) and do not identify the key points that differ the 240 ECTS Major programs from 180 ECTS Bachelor programs. Both programs aim is to prepare competent professionals capable of assuming managerial positions and leadership roles in a rapidly expanding and highly competitive business environment, who will:
- be equipped with fundamental knowledge and skills related to organization management;
- possess a comprehensive grasp of the principles of entrepreneurship;
- demonstrate the capacity to employ critical and innovative thinking to identify and address business challenges.

Both bachelor programs lay the foundation for graduates to attain a prosperous professional career and/or pursue further academic endeavors at a more advanced level. They (Georgian as well as English language bachelor program in management) ensure students' active involvement in practical activities enabling them to refine and enhance their professional competencies and acquire significant working knowledge of the aspects of business ethics.

In addition, programs allow students to broaden their cognitive and intellectual horizons, and cultivate transferable skills such as argumentation, quantitative reasoning, communication skills in Georgian and English, and academic work-related competencies.

Although the objectives of all Bachelor's programs in Management are defined as achievable, logically aligning with the university's mission, they do not contain enough specific information that clearly indicates unique features or competitive advantages of these bachelor's programs from other ones. Moreover, objectives of this 180 ECTS Bachelor's program do not identify the key points that differ the 180 ECTS Bachelor programs from 240 ECTS Major Bachelor programs in management.

Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS

The Master's program "Management" aims to prepare competitive professionals who are equipped with the latest knowledge and skills tailored to the ever-evolving and challenging modern business environment, and are capable of performing effective professional activities in various types of organizations based on profound and systematic theoretical, empirical and practical knowledge and who:
- have developed effective interpersonal and professional skills necessary for a successful leader;

- are equipped with a set of relevant competencies for change management;
- can solve complex problems related to organization management by using modern management approaches and techniques;
- act in compliance with ethical principles.

Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS

The Master's Program aims to develop a competitive specialist oriented towards the dynamic challenges of healthcare systems and the ever-evolving business environment and able to effectively respond to the growing demands of the field and, based on the acquired systematic theoretical, empirical, and practical knowledge, can:
- Act as a competent and independent specialist capable of defining and effectively implementing healthcare system management policies;
- Work independently on strategic planning, operations management, and development of a healthcare organization;
- Identify and analyze independently the challenges/problems facing healthcare system organizations and policy, and develop mechanisms and opportunities for meaningful outcomes and effective solutions;
- Substantiate/validate decisions made and outcomes achieved in professional and academic fields.

Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS

The program prepares intellectually curious professionals and well-rounded future leaders with relevant, up to date and empirically proven knowledge of cutting-edge business administration and skills to:
- create a game-changing impact in the workplace;
- find creative and credible solutions to complex real-world business problems;
- confidently lead in the face of ambiguity, unprecedented challenges and opportunities in the workplace.

Students enrolled in the Master's program "Business Administration" (English) have an opportunity to partake in a master's exchange program with Burgenland University of Applied Sciences (Austria) and, upon successful completion of all the requirements set by the universities, obtain a dual master's degree from both Ilia State University and Burgenland University of Applied Sciences.

Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS

The program aims to prepare a new generation of researchers capable of:
- Conducting innovative research by employing the latest methodologies in business administration to expand the current scholarly knowledge in the field or create new knowledge;
- Disseminating research results across the international scientific community and making themselves competitive both in academia and in businesses of the relevant profile (e.g., private, state, or non-governmental organizations) whose operations widely utilize the most recent research results.

Evidences/Indicators
- Component Program learning outcomes assessment mechanism;
- Curriculum map;
- Educational program/s;
- Self-evaluation report;
- Expert Panel's meeting with the head of the programs;
- Expert Panel's meeting with academic and invited staff;
- Expert Panel's meeting with representatives of quality assurance service;
- Expert Panel's meetings with students, graduates and employers of the programs.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the Programs:
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS
&
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS

Recommendation(s):

● 1.1.1. It is recommended the elaboration of the clearly defined objectives of Bachelor's programs in Management aimed to highlight the uniqueness and competitive advantages of each Bachelor program (180 ECTS and 240 ECTS) and clearly identify the key feature that differs the Bachelor programs in Management (Major, 240 ECTS) from Bachelor programs in Management (180 ECTS).

Evaluation

Component 1.1 - Program Objectives	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies the requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	X	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	X	☐	☐	☐

Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	X	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	X	☐	☐	☐

1.2 Program Learning Outcomes

➢ The learning outcomes of the Program are logically related to the Program objectives and the specificity of the field of study.

➢ Program learning outcomes describe knowledge, skills, and/or sense of responsibility and autonomy which students gain upon completion of the Program.

Cluster and individual evaluation

The learning outcomes of the cluster programs are aligned with the program objectives, which are reflected in the objectives and learning outcomes map.

The learning outcomes of the cluster programs are substantially based on Subject Benchmarks for Higher Education in Management and Business Administration, as well as other sector benchmarks and characteristics, which, in turn, ensures the relevance of the learning outcomes to the sector specifics and labor market requirements.

The learning outcomes of the program also correspond to the descriptors of the corresponding level of the National Qualification Framework, the qualification to be awarded, and the Classifier of the Fields of Study. In particular, the bachelor's educational programs grouped in the cluster demonstrate essential alignment with component 1.2 of the Program Learning Outcomes and meet key requirements for accreditation.

The design of these BA programs ensures that the learning outcomes are logically connected to the program objectives and appropriately reflect the specificities of their respective fields of study. In general, the learning outcomes substantially cover the essential knowledge, skills, and sense of responsibility and autonomy that students are expected to acquire upon completion and prepare graduates for relevant positions in various business organizations. Moreover, the Bachelor programs learning outcomes are measurable, achievable, and realistic. They are consistent with the appropriate level of qualification, detailed field descriptors, and the qualifications to be awarded.

Learning outcomes of the bachelor programs "Management (Major)", "Management (Major)" (English), "Management (180 ECTS)" and "Management (180 ECTS)" (English) are identical, being included in the cluster provide same basic, fundamental knowledge in the field, while the learning outcomes of the Master's programs "Management", "Healthcare Policy and Management", "Business Administration" (English) prioritize demonstrating comprehensive, in-depth knowledge of the fundamental tenets of the field, focusing on problem-solving and developing research skills necessary for independent research. As regards the doctoral program "Business Administration", its learning outcomes are focused on independent planning and implementation of innovative research in the field by using the most up-to-date research methodology.

The content of a program, its structure, and the combination of all its components ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes defined by the program, which is confirmed by the map of learning outcomes devised by each program. The learning outcomes of each program are measurable, achievable, and realistic. The learning outcomes of

the programs clearly define the knowledge, skills, responsibilities, and degree of autonomy required specifically for each level of the field.

The learning outcomes of the programs were established gradually through the active involvement of the programs' working groups, comprising heads of programs, the academic and invited staff involved in their implementation, and the Faculty and University administration. In constructing the learning outcomes, besides sector benchmarks and characteristics, each academic program incorporated the results of surveys with students, graduates, advisory boards, potential employers, and their recommendations.

While defining the learning outcomes, the program working groups also considered the needs, contemporary standards and requirements of the field, and common international practices, and following these considerations, practical skill-building activities and components became prioritized.

To share the learning outcomes of the programs with all interested parties (students, graduates, potential employers, partners, and others), the curricula of the programs are published on the university website and regularly updated to reflect if any modifications have been made to them. International applicants seeking to enroll in English programs can find all the related information on the website: https://iliauni.edu.ge/en/international as well as on social media platforms of Ilia State University. In addition, the information related to the programs is available on various platforms for higher education programs (Times Higher Education, Bachelor Studies, Educations.com, etc.) and also shared with external relations services of various institutions/organizations.

Description and Analysis

Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS

The program's learning outcomes are aligned with its objectives, providing students with comprehensive knowledge of contemporary management theories and fundamental disciplines of business; the basic principles and functions of business management; essential skills for identifying and analyzing environmental factors affecting the operation of organizations of diverse types and structures at both micro and macro levels.

Moreover, the program ensures that graduates can describe business planning stages, analyze business environments, and critically understand ongoing business events; perform functions relevant to a managerial position that require active involvement in the management of the organization's strategies, operations, projects, and initiatives; demonstrate basic knowledge and skills essential for entrepreneurship, which ensures the supply of new products and services in the competitive market; and etc.

Additionally, the learning outcomes are measurable, achievable, and realistic, aligning with the program objectives and substantial demands of the labor market.

Skills development is a significant aspect of this program, as students are trained to apply theoretical and practical knowledge to solve complex business problems. The program emphasizes the use of standard techniques to analyze business situations and prepare well-reasoned conclusions. Communication skills are also prioritized, with students expected to effectively present their presentations and/or practical projects to diverse stakeholders in both Georgian and English language using modern communication technologies. This focus on practical application and communication ensures that the graduates are well-prepared to meet the demands of the labor market and continue their education at higher levels. Responsibility and autonomy are integral components of the program, as students are encouraged to conduct business activities ethically and sustainably. The program also emphasizes personal and professional development, guiding students to identify their or others educational needs and plan for future growth.

In addition, it should be mentioned that this bachelor program outlines nine learning outcomes, which fully reflect the level-specific knowledge and skills defined by the Higher Education Sector Benchmarks for Management. The program graduate:

1. exhibits general and broad knowledge of contemporary management theories and fundamental disciplines of business;
2. articulates and analyzes dynamic environmental factors affecting the operation of organizations of diverse types and structures at both micro and macro levels;
3. performs functions relevant to a managerial position that require active involvement in the management of the organization's strategies, operations, projects, and initiatives.
4. locates and gathers necessary data from diverse relevant sources, conducts analysis of the data, and applies them to make well-informed decisions for the solution of complex problems;
5. selects and uses innovations and information communication technologies for effective management of business processes;
6. demonstrates basic knowledge and skills essential for entrepreneurship, which ensures the supply of new products and services in the competitive market;
7. observes the norms and principles of professional ethics;
8. establishes effective verbal and written communication in both Georgian and foreign languages with diverse stakeholders;
9. identifies both own and others' developmental needs and actively contributes to the planning of appropriate actions and strategies to effectively address these needs.

Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS

The program's learning outcomes are identical to the above-mentioned BA program's learning outcomes as the main difference between these programs is language of teaching and related issues. This bachelor program outlines nine learning outcomes, which reflect the level-specific knowledge and skills defined by the Higher Education Sector Benchmarks for Management.

Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS

The 180 ECTS Bachelor program in Management has the identical learning outcomes as the above-mentioned Bachelor's program in Management (major). Thus, the 9 learning outcomes that this program seeks to develop, align with the program's objectives and the specifics of business management field, and define essential knowledge and comprehension, basic skills, responsibility and autonomy that students are expected to gain upon completion, that is consistent with the qualifications level and field-specific requirements. Moreover, this alignment is evident in how the program emphasizes understanding modern management theories, analyzing business situations, and applying critical reasoning to business environments.

The description of how each course's goals correspond to the overall program objectives describes a structured approach to achieving these learning outcomes. The program includes a map of how objectives and learning outcomes correspond, ensuring that each course contributes to the overall goals.

As learning outcomes are formulated as achievable and measurable, the program structure and mandatory courses ensure their substantial achievement.

In terms of compliance with the standard the 180 ECTS Bachelor's program in management substantially meets the criteria.

Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS

The program's learning outcomes are identical to the learning outcomes of above-mentioned BA programs. The main difference between them in terms of learning outcomes is the language of teaching.

Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS

The Master's program outlines eight learning outcomes, which fully reflect the level-specific knowledge and skills defined by the Higher Education Sector Benchmarks for Management. The program graduate:

1.   Demonstrates profound and systematic knowledge of the concepts, theories, modern trends, and challenges of the main functional areas of business;

2.   Analyzes complex business problems by using modern management principles, methods, and technologies, identifies and assesses associated risks, and devise potential solutions or proposes relevant alternatives;

3.   Performs functions relevant to a managerial position, which involves the development as well as implementation and evaluation of business models, strategies, and projects;

4.   Plans organizational changes in response to the challenges of the internal and external environment by utilizing creative and innovative approaches;

5.   Plans and implements research independently by using modern approaches and innovative methods of the field while also adhering to the principles of academic integrity and ethics;

6.   Acts in compliance with the norms of professional ethics and adheres to legal and regulatory requirements;

7.   Establishes effective verbal and written communication by conveying ideas, arguments, and opinions persuasively and competently with representatives of both professional and academic communities;

8.   Takes responsibility for their own as well as their team members' professional development.

Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS

The program outlines six learning outcomes, which fully reflect the level-specific knowledge and skills defined by the Higher Education Sector Benchmarks for Management. A graduate of the Master's Program:

1.   Demonstrates profound and systematic knowledge of the latest theories, concepts, trends, and challenges in the field of healthcare policy and management;

2.   Analyzes and evaluates healthcare system management and policy as well as various local or global factors/risks affecting them and develop evidence-based solutions/recommendations;

3.   Evaluates human, financial, relevant communication, marketing, and public relations strategies and develops approaches required for the effective management of a medical institution;

4.   Analyzes and evaluates both state-run and non-state healthcare programs; independently plans/develops relevant programs and projects while adhering to the principles of bioethics and protection of patients' rights;

5.   Plans and conducts independent research using innovative approaches and the latest methods of the field while adhering to the principles of academic integrity and ethics;

6.   Establishes effective verbal and written communication with both the general and professional community by conveying well-reasoned assumptions, arguments, and ideas.

Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS

The program outlines five learning outcomes, which reflect the level-specific knowledge and skills defined by the Higher Education Sector Benchmarks for Business Administration. The program graduate:

1. Demonstrates solid knowledge of advanced concepts and contemporary theories across all the major disciplinary areas of business, including finance, accounting, economics, statistics & business analytics, business strategy, marketing, responsible management and operations management;

2. Applies novel business principles and a combination of quantitative and qualitative reasoning for the provision of innovative, credible, ethical solutions to organizational and real-world pressing, complex business problems;

3. Conducts research to explore critical problems in business administration, collects and analyzes relevant business data using appropriate methodologies.

4. Exhibits effective management, leadership and critical thinking skills for managing diverse teams and accomplishing goals in different types of organizations;

5. Effectively demonstrates professional written and verbal communication skills with a diverse audience.

Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS

The program outlines four learning outcomes, which reflect the level-specific knowledge and skills defined for the doctoral level. A graduate of the Business Administration Doctoral Program:

1. Exhibits a profound knowledge/understanding and critical analysis of the latest theories and advancements in the selected research area of business administration;

2. Plans and implements innovative research independently by using the most recent research methodology while adhering to the principles of academic integrity;

3. Shares new knowledge with the scientific community by establishing effective oral and written communication, including having their scholarly work published in an international peer-reviewed journal;

4. Transfers knowledge in the process of classroom teaching.

Evidences/Indicators
- Component Program learning outcomes assessment mechanism;
- Curriculum map;
- Educational program/s;
- Self-evaluation report;
- Expert Panel's meeting with the head of the programs;
- Expert Panel's meeting with academic and invited staff;
- Expert Panel's meeting with representatives of quality assurance service;
- Expert Panel's meetings with students, graduates and employers of the programs.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and suggestions according to the Programs:

Program 1. Management, Bachelor (Major), 240 ECTS,
Program 2. Management, Bachelor (Major), English 240 ECTS,
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS
&
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS

Evaluation

Component 1.2 Program Learning Outcomes	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	X	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	X	☐	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	X	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	X	☐	☐	☐

1.3 Evaluation Mechanism of the Program Learning Outcomes

➢ Evaluation mechanisms of the Program learning outcomes are defined. The Program learning outcomes assessment process consists of defining, collecting and analyzing data necessary to measure learning outcomes.
➢ Program learning outcomes assessment results are utilized for the improvement of the Program.

Cluster and individual evaluation

The evaluation system for the educational programs in the management cluster is comprehensive. It involves regular assessment of teaching and scientific research components, considering the specific field (Management and business administration) and the academic level (bachelor's, master's, and doctoral). The documentation indicates how each program's learning outcomes are measured through teaching courses, scientific research, and evaluation methods. Furthermore, each situation includes a defined evaluation period and sets specific target goals. In particular, the evaluation components for mandatory introductory teaching courses are outlined to effectively gauge the results of comprehensive knowledge acquisition in the field.

Regarding the benchmarks, in most programs, more than 50% of the students achieved scores that exceed 50% of the maximum evaluation for a specific component. Since the learning outcomes of these programs have not been evaluated yet, it is not easy to demonstrate the significance of these expected quantitative measures. However, setting higher benchmarks for learning outcomes is preferable unless mechanisms normalize it when half of the students fail.

To explain the mechanism mentioned above, let us take an example of one of the learning outcomes of the BA program in Management: "Articulate and analyze dynamic environmental factors affecting the operation of organizations of diverse types and structures at both micro and macro levels." As per the provided documents, this learning outcome will be assessed through the final exam of the Principles of Macroeconomics course. Furthermore, it has been decided that the assessment will take place in the third semester (once students have completed the mentioned course), and the target benchmark is set at 50% of students achieving at least 50% of the specified grade for this component. According to the syllabus, the final exam will comprise 30 multiple-choice questions, which may not fully assess the "articulation" and "analysis" skills. It is crucial for those responsible for evaluating learning outcomes to regularly ensure that the rubrics align with the assessment mechanism for learning outcomes, as this alignment is not just necessary, but vital for effective evaluation.

Based on the documents and interviews, it is evident that the university's quality assurance service and faculty actively participated in creating a mechanism to evaluate the educational program's learning outcomes. Their active involvement underscores their integral role in the process, and the manual they created serves as a helpful document and support tool for the academic and invited staff engaged in the program. It is likely why most of them were familiar with the learning outcomes assessment mechanism.

However, it is important that this indicator covers all program implementers. Although analyzing learning outcomes is a mechanism for improving educational programs, the presented document does not clearly show how external stakeholders are involved in assessing learning outcomes. Their involvement is crucial to ensure a comprehensive and inclusive evaluation process.

Evidences/Indicators
- Component Program learning outcomes assessment mechanism;
- Curriculum map;
- Educational program/s;
- Self-evaluation report;
- Expert Panel's meeting with the head of the programs;
- Expert Panel's meeting with academic and invited staff;
- Expert Panel's meeting with representatives of quality assurance service;
- Expert Panel's meetings with students, graduates and employers of the programs.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A
General suggestions of the cluster:

● 1.3.1. It is suggested that the document on the evaluation mechanism of learning outcomes for each education program include clear and effective ways to ensure external stakeholders' engagement.

● 1.3.2. It is suggested that the benchmarks (50% of students achieve more than 50% of the maximum evaluation for a particular component) to be increased to ensure higher quality standards.

● 1.3.3. It is suggested that those overseeing the process ensure that the rubrics of the assessment instrument, as outlined in the syllabus, accurately and reliably measure the intended learning outcomes.

Evaluation

Component 1.3 Evaluation Mechanism of the Program Learning Outcomes	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	X	☐	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	X	☐	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	X	☐	☐	☐
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	X	☐	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	X	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	X	☐	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	X	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	X	☐	☐	☐

1.4. Structure and Content of Educational Program

➢The Program is designed according to HEI's methodology for planning, designing and developing of educational Programs.

➢The Program structure is consistent and logical. The content and structure ensure the achievement of the Program learning outcomes. The qualification to be awarded is corresponding to the Program content and learning outcomes.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Ilia State University has "Rules and Procedures for Developing, Approving, Amending and Canceling Educational Programs" the programs are prepared according to the documents. The Program is designed in accordance with the legislation of Georgia and ECTS - European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System. The programs are placed in the web of the university, and HEI ensures the publicity and availability of the information on the program. Program development is a collaborative process and engages all stakeholders (academic / research / visiting staff, students, graduates, employers, etc.).

In general, all undergraduate educational programs in Management within the cluster demonstrate substantially compliance with the criteria for program structure and content. The collaborative and transparent process for program development, along with the integration of feedback from a wide range of stakeholders, mostly supports the achievement of program learning outcomes. However, there are areas that require ongoing attention and improvement, particularly in terms of optimizing general module courses, strengthening the business management subject-based mandatory courses and updating the program content to reflect the latest industry developments.

Description and Analysis

Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS

The Bachelor's program in Management (major) is structured to support the achievement of the stated learning outcomes. The program is elaborated based on the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS) and corresponds to the student's academic load required to achieve the goals of the educational program. The volume of this undergraduate program is 240 ECTS credits (6000 hours in total – as 1 credit includes 25 astronomical hours and includes contact and independent work hours). The logical sequence of the formation of competencies to be achieved within the framework of the bachelor's program determines the content, structure and curriculum of the bachelor's program.

The duration of the study is 4 years (8 semesters). In the 1st and 2nd semesters of the program, students study the Free component General Module Courses (Introduction to Modern Thought I, Introduction to Contemporary Thought II, Academic Work Techniques, Practical English Course, Elements of Practical Mathematics, Mathematics for Business and Business Fundamentals) which aim to broaden students' horizons and develop transferable skills essential to navigate the academic environment. Furthermore, it is notable that starting from the very first semester, students engage in mandatory courses in the major study area, such as Principles of Microeconomics and Principles of Macroeconomics. From the 3rd semester of study, students have the opportunity to either select a Minor or enroll in courses offered by a wide range of bachelor's programs with a volume of 60 credits as part of the free component.

The program structure is the following:
- Free Component: General Module - 60 credits;
- Major Field of Study - 120 credits:
- Mandatory courses module - 96 credits;
- Elective courses module - 24 credits.
- Free components/Minor - 60 credits (Students can alternatively complete 60 credits within additional free component elective courses).

The curriculum substantially covers a range of courses including management, marketing, finance and economics, and more. This comprehensive coverage ensures that students gain in-depth knowledge across various aspects of business management. The inclusion of the 6 credits Practical Entrepreneurship course in the program helps students apply theoretical knowledge in real-world settings. Moreover, students have an opportunity to select an internship that is

offered as an elective course in the program. Thus, this program is designed as student-centered, students of this program have the opportunity to create their own profiles by combining compulsory, optional, or free study courses of the specialty.

The study courses provided by the bachelor's program are mostly directed to the achievement of the objectives set in the program and to the formation of competencies corresponding to acceptable qualifications as a result of studies.

However, there are areas that require ongoing attention and improvement, particularly in terms of revising the structure of Bachelors' programs to ensure the achievement of learning outcomes; to update and enhance the program content with teaching core courses or topics/issues related to: operations, supply chain and quality management, sales management, financial management, as well as to reflect the latest industry developments. To achieve the stated outcomes more effectively, the structure of the educational program should be revised optimization of courses offered in Free Component: General Module - to increase the Major component of Mandatory Courses that are oriented on development subject-specific knowledge and skills important for the successful performing in contemporary business world and dealing with the management issues. To be more specific - for example, students take 2 courses in Introduction in Modern Thought (volume of each is 6 ECTS credits), while management-subject courses offered as mandatory courses within the major area of study are not enough to cover such critical issues as: legal regulation on business, financial analysis and managerial accounting, supply chain, sales management, digital marketing; organizational development and change management, managing risks or crisis, quality management issues or other topics/key issues related to the business management and managerial decision-making processes. The mentioned areas/issues are becoming increasingly crucial in modern business operations and decision-making processes. Furthermore, the program must ensure that graduates are truly prepared for the rapidly evolving business world without exposure to these emerging technologies and methodologies that are reshaping industries globally.

While considering the structure of this program (as well as other undergraduate programs in Management within the cluster) it is not clear enough - how does the program ensure that the credits of General component, including free component electives from any educational program, align with and contribute to the overall learning outcomes of the Management degree. Thus, to achieve effectively learning outcomes stated in the undergraduate programs, the structure of all educational programs in Management should be revised in terms of optimization courses offered in General module and enrichment content of subject-based Mandatory Courses, (or some elective courses can be replaced as mandatory), that are required to acquire a bachelor's degree and deepening graduates' competency (particularly, in area of operations - operations and quality management; supply chain management and logistics; markets: development and operation of financial, commodity, and service markets; customer expectations, service, and focus; the competitive environment, market structure, and organizational activities; finance – funding sources, use and management of financial resources; utilization of financial information and information systems for management purposes, etc.) that are stated in Subject Benchmark for Higher Education in Management.

Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS

It should be mentioned that as both programs are the same (the teaching language is considered as a main difference between these two programs), the logical sequence of the formation of competencies to be achieved within the framework of this bachelor's program that determines the content, structure and curriculum is similar to the above-mentioned BA program.

It is notable that within the parameters of the general module of the free component, international students can study Georgian (12 credits) and improve their English language competences (12 credits), while local students have the opportunity to develop competence in another foreign language (12 credits).

While considering the structure and contents of this undergraduate program similar to the above-mentioned program, should be identified the same areas that require ongoing attention and improvement. Thus, to achieve the stated outcomes more effectively, the structure of the educational program should be revised in terms of optimization of offered courses, particularly, the Major component of Mandatory Courses should be increased.

Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS

The volume of this undergraduate program in "Management" is 180 credits (4500 hours in total) that include contact and independent work hours. Credit allocation also adheres to the ECTS, with appropriate distribution and workload for students across semesters that correspond to the student's academic load required to achieve the goals of the educational program. The logical sequence of the formation of competencies to be achieved within the framework of the bachelor's program determines the content, structure and curriculum of the bachelor's program. Also, the program's content and structure take into account various factors, including labor market requirements and stakeholder feedback, indicating a collaborative development process. Design of this undergraduate program aligns with the stated objectives, preparing graduates to address general market demands and key challenges through modern management practices. This program also integrates theoretical knowledge with practical skills, emphasizing key basic competencies to enhance professional activities. The coherence between the stated learning outcomes, program's structure and content is evident. Moreover, the structure of this program is substantially consistent and logical, and mostly ensures the substantial achievement of learning outcomes.

The duration of the study is 3 years (6 academic semesters). In the 1st and 2nd semesters of the program, students study the Free component General Module Courses (Introduction to Modern Thought I, Introduction to Contemporary Thought II, Academic Work Techniques, Practical English Course, Elements of Practical Mathematics, Mathematics for Business and Business Fundamentals) which aim to broaden students' horizons and develop transferable skills essential to navigate the academic environment. Furthermore, it is notable that starting from the very first semester, students engage in mandatory courses in the major study area, such as Principles of Microeconomics and Principles of Macroeconomics.

Program has the following Structure:
- Free Component: General Module - 60 credits;
- Major Field of Study - 120 credits:
- ✔ Mandatory courses module - 96 credits;
- ✔ Elective courses module - 24 credits.

The qualification to be granted is substantially consistent with the content and learning outcomes of the program, aligning with the National Qualifications Framework.

While considering the structure and content of this undergraduate program, the similarities between the above-mentioned programs are clearly visible. Thus, to achieve the stated outcomes more effectively, it should be noted that above-mentioned issues are identified as areas that require ongoing attention and improvement.

Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS

It should be mentioned that as both 180 ECTS Bachelor's programs are the similar, (the teaching language is considered as a main difference between these two programs), the logical sequence of the formation of competencies to be achieved within the framework of this bachelor's program that determines the content, structure and curriculum is similar to the above-mentioned BA program.

It is worth noting that within the parameters of the general module of the free component, international students can study Georgian (12 credits), in addition to improving their English language competence (12 credits), while local students have the opportunity to develop competence in another foreign language (12 credits). Thus, to focus on program development for achieving the stated outcomes more effectively, above-mentioned areas should be considered as issues that require revision and improvement.

Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS

The Master's Program "Management" volume is 120 credits. Language of study is Georgian.
The duration of the study is 2 years. The program structure is divided by semester, the distribution is logical, sequential and serves to achieve the aims and learning outcomes provided by the program.

Program Structure:
- Mandatory courses - 78 credits
- Elective courses - 24 credits
- Master's Thesis - 18 credits

The last academic semester is devoted to work on the master's thesis, whereby the student identifies a problematic issue in the field of business and conducts independent research to address it, utilizing the most recent methodologies and principles of academic integrity.

Even though the Program structure is consistent and logical, the content and structure ensure partial achievement of the Program learning outcomes. For example, the outcome - "Acts in compliance with the norms of professional ethics and adheres to legal and regulatory requirements" – is covered by the courses: Strategic Management; Marketing Management; Technology and Innovation Management; Leadership; Agile IT Project Management; Research Methods and Strategic Human Resources Management, but there are no courses referring to business legislation issues necessary to cover the legal part of the mentioned outcome.

There are courses, for example - "Agile IT Project Management" which is more subject-specific, but there is no general course, such as Project management, for example, for this specific course. It is recommended to have a more general course and then to go to more specific ones.

For better achievement of the program outcomes the course "Managerial Economics" should be mandatory.

Based on the analysis of the Program content and learning outcomes, the qualification to be awarded is not fully ensured.

Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS

The Master's Program "Healthcare Policy and Management" volume is 120 credits. The study language of the program is Georgian.

The duration of the study is 2 years. The program structure is divided by semester, the distribution is logical, sequential and serves to achieve the aims and learning outcomes provided by the program.

Program Structure:
- Mandatory courses - 78 credits
- Elective courses - 24 credits

- Master's Thesis - 18 credits

The last academic semester is devoted to work on the master's thesis, whereby the student identifies a problematic issue in the field of business and conducts independent research to address it, utilizing the most recent methodologies and principles of academic integrity.

Even though the Program structure is consistent and logical, the content and structure ensure the partial achievement of the Program learning outcomes, based on the requirement of the Benchmark for Higher Education in Management.

For example, according to the mentioned Benchmark the graduator "Independently makes informed strategic decisions, considering ethics and legal regulations". The program has the course "Health Law and Bioethics", which partially covers legal regulation, as it doesn't include subjects on business law or taxation which are mandatory for study programs in management.

Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS

The volume of the Master Program "Business Administration" (English) is 120 credits. Language of study is English.

The duration of the study is 2 years. The program structure is divided by semester, the distribution is logical, sequential and serves to achieve the aims and learning outcomes provided by the program.

Program Structure:
- Mandatory courses - 72 credits
- Elective courses - 30 credits
- Master's Thesis - 18 credits

The last academic semester is devoted to work on the master's thesis, whereby the student identifies a problematic issue in the field of business and conducts independent research to address it, utilizing the most recent methodologies and principles of academic integrity.

The English Master's Program in Business Administration has been developed in close cooperation with Burgenland University of Applied Sciences (Austria). The program operates Since 2017, students of both Ilia State University and Burgenland University of Applied Sciences have been provided the opportunity to study at a partner university for one semester and receive a double degree: "Master of Business Administration" as defined by the Master's Program, and "Master of Arts in Business" - qualification awarded under the Burgenland Program. Student mobility occurs in the 2nd and 3rd semesters, and to ensure that the curricula of the partner universities are synchronized, a program compatibility table was revised and developed.

Even though the Program structure is consistent and logical, the content and structure ensure the partial achievement of the Program learning outcomes, based on the requirement of the Benchmark. Based on the analysis of the program structure and content, one of the outcomes listed in the Benchmark for Higher Education in Business Administration is not covered, namely - *Independently develops and/or manages projects in an unfamiliar and multidisciplinary environment.*

Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS

PhD Program in Business Administration comprises a total of 30 credits. Among them, 24 credits are allocated for mandatory courses/components, and the remaining six (6) credits are for elective ones.

From 24 ECTS, 18 ECTS are allocated to Assistantship, that can be realized through teaching assistantship or research assistantship; over 6 credits can be accumulated by the PhD student by choosing from following courses, each having 6 ECTS:

- Qualitative Data Analysis with Nvivo,
- Panel Data Analysis using Eviews,
- Time Series Analysis using EViews.

As a result, the Doctorate students can obtain quantitative or qualitative skills, not both.

The Doctorate student must follow up a mandatory training program on teaching and assessment strategies in higher education, developed by The Public and Private Development Centre (PPDC).

During the expert panel meeting, the program responsible mentioned that the course on teaching methods was excluded from the PhD program, as most PhD students have teaching experience at the moment of admission to the PhD program. In our opinion there is a contradiction, because teaching assistantship is mandatory, but the course on teaching and learning methods isn't.

Also, it should be mentioned that the program is not giving broad versatile business administrative research and knowledge creation competence, because in the structure of the program there are no courses or seminars which are not related to PhD thesis.

The doctoral candidate must have at least one scholarly article published in an international peer-reviewed thematic journal before defending the dissertation. The requirements regarding the publication component of the doctoral program are outlined in the document of the Dissertation Board and Doctoral School Regulations of the Faculty of Business, Technology, and Education of the LEPL Ilia State University. Also, PhD Students, before PhD defense, should have conference participation as well. Ilia University offers support in writing articles through its Academic writing center.

Evidences/Indicators
- Self assessment Reports;
- Educational programs;
- Program syllabuses;
- Curriculum map;
- Evidence of participation of stakeholders in the development of the Program;
- The website - https://iliauni.edu.ge/en/;
- Expert Panel's meeting with the head of the programs;
- Expert Panel's meeting with academic and invited staff;
- Expert Panel's meeting with representatives of quality assurance service;
- Expert Panel's meetings with students, graduates and employers of the programs

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestion of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and suggestions according to the Programs:

For all Bachelor and Master programs :

Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS

Recommendation(s):
● 1.4.1. It is recommended to effectively achieve learning outcomes stated in the undergraduate programs, to revise the structure of all educational programs in Management in terms of optimization courses offered in General module and the enrichment of the content of Mandatory Courses namely business management subject-based (some subject-based elective courses can be replaced as mandatory as well). This revision is required to acquire a bachelor's degree and deepening graduates' competency in issues stated in the Subject Benchmark for Higher Education in Management.
● 1.4.2. It is recommended to bring programs into compliance with the Subject Benchmarks, Level I of Higher Education, VI Level of the National Qualification Framework, See https://eqe.ge/en/page/static/1028/biznesi-administrireba-da-samartali.

Suggestion(s):
● 1.4.1. It is suggested to revise curriculum of all undergraduate programs in Management and replace some major elective courses (e.g. - "Management Accounting Fundamentals", "Basics of Sales Management", "Supply Chain Management", "Corporate Social Responsibility") and offer them as the Major Mandatory courses.
● 1.4.2. It is suggested to update the program and include more contemporary courses (or topics in courses) such as digital transformation of business/organizations, data analytics, strategic innovation and change management, etc.
● 1.4.3. It is suggested to enhance the elective options that could provide students with more specialized knowledge and skills tailored to emerging industry needs and contemporary issues of modern organizational management.
● 1.4.4. To achieve the stated objectives more effectively and ensure graduates are truly prepared for the rapidly evolving business world, it is suggested to enrich program or relevant courses with the topics/issues related to the organizational development and change management; risk or/and crisis management; quality management; organizational leadership (etc.), that are becoming increasingly crucial in modern business operations and decision-making processes.

Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS

Recommendation(s):
● 1.4.1. It is recommended to introduce courses which cover business legislation and taxation issues;
● 1.4.2. It is recommended that the course "Managerial Economics" to be mandatory.
● 1.4.3. It is recommended to introduce the course Project Management, followed up by the course Agile IT Project Management
● 1.4.4. It is recommended to bring programs into compliance with the Subject Benchmarks, Level II of Higher Education, VII Level of the National Qualification Framework, see
https://eqe.ge/en/page/static/1028/biznesi-administrireba-da-samartali.

Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS

Recommendation(s):

● 1.4.1 It is recommended to update the program results in order to meet the requirements of the Subject Benchmark for Higher Education in Management. In the program should be added the course whose results will be - *Independently makes informed strategic decisions, considering ethics and legal regulations*.

● 1.4.2. It is recommended to bring programs into compliance with the Subject Benchmarks, Level II of Higher Education, VII Level of the National Qualification Framework, see https://eqe.ge/en/page/static/1028/biznesi-administrireba-da-samartali.

Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS

Recommendation(s):

● 1.4.1 It is recommended to update the program in order to meet the requirements of the Subject Benchmark for Higher Education in Business Administration. In the program should be added the course whose results will be -*Independently develops and/or manages projects in an unfamiliar and multidisciplinary environment.*

1.4.2. It is recommended to bring programs into compliance with the Subject Benchmarks, Level II of Higher Education, VII Level of the National Qualification Framework, see https://eqe.ge/en/page/static/1028/biznesi-administrireba-da-samartali.

Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS

Recommendation(s):

● 1.4.1. It is recommended to add courses, having as subjects teaching and assessments methods in higher education;

● 1.4.2. It is recommended to add courses that will assure the achievement of broad versatile business administrative research and knowledge creation competences;

● 1.4.3. It is recommended to assure that PhD students have and follow courses that cover both quantitative and qualitative research methods.

Suggestion(s):

● 1.4.1. In order to assure a higher visibility of the PhD research it is suggested that before PhD defense, the PhD students have more than one publication and more conference participation as well.

Evaluation

Component 1.4 Structure and Content of Educational Program	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐

Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	☐	☐	x	☐

1.5. Academic Course/Subject

➢ The content of the academic course / subject and the number of credits ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes defined by this course / subject.

➢ The content and the learning outcomes of the academic course/subject of the main field of study ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the Program.

➢ The study materials indicated in the syllabus ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the Program.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Academic courses of the programs' cohort in the cluster mostly correspond to the learning outcomes of the academic course/subject of the main field of study, and they are mostly in line with Program learning outcomes.

Number of credits allocated for each teaching course/subject corresponds to the content and learning outcomes of this course/subject; the ratio between contact and independent hours is adequate and considers peculiarities of the course/subject.

Every learning outcome of each academic course/subject is assessed, assessment methods are mostly relevant for the course and program learning outcomes. But there the number of contact hours the academic courses of correspond to the content and learning outcomes of the course/subject. there are some cases when the content academic course / subject corresponds to the learning outcomes of this course / subject;

Description and Analysis

Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS
&
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS

The undergraduate programs within the cluster have been analyzed for compliance with accreditation standards, focusing on the alignment of course content, learning outcomes, and credit allocation. The content and structure of these programs appear to comply with the requirements specified in the educational standards, including adherence to European guidelines for ECTS credits.

In general, the learning outcomes for each course are aligned with both the program's overall objectives and the specific outcomes for each subject, ensuring that the educational goals are met comprehensively. The syllabi for these courses include detailed descriptions of teaching and assessment methods, learning outcomes, and course content, which are designed to achieve the objectives of each course effectively. The content of each academic course is designed to correspond with its stated learning outcomes, with course objectives and outcomes clearly defined and integrated into the program's overall learning outcomes. Every learning outcome in courses is assessed. Moreover, the course syllabi indicate that all learning outcomes are assessed through midterm and final evaluations, in line with the Order N3 of the Minister of MoES of Georgia, which mandates assessment methods.

Regarding the determination of course credits, the following should be noted: the review of undergraduate programs in Management (240 as well as 180 ECTS credit volume programs) showed that all courses of the programs (General/Major/Mandatory/Elective) are defined as 6 credits courses. While interviewing the heads of programs and academic staff, the panel noted that the volume of credits was defined "mechanically", the specifics of the course have not been considered. For effective implementation of program and teaching courses, the number of ECTS credits assigned to each course should be calculated based on the student's workload and the material to be covered, ensuring that the credit allocation reflects both the content and learning outcomes of each course. The balance between contact hours and independent study is appropriate for the content and learning outcomes of each course, considering the nature of the subject matter.

The undergraduate program's curriculum map reflects how the learning outcomes of individual courses contribute to the broader program objectives. The syllabi also specify the teaching and learning methods employed in each course, which are chosen to effectively meet the course's goals and learning outcomes. Each course's content is designed to contribute to the overall program competencies, and the syllabi ensure that these courses collectively form a coherent and comprehensive educational experience. The detailed reviewing of syllabi (especially in business management subject-based courses) showed that in most courses the similar teaching and assessment methods and tools are applied. However, some of them are more or less valid for achieving the learning outcomes that are stated in the course. (E.g. Team Project Presentation in "Basics of Statistics"; "Essentials of Marketing"; "Fundamentals of HRM"; etc.). Moreover, while interviewing academic staff the panel noted that lecturers apply and implement more relevant and valid teaching methods or assessment tools for the measuring and evaluating students' achievement, but the implemented methods have not been mentioned and described in syllabi, and programs as well. Syllabi should describe clearly the methods/tools that are implemented in teaching-assessment processes.

Thus, some syllabi, where team presentation or/and group project is implemented as a student's competency assessment tool (e.g. Basics of Statistics, Fundamentals of HRM; Project Management Basics; Basics of Strategic Management; etc.) should be revised in terms of adding more relevant assessment forms (particularly, detail-described rubrics) for valid and reliable assessment of competency of each student; for developing students' critical thinking, problem-solving and practical decision-making skills, and achieving course as well as program learning outcomes.

Regarding study materials, the syllabi list compulsory literature and other educational resources that support the achievement of course and program learning outcomes. These materials are aligned with current field achievements and include recent publications, ensuring that the resources remain relevant and effective in meeting the program's educational goals.

In terms of ongoing improvement, the programs are updated based on student feedback and assessments, with syllabi periodically revised to include updated literature, refined evaluation criteria, and improved teaching methods. Students are informed of these changes at the beginning of each semester, ensuring transparency and consistency in the learning process.

The reviewed programs mostly demonstrate a clear alignment between course content, learning outcomes, and credit allocation, meeting the specified criteria for academic course compliance. The syllabi are substantially comprehensive, with appropriate teaching methods, assessment strategies, and educational materials that collectively support the achievement of the program's objectives.

Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS

The content of the academic courses and the number of credits ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes defined by this program.

Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS
The research methods course pays more attention to quantitative research methods, and less to qualitative research methods. The expert group considers that both research methods are important, and the time allocated to each method has to be equal.

Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS

The content of the academic courses and the number of credits ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes defined by this program.

Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS

The PhD Program in Business Administration comprises a total of 30 credits. Among them, 24 credits are allocated for mandatory courses/components, and the remaining six (6) credits are for elective ones.
18 Credits are allocated for Assistantship, that has two directions - teaching assistantship and research assistantship, and 6 ECTS for writing academic publications.

For the elective 6 ECTS the Doctorate student have to choose from following courses:
1. Qualitative Data Analysis with Nvivo, or
2. Panel Data Analysis using Eviews, or
3. Time Series Analysis using Eviews.

The expert panel noticed that in the program in the part of the Program Concept is written:
The program explores various latest theoretical paradigms and research (qualitative and quantitative) methodologies. It serves to generate new knowledge in the field of business administration based on original research;
also in the Program results it is stated that PhD students:
2. Plans and implements innovative research independently by using the most recent research methodology while adhering to the principles of academic integrity;
3. Shares new knowledge with the scientific community by establishing effective oral and written communication, including having their scholarly work published in an international peer-reviewed journal;
4. Transfers knowledge in the process of classroom teaching;

Based on the above-mentioned issues the expert panel considers that outcomes of the program could not be achieved fully, as doctoral students:

● have to select one course from three listed above, as result only quantitative or qualitative competencies are created not both of them,

● and have to choose one direction from two of the assistantships, which lead to the creation of only research or teaching competencies, not both of them.

The panel expert considers that to achieve the program outcomes, the program should have more comprehensive research method courses. Also, the program has to have courses for Advanced Modern Teaching and Learning Methods. As well, some courses or components which create skills in other areas of the business administration, which are not doctoral students' main research directions.

Evidences/Indicators
- Self-assessment Reports;
- Educational programs;
- Program syllabuses;
- Curriculum map;
- Expert Panel's meeting with the head of the programs;
- Expert Panel's meeting with academic and invited staff;
- Expert Panel's meeting with representatives of quality assurance service;
- Expert Panel's meetings with students, graduates and employers of the programs.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and suggestions according to the Programs:

Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS
&
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS

Recommendation(s):

● 1.5.1. It is recommended to ensure revision of all courses to determine valid volume of credits, based on consideration of the course objectives and learning outcomes to be achieved, the topics to be covered, intensity, scope and complexity of the tasks to be completed, the volume and complexity of resources to be taught, and specifics of achievements' assessment.

● 1.5.2. It is recommended to revise syllabi of courses to define relevant assessment methods/tools for achieving and evaluating the stated learning outcomes of the courses effectively.

● 1.5.3. It is recommended to revise some syllabi (e.g. Foundations of HRM; Project Management Basics; Basics of Statistics; Essentials of Marketing; etc.) in terms of adding more relevant assessment forms (particularly, detail-described rubrics), for developing students' critical thinking, problem-solving and practical decision-making skills, and achieving course as well as program learning outcomes.

Suggestions:

● 1.5.1 It is suggested to define basics of operation management as a prerequisite course for project management basics.

Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS

● 1.5.1 It is recommended that the course of the research method pays the same amount of time to quantitative and qualitative research methods.

Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS

● 1.5.1. It is recommended to introduce some courses or components which create skills in other areas of the business administration, which are not doctoral students' main research directions.

Evaluation

Component 1.5 Academic Course/Subject	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐

Compliance of the Programs with the standards

1. Educational Program Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Program	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐

2 Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Program Mastering

Prerequisites for admission to the Program, teaching-learning methods and student assessment consider the specificity of the study field, level requirements, student needs, and ensure the engagement achievement of the objectives and expected learning outcomes of the Program.

2.1 Program Admission Preconditions

The HEI has relevant, transparent, fair, public and accessible Program admission preconditions and procedures that ensure the engagement of individuals with relevant knowledge and skills in the Program to achieve learning outcomes.

Cluster and individual evaluation

The enrolment process is based on transparent, fair, public and accessible preconditions for all 3 study programs of the cluster. Preconditions for Bachelor programs, as well for the Master and PhD programs can be found on the University website - https://iliauni.edu.ge/en and on the website of the National Assessment and Examinations Center.

The prerequisite to be admitted to cluster programs are described in the program admission documents for each level.

Admission preconditions are in accordance with the applicable legislation and are logically related to the programs' content, learning outcomes, level of education and qualification awarded, as well as consider the program specificity, and ensure the inclusion of persons with the knowledge, skills and competence required to overcome the program.

Students mentioned that they found out about study programs from their relatives or during information meetings organized within their schools. Also, the Faculty of Business, Technology, and Education at Ilia State University, with the support of the Public Relations Office, participates at university "Open Door Days".

According to SER, the university has the student body planning mechanism and methodology operating in the University. The methodology describes how the total number of students eligible for a specific program is stated. According to the methodology in stating the number of students is taken into consideration such factors as the level of education, student-to-academic/ staff ratios, students with active, suspended, terminated, and restored statuses, graduating students, as well quantitative indicators of internal/external mobility.

At Bachelor program Management (major) there are 1618 students, the academic personnel which ensure the teaching at all Bachelor programs is about 134, from them 101 are invited staff. So, the ratio of students to academic personnel is about 12 students/one academic person, or more than 50 students/one internal academic person, also the ratio between own academic personnel/invited staff is 1/3.06. Expert panel considers that University has to pay more attention to the planning mechanism and methodology operating in the University.

Description and Analysis

Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS
&
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS

According to the self-assessment report of the cluster submitted by the University, the documentation enclosed to it and the interviews conducted during the accreditation visit, admission preconditions of both Bachelor programs in Management (240 ECTS and 180 ECTS, Georgian language) are transparent and accessible for everyone.

The information about program admission preconditions is placed on the University website. The admission to the Bachelor's Programs in Management is conducted based on the Unified National Exams in accordance with the rules established by the Ministry of Education and Science of Georgia

Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS
&
Program 4. Management, English, Bachelor, 180 ECTS

According to the self-assessment report of the cluster submitted by the University, the documentation enclosed to it and the interviews conducted during the accreditation visit, admission preconditions of both Bachelor programs in Management (240 ECTS and 180 ECTS, English language) are transparent and accessible for everyone.

The information about program admission preconditions is placed on the University website. The admission to the Bachelor's Programs in Management is conducted based on the Unified National Exams in accordance with the rules established by the Ministry of Education and Science of Georgia

To be enrolled in the program, Georgian citizens must pass the unified national exams. The minimum competence thresholds required for admission to the program in the unified national exams are determined as follows:
● English language - 70%+1;
● Georgian language - following the limits of competence determined by unified national exams;
● Mathematics or history - following the limits of competence determined by unified national exams.

In case of not passing the unified national exams, according to the procedure established by the MoES of Georgia and within the established time frame, the following is allowed:
● For the citizens of foreign countries and stateless persons who received complete general or equivalent education in a foreign country;
● For the citizens of Georgia who received full general or equivalent education in a foreign country and completed the last 2 years of full general education in a foreign country;
● For the persons who study/studied and received credits in a foreign country from a higher educational institution recognized by the legislation of that country.
● An undergraduate student of an authorized higher educational institution through external or internal mobility.
International applicants must be guided by the rules and conditions established by the Ministry of Education, Science and Youth of Georgia Order #224/N (December 29, 2011).

● Applicants must demonstrate English language proficiency at the B2 level or higher. To confirm their knowledge of the English language, an applicant must either pass a test organized by the university (either paper-based or online) corresponding to the B2 level of the Common European Framework of Reference for languages or, to be exempt from the test, submit one of the following:
A. Official international certificate (see below for the main recognized certificates and minimum scores):
● Cambridge Examinations:
● Cambridge English Scale – 160
● IELTS – Band 5.5 (validity – up to 2 years)
● Cambridge First – Grade C
● FCE – Grade C
● BEC Vantage – Grade C
● ILEC - Pass with B2
● Aptis Test - 140
● Pearson Tests:
● PTE General: Level 3
● PTE Academic: 59
● TOEFL iBT: 72 (validity – up to 2 years)
● EF SET: 51
● Duolingo: 90
● Certus: National Assessment and Examination Center (NAEC) project, validity – 3 years: a certificate in Georgian is awarded to those who pass all four parts of the test; if one or several parts of the test are taken - a "Test Report Form" is issued.

● A certificate of English language proficiency from high school or college, confirming that the teaching was conducted in English.

It should be noted that the English language requirement may be waived if English is the applicant's first language or if he/she graduated from an English high school/university in a country where English is an official language.

Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS

To be enrolled in the Master's Program Finance, the applicant must hold a bachelor's degree or an equivalent academic degree in any field (preferable but not mandatory - 0412 Finance, Banking and Insurance/0413 Management and Administration/0414 Marketing and Advertising/0311 Economics in the field) and must have successfully completed the common master's and institutional exams. Once the candidates pass the Unified Masters Exam, they have to fulfill additional criteria:
● Confirm English language competence at the B2 level (only the proof of the B2 level of the reading skill is required);
● Submit a resume (CV);
● Pass the institutional exam.

For prove English language competence, the candidate must pass a university-administered institutional exam (only the proof of the B2 level of the reading skill is required), or submit one of the following documents verifying English language competence:

A. Official international certificate (see below for the main recognized certificates and minimum scores):
● Cambridge Examinations:
● Cambridge English Scale – 160
● IELTS – Band 5.5 (validity – up to 2 years)
● Cambridge First – Grade C
● FCE – Grade C
● BEC Vantage – Grade C
● ILEC - Pass with B2
● Aptis Test - 140
● Pearson Tests:
● PTE General: Level 3
● PTE Academic: 59
● TOEFL iBT: 72 (validity – up to 2 years)
● EF SET: 51
● Duolingo: 90
● Certus: National Assessment and Examination Center (NAEC) project, validity – 3 years: a certificate in Georgian is awarded to those who pass all four parts of the test; if one or several parts of the test are taken - a "Test Report Form" is issued.

B.   A diploma confirming the completion of an English bachelor's degree program and indicating that the language of instruction was English.

Assessment criteria for the admission exam are reviewed annually and are available at the university web page. Exam' structure is logically linked to Program content and learning outcomes.

Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS

To be enrolled in the Master Program Healthcare Policy and Management, the applicant must hold a bachelor's degree or an equivalent academic degree in any of the fields (preferable but not mandatory - 0412 Finances, Banking, and

Insurance/0413 Management and Administration/0414 Marketing and Advertising/0311 Economics/091 Health) and must have successfully completed the common master's and institutional exams. Once the candidates pass the Unified Masters Exam, they have to fulfill additional criteria:

● Confirm English language competence at the B2 level (reading competences only);
● Submit a resume (CV);
● Pass the institutional exam.

To prove English language competence, the applicant must pass a university-administered exam (only proof of reading competence at B2 level is required), or submit one of the following documents:

A. Official international certificate (see below for the main recognized certificates and minimum scores):
● Cambridge Examinations:
● Cambridge English Scale – 160
● IELTS – Band 5.5 (validity – up to 2 years)
● Cambridge First – Grade C
● FCE – Grade C
● BEC Vantage – Grade C
● ILEC - Pass with B2
● Aptis Test - 140
● Pearson Tests:
● PTE General: Level 3
● PTE Academic: 59
● TOEFL iBT: 72 (validity – up to 2 years)
● EF SET: 51
● Duolingo: 90
● Certus: National Assessment and Examination Center (NAEC) project, validity – 3 years: a certificate in Georgian is awarded to those who pass all four parts of the test; if one or several parts of the test are taken - a "Test Report Form" is issued.

B. A diploma confirming the completion of an English bachelor's degree program and indicating that the language of instruction was English.

Assessment criteria for the admission exam are reviewed annually and are available at the university web page. Exam' structure is logically linked to Program content and learning outcomes.

According to the program, the course of the quantitative research methods starts with regression analyses, for that reason the internal examination has subjects that cover the introductory part of quantitative research.

Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS

To be enrolled in the Master Program Business Administration, the applicant must hold a bachelor's degree or an equivalent academic degree preferable, but not mandatory, in the field of Business Administration (041): Finance, Banking and Insurance (0412), Management and Administration (0413), Marketing and Advertising (0414) or Economics (0311) and must have successfully completed the common master's and institutional exams. Once the candidates pass the Unified Masters Exam, they have to fulfill additional criteria:

1. Confirm English language competence at the B2 level or higher;
2. Submit a resume (CV);
3. Pass the institutional exam.

Assessment criteria for the admission exam are reviewed annually and are available at the university web page. Exam' structure is logically linked to Program content and learning outcomes.

Applicants must demonstrate English language proficiency at the B2 level or higher. To confirm their knowledge of the English language, an applicant must either pass a test organized by the university (either paper-based or online) corresponding to the B2 level of the Common European Framework of Reference for languages or, to be exempt from the test, submit one of the following:

A. Official international certificate (see below for the main recognized certificates and minimum scores):

● Cambridge Examinations:
● Cambridge English Scale – 160
● IELTS – Band 5.5 (validity – up to 2 years)
● Cambridge First – Grade C
● FCE – Grade C
● BEC Vantage – Grade C
● ILEC - Pass with B2
● Aptis Test - 140
● Pearson Tests:
● PTE General: Level 3
● PTE Academic: 59
● TOEFL iBT: 72 (validity – up to 2 years)
● EF SET: 51
● Duolingo: 90
● Certus: National Assessment and Examination Center (NAEC) project, validity – 3 years: a certificate in Georgian is awarded to those who pass all four parts of the test; if one or several parts of the test are taken - a "Test Report Form" is issued.

B. A diploma confirming the completion of an English bachelor's degree program and indicating that the language of instruction was English.

English language requirement may be waived if English is the applicant's first language or if he/she graduated from an English high school/university in a country where English is an official language.

Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS

The admission procedure is described in the Ilia State University's normative document - Bylaws of the Dissertation Board and Doctoral Studies.

For the admission candidate should have a master or an equivalent academic degree in Economics (0311) or Business Administration (041). Applicants who hold a master or an equivalent degree in another field or discipline are required to have a 7-year managerial experience or a GMAT score of at least 550.

Applicants must demonstrate English language proficiency at the C1 level or higher. To confirm their knowledge of the English language, an applicant has to pass the test organized by the university (either paper-based or online) corresponding to the C1 level of the Common European Framework of Reference for languages or, have to submit an internationally recognized certificate that states the language proficiency (Cambridge, Person, TOEFL, etc.) or a certificate of English language from an accredited university, high school, or college, confirming that the language of instruction was English.

Also the applicant should provide a PhD research proposal and pass an oral exam on the research project proposal.

Program admission preconditions and procedures are consistent with the existing legislation; Program admission preconditions are logically linked to Program content, learning outcomes, level of education, the qualification to be awarded and the instruction language.

Evidences/Indicators
- Self assessment Reports;
- Educational programs;
- University website: www.iliauni.edu.ge , https://iliauni.edu.ge/en/international
- Expert Panel's meeting with the head of the programs;
- Expert Panel's meeting with academic and invited staff;
- Expert Panel's meeting with representatives of quality assurance service;
- Expert Panel's meetings with students, graduates.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and suggestions according to the Programs:

Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS
&
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS

Suggestion(s):
- 2.1. It is suggested that the University pay more attention to the planning mechanism and methodology operating in the University, to ensure an optimal ratio of students/ academic staff.

Evaluation

Component 2.1 Program admission preconditions	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

2.2. The Development of Practical, Scientific/Research/Creative/Performing and Transferable Skills

Program ensures the development of students' practical, scientific/research/creative/performing and transferable skills and/or their involvement in research projects, in accordance with the Program learning outcomes.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Programs ensure development of students' practical, scientific and research skills in accordance with learning outcomes and educational level through components of the study Programs. Also, for these purposes Ilia University has various centers and research institutes, as well as signed memorandums with partner organizations.

Ilia state university has an entrepreneurial laboratory called FabLab, where students can test their ideas, and further develop it with the support of FabLab's staff.

Description and Analysis

Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS
&
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS

The structure of bachelor programs assures substantially the development of students' practical, scientific/research/creative/performing and transferable skills. The development is assured through compulsory and elective disciplines, by using appropriate teaching methods (e.g. case studies; discussions; problem-based learning; role-plays and situational games/simulations, etc.), during practical lessons and seminars by using group presentations on specific subjects prepared by students.

Additionally, it can be mentioned that the practical component is integrated in some mandatory courses, such as Basics of strategic management; Essentials of marketing; Entrepreneurship; Practical Entrepreneurship; is planned to achieve learning outcomes and correspond to the second cycle of education. All programs have the option of a major elective

course - the Internship. Has to be mentioned that there are different formal agreements and memorandums with the employers, such as "Greenway", "Georgian Competition and Consumer Agency", "Coca-cola Bottlers Georgia", "Castel Georgia", "T&K Restaurants (McDonald's)", "IRAO", "Vimm-Bill-Dann Georgia", "PMC Research Center", "Wissol Petroleum Georgia", "Impexpharm", "Gastronome Group", "GEC", "Alta", "BiBlusi", "Tegeta Motors", "Gepra", "Expo Georgia", "Lomisi", where is stated that enterprises are offering internships for students (in case if they elect this component) .

Also, the University organizes different kinds of practices and internships, masterclasses, annual students' conferences and workshops, where BA students are eligible to participate, that contribute to the development of various skills.

As the Internship is an optional subject and BBA programs curricula do not include an undergraduate thesis/project and none of the programs subject has a mandatory component of assessment a practical/research project the Expert Panel consider that the development of practical and research skills is insufficient.

Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS
&
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS

The Master programs ensure the development of students' practical, research, and transferable skills in accordance with the learning outcomes, through components of study programs.

It should also be noted that the program ensures the development of students' ability to conduct the research process in accordance with the principles of academic integrity and ethics, which is provided by the Academic Writing course. Additionally, in order to facilitate the development of academic techniques, the Centre for Academic Writing consults students as needed.

The master's thesis component is mandatory within the scope of the program. The thesis must be completed in the last semester, and it serves to strengthen and demonstrate the student's research skills. Also in order to facilitate the development of skills in research planning and implementation, the Center for Business Studies offer their support as needed.

Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS

PhD program is mainly focused on the development of scientific and research skills.

According to the University, transferable skills are also formed by the International Doctoral School, that conducts trainings and different activities on various topics, f. e.: "Effective Academic Communication", "PR for Young Scientists and Academics", "Engaging with Sources Information Seeking and Literature Review", "Research Data – Management, Infrastructure and Applications", "Stress Management", "Presentation Skills", "Statistics and Data Analysis: Data Visualization & Univariate Analysis", Summer School on Research Methods for Doctoral Students and Young Researchers, "Grounded theory" etc. Also, according to the University the development of practical skills related to teaching is also ensured by the assistantship component and training on modern teaching methods offered to doctoral students by the "Personal and Professional Development Center (PPDC).

All mentioned training is not compulsory, the assistantship is a compulsory component, but is not evaluated. There are no compulsory courses on research methods, on advanced teaching and learning methods, there are no compulsory activities in the framework of the PhD program where PhD students have to present their research and to have a

feedback on their research, so the Expert Panel considers that the development of research/transferable and practical skills is not organized and evaluated efficiently.

Evidences/Indicators
- Self assessment Reports;
- Educational programs;
- Program descriptions and course syllabi;
- Expert Panel's meeting with the head of the programs;
- Expert Panel's meeting with academic and invited staff;
- Expert Panel's meeting with representatives of quality assurance service;
- Expert Panel's meetings with students, graduates.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and suggestions according to the Programs:

Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS
&
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS

Recommendation**:**
- 2.2.1 It is recommended to introduced the final thesis or create some other mechanisms for ensure program outcome achievements in order to fulfill the benchmark requirements.   .

Suggestion(s):
- 2.2.1 It is suggested to involve more students in research projects, in accordance with the Program learning outcomes;
- 2.2.2 It is suggested to add as a mandatory component of the assessment a semester project for 1-2 courses of the study programs;
- 2.2.3 It is suggested to introduce as mandatory the internship.

Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS
&
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS

Suggestion(s):
- 2.2.1 It is suggested to involve more students in university research projects, in accordance with the Program learning outcomes.

Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS

Evaluation

Component 2.2. The Development of practical, scientific/research/creative/performing and transferable Skills	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐

2.3. Teaching and Learning Methods

The Program is implemented by using student-centered teaching and learning methods. Teaching and learning methods correspond to the level of education, course/subject content, learning outcomes and ensure their achievement.

Cluster and individual evaluation

For implementation of the programs grouped in the cluster are used relevant teaching and learning methods. The programs offered mostly components with appropriate study methods.

For teaching and learning are used following resources:
- Lecture halls and computer labs;
- "Argus" – an electronic selection system;
- Turnitin, E-learning;
- University library and scientific electronic databases;
- Centre for Academic Writing of Ilia State University;
- Business Research Centre.

Each program states teaching and learning methods. This one are specified in the syllabi/guidelines of respective courses.

Teaching and learning methods of most academic course/subject correspond to the level of education, course/subject content, learning outcomes, sectoral benchmark requirements (if any) and ensure their achievement. Teaching-learning methods ensure students' active engagement in the learning process, interaction both between students and staff and students themselves; ensure student participation in the learning process with appropriate autonomy and responsibility, and are aimed at the development of various skills by the student, including critical and analytical skills.

During interviews there were some issues when invited or university staff could not fully describe learning outcomes and teaching methods, but in the program most teaching-learning methods are flexible and envisage individual needs of students. If necessary, individual Programs are created and utilized in accordance with the interest and academic readiness of the student.

HEI has resources for electronic/distance learning in case of necessity.

Description and Analysis

Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS
&
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS

In general, all undergraduate educational programs in management grouped in this cluster demonstrate compliance with the requirements of student-centered teaching and learning methods, ensuring that applied methods correspond to the level of education, course content, and desired learning outcomes.

The programs employ a variety of teaching methods designed to engage students actively in the learning process. These methods include: interactive lectures/seminars; masterclasses; case study; projects; discussion/debates; group work; collaborative learning; project /problem-based learning; brainstorming; reflection; role-plays and situational games/simulations; demonstration method; modeling; practical work; flipped classroom; verbal instruction, written assignments, and etc.

The diversity of teaching methods is appropriate for the course content and ensures that students can achieve the learning outcomes specified in each course syllabus.

It should be noted that the instruction methods used in the program are specified in the syllabi/guidelines of respective courses. Thus, the syllabi for each course clearly outline the teaching-learning methods to be employed, demonstrating an alignment between these methods and the course objectives.

The methods are not only diverse but also flexible, allowing lecturers to adapt their approach depending on the specific needs of the course or the individual student. This flexibility is crucial in a student-centered learning environment and is particularly important for ensuring that students with different learning needs can succeed. For example, the provision of individual curricula for students with special needs reflects a commitment to inclusivity and personalized education.

Moreover, all undergraduate programs in management are structured to ensure that teaching methods are interactive, promoting active engagement among students and between students and faculty. This interaction is essential for the developing of critical and analytical skills, which are key components of the learning outcomes across the programs. The focus on interactive learning methods, such as group discussions and case studies, team-projects, ensures that students are not passive recipients of information but are actively involved in constructing their knowledge. This approach aligns well with the principles of student-centered learning, where the student's active role in the learning process is emphasized.

Despite the above-mentioned, detailed reviewing of syllabi (especially in business management subject-based courses) showed that in most courses the similar teaching and assessment methods and tools are applied. However, some of them are more or less valid for achieving the learning outcomes that are stated in the course (it is mentioned above while considering the academic courses/subjects in 1.5.). The panel noted that some syllabi, where team presentation or/and group project is implemented as a student's competency assessment tool (e.g. Basics of Statistics, Fundamentals of HRM; Project Management Basics; Basics of Strategic Management; etc.) should be revised in terms of adding more relevant assessment forms (particularly, detail-described rubrics) for valid and reliable assessment of competency of each student. For objective and reliable evaluation of students' individual achievements, as well as to identify and measure each student's individual abilities, competencies, and knowledge in a specific topic or subject/course, as well as to identify student's strengths, reveal gaps, and understand his/her proficiency levels, the assessment should be conducted using valid method(s) with detailed described rubrics, measurable and reliable indicators and relevant scores. While assessing the team presentation evaluator/lecturer should ensure that each student demonstrates the same competency. Assessment rubrics for team works are not guaranteed the objective and reliable evaluation of each student. Thus, the assessment tools / rubrics in some syllabi should be revised and described more detailed.

In addition, while interviewing academic and invited staff the panel noted that some lecturers apply and implement more relevant and valid teaching methods or assessment tools for the developing, measuring and evaluating students' achievement, but the implemented methods have not been mentioned and described in syllabi, and in programs as well. Syllabi should describe clearly the methods/tools that are implemented in teaching-assessment processes.

Thus, some syllabi should be revised in terms of detailed description of teaching methods and assessment tools / rubrics.

Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS
&
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS

The master programs employ a variety of teaching methods designed to engage students actively in the learning process. These methods include:
- Interactive lectures and seminars;
- Analysis and synthesis;

- Masterclasses;
- Case study;
- Projects;
- Discussions/debates;
- Collaborative group work;
- Practical work method;
- Problem-based learning;
- Brainstorming, reflection;
- Role-play and situational games/simulations;
- Demonstration method;
- Presentation;
- Supervision.

Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS

The PhD programs employ a variety of teaching methods designed to engage students actively in the learning process. These methods include Supervision;
- Lecture and seminar;
- Discussion;
- Analysis and synthesis;
- Reflection;
- Demonstration;
- Practical work.

Evidences/Indicators
- Educational Programs;
- Program Courses Syllabi/Guidelines;
- Program Evaluation Criteria;
- Bylaws of the Centre for Academic Writing.
- Expert Panel's meeting with the head of the programs;
- Expert Panel's meeting with academic and invited staff;
- Expert Panel's meeting with representatives of quality assurance service;
- Expert Panel's meetings with students, graduates and employers of the programs.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A
- 2.3.1 It is suggested that Teaching and Learning Methods of the program should be released by invited and local personnel fully.

Recommendations and suggestions according to the Programs:
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS
&
Program 4. Management, English, Bachelor, 180 ECTS

Evaluation

Component 2.3. Teaching and learning methods	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

2.4. Student Evaluation

Student evaluation is conducted in accordance with the established procedures. It is transparent, reliable and complies with existing legislation.

Cluster and individual evaluation

The student evaluation process complies with both internal (university) and external regulations (Order No. 3 of the Minister of Education and Science of Georgia: "On approving the rules for calculating credits for higher education

programs" and "Ilia State University Policy on Student/Vocational Student Assessment, Credit Assignment, Ratings, and Payment for Additional or Retaken Courses/Components".

Evaluation of students within the courses included in the programs is carried out with methods and components that are in line with the specifics of the course and ensure the assessment of the achievement of the learning outcomes defined by the course using the measurable criteria and rubrics defined in them. Student evaluation is based on four key evaluation principles: objectivity, reliability, validity, and transparency.

The evaluation system of each academic course consists of multiple components and ensures evaluation by at least three components (midterm evaluations and one final evaluation). Midterm evaluation is an assessment of the student's knowledge during the period determined for the lectures and seminars of the semester. The final evaluation is the assessment of the student at the end of the semester, during the examination period. Minimum competency thresholds are defined for midterm and final evaluations. For the final evaluation, this limit does not exceed 60% of the points defined for it. The specific share of the final evaluation does not exceed 30 points. The final evaluation is a mandatory component of the course.

Assessment is based on a 100-point scale. Points in the assessment system are distributed in the following way:
- (A) 91 - 100 Excellent
- (B) 81 - 90 Very good
- (C) 71 - 80 Good
- (D) 61 - 70 Satisfactory
- (E) 51 - 60 Sufficient
- (FX) 41 – 50 Unsatisfactory, a student needs more efforts to pass an examination and is given an extra chance to pass an additional examination through independent work
- (F) 0 – 40 Failure, the student's effort is not sufficient and s/he has to retake a course.

The defense of the dissertation is assessed according to the following system:
- Excellent (summa cum laude) –work with the highest distinction;
- Very good (magna cum laude) – a result that exceeds the requirements in every aspect;
- Good (cum laude) – a result that exceeds the requirements;
- Average (bene) – an average-level paper that fulfills the basic requirements;
- Satisfactory (rite) - the result, which, despite the flaws, still duly satisfies the requirements;
- Insufficient – a work of an unsatisfactory level, which is unable to meet the requirements due to significant gaps in it;
- Completely unsatisfactory (sub omni canone) – a result that falls short of meeting minimum requirements.

If the doctoral student receives any of the assessments specified in sections "A"-"E," they are awarded the academic degree of Doctor. If the doctoral student receives the assessment specified in section "F," they are allowed to submit a revised dissertation within the deadline of one year. If the doctoral student receives the assessment specified in section "G" they are no longer entitled to submit the same dissertation.

The evaluation of the master's thesis/dissertation at the master's and doctoral levels is carried out once and includes multiple components. The paper is evaluated through a peer evaluation, in a commission manner. The supervisor of the paper, the reviewer and the defense evaluation commission, which is staffed by active specialists in the field, are involved in the evaluation process of the paper.

The defense of a master's thesis/dissertation is public, evaluation procedures and criteria are clearly established, considers the specifics of a particular field, is transparent and fair, and is specified in the guiding document of the thesis/dissertation.

The academic style of Ilia State University is used for the completion of master's thesis/dissertation. The requirements related to adherence to the style mentioned in papers are detailed in the Master's Thesis/PhD Dissertation Guidelines.

In order to prevent plagiarism, the papers are uploaded to the eLearning platform, and the Turnitin system is used to identify similarities between them. The supervisor of the work submits a report to the faculty about the readiness of the defense and indicates the results of its check for plagiarism.

The syllabus of each course defines the evaluation methods used within the courses, which ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes provided by the course. The syllabi also specify the relevant evaluation criteria. The evaluation methods, components, and criteria used within each course are known in advance to the students through the electronic selection system "Argus". Predetermining evaluation components and criteria and their availability in "Argus" ensures transparency, objectivity and fairness of the system.

The university also operates an evaluation appeal mechanism, which gives students the opportunity to apply to the faculty/school for the purpose of creating an appeals committee and initiating relevant procedures in case of reasonable doubt.

It is important to mention that to create/administer a unified system of exams, promote the improvement of teaching quality, ensure objectivity and transparency in the student evaluation system, and conduct the exam process flawlessly, an exam center was established at the Business School. This center oversees the administration of mid-term and final exams in various subjects. In order to fully adapt to the online teaching format specially allowed during the pandemic period, in 2020-2021, the examination center provided employees with training and video instructions about the innovative methods of teaching/exams, thus making the effective implementation and monitoring of the online evaluation process possible. In 2022, the center switched to an offline format of work and, at this stage, organizes the examination process of fifteen academic courses for bachelor's and master's programs.

For effective communication between the students of the programs and the academic/invited staff, on the one hand, the electronic system "Argus" is used, which provides the possibility of constant communication between the student and the lecturer, and on the other hand, there are individual counseling hours. Additionally, students are given the opportunity to receive feedback from the lecturer about their work and grade after midterm evaluations within the framework of each academic course. During the learning process, students receive feedback from academic/invited staff on their achievements and opportunities for improvement. If it is necessary to conduct the training process remotely, the eLearning platform is used.

Additionally, in order to ensure the effectiveness of the evaluation process, the university has developed a guide for lecturers on recommended evaluation methods and approaches during the remote educational format while taking into consideration the good international practice.

In order to monitor the effectiveness of bachelor's and master's program courses, key indicators such as mean and median, frequency, and standard deviation are used for statistical analysis of students' academic performance. The aforementioned data is generated through the "Argus" system, and the head of the program, the working group, specialists of the Quality Assurance Office of the faculty, and the specialist of evaluation and development of the educational process are involved in the analysis process. It should be noted here that such a complex system for evaluating academic performance was developed in 2022, and at this stage, the process of its implementation is underway.

It should be noted that within the framework of the systematic evaluation of academic courses, it is envisaged to receive feedback from the students about the effectiveness of the evaluation system defined by the course. As a result of the surveys, it was determined how well students were informed in advance about the evaluation system, whether the evaluation was objective, whether the evaluation results were uploaded to "Argus" on time, whether they received feedback from the lecturer about their strengths and weaknesses, etc. The results of the survey are available to lecturers and faculty administration and are used to modify the course evaluation system in order to improve it.

The academic and invited staff involved in the program have adequate knowledge of modern evaluation methods. Additionally, in the process of developing, updating and improving the academic courses, the staff involved in the program receive consultations and support from the Quality Assurance Office of the faculty regarding various issues, including evaluation mechanisms and approaches.

It is worth noting that the "Personal and Professional Development Center (PPDC)" was established at the university, which, taking into account international practice, offers training modules about the definition, evaluation and analysis of program results to program administrators, supervisors and staff involved in the program implementation. Training modules have been developed while taking into consideration international best practices and on the basis of cooperation with leading European universities.

Evidences/Indicators
- Educational programs;
- Syllabi;
- Guidelines;
- Bylaws of the Examination Center;
- Electronic selection system "Argus": http://argus.ge/ge/
- Ilia State University Policy on Student/Vocational Student Assessment, Credit Assignment, Ratings, and Payment for Additional or Retaken Courses/Components;
- The method of evaluating the implementation of educational programs of Ilia State University;
- Systems: http://elearning.iliauni.edu.ge and http://turnitin.com
- Evaluation criteria of the educational programs of Ilia State University;
- Bylaws of the Personal and Professional Development Center;
- Trainings carried out by the Personal and Professional Development Center;
- Expert Panel's meeting with the head of the programs;
- Expert Panel's meeting with academic and invited staff;
- Expert Panel's meeting with representatives of quality assurance service;
- Expert Panel's meetings with students, graduates and employers of the programs.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and suggestions according to the Programs: N/A

Evaluation

Component 2.4 - Student evaluation	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

Compliance of the Programs with the standards

2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy Evaluation of Program Mastering	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐

Program				
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with Them

The Program ensures the creation of a student-centered environment by providing students with relevant services; promotes maximum student awareness, implements a variety of activities and facilitates student engagement in local and / or international projects; proper quality of scientific guidance and supervision is provided for master's and doctoral students.

3.1 Student Consulting and Support Services

Students receive consultation and support regarding planning of the learning process, improvement of academic achievement, and career development from the people involved in the Program and/or structural units of the HEI. A student has an opportunity to have a diverse learning process and receive relevant information and recommendations from those involved in the Program.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Students of each program grouped in a cluster receive the necessary information about planning their learning process, improving academic achievements, employment and career advancement issues. Information meetings are held at the university for students enrolled in bachelor's, master's and doctoral programs of the Faculty of Business, Technology and Education at Ilia State University, where interested persons receive detailed information about the learning environment and possibilities for planning the learning process.

The workload of the academic and administrative staff involved in the teaching process includes the hours allocated for student consultations. Information about consultations with academic and invited staff is outlined in the course syllabi.

To manage and support the educational process, the university operates a specially designed software system "Argus" - an electronic selection system.

The university registers all students, offers them academic courses, places electronic study materials and syllabi in this system. In order to ensure objective, transparent and fair evaluation, the syllabi specify the evaluation system considering the relevant components, methods and criteria.

Through "Argus", students choose courses, check their grades and accumulated credits. The system reflects final and midterm evaluations, which allows students to assess their strengths and weaknesses in each component of the course and plan a strategy to improve learning outcomes before receiving the final grade.

The system is also used as a communication platform between academic staff, other individuals involved in the learning process and students. Through "Argus", students have the opportunity to be in contact with the heads of the study component throughout the year, receive the necessary information and feedback from them to improve their academic achievements.

The consulting cycle and opportunities related to the learning process include the following:

● Agreements are signed with newly admitted students, in which the study conditions and the responsibilities of the parties are defined clearly and in detail;

● Orientation meetings are held with the students who are newly accepted/enrolled in the programs in order to familiarize them with the main aspects of the educational process;

● Students join the information network immediately after enrollment. They are given a corporate email and an Argus password to be fully integrated into the internal information space of the university and to receive all kinds of information smoothly;

● At the beginning of each academic year, the Department of Student Affairs develops informative material (guide for newcomers) that describes the internal procedures of the university related to the educational process in detail; provides students with information about various university regulations, including ethical standards and issues of academic integrity. As soon as the studies begin, the mentioned material is delivered in electronic form to the students of the first academic year at all levels and to those enrolled through mobility. Informational material is posted on the university's website, as well as personally sent to students via email and "Argus";

● Faculty has program coordinators who actively cooperate with students. Students can approach them for counseling; however, they can also use e-mail, Argus or a phone. The coordinator advises the students about the planning and progress of the educational process and gives them relevant recommendations and advice; Counseling students on program-related issues, including mobility, recognition of credits, compatibility of academic courses with the program, individual curricula, etc. is conducted by a specialist of the Quality Assurance Office of the faculty;

● The university library regularly conducts trainings on the use of the university's electronic system and resources. Relevant information is regularly published on the website and sent to students via email. The university operates the Centre for Academic Writing that offers students the opportunity to: ○ register online for seminars offered by the center, which are synchronized with the educational components of different levels developed by the center and additionally offers students assistance in developing writing skills;

● take advantage of the online resources created by the Centre for Academic Writing, which are available on the Centre's website: http://writingcentre.iliauni.edu.ge/. To provide the above-mentioned academic support, the Centre for Academic Writing uses resources such as the eLearning platform and Turnitin.

The university has a psychological counseling center for students. Qualified specialists who are employed there provide psychological counseling to students. At the center, students are helped by professionals who have graduated from the master's programs of Ilia State University, including the master's program in Mental Health, using the latest evidence-based methods, accompanied by regular supervision. Any student who needs help and support with common psychosocial problems such as anxiety, depression, various fears, relationship problems, stress-related conditions, etc. can refer to the counseling center.

A special structural unit – the Iliauni Department of Student Affairs, was created for the academic and career advancement of students, their guidance and greater involvement in university life, ensuring an interesting and diverse student life and effective communication between the administration and students. The department regularly organizes various events or projects in cooperation with various university offices and external partners. The following is organized in order to promote the career development of students and graduates: Mari Burduli Career Month, within

the framework of which about 100 sectoral employment forums were held in 2019-2022; Up to 80 meetings with representatives of leading companies and persons involved in the planning and management of employment policy; Up to 10 tutorials posted on the Online Iliauni platform; ADS GEORGIA project, which was implemented in cooperation with leading communication and creative agencies of the country; The Restart project was implemented in cooperation with the consulting company "Gepra"; Tourmode project, implemented in cooperation with the National Tourism Center and tourist organizations; Students' paid internship projects. In regards with career development and employment of students, the Department of Student Affairs registers students and graduates on the base of career development services of Ilia State University within the framework of the employment promotion program UNIJOBS. As a result, job vacancies, internship programs, offers related to employment and career development are filtered on the basis of the obtained information and applicants are sent information of interest to them via the specified email address on a daily basis. Notably, in order to employ students of Ilia State University, the Department of Student Affairs constantly receives proposals from various companies, the registration of which, if there are relevant vacancies, is carried out in parallel. Currently, approximately 500 employers are registered in the relevant database. The Department of Student Affairs provides information to students about more than 1,000 vacancies annually. At the same time, employment days of various companies are organized at Ilia State University throughout the year and within its framework company representatives meet students of the respective fields and present various vacancies tailored to them. In addition to thematic forums and meetings, the Iliauni Department of Student Affairs annually holds a culminating employment week and forum, in which dozens of companies are presented with current vacancies. Students and graduates receive information about the employment forum through the university e-mail, website, official pages and groups of social networks. In addition to the above, the Department of Student Affairs of the university carries out various events and activities to ensure maximum involvement of students in university life. Under the auspices of the department, such activities as: advisory/information meetings, field trips/camps, workshops, employment forums, sports and cultural activities and other extracurricular activities are regularly carried out. Also, the department plays an important part in supporting student initiatives. The student project reviewing committee at the Department of Student Affairs makes decisions regarding the support of student-initiated project proposals. The events/projects organized by the department in the above-mentioned direction are: ➔ Field camps for the top-performing first-year students– for better integration into university life, the Department of Student Affairs organizes field camps at the university's research bases in the beginning of the academic year for the freshmen who were enrolled at Iliauni with the best scores in the Unified National Examinations. There students get to know the university environment and principles and are informed about the opportunities that exist for them at the university. Other university offices also participate in these field camps with the faculties, for example, the Centre for Academic Writing. The teachers of the center conduct plagiarism awareness sessions during these camps. In 2018-2023, 14 such three-day field camps were held, in which a total of approximately 400 students were given the opportunity to participate; ➔ Student clubs – in order to encourage extracurricular activities and integration of students into the university environment, professional student clubs, as well as artistic, cultural and cognitive clubs operate at the university. These clubs are an essential part of student life and represent student communities united around common interests. The Department of Student Affairs plays an important part in the cooperation with student clubs. As of 2023, there are 20 student clubs in the university, including: "Debate Club", "Managers' Club", "Club What? Where? When?", "Google Developer Club" and others. Clubs, as well as a single student or an initiative group, have the opportunity to initiate any project that is submitted to the student project reviewing committee. In case of approval of the committee, the university ensures the allocation of technical, financial or other resources necessary for the implementation of the supported project(s); ➔ Support for student projects – the university has a permanent fund that provides financial support for projects initiated by students, student clubs, and student initiative groups. Between 2018 and 2023, 436 student projects were initiated at Ilia State University, 88% of which were approved by the student project review commission, and the students were provided with the required resources from the university to implement their projects. Within the scope of these projects, students and student clubs had the opportunity to participate in interesting and important activities for them, or to plan and organize the desired event themselves. For example, folk

songs and dance clubs participated in dozens of cultural festivals in Georgia and abroad through student projects. The participation of students in the European Universities Games, which is one of the largest sports and cultural events held for students, was financed. Students were able to implement large educational projects: "Copy Break", an intellectual game "What? Where? When?" that is held every semester, "PR days", through student projects. Within the framework of student projects, the team composed of Iliauni students also had the opportunity to participate in the startup competition, held in Bulgaria, Sofia, which they won; → Field trips/camps – field trips/camps are an important part of university extracurricular activities. Schools on various topics are organized by the Department of Student Affairs as well as by faculties and academic staff. In 2019-2023, 13 such field trips/camps were organized by the Department of Student Affairs with the support of faculties. For example, the interdisciplinary winter school "Georgia and Europe: Connections and Perspectives" was held in November-December 2023. The mentioned school was dedicated to Georgia's adoption of the EU membership candidate status. Approximately 30 students and 15 professors from different programs participated in it; → Sports – one of the directions of university life of students at Ilia State University is sports clubs and sports activities. The Department of Student Affairs administers intra-university championships of 9 sports (mini-football, chess, table tennis, basketball, billiards, arm wrestling, volleyball, bowling, judo) every semester. The university also has 5 university teams in the following sports: futsal (boys' team); volleyball (girls); volleyball (boys); basketball (boys). More than 4,600 students were involved in intra-university championships and sports activities in 2018-2023; → International Seasonal Schools – in addition to local field schools/camps, Ilia State University regularly hosts international seasonal schools where foreign professors and students participate along with Iliauni students and academic staff.

The International Relations Office administers international exchange programs (e.g., Erasmus+) and provides international mobility opportunities for university students. Within the framework of the exchange programs, the office offers students various types of support services: Ensures the availability of information through the website, "Argus", email and social networks; Conducts regular information meetings with students; Provides individual counseling to interested students; Assists students in the process of study agreements with faculties; Conducts pre-departure orientation meetings for students who won; Provides preparation of relevant official letters and support for student visa applications; Ensures that students are informed about intra-university procedures; Continues to support students during the mobility period to resolve various issues, if necessary. Additionally, the International Relations Office provides students with access to information about international opportunities (summer schools, international scholarships, conferences, internships, etc.) that are not administered by the university. The International Students and Program Marketing Office was established to promote the development of international programs, attract local and foreign students for international programs, advise and support them. The office leads the following activities: Promoting the internationalization of the educational process at the university; Attracting international students; Attracting local students; Admitting and enrolling international students; Monitoring the educational process of international students; Supporting international students; Promoting cultural integration of international students.

In addition to the above, it should be noted that the Iliauni FabLab has been operating centrally at Ilia State University since 2015. Initially functioning independently, it became part of the Technological Entrepreneurship and Innovation Development Center in 2022. It is the first FabLab created on the basis of a university in Georgia, modeled after the media lab of the Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT Media Lab). The Fablab provides students and other interested parties with the opportunity to turn innovative ideas into reality with the help of qualified staff and state-of-the-art equipment. FabLab Iliauni offers courses in the field of technology that are oriented on hands-on, applied skills to students, as well as graduates (and academic staff, pupils and the general public), completely free of charge. The aim of these courses is to provide the participants with knowledge and skills corresponding to the requirements of the modern market and thereby increase their employment prospects. The academic courses conducted by Fablab are: graphic design course (Adobe Illustrator, Adobe Photoshop, Coreldraw), 3D modeling course (Cinema 4D, Fusion 360, Rhino), block programming, social media course, entrepreneurship course, mobile application development, web

development, Python course, game creation course, electronics course, digital security, robotics course, 3D printing course and many more. Since 2017, more than 3,000 students have received training in various areas listed above with the help of Fablab Iliauni, which includes both long-term and short-term courses. Fablab has assisted more than 300 startups or budding entrepreneurs in developing, prototyping and creating final products, including student startups, since its establishment.

It should be noted that in 2022, the Technological Entrepreneurship and Innovation Development Center was established at Ilia State University as a structural unit of the university, and FabLab Iliauni, Zoomout Pre-Accelerator and Gamelab were united under it. The center operates within the framework of the university's mission, aiming to provide services focused on students' needs and career support. Since its establishment, the center actively continues the existing activities and projects of FabLab and Zoomout Pre-Accelerator, and also carries out activities focused on the development of university students, student startups, budding entrepreneurs, and pupils. In 2023, on the initiative of the center, the university representative office of Startup Grind was opened at Ilia State University. Startup Grind is a global organization that unites up to 3 million entrepreneurs around the world. The main goal of the organization is to discover and promote the development of startups, knowledge sharing and creation of entrepreneurial communities. By registering a representative on the university base, the center implements many events where students are involved as volunteers, who get real practical experience and organize meetings, get involved in the work process, which contributes to their development.

It should be noted that within the framework of the existing cooperation between the Master's program: "Business Administration" (English) and Burgenland University of Applied Sciences, Ilia State University periodically hosts students and academic staff from the Burgenland University and organizes academic events, which gives the students of the program the opportunity to establish international connections.

For doctoral students, in addition to the consulting services presented above, there is an opportunity to receive feedback on the progress of their research from the staff and doctoral students involved in the program within the colloquiums provided by the doctoral program. In addition, it is worth noting that information related to the mandatory components of the doctoral program was prepared and shared in the form of a document at the Faculty of Business, Technology and Education to increase the awareness of doctoral students and their supervisors.

Additionally, it is worth noting that the "Personal and Professional Development Center (PPDC)" was established at the university, which offers doctoral students various types of training for professional development, for example, "modern teaching methods", "active teaching in a flipped classroom" etc. It should be noted that professional development trainings and activities are held for doctoral students within the framework of the International Doctoral School f. e.: "Effective Academic Communication", "PR for Young Scientists and Academics", "Engaging with Sources Information Seeking and Literature Review", "Research Data – Management, Infrastructure and Applications", "Stress Management", "Presentation Skills", "Statistics and Data Analysis: Data Visualization & Univariate Analysis", Summer School on Research Methods for Doctoral Students and Young Researchers, "Grounded theory" etc. These activities contribute to the development of doctoral students.

The creation of a unified communication system/network within the framework of the Carl Friedrich Lehmann-Haupt International Doctoral School is considered for information exchange, collection, organization and promotion of initial/intermediate research results, reports, colloquiums, and financial support of their research, assistance in finding doctoral scholarships both locally and internationally.

Information is disseminated by all the above-mentioned offices through the website, "Argus", email and social networks.

Evidences/Indicators

- Bylaws of the International Relations Office;
- Bylaws of the International Students and Program Marketing Office;
- Bylaws of the Scientific Research Coordination Office;
- Bylaws of the Office of Development;
- Psychological Counseling Center for students: https://bit.ly/3MoRMxu
- Bylaws of the Department of Student Affairs;
- Ilia State University Library: http://library.iliauni.edu.ge
- International exchange programs:
https://iliauni.edu.ge/ge/iliauni/units/foreignrelations/gacvliti-programebi ;
- Electronic selection system "Argus": http://argus.ge/ge/ ;
- A sample of the agreement to be signed between the university and the student (available at the faculty);
- Personal files of administrative and support staff - fully available at the Human Resources Office of the university;
- Report on Service Research (available at the Quality Assurance Office of the university);
- Agreements signed within the framework of the international exchange program;
- Bylaws of the Personal and Professional Development Center;
- Trainings carried out by the Personal and Professional Development Center;
- Bylaws and website of the Centre for Academic Writing: http://writingcentre.iliauni.edu.ge/ ;
- Website of FabLab Iliauni: https://fablab.iliauni.edu.ge/
- Expert Panel's meeting with the head of the programs;
- Expert Panel's meeting with academic and invited staff;
- Expert Panel's meeting with representatives of quality assurance service;
- Expert Panel's meetings with students, graduates and employers of the programs.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster:

- 3.1.1 It is suggested to diversify student services based on the study of their wishes to ensure that services cater to the diverse student population rather than adopting a one-size-fits-all approach.

Recommendations and suggestions according to the Programs: N/A

Evaluation

Component 3.1 Student consulting and support services	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision

➢ A scientific supervisor provides proper support to master's and doctorate students to perform the scientific-research component successfully.

➢ Within master's and doctoral Programs, ratio of students and supervisors enables to perform scientific supervision properly.

Cluster and individual evaluation

In order to ensure the effectiveness of master's theses supervision, Master's Thesis Guidelines have been developed, taking into consideration the specifics of each program, at the Faculty of Business, Technology and Education. These documents systematize and regulate the requirements and processes at the master's level, including the rights and duties of the supervisor. Information about the profiles and research interests of the academic staff involved in the program is posted on the website, which facilitates the selection process of the supervisors based on the research interests of the students of master's and doctoral programs. The above-mentioned information about the research interests of the staff as well as the Master's Thesis Guidelines is published in the electronic selection system "Argus". The work on the master's thesis begins in the final (4th) semester within the framework of master's programs. While working on the master's thesis, the student chooses the supervisor and, if necessary, the co-supervisor in the semester before the final semester. The program provides students with the qualified academic or invited staff with relevant knowledge and scientific-research experience.

The supervisor of the master's thesis must have scientific research experience relevant to the research topic and can be: academic or invited staff who, depending on the specifics of the field, has actively participated in scientific research or has published a scientific work that corresponds to the general topic/direction of the master's work; a doctoral candidate in the relevant direction or field, who has defended a prospectus in the relevant direction or field or a publication corresponding to the requirements stipulated by the doctoral program; a researcher in the relevant direction or field, who has an academic degree of doctor in the relevant direction or field and has published in journals included in international bases in the last two years. Upon agreement with the student on the master's thesis, the supervisor submits the appropriate consent form, where they indicate the student's first name, last name and title of the thesis.

The obligations of the supervisor of the master's thesis include the following types of support for the student's research work: In the course of the master's thesis, providing regular counseling to the student regarding the methodology/design used for the thesis, the implementation of the research and the process of writing the master's thesis. As well as advising students in the process of participating in scientific events and presenting results; Evaluating the student's work progress and providing constructive and timely feedback (regarding the research plan and thesis); Checking the submitted work for plagiarism.

As for the supervision of the doctoral student, the Bylaws of the Dissertation Board and Doctoral Studies stipulate that the scientific supervisor must be a university professor, associate professor, assistant professor, emeritus professor, who has a doctoral degree, scientific-research experience relevant to the research direction of the doctoral student and is equipped with the latest knowledge; on the basis of the specifics of the field, has actively participated in scientific research and has published a scientific paper that corresponds to the general topic/direction of the doctoral dissertation. It should be noted that the first major project of the international doctoral school - the Carl Friedrich Lehmann-Haupt International Doctoral Program (LHIDP), started in 2018. It is implemented in cooperation with the Georg-August-Universität Göttingen. Participating doctoral students are given the opportunity to benefit from the scientific-academic supervision of Georgian and German professors and, upon successful completion of their doctoral project, receive a doctoral degree from both a Georgian and a German university. The project is implemented with the support of Volkswagen Foundation and Shota Rustaveli National Science Foundation of Georgia.

The doctoral program gives the doctoral student the opportunity to have a foreign co-supervisor and to obtain a double degree on the basis of the Cotutelle principle. If necessary, the doctoral student may have more than one scientific supervisor. Also, the second supervisor/co-supervisor of the doctoral student can be invited from another academic institution, including a foreign country, within the framework of the international cooperation agreement or by the decision of the sectoral commission.

The main functions and duties of the scientific supervisor are to conduct regular consultations with the doctoral student, which means: Periodic feedback on the progress of the doctoral student; Providing general scientific advice; Selecting research methodology and design; Assisting in the process of writing a thesis/scientific-research paper/dissertation, in the process of integration into the local and international scientific network, in the process of participation in local and international scientific events (including doctoral colloquiums) and in the process of presenting results; Giving advice on publishing scientific articles in refereed journals.

The total number of students in the master's and doctoral programs grouped in the cluster is in line with the methodology of planning the student contingent, and the issue of supervising no more than 8 students at the master's and doctoral levels at the same time is considered in the case of a potential supervisor.

It should be noted here that the Master's Thesis and Doctoral Dissertation Guidelines take into consideration the procedures for adhering to the principles of academic integrity. In particular, papers are checked for plagiarism using the Turnitin software, and if found, the master's student is given the opportunity to correct the errors and re-upload it to the system within a week. After that, the student's completed work is checked for plagiarism again, and in the case of plagiarism being detected by any evaluator (supervisor, reviewer, defense committee), the master's thesis, as a component of the program, is canceled for the student. In the case that plagiarism is detected in a doctoral dissertation at any stage of the process, the work will be disqualified from the defense procedures, and the doctoral student will be expelled from the program due to academic dishonesty.

Within the framework of the internal quality mechanisms of the educational programs operating at the university, the evaluation of the component of master's thesis and doctoral dissertation is provided, which also includes the

evaluation of the supervision process. Within the framework of the mentioned mechanism, evaluation tools (student surveys) have been developed and with the use of them data, in relation to various aspects of supervision, is collected. Based on the results of the analysis of the received data, the strengths and areas for improvement of the mentioned component are identified and appropriate interventions/measures are determined on the basis of the identified needs. In the fall semester of last year, a workshop was held for the supervisors of doctoral students on the basis of the needs identified from the aforementioned studies. Within its framework, the main principles and existing difficulties of the supervision of doctoral students, issues related to time management, responsibilities, ethical approaches, integration of doctoral students and other relevant topics were discussed. It should be noted that training and workshops are periodically carried out by the International Doctoral School in relation to important issues for the guidance of doctoral students.

Despite the effectiveness of the ongoing research processes both on Ma and PhD programs there might be room for improvement. Therefore, the expert's panel suggests strengthening research components on MA, as well as on PhD programs, particularly to enhance the quality of student works.

Data related to the supervision of master's students Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	
Number of master's theses supervisors	43
Number of master's students	142
Ratio - supervisors of master's theses/master's students	0.30

Data related to the supervision of master's students Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	
Number of master's theses supervisors	30
Number of master's students	50
Ratio - supervisors of master's theses/master's students	0.6

Data related to the supervision of master's students Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	
Number of master's theses supervisors	19
Number of master's students	73
Ratio - supervisors of master's theses/master's students	0.26

Data related to the supervision of doctoral students Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	
Number of doctoral theses supervisors	16
Number of doctoral students	1

Ratio - supervisors of doctoral theses/doctoral students	16

Evidences/Indicators

● Educational program;
● Master's Thesis Guidelines;
● Doctoral Dissertation Guidelines;
● Bylaws of the Dissertation Board and Doctoral Studies of the Faculty of Business, Technology and Education;
● Electronic selection system "Argus": http://argus.ge/ge/
● Personal files of academic and invited staff;
● Faculty website:
● https://faculty.iliauni.edu.ge/biznesis-teqnologiis-da-ganathlebis-phakulteti/
● The method of evaluating the implementation of educational programs of Ilia State University;
● Ilia State University student body planning mechanism and methodology;
● Alumni Survey Report;
● Program Satisfaction Survey Report
● Expert Panel's meeting with the head of the programs;
● Expert Panel's meeting with academic and invited staff;
● Expert Panel's meeting with representatives of quality assurance service;
● Expert Panel's meetings with students, graduates of the programs.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster:
● 3.2.1 It is suggested to strengthen research components on MA, as well as on PhD programs, particularly to enhance the quality of student works.

Recommendations and suggestions according to the Programs: N/A

Evaluation

Component 3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

Compliance of the Programs with the standards

3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

4. Providing Teaching Resources

Human, material, information and financial resources of educational Program/educational Programs grouped in a cluster ensure the sustainable, stable, efficient and effective functioning of the Program and the achievement of the defined objectives.

4.1 Human Resources

➢ Program staff consists of qualified persons who have necessary competences in order to help students to achieve the Program learning outcomes.

➢ The number and workload of Program academic/scientific and invited staff ensures the sustainable running of the educational process and also, proper execution of their research/creative/performance activities and other assigned duties. Quantitative indicators related to academic/scientific/invited staff ensure Program sustainability.

➢ The Head of the Program possesses necessary knowledge and experience required for Program elaboration, and also the appropriate competences in the field of study of the Program. He/she is personally involved in Program implementation.

➢ Program students are provided with an adequate number of administrative and support staff with relevant competence.

Cluster and individual evaluation

The academic and visiting staff of the cluster's eight programs are highly qualified and possess the necessary competencies to fulfill their roles and help students achieve the program's learning outcomes. Their inclusion in the programs complies with the rules and legislation of Ilia State University. They have made significant contributions to scientific work, including publications, participation in academic events, and involvement in research projects. Their experience and qualifications are confirmed by personal files and CVs.

A workload scheme for the academic and invited staff involved in the cluster's programs has been developed by the Faculty of Business, Technology, and Education. This scheme allows for the monitoring of staff workloads, taking into account the contractual obligations and full workload of both academic and invited staff within the cluster's programs.

The university presented the "Staff Workload of Educational Programs United in the Management Cluster," where the ratio of academic staff to invited staff was not always acceptable for certain programs (see Description and Analysis of each Program).

Additionally, the turnover rate of academic staff has been observed in some cases to be high (see Description and Analysis of each Program). Hours allocated for student consultation are envisaged by the workload of academic/scientific/invited personnel.
It should be noted that the academic staff is fully affiliated with the university. In the workload of academic staff is not shown scientific work direction. The university must take into account the scientific work in the workload of the academic staff

The heads of the programs have good profiles and possess the necessary abilities to provide effective guidance. Their involvement in assessment, implementation, student advising, and organizing relevant academic activities was clearly outlined with references to specific measures. During the interviews, both management and academic staff demonstrated a mature understanding of their roles, clear insights into the field, and shared significant information regarding scientific achievements.

Program students are supported by an adequate number of administrative and support staff with appropriate competencies. It should be noted that the qualifications of the administrative and support staff correspond to their functions.

Description and Analysis

Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS

Structure of Program staff.
A total of 134 persons are involved in the program, including 33 academic staff members and 101 invited lecturers. The academic staff comprises 3 professors, 22 associate professors, and 8 assistant professors, all of whom (33) are affiliated with the university.

Student Enrollment and Ratios.
The program has 1618 students enrolled. The ratios for staff to students are as follows:

- Affiliated Academic Staff/Students: 1:49.03 (0.02),
- Total Staff/Students: 1:12.07 (0.08).
- Academic/Visiting Staff: 1:3.06 (0.32),
- Staff Turnover (Last 5 Years): Academic Staff: 41.9% turnover (55.2% retention), Invited Staff: 74.9% turnover (14.1% retention).

Scientific Activities:
A total of 632 scientific activities have been reported, including: 285 published papers (114 in local journals and 171 in international journals), 217 conference presentations (88 at local conferences and 129 at international conferences), 130 other scientific or research activities.

The program has a relatively high ratio of visiting to academic staff (3.06 visiting lecturers for every 1 academic staff member), which may suggest an over-reliance on visiting lecturers. However, interviews indicate that this issue is being managed through long-term contracts with visiting staff, and there are opportunities for invited staff to be promoted.

The student-to-affiliated-academic-staff ratio (49.03) students per 1 affiliated academic staff member) is moderately high.

The staff turnover rate is significant, particularly among invited staff, with a turnover rate of 74.9%. This suggests potential instability in the teaching workforce, which may impact continuity and the quality of education.

The program demonstrates a strong commitment to scientific activity, with a diverse range of outputs including publications and conference presentations. The high proportion of international activities is a positive indicator of the program's global engagement and the academic staff's active participation in the broader academic community.

Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS

Number of the staff involved in the Program (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Program Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Total number of academic staff	134	93	48	33
- Professor	3	3	3	3
- Associate Professor	22	15	15	22
- Assistant-Professor	8	5	-	8
- Assistant	-	-	-	-
Invited Staff	101	70	30	
Scientific Staff	-	-	-	-

Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS

Structure of Program staff.

A total of 39 persons are involved in the program, including 22 academic staff members and 17 invited lecturers. The academic staff comprises 4 professors, 13 associate professors, and 5 assistant professors, all of whom (22) are affiliated with the university.

Student Enrollment and Ratios.

The program has 76 students enrolled. The ratios for staff to students are as follows:

- Affiliated Academic Staff/Students: 1:3.4 (0.29),
- Total Staff/Students: 1:2 (0.51).
- Academic/Visiting Staff: 1:0.8 (1.29),
- Staff Turnover (Last 5 Years): Academic Staff: 32.4 % turnover (60.0% retention), Invited Staff: 115% turnover – according to the data all personnel has changed during last 5 years.

Scientific Activities:

A total of 170 scientific activities have been reported, including: 79 published papers (38 in local journals and 41 in international journals), 72 conference presentations (23 at local conferences and 49 at international conferences), 19 other scientific or research activities.

For each academic staff, there is one invited staff, but the turnover of invited staff is high for invited personnel, which may suggest that the quality of teaching can be affected. For this program, University has to pay more attention to the retention of invited staff.

The student-to-affiliated-academic-staff ratio (3.4 students per 1 affiliated academic staff member) is an adequate rate and a moderate rate of academic staff turnover suggest that the quality of teaching program is assured and individual attention to achieve learning outcomes.

The program demonstrates a strong commitment to scientific activity, with a diverse range of outputs including publications and conference presentations. The high proportion of international activities is a positive indicator of the program's global engagement and the academic staff's active participation in the broader academic community.

Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS				
Number of the staff involved in the Program (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Program Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Total number of academic staff	39	16	24	22
- Professor	4	4	4	4
- Associate Professor	13	11	10	13
- Assistant-Professor	5	2	-	5

- Assistant	-	-	-	-
Invited Staff	17		10	-
Scientific Staff				-

Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS

Structure of Program staff.
A total of 132 persons are involved in the program, including 32 academic staff members and 100 invited lecturers. The academic staff comprises 2 professors, 22 associate professors, and 8 assistant professors, all of whom (32) are affiliated with the university.

Student Enrollment and Ratios.
The program was launched in the academic period 2024, so not all ratios cannot be calculated. The ratio of Academic/Visiting Staff: 1:3.1 (0.32). This rate is relatively high which may suggest an over-reliance on visiting lecturers. However, interviews indicate that this issue is being managed through long-term contracts with visiting staff, and there are opportunities for invited staff to be promoted.

Scientific Activities.
A total of 620 scientific activities have been reported, including: 281 published papers (112 in local journals and 169 in international journals), 212 conference presentations (86 at local conferences and 126 at international conferences), 127 other scientific or research activities.

The program demonstrates a strong commitment to scientific activity, with a diverse range of outputs including publications and conference presentations. The high proportion of international activities is a positive indicator of the program's global engagement and the academic staff's active participation in the broader academic community.

Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS				
Number of the staff involved in the Program (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Program Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Total number of academic staff	132	115	48	32
- Professor	2	2	2	2
- Associate Professor	22	18	16	22
- Assistant-Professor	8	6	-	8
- Assistant	-	-	-	-

Invited Staff	100	85	30	
Scientific Staff	-	-	-	-

Program 4. Management, English, Bachelor, 180 ECTS

Structure of Program staff.
A total of 38 persons are involved in the program, including 2 academic staff members and 16 invited lecturers. The academic staff comprises 4 professors, 13 associate professors, and 5 assistant professors, all of whom (22) are affiliated with the university.

Student Enrollment and Ratios.
The program was launched in the academic period 2024, so not all ratios cannot be calculated. The ratio of Academic/Visiting Staff: 1:0.72 (1.375). As for Bachelor program counting 240 ECTS, the number of invited staff is less than the number of academic staff. This rate suggests the reliance more on affiliated lecturers. Taking into account the high rate of turnover of invited personal in case of 240 ECTS program it is suggested to the University to take some corrective actions to not admit the same situation for 180 ECTS program.

Scientific Activities:
A total of 170 scientific activities have been reported, including: 79 published papers (38 in local journals and 41 in international journals), 72 conference presentations (23 at local conferences and 49 at international conferences), 19 other scientific or research activities.

The program demonstrates a strong commitment to scientific activity, with a diverse range of outputs including publications and conference presentations. The high proportion of international activities is a positive indicator of the program's global engagement and the academic staff's active participation in the broader academic community.

Program 4. Management, English, Bachelor, 180 ECTS				
Number of the staff involved in the Program (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Program Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Total number of academic staff	38	31	25	22
- Professor	4	4	4	4
- Associate Professor	13	11	13	13
- Assistant-Professor	5	2	-	5
- Assistant	-	-	-	-

Invited Staff	16	14	8	-
Scientific Staff				

Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS

Structure of Program staff.
A total of 43 persons are involved in the program, including 23 academic staff members and 20 invited lecturers. The academic staff comprises 3 professors, 15 associate professors, and 5 assistant professors, all of whom (23) are affiliated with the university.

Student Enrollment and Ratios.
The program has 142 students enrolled. The ratios for staff to students are as follows:
● Affiliated Academic Staff/Students: 1:6.17 (0.16),
● Total Staff/Students: 1:3.3 (0.3).
● Academic/Visiting Staff: 1:0.86 (1.15),
● Staff Turnover (Last 5 Years): Academic Staff: 49.0% turnover (53.8% retention), Invited Staff: 81.3% turnover (8.3% retention).

Scientific Activities:
A total of 263 scientific activities have been reported, including: 102 published papers (49 in local journals and 53 in international journals), 104 conference presentations (53 at local conferences and 51 at international conferences), 57 other scientific or research activities.

The ratio of student to the total staff is 3.3 student per one person, and 6.17 student per affiliated staff suggests that student beneficiate from individual attentions and contribute to the achieving of learning outcomes.

The University have to pay attention to the retention of the invited staff to assure the continuing quality of educational program.

The program demonstrates a strong commitment to scientific activity, with a diverse range of outputs including publications and conference presentations. The high proportion of international activities is a positive indicator of the program's global engagement and the academic staff's active participation in the broader academic community.

Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS				
Number of the staff involved in the Program (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Program Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Total number of academic staff	43	35	24	23
- Professor	3	3	3	3
- Associate Professor	15	15	13	15

- Assistant-Professor	5	5		5
- Assistant	0			
Invited Staff	20	12	8	
Scientific Staff				

Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS

Structure of Program staff.

A total of 30 persons are involved in the program, including 14 academic staff members and 16 invited lecturers. The academic staff comprises 2 professors, 10 associate professors, and 2 assistant professors, all of whom (14) are affiliated with the university.

Student Enrollment and Ratios.

The program has 50 students enrolled. The ratios for staff to students are as follows:

● Affiliated Academic Staff/Students: 1:3.57 (0.28),
● Total Staff/Students: 1:1.66 (0.6).
● Academic/Visiting Staff: 1:1.14 (0.88),
● Staff Turnover (Last 5 Years): Academic Staff: 51.6% turnover (52.9% retention), Invited Staff: 86.7% turnover (7.1% retention),

Scientific Activities:

A total of 152 scientific activities have been reported, including: 73 published papers (38 in local journals and 35 in international journals), 33 conference presentations (11 at local conferences and 21 at international conferences), 47 other scientific or research activities.

The ratio of student to the total staff is 1.66 student per one person, and 3.57 student per affiliated staff suggests that student beneficiate from individual attentions and contribute to the achieving of learning outcomes.

The University have to pay attention to the retention of the invited staff to assure the continuing quality of educational program, as the retention of invited staff is 7.1%.

The program demonstrates a strong commitment to scientific activity, with a diverse range of outputs including publications and conference presentations. The high proportion of international activities is a positive indicator of the program's global engagement and the academic staff's active participation in the broader academic community.

Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS				
Number of the staff involved in the Program (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Program Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Total number of academic staff	30	24	16	14
- Professor	2	2	2	2
- Associate Professor	10	10	10	10

- Assistant-Professor	2	2		2
- Assistant				
Invited Staff	16	10	4	
Scientific Staff				

Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS

Structure of Program staff.

A total of 19 persons are involved in the program, including 16 academic staff members and 3 invited lecturers. The academic staff comprises 4 professors, 9 associate professors, and 3 assistant professors, all of whom (16) are affiliated with the university.

Student Enrollment and Ratios.
The program has 73 students enrolled. The ratios for staff to students are as follows:
● Affiliated Academic Staff/Students: 1:4.54 (0.22),
● Total Staff/Students: 1:3.8 (0.26).
● Academic/Visiting Staff: 1:0.19 (5.33),
● Staff Turnover (Last 5 Years): Academic Staff: 33.3% turnover (64.3% retention), Invited Staff: 114.3% turnover.

Scientific Activities:
A total of 99 scientific activities have been reported, including: 40 published papers (17 in local journals and 23 in international journals), 44 conference presentations (11 at local conferences and 33 at international conferences), 15 other scientific or research activities.

The student-to-affiliated-academic-staff ratio (4.54 students per 1 affiliated academic staff member) is an adequate rate and a moderate rate of academic staff turnover suggest that the quality of teaching program is assured and individual attention to achieve learning outcomes.

The turnover of invited staff is high for invited personnel, which may suggest that the quality of teaching can be affected. For this program, University has to pay more attention to the retention of invited staff.

The program demonstrates a strong commitment to scientific activity, with a diverse range of outputs including publications and conference presentations. The high proportion of international activities is a positive indicator of the program's global engagement and the academic staff's active participation in the broader academic community.

Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS				
Number of the staff involved in the Program (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Program Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Total number of academic staff	19	19	13	16

- Professor	4	4	4	4
- Associate Professor	9	9	9	9
- Assistant-Professor	3	3	-	3
- Assistant				
Invited Staff	3	3		
Scientific Staff	-	-		

Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS

Structure of Program staff.

A total of 16 persons are involved in the program, all of them are affiliated academic staff members. The academic staff comprises 6 professors and 10 associate professors.

Student Enrollment and Ratios.
The program has 1 student enrolled. The ratios for staff to students are as follows:
● Affiliated Academic Staff/Students: 1:0.06 (16),
● Total Staff/Students: 1:0.06 (16).
● Staff Turnover (Last 5 Years): Academic Staff: 34.5% turnover (61.5% retention).

Scientific Activities:
A total of 163 scientific activities have been reported, including: 67 published papers (30 in local journals and 37 in international journals), 41 conference presentations (30 at local conferences and 11 at international conferences), 55 other scientific or research activities.

The program has a relatively high ratio of visiting to academic staff (3.6 visiting lecturers for every 1 academic staff member), which may suggest an over-reliance on visiting lecturers. However, interviews indicate that this issue is being managed through long-term contracts with visiting staff, and there are opportunities for invited staff to be promoted.

The program demonstrates a strong commitment to scientific activity, with a diverse range of outputs including publications and conference presentations. The high proportion of international activities is a positive indicator of the program's global engagement and the academic staff's active participation in the broader academic community.

Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS				
Number of the staff involved in the Program (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)	Number of Program Staff	Including the staff with sectoral expertise	Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Total number of academic staff	16	16	16	16

- Professor	6	6	6	6
- Associate Professor	10	10	10	10
- Assistant-Professor	-	-	-	-
- Assistant	-	-	-	-
Invited Staff	-	-	-	-
Scientific Staff	-	-	-	-

Evidences/Indicators

- Self-evaluation reports
- Personal files of academic, visiting and administrative staff;
- Ilia State University student contingent planning mechanism and methodology;
- The ratio of academic and visiting staff to students enrolled in the program in relation to quantity;
- Job description of the head of the program;
- University website: www.iliauni.edu.ge ;
- Expert Panel's meeting with the head of the programs;
- Expert Panel's meeting with academic and invited staff;
- Expert Panel's meeting with representatives of quality assurance service;
- Expert Panel's meetings with students, graduates and employers of the programs.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/a

General suggestions of the cluster: N/a

Recommendations and suggestions according to the Programs:

○ **Bachelor and Master programs:**

    ○ 4.1.1. It is suggested that university pay attention to the retain the academic staff;
    ○ 4.1.2. It is suggested that university pay attention to the retain of invited staff, especially for master programs.

Evaluation

Component 4.1 Human resources	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

4.2 Qualification of Supervisors of Master's and Doctoral Students

Master's and Doctoral students have qualified supervisor/supervisors and, if necessary, co-supervisor/co-supervisors who have relevant scientific-research experience in the field of research.

Cluster and individual evaluation

The university has developed guidance requirements for the supervisor / co-supervisor, which are in line with the requirements of the Master /Doctoral level supervision and respond to the specifics of the Program and international best practice;

The requirements for the supervisors of the master's theses of the master's programs included in the cluster are defined in the Master's Thesis Guidelines. According of that, the supervisor of the master's thesis can be:
● an academic or invited staff who, depending on the specifics of the field, has actively participated in scientific research or has published a scientific work that corresponds to the general topic/direction of the master's work;
● a doctoral candidate in the relevant direction or field, who has defended a prospectus in the relevant direction or field or a publication corresponding to the requirements stipulated by the doctoral program;
● a researcher in the relevant direction or field, who has an academic degree of doctor in the relevant direction or field and has published in journals included in international bases in the last two years.

Most personnel of the HEI are highly qualified and have publications and scientific publications, but there are supervisors in master programs which have latest publications. Not all master's supervisors have a PhD.

University has to follow the requirements for the supervisors of the master's thesis - all supervisors should have PhD degree.

As for the supervision of the doctoral student, the Dissertation Board and the Doctoral Regulations of the Faculty of Business, Technology and Education stipulate that the scientific supervisor must be a university professor, associate professor, assistant professor, emeritus professor, who has a doctoral degree, scientific-research experience relevant to the research direction of the doctoral student and is equipped with the latest knowledge; on the basis of the specifics of the field, has actively participated in scientific research and has published a scientific paper that corresponds to the general topic/direction of the doctoral dissertation.

Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS

Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	These supervisors	Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	43	24	23
- Professor	3	3	3
- Associate Professor	15	13	15
- Assistant-Professor	3		3
Invited Staff	20	8	
Scientific Staff			

Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS

Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	These supervisors	Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	30	16	14
- Professor	2	2	2
- Associate Professor	10	10	10
- Assistant-Professor	2		
Invited Staff	16		
Scientific Staff			

Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS

Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	These supervisors	Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction	Among them, the affiliated academic staff

Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	19	13	16
- Professor	4	4	4
- Associate Professor	9	9	9
- Assistant-Professor	3		3
Invited Staff	3	3	
Scientific Staff			

Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS

Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	These supervisors	Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	16	16	16
- Professor	6	6	6
- Associate Professor	10	10	10
- Assistant-Professor			
Invited Staff			
Scientific Staff			

Evidences/Indicators
- Self-evaluation report
- Samples of academic staff contracts;
- The procedure for holding a competition for an academic position and the conditions of employment for an academic position;
- Personal files of academic and invited staff;
- Master thesis concept;
- Expert Panel's meeting with the head of the programs;
- Expert Panel's meeting with academic and invited staff;
- Expert Panel's meeting with representatives of quality assurance service;
- Expert Panel's meetings with students, graduates and employers of the programs.
- Component evidences/indicators, including the relevant documents and interview results

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Evaluation

Component 4.2 Qualification of supervisors of master's and doctoral students	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	☐	x	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

4.3 Professional Development of Academic, Scientific and Invited Staff

➢ The HEI conducts the evaluation of Program staff and analyses evaluation results on a regular basis.

➢ The HEI fosters professional development of the academic, scientific and invited staff. Moreover, it fosters their scientific and research work.

Cluster and individual evaluation

The Faculty of Business, Technology, and Education has an evaluation mechanism for both academic and invited staff. This mechanism includes an Evaluation Policy for academic staff and another for invited staff. The assessment for academic staff focuses on their research and teaching contributions, while for invited staff, it primarily evaluates their participation in the teaching process.

As mentioned by the self-evaluation group during the interview, this evaluation system, in effect since 2018, considers various components. Teaching and research each have their own evaluation criteria, and the method for evaluating academic staff is based on a system of accumulated points. Activities are ranked, and points are awarded accordingly. The results are presented to the Board of Studies, and the outcomes are reflected in areas such as staff salary increases, promotions, improvements in working conditions, and the promotion of various activities. The document "Academic Staff of Ilia State University: Activity Evaluation Rule" confirms all of the above.

The HEI fosters the professional development of its academic, scientific, and invited staff through a variety of activities. The Personal and Professional Development Center was established to support the growth of academic and invited staff, providing management and teaching personnel with access to numerous training opportunities, grants, and research exchanges. The available resources are sufficient to ensure the effective execution of these activities. From the documentation presented by the university and the results of the interview, it is clear that, between 2021 and 2024, the mentioned center has conducted various types of training for academic, invited, and administrative personnel.

Additionally, the university has developed a certificate program aimed at equipping participants with the skills to apply both formative and summative assessments that align with educational goals. A training session for PhD students, titled "Modern Teaching Methods," was also conducted. The university provided documents confirming both of these events.

During the pandemic, the university took steps to enhance the effectiveness of remote learning. To facilitate the engagement of academic and invited staff in online learning, the university organized webinars, developed guidelines, and conducted trainings through the Personal and Professional Development Center.

The HEI provides necessary conditions for fostering scientific, research and creative work of academic, scientific and invited staff. The scientific research work of the university is supported by the Scientific Research Coordination Office and Office of Development The personnel have the support from the university in the publication of scientific works in international and local scientific journals, preparation of monographs, participation in international conferences, obtaining scientific awards, participation in international collaborations and others.

The university also presented a document highlighting the mobility of academic staff across various European universities within the framework of the Erasmus project from 2019 to 2024. This was also confirmed by the academic staff during the interview, who noted that they were assigned to different universities and had the opportunity to host foreign colleagues.

However, the expert's panel found that most of the staff have no profile on platforms such as Google Scholar, ResearchGate, ORCID, Scopus, and Clarivate. Therefore, the University needs to intensify its efforts in this direction, as it is a key factor in enhancing the scientific research productivity of the staff.

Evidences/Indicators
- Self evaluation report
- Academic Staff of Ilia State University: Activity Evaluation Rule
- Interview results;
- Self- evaluation report on Accreditation of Higher Education Programs.
- Policy on Funding for Participation in International Scientific Conferences and the The method of evaluating the implementation of educational programs of Ilia State University;
- Policy for Evaluating Scientific Research Activities and University Financing;
- Personal files of academic, invited and administrative/support staff.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A
General suggestions of the cluster:
- 4.3.1 It is suggested that the university ensures its all-academic staff have their scientific profiles on various platforms such as Google Scholar, ResearchGate, ORCID, Scopus, and Clarivate.

Evaluation

Component 4.3 Professional development of academic, scientific and invited staff	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

4.4. Material Resources

Program is provided with necessary infrastructure, information resources relevant to the field of study and technical equipment required for achieving Program learning outcomes.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Accreditation experts visited several buildings (S, E, G) located on N3 G. Tsereteli Street, all of which are equipped with the necessary infrastructure. The programs are supported by well-lit, well-equipped auditoriums with modern technical equipment and new furniture, along with modern computer labs, professors' offices, student self-government spaces, individual offices for academic staff, a conference hall, an examination center, a Forbes auditorium with a capacity for 120 students, a consulting room, and a buffet, although the buffet is currently closed this season. The needs of students with disabilities have been thoughtfully considered. The academic staff is provided with dedicated workspace for conducting individual and group consultations with students.

Notably, Ilia State University operates an entrepreneurial innovation laboratory called FabLab, which gives students the opportunity to bring innovative ideas to life with the support of qualified staff. The experts inspected various projects, including student-created robots, specialized devices for beekeeping, and other innovative tools.

Experts visited one of the university libraries, which is managed by qualified specialists. The staff regularly conducts training sessions on the use of the university's electronic systems and resources. The library houses the mandatory literature and other educational materials specified in course syllabi, the latest scientific periodicals, digital resources, and international electronic databases. It should be noted that access to these databases is available not only from within the university but also remotely. According to the library staff, the library is systematically updated. If necessary, students are provided with "readers" in both electronic and printed formats. However, during the student interviews, it became evident that it would be better to have more translated "readers" available in Georgian in the university library."

During the visit, experts verified that the books listed in the syllabi were available.

IT services are supported by the IT department, with each specialist assigned to a specific building. To enhance students' awareness and active involvement in the educational process, the university uses the learning software "Argus." Through this system, students receive information about their class schedules, exam timetables, syllabi, and more. The system also facilitates communication with academic staff. Additionally, remote learning platforms such as Turnitin and E-learning are employed to ensure the achievement of the program's learning outcomes. To prevent plagiarism, Master's Thesis and PhD Dissertation papers are uploaded to the E-learning platform, where the Turnitin system is used to identify similarities. Nvivo data analysis software is also utilized in Master's and Doctoral programs.

The experts were left with a very positive impression after reviewing the university's infrastructure. They confirmed that the programs are supported by the necessary infrastructure, technical equipment, and information resources needed to achieve the desired learning outcomes.

Description and analysis

Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS

The necessary infrastructure and resources are in place for the operation of the Bachelor's Program in 'Management (Major).' The library offers ample resources and services, including convenient e-learning, Argus platforms and access to various databases. There are sufficient student spaces across several locations within the buildings. The mandatory academic course, 'Practical Entrepreneurship,' is delivered with the support of the Technological Entrepreneurship and Innovation Development Center, the FabLab entrepreneurial innovation laboratory and the university's representation of Startup Grind.

Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS

The necessary infrastructure and resources are in place for the operation of the Bachelor's Program in 'Management (Major) English. The library offers ample resources and services, including convenient e-learning, Argus platforms and access to various databases. There are sufficient student spaces across several locations within the buildings. The mandatory academic course, 'Practical Entrepreneurship,' is delivered with the support of the Technological Entrepreneurship and Innovation Development Center, the FabLab entrepreneurial innovation laboratory, and the university's representation of Startup Grind.

Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS

The necessary infrastructure and resources are in place for the operation of the Management, Bachelor, program. The library offers ample resources and services, including convenient e-learning, Argus platforms and access to various databases. There are sufficient student spaces across several locations within the buildings. The academic course, 'Practical Entrepreneurship,' is delivered with the support of the Technological Entrepreneurship and Innovation Development Center, the FabLab entrepreneurial innovation laboratory, and the university's representation of Startup Grind.

Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS

The necessary infrastructure and resources are in place for the operation of the Management (English), Bachelor, program. The library offers ample resources and services, including convenient e-learning, Argus platforms and access to various databases. There are sufficient student spaces across the locations within the buildings.

Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS

The Master's Program in Management is supported by sufficient infrastructure, technical equipment, and study materials necessary to achieve the learning outcomes outlined in the educational program. The library provides adequate resources and services, including convenient e-learning platforms and access to databases. To successfully implement the "Research Methods" course within the master's program, learning materials and software (e.g."Excel", "NVivo") have been used.

Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS

The Master's Program Healthcare Policy and Management" is supported by sufficient infrastructure, technical equipment, and study materials necessary to achieve the learning outcomes outlined in the educational program. The library provides adequate resources and services, including convenient e-learning platforms and access to databases. To successfully implement the "Research Methods" course within the master's program, learning materials and software (e.g."Excel", "NVivo") have been used.

Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS

The Master's Program Business Administration (English) is supported by sufficient infrastructure, technical equipment, and study materials necessary to achieve the learning outcomes outlined in the educational program. The library provides adequate resources and services, including convenient e-learning platforms and access to databases. To successfully implement the "Research Methods" course within the master's program, learning materials and software (e.g."Excel", "NVivo") have been used.

Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS

In order to implement the elective academic courses within the scope of the doctoral program Business Administration, assistance of NVivo and Eviews, data analysis and processing software programs, is required.

Evidences/Indicators
- Self-evaluation report;
- University Library;

- University building and auditoriums;
- List of scientific bases in the university;
- Electronic systems of learning process management;
- Interview results;
- Self- evaluation report on Accreditation of Higher Education Programs.
- The list of software with licensing that is actively used;
- Scientific databases licensing agreements

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster:
- 4.4.1. It is suggested to provide more Georgian study readers to enhance student success, support and promotion.

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the Programs: N/A

Evaluation

Component 4.4 Material resources	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

The allocation of financial resources stipulated in Program/faculty/school budget is economically feasible and corresponds to the Program needs.

Cluster and individual evaluation

The financial resources required for each program's implementation are allocated in the unified university budget in a manner appropriate to the program's needs and are economically feasible. The programs are financially stable, with budgets that cover the necessary resources, personnel funding, and other costs essential for their development.

Description and Analysis

Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS

In the budget for the Management (Major) Bachelor's program, the university has calculated income for 400 students, totaling 900,000 GEL. This budget includes detailed expenses for academic and invited staff salaries, library and infrastructure maintenance, and other necessary costs. Consequently, the financial support for this educational program is economically feasible.

According to the interview results and the Self-Evaluation Report, conferences and other scientific expenses are included in the central budgets of the faculty and university. Additionally, any other program-related expenses, as needed, will be covered by the main budget of the faculty or university.

Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS

In the budget for the Management (Major) Bachelor's program, the university has calculated income for 25 students, totaling 159000 GEL. This budget includes detailed expenses for academic and invited staff salaries, library and infrastructure maintenance, cost of internationalization, cost for development and other necessary costs. Total expenses - 84,500 GEL. Consequently, the financial support for this educational program is economically feasible.

According to the interview results and the Self-Evaluation Report, conferences and other scientific expenses are included in the central budgets of the faculty and university. Additionally, any other program-related expenses, as needed, will be covered by the main budget of the faculty or university.

Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS

In the budget for the Management Bachelor's program, the university has calculated income for 390 students, totaling 877500 GEL.

This budget includes detailed expenses for academic and invited staff salaries, library and infrastructure maintenance, cost of internationalization, cost for development and other necessary costs. Total expenses - 834,000 GEL. Consequently, the financial support for this educational program is economically feasible.

According to the interview results and the Self-Evaluation Report, conferences and other scientific expenses are included in the central budgets of the faculty and university. Additionally, any other program-related expenses, as needed, will be covered by the main budget of the faculty or university.

Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS

In the budget for the Management (English) Bachelor's program, the university has calculated income for 55 students, totaling 381700 GEL. This budget includes detailed expenses for academic and invited staff salaries, library and infrastructure maintenance, cost of internationalization, cost for development and other necessary costs. Total expenses – 18500 GEL. Consequently, the financial support for this educational program is economically feasible.

According to the interview results and the Self-Evaluation Report, conferences and other scientific expenses are included in the central budgets of the faculty and university. Additionally, any other program-related expenses, as needed, will be covered by the main budget of the faculty or university.

Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS

In the budget for the Management Master program, the university has calculated income for 125 students, totaling 562500 GEL. This budget includes detailed expenses for academic and invited staff salaries, library and infrastructure maintenance, cost of internationalization, cost for development and other necessary costs. Total expenses – 472500 GEL. Consequently, the financial support for this educational program is economically feasible.

According to the interview results and the Self-Evaluation Report, conferences and other scientific expenses are included in the central budgets of the faculty and university. Additionally, any other program-related expenses, as needed, will be covered by the main budget of the faculty or university.

Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS

The budget for the Master program -Healthcare Policy and Management is calculated for 30 students, totaling a revenue of 135,000 GEL. This budget includes detailed expenses for academic and invited staff salaries, library and infrastructure maintenance, cost of internationalization, cost for development and other necessary costs. Total expenses – 115,000 GEL. Thus, the financial support for this educational program is economically feasible.

According to the interview results and the Self-Evaluation Report, conferences and other scientific expenses are included in the overall budgets of the faculty and university. Additionally, any other program-related expenses, as needed, will be covered by the main budget of the faculty or university.

Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS

In the budget for the Business Administration (English), Master program, the university has calculated income for 50 students, totaling 388,000 GEL. This budget includes detailed expenses for academic and invited staff salaries, library and infrastructure maintenance, cost for development, internationalization and other necessary costs. Total expenses – 268,000 GEL. Thus, the financial support for this educational program is economically feasible.

According to the interview results and the Self-Evaluation Report, conferences and other scientific expenses are included in the central budgets of the faculty and university. Additionally, any other program-related expenses, as needed, will be covered by the main budget of the faculty or university.

Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS

The budget for the Business Administration, Ph.D program, includes detailed expenses for academic and invited staff salaries, library and infrastructure maintenance, cost for development, Expeditions/ training practice/ conference expenses and other necessary costs. Total expenses – 53,000 GEL. Consequently, the financial support for this educational program is economically feasible.

According to the interview results and the Self-Evaluation Report, conferences and other scientific expenses are included in the central budgets of the faculty and university. Additionally, any other program-related expenses, as needed, will be covered by the main budget of the faculty or university.

The educational process of the program is fully provided by the academic staff of the faculty, whose salary expenses are included in the central budget of the university, and this specific doctoral program does not require additional expenses.

Evidences/Indicators
● Self-Evaluation Report
● Cluster budget
● Ilia State University: Funding Guidelines for Participation in International Scientific Conferences and Publication in International Journals
● Interviews with the management

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Recommendations and Suggestions according to the Programs: N/A

Evaluation

Component 4.5 Program/faculty/school budget and Program financial sustainability	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

Compliance of the Programs with the standards

4. Providing Teaching Resources	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities

In order to enhance teaching quality, Program utilizes internal and external quality assurance services and also periodically conducts Program monitoring and Program review. Relevant data is collected, analysed and utilized for informed decision making and Program development.

5.1. Internal Quality Evaluation

Program staff collaborates with internal quality assurance department(s)/staff available at the HEI when planning the process of Program quality assurance, developing assessment instruments, and implementing assessment process. Program staff utilizes quality assurance results for Program improvement.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Ilia State University's internal quality assurance concept is integral to its strategic management and aims to achieve its mission and strategic objectives. This concept relies on systematic and needs-based research and evaluation practices. It involves various tools such as internal program self-evaluation, analysis of students' academic performance, surveys of students and graduates, benchmarking, employer research, as well as self-assessment and personnel assessments conducted by academic, invited, and administrative staff. It is evident from the analyzed documents and interviews that the development and approval of the programs included in the cluster align with the procedure established by the university's internal regulations. This alignment provides a sense of security and compliance, ensuring that the programs were developed and approved in accordance with the university's standards.

The documents and stakeholder interviews indicated that the program staff actively collaborated with the Internal Quality Assurance Office. It highlights the importance of evaluating the program's quality and addressing the challenges identified during the self-evaluation report process. The documents and interviews revealed that the self-evaluation group members met twice. In contrast, a working group was formed, with its members meeting four times to exchange information about the educational program's development, presented in the form of reports. The following topics were discussed during the meetings, and appropriate actions have been taken: updating training courses, creating program competencies and curriculum maps, establishing a mechanism for evaluating the learning outcomes of the program, and others.

The self-evaluation reports for the clustered education programs have identified three main challenges: thematic overlap, the lack of the latest teaching materials, and the need to increase the number of academic staff. Ilia State University has also provided a separate analysis of the results of internal evaluations, detailing the actions needed to address these challenges. Therefore, the self-evaluation team acknowledges and shares these identified challenges, indicating that the process has been reflective.

The educational programs within the cluster conducted a collaborative self-evaluation process, as evidenced by the documents and interviews studied during the site visit. This inclusive process involved academic and invited staff, faculty administration personnel, and university quality assurance team members, making everyone feel part of a team. During the site visits, the expert panel expressed a desire to understand the involvement of students, graduates, and employers. Interviews revealed that the self-evaluation team had researched to understand each group's attitudes, strengths, weaknesses, and areas for improvement. Evidently, the students, graduates, and employers were not directly represented in the self-evaluation group. However, as self-evaluation is an inclusive and ongoing process, having the direct input of these groups would have made the process more comprehensive.

Moreover, the heads of the educational program within the cluster, academic and invited staff interviewed mentioned that the faculty and the university's quality assurance office played a significant role in providing support and guidance. This support involved formulating program and course objectives and measurable learning outcomes, establishing a mechanism to assess learning outcomes based on academic performance analysis, and improving assessment components. The critical role of these entities in providing support and guidance underscores the robust quality assurance process in place.

Hence, the examples and practices mentioned above indicate that program quality assurance is based on the "Plan, Do, Check, Act (PDCA) cycle principle.

Evidences/Indicators
- Self evaluation report

- Internal quality assurance service assessment results and changes made based on these results;
- Activities and changes made to eliminate weaknesses identified during self-evaluation report elaboration process;
- Survey results conducted by higher education institution;
- Expert Panel's meeting with the head of the Programs;
- Expert Panel's meeting with academic and invited staff;
- Expert Panel's meeting with representatives of quality assurance service;
- Expert Panel's meetings with students, graduates and employers of the Programs.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster:
- 5.1.1 It is suggested that students, graduates, and employers be directly represented as members of the self-evaluation group for the educational programs included in the cluster

Evaluation

Component 5.1 Internal Quality Evaluation	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

5.2. External Quality Evaluation
Program utilizes the results of external quality assurance on a regular basis.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Two of the eight educational programs within the cluster are new, and six are undergoing re-accreditation. Specifically, newly introduced programs include 180 ECTS BA programs in management taught in Georgian and English.

According to Ilia State University's quality assurance concept, a document outlining the actions taken in response to the recommendations and advice received during the external quality assurance process has been prepared. Additionally, the external evaluation consists of four main components: feedback from the previous accreditation process, input from the advisory board, comments from employers, and peer review.

The submitted documentation shows that contact hours for some courses have increased. Furthermore, the program's structure has been altered, and the updated version no longer includes mandatory-optional courses, a change that is expected to bring about positive outcomes. The learning outcomes for the programs have changed and are now more measurable. Based on the provided documentation, the reading materials in most of the syllabi have been revised and enhanced, addressing one of the main concerns raised in the external evaluation. Moreover, it is essential to highlight that twelve program evaluations have been conducted by external peers, four undertaken by international academic staff. However, the submitted evaluations seem to resemble letters of support more than formative evaluations.

Ilia State University is committed to upholding high standards, which are reflected in its external quality assurance approach. This approach involves reviews to ensure the effectiveness of quality assurance practices, which include external quality assurance policies, local and international peer reviews, accreditation, and feedback from employers and advisory boards. However, the university may focus on establishing more periodic and systematic procedures.

Evidences/Indicators

- External Evaluation Results;
- Developmental peer review;
- Amendments made as a result of external quality assessment;
- Self-evaluation report;
- Expert Panel's meeting with the head of the Programs;
- Expert Panel's meeting with academic and invited staff;
- Expert Panel's meeting with representatives of quality assurance service;
- Expert Panel's meetings with students, graduates and employers of the Programs.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Evaluation

Component 5.2 External Quality Evaluation	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

5.3. Program Monitoring and Periodic Review

Program monitoring and periodic evaluation is conducted with the involvement of academic, scientific, invited, administrative, supporting staff, students, graduates, employers and other stakeholders through systematic data collection, study and analysis. Evaluation results are applied for the Program improvement.

Cluster and individual evaluation

Ilia State University utilizes the quality assurance concept to monitor and periodically evaluate educational programs in a specified manner. The results of these evaluations are used to make improvements to the programs. The process is inclusive and operational, involving academic, visiting, and administrative staff, students, alumni, employers, advisory board members, as well as international and local professors who participate in the peer review process. The data collection and analysis process are systematic, relying on a mixture of social science research methodology and data aggregation practices. This approach ultimately allows for the formulation of conclusions and recommendations. The competence and vision of the person responsible for the given issue ensure the practical realization of this task.

In addition, as per Ilia State University's internal regulations, the self-evaluation process for academic, visiting, and administrative personnel is conducted, checked, and evaluated by the quality assurance service of the respective faculty. It is evident from the interviews that, according to the vision of Ilia State University, this approach is not founded on stringent control and inspection but on self-improvement and introspection. In addition, the educational programs within the cluster are periodically evaluated, and the satisfaction of both students and graduates is assessed through online surveys and focus groups. Furthermore, students evaluate specific courses at the end of each course. The same practice is applied to master's and doctoral theses, confirmed through interviews with students and alumni during their visits.

Based on the documents and interviews from the field visit, it is evident that the educational programs within the cluster are regularly compared with similar programs at foreign universities. This international benchmarking process, as indicated in the working group's minutes, includes comparing the components of the program name, objectives, learning outcomes, structure, content, teaching, and assessment methods. It aims to use the best international practices, fostering a sense of belonging to a global academic community.

Thus, in the process of data collection, analysis, interpretation, and formulation of recommendations, the monitoring and effectiveness of the educational programs included in the cluster are evaluated in accordance with Ilia State University's quality assurance policy concept, and the program is modified and improved.

Evidences/Indicators
- Survey results conducted by the higher education institution;
- Activities and changes implemented for the purpose of evaluating the academic course / subject, as well as for the development of the scientific research component;
- Program monitoring and periodic review results and the document certifying utilization of these results;
- Self-evaluation report;
- Expert Panel's meeting with the head of the Programs;
- Expert Panel's meeting with academic and invited staff;
- Expert Panel's meeting with representatives of quality assurance service;
- Expert Panel's meetings with students, graduates and employers of the Programs.

General recommendations of the cluster: N/A

General suggestions of the cluster: N/A

Evaluation

Component 5.3. Program Monitoring and Periodic Review	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

Compliance of the Programs with the standards

5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	x	☐	☐	☐

Name of the higher education institution: Ilia State University

Name of Higher Educational Programs, Levels:

✔   Bachelor Educational Programs:

1. Management (Major), 240 ECTS
2. Management (Major) (English), 240 ECTS
3. Management, 180 ECTS
4. Management (English), 180 ECTS

✔   Master Educational Programs:

5. Management, 120 ECTS
6. Healthcare Policy and Management, 120 ECTS
7. Business Administration (English), 120 ECTS

✔   Doctoral Educational Program:

8. Business Administration

Compliance of the Programs with the standards

Contents / Standard	1. Educational Program Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Program	2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy Evaluation of Program Mastering	3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them	4. Providing Teaching Resources	5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities
Program 1. Management (Major), Bachelor, 240 ECTS	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements
Program 2. Management (Major), English, Bachelor, 240 ECTS	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements
Program 3. Management, Bachelor, 180 ECTS	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements
Program 4. Management (English), Bachelor, 180 ECTS	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements
Program 5. Management, Master, 120 ECTS	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements
Program 6. Healthcare Policy and Management, Master, 120 ECTS	Substantially complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements

Program 7. Business Administration (English), Master, 120 ECTS	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements
Program 8. Business Administration, PhD, 30 ECTS	Substantially complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements

Signatures

Chair of Accreditation Experts Panel

Carolina Timco

Of the member(s) of the Accreditation Experts Panel

Eka Gegeshidze

Ekaterine Natsvlishvili

Maia Chincharashvili

Sandro Tabatadze

Giorgi Pareshishvili