



**NATIONAL CENTER FOR  
EDUCATIONAL QUALITY  
ENHANCEMENT**

## **Accreditation Expert Group Report on Cluster of Higher Education Programmes**

### **Name of the Cluster of Educational Programmes according to the Fields of Study of the Classifier**

Bachelor's educational programme in Business Administration  
Master's educational programme in Business Administration  
Doctoral educational programme in Business Administration  
Bachelor's educational programme in Finance  
Master's educational programme in Finance and Banking  
Master's educational programme in Marketing  
Master's educational programme in Accounting, Auditing, Taxation  
Bachelor's educational programme in Public Administration

LEPL - BATUMI SHOTA RUSTAVELI STATE UNIVERSITY

Tbilisi  
2025

## Contents

<b>I. Information on the Cluster of Educational Programmes</b> .....	4
<b>II. Accreditation Report Executive Summary</b> .....	5
<b>III. Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards</b> .....	11
<b>1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes, and their Compliance with the Programme</b> .....	11
<b>2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering</b> .....	36
<b>3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with Them</b> .....	56
<b>4. Providing Teaching Resources</b> .....	63
<b>5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities</b> .....	95

### Information on the Higher educational Institution

Name of Institution Indicating its Organizational Legal Form	Legal Entity of Public Law - Batumi Shota Rustaveli State University
Identification Code of Institution	245428158
Type of the Institution	Legal Entity of Public Law

### Expert Panel Members

<b>Chair</b>	Eugenia BUSMACHIU, National Agency of Quality Insurance/Academy of Economic Studies, Republic of Moldova
<b>Member</b>	Ekaterina ZAKARADZE, Grigol Robakidze University, Georgia
<b>Member</b>	Eka LEKASHVILI, Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University, Georgia
<b>Member</b>	Natia NOGHAI DELI, Geo Hospitals, Georgia
<b>Member</b>	Kristine CHIKHLADZE, Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University, Georgia
<b>Member</b>	Beka BENDELIAN, Ivane Javakhishvili Tbilisi State University, Georgia

## I. Information on the Cluster of Educational Programmes

	Programme 1	Programme 2	Programme 3	Programme 4	Programme 5	Programme 6	Programme 7	Programme 8
<b>Name of the educational program</b>	Business Administration	Business Administration	Business Administration	Finance	Finance and Banking	Marketing	Accounting, auditing, taxation	Public Administration
<b>Level of higher education</b>	Bachelor's Degree	Master's Degree	Doctoral Degree	Bachelor's Degree	Master's Degree	Master's Degree	Master's Degree	Bachelor's Degree
<b>Qualification to be awarded</b>	Bachelor of Business Administration	Master of Business Administration	Doctor of Business Administration	Bachelor of Finance	Master of Finance	Master of Business Administration in Marketing	Master of Accounting and Taxation	Bachelor of Public Administration
<b>Name and code of the detailed field</b>	Business administration 0413.1.2	Business administration 0413.1.2	Business administration 0413.1.2	Finance 0412.1.1	Finance 0412.1.1	Marketing 0414.1.1	Accounting and taxation 0411.1.1	Public Administration 0413.1.1
<b>Indication of the right to provide teaching of subject/subjects/group of subjects of the relevant level of general education<sup>1</sup></b>	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
<b>Language of instruction</b>	Georgian	Georgian	Georgian	Georgian	Georgian	Georgian	Georgian	Georgian
<b>Number of ECTS credits</b>	180	120	60	180	120	120	120	180
<b>Programme Status (Accredited/Non-accredited/Conditionally Accredited/New/International Accreditation) Indicating Relevant Decision (number, date)</b>	New	Decision №150 16.11.2018	Decision № 09 16.01.2019	New	Decision № 149 16.11.2018	New	New	New

<sup>1</sup> In case of Integrated Bachelor's-Master's Teacher Training Educational Programme and Teacher Training Educational Programme

## II. Accreditation Report Executive Summary

### - General Information on the Cluster of Education Programmes<sup>2</sup>

Accreditation has been conducted for eight study programs at Batumi Shota Rustaveli State University and grouped in a cluster. According to the “National Qualifications Framework and the Classifier of Fields of Study” approved by the Order №69/N of the Minister of Education, Science, Culture and Sports of Georgia of April 10, 2019, and the rule for grouping educational programmes into clusters, including following programs:

- Bachelor’s educational programme in Business Administration - 180 credits;
- Master’s educational programme in Business Administration - 120 Credits;
- Doctoral educational programme in Business Administration - 60 Credits
- Bachelor’s educational programme in Finances - 180 credits;
- Master’s educational programme in Finance and Banking - 120 Credits;
- Master’s educational programme in Marketing - 120 credits;
- Master’s educational programme in Accounting, Auditing, and Taxation" - 120 credits;
- Bachelor’s educational programme in Public Administration - 180 Credits.

Out of the educational programmes grouped in the cluster, the public administration bachelor's programme is implemented at the Faculty of Law and Social Sciences, and the rest of the programmes - at the Faculty of Economics and Business.

### - Overview of the Accreditation Site Visit

The academic programs in Business Administration, including Bachelor's, Master's, and Doctoral degrees, as well as Bachelor's degrees in Finance and Master's degrees in Finance and Banking, Marketing, Accounting, Auditing, and Taxation, are organized within this cluster. The Expert Panel conducted a site visit at BSU according to a pre-developed agenda and grid map, which included preliminary questions formulated by the Panel Experts. The panel held interview sessions with various groups, including the university and faculty administration, the self-evaluation team, and academics, and invited staff from all programs, program heads, students and alumni from all programs, employers, and representatives from the quality assurance service. The panel team was granted access to documentary materials, including the external evaluation report prepared by the University.

The documents provided were well-written in clear English and were generally helpful to the panel in understanding the university's curricula, study programs, development and strategic objectives, and operations.

The panel met with the Rector, Deans, and representatives from all programs and support services during their visit. The director of the Quality Assurance Department, along with several teachers and students from all evaluated programs, alumni, and labor market representatives, actively participated in the accreditation process. Additionally, the Panel of Experts had the opportunity to observe the university's infrastructure, including the library, laboratories, multimedia rooms, and teaching spaces.

The final meeting occurred on October 4, after all interview sessions with representatives from the university administration. During this meeting, they were presented with the panel's initial conclusions and recommendations based on the visits.

### - Brief Overview of Education Programme Compliance with the Standards

Bachelor’s educational program in Business Administration-180 credits

Standard 1: Complies with Requirements

Standard 2: Complies with Requirements

Standard 3: Substantially complies with Requirements

Standard 4: Substantially complies with Requirements

Standard 5: Complies with Requirements

Master’s educational program in Business Administration -120 Credits

Standard 1: Complies with Requirements

Standard 2: Complies with Requirements

Standard 3: Substantially complies with Requirements

Standard 4: Substantially complies with Requirements

Standard 5: Complies with Requirements

Doctoral educational program in Business Administration-60 credits

---

<sup>2</sup> When providing general information related to the programme, it is appropriate to also present the quantitative data analysis of the educational programme.

Standard 1: Complies with Requirements  
Standard 2: Complies with Requirements  
Standard 3: Substantially complies with Requirements  
Standard 4: Substantially complies with Requirements  
Standard 5: Complies with Requirements

Bachelor's educational programme in Finance -180 credits

Standard 1: Complies with Requirements  
Standard 2: Complies with Requirements  
Standard 3: Substantially complies with Requirements  
Standard 4: Substantially complies with Requirements  
Standard 5: Complies with Requirements

Master's educational programme in Finance and Banking-120 credits

Standard 1: Complies with Requirements  
Standard 2: Complies with Requirements  
Standard 3: Substantially complies with Requirements  
Standard 4: Substantially complies with Requirements  
Standard 5: Complies with Requirements

Master's educational programme in Marketing-120 credits

Standard 1: Complies with Requirements  
Standard 2: Complies with Requirements  
Standard 3: Substantially complies with Requirements  
Standard 4: Substantially complies with Requirements  
Standard 5: Complies with Requirements

Master's educational programme in Accounting, Auditing, and Taxation-120 credits

Standard 1: Complies with Requirements  
Standard 2: Complies with Requirements  
Standard 3: Substantially complies with Requirements  
Standard 4: Substantially complies with Requirements  
Standard 5: Complies with Requirements

Bachelor's educational programme in Public Administration-180 credits

Standard 1: Complies with Requirements  
Standard 2: Complies with Requirements  
Standard 3: Substantially complies with Requirements  
Standard 4: Substantially complies with Requirements  
Standard 5: Complies with Requirements

## **General recommendations of the cluster:**

### Substandard 3.1. Student Consulting and Support Services

- It is recommended that the HEI focus on enhancing practical studies for students.

### Substandard 4.2. Human Resources

- It is recommended to organize regular training sessions focused on promoting academic development in the following areas: "Modern Methods of Teaching": To keep faculty members updated on the latest pedagogical techniques and enhance teaching effectiveness; "The Use of Artificial Intelligence in the Educational Process and Its Modernization": To familiarize educators with AI tools that can enhance the learning experience and streamline administrative tasks; "Other Relevant Topics": Sessions can also cover emerging trends and technologies that can improve academic practices. Additionally, efforts should be made to facilitate the internationalization of research, encouraging collaboration with global research networks, increasing the university's visibility in international academic circles, and fostering diverse academic perspectives.

### Substandard 4.4 Material Resources

- It is recommended that all educational literature, including handouts, textbooks, and other materials, particularly those designated as required reading, be made available in both electronic format and physical copies at the university library. This would ensure easy access for all students, accommodating different preferences and providing equitable access to essential learning resources.

#### Substandard 5.1. Internal Quality Evaluation

- It is recommended to retrain program managers and academic staff on the basic principles of creating conceptual maps for the assessment of learning outcomes.
- **Suggestions for the cluster:**

#### Substandard. 1.1 Program Objectives

- It would be suggested to increase the level of internationalization and visibility of all education programs.

#### Substandard 1.2. Programme Learning Outcomes

- It would be suggested to update the learning outcomes for all programs with digitalization and sustainability aspects;
- It is suggested to improve the requirements for the master theses content.

#### Substandard 1.3. Evaluation Mechanism of the Program Learning Outcomes

- It is suggested to diversify university stakeholders by attracting representatives from all areas of the economy (agriculture, services, transportation, etc.) and to involve more local public authorities in defining the program's learning outcomes;
- It is suggested to extend the list of international partners and visibility of all programs;
- It is suggested to update the information on the university website in English language.

#### Substandard. 1.4. Structure and Content of Educational Program

- It is suggested to increase the number of hours for practical activities;
- It is suggested to revise the list of subjects and prioritize the professional specialized unit courses;
- It is suggested to improve the mechanism of promotion of the education program to increase the number of students;
- It is suggested to increase the internationalization and visibility of PhD research results.

#### Substandard.1.5. Academic Course/Subject

- It is suggested to integrate sustainability issues into mandatory introductory courses;
- It is suggested to improve the assurance of study programs with literature in English and other foreign languages.

#### Substandard 2.1. Program Admission Preconditions

- It is suggested to provide complete information regarding the prerequisites for admission to all programs, including the determination of the level of English and Georgian language proficiency.

#### Substandard 2.2. The Development of Practical, Scientific/Research/Creative/Performing and Transferable Skills

- It is suggested that the bachelor's thesis should preferably be presented in the list of elective courses of the speciality. It is desirable to expand the signing of memorandums with private business companies for student internships.

#### Substandard 4.1. Human Resources

- It is suggested in order to reach a broader audience and increase the diversity of the university's teaching staff, posting current vacancies on additional platforms, such as jobs.ge, would be beneficial. By advertising on more widely used job boards, the university can extend its reach to a larger pool of potential candidates, offering more individuals the opportunity to apply for active positions. This approach can help attract a wider range of applicants, contributing to a more diverse and qualified teaching staff.

#### Substandard 4.2. Human Resources

- It is suggested to increase involvement in international projects, it is essential to provide master's and doctoral students with more information regarding **international databases** and their utilization. By familiarizing students with key global research resources, they will be better equipped to engage with international research networks, access cutting-edge studies, and contribute to global academic initiatives. This knowledge will not only enhance their research skills but also open up opportunities for collaboration with international scholars and participation in global projects.

#### Substandard 4.3. Professional Development of Academic, Scientific and Invited Staff

- It is suggested to align with the significant progress made in the field of internationalization, which includes well-developed plans for further growth, it would be beneficial to strengthen support for internationalization activities related to research, publication, and participation in academic events for both teaching staff and graduate students (Master's and Doctoral). This could include offering funding, logistical support, and opportunities for collaboration with international researchers and institutions. By facilitating greater involvement in global academic networks, the university can enhance its research profile, foster cross-cultural exchange, and improve the overall quality of academic output.
- It is suggested to continually improve academic skills, it is essential to conduct ongoing training sessions or workshops for both academic and invited staff. Regular, structured professional development programs will ensure that faculty members are up-to-date with the latest pedagogical methods, research trends, and technological innovations, contributing to the sustained academic growth of the university. These programs should focus on improving teaching effectiveness, research capabilities, and overall academic performance, fostering a culture of continuous development at all levels.

#### Substandard. 4.4. Material Resources

- It is suggested that the university **diversify internship locations** by signing additional memoranda of understanding (MOUs) with various organizations, institutions, and companies. This would offer students a broader range of practical experiences and opportunities to apply their academic knowledge in diverse settings, enhancing the overall quality and relevance of their education.

#### Substandard. 4.5. Program/Faculty/School Budget and Program Financial Sustainability

- It is suggested that the university continue and enhance efforts to secure grants while simultaneously seeking additional funding opportunities. By actively pursuing various funding sources—such as government grants, private sector partnerships, and international research funds—the university can expand its financial resources, support research initiatives, and improve overall institutional development. This proactive approach to funding can help ensure the sustainability and growth of academic programs, research projects, and other university initiatives.

### **Recommendations for the Programme Development**

#### **Programme 3: Doctoral educational programme in Business Administration, level 8**

##### Substandard: 4.1. Human Resources

- It is recommended to pay special attention during the writing of the doctoral dissertation to the following: the topic of the doctoral dissertation should be determined according to the qualification to be awarded; significant attention should be given to the rules of citation and bibliography composition, as these were violated during the doctoral dissertation process, when a student received a high grade despite having not adhered to the citation and bibliography guidelines

#### **Suggestions for the Programme Development:**

##### **Programme 1: Bachelor's educational programme in Business Administration**

- It is suggested to update the information in English on the university website related to the program;
- It is suggested to require the English language in the entrance exams.

##### **Programme 2 Master's educational programme in Business Administration**

- It is suggested to improve the quality of the master thesis;
- It is suggested to increase cooperation with more business companies to diversify the internship offers;



- It is suggested to update the list of references indicated for the preparation for the current exams.

### **Programme 3 Doctoral educational programme in Business Administration**

- It is suggested to increase the level of internationalization of the Doctoral program and the visibility in the area of publications in internationally recognized databases;
- It is desirable to include advanced study literature in a foreign language in the preparation of the exam/interview questions of the doctoral program in business administration.

### **Programme 4 Bachelor's educational programme in Finance**

- It is suggested to involve the private sector more in the design of internship learning objectives and curricula.

### **Programme 5 Master's educational programme in Finance and Banking.**

- It is suggested to increase the cooperation with the banking sector;
- It is suggested to revise the list of mandatory courses, as a suggestion to include the Financial "Corporate Governance" unit course;
- It is suggested to revise the number of hours for independent work for the Subject "State Finance";
- It is suggested to study literature/references for the preparation of the specialty exams needs to be updated.

### **Program 6 Master's educational programme in Marketing, level 7**

- It is suggested to analyze the possibility of updating the learning objectives and curricula according to new technologies and innovations in the marketing field;
- It is suggested to focus the curriculum subjects on new trends in marketing.

### **Programme 7 Master's educational programme in Accounting, Auditing, Taxation**

- It is suggested to promote international certification in audit and accounting;
- It is suggested to improve the curricula with sustainability reporting aspects;
- It is suggested for those who wish to study a Master's educational program in Accounting, Auditing, or Taxation, to have a Bachelor's degree in Business Administration and Economics, as well as a similar profile direction;
- It is suggested to deepen partnerships in the area of Big 4, to develop the programmatic skills of academic and invited personnel. It is essential to focus on the development of the English language skills of academic personnel so that everyone can equally participate in various exchange programs. Of course, the university cannot force personnel to learn or improve their language skills, but certain mechanisms can be implemented to enhance this aspect;
- It is suggested to deepen partnerships in the area of Big 4, to develop the programmatic skills of academic and invited personnel;
- It is suggested to focus on the development of the English language skills of academic personnel so that everyone can equally participate in various exchange programs. Of course, the university cannot force personnel to learn or improve their language skills, but certain mechanisms can be implemented to enhance this aspect.

### **Program 8 Bachelor's educational programme in Public Administration, level 6**

- It is suggested to extend cooperation with local public authorities.
- It is suggested to revise the syllabus of State signs and symbols (2 ECTS)
- It is suggested/preferable for the workload (hourly schedule) of the program's academic and invited staff to be distributed evenly so that, as much as possible, all personnel can engage in academic activities according to their qualifications.

### **- Brief Overview of the Best Practices (if applicable)<sup>3</sup>**

- Strong managerial team;

---

<sup>3</sup> A practice that is exceptionally effective and that can serve as a benchmark or example for other educational programme/programmes.

- Professional staff at all education programs;
- High-qualified manager of the quality assurance service;
- Advanced settled information system;
- Strong support from local stakeholders and administration and a good reputation.

▪ **The action on Sharing or Not Sharing the Argumentative Position of the HEI**

- **In case of re-accreditation, it is important to provide a brief overview of the achievements and/or the progress (if applicable)**

- The University agrees with the recommendation for Standard 3.1, which recommends that the HEI focus on enhancing practical studies for students. Therefore, the panel has made no changes.
- The university agrees with the recommendations and suggestions provided regarding the fifth standard. Therefore, the expert group has not made any changes to the report.

**Evaluation approaches for the accreditation experts:**

- The Quality Assurance Service is monitoring the implementation of the progress and recommendations from the previous accreditation per the university activity plan. The self-evaluation report summarizes the accomplishments.

**The components of the accreditation standards are evaluated using the following two approaches:**

1. Cluster and individual evaluation<sup>4</sup>
2. Cluster evaluation<sup>5</sup>

Standard/Component	Assessment approaches:
<b>1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes, and their Compliance with the Programme</b>	
1.1. Programme Objectives	Cluster and individual
1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes	Cluster and individual
1.3. Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes	Cluster
1.4 Structure and Content of Educational Programme	Cluster and individual
1.5 Academic Course/Subject	Cluster and individual
<b>2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering</b>	
2.1. Programme Admission Preconditions	Cluster and individual
2.2. The Development of Practical, Scientific/Research/Creative/Performing and Transferable Skills	Cluster
2.3. Teaching and Learning Methods	Cluster
2.4. Student Evaluation	Cluster
<b>3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them</b>	
3.1. Student Consulting and Support Services	Cluster

<sup>4</sup> **Evaluation Approaches:** Describe, analyse, and evaluate the compliance of each educational programme grouped in the cluster with the requirements of the corresponding component of the standard. Also, you can specify information about an educational programme that is different from the common and basic characteristics of educational programmes grouped in the cluster.

<sup>5</sup> **Assessment approaches:** In case of necessity, describe, analyse and evaluate compliance of each education programme in the cluster with the requirements of this component of the standard. Also, you can indicate the information on the education programme, distinguished from the general and major characteristics of the education programmes in a cluster.

3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision	Cluster
<b>4. Providing Teaching Resources</b>	
4.1. Human Resources	Cluster and individual
4.2. Qualification of Supervisors of Master's and Doctoral Students	Cluster and individual
4.3. Professional Development of Academic, Scientific, and Invited Staff	Cluster
4.4. Material Resources	Cluster and individual
4.5. Programme/Faculty/School Budget and Programme Financial Sustainability	Cluster and individual
<b>5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities</b>	
5.1. Internal Quality Evaluation	Cluster
5.2. External Quality Evaluation	Cluster
5.3. Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review	Cluster

### III. Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards

#### 1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes, and their Compliance with the Programme

A programme has clearly established objectives and learning outcomes that are logically connected to each other. The objectives are consistent with the institution's mission, objectives, and strategic plan. The learning outcomes are assessed on a regular basis to improve the programme. The content and consistent structure of the programme ensure the achievement of the set goals and expected learning outcomes.

Educational programmes grouped in a cluster are logically interrelated to each other in line with the study fields and evolve according to the respective levels of higher education.

##### 1.1 Programme Objectives

Programme objectives consider the specificity of the field of study, level, and educational programme, and define the set of knowledge, skills, and competences a programme aims to develop in graduate students. They also illustrate the contribution of the programme to the development of the field and society.

#### Cluster and individual evaluation

#### Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The Educational Programmes Grouped in the Cluster include:

- Bachelor's educational programme in Business Administration;
- Master's educational programme in Business Administration;
- Doctoral educational programme in Business Administration;
- Bachelor's educational programme in Finance;
- Master's educational programme in Finance and Banking;
- Master's educational programme in Marketing;
- Master's educational programme in Accounting, Auditing, and Taxation.
- Bachelor's educational programme in Public Administration.

The Bachelor, Master, and Doctoral programs in this academic cluster are well-organized and aligned with the appropriate field of study, adhering to the official legal frameworks and strategic guidelines of Georgia and meeting the requirements of the labor market representatives. The educational programs are regularly updated and adjusted to reflect changes in the labor market for each student promotion. The procedure for initiating, approving, and monitoring the study program at BSU is well-defined. The faculty develops and manages the study programs. The working group responsible for the elaboration of the educational plan is coordinated by the head of the service or program and includes tenured teachers, representatives of employers, and graduates. The disciplines, number of hours, and credits allocated to course units/modules are determined by them by the normative acts in force.

All programs within the cluster meet the standards established by the national qualification system. They are clearly outlined and accessible on the university's website, making them available to all stakeholders, including academic and administrative staff, prospective students, and the public.

Teaching and assessment methods are consistent with the general objectives and learning outcomes of the educational cluster programs. The university applies student-centered teaching methods for all programs.

Additionally, the goals of the programs are clearly defined and realistic, considering the specific field of study, academic level, and educational framework. University graduates were able to express themselves clearly and persuasively in oral communication with the Panel External Evaluation Team during the interview and demonstrated a high level of professional qualification according to their program level of studies.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1: Bachelor's educational program in Business Administration - 180 credits.

Batumi State University has developed a "Business Administration" academic program that aligns with its strategic goals while incorporating EU and international best practices and addressing current challenges in the field. The Bachelor of Business Administration program highlights the primary priorities, responsibilities, and challenges faced by the business environment. Additionally, students are required to select a considerate area of business, allowing them to deepen their understanding of their selected field of study. The goals of the Business Administration program are designed to address the growing demand for skilled professionals in various sectors of both public and private entities. Graduates of the "Business Administration" bachelor's program will be prepared to manage their businesses and contribute to the management of business units and processes in line with contemporary standards. They will be prepared to take on roles as line (technical, lower) and middle managers.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2: Master's educational programme in Business Administration - 120 Credits.

The objectives of the Master's program in Business Administration arise from the increasing demand for high-level professionals in the region and also at the level of the country. The required specialists must not only understand modern business administration theories and principles but also demonstrate analytical and evaluative skills to identify problems and establish strategic directions.

Employers anticipate that these individuals will execute business operations with a robust commitment to social responsibility, environment, and governance considering the interests of the private, public, and governmental sectors. Employers prioritize strong qualifications, teamwork, creativity, communication skills, and the capacity for autonomous knowledge enhancement through the self-assessment of professional competencies, all while upholding work ethics.

The university personnel tasked with executing the master program formulate its objectives through deliberations in departmental and Curriculum Committee meetings according to well-defined internal

procedures and regulations in force. Additionally, they have undertaken extensive efforts to update study programs and curricula to meet qualification standards and address new requirements related to digital and social responsibility. The master's program is designed to produce a highly qualified and competitive specialist in business administration who can adapt to a dynamic professional environment possesses competencies aligned with contemporary standards and aims to meet the needs of the local labor market while also reflecting international market trends and addressing the developmental requirements of industry, government, and society.

Description and Analysis - Programme 3: Doctoral educational programme in Business Administration - 60 Credits.

The doctoral program is well-designed and aims to develop a new generation of professionals skilled in conducting original and innovative research using modern methodologies in key areas of business administration. The doctoral program objectives align with the educational market's needs, the university's mission, the strategic development plan, and the provisions of regulations of the Faculty of Economics and Business.

The program aims to address the employment market's need for researchers capable of independently planning, executing, and overseeing innovative research and focuses on creating new insights into contemporary business issues, digital entrepreneurship, and regional business processes.

Graduates of the Doctoral program are highly skilled professionals who engage in university research activities, publish their findings in international databases, and contribute to the educational process. They also play a significant role in the Adjara public administration, influencing policy and strategic frameworks in the region, while being involved in the business environment.

Description and Analysis - **Programme 4:** Bachelor's educational programme in Finances - 180 credits.

The real sector of the economy played a significant role in the education program's development. To align the program with national and international practices, a comparative benchmarking study was conducted, which included national universities and international universities such as Moravian University (USA), Canisius University (Buffalo, USA), Carroll University (USA), Rider University (USA), ISM University of Management and Economics (Vilnius, Lithuania), Sunway University (Shah Alam, Malaysia), and Mind Development Academy (Cape Town, South Africa), etc. mentioned in the report and confirmed during the interviews. As a result, the primary aim of the program is to prepare Bachelor of Finance graduates who possess both theoretical and specialized knowledge in finance. The program seeks to cultivate competitive finance professionals who can thrive in the national and global labor markets across public, private, and non-governmental sectors, with competencies that meet modern requirements and the ability to adapt to a changing professional environment. The program is well-structured and aims to develop Bachelor of Finance graduates equipped with both theoretical and specialized knowledge in finance.

It focuses on producing competitive finance professionals capable of securing employment in various sectors, including banks, taxation services, the insurance sector, and public, private, and non-governmental organizations, both nationally and globally. Graduates demonstrate competencies that align with the contemporary demands of the labor market, particularly in banking and the real sector. During the interview, it was mentioned that entities and public administration institutions involved in the development of study programs are more open to providing students with data for research and involving them in internship programs. In this context, local financial institutions, such as banks, tend to adopt a more conservative approach in their operations compared to other financial entities.

Description and Analysis - Programme 5: Master's educational programme in Finance and Banking - 120 Credits.

The master's program in Finance and Banking has a strong aim to equip students with comprehensive theoretical knowledge practical skills and critical thinking in the area of finance and banking. The objectives of the program are formulated as the result of an analysis of a survey completed by employers and graduates. Also, the university has clear evidence of the employment rates and some recommendations from the NCEQE's subject benchmark statement. The program's goals align with the university's mission, strategic plan, and internal regulations of the Faculty of Economics and Business.

Graduates are qualified to manage the financial resources of the companies, perform professional and accurate financial statements, to make decisions regarding asset investment, financial resource acquisition, and profit maximization, while also developing the ability to identify organizational problems, assess risks, predict outcomes, and prioritize actions in the context of the macroeconomic environment. The faculty maintains a strong collaboration with the Ministry of Education, Culture, and Sports, as well as the public administration of the Autonomous Republic of Adjara, engaging them in various aspects of didactic, methodological, and research cooperation.

Description and Analysis - Programme 6: Master's educational programme in Marketing - 120 credits.

The master's educational program in Marketing has been developed through benchmarking research on various foreign and Georgian universities, including institutions in Germany, the USA, the UK, and Italy, and based on demand from the labor market.

The program has a strong specifically designed objective for the marketing field and aims to prepare students with competitive, research-oriented, and creative skills that align the competencies of the degree qualification with labour market demands.

This preparation enables graduates to pursue managerial roles in both the private and public sectors. Graduates will gain comprehensive knowledge of product and service exchange processes, consumer behavior, and digital marketing, and will have the ability to identify and analyze market development in various sectors and business challenges while upholding academic integrity. Furthermore, they will cultivate skills in information gathering, strategy evaluation, and decision-making related to marketing practices. The university also collaborates with local organizations specialized in tourism and water utility, providing students and faculty with opportunities for market research studies internships, and other common activities. The invited professor significantly influences and enhances the quality of studies in the Master's program in Marketing.

Description and Analysis - Programme 7: Master's educational program in Accounting, Auditing, and Taxation" - 120 credits.

The master's educational program "Accounting, Auditing, Taxation" is designed to align with higher education standards and labor market demands, aiming to produce highly qualified specialists in the area of accounting, taxation, and international financial reporting standards. The program focuses on equipping students with essential professional skills necessary for the dynamic environment of accounting and taxation at national and international levels. Graduates demonstrated good knowledge in preparing financial and management reports, conducting financial analyses, applying international financial accounting standards, and utilizing relevant software tools as a result of their studies in the BSU University program.

The students mentioned that they accomplished the professional objectives and contributed to enriching the

study program objectives by answering the questions from the evaluation questionnaire. Also, they perform during the laboratory classes in evaluation of financial activities techniques, and risk assessment by applying IT technologies and software.

They are well qualified to be inserted into the labor market and are open to making independent decisions. They have the competence and skills to work in accounting program software and to develop audit opinions content. The master's educational program "Accounting, Auditing, Taxation" emphasizes the importance of effective communication among regulatory bodies, accounting professionals, and stakeholders in the fields of accounting and taxation, highlighting that graduates with these skills can significantly enhance the development of the sector and establish best practices beneficial to both public and private sectors.

Additionally, the preparation of the master's educational program in accounting, audit, and taxation involved benchmarking against fifteen foreign institutions and three Georgian universities, ensuring that the program aligns with international standards and incorporates relevant academic courses.

Description and Analysis – Programme 8: Bachelor's educational programme in Public Administration - 180 Credits.

The Bachelor's program in Public Administration is designed to address the job market and public administration needs and recent developments in the public sector.

The study program in Public administration objectives are well structured and considers the specificity of the public administration institution of the Autonomous Republic of Adjara by preparing students with essential knowledge and skills.

The university prepares competitive specialists in the area of central and local public administration. The local public authorities are involved in the study program development and contribute to the education process by offering support in organizing scientific events and accepting students for internships. Additionally, they share a common research focus that involves engaging with university staff to discuss local development plans and strategies for the community.

The program objectives are designed to align with labor market analysis and requirements, employer expectations, and the strategic goals of the university. Graduates of the program secure employment in government positions and have the opportunity to pursue master 's-level studies, which enhances their engagement in public or professional activities and promotes career advancement.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Analysis of the labor market survey report
- BSU mission
- BSU strategic plan
- Statute of the Faculty of Economics and Business
- Statute of the Faculty of law and Social Sciences
- Analysis of foreign universities study programs
- Clusters study programs
- Panel Expert's interview results

**Recommendations:** Non

#### **Suggestions:**

- It is suggested to increase the level of internationalization and visibility of all education programs.

## **Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes:**

**Programme 1** Business Administration, level 6

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s): Non**

**Programme 2** Business Administration, level 7

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to improve the quality of the master thesis.

**Programme 3** Business Administration, level 8

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to increase the level of internationalization and exchange programs of the Doctoral program and the visibility in the area of exchange research programs and publications.

**Programme 4** Finance, level 6 Non

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to involve the private sector more in the design of internship learning objectives and curricula.

**Programme 5** Finance and Banking, level 7

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to increase the cooperation with the banking sector.

**Programme 6** Marketing, level 7

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to analyze the possibility of updating the learning objectives and curricula according to new technologies and innovations in the marketing field.

**Programme 7** Accounting, Auditing and Taxation, level 7

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s): Non**

**Programme 8** Public Administration, level 6

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to extend cooperation with local public authorities.



## Evaluation <sup>6</sup>

Component 1.1 - Programme Objectives	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies the requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Business Administration, level 6	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 Business Administration, level 7	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 Finance, level 6	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 Finance and Banking, level 7	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 Marketing, level 7	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 8 Public Administration, level 6	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### 1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes

➤ The learning outcomes of the programme are logically related to the programme objectives and the specificity of the field of study.

➤ Programme learning outcomes describe knowledge, skills, and/or sense of responsibility and autonomy which students gain upon completion of the programme.

### Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Programs within this cluster of Business administration, Finance, Finance and Banking, Marketing, Accounting Audit, Taxation, and Public Administration are designed to provide students at all program levels of study with a broad-based education in business, finance, public administration, accounting, marketing, social sciences, and other disciplines.

Common program outcomes for cluster programs include the development of critical thinking, problem-solving, and cognitive professionalism competencies in the socioeconomic areas.

The expert panel noticed that students and program graduates emphasized the skills they acquired, especially focused on the analysis of complex issues and problems related to business, governance, market and accounting and taxation, business valuation, and making decisions.

All programs promote teamwork and collaboration among students by employing applied software in accounting (Accounting software) and finance and banking (specialized software is in place at the university) during practical lessons, workshop activities, and group case studies based on real sector entities and actual subjects. During the interview with the employers, it was noted that they actively cooperate with the university in defining the programs' objectives and outcomes and are also open to receiving students for internship programs.

<sup>6</sup> Evaluation is performed for each programme separately.

The result of interviews and the provided evidence by all parties for all cluster programs demonstrated that the learning outcomes are logically formulated, closely aligned with its objectives and the specific field of study, outlining the knowledge, skills, and sense of responsibility and autonomy that students are expected to acquire by the end of the program. The programs within the cluster provide students with a solid foundation in scientific principles and practices, preparing them for careers in scientific research both in their area of study and in the local and national workforce.

The program's objectives comply with the university mission and align with the strategy of BSU University and the Faculty of Economics and Business and Law and Social Sciences. To promote the internationalization of programs, the best practices of partner university programs are integrated into education programs.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1: Bachelor's educational programme in Business Administration - 180 credits.

The Business Administration program outcomes are clearly defined following professional standards and legal framework. They were formulated based on the survey results and market research related to needed competencies for the actual market and correspond to the mission and strategic lines of the university's medium-term policy documents.

The program ensures that the students can apply general management principles in practical business situations and understand the business's economic environment. Additionally, the program's outcome focuses on obtaining students' practical and theoretical skills related to organizational performance and developing the skills necessary to create effective company plans.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2: Master's educational programme in Business Administration - 120 Credits.

The precisely designed and professionally articulated program outcomes indicate that graduates of the Business Master's program are prepared with extensive competencies and research skills in the field of Business Administration. According to the program coordinators' opinion, declared during the interview, the graduates are required for employment across a range of organizational and legal structures, including SMEs, hotels, financial institutions, and public administration entities, where they may assume roles as middle or upper-level managers, experts, consultants or analysts.

The knowledge and understanding of responsibility gained during their studies at BSU, along with the skills they have developed, will also allow students to achieve pertinent positions within private or governmental organizations and to compete effectively with candidates from other national academic institutions. To enhance the educational outcomes at the faculty level, a working group has been established to conduct an annual analysis of the learning outcomes linked to each program objective. The findings of this analysis, along with corresponding recommendations, are deliberated during meetings of the Curriculum Committee and are approved by the university's Quality Service.

Description and Analysis - Programme 3: Doctoral educational programme in Business Administration - 60 Credits.

The doctoral program in business administration has established its learning outcomes by considering the faculty recommendations, academic discipline, and specific qualification standards. The doctoral program also incorporates insights from employers, graduate employment statistics, and feedback from faculty involved in the program.

The learning outcomes are aligned with the program objectives, promoting the development of highly qualified competencies, including knowledge, skills, and a sense of responsibility. This alignment of the doctoral program content is assessed by evaluating the consistency between the qualifications awarded, the program's learning outcomes, and other relevant outcomes.

During the program, the PhD students are guided by faculty-accredited professors with a deep understanding of the field of business administration and the topic of the PhD thesis. Additionally, they collaborate on various research projects and jointly publish their findings. Some of the PhD students are part of the teaching staff of the university or invited professors.

The activities designed to develop essential competencies after graduation from the doctoral program in the field of BA are assessed based on specific criteria approved by the Faculty Committee. The content of the academic courses for the Doctoral Program and the qualifications of the PHD coordinators and consultants are also assessed based on clear internal rules and procedures. A curriculum map is created based on the learning outcomes.

Description and Analysis - Programme 4: Bachelor's educational programme in Finances - 180 credits.

The Bachelor's program in Finance is designed to provide students with a comprehensive understanding of both theoretical frameworks and practical applications pertinent to the financial system, markets, management, and technology. Graduates of this program possess the ability to articulate contemporary financial theories, conduct financial data analysis, and employ technological tools for the processing of financial information. The curriculum highlights the significance of ethical conduct and proficient communication skills within the financial industry. The learning outcomes are comparatively aligned with the program's objectives, ensuring that students acquire the essential competencies and skills required to enhance financial services and engage effectively in financial operations across diverse entities and institutions. The curriculum committee is very responsible and is monitoring the results of the surveys in place from all program stakeholders and conducting permanent reviews and discussions regarding the relevance and feasibility of these learning outcomes.

Description and Analysis - Programme 5: Master's educational programme in Finance and Banking - 120 Credits.

Students gain a comprehensive understanding of scientific principles and methodologies relevant to the field of finance and banking. They are qualified to critically analyze and evaluate financial data, thereby enhancing their problem-solving and critical thinking skills. A Bachelor's degree in Finance prepares students for a wide range of career opportunities across various sectors, including financial markets, corporate finance, public finance, insurance, financial instruments, and banking. Additionally, this degree provides a solid foundation for advanced academic pursuits, such as Master's and Doctoral programs, and plays a crucial role in promoting research initiatives and informing the development of policy and economic strategies. The internal rules concerning the learning outcomes are in place at the university. The outcomes of the program are aligned with international practices.

Description and Analysis - Programme 6: Master's educational programme in Marketing - 120 credits.

The learning outcomes for the Master Program in Marketing are guided by the results of the benchmark statement analysis, labor market research report, and feedback from academic staff and the program coordinator. These outcomes of the Master Program in Marketing align totally with the program's objectives and emphasize competencies in marketing theories, market knowledge, understanding, skills, responsibility, and autonomy, ensuring that they can be effectively measured and achieved. The Master's program is designed for individuals interested in strategic marketing, with a focus on consumer behavior and market analysis. Upon completion of

the program, the students mentioned that they are very easily integrated into the marketing activities. Sustainability and internationalization are integral components of the educational experience of the Master's Program in Marketing at BSU.

Description and Analysis - Programme 7: Master's educational program in Accounting, Auditing, and Taxation - 120 credits.

The Master's program in Accounting, Audit, and Taxation offers advanced education tailored to meet the standards of regional auditing firms, corporations, and tax services. The logical structure of learning outcomes permits the preparation of graduates for auditor authorization and participation in national and international accounting and auditing certification programs.

Graduates typically follow careers in auditing, consulting, accounting, economics, or management in both business and public administration sectors. The curriculum features specialized courses and concludes with a master's thesis in the final semester, emphasizing the enhancement of student's communication skills as a critical component of the program. The student is expected to possess strong analytical skills to apply master thesis research and findings from both practical and theoretical aspects in the real sector and to justify the choices. The students should master various methods and techniques in accounting and auditing and be capable of independently or collaboratively planning and executing job position tasks. Additionally, the candidates are skilled in finding, evaluating, and presenting information effectively to address problems, as well as understanding the regulatory and legal implications of financial statements and audit reports. University updating continued knowledge in accounting and taxation by organizing at the faculty various meetings, workshops, and activities for students. The implementation of Information Technology (IT) in the education process of the program facilitates the accomplishment of educational objectives. The working group developed and deliberated the learning outcomes of the Master's program goal, including the significance and feasibility of the program. The working group approved them during the Curriculum Committee meetings. The university has very clear internal rules and monitoring processes for learning outcomes. Also, in the process of developing the master's program in accounting, audit, and taxation, a benchmarking analysis was performed, examining fifteen international institutions and three Georgian universities (TSU, Telavi State University, and Kutaisi University) to increase national and international visibility.

Description and Analysis – Programme 8: Bachelor's educational programme in Public Administration - 180 credits.

In particular, the objectives of the Bachelor's educational program in Public Administration describe the demand of the employment market. Employability in public administration is a fundamental focus of the bachelor's education program. Upon completing the degree, graduates are eligible for employment in fields such as law, local public authorities, government, and various other areas.

Representatives from the Adjara Public Administration held discussions during the Panel Experts interview session about a cooperation agreement with the BSU, focusing on collaboration in education programs in Public Administration, practical skills training, and research initiatives. A key aspect of this partnership is the university's role as the primary source of specialists in public administration for the region, ensuring that these professionals are adequately prepared to meet the program's objectives.

The alumni of the program emphasize the objectives of developing writing skills in official correspondence in Georgian and English languages and engaging students in competitive positions in both government and non-government sectors.

A comprehensive study of diverse subjects included in the bachelor's education program prepares students to succeed in various employment positions or to continue their studies in Master's and Doctoral programs.

### Evidences/Indicators

- Map of PA program objectives and learning outcomes
- Map of evaluation of program learning outcomes
- Minutes of the working group meetings
- Minutes of the curriculum committee meetings
- Public administration educational program
- Programme learning outcomes (see program)
- Labor market analysis evidence
- Panel Experts Interviews

**General recommendations of the cluster: Non**

**General suggestions of the cluster:**

- It is suggested to update the learning outcomes for all programs with digitalization and sustainability aspects;
- It is suggested to improve the requirements for the master thesis content.

**Recommendations and suggestions according to the programs: Non**

### Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the program with the component

Component 1.2 Programme Learning Outcomes	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Program 1 Business Administration, level 6	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Program 2 Business Administration, level 7	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Program 4 Finance, level 6	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Program 5 Finance and Banking, level 7	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Program 6 Marketing, level 7	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Program 8 Public Administration, level 6	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### 1.3 Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes

- Evaluation mechanisms of the program learning outcomes are defined. The program learning outcomes assessment process consists of defining, collecting, and analyzing data necessary to measure learning outcomes.
- Program learning outcomes assessment results are utilized for the improvement of the program.

#### **Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component**

The assessment framework for the learning outcomes of educational cluster programs is well-defined and based on a clear methodology. It features transparent, clear, reliable, and regular evaluations of teaching methods and research aspects. The documentation specifies that the learning outcomes for each program are linked to particular courses or research components, along with the evaluation methods used to assess their accomplishment.

Each evaluation period is specified for all study programs in Business Administration, Finance, Public Administration, Marketing Accounting, and Taxation, and also appropriate target benchmarks are set.

Additionally, specific assessment criteria for required introductory courses are detailed to measure the outcomes of comprehensive learning, encompassing both general and specialized knowledge in the respective fields.

The expected learning outcomes for cluster all education programs were defined according to Bloom's taxonomy, encompassing remembering, understanding, applying, analyzing, evaluating, and creating in the areas of study. The most advanced skills are observed for the Doctoral program in Business administration. According to the PHD student's opinion, it was noted that the BSU standards for the quality of the PhD thesis are very high.

At each of the three education study levels, summative assessments are used to evaluate students' understanding through tests, quizzes, and other graded assignments specific to each course.

The information provided, documents, and interviews conclude that the university and Quality assurance service are essential in establishing a system for evaluating the learning outcomes of educational programs.

The faculty for the cluster programs analysed the findings from the surveys conducted among students and faculty teachers during the execution of the program and semester. The evaluation of outcomes helps the university to enhance the program's effectiveness and increase the qualification of teachers.

The oversight of lecture-practical sessions by the faculty dean, the quality assurance service, and Department management are involved in assessing learning outcomes.

The monitoring protocol is structured around the criterion: "Instruction is aimed at achieving the learning outcomes and competencies outlined in the syllabus.". A low evaluation of this criterion prompts further discussion, necessitating additional observations, verification of the activities detailed in the syllabus, assessment of the instructional methods employed, and review of the lecture materials presented. Consequently, adjustments may be made to the syllabus of the training course based on the findings. Therefore, the evaluation of learning outcomes at each stage contributes to the enhancement of the educational program.

The assessment of the "Research component" for Doctoral Program is evaluated according to the following system: Excellent (*summa cum laude*) – outstanding thesis; Very Good (*magna cum laude*) – result that highly exceeds the requirements; Good (*cum laude*) – result that exceeds the requirements; Average (*bene*) – mediocre thesis that meets the basic requirements; Satisfactory (*rite*) – result that still meets the requirements despite drawbacks; Fail (*insufficient*) – unsatisfactory thesis that does not meet the requirements owing to significant drawbacks in it; Fail outright – a result that does not meet any requirements at all.

The learning outcomes of all cluster programs are specifically designed to align with the needs and priorities of students, while also underscoring the importance of ethical and democratic principles. Additionally, there is a

systematic approach to the periodic assessment of learning outcomes, which includes consultations with alumni and employers. Quality assurance Service is in charge of monitoring all the processes related to evaluation during the semester and during the examination sessions.

**Evidences/Indicators**

- Educational programmers’ learning outcomes
- Syllabi of the study courses
- Regulation for conducting exams
- Student guide
- Rules for designing, approval and developing BSU educational programs
- Labor market analysis report
- Panel Expert interviews

General recommendations of the cluster: Non

General suggestions of the cluster:

- It is suggested to diversify university stakeholders by attracting representatives from all areas of the economy (agriculture, services, transportation, etc.) and to involve more local public authorities in defining the program's learning outcomes.
- It is suggested to extend the list of international partners and visibility of all programs.
- It is suggested to update the information on the university website in English language.

**Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes: Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s): Non**

**Evaluation**

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 1.3 Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Business Administration, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 Business Administration, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 Finance, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 Finance and Banking, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 Marketing, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

<b>Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7</b>	<b>x</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 8 Public Administration, level 6</b>	<b>x</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

#### 1.4. Structure and Content of Educational Programme

- The programme is designed according to HEI's methodology for planning, designing and developing of educational programmes.
- The programme structure is consistent and logical. The content and structure ensure the achievement of the programme learning outcomes. The qualification to be awarded corresponds to the programme content and learning outcomes.

#### Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Educational programs grouped in this cluster are compiled according to the criteria defined by the National Qualifications Framework, and Study Field Classifier by the methodology for planning, designing, and developing programs at BSU. The optional study courses of the programs included in the cluster (8 programs) allow the students to deepen their knowledge in any area. The methodology of the program development is complete and applied according to national and internal regulations and standards

The university follows the legal framework requirements and ensures the awarding of the appropriate qualification at the final stage of education. The curriculum for the education program at the Bachelor, Master, and Doctoral levels is developed according to the educational plan approved by the University's Academic Council, with regulations and procedures well understood and followed by university management, program leaders, and faculty. This adherence supports the achievement of the study program's objectives. However, students and graduates have expressed a desire for an increased number of hours for practical activities.

During the interview, the employers confirmed their active involvement in developing the structure and the content of the educational programs and expressed strong support for its continuation at BSU.

They are engaged at every stage of the study program's development and review, spanning cycles I, II, and III. During the development of the content and structure of the "Business Administration" educational program the "Sectoral Characteristics of Higher Education of Business Administration" is recognized as the main document; as well as the results of the research conducted, which includes surveys of employers and graduates. The educational program is designed to meet master's level standards, with its content, structure, scope, and complexity appropriately aligned.

Information about the program is publicly accessible and published on the university's website. The programs align with the strategic plan of the BSU University The program consists of a total of 180 credits, which includes 30 credits for free components or additional educational programs, 11 credits for optional courses within the main study area, and 139 credits for mandatory courses. The consistency of the program structure is ensured by the logical applied principles.

One employer representative emphasized the importance of employer questionnaires and affirmed their companies' commitment to hiring students from the labor market, providing internships, and contributing to the revision of the educational plan as members of the faculty's quality assurance committee. All education program changes require formal approval before they can be implemented. All recommendations made during the working group meetings have been documented in the meeting minutes and the implementation is monitored by the Quality Assurance Service. The university has clear incentive motivation for teachers and PhD students to increase the visibility of the research component.



It is appreciable that the university supports the financing of participation in national and international scientific and professional development events (conferences, training, symposiums, etc) and promotes the publication of scientific articles and scientific research results in international scientific journals.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1: Bachelor's educational programme in Business Administration - 180 credits.

The content and structure of the education Bachelor's program in Business Administration is based on the internal procedure of the BSU and national rules. In the process of initiation and elaboration, the management of the university cooperated with the staff, students, faculty, and university external parties to design the program.

The program includes an elective component. The program is designed to make the program efficient by using education process concepts, research elements, practical work, and familiarizing the students with the industry via different academic courses, case studies, and didactic projects. The structure is consistent and logical and ensures the achievement of the program's learning outcomes

Description and Analysis - Programme 2: Master's educational programme in Business Administration - 120 Credits.

The program is designed to meet the standards of a master's level of study in terms of its content, structure, scope, and complexity. Information regarding the program is publicly accessible and can be found partially on the university's website. An essential component of the master's BA program is the research component, aimed at developing the independent research skills of master's students. Interviews with academic management, teachers, and students presented that internships within the study program are assessed according to institutional regulations. The program is structured over two years and comprises four semesters, with a curriculum including theoretical concepts and practical applications. It complies with Georgian legislation and the European Credit Transfer System, amounting to a total of 120 ECTS credits.

This includes 80 ECTS allocated for compulsory courses (70 ECTS) and optional courses (10 ECTS), 10 ECTS designated for internship, and 30 ECTS for the completion of a master thesis. The program's framework ensures that each component is specifically made to achieve defined objectives and learning outcomes through appropriate volume, pedagogical methods, and assessment criteria.

Description and Analysis - Programme 3: Doctoral educational programme in Business Administration - 60 Credits.

The doctoral program in Business Administration is designed to meet specific goals and learning outcomes through a structured curriculum that combines academic and scientific components, ensuring graduates are awarded the Doctor of Business Administration qualification.

The program's final structure and content are developed with input from qualified academic and scientific personnel, taking into account available resources, evaluations of the academic process, and labor market demands, including feedback from graduate employment research and employer requirements.

The PhD program is accessible to all interested individuals, with details available on the university's website. The university offers the possibility for PhD students to publish and present their research results to the business environment community. The faculty is responsible for the PhD program.

Description and Analysis - Programme 4: Bachelor's educational programme in Finances - 180 credits.

The bachelor's education program in Finance is designed to meet specific goals and learning outcomes, ensuring a coherent structure and content distribution that follows to prerequisites for achieving the desired competencies.

The program consists of 180 credits, with 137 credits dedicated to mandatory courses in the main field of study, 13 credits for optional courses, and 30 credits for free components or additional educational opportunities.

It aligns with current legislation and the National Qualifications Framework, ensuring that the qualification awarded, program content, and learning outcomes are consistent and integrated. The final structure of the Bachelor's Finance program provides a significant level of flexibility, enabling students to adapt their studies to specific academic interests.

Description and Analysis - Programme 5: Master's educational programme in Finance and Banking - 120 Credits.

The Master's program in Finance and Banking at BSU meets higher education standards and is led by the Department of Finance, Banking, and Insurance Affairs. A working group organized by the university evaluated financial sector characteristics and incorporated employer feedback in the study program development.

The program requires a foundational understanding of finance and risk management obtained by students at the bachelor's level of studies (120 credits).

The program prepares students with theoretical knowledge and practical skills in financial areas and has been approved by the Academic Council after the Faculty Council meeting decisions. Students aspiring to advance their academic and specialized careers in Finance and Banking attain an appropriate balance between the program's theoretical course units and practical, applicable case studies.

This equilibrium facilitates the development of skill sets that are aligned with the financial market trends in the increasingly complex labor market they will meet after graduation. The students mentioned that the banking sector from the region is not so open for internship and research opportunities.

The university administration is actively engaged in initiatives aimed at enhancing collaboration with financial institutions and integrating them into academic activities. Graduates of the Master's in Banking and Finance program during the two years of studies advance in full understanding of both theoretical and practical finance, covering topics like public finance, portfolio theory, corporate finance, financial market, statistics, and financial analysis, as well as the role of financial institutions and real businesses for the economic development of the country.

The Master's educational program in Finance and Banking program is designed according to HEI's methodology, it is delivered by faculty members, including teachers, professors, and researchers, and focuses on the continuous improvement of knowledge of the students enrolled in the program. The master's program in Finance and Banking promotes critical thinking, deep learning, and ethical business practices. The qualification in Finance and Banking corresponds to the programme content and learning outcomes.

Description and Analysis - Programme 6: Master's educational programme in Marketing - 120 credits.

The Master's educational program in Marketing aims to cultivate advanced academic expertise in marketing, providing students with the essential theories, concepts, and skills necessary to effectively market products and excel in a competitive labor market. A clear procedure governs the flow of the education program. The program coordinator emphasized that the Curriculum Committee's decision is crucial for program approval. This decision concerning the study program is discussed at the Faculty Council sessions and approved by the Academic Council. The curriculum encompasses a diverse range of courses, collaboration with industry actors, and practical learning through real case studies and market research projects, thereby enriching both national and international student experiences. Teaching methods applied for this program include case studies, seminars, teamwork, and problem-solving exercises, all designed to foster active master student engagement to integrate theory with practice. The program is highly appreciated in the Autonomous Republic of Adjara and is dedicated

to enhancing students' decision-making capabilities. Because of the well-designed and logical structure of the program, the qualified graduates are very easily employed.

Description and Analysis - Programme 7: Master's educational programme in Accounting, Auditing, Taxation" - 120 credits.

The educational program was developed by a working group based on surveys of employers and graduates, aligning with labor market requirements. It consists of 120 ECTS credits. The program includes a structured curriculum that builds knowledge progressively across four semesters. The first semester covers important courses such as Financial Accounting and Business Financial Management, employing student-centered teaching methods. Subsequent semesters introduce advanced topics like Tax Accounting and Auditing, with a focus on developing sectoral competencies and research skills necessary for the master's thesis. The program emphasizes logical course prerequisites and includes a comprehensive academic plan detailing course interdisciplinarity. It was reviewed and approved by the Faculty, Quality Assurance Service, and the University Academic Council, ensuring that it meets the needs of the labor market and is accessible to all interested individuals.

Description and Analysis – Programme 8: Bachelor's educational programme in Public Administration - 180 credits.

The program in Public Administration at BSU was developed by the Department of Law and Public Administration, following market research and employer consultations to identify necessary competencies. The staff mentioned the international professors' help concerning the program's internationalization. The program is correlated with the university's strategic plan and faculty strategic objectives and the content is formulated based on international and national educational practices. The program's duration is 3 years and includes 180 ECTS credits. The program has a structured curriculum that progresses from general to specific subjects, emphasizing conceptual knowledge in public administration. The program curriculum incorporates a logical list of courses, ensuring practical activities for each subject. Key courses include Public Administration, Communication and Presentation Skills, Research Methods, and various mandatory subjects to build essential competencies. The references to the courses are more focused on national sources with few references in foreign languages. The alumni noted that the program aims to meet the needs of all stakeholders. Labor market demands are the key issues for the university in the area of public administration. The level of employment is very high because of the increased qualifications of the BSU Bachelor of Public Administration graduates.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- The rule for ensuring the elaboration, assessment and development of academic higher education programs operating in BSU
- Decision on Approval of the Working Group
- Educational programme curriculum
- Action plans for the development of educational programs
- Benchmarking of the marketing master's educational programme
- Document - Strategic plan for the internationalization (PA)
- Doctoral Program regulations
- Self-evaluation report

**General recommendations of the cluster:** Non

### **General suggestion of the cluster:**

- It is suggested to increase the number of hours for practical activities;
- It is suggested to revise the list of subjects and prioritize the professional specialized unit courses;
- It is suggested to improve the mechanism of promotion of the education program to increase the number of students;
- It is suggested to increase the internationalization and visibility of PHD research results.

### **Recommendations and suggestions according to the programs: Non**

#### **Programme 1 Business Administration, level 6**

##### **Recommendation(s): Non**

##### **Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to update the information in English on the university website related to the program.

#### **Programme 2 Business Administration, level 7**

##### **Recommendation(s): Non**

##### **Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to increase the cooperation with more business companies to diversify the internship offers for master students' program.

#### **Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8**

##### **Recommendation(s): Non**

##### **Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to increase the level of internationalization of the Doctoral program and the visibility in the area of publications in internationally recognized databases.

#### **Programme 4 Finance, level 6**

##### **Recommendation(s): Non**

##### **Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested To involve the private sector more in the design of internship learning objectives and curricula.

#### **Programme 5 Finance and Banking, level 7**

##### **Recommendation(s): Non**

##### **Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to increase the cooperation level of the faculty with the banking sector.

**Programme 6** Marketing, level 7

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to focus the curriculum subjects on new trends in marketing.

**Programme 7** Accounting, Auditing, and Taxation, level 7

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to promote the international certification in audit and accounting.

**Programme 8** Public Administration, level 6

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

## Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 1.4 Structure and Content of Educational Programme	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
<b>Programme 1</b> (Business Administration, level 6)	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 2</b> (Business Administration, level 7)	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 3</b> (Business Administration, level 8)	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 4</b> (Finances, level 6)	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 5</b> (Finances and Banking, level 7)	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 6</b> (Marketing, level 6)	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 7</b> (Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7)	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 8</b> (Public Administration, level 6)	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### 1.5. Academic Course/Subject

➤ The content of the academic course / subject and the number of credits ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes defined by this course / subject.

- The content and the learning outcomes of the academic course/subject of the main field of study ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme.
  - The study materials indicated in the syllabus ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme.
- 

#### **Cluster and individual evaluation**

#### **Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component**

The Evaluated cluster programs bachelor, master's and doctoral programs have standardized syllabi. For each course, a very detailed well-organized subject descriptor (Syllabus) has been developed. Each descriptor contains: Course objectives, intended learning outcomes, teaching methods used to achieve learning outcomes, detailed description of weekly content, corresponding literature, and independent work, assessment methods for each component of assessment work, as well as clear criteria linking student achievement to grades, and suggested literature. The learning outcomes of the academic course of the main field of study are in line with program learning outcomes as the content of each academic course corresponds to the learning outcomes of this subject.

The provisions of the educational plan are articulated through the curriculum for each discipline, which is developed by a model approved by the Academic Council. The panel experts noted that the BSU internal regulations regarding curricula and syllabi procedures are well-known by teachers and students and consistently followed at all levels—Departments, Faculty, and institutions, facilitating the achievement of the cluster study program's objectives. The faculty selected appropriate training courses for each educational program. The curriculum committee ensures that course content is logically connected to program learning outcomes, and changes are made as necessary.

Effective learning outcomes are supported by accessible learning materials, practical examples, and the annual acquisition of modern literature in business administration. The literature listed in the syllabi is well organized and presented.

The university has an advanced information database and literature in Business administration and a good library infrastructure including manuals. The quickly evolving nature of the business areas and continuous updates of training materials are essential to produce highly qualified specialists.

The panel noted that students and graduates of bachelor's programs in Business Administration, Public Administration, and Finance emphasized the necessity for an increased number of hours for practical activities. They suggested more hours for internship components.

The consultation and communication mechanism with Alumni is in place. Alumni students are part of the university quality program assessment process and annually are questioned regarding the quality of the study program upon completion of their studies. The alumni recommendations were taken into account for revising the study plans. An example is the Accounting and Audit program

The curriculum is regularly assessed by all subject matter including business managers, considering new teaching methods, labor market demands, trends in the field sectors, and the results of their own research, as well as changes in regulations and students' expectations.

The curricula developed by the university for each educational program are structured according to internal procedures approved by the Faculty and by the BSU Academic Council. Curricula for BA, MA, and Doctoral Education programs were organized in a coherent and logical structure. All curricula and syllabi have a standard format. The topics are outlined in subjects, concepts, and activities. All subjects are linked to the field and level of study, learning objectives, and outcomes.

New instructional approaches have been implemented in the programs, incorporating theoretical subjects and hands-on activities, case studies, presentations, research projects, and various other tasks to meet the program's

learning goals and outcomes. The systematic methodology described in the curricula guarantees detailed learning.

The development of professional skills for all cluster programs is centered on students. The role of employers in the study program is great because they take part in the process of curriculum change and promote labor market interests. Their contribution impacts the quality of curricula based on qualification needs. Additional topics are included in the content of the curricula.

The market research study report includes the main provisions and evidence of the weak points. The evaluation strategies are in place. Students know very well the content of the curricula and the requirements for knowledge assessment. The planning process of syllabi and curricula involves companies reviewing and coming up with feedback. The joint research projects among university cluster program actors (teachers, students, and PHD students), private business owners, and public servants are in progress.

The university staff participates in the development of policy documents at the local public administration level and consults the companies and banks in business planning. Regarding the problem-solving skills of university graduates, the employers demonstrated that the graduates showed a high level of proficiency in judging the rationality of opinions based on both qualitative and measurable data. The objectives and learning outcomes for all education cluster programs were defined in cooperation with the stakeholders identified by the Quality Assurance Service and faculty and based on cooperation agreements of the university. All academic course curricula are designed to facilitate specific field learning outcomes, with credit allocation supporting this aim. The course contents and learning outcomes are aligned with the program's objectives and the study materials outlined in the syllabus are essential for helping students to achieve program learning outcomes.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1: Bachelor's educational programme in Business Administration - 180 credits.

The curriculum structure for the Business Administration bachelor's degree offers a progressive learning approach. The Bachelor's program is accurately organized to prepare students for potential master's studies, focusing on both theoretical knowledge and practical skills aligned with the program's learning outcomes. It employs varied modern teaching methods and modern assessment methods. Additionally, the curriculum attests advanced learning materials, planning software tools, manuals, and information databases to enhance educational knowledge.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2: Master's educational programme in Business Administration - 120 Credits.

The program in Master of Business Administration provides students with the general qualifications needed to apply for highly qualified managerial positions and Doctoral programs. The curriculum attests to a logical structure and promotes advanced studies in business administration. All syllabi for the master's program are in place. The curriculum emphasizes both theoretical and applied knowledge and research, equipping students with leadership abilities for roles as executives, consultants, or entrepreneurs.

Description and Analysis - Programme 3: Doctoral educational programme in Business Administration - 60 credits.

The curriculum emphasizes both theoretical and applied research, equipping students with leadership abilities for roles as executives, consultants, or entrepreneurs. The course contents and learning outcomes are aligned with the program's objectives and the study materials outlined in the syllabus are essential for helping students to achieve program learning outcomes.

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 4: Bachelor's educational programme in Finances - 180 credits.

The Panel noted that the structure and curricular content of the Finance study program align with the methodological provisions of the curricular concept. The curriculum structure includes the study goals, which are correlated with those outlined in the program, recommended bibliography and references, teaching and learning methods, evaluation tasks, curricular content, and the allocation of time dedicated to each content unit. The curriculum structure for the subjects within the study program has been updated as part of the implementation of previously accredited curricula. Each unit course is accompanied by lecture notes and support materials as part of the curricular packages. The curriculum for the discipline of "Corporate Finance" includes a conceptual framework, general and standard objectives, a breakdown of topics with indicative time allocations by educational format, reference, and content objectives, teaching and learning activities, topics for individual study, subjects for exam preparation, evaluation processes, and scoring scales, as well as bibliographic sources.

The bibliography is updated, incorporating the course holder's scientific contributions with the latest publications in the field of financial analysis. These syllabus updates are communicated to students at the beginning of each course by the teachers. The curriculum development process is compliant with normative acts and standards and involves managers, teachers, students, graduates, and employers.

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 5: Master's educational programme in Finance and Banking - 120 Credits.

The Master's program in Finance and Banking curricula is approved at all levels including mandatory and elective courses. The content of syllabi was compiled according to the principle of the need to achieve the learning objectives and outcomes. The list of academic courses is logically linked and ensures continuity to the doctoral level of the education program. The members of the faculty curriculum development team are selected based on their profile and subject teaching. In the team/working group are invited also the invited professors and representatives of bachelor level students, masters, and doctoral community. All curricula have the same structure and are accessible to students and teachers on the university IT platform.

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 6: Master's educational programme in Marketing - 120 credits.

The Master's program in Marketing offers students the chance to challenge opportunities and generate value for organizations. This program aims to enhance students' creativity, innovation abilities, and skills in identifying, attracting, selling, managing, and collaborating with industries. The existing program curricula are well structured but because marketing continues to grow steadily it has to be improved. The rapid expansion of social media and digital technology has also driven demand for marketing analytics for different industries in both the public and private sectors. A comparison of the curriculum with career outcomes suggests that there is a need to adjust the curriculum with new technologies included and innovation in the field. The Master's educational program in Marketing study program is 100% assured with curricula syllabi according to education and study plan.

The faculty management presented argumentatively to the Panel how they correlate the discipline-specific goals with the competencies of the Marketing program. Furthermore, the Panel noted the results of teaching and content of the syllabi courses improved with best practices from other universities (enumerated by the program coordinators and evidenced in the self-evaluation report) with similar programs. All curricula syllabi have the same structure and are accessible to students and teachers on the IT platform developed by the university. Students have access to IT systems based on their accounts. The syllabi course objectives, outcomes content, timeline, and assessment methods are presented in the first hour of the course by the teacher. Also, the student guide is a source of information. All curricula are focused on knowledge, skills, and performance, and are consulted with all university program stakeholders.

Marketing Master Program's effectively structured curriculum offers a clear and logical understanding of



students' education, detailing the sequence of topics, concepts, and activities necessary to meet learning goals and realize the outcomes. This approach promotes for students comprehensive understanding and skill development. As per the program coordinator's insights, graduates have a high employment rate.

Description and Analysis - Programme 7: Master's educational programme in Accounting, Auditing, Taxation - 120 credits.

The Master's Programme in Accounting, Auditing, and Taxation is the equivalent of 120 credits. (ECTS) and corresponds to a program duration of four semesters. The curriculum for the educational program in Accounting, Auditing, and Taxation degree adopts a gradual learning method, starting with the basics of accounting and advancing to financial accounting, international accounting standards, financial reporting, taxation, and audit.

Description and Analysis – Programme 8: Bachelor's educational programme in Public Administration - 180 credits.

Bachelor's educational program in Public Administration courses syllabus contents correspond with learning outcomes and with the overall objectives of the academic program. The study materials specified in the syllabus play a crucial role in facilitating students' achievement of the program's learning outcomes. The findings noted a well-structured curriculum, which integrates relevant resources and clear objectives and significantly enhances the educational experience and effectiveness of student learning.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Educational programs;
- Programs' Syllabi;
- Self-Evaluation Report;
- Curriculum map;
- Student guide;
- Expert Panel meetings with students, graduates, and employers of the programs

**General recommendations of the cluster: Non**

#### **General suggestions of the cluster:**

- It is suggested that sustainability issues be integrated into mandatory introductory courses It is suggested to improve the assurance of study programs with literature in the English language.

**Programme 1 Business Administration, level 6**

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s): Non**

**Programme 2 Business Administration, level 7**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

**Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to increase the level of internationalization of the Doctoral program and the visibility in the area of publications in internationally recognized databases.

**Programme 4 Finance, level 6 Non**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):**

**Programme 5 Finance and Banking, level 7**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to increase the cooperation with the banking sector. To revise the list of mandatory courses, as a suggestion to include the Financial "Corporate Governance "unit course;
- It is suggested to revise the number of hours for independent work for the Subject "State Finance".

**Programme 6 Marketing, level 7**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

**Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing and Taxation, level 7**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to improve the curricula with sustainability reporting aspects.

**Programme 8 Public Administration, level 6**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to revise the syllabus of State signs and symbols (2 ECTS).

## Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 1.5 Academic Course/Subject	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Business Administration, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 Business Administration, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 Finance, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 Finance and Banking, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 Marketing, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 8 Public Administration, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

## Compliance of the programmes with the standards

1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Business Administration, level 6)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (Business Administration, level 7)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 (Business Administration, level 8)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 (Finance, level 6)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 (Finance and banking, level7)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 (Marketing, level7)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 (Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level7)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 8 (Public Administration, level 6)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

## **2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering**

Prerequisites for admission to the programme, teaching-learning methods and student assessment consider the specificity of the study field, level requirements, student needs, and ensure the engagement achievement of the objectives and expected learning outcomes of the programme.

### **2.1 Programme Admission Preconditions**

The HEI has relevant, transparent, fair, public and accessible programme admission preconditions and procedures that ensure the engagement of individuals with relevant knowledge and skills in the programme to achieve learning outcomes.

#### **Cluster evaluation**

#### **Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component**

The University has defined appropriate, transparent, fair, public, and accessible prerequisites and procedures for admission of persons to the program, which ensures the inclusion of persons with appropriate knowledge and skills in the program to achieve the learning outcomes of the program. In particular, a person with a complete general or equivalent education, who has a relevant document (certificate) certified by the state, and who obtains the right to study the mentioned programs based on the results of the unified national exams, has the right to study at the bachelor educational programs presented for cluster accreditation.

According to the changes made in the order No. 19/N of the Minister of Education and Science of Georgia dated February 18, 2011, the prerequisites for admission to bachelor's programs are determined. Enrollment in the bachelor's program without passing the unified national exams is carried out in accordance with the order of the Minister of Education and Science of Georgia dated December 29, 2011 No. 224/N "On the approval of the rules for submission and review of documents by students who have the right to study in a higher educational institution without passing the unified national exams."

According to the information of the institution, along with other mechanisms „ Open Hours' Days” are held in public schools before the start of each registration to provide information to interested persons about the prerequisites for enrolling in the programs. Entrants and other interested persons are informed about the conditions of admission. Also, the prerequisites for admission are published on the BSU website and in the reference, book published by the National Center for Evaluation and Examinations, as well as posted on the website of the mentioned center.

Prerequisite for enrollment in master's education programs is open to holders of a bachelor's degree in academic higher education in any specialty, who pass the common master's examination and the examinations established by the BSU in a foreign language and specialty.

Citizens of foreign countries, who have obtained the right to receive higher education according to the legislation of their country, have the right to study without common master's exams.

For those wishing to enroll in master's programs, the institution has developed a support mechanism for entrants for bachelors with other specialties, in particular, the departments implementing the program hold consultation meetings on specialty exam issues, as evidenced by the minutes of the departments.

Information about internal university exams and exam issues is posted on the website of the Faculty of Economics and Business of BSU and is available to all interested persons.

During the accreditation period, the university's website posted the schedule of additional specialty exams for master's degree candidates, evaluations of foreign language and specialty additional exams, where the information (surname, first name, program, evaluation score) is given. As administration persons mentioned during the interview it does not conflict with personal data protection legislation. The institution has developed "BSU personal data protection policy" (Order of the Rector of BSU dated June 05, 2024 N 01-02/75), according to which it manages personal data protection.

"Knowledge of a foreign language at a certain level" is meant as additional conditions for studying at the master's program. The programs submitted for evaluation require the English language as a prerequisite based on the structure and teaching materials.

It should be noted that different programs have different complete information about prerequisites.

Prerequisites and procedures for admission to the program are in accordance with applicable legislation. Prerequisites for admission to the program are logically related to the results of the program, teaching content, level, qualification.

BSU determines the methodology of planning the number of students in the educational program, which takes into account the specifics of the program and the resources of the institution and ensures the smooth implementation of the educational process. A group of experts requested a methodology for determining the student quota. The institution presented the decision of the representative council No. 6, "Regarding the rule for determining the student contingent of the public law legal entity - Shota Rustaveli State University of Batumi" (28.07.2017). Admission of students to the program ensures the smooth implementation of the program in accordance with the methodology of planning the number of students.

The possibility of enrolling a foreign citizen and without unified national examiners is allowed in the programs, although it is not mentioned how the institution checks the level of knowledge of the Georgian language. In the interview process with the heads of the program, it was mentioned that the entrants are required to have B1 level in Georgian. BSU Language Center provides an exam in Georgian.

### **individual evaluation**

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 Bachelor's educational programme in Business Administration - 180 credits

The entrant to the "Business Administration" bachelor's program takes mandatory subjects: Georgian language and literature and a foreign language. Mathematics and history are optional subjects. 50% of the contingent enrolled in the program is enrolled by passing mathematics, and 50% by passing history. The minimum competence limit of the subjects and the priorities are also defined. In particular, the main priority is given to mathematics or history, the next priority is Georgian language and literature and foreign language. Differentiation of electives helps to attract applicants with different subject interests. It should be noted that the additional literature in the training courses is mainly in English.

Description and Analysis - Programme 2 Master's educational programme in Business Administration

A person with a bachelor's degree, who has passed the common master's exam and has registered as a master's candidate within the terms established by the individual-legal act of the BSU rector, has the right to enroll in the educational program. To enroll in the program, the applicant must pass internal university exams in English language (B2 level) and specialty. It is possible to enroll in the master's educational program as part of internal

or external mobility. According to the procedure established by the Ministry of Education and Science of Georgia, it is allowed to enroll citizens of foreign countries in the program.

The self-assessment report contains information that is not found in the program transcript. In particular, the internal university exam includes a test to determine the level of English language proficiency (B2) and a written exam in the specialty, which may include open and closed tests, case analysis, and written answers to specific topics. The entrance exam is held in the BSU exam center, in written form. The assessment is done by commission", in relation to the given master's program, during the interview process with the heads of the program, it was clarified that the format of the specialty exam includes theoretical issues. As program prerequisites are open, the leaders of the program believe that the basic knowledge in this area is verified by the admission specialty exams and that the level of knowledge demonstrated in the specialty exam is sufficient to overcome the program. The examination issues of the master's program specialty are posted on the website: <https://bsu.edu.ge/sub-33/program/3/index.html>.

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 3 Doctoral educational programme in Business Administration

According to the information contained in the PhD program presented for evaluation, admission to the doctoral educational program is carried out in accordance with the rules established by the Georgian legislation and the regulations of the BSU doctoral program. Those wishing to study in the program are required to:

- Master's degree or an equivalent academic degree in business administration (or in fields classified in the narrow field of business and administration provided by the "classifier of study areas"), or in economics;
- Knowledge of English language at least B2 level.

The right to study for a doctorate can also be granted to a graduate of a higher educational institution of a foreign country in accordance with the rules established by the legislation of Georgia. A doctoral candidate for whom the Georgian language is not his/her native language and wishes to study in a Georgian-language program must submit a certificate confirming the B2 level of the Georgian language, or pass an exam in the Georgian language at BSU. It is desirable, in the case of a citizen of a foreign country, to specify the qualification of Master of Business Administration and Economics.

- Those wishing to study on the program must pass internal university exams.

The admission procedure consists of two parts: 1. A written exam in English, the purpose of which is to check the candidate's knowledge of English at the B2 level; 2. After successfully passing the exam, the doctoral candidate will be interviewed/examined in the specialty. The purpose of the interview is to determine the candidate's academic achievements, knowledge about the chosen field and motivation. Also, the doctoral research application will be evaluated. It is possible to enroll in the doctoral educational program as part of internal or external mobility.

Enrollment of citizens of foreign countries in the program is allowed in accordance with the procedure defined by the legislation of Georgia. The institution presented the evaluation criteria for admission to the doctoral program and summary protocols of interviews. Also, the test sample of the English language exam, which is located on the website. <https://bsu.edu.ge/main/page/21259/index.html>. The exam questions of the doctoral program specialty are located on the web: <https://bsu.edu.ge/sub-33/program/4/index.html>. The study literature specified for the preparation of the specialty exam is partially updated. During the interview with the program leaders, it was also mentioned that the prerequisites will have to be changed according to the new framework-document for the doctoral level.

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 4 Bachelor's educational programme in Finance

According to the record of the program, "Enrollment in the educational program is done in accordance with the rules established by the legislation of Georgia and the "rules regulating the educational process of BSU's undergraduate and master's educational programs" approved by Resolution No. 111 of October 8, 2015 of the Academic Council of Batumi Shota Rustaveli State University. In order to enroll in the "Finance" bachelor's program, it is necessary for the applicant to pass the mandatory subjects of Georgian language and literature, foreign language, and mathematics is considered as an optional subject.

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 5 Master's educational programme in Finance and Banking

In order to enroll in the program, "Bachelor's academic degree in any specialty, the common master's exam established by the legislation of Georgia and the exam established by BSU in the specialty and foreign language".

There is no information in the prerequisites of the program, which is presented in the self-assessment report, in particular, "the knowledge and competences necessary for achieving the goals and learning outcomes provided for by the program are assessed by passing a complex exam relevant to the field in the specialty. The exam questions are selected in accordance with the confirmation of the necessary competences to pass the learning outcomes achieved by the program. Due to the fact that candidates for master's degrees who do not have a bachelor's degree in business administration and economics are also admitted to the program, in order to master the training courses provided by the program, the professors-teachers of the faculty provide consultation regarding exam issues during the pre-examination period (for 2 weeks, 20 consulting hours). When drawing up the exam ticket, it is envisaged to include the necessary theoretical and practical materials for the evaluation of the competencies (knowledge, skills) determining the learning results. The entrance exam is held in the BSU exam center, in written form. The assessment is done by commission, which excludes a subjective approach as much as possible. In order to ensure publicity and accessibility, information about prerequisites for admission to the program and examination issues is posted on the university's website. The exam questions of the master's program specialty are located on the web: [https://bsu.edu.ge/text\\_files/ge\\_file\\_420\\_3.pdf](https://bsu.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_420_3.pdf).

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 6 Master's educational programme in Marketing

Prerequisite for admission to the program: "Bachelor's academic degree in any specialty, the common master's exam established by the legislation of Georgia and the exam established by BSU in the specialty and B2 level English language".

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 7 Master's educational programme in Accounting, Auditing, Taxation

"Enrollment in the educational program is granted to a person who has a bachelor's degree, passed the common master's exam and registered as a master's degree candidate in the BSU within the terms established by the individual-legal act of the rector, fully submitted the documentation established by this rule, passed the internal university exams in a foreign language and specialty and established He signed an agreement with BSU on time. The internal university exam includes a test to determine the level of foreign language proficiency (B2) and a written exam in the specialty.

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 8 Bachelor's educational programme in Public Administration

BSU student status is obtained on the basis of unified national exams, and citizens of foreign countries and stateless persons who have obtained the right to receive higher education according to the legislation of the

country in which they received secondary education or its equivalent have the right to study without the unified national exams. Internal mobility or external mobility (by transfer) can be enrolled in the bachelor's program of public administration.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Programs and syllabi submitted for cluster accreditation
- Resolution of the academic council of BSU N-111, 08.10.2015 "On approval of the regulation of the educational process"
- Resolution of the Academic Council N-59, 07.07.2017 on approval of the rules for admission to the master's program of BSU
- Matters of entrance exams for master's degree in "Finance and Banking" [https://bsu.edu.ge/text\\_files/ge\\_file\\_420\\_3.pdf](https://bsu.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_420_3.pdf)
- Admission exam issues and literature for enrollment in the "Business Administration" master's educational program [https://bsu.edu.ge/text\\_files/ge\\_file\\_417\\_3.pdf](https://bsu.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_417_3.pdf)
- Decision of the representative council No. 6, "Regarding the rules for determining the student contingent of the legal entity under public law - Shota Rustaveli State University of Batumi" (28.07.2017)
- Provision of doctoral studies
- "Personal data protection policy at BSU" (order N01-02/75 of the rector of BSU dated June 5, 2024),
- Admission exam issues and literature for enrollment in the "Business Administration" doctoral educational program [https://bsu.edu.ge/text\\_files/ge\\_file\\_414\\_3.pdf](https://bsu.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_414_3.pdf) - 2.1.9
- Interview results
- University website

**General recommendations of the cluster:** Non

#### **General suggestions of the cluster:**

- It is suggested for the institution to provide complete information regarding the prerequisites for admission to all programs, including the determination of the level of English and Georgian language proficiency.

**Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:** Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

#### **Programme 1 (Bachelor's educational programme in Business Administration)**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

#### **Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to require the English language in the entrance exams.

#### **Programme 2 (Master's educational programme in Business Administration)**



**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to study literature indicated for the preparation of the specialty exam on the master's program in business administration needs to be updated.

**Programme 3 (Doctoral educational programme in Business Administration)**

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to include advanced study literature in a foreign language in the preparation of the exam/interview questions of the doctoral program in business administration.

**Programme 4 (Bachelor's educational programme in Finance)**

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s): Non**

**Programme 5 (Master's educational programme in Finance and Banking)**

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to study literature indicated for the preparation of the specialty exam of the master's program in finance and banking needs to be updated.

**Programme 6 (Master's educational programme in Marketing)**

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s): Non**

**Programme 7 (Master's educational programme in Accounting, Auditing, Taxation)**

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested for those who wish to study Master's educational program in Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, to have a Bachelor's degree in Business Administration and Economics, as well as a similar profile direction.

**Programme 8 (Bachelor's educational programme in Public Administration)**

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s): Non**

## Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programme with the component

Component 2.1 Programme admission preconditions	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Business Administration, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 Business Administration, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 Finance, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 Finance and Banking, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 Marketing, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 8 Public Administration, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

## 2.2. The Development of Practical, Scientific/Research/Creative/Performing and Transferable Skills

Programme ensures the development of students' practical, scientific/research/creative/performing and transferable skills and/or their involvement in research projects, in accordance with the programme learning outcomes.

### Cluster and individual evaluation

#### Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The programs, the courses they include and the research components according to the learning outcomes and level, ensure that students develop practical and research skills. The combination of learning and teaching methods offered by the curriculum promotes the development of analysis and synthesis, critical thinking and practical skills. Courses include written assignments, small projects, oral discussions, presentations, professional and industrial practice, and master's and doctoral theses to help develop research skills.

Specifically, "Professional Practice", "Fundamentals of Academic Writing", "Business Statistics", "Project Management" serve to develop practical and transferable skills in the "Business Administration" Bachelor educational program; "Business Administration" Master's Program - "Business Research Methods and Design", "Business Process Modeling", "Business Project Management", "Professional Practice", "Master's Thesis";

"Business Administration" doctoral program - "Modern teaching methods", "Academic writing for doctoral students", "Research techniques and methods", "Professor's assistantship", "Seminar in the field", "Seminar in the subfield", "Science and Research Management", "Applied Statistics with SPSS Elements", Colloquiums and Doctoral Thesis. "Finance" - "Fundamentals of Academic Writing", "Professional Practice", "Mathematical Modeling of Financial Economic Processes" in the bachelor's program "Finance"; "Finance and Banking" Master's Program - "Scientific Research Methods and Design", "Business Process Modeling and Simulations", "Professional Practice", "Master's Thesis"; on the Master's program "Marketing" - "Academic Writing for Master's Students", "Marketing Research", "Business Marketing", "Professional Practice", "Master's Thesis"; "Accounting, Auditing, Taxation" master's program - "Practical course of tax administration", "Scientific research methods and design", "Solving economic and business problems in Excel and Power BI", "Mathematical modeling of business processes" "Labor market analysis", "Professional practice", "Master's thesis"; In the Bachelor's program "Public administration" - "Communication and presentation skills", "Research methods in public administration", "Project management in the public sector", "Professional practice".

The development and strengthening of students' research skills is facilitated by participation in targeted scientific-research projects at BSU, funding of student research projects announced for students, organization of scientific conferences, etc.

The practical component of the program is organized and planned according to the learning outcomes of the program and corresponds to the teaching level. During the period of practice and in the case of involvement in a scientific research project, the student is guided by a qualified person in the field.

During the interview process with the program leaders, it was noted that it is difficult to send students to the practice facilities due to the limitations of the space and human resources of the practice organizations.

In the process of practice, contact consultations are held with the head of the practice and the mentor (leader from the enterprise practice). The practice is led by a representative of BSU. The supervisor of the practice helps the students to solve the problems raised during the practice, and leads the activities provided by the practice syllabus. By following the mentor's instructions and the given tasks, a practice diary is developed. At the end of the practice, the mentor writes a description describing the knowledge and skills demonstrated by the student during the practice, the work performed by the student, notes and recommendations. A resource for evaluating student activity is attached to the description. The student records the work done daily in the practice diary and, after completing the practice, prepares a practice report to be kept publicly. The institution presented material practice diaries, descriptions and reports. In the package of materials submitted for accreditation, the institution presented a memorandum signed with 8 facilities. Among them are: the Ministry of Education, Culture and Sports of the Autonomous Republic of Adjara, with which an agreement has been signed within the framework of the grant project; Ministry of Finance and Economy of the A/R Republic of Adjara, the purpose of which is to use the Faculty of Natural Sciences and Healthcare of BSU as a training base; Ministry of Agriculture of the

Autonomous Republic of Adjara - promotion of internship and training practice for university students; City Hall of Batumi Municipality - provision of production proactivity of undergraduate educational program "Oil and Gas Engineering"; JSC "Bazisbank" Batumi service center - cooperation within the professional educational program - bank cashier-operator (third level); "Liberty Bank" - the question of the practice of the professional educational program "Financial Services"; Microfinance organization "Bermel" - passing of educational and professional practice of students; Elt Building LLC - cooperation in educational, scientific and cultural spheres; JSC "TBS Bank" department - development of professional skills. During the study of the memorandums, it was determined that the majority of the memorandums are signed for other programs and the purpose, duration and number of admitted students of the industrial practice are incompletely reflected. During the interview with the heads of the program, it was noted that the university has signed a lot of memoranda, and according to them, it is a technical error to present memoranda inconsistent with the accreditation programs. In addition, the institution presented the rector's orders to send the students of the valid programs submitted for evaluation to the practice facility. The expert group requested memorandums with Practice facilities. The institution additionally presented memoranda: with the Ministry of Finance and Economy of Adjara, the Chamber of Commerce of Adjara, St. Batumi City Hall, Bermel LLC Microfinance Organization, JSC Batumi Business Incubator and Prestige Audit LLC, The aim, number and duration of the professional practice are indicated in the memorandums in accordance with the accreditation standards. Accreditation experts have taken into account the new situation regarding memorandums. During the conversation with the heads of the program, it was noted that the representatives of the private sector refrain from dealing with the objects of production practice. Mainly, state structures cooperates with BSU.

During the interview with the employers, it was noted that they actively cooperate with the university both within the framework of production practice and internship programs. Many students were employed after a paid internship. In addition, the self-evaluation report describes the activities that support the development of students' practical and research skills.

During the interview process with the program leaders, it was noted that the bachelor's thesis is not presented in the bachelor's programs, because the experience of the previous years showed a deficient character of it. Moreover, at the level of study courses, students completed essays and, ultimately, their completion served the same purpose as a bachelor's thesis, namely, information search, sorting, processing. So, bachelor's programs project completion requirements have been introduced at the level of individual study courses, thereby developing transferable skills. The group of experts think that the bachelor's thesis should preferably be presented in the list of elective courses of the specialty.

The regulations of the master's degree program define that "the scientific supervisor should help the student in the process of integration into the local and international scientific space, help the master's student to fulfill the prerequisites provided by the syllabus for admission to the public defense of the master's thesis - the master's

thesis must submit at least one report to the university (national or international) scientific at the conference or publication (paper/article/thesis) to be printed (or accepted for printing) in the materials of the university (national or international) scientific conference); "During the interview process, it was noted that the requirement to present a report at the conference before defending the master's thesis serves the development of public presentation skills, the development of the skills to participate in academic discussion, and the development of critical thinking. Also, lecturers involve students in the development of a scientific article/paper, publish joint articles.

During the interview, the students mentioned that they submitted the projects developed within the study courses to the competition and received funding. They participate in student grant competitions. Before writing the grant project, they have 1-2 weeks of workshops on project development and implementation. Even now, they have ongoing projects, which they present in competitions announced at the level of university, municipality, A/R of Adjara, the Republic of Georgia and international organizations.

During the interview process, employers mentioned that joint activities are carried out with academic staff and students. Based on their recommendation, the business plan component was included in the program. In addition, public lectures are held at the university.

The project offered by Liberty Bank is "My cash register" - a simulation room where the necessary knowledge and skills for a cashier operator are developed. 60% of the students admitted to the practice facility are employed in 14 branches of Liberty Bank.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Orders for students' business trips for educational/professional practice
- Educational programs and syllabi submitted for accreditation
- Resolution of the Academic Council of BSU N-111, 08.10.2015 "On approval of the regulation of the educational process"
- Document of victory in the master's competition of the Rustaveli Scientific Foundation
- Legal entity under public law – Regulation of the selection competition for the targeted scientific-research project of Shota Rustaveli State University of Batumi, [https://www.bsu.edu.ge/text\\_files/ge\\_file\\_6256\\_1.pdf](https://www.bsu.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_6256_1.pdf)
- University website
- Memorandums of cooperation with state and private structures
- Doctoral Educational Program "Business Administration" Doctoral Regulations
- Memoranda with applicants and practice facilities
- Results of the interview

**General recommendations of the cluster:** Non

**General suggestions of the cluster:**

- It is suggested that the bachelor's thesis should preferably be presented in the list of elective courses of the specialty.
- It is suggested to expand the signing of memorandums with private business companies for the purpose of student internships.

**Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:** Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

**Programme 1 (Bachelor's educational programme in Business Administration)**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

**Programme 2 (Master's educational programme in Business Administration)**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

**Programme 3 (Doctoral educational programme in Business Administration)**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

**Programme 4 (Bachelor's educational programme in Finance)**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

**Programme 5 (Master's educational programme in Finance and Banking)**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

**Programme 6 (Master's educational programme in Marketing)**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

**Programme 7 (Master's educational programme in Accounting, Auditing, Taxation)**

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s): Non**

**Programme 8 (Bachelor's educational programme in Public Administration)**

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s): Non**

## Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component 2.2. The Development of practical, scientific/research/creative/performing and transferable Skills	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Business Administration, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 Business Administration, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 Finance, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 Finance and Banking, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 Marketing, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 8 Public Administration, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### 2.3. Teaching and Learning Methods

The programme is implemented by using student-centered teaching and learning methods. Teaching and learning methods correspond to the level of education, course/subject content, learning outcomes and ensure their achievement.

#### Cluster and individual evaluation

#### Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The teaching methods of each study course/subject of the program correspond to the teaching level, the content of the course/subject, the learning outcomes, the requirements of the field characteristics and ensure their achievement.

In the bachelor's program, teaching-learning methods are used: to achieve the learning outcomes set by the program. The following combination of methods is used: verbal methods - explanatory method, question-and-answer method, debate, case analysis method, problem-based teaching method, group work and other methods;

Method of written work - which means making notes while teaching a number of specific issues, such as: mathematical formulation of some financial and economic issues, statistical analysis, tables, graphs and others; Demonstration method - demonstration of the studied material can be done both by the teacher and the student. Also, practical methods - combine all those forms of teaching that form the student's practical skills, the student independently performs one or another activity based on the acquired knowledge, such as preparing a presentation, conducting statistical observation, and others. Method of working on the book - students process the literature indicated in the syllabi, as well as refer to other literary sources (such as journals, Internet resources, etc.) when preparing research works and/or popular articles.

The combination of teaching-learning methods used in different components of the master's programs ensures the achievement of the learning outcomes envisaged by the program. The lecturer chooses the necessary method depending on the specific goal and task. The program offers lecture, group (collaborative) work, independent work, verbal, i.e. oral - lecture, narration, conversation, etc. Working on a book, method of written work, practical methods, discussion/debate, problem-based learning (PBL), case study - case studies, active problematic situational analysis method, brainstorming method, role-playing and situational games, Action-oriented learning, project development and presentation, electronic learning (E-learning), master thesis and professional practice. The learning and teaching methods used in the different components of the doctoral program in business administration are focused on developing different competencies for the doctoral student; To develop the skills of critical evaluation of scientific information, independent thinking, listening to alternative points of view and defending one's own point of view, drawing logical conclusions.

Within the doctoral program, through training courses, seminars, colloquiums, participation in conferences, publication of articles in scientific periodicals, learning and research results are promoted. The teaching methodology of the doctoral educational program in business administration is focused on research. The development of the research component is confirmed by the qualification paper at the final stage of the program. Written and verbal method, demonstration method, mental attack, discussion-debate, individual and group work, case analysis, modeling/simulation, reflection, mutual evaluation, practical work method are used in learning. The learning methods used in each component of the program are given in the respective syllabi. Teaching-learning methods ensure the active involvement of students in the learning process, interaction between staff and students, as well as between students.

Teaching-learning methods are flexible and take into account the individual needs of students. If necessary, an individual program drawn up according to the student's interests and level of academic preparation is used. In the doctoral program, an individual doctoral student has an individual study plan, the report of which is submitted to the department.

A graduate student in the self-assessment group reported experiencing a deficiency in the practice component. There was a training course (for example, "State Budget"), where simulations of budgeting took place. He presented his own opinion to the self-evaluation group to strengthen the use of practical teaching methods in the formation of programs, which was taken into account in the teaching-learning methods of the programs.

If necessary, the University provides electronic/distance learning, which is based on the use of the Moodle platform and uses relevant teaching methods relevant to the study area of the program, which do not lead to changes in the program goals and learning outcomes.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Programs and syllabi of training courses



- Monitoring of educational process, analysis of attendance at lecture-practical classes
- Curriculum map
- Rules for developing an individual study plan of a BSU student, [https://www.bsu.edu.ge/text\\_files/ge\\_file\\_20443\\_1.pdf](https://www.bsu.edu.ge/text_files/ge_file_20443_1.pdf)
- BSU Academic Council No. 06-01/54 of July 14, 2022 "Rules for development, approval and development of BSU educational programs".
- The regulation of the educational process of BSU
- Doctoral Educational Program "Business Administration" Doctoral Regulations
- Results of the interview

**General recommendations of the cluster:** Non

**General suggestions of the cluster:** Non

**Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:** Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

**Programme 1 Bachelor’s educational programme in Business Administration**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

**Programme 2 Master’s educational programme in Business Administration**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

**Programme 3 Doctoral educational programme in Business Administration**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

**Programme 4 Bachelor’s educational programme in Finance**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

**Programme 5 Master’s educational programme in Finance and Banking**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

### **Programme 6 Master's educational programme in Marketing**

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s): Non**

### **Programme 7 Master's educational programme in Accounting, Auditing, Taxation**

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s): Non**

### **Programme 8 Bachelor's educational programme in Public Administration**

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s): Non**

## **Evaluation**

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component 2.3. Teaching and learning methods	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Business Administration, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 Business Administration, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 Finance, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 Finance and Banking, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 Marketing, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 8 Public Administration, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

## **2.4. Student Evaluation**

Student evaluation is conducted in accordance with the established procedures. It is transparent, reliable and complies with existing legislation.

### **Cluster and individual evaluation**

**Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component**

Student knowledge assessment at BSU is regulated by Order No. 3 of the Minister of Education and Science, dated January 5, 2007, and the “BSU Bachelor's and Master's Educational Programs Study Process Management,” approved by Resolution No. 111 of the Academic Council of Shota Rustaveli State University on October 8, 2015. The evaluation process includes the following components: ongoing assessment, mid-term exams, and final examinations, in line with established procedures. The university's rules for evaluating student learning outcomes allow professors to select different evaluation methods and weight the learning outcomes based on the specifics of each field. According to these rules, a student's final grade is the sum of their midterm and final evaluations. The total score for a course is 100 points, with 60 points allocated to the midterm evaluation (20 points for the midterm exam and 40 points for ongoing assessment) and 40 points to the final exam. The university has set minimum competency thresholds: for the midterm evaluation, a student must achieve at least 35% (21 points out of 60), and for the final exam, at least 50% (20 points out of 40). Components of both midterm and final evaluations may include oral or written exams, tests, practical or theoretical work. The evaluation methods, criteria, and grade accumulation rules for each course are detailed in the syllabus. Each lecturer selects their own evaluation methods, defines and formulates clear assessment criteria and corresponding points, and must provide strong justification for their chosen approach. This method offers greater flexibility to lecturers, ultimately enabling a more diverse and enriching learning experience for students. In the teaching process, particular emphasis is placed on providing feedback to students, including timely and detailed information about their midterm assessments and final exam results. This feedback helps students gain a clearer understanding of their strengths, mistakes or weaknesses, allowing them to take steps to improve their learning. In case of non-appearance at the mid-term and final exam (due to a special reason - death of a family member and participation in an educational and cultural event on behalf of the university), retaking the exam is allowed no later than one week after the exam. A student who receives a final grade of FX (failure, 41-50 points) is entitled to take an additional exam during the same semester.

Additionally, BSU calculates a student's GPA as part of their overall evaluation. To calculate the GPA, the number of ECTS credits assigned to a course or module is multiplied by the coefficient corresponding to the student's grade in that course (0 for up to 50 points; 1.55 for 51-61 points; 2.16 for 61-71 points; 2.77 for 71-81 points; 3.38 for 81-91 points; and 4 for over 91 points). The total is then divided by the sum of all ECTS credits taken by the student. The evaluation system is outlined in the "Study Process Regulation," which is available on the BSU website and in the student guide. At the start of the academic year, first-year students are informed about the evaluation system by the dean of the faculty, the head of the quality assurance department, and the heads of departments and programs. Within each educational program, the specific evaluation methods, tailored to the requirements of the field, are detailed in the course syllabi.

A Master's thesis may be defended either in the same semester or in the following semester after the student completes it. The thesis is evaluated using a 100-point system: the reviewer's assessment can contribute up to 40 points, while the commission's assessment can contribute up to 60 points. To pass, a Master's thesis must score above the minimum threshold of 51 points, which is determined by averaging the evaluations from the commission members. A thesis can receive a negative grade (0-50 points) from two categories: a) Failed to pass (FX) (41-50 points): in this case, the student is allowed to resubmit a revised thesis during the next semester without the need for additional administrative registration. b) Failed (F) (0-40 points): in this case, the student loses the right to submit the same thesis or scientific-research component. The evaluation of the Master's thesis

is based on criteria and rubrics outlined in the thesis syllabus. Key evaluation aspects include the relevance of the research or problem, the scientific and practical significance of the results, the academic quality of the thesis, the student's ability to present their work, adherence to academic integrity and research ethics, the appropriateness of the research methods, and compliance with academic standards. The final score for the thesis is determined by the arithmetic average of the evaluations given by the members of the Master's Thesis Defense Commission.

PhD students are required to complete a professor's assistantship, an essential component of their academic training. In this role, doctoral candidates assist professors with various tasks related to undergraduate and Master's courses, including facilitating group work, conducting practical sessions, and preparing and administering midterm and final exams. The assistantship workload is calculated based on the academic course volume. Candidates must submit a detailed report of their assistantship activities using a specific form (Form N6, as per Resolution No. 19 of the Academic Council of Batumi Shota Rustaveli State University, dated April 5, 2017), which is graded on a 100-point scale. A score below 51 indicates failure. The evaluation criteria include preparation of teaching materials (30 points), organization of group learning activities (30 points), preparation of exam materials (20 points), and organization of exam processes (20 points). Candidates must earn at least 31 points in the categories of preparation of teaching materials and organization of group activities to qualify for evaluation in the other categories.

After completing the required credits for both the educational and scientific components of the doctoral program by the end of the 6th semester, a preliminary review, or approbation, of the dissertation is conducted by the department. This process includes a report from the doctoral student, reviews, and a conclusion from the scientific supervisor, followed by an evaluation. A positive evaluation allows the candidate to proceed to public defense, while a negative evaluation necessitates revision and resubmission of the thesis in the following semester. If the thesis is positively evaluated, the revised document and supporting materials must be submitted to the Dissertation Council within six months. The research component, including the dissertation, is assessed according to the "Statutes of Doctoral Studies at BSU" and relevant "Dissertation Council Regulations" for awarding doctoral degrees.

To maintain high standards in dissertation evaluation and defense, the process is designed to be public, rigorous, and equitable, involving highly qualified academic and scientific personnel. After completing the academic components, doctoral students are required to present their research findings through colloquiums in various semesters, which are structured to enhance knowledge in the field, develop innovative research methodologies, critically engage with scientific literature, and improve presentation and debate skills. Additionally, these presentations facilitate the preparation of scientific publications for refereed journals.

Prior to the preliminary review of the doctoral thesis, the student must upload their dissertation to the Moodle platform for a plagiarism check using a similarity detection program. If no significant similarities are found, the

scientific supervisor submits a recommendation to the dean for thesis approval. This recommendation includes crucial information such as the title, author, a brief overview, strengths and weaknesses, the similarity report, and a position on whether the thesis should proceed to preliminary defense. If high similarity is detected, the supervisor will provide feedback on Moodle, identifying permissible categories of similarity (e.g., literature citations, legislative acts). The student is allowed to revise and re-upload the thesis within 15 days based on the supervisor's feedback. If high similarity persists after resubmission, a commission is formed to investigate potential plagiarism. This commission consists of faculty and university officials and must make a decision within five days regarding whether the thesis can proceed, following Georgian legislation and university regulations. The commission's conclusion and report are then submitted to the rector for final action.

The dissertation thesis is evaluated for approval by reviewers who hold doctoral degrees and possess the appropriate qualifications, ensuring that there are no overlapping research interests with the doctoral student. Based on their assessment, the thesis is either approved by the relevant department or, in the case of a negative evaluation, returned to the student for revision and resubmission in the next semester. If evaluated positively, the student must submit the revised thesis, incorporating the feedback, to the dissertation council within six months of the preliminary defense.

In addition, PhD students must prepare at least three papers or articles related to their dissertation topic. These must be published or accepted for publication in refereed or peer-reviewed electronic or printed journals, either abroad or in Georgia, that are registered in relevant international classifications, or in an international scientific journal, or the proceedings of an international scientific conference. At least one of these articles must be published in a journal with an impact factor.

To ensure a transparent and fair assessment of the dissertation, the process of internationalization has been introduced. This includes appointing a foreign co-supervisor alongside the Georgian scientific supervisor, having the dissertation evaluated by a foreign reviewer, or conducting an international review of the thesis's abbreviated version.

To further guarantee transparency and openness in the dissertation evaluation and defense process, the chair of the Dissertation Council selects three evaluators within ten days after receiving the conclusions and international reviews from the scientific research service. These evaluators must be approved by a majority vote of the Dissertation Council members and must represent the relevant field of the dissertation. Importantly, evaluators cannot include the doctoral student's supervisor or co-authors of their papers. If two evaluators provide negative assessments, the thesis will not be accepted for defense. Evaluators have one month to submit their written reports, which are then presented to the Dissertation Council. The report must assess the research's relevance, novelty, originality, theoretical and practical value, research design and methodology, objectivity of the data, coherence of the thesis structure, and the quality of presentation and language. The report must clearly state whether the thesis should be admitted for defense.

During the public defense of the dissertation, the Dissertation Council forms a sectoral dissertation commission, typically comprising at least seven members, to evaluate the thesis. This commission includes principal and senior scientific staff from the relevant field within the university's independent research unit and may also invite academics with degrees in relevant disciplines from Georgia or abroad, as approved by the rector. The public defense concludes with an assessment based on established criteria, such as the relevance of the research topic, appropriateness of research methods, scientific innovation, and practical implications of the results. Evaluations are conducted confidentially using a grading scale ranging from „Excellent“ to „Completely Unsatisfactory“.

If the sectoral dissertation commission gives a positive assessment, the doctoral candidate is awarded the corresponding academic degree by the faculty's dissertation council. If the assessment is 'unsatisfactory,' the doctoral candidate has the right to submit a revised thesis after one year. However, if the assessment is 'completely unsatisfactory,' the candidate forfeits the right to resubmit the same dissertation.

The analysis of the information provided in the Self-Evaluation Report indicates that all regulations related to student evaluation comply with Georgian laws and legislation, ensuring transparency and validity. Interviews with bachelor's, master's, and PhD students have demonstrated that the evaluation process is perceived as acceptable and fair. Furthermore, the practices outlined for student knowledge assessment and doctoral studies at Batumi Shota Rustaveli State University reflect a structured and comprehensive approach that aligns with many best practices found in European universities. Notably, the doctoral assessment process is multidimensional and diverse, involving multiple levels of review and analysis. This thorough approach ultimately provides the best possible evaluation outcomes.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- SER
- Site-Interviews
- Student evaluation rule - Resolution N- 111, 08.10.2015 of the Academic Council of BSU "On the approval of the Study Process Regulation", Article 14.14. - 2.4.1
- Evaluation of the master's thesis - Resolution N- 111, 08.10.2015 of the Academic Council of BSU "On the approval of the Study Process Regulation", Article 16.16-16.20- 2.4.3
- Grade GRA - Resolution N- 111, 08.10.2015 of the Academic Council of BSU "On the approval of the Study Process Regulation", Article 14.18-2.4.4
- Resolution No. 23, 20.02.2018. of BSU Academic Council on approval of instructions for conducting exams- 2.4.6
- Doctoral Educational Programme "Business Administration"
- Regulation on the establishment, activity of the dissertation council and awarding of the doctoral academic degree at the Faculties of Economics and Business
- Syllabi of learning courses - 2.4.2
- Syllabi of Public Administration Programme

**General recommendations of the cluster: Non**

**General suggestions of the cluster: Non**

**Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:** Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any) **Non**

## Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component 2.4 - Student evaluation	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Business Administration, level 6	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 Business Administration, level 7	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 Finance, level 6	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 Finance and Banking, level 7	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 Marketing, level 7	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 8 Public Administration, level 6	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

## Compliance of the programmes with the standards

2. Methodology and Organisation of Teaching, Adequacy Evaluation of Programme Mastering	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Business Administration, level 6)	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (Business Administration, level 7)	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 (Business Administration, level 8)	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 (Finance, level 6)	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 (Finance and banking, level7)	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 (Marketing, level7)	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

<b>Programme 7 (Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level7)</b>	<b>x</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 8 (Public Administration, level 6)</b>	<b>x</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### **3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with Them**

The programme ensures the creation of a student-centered environment by providing students with relevant services; promotes maximum student awareness, implements a variety of activities and facilitates student engagement in local and / or international projects; proper quality of scientific guidance and supervision is provided for master’s and doctoral students.

#### **3.1 Student Consulting and Support Services**

Students receive consultation and support regarding planning of the learning process, improvement of academic achievement, and career development from the people involved in the programme and/or structural units of the HEI. A student has an opportunity to have a diverse learning process and receive relevant information and recommendations from those involved in the programme.

#### **Cluster and individual evaluation**

#### **Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component**

Student consultation and support are of great importance at Batumi Shota Rustaveli State University. The university has established various support services to assist students across all programs. Each support mechanism serves a specific purpose, such as helping students plan their learning process individually when necessary, providing consultations, assisting students in obtaining scholarships abroad, supporting career development, and facilitating employment opportunities through employer representatives and stakeholders. Additionally, the university ensures that student’s voices are heard, whether through initiatives or recommendations and actively involves them in the development of the educational process. According to the BSU charter, the roles and responsibilities of BSU's management bodies and faculty administration are clearly outlined, while the BSU Code of Ethics sets clear standards for professors and teachers. These standards require faculty members to create a student-centered environment within their areas of expertise.

Professors and teachers are expected to offer intellectual and academic guidance to students, following the counseling schedule established at BSU. At the start of each academic year, the University Rector issues an order approving the consulting hours of academic staff and the work schedule for administering the study process by administrative staff. The hours allocated for student consultations are included in the workload of academic, scientific, and invited personnel.

Units that are placed to support students are the following: Educational Process Department, Student Career Development, Culture and Sports Department, Information Technology Service, Strategic Development and External Relations Department, Examination Center, Library, etc. Students can access information about their



rights, legal interests, career development, and available student services through the Student Guide, as well as via the student portal, university website, and other social media platforms.

They receive updates on educational and academic planning, academic and administrative registration, active social programs, scholarships, exchange programs, conferences, competitions, and the availability of sports and cultural-creative activities. Additionally, they are informed about other educational, cognitive, and recreational resources offered at BSU. Student awareness of international projects, events, exchange programs, summer schools, conferences, and mobility opportunities are coordinated by the Department of Strategic Development and International Relations at BSU, in collaboration with faculty administration and program heads. Information is made available through the university website, faculty information boards, and service announcements.

It is important to note that the electronic portal, which was presented in detail to the panel members, is both sophisticated and user-friendly. The portal engages students, university staff, academic personnel, and stakeholders, facilitating communication and the exchange of information. All new initiatives from the university, including projects, conferences, internships and exchange programs, are made available on the portal, ensuring that students can easily access relevant information.

Students have the opportunity to initiate and carry out projects, either individually or collaboratively, in areas such as education, science, culture and the arts, or sports. To facilitate the identification, discussion, and decision-making regarding project funding, the Rector issues an order announcing the competition and appoints the members of the Competition Commission. Student projects can fall into the following categories: a) scientific projects, which involve research and the development of professional skills; b) educational projects, which focus on informal education and cognitive development; c) cultural-creative projects, which include artistic or creative endeavors; and d) sports projects, which promote participation in sports.

Based on interviews with students at all levels, bachelor's, master's, PhD, and alumni, it is evident that the university has successfully supported its students throughout their academic journey. Many students emphasized how the university effectively addressed the challenges and obstacles they faced during their studies, providing clear pathways to academic success. A key highlight was the value of consulting services, which students noted as instrumental in helping them overcome difficulties through the recommendations provided by the university. However, during interviews with both students and employer representatives, the need for enhancing practical skills and activities became evident. It was widely agreed that improving student's practical experience is crucial to better preparing them for employment. Therefore, the panel members recommend that the university increase its focus on practical studies across programs.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Site-interviews
- SER

- Statute of BSU
- Student Career Development, Culture and Sports Service dent portal -<https://portal.bsu.edu.ge/>
- Order on consultation hours for professors/teachers
- Department of Strategic Development and Foreign Relations - <https://bsu.edu.ge/sub-19/page/2-166/index.html>
- Batumi Shota Rustaveli State University Student Guide

#### General recommendations of the cluster:

- It is recommended that the HEI focus on enhancing practical studies for students.

**General suggestions of the cluster:** Non

**Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:** Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any) Non

### Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component 3.1 Student consulting and support services	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Business Administration, level 6	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 Business Administration, level 7	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 Finance, level 6	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 Finance and Banking, level 7	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 Marketing, level 7	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 8 Public Administration, level 6	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### 3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision

- A scientific supervisor provides proper support to master's and doctorate students to perform the scientific-research component successfully.
- Within master's and doctoral programmes, ratio of students and supervisors enables to perform scientific supervision properly.

#### Cluster and individual evaluation

#### Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Batumi Shota Rustaveli State University provides services related to the supervision of master's and doctoral student's thesis. Selecting a master's thesis begins with choosing a scientific supervisor who specializes in the student's area of interest. The selection of supervisors considers their relevant research experience and qualifications. Together, they identify a relevant research problem, which is documented in the supervisor's academic workload and approved by the Faculty Council. The supervisor's responsibilities are outlined in the BSU "Study Process Regulation," established by Resolution N111 of the BSU Academic Council on October 8, 2015. To ensure successful research, the supervisor and student will collaboratively develop a thesis plan and counseling schedule. The scientific supervisor plays a crucial role in helping Master's students integrate into both local and international scientific communities. The supervisor of the Master's thesis is obliged to submit periodic information about the completion of the thesis to the Department. Supervision also includes assisting students in meeting syllabus requirements for their thesis defense, specifically by ensuring they present at least one report at a relevant scientific conference or have a paper accepted for publication. Among the four Master's programs in the cluster, "Marketing" and "Accounting, Audit, Taxation" are newly established. Their development considered the balance between student enrollment and available academic staff to ensure adequate supervision for thesis work, maintaining academic support for all active programs. The BSU "Study Process Regulation" outlines the process for Master's thesis supervision, including the assignment of a qualified supervisor, typically a Doctoral degree holder, based on the student's topic preferences. The thesis topic and supervisor are approved by the Faculty Council in the third semester. Supervisors provide regular consultations, assist in planning and bibliography, and help students engage in academic conferences. Master's students must study relevant literature, conduct research, and submit their thesis for preliminary review one month before graduation. Evaluation criteria include the relevance and quality of research, adherence to academic integrity, and presentation skills. A separate reviewer, not the supervisor, assesses the thesis and provides feedback within two weeks. The thesis topic is chosen based on the student's interests and contemporary issues, with approval from the Faculty Council at the end of the second semester. Students must have completed the "Fundamentals of Scientific Research" course and practical training to prepare for their research. Supervisors conduct regular consultations, with a minimum of 20 allocated contact hours, and the frequency of meetings may increase as the thesis work progresses. The frequency of consultations increases in the fourth semester, which is dedicated to thesis work. Students must present at least one conference report or publish an article related to their thesis before the public defense. According to BSU regulations, it is permissible for one person to supervise 8 bachelor's/master's/doctoral theses simultaneously during the academic year, including the supervision of no more than 2 Doctoral and 3 Master's theses or no more than 5 Master's theses simultaneously. Compliance with the mentioned rule ensures that the supervisors of the Master's students perform the functions described above at an appropriate level.

For Doctoral studies, the "Provision of BSU Doctoral Studies" outlines the rights and responsibilities of Doctoral student supervisors and the supervision process. Supervisors can be BSU professors or qualified scientists with a

Doctoral degree who have relevant research experience and publications in high-rated journals. In exceptional cases, a Doctoral student may serve as a supervisor after completing their training. Doctoral students work with their supervisors to establish individual study and research plans within two months of starting their studies. These plans include the research purpose, dissertation structure, and schedule. Supervisors provide a minimum of 20 consultation hours in the first year and 40 hours in subsequent years, helping students with research design, writing, and integration into academic networks. Students choose dissertation topics related to contemporary issues, subject to approval by the Faculty Council. Throughout the thesis process, supervisors offer continuous support, guiding literature review and innovative research. After completing the required credits, a preliminary review of the dissertation occurs, assessing the topic's relevance and scientific novelty. To qualify for public defense, students must have at least three publications related to their dissertation in recognized journals, including one in a high-impact journal. Additionally, the evaluation process may involve international experts, and multiple supervisors can be assigned, including foreign professors. To enhance research quality, co-supervision is encouraged, and a threshold for the number of Doctoral students per supervisor is established. This collaborative approach aims to enhance the academic experience and support the students effectively.

Based on information gathered from site interviews with students and supervisors, it is clear that Batumi Shota Rustaveli State University has established an effective and equitable supervision process. It was highlighted the strengths of the supervision service, noting its alignment with academic standards and its commitment to supporting student's research and development. This successful supervision framework fosters a collaborative environment that enhances the overall educational experience, ensuring that both students and supervisors are well-equipped to achieve their academic goals.

<b>Data related to the supervision of master's/doctoral students</b> <b>Programme 1 (Business Administration, Master's)<sup>7</sup></b>	
Number of master's/doctoral theses supervisors	13
//Number of doctoral thesis supervisors	N/A
Number of master's students	46
//Number of doctoral students	N/A
Ratio - supervisors of master's theses/master's students	0.52
Ratio - supervisors of doctoral theses/doctoral students	N/A

---

<sup>7</sup> In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

<b>Data related to the supervision of master's/doctoral students Programme 2 (Finance and Banking, Master's)<sup>8</sup></b>	
Number of master's/doctoral theses supervisors	9
//Number of doctoral thesis supervisors	N/A
Number of master's students	27
//Number of doctoral students	N/A
Ratio - supervisors of master's theses/master's students	0.63
Ratio - supervisors of doctoral theses/doctoral students	N/A

<b>Data related to the supervision of master's/doctoral students Programme 3 (Marketing , Master's)<sup>9</sup></b>	
Number of master's/doctoral theses supervisors	8
//Number of doctoral thesis supervisors	N/A
Number of master's students	N/A
//Number of doctoral students	N/A
Ratio - supervisors of master's theses/master's students	N/A
Ratio - supervisors of doctoral theses/doctoral students	N/A

<b>Data related to the supervision of master's/doctoral students Programme 4 (Accounting, Auditing, Taxation , Master's)<sup>10</sup></b>	
Number of master's/doctoral theses supervisors	N/A
//Number of doctoral thesis supervisors	N/A
Number of master's students	N/A

---

<sup>8</sup> In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

<sup>9</sup> In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

<sup>10</sup> In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

//Number of doctoral students	N/A
Ratio - supervisors of master's theses/master's students	N/A
Ratio - supervisors of doctoral theses/doctoral students	N/A

<b>Data related to the supervision of master's/doctoral students Programme 5 (Business Administration , Doctoral)<sup>11</sup></b>	
Number of master's/doctoral theses supervisors	27
//Number of doctoral thesis supervisors	27
Number of master's students	N/A
//Number of doctoral students	25
Ratio - supervisors of master's theses/master's students	N/A
Ratio - supervisors of doctoral theses/doctoral students	1.08

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- SER
- Site-interviews
- BSU Study Process Regulation (Article 16.2-3.2.1 of Resolution No. 01-06.39 - amended June 3, 2022)
- Articles 7.2 - 3.2.5 of the BSU Representative Council Decision N07-01/42 of September 8, 2023, "On the rules for affiliation of the academic staff of BSU, determination of workload of academic and invited staff and payment of remuneration"
- Article 16.4.d of the BSU Study Process Regulation - the Master's student will present at least one report at a university (national or international) scientific conference or publication - 3.2.3
- Provision of the Doctoral Studies

**General recommendations of the cluster: Non**

**General suggestions of the cluster: Non**

**Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:** Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes **Non**

<sup>11</sup> In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

## Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component

Component 3.2. Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Business Administration, level 6	N/A	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 Business Administration, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 Finance, level 6	N/A	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 Finance and Banking, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 Marketing, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 8 Public Administration, level 6	N/A	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### Compliance of the programmes with the standards

3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Business Administration, level 6)	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (Business Administration, level 7)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 (Business Administration, level 8)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 (Finance, level 6)	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 (Finance and banking, level7)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 (Marketing, level7)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 (Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level7)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 8 (Public Administration, level 6)	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

## 4. Providing Teaching Resources

Human, material, information and financial resources of educational programme/educational programmes grouped in a cluster ensure the sustainable, stable, efficient and effective functioning of the programme and the achievement of the defined objectives.

#### 4.1 Human Resources

- Programme staff consists of qualified persons who have necessary competences in order to help students to achieve the programme learning outcomes.
- The number and workload of programme academic/scientific and invited staff ensures the sustainable running of the educational process and also, proper execution of their research/creative/performance activities and other assigned duties. Quantitative indicators related to academic/scientific/invited staff ensure programme sustainability.
- The Head of the Programme possesses necessary knowledge and experience required for programme elaboration, and also the appropriate competences in the field of study of the programme. He/she is personally involved in programme implementation.
- Programme students are provided with an adequate number of administrative and support staff with relevant competence.

---

#### Cluster and individual evaluation

#### Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Based on the presented documentation and conducted interviews, it is established that the educational process at Shota Rustaveli State University in Batumi is primarily carried out by academic staff (professors, associate professors, assistant professors) and invited personnel (senior teachers). The selection of personnel for academic and scientific positions is conducted in accordance with the legislation in force in Georgia and the internal regulations of BSU, through a competitive process approved by a commission designated by the rector. Qualified specialists in the field are selected/invited through this competition. The functions of the academic staff are defined by the faculty's regulations. The qualifications of the academic and invited personnel involved in the specified programs meet the requirements set for the resources implementing the program. They possess the relevant qualifications, experience, and competence to ensure the achievement of the outcomes outlined in the designated programs. Complete information about the academic personnel implementing the program can be obtained from the syllabi of the courses provided in the educational program and from the personnel's CVs. An academic staff member at BSU has an academic load categorized as "A," "B," or "C," taking into account their affiliation with BSU. The first two categories require the personnel to be present at BSU during working hours (from Monday to Saturday—at least 5 days a week and no more than 40 hours).

The pedagogical load for academic staff affiliated with BSU is defined as follows: for a professor—300 hours, for an associate professor—350 hours, and for an assistant professor—365 hours.

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 1 Business Administration, BA

The presented documentation and conducted interviews confirm that the educational process at Shota Rustaveli State University in Batumi is carried out by academic personnel (professors, associate professors, assistant professors, assistants) and invited personnel (senior teachers, teachers). In accordance with the current legislation and BSU regulations, the selection for academic positions at the university is conducted through a competitive process. This information is published on the university's website.

To reach a broader audience, it might be better to post current vacancies on other platforms as well, such as jobs.ge, to give more people the opportunity to learn about the active vacancies announced by the university. This would help the university diversify its teaching staff.



The Bachelor's degree program in Business Administration involves 8 professors, 18 associate professors, 2 assistant professors, 1 assistant, and 19 invited teachers from the Faculty of Economics and Business. In addition, academic staff from other faculties at BSU are also engaged in the educational process: 2 professors, 8 associate professors, 4 assistant professors, and 10 invited teachers. In total, there are 53 teaching staff members, of which 48 are academic personnel and invited teachers from the Faculty of Economics and Business.

The number of academic staff at the Faculty of Economics and Business is regulated by the relevant guidelines. The quantity of academic and invited personnel is adequate for effectively managing the educational process, providing student consultations, and conducting other activities planned within the program.

The Academic and Representative Council of BSU determines the hourly load of academic personnel, the maximum number of students in academic groups, and the mandatory annual load for academic staff. An academic staff member at BSU may have an academic load categorized as "A," "B," or "C," depending on their affiliation with BSU. Academic loads in categories "A" and "B" (including classroom, consultation, research, and other activities) require the personnel to be present at their workplace (from Monday to Saturday—at least 5 days a week and no more than 40 hours).

For academic staff affiliated with BSU, the "A" category loads are as follows:

- Professor: 300 hours;
- Associate Professor: 350 hours;
- Assistant Professor: 370 hours;
- Assistant: 390 hours.

Out of the 45 academic personnel involved in the implementation of the Bachelor's degree program in Business Administration, 36 are affiliated with BSU.

<b>Programme 1 (Business Administration, BA)<sup>12</sup></b>				
<b>Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)</b>	<b>Number of Programme Staff</b>	<b>Including the staff with sectoral expertise<sup>13</sup></b>	<b>Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction<sup>14</sup></b>	<b>Among them, the affiliated academic staff</b>
<b>Total number of academic staff</b>	45			36
<b>- Professor</b>	10	10	10	10
<b>- Associate Professor</b>	21	20	20	20
<b>- Assistant-Professor</b>	6	5	5	5
<b>- Assistant</b>	1	1	1	1
<b>Invited Staff</b>	7			–
<b>Scientific Staff</b>	-			–

<sup>12</sup> In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

<sup>13</sup> Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

<sup>14</sup> Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

## Description and Analysis - Programme 2 Business Administration, MA

Based on the presented documentation and on-site interviews, it has been established that the personnel implementing the program at Shota Rustaveli State University in Batumi are involved in accordance with Georgian legislation and BSU's internal regulations. The educational process is primarily carried out by academic staff (professors, associate professors, assistant professors, assistants) and invited personnel (senior teachers, teachers). The selection of staff for academic and scientific positions at the university is conducted through a competitive process by a commission approved by the rector. For the implementation of the educational process, qualified specialists in the field are selected/invited through this competition, and the functions of the academic personnel are defined by the faculty's regulations. A total of 16 personnel are involved in the program, including 5 professors, 9 associate professors, and 1 assistant professor. Out of the 16 personnel involved in the program, 14 are affiliated personnel, comprising 5 affiliated professors and 9 affiliated assistant professors.

The personnel involved in the presented program possess the relevant qualifications, experience, and competence to ensure the achievement of the outcomes outlined in this educational program. This is supported by their presentations at local and international conferences and published works over the past five years. Information about the academic personnel implementing the program can be obtained from the syllabi of the courses provided in the educational program, as well as from the personnel's CVs and personal files.

An academic staff member at BSU may have an academic load categorized as "A," "B," or "C," depending on their affiliation with BSU. The "A" category pedagogical load for academic staff affiliated with BSU is defined as follows: for a professor—300 hours; for an associate professor—350 hours; for an assistant professor—360 hours; and for an assistant—370 hours. The basis for issuing a rector's order regarding the academic load of academic personnel is a project prepared by the Department of Educational Process Management at BSU, based on the proposals from the heads of the relevant departmental units and the dean's official letter. It should also be noted that, in addition to their competence, academic and invited personnel are required to at least be familiar with and involved in the classification of learning outcomes during the development of their educational discipline and program, and to be more actively engaged in the creation of the learning outcomes mapping.

<b>Programme 2 (Business Administration, MA)[1]</b>				
<b>Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)</b>	<b>Number of Programme Staff</b>	<b>Including the staff with sectoral expertise[2]</b>	<b>Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[3]</b>	<b>Among them, the affiliated academic staff</b>
<b>Total number of academic staff</b>	16	16	14	14
<b>- Professor</b>	5	5	5	5
<b>- Associate Professor</b>	9	9	9	9
<b>- Assistant-Professor</b>	1	1	-	-
<b>- Assistant</b>	-	-	-	-
<b>Invited Staff</b>	1	1	-	-
<b>Scientific Staff</b>	-	-	-	-

## Description and Analysis - Programme 3 Business Administration, PhD

Based on the presented documentation and on-site interviews, it is confirmed that the educational process at Shota Rustaveli State University in Batumi is carried out by academic personnel (professors, associate professors, assistant professors, assistants) and invited personnel (senior teachers, teachers). In accordance with current legislation and BSU regulations, the selection of academic staff at the university is conducted through a competitive process. The number of academic and invited personnel is adequate for effectively managing the educational process, providing student consultations, and conducting other planned activities within the program.

The qualifications of the personnel involved in the implementation of the educational program meet the requirements set for the human resources involved. Information about the academic personnel can be obtained from the syllabi of the courses and their CVs.

The determining factor for the mandatory academic load of academic personnel is their affiliation with BSU, which is regulated by a written agreement that defines the primary workplace between the employee and BSU (this agreement is reflected in the employment contract as soon as the labor-legal relationship is established). An academic staff member at BSU may have an academic load categorized as "A," "B," or "C," depending on their affiliation with BSU.

The presented documentation indicates that 32 personnel are involved in the implementation of the Doctoral Program in Business Administration. Among them are 12 professors, 19 associate professors, and 1 assistant professor. It is also noteworthy that all 32 personnel are affiliated. Despite the fact that the academic and invited personnel of the doctoral program are distinguished by their professionalism, it is crucial to pay special attention during the writing of the doctoral dissertation to the following:

1. The topic of the doctoral dissertation should be determined according to the qualification to be awarded.
2. Significant attention should be given to the rules of citation and bibliography composition, as these were violated during the doctoral dissertation process when a student received a high grade despite having not adhered to the citation and bibliography guidelines.

<b>Programme 3 (Business Administration, PhD)[1]</b>				
<b>Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)</b>	<b>Number of Programme Staff</b>	<b>Including the staff with sectoral expertise[2]</b>	<b>Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[3]</b>	<b>Among them, the affiliated academic staff</b>
<b>Total number of academic staff</b>	32	32	32	32
<b>- Professor</b>	12	12	12	12
<b>- Associate Professor</b>	19	19	19	19
<b>- Assistant-Professor</b>	1	1	1	1
<b>- Assistant</b>	-	-	-	-

<b>Invited Staff</b>	-	-	-	-
<b>Scientific Staff</b>	-	-	-	-

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 4 Finances, BA

Based on the presented documentation and on-site interviews, it is established that the educational process at Shota Rustaveli State University in Batumi is carried out by academic personnel (professors, associate professors, assistant professors, assistants) and invited personnel (senior teachers, teachers). In accordance with current legislation and BSU regulations, the selection for academic positions at the university is conducted through a competitive process. The functions of the academic personnel are defined by the faculty's regulations.

The qualifications of the academic personnel and invited teachers involved in the educational program meet the requirements set for the human resources implementing the program. During the 2019-2024 academic year, three research projects, with the participation of academic personnel from the Faculty of Economics and Business, won the targeted research project competition at BSU, involving both academic staff and students participating in the implementation of the program.

A total of 46 academic and invited personnel are involved in the implementation of the Bachelor's degree program in Finance. Among them are 13 professors, 20 associate professors, 5 assistant professors, 6 invited staff and 2 assistants.

Out of the 46 personnel implementing the program, 40 are affiliated personnel. Among them are 13 affiliated professors, 20 affiliated associate professors, 5 affiliated assistant professors, and 2 affiliated assistants. Academic personnel and invited teachers possess the relevant experience and competence to ensure the achievement of the outcomes outlined in the Bachelor's degree program in Finance. Information about the academic personnel can be obtained from the syllabi of the courses and their CVs. An academic staff member at BSU may have an academic load categorized as "A," "B," or "C," depending on their affiliation with BSU. The performance of the "A" and "B" category academic loads (including classroom, consultation, research, and other activities) requires the personnel to be present at their workplace (from Monday to Saturday—at least 5 days a week and no more than 40 hours). For academic personnel affiliated with BSU, the "A" category loads are as follows:

- Professor: 300 hours
- Associate Professor: 350 hours
- Assistant Professor: 360 hours
- Assistant: 390 hours

<b>Programme 4 (Finances, BA)[1]</b>				
<b>Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)</b>	<b>Number of Programme Staff</b>	<b>Including the staff with sectoral expertise[2]</b>	<b>Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[3]</b>	<b>Among them, the affiliated academic staff</b>
<b>Total number of academic staff</b>	46	46	40	40

- Professor	13	13	13	13
- Associate Professor	20	20	20	20
- Assistant-Professor	5	5	5	5
- Assistant	2	2	2	2
Invited Staff	6	6	-	-
Scientific Staff	-	-	-	-

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 5 Finance and Banking.MA

Based on the presented documentation and on-site interviews, it is established that the educational process at BSU is primarily carried out with the participation of academic personnel (professors, associate professors, assistant professors, assistants) and invited personnel (senior teachers, teachers). The selection of staff for academic and scientific positions at the university is conducted through a competitive process, in accordance with current legislation in Georgia and BSU regulations, by a commission approved by the rector.

The qualifications of the academic and invited professors involved in the educational program meet the requirements set for the resources implementing the program. They possess the relevant qualifications, experience, and competence to ensure the achievement of the outcomes outlined in the educational program, as evidenced by their presentations at local and international conferences, publications in Georgian and international peer-reviewed journals, published textbooks and monographs, participation in various grant projects, and so on.

The implementation of the presented program involves 12 academic and invited personnel. Among them are 4 professors, all of whom are affiliated, 7 associate professors, all of whom are affiliated, and 1 invited personnel.

The determining factor for the mandatory academic load of academic personnel is their affiliation with BSU, which is regulated by a written agreement between the employee and BSU regarding the definition of the primary workplace (this agreement is reflected in the employment contract upon the establishment of the labor legal relationship). An academic staff member at BSU may have an academic load categorized as "A," "B," or "C," depending on their affiliation with BSU.

The load for academic personnel categorized as "A" is as follows: a) For professors: 300 hours; b) For associate professors: 350 hours.

On the other hand, personnel in category "B" are required to complete the following within the year: for professors - 150 hours; for associate professors - 175 hours.

To ensure the proper conduct of the educational process, BSU has established a maximum number of hours for the performance of teaching and scientific-research activities. Specifically, a person with "A1" category workload may not perform more than 180 academic hours in addition to their academic load during the academic year; while a person with a "B1" category workload may not perform more than 15 academic hours during the academic year. Additionally, there are limits set for the hours of scientific supervision in cases of scientific research activities. This approach helps ensure that academic personnel adequately fulfill their assigned responsibilities.

<b>Programme 5 (Finance and Banking.MA)[1]</b>				
<b>Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)</b>	<b>Number of Programme Staff</b>	<b>Including the staff with sectoral expertise[2]</b>	<b>Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[3]</b>	<b>Among them, the affiliated academic staff</b>
<b>Total number of academic staff</b>	12	12	12	11
<b>- Professor</b>	4	4	4	4
<b>- Associate Professor</b>	7	7	7	7
<b>-Assistant-Professor</b>	-	-	-	-
<b>- Assistant</b>	-	-	-	-
<b>Invited Staff</b>	1	1	1	-
<b>Scientific Staff</b>	-	-	-	-

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 6 Marketing. MA

Based on the presented documentation and on-site interviews, it is established that the educational process at Batumi Shota Rustaveli State University is carried out by academic personnel (professors, associate professors, assistant professors) and senior teachers. According to the current legislation and BSU regulations, the selection of academic staff for academic positions at the university is conducted through a competitive process by a commission approved by the rector. The functions of the academic personnel are defined by the faculty regulations. An academic staff member at BSU, considering their affiliation with the university, may have academic workloads categorized as “A,” “B,” or “C.” Among these, fulfilling the academic workloads of categories “A” and “B” (including classroom, advisory, research, and other activities) requires the individual to be present at their workplace (from Monday to Saturday – at least 5 days a week and no more than 40 hours).

For an academic staff member affiliated with BSU, the workload for category “A” is as follows:

- Professor: 300 hours
- Associate Professor: 350 hours
- Assistant Professor: 360 hours
- Assistant: 390 hours

The provided program involves 14 academic and invited staff members. Among them, there are 2 professors, both of whom are affiliated; 7 associate professors, all of whom are affiliated; 3 assistant professors (2 of whom are affiliated); and 2 invited staff members.

At the Faculty of Economics and Business of Batumi Shota Rustaveli State University, the implementation of educational programs involves auxiliary staff with appropriate competencies and qualifications, such as the faculty secretary and departmental specialists. They assist the faculty dean, the head of the quality assurance office, program leaders, and professors in both the delivery of the educational process and the organized conduct of mid-term and final exams. Their roles are outlined in the faculty regulations.

<b>Programme 6 Marketing. MA[1]</b>				
<b>Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)</b>	<b>Number of Programme Staff</b>	<b>Including the staff with sectoral expertise[2]</b>	<b>Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[3]</b>	<b>Among them, the affiliated academic staff</b>
<b>Total number of academic staff</b>	14	14	14	11
<b>- Professor</b>	2	2	2	2
<b>- Associate Professor</b>	7	7	7	7
<b>- Assistant-Professor</b>	3	3	3	2
<b>- Assistant</b>	-	-	-	-
<b>Invited Staff</b>	2	2	2	-
<b>Scientific Staff</b>	-	-	-	-

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation.MA

Based on the provided documentation and on-site interviews, it is determined that the educational process at BSU is primarily conducted by academic staff (professors, associate professors, assistant professors, and teaching assistants) and invited personnel (senior teachers and teachers). The selection of personnel for academic and scientific positions at the university is carried out in accordance with the legislation of Georgia and the regulations of BSU, through a competitive process approved by a commission designated by the rector. To facilitate the educational process, qualified specialists in the field are selected and invited through a competitive process. The functions of the academic staff are outlined in the faculty regulations.

The implementation of the educational program is supported by the administrative and auxiliary staff of the university and the faculty. The program is carried out at the Faculty of Economics and Business.

The qualifications of the academic staff and invited teachers involved in the educational program meet the requirements set for the human resources implementing the program. Their participation in local and international conferences, the presentations they have made, and their published works and textbooks confirm that the academic staff and invited teachers possess the relevant experience and competence to ensure the achievement of the outcomes related to accounting, auditing, and taxation as specified in the educational program. Information about the academic staff can be obtained from the syllabi of the courses and their CVs.

The academic and representative council of BSU determines the hourly workload of academic staff, the maximum number of students in academic groups, and the mandatory annual workload for academic personnel, taking into account the affiliation with BSU, which can be categorized as "A," "B," or "C."

For academic staff affiliated with BSU, the "A" category workload is as follows:

- Professor: 300 hours
- Associate Professor: 350 hours
- Assistant Professor: 360 hours

- Assistant: 390 hours.

The program includes a total of 23 academic and invited personnel. Among them are: 4 professors, all of whom are affiliated; 10 associate professors, all of whom are affiliated; 1 assistant professor, who is also affiliated; and 8 invited staff members.

**It is very important to deepen partnerships in the area of Big 4, in order to develop the programmatic skills of academic and invited personnel.**

It is essential to focus on the development of the English language skills of academic personnel, so that everyone can equally participate in various exchange programs. Of course, the university cannot force personnel to learn or improve their language skills, but certain mechanisms can be implemented to enhance this aspect.

<b>Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation.MA A [1]</b>				
<b>Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)</b>	<b>Number of Programme Staff</b>	<b>Including the staff with sectoral expertise[2]</b>	<b>Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[3]</b>	<b>Among them, the affiliated academic staff</b>
<b>Total number of academic staff</b>	23	23	15	15
<b>- Professor</b>	4	4	4	4
<b>- Associate Professor</b>	10	10	10	10
<b>- Assistant-Professor</b>	1	1	1	1
<b>- Assistant</b>	-	-	-	-
<b>Invited Staff</b>	8	8	-	-
<b>Scientific Staff</b>	-	-	-	-

[1] In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

[2] Staff implementing the relevant components of the main field of study

[3] Staff with relevant doctoral degrees implementing the components of the main field of study

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 8 Public Administration.BA

Based on the presented documentation and on-site interviews, it is determined that the personnel involved in the implementation of the Bachelor's degree program in Public Administration possess the necessary competencies to achieve the learning outcomes of the components offered by the educational program. This is supported by the qualification documents of the academic staff and invited teachers, published works, and the topics of presentations made at international and local conferences, which are reflected in the CVs of the staff and invited specialists.



The program involves 24 academic and invited personnel. Among them, there are 7 professors, all of whom are affiliated; 5 associate professors, all of whom are affiliated; 3 assistant professors, all of whom are affiliated; and 9 invited personnel.

In the Bachelor's degree program in Public Administration, the selection of personnel for academic and scientific positions is conducted through a competitive process established by a commission approved by the rector. To facilitate the educational process, the selection and invitation of qualified specialists in the field are carried out competitively, and the functions of the academic staff are defined by relevant regulations.

The personnel involved in the program have published nearly 114 works over the past five years, in both local and international publications.

<b>Programme 8 Public Administration.BA[1]</b>				
<b>Number of the staff involved in the programme (including academic, scientific, and invited staff)</b>	<b>Number of Programme Staff</b>	<b>Including the staff with sectoral expertise[2]</b>	<b>Including the staff holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[3]</b>	<b>Among them, the affiliated academic staff</b>
<b>Total number of academic staff</b>	24	24	15	15
- Professor	7	7	7	7
- Associate Professor	5	5	5	5
-Assistant-Professor	3	3	3	3
- Assistant	-	-	-	-
<b>Invited Staff</b>	9	9	-	-
<b>Scientific Staff</b>	-	-	-	-

#### Evidences/Indicators

- Personal files of the staff
- Academic, scientific, invited staff workload scheme, which envisages staff workload in other HEIs
- The ratio of academic/scientific/invited staff to the number of students enrolled in the programme
- Functions of the Head of the Programme, personal file
- Job description of administrative and support staff
- Interview results

**General recommendations of the cluster: Non**

**General suggestions of the cluster:**

- It is suggested that, to reach a broader audience and increase the diversity of the university's teaching staff, posting current vacancies on additional platforms, such as jobs.ge, would be beneficial. By advertising on more widely used job boards, the university can extend its reach to a larger pool of potential candidates, offering more individuals the opportunity to apply for active positions. This approach can help attract a wider range of applicants, contributing to a more diverse and qualified teaching staff.

**Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:** Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

**Programme 1 Bachelor's educational programme in Business Administration )**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

**Programme 2 Master's educational programme in Business Administration**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

**Programme 3 Doctoral educational programme in Business Administration**

**Recommendation(s):**

- It is recommended that despite the fact that the academic and invited personnel of the doctoral program are distinguished by their professionalism, it is crucial to pay special attention during the writing of the doctoral dissertation to the following: The topic of the doctoral dissertation should be determined according to the qualification to be awarded; Significant attention should be given to the rules of citation and bibliography composition, as these were violated during the doctoral dissertation process, when a student received a high grade despite having not adhered to the citation and bibliography guidelines.

**Suggestion(s):**

**Programme 4 Bachelor's educational programme in Finances**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s): Non**

**Programme 5 Master’s educational programme in Finance and Banking**

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s): Non**

**Programme 6 Master’s educational programme in Marketing**

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s): Non**

**Programme 7 (Master’s educational programme in Accounting, Auditing, Taxation )**

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested to deepen partnerships in the area of Big 4, in order to develop the programmatic skills of academic and invited personnel.
- It is suggested to focus on the development of the English language skills of academic personnel so that everyone can equally participate in various exchange programs. Of course, the university cannot force personnel to learn or improve their language skills, but certain mechanisms can be implemented to enhance this aspect.

**Programme 8 Bachelor’s educational programme in Public Administration**

**Recommendation(s): None**

**Suggestion(s):**

- It is suggested/preferable for the workload (hourly schedule) of the program's academic and invited staff to be distributed evenly so that, as much as possible, all personnel can engage in academic activities according to their qualifications.

**Evaluation**

**Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with the component**

Component 4.1 Human resources	<b>Complies with requirements</b>	<b>Substantially complies with requirements</b>	<b>Partially complies with requirements</b>	<b>Does not comply with requirements</b>
-------------------------------	-----------------------------------	---	---	--

Programme 1 Business Administration, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 Business Administration, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 Finance, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 Finance and Banking, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 Marketing, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 8 Public Administration, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

#### 4.2 Qualification of Supervisors of Master's and Doctoral Students

Master's and Doctoral students have qualified supervisor/supervisors and, if necessary, co-supervisor/co-supervisors who have relevant scientific-research experience in the field of research.

#### Cluster and individual evaluation

##### Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The supervisors within the cluster comply with all the quality requirements regarding achievements in relevant fields, extensive experience training young scholars, and international visibility. These requirements are properly established in suitable regulations and the institution has sufficient procedures and protocols to monitor compliance. They pay due attention to the specific requirements related to academic degree, research experience in the specific field, appropriate number of publications, and experience training young scholars.

##### Description and Analysis – Programme 2 Business Administration.MA

Based on the presented documentation and the on-site interview, it is established that the scientific supervisor may be a representative of BSU's academic/scientific personnel or an invited individual who possesses the appropriate qualifications and research experience in the scientific field related to the master's thesis (including relevant publications) and holds a doctoral degree. If the master's topic encompasses two or more fields/subfields, the graduate student may have a co-supervisor.

The scientific research experience of the scientific supervisor at BSU is evaluated according to the rules for assessing the activities of academic and invited personnel, as well as the scientific research work of scientific personnel. This evaluation includes participation in various types of scientific events, quantitative analysis of scientific publications, involvement in scientific grant projects, and more.

At Batumi Shota Rustaveli State University, academic and invited personnel annually upload information about their scientific and pedagogical activities to the scientific activities section of the BSU electronic portal. This may include scientific papers, monographs, pedagogical activities, and other engagements. The information posted on the electronic portal is verified by the Dean of the Faculty of Economics and Business, the heads of departments, the head of the Faculty's Quality Assurance Service, and the Scientific Research Service of BSU.

Participants involved in the implementation of the program have published nearly 68 articles in highly rated scientific databases (Web of Science, Scopus, ERIH PLUS) and have participated in around 90 international scientific conferences and workshops from 2019 to 2024.

However, for the continuous development of academic personnel, it is crucial to implement mechanisms that support their ongoing growth, such as:

- Regular training sessions aimed at promoting academic development –
- Modern Methods of Teaching;
- The Use of Artificial Intelligence in the Educational Process and Its Modernization, and so on.
- Facilitation of the internationalization of research.
- Increasing involvement in international projects, and so on.

<b>Programme 2 (Business Administration)[1]</b>			
<b>Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses</b>	These supervisors	Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[2]	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
<b>Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses</b>	13	13	
- Professor	5	5	5
- Associate Professor	8	8	8
- Assistant-Professor	-	-	-
Invited Staff	-	-	-
Scientific Staff	-	-	-

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 3 Business Administration. PhD

It is confirmed through the presented documentation and the in-person interview that when selecting a doctoral dissertation supervisor, the research conducted on the current achievements and ongoing processes in the field will be taken into account. Given that the topics of doctoral dissertations encompass relevant issues in various directions of the field, attention is paid to the scientific activity of the supervisor in the specific area. Accordingly, to ensure the successful completion of the doctoral dissertation, a scientific supervisor is appointed for the doctoral candidate, who may be a representative/invited person from the academic/scientific staff of BSU with relevant qualifications and research experience in the scientific field related to the topic of the doctoral dissertation (with appropriate publications).

At Batumi Shota Rustaveli State University, the academic staff annually updates the information about their scientific and pedagogical activities in the scientific activities section of the BSU electronic portal. This may include scientific papers, monographs, pedagogical activities, and other activities. The quality of the scientific

research activities of the doctoral candidates' supervisors is evaluated based on the weighty information provided by the publication of their scientific papers in international databases such as Web of Science, Scopus, and ERIH PLUS.

The professional development of the academic staff is supported by holding scientific seminars on current economic issues in the respective departments. The Faculty of Economics and Business at BSU actively collaborates with various foreign universities through joint scientific research, participation in international conferences, conducting open lectures, involvement in student exchange programs, and more. **However, regarding the latter, the university needs to make further efforts.**

Programme 3 (Business Administration. PhD)[1]			
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	These supervisors	Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[2]	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	25	25	25
- Professor	12	12	12
- Associate Professor	13	13	13
- Assistant-Professor	-	-	-
Invited Staff	-	-	-
Scientific Staff	-	-	-

[1] In case of necessity please add the appropriate number of tables for the educational programmes grouped in a cluster.

[2] These supervisors having a PhD degree relevant to the qualification awarded by the educational programme.

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 5 Finance and Banking.MA

It is confirmed through the presented documentation and the in-person interview that to ensure the completion of the master's thesis at BSU, a scientific supervisor is appointed for the master's student, who may be a representative/invited person from the academic/scientific staff of BSU with relevant qualifications and research experience in the scientific field related to the topic of the master's thesis (with appropriate publications).

The academic staff annually updates the BSU electronic portal's scientific activities section with information about their scientific and pedagogical work: scientific papers, monographs, pedagogical activities, and other activities. Information regarding the publication of scientific papers in international databases such as Web of Science, Scopus, and ERIH PLUS serves as an important source for assessing the quality of the scientific-research activities of the master's students' supervisors. The posted information is validated by the Dean of the Faculty of Economics and Business, the heads of the departments, the head of the faculty's quality assurance service, and the BSU research office.

During the period from 2021 to 2023, the academic staff implementing the Finance and Banking educational program published 28 scientific papers in highly indexed international databases.

<b>Programme 5 (Finance and Banking.MA)[1]</b>			
<b>Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses</b>	These supervisors	Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[2]	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
<b>Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses</b>	10	10	10
<b>- Professor</b>	10	10	10
<b>- Associate Professor</b>	-	-	-
<b>- Assistant-Professor</b>	-	-	-
<b>Invited Staff</b>	1	1	1
<b>Scientific Staff</b>	-	-	-

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 6 Marketing.MA

It is determined through the presented documentation and the in-person interview that the requirements for the master's student's supervisor regarding the necessity of scientific-research experience are assessed at BSU according to the rules for evaluating the activities of academic and invited staff and the scientific-research work of the scientific personnel.

These rules assess participation in scientific events, qualitative analysis of scientific papers, involvement in scientific grant projects, participation of doctoral candidates and/or master's students in scientific projects, supervision of master's and/or doctoral theses, involvement in the work of scientific seminars, participation in the organization of scientific events, engagement in student scientific conferences, and more.

To ensure the successful completion of the master's thesis, a scientific supervisor is appointed for the master's student, who may be a representative/invited person from the academic/scientific staff of BSU with relevant qualifications and research experience in the scientific field related to the topic of the master's thesis (with appropriate publications).

The academic staff annually updates the BSU electronic portal's scientific activities section with information about their scientific and pedagogical work: scientific papers, monographs, pedagogical activities, and other activities. Information regarding the publication of scientific papers in international databases such as Web of Science, Scopus, and ERIH PLUS serves as an important source for assessing the quality of the scientific-research activities of the master's students' supervisors. The posted information is validated by the Dean of the Faculty of Economics and Business, the heads of the departments, the head of the faculty's quality assurance service, and the BSU research office.

<b>Programme 6 (Marketing.MA)[3]</b>			
<b>Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses</b>	These supervisors	Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[4]	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
<b>Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses</b>	8	8	8

- Professor	2	2	2
- Associate Professor	6	6	6
- Assistant-Professor	-	-	-
Invited Staff	-	-	-
Scientific Staff	-	-	-

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation.MA

At BSU, a scientific supervisor is appointed for the master's student to ensure the successful completion of the master's thesis. The supervisor may be a representative or invited person from the academic/scientific staff of BSU with the appropriate qualifications and research experience in the scientific field related to the topic of the master's thesis.

The academic staff annually updates the BSU electronic portal's scientific activities section with information about their scientific and pedagogical work: scientific papers, monographs, pedagogical activities, and other activities. Information regarding the publication of scientific papers in international databases such as Web of Science, Scopus, and ERIH PLUS serves as an important source for assessing the quality of the scientific-research activities of the master's students' supervisors. The posted information is validated by the Dean of the Faculty of Economics and Business, the heads of the departments, the head of the faculty's quality assurance service, and the BSU research office.

Between 2021 and 2023, the academic and invited staff implementing the educational program in Accounting, Auditing, and Taxation published 247 scientific papers in highly indexed international databases.

Programme 7 (Accounting, Auditing, Taxation.MA)[5]			
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	These supervisors	Including the supervisors holding PhD degree in the sectoral direction[6]	Among them, the affiliated academic staff
Number of supervisors of Master's/Doctoral theses	15	15	15
- Professor	4	4	4
- Associate Professor	10	10	10
- Assistant-Professor	1	1	1
Invited Staff	-	-	-

#### Evidences/Indicators

- On-Site Interview
- Presented Documentation
- Article 16 of the Academic Council's Resolution No. 111, dated October 8, 2015, on the Approval of the Regulations for the Educational Process at BSSU, regarding the procedures for planning, preparing, and defending Master's theses
- BSU Electronic Portal: Scientific Activity - Scientific Activities - Academic/Invited Personnel



- CVs of Individuals Implementing the Educational Program
- Institutional website
- Self-assessment report
- Minutes of Meetings of the Department of Financial, Banking, and Insurance Affairs Regarding Conducted Scientific Seminars (stored in the relevant departments)

#### General recommendations of the cluster:

- It is recommended to organize regular training sessions focused on promoting academic development in the following areas: Modern Methods of Teaching: To keep faculty members updated on the latest pedagogical techniques and enhance teaching effectiveness. The Use of Artificial Intelligence in the Educational Process and Its Modernization: To familiarize educators with AI tools that can enhance the learning experience and streamline administrative tasks. Other Relevant Topics: Sessions can also cover emerging trends and technologies that can improve academic practices. Additionally, efforts should be made to facilitate the internationalization of research, encouraging collaboration with global research networks, increasing the university's visibility in international academic circles, and fostering diverse academic perspectives.

#### General suggestions of the cluster:

It is suggested to increase involvement in international projects, it is essential to provide master's and doctoral students with more information regarding **international databases** and their utilization. By familiarizing students with key global research resources, they will be better equipped to engage with international research networks, access cutting-edge studies, and contribute to global academic initiatives. This knowledge will not only enhance their research skills but also open up opportunities for collaboration with international scholars and participation in global projects.

**Recommendations and suggestions according to the programmes:** Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

#### **Programme 2 (Master's educational programme in Business Administration )**

**Recommendation(s): None**

**Suggestion(s): None**

#### **Programme 3 (Doctoral educational programme in Business Administration )**

**Recommendation(s): None**

**Suggestion(s): None**

#### **Programme 5 (Master's educational programme in Finance and Banking )**

**Recommendation(s): None**

**Suggestion(s): None**

#### **Programme 6 (Master's educational programme in Marketing )**

**Recommendation(s): None**

**Suggestion(s): None**

**Programme 7 (Master's educational programme in Accounting, Auditing, Taxation )**

**Recommendation(s): None**

**Suggestion(s): None**

### **Evaluation**

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 4.2 Qualification of supervisors of master's and doctoral students	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
<b>Programme 2 Business Administration.MA</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 3 Business Administration, PhD</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 5 Finance and Banking MA</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 6 Marketing. MA</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation. MA</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### **4.3 Professional Development of Academic, Scientific and Invited Staff**

- The HEI conducts the evaluation of programme staff and analyses evaluation results on a regular basis.
- The HEI fosters professional development of the academic, scientific and invited staff. Moreover, it fosters their scientific and research work.

#### **Cluster and individual evaluation**

#### **Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component**

According to the on-site interviews and the presented documentation, the evaluation rules for academic and invited staff developed by the BSU Quality Assurance Office take into account the assessment of staff participation in pedagogical, scientific, and other university activities. Specifically, this includes evaluating the involvement of professors and teachers in the development of educational programs, the updating and improvement of syllabi, the preparation of teaching materials, the monitoring of the teaching process, conducting student satisfaction surveys, their interviews, and the results of other academic activities.

Information about the pedagogical activities of academic and invited staff is available on the electronic portal at <https://apa.bsu.edu.ge/MyRate> , while information about scientific activities can be found at <https://portal.bsu.edu.ge/sa/index.html>.

By the decision of the Representative Council on April 20, 2022, N07-01/21, the "Regulations for the Funding of Professional Development and Publication Incentives for BSU Staff" have been activated to finance participation of academic/scientific staff in conferences, seminars, congresses, forums, and other similar events.

Additionally, there are incentives for the publication of articles by academic and scientific staff. According to the policy, "for articles published during the previous calendar year, a one-time monetary reward is granted as an incentive to the employee. This is in accordance with the scientific activity plans of the main scientific-research directions approved by BSU's research policy."

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 1 Business Administration,BA

The evaluation of the personnel involved in the "Business Administration" and "Public Administration" first-level educational programs is conducted at the end of each academic year, both in terms of scientific activity and pedagogical work. Scientific activity is assessed through the confirmation of monographs and scientific papers; participation in international and local scientific events; ongoing and submitted grants; conducting scientific seminars; supervising bachelor's, master's, and doctoral theses; being a member of editorial boards of scientific publications, and other activities.

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 2 Business Administration,MA

According to the on-site interviews and the presented documentation, the internal quality assurance mechanisms in place at BSU are focused on the assessment and development of academic staff. The strategic development plan of BSU includes the enhancement of the evaluation of academic, invited, and scientific staff activities and the refinement of mechanisms for their application in management processes. For this purpose, separate evaluation rules have been developed for the activities of BSU's academic and invited staff, as well as for the scientific-research work of the scientific personnel.

To effectively implement educational programs, the university has decided to support professors and teachers in enhancing their language competencies by co-financing English language certification courses. However, this initiative requires the development of additional mechanisms to improve language competencies.

With the support of the university and local authorities, professors from various foreign universities are periodically invited to conduct training sessions and share experiences with students and academic personnel. The role of local authorities in promoting education is undoubtedly significant.

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 3 Business Administration,PhD

The strategic development plan of BSU aims to enhance the evaluation mechanism for the activities of academic, invited, and scientific staff. For this purpose, evaluation rules for the activities of BSU's academic and invited staff have been developed, which include assessing the involvement of professors and teachers in the development of educational programs, updating and refining syllabi, preparing teaching materials, participating in scientific events and grant projects, monitoring the teaching process, conducting qualitative analyses of scientific papers, researching student satisfaction, and more.

The university annually announces a targeted competition for selecting scientific-research projects. The projects involve academic personnel and students from the doctoral educational program in Business Administration.

The academic staff of the educational program have received various grant projects announced under the "Higher Education Support Program" of the Rustaveli Foundation and the Ministry of Education, Culture, and Sports of the Autonomous Republic of Adjara. Periodic training sessions on modern teaching methods and overall professional development are conducted.

However, to improve academic skills, it is essential to conduct more continuous training sessions or workshops to ensure the ongoing development of both academic and invited staff at the university.

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 4 Finances. BA

According to the on-site interviews and the presented documentation, from 2018 to 2023, the academic staff implementing the Finance educational program at BSU published 300 scientific papers. This includes 60 in local journals, 140 in international journals indexed in high-ranking scientific metric databases (Scopus, Web of Science, Erih Plus), 40 presentations at local conferences, and 60 at international conferences. The majority of the published scientific papers are indexed in international scientific metric databases: Scopus, Web of Science, EBSCO, and Google Scholar.

Additionally, since 2021, BSU personnel have participated in grant projects such as Erasmus+ "Integration of Educational, Scientific, Managerial, and Industrial Components for Climate Management and Climate Change Prevention" (CLIMAN) (grant project number: 619119-EPP-1-2020-1-NL-EPPKA2-CBHE-JP); DeSIRE-2023 - Project Title: Development of Soft Skills at Higher Education Institutions of Armenia and Georgia in Compliance with the 21st Century Labour Market Requirements (Project number: 101128804 - DeSIRE - ERASMUS-EDU-2023-CBHE), coordinated by Vanadzor State University (Armenia); and ETHICS-2022, Project Title: Responsible Conduct of Research – Research Integrity and Ethics in Georgian Universities (Project number: 101082546 - ERASMUS-EDU-2022-CBHE).

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 5 Finance and Banking. MA

To support the implementation of scientific/research activities by academic, scientific, and invited staff at BSU, a targeted funding system for scientific-research projects is in place. Within this framework, two scientific-research projects were carried out at the Faculty of Economics and Business from 2018 to 2024: "Constructing a Mortality Table for the Population of Adjara: Statistical Analysis and Future Forecasting," and "Systemic Trends in the Socio-Economic Development of the Autonomous Republic of Adjara: Strategy, Instrumentation, Effectiveness" (2018).

The selection of a supervisor by master's students is based on the field of interest, after which the relevance of the research topic is determined following an interview with the prospective supervisor, and the supervisor is appointed.

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 6 Marketing. MA

Through on-site interviews and the presented documentation, it is confirmed that for the purpose of improving the quality of achieving the educational program's goals and learning outcomes, evaluation rules for the activities of academic and invited staff, as well as for the scientific-research work of scientific personnel, have been

developed at BSU. These rules include the assessment of staff participation in pedagogical, scientific, and other university activities.

At BSU, various programs are available for academic, scientific, and invited staff: a competition for the Erasmus+ exchange program funded by the European Commission for mobility at various universities in Europe; a competition for participation in scientific events held abroad (conferences, seminars, congresses, forums); incentives for articles published in high-ranking scientific journals, among others.

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation MA

With the support of the university and local authorities, professors from various foreign universities are periodically invited to conduct training sessions for students and academic personnel and to share their experiences. Participation in these events contributes to both the professional growth of the staff and the design of the educational program in accordance with international standards.

According to the decision of the representative council dated April 20, 2022, N07-01/21, the "Regulation on Funding for the Professional Development of BSU Personnel and Incentives for Article Publication" has been implemented at BSU.

#### Description and Analysis - Programme 8 Public Administration. BA

The evaluation of academic and invited personnel involved in the Bachelor's program in Public Administration is periodically conducted according to the assessment criteria specified in the evaluation rules for academic and invited staff and the scientific-research work of scientific personnel developed at BSU. This evaluation is carried out through an electronic system - Scientific Activity - Research Activities - Academic/Invited Personnel - <https://portal.bsu.edu.ge/sa/index.html>.

The assessment of academic and invited personnel in Public Administration is also conducted as a result of academic monitoring. A relevant competent person from the university and faculty evaluates the staff based on attendance at in-person classes, and the results are recorded in the electronic system's extension module - Attendance - Academic Monitoring - <https://portal.bsu.edu.ge/Acad-Monitoring/index.html>, which is accessible to the staff.

The evaluation of personnel involved in the program is also conducted through the electronic self-assessment system for academic and invited personnel - <https://apa.bsu.edu.ge/>, which includes components of pedagogical activity and directions for teaching and academic engagement.

Based on the analysis of the performance evaluation of academic and invited personnel (invited professors, specialists, teachers, senior teachers), the Quality Assurance Office of the relevant faculty will develop recommendations and present a final report to the faculty dean and the university's Quality Assurance Office. The university's Quality Assurance Office will provide the rector and the academic council with recommendations for actions to be taken based on the information/material defined in the first paragraph of this article.

The BSU administration periodically offers academic personnel the opportunity to participate in qualification enhancement training, and information about this is provided to personnel through the electronic portal <https://portal.bsu.ge>, where interested individuals can register for training courses electronically.

The development of international collaboration serves to enhance the academic and scientific potential of the university's academic and research personnel. The university has signed cooperation memorandums with 115 universities, research institutions, and foundations in 35 countries, among which up to 10 organizations focus on collaboration in the field of Public Administration.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Annual scientific reports of the Faculty
  - Curricula vitae of the teaching staff
  - Institutional website
  - Results of the survey of staff performance and satisfaction
  - Information about activities oriented to the development of academic, scientific, and invited staff
  - Documents concerning international cooperation
  - Self-assessment report
  - Interviews with the management staff, the Quality assurance units, the teaching staff, the students, and the graduates.
- 

**General recommendations of the cluster:** Non

#### **General suggestions of the cluster**

- It is suggested to align with the significant progress made in the field of internationalization, which includes well-developed plans for further growth, it would be beneficial to strengthen support for internationalization activities related to research, publication, and participation in academic events for both teaching staff and graduate students (Master's and Doctoral). This could include offering funding, logistical support, and opportunities for collaboration with international researchers and institutions. By facilitating greater involvement in global academic networks, the university can enhance its research profile, foster cross-cultural exchange, and improve the overall quality of academic output.
- It is suggested to continually improve academic skills, it is essential to conduct ongoing training sessions or workshops for both academic and invited staff. Regular, structured professional development programs will ensure that faculty members are up-to-date with the latest pedagogical methods, research trends, and technological innovations, contributing to the sustained academic growth of the university. These programs should focus on improving teaching effectiveness, research capabilities, and overall academic performance, fostering a culture of continuous development at all levels.

**Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any):** Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes **Non**

## Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 4.3 Professional development of academic, scientific and invited staff	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Business Administration, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 Business Administration, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 Finance, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 Finance and Banking, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 Marketing, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 8 Public Administration, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### 4.4. Material Resources

Programme is provided with necessary infrastructure, information resources relevant to the field of study and technical equipment required for achieving programme learning outcomes.

### Cluster and individual evaluation

### Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Based on the on-site interviews, the presented documentation, and the inspection of the university's material-technical resources, it is confirmed that the infrastructure and technical equipment of Batumi Shota Rustaveli State University ensures the achievement of learning outcomes provided by all educational programs. The university has unrestricted and accessible infrastructure and material-technical resources necessary for the educational process, specifically:

- Classrooms and conference halls equipped with appropriate inventory;
  - Examination center;
  - Library equipped with computer technology and information-communication technologies;
  - University spaces equipped with internet-connected computers and soft furnishings;
  - Various technical devices;
  - Sports halls;
  - The building is fully adapted for persons with disabilities.
- 
- The university has a modern library, whose book collection is represented both by printed educational and artistic literature located on-site and by a rich array of electronic resources.
- 
- To facilitate literature searches for students and professors, an electronic catalog of library documents has been created at BSSU. The library has access to international scientific databases, including Elsevier's ScienceDirect and Scopus, EBSCO Publishing, Cambridge University Press, Royal Society Journals Collection, and BioOne.
- 
- The library utilizes integrated management systems such as "Open Biblio" and "KOHA," which allow readers to remotely access interesting electronic resources. BSSU, as an organization, is registered on the EURAXESS portal, enabling the university's scientific and academic personnel to register on the EURAXESS website, which allows them to participate in international competitions and projects and obtain funding.
- 
- To ensure effective access to educational literature, an internal electronic library has been established, where almost all educational materials are available. BSSU is registered in the project "Electronic Information for Libraries - EIFL" as a consortium member, allowing students to access the following electronic resources: EBSCOHost (<http://search.epnet.com>), Cambridge University Journals (<http://journals.cambridge.org>), Oxford University Journals (<http://www.oxfordjournals.org>), and Oxford Reference Online. The library uses integrated management systems "Open Biblio" and "KOHA," enabling readers to remotely access the resources they are interested in.

However, during the library visit, the requested educational material, which is indicated as primary material for various academic disciplines, was neither available electronically nor physically on-site. The library staff explained that the educational materials labeled as lecture materials were stored in the faculty dean's office. We requested this type of documentation, which was provided to us without any issues. However, we believe that the educational material listed as primary resources should be housed in the university library, both in printed and electronic formats.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Business Administration. BA)

Description and Analysis – Programme 2 (Business Administration . MA)

Description and Analysis - Programme 3 (Business Administration . PhD)



The lecture and practical training rooms are equipped with modern technologies: personal computers and presentation projectors. There is a discussion/debate space with a round table, literature, and a smart board.

BSU is registered as a member of the project 'Electronic Information for Libraries - EIFL' consortium, which allows students to access various electronic resources. The university has access to the following major international databases:

- Elsevier - [www.elsevier.com](http://www.elsevier.com);
- ScienceDirect - [www.sciencedirect.com](http://www.sciencedirect.com);
- Scopus - [www.scopus.com](http://www.scopus.com).
- EBSCO Publishing (<http://search.epnet.com>);
- Cambridge University Press (<http://journals.cambridge.org>);
- Royal Society Journals Collection (<http://royalsocietypublishing.org>);
- BioOne (<http://www.bioone.org>); (for additional information about library resources, see the link <http://www.bsu.edu.ge/sub-15/page/2-237/index.html>).

The BSU library houses the mandatory literature and electronic resources specified in the syllabi.

Additionally, BSU, as an organization, is registered on the EURAXESS portal, allowing university staff to register on the EURAXESS website, participate in international competitions and projects, and secure funding. In 2022, a Horizon Europe office was opened at the university, where doctoral students can obtain detailed information about scientific grant competitions, etc.

Description and Analysis - Programme 4 Finances. BA

The infrastructure and technical equipment of BSU ensure the achievement of learning outcomes specified in the Finance educational program. The material and technical base is periodically updated.

BSU is registered as a member of the project "Electronic Information for Libraries - eIFL" consortium, which allows students to access the following electronic resources:

- EBSCOHost (<http://search.epnet.com>),
- Cambridge University Journals (<http://journals.cambridge.org>),
- Oxford University Journals (<http://www.oxfordjournals.org>),
- Oxford Reference Online (<http://www.oxfordreference.com>),
- Royal Society Journals Collection (<http://royalsocietypublishing.org>),
- BioOne (<http://www.bioone.org>).Ø

Description and Analysis - Programme 5 Finance and Banking. MA

Description and Analysis - Programme 6 Marketing. MA

Description and Analysis - Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation. MA

BSU's library provides researchers and students with access to international library databases, specifically:

- e-Duke Journals Scholarly Collection (<https://www.dukeupress.edu/>) - features high citation index scholarly journals;

- Edward Elgar Publishing Journals and Development Studies e-books (<https://www.elgaronline.com/page/70/journals>);
- IMF eLibrary (<http://www.elibrary.imf.org/?redirect=true>) - a database;
- EBSCO Publishing (<http://search.epnet.com>);
- Cambridge University Press (<http://journals.cambridge.org>);
- Royal Society Journals Collection (<http://royalsocietypublishing.org>);
- BioOne (<http://www.bioone.org>).

The implementation of the educational program is ensured by the academic staff and invited specialists from the Departments of Finance, Banking, Insurance, Computer Sciences, and Social Sciences, as well as the Center for Languages and Information Technologies at BSU.

Description and Analysis - Programme 8 Public Administration BA

The university is equipped with classrooms, laboratories, computer labs connected to the internet, sports facilities, and conference rooms necessary for the educational process of the Bachelor's program in Public Administration.

The university supports the educational program with a university library and electronic library resources:

- EBSCO Publishing (<http://search.epnet.com>),
- Cambridge University Press (<http://journals.cambridge.org>),
- Royal Society Journals Collection (<http://royalsocietypublishing.org>),
- BioOne (<http://www.bioone.org>);

for additional information about library resources, see the link: <http://www.bsu.edu.ge/sub-15/page/2-237/index.html>.

The university provides the educational program in Public Administration with a base for professional practice, for which it has signed cooperation memoranda with various public and private institutions in the region.

**However, program leaders and students mentioned during interviews that there is a shortage of placements at practice sites, which is a critical point to consider. It is necessary to increase the number of practice sites by formalizing additional memoranda.**

BSU's library also offers interested parties (students, master's students, doctoral candidates, faculty members) the opportunity to access the following libraries:

1. National Library of the Parliament of Georgia;
2. National Scientific Library;
3. Library of Congress;
4. Batumi Public Library;
5. Wikibooks, the internet library of Wikipedia.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Documents concerning material resource
- Institutional website

- Library resources, catalog and website
- Information about available databases
- Self-assessment report
- Interviews with the management staff, the Quality assurance units, the teaching staff, the students, and the graduates.
- Regulation of the BSU Library
- BSU's Electronic Library: <http://10.10.48.48/> BSU Library: <http://library.bsu.edu.ge/>
- Public Administration - Signed Cooperation Memoranda.

**General recommendations of the cluster:**

- It is recommended that all **educational literature**, including handouts, textbooks, and other materials, particularly those designated as required reading, be made available in both **electronic format and physical copies** at the university library. This would ensure easy access for all students, accommodating different preferences and providing equitable access to essential learning resources.

**General suggestions of the cluster:**

- It is suggested that the university **diversify internship locations** by signing additional memoranda of understanding (MOUs) with various organizations, institutions, and companies. This would offer students a broader range of practical experiences and opportunities to apply their academic knowledge in diverse settings, enhancing the overall quality and relevance of their education.

**Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes:** Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

None

**Evaluation**

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 4.4 Material resources	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Business Administration, level 6	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 Business Administration, level 7	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 Finance, level 6	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 Finance and Banking, level 7	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

<b>Programme 6 Marketing, level 7</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>x</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>x</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 8 Public Administration, level 6</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<b>x</b>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

#### 4.5. Programme/Faculty/School Budget and Programme Financial Sustainability

The allocation of financial resources stipulated in programme/faculty/school budget is economically feasible and corresponds to the programme needs.

##### Cluster and individual evaluation

##### Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

On-site interviews, along with the presented and requested documents, confirm that the financial support for the academic educational programs at BSU is managed according to the revenue and expenditure categories reflected in the university's unified budget. The expenditure section of the budget includes allocations for labor remuneration, the provision of computer equipment necessary for the educational process, maintenance of existing infrastructure, and utility costs. The technical equipment purchased within the framework of international projects operating at the faculty has partially supplemented the material-technical base.

Description and Analysis - Programme 1 (Business Administration. BA)

Description and Analysis - Programme 4 (Business Administration. MA)

Description and Analysis - Programme 8 Business Administration. DOCTORAL

The financial support for the academic educational programs at BSU is managed according to the revenue and expenditure categories reflected in the university's unified budget. The expenditure section of the program's budget includes allocations for labor remuneration, overhead costs, expenses for providing computer equipment necessary for the educational process, maintenance of existing infrastructure, and utility costs.

Additionally, the material-technical base has been partially supplemented by the technical equipment acquired through international projects operating within the faculty.

The Faculty of Economics and Business, where the doctoral program in Business Administration is to be implemented, is financially stable and sustainable. The financial support for the faculty and its educational programs is provided based on the categories of income and expenditures reflected in the university's unified budget.

##### Evidences/Indicators

- Cluster budget
- Self-assessment report
- Interviews with the management staff and other relevant stakeholders
- The Regulation of the Financial and Economic Department of BSU
- Order of the BSU Administration Head on the Approval of the Budget for Educational Programs

- Budget for the Public Administration Program
- Budget for the Master's Educational Program "Business Administration"
- Budget for the Doctoral Educational Program "Business Administration"

**General recommendations of the cluster:** Non

**General suggestions of the cluster:**

- It is suggested that the university **continue and enhance efforts to secure grants** while simultaneously seeking additional **funding opportunities**. By actively pursuing various funding sources—such as government grants, private sector partnerships, and international research funds—the university can expand its financial resources, support research initiatives, and improve overall institutional development. This proactive approach to funding can help ensure the sustainability and growth of academic programs, research projects, and other university initiatives.

**Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes:** Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes (if any)

**Programme 1 Bachelor’s educational programme in Business Administration**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

**Programme 2 Master’s educational programme in Business Administration**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

**Programme 3 Doctoral educational programme in Business Administration**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

**Programme 4 Bachelor’s educational programme in Finances**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s):** Non

**Programme 5 Master’s educational programme in Finance and Banking**

**Recommendation(s):** Non

**Suggestion(s): Non**

**Programme 6 Master’s educational programme in Marketing**

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s): Non**

**Programme 7 Master’s educational programme in Accounting, Auditing, Taxation**

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s): Non**

**Programme 8 Bachelor’s educational programme in Public Administration**

**Recommendation(s): Non**

**Suggestion(s): Non**

## Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 4.5 Programme/faculty/school budget and programme financial sustainability	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Business Administration, level 6	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 Business Administration, level 7	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 Finance, level 6	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 Finance and Banking, level 7	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 Marketing, level 7	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 8 Public Administration, level 6	X	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

## Compliance of the programmes with the standards

<b>4. Providing Teaching Resources</b>	<b>Complies with requirements</b>	<b>Substantially complies with requirements</b>	<b>Partially complies with requirements</b>	<b>Does not comply with requirements</b>
--	---------------------------------------	---	---	--

Programme 1 (Business Administration, level 6)	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (Business Administration, level 7)	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 (Business Administration, level 8)	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 (Finance, level 6)	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 (Finance and banking, level7)	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 (Marketing, level7)	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 (Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level7)	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 8 (Public Administration, level 6)	<input type="checkbox"/>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

## 5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities

In order to enhance teaching quality, programme utilizes internal and external quality assurance services and also periodically conducts programme monitoring and programme review. Relevant data is collected, analysed and utilized for informed decision making and programme development.

### 5.1. Internal Quality Evaluation

Programme staff collaborates with internal quality assurance department(s)/staff available at the HEI when planning the process of programme quality assurance, developing assessment instruments, and implementing assessment process. Programme staff utilizes quality assurance results for programme improvement.

#### Cluster and individual evaluation

#### Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

Ensuring the quality of teaching and learning, research process or students' services at the university is based not only on the internal university regulations and normative acts developed by the university itself but also on Georgian legislation and international experience in the field of higher education. Accordingly, the quality assurance service of the university is guided in its activities by the following documents: Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG), Law of Georgia „On Education Quality Improvement“; standards for authorization of higher education institutions and accreditation of higher education programs; University Charter; University mission and strategic development plan; Regulations of Quality Assurance Service; BSU quality assurance policy, etc. These documents form the foundation for ensuring quality in various aspects of university life, including teaching, research, and services, while aligning with both national legislation and international best practices in higher education.

The internal quality assurance mechanisms developed at the university envisage the work of the "Plan, Do, check, Act" quality assurance system, which ensures the participation of all interested parties in the planning, implementation and evaluation of educational programs.

The interviews confirmed that academic staff, invited personnel, and employers were actively involved in the process of developing and evaluating the programs. The modification process of educational programs was led by program leaders, while the faculty's quality assurance service actively participated in the evaluation process. In the first stage of updating the presented programs, the working groups studied the recommendations and advice received during the previous accreditation, as well as the Subject Benchmark Statements of Business Administration/Public Administration/Finance/Marketing. Several working meetings were organized with the participation of academic, invited staff, employers and the representative of the quality assurance service. Insights from stakeholders are reflected in programs objectives, learning outcomes and curricula.

It should be noted that the staff developed so-called "maps" (goals and learning outcomes map, curriculum map, learning outcomes evaluation mechanism/plan) to ensure and evaluate the quality of the programs and achievement of learning outcomes. There are some content and technical errors in the mentioned documents. For example, according to maps, master's programs learning outcomes are not developed according to three levels (1- introduction, 2 - deepening, 3 - reinforcement).

The basis of this approach is the policy of the university that a student who is already qualified in the field comes to the master's level. However, the prerequisites for admission to master's programs are open to anyone, so a student who does not know the field can be enrolled in the program. In such a case, there may be a need for introductory courses relevant to the master's level. Meanwhile, NCEQE guidelines recommend that learning outcomes develop at all three levels. In addition, in the first semester, mandatory courses are provided that develop the learning outcomes at the third, reinforcement level, and in the subsequent semesters, the learning outcomes are deepened, which certainly violates the idea of a spiral curriculum, where knowledge should be achieved gradually, logically, from simple to complex. Based on the above, it is recommended to retrain programs managers and academic staff on the basic principles of creating conceptual maps for the assessment of learning outcomes.

The self-evaluation report and attached documents reveal that the university systematically conducts regular surveys of students, academic/invited staff, graduates, and employers to determine their level of satisfaction. Surveys serve to evaluate the quality of implementation of educational programs. Academic and scientific activities of lecturers and collegial attendance at lectures are permanently evaluated in the institution.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Self-Evaluation Report;
- Educational Programs;
- The Study Courses Syllabi;
- Regulations of Quality Assurance Service;
- BSU quality assurance policy;
- Programs' Maps;
- Interview Results.

#### **General recommendations of the cluster:**

- It is recommended to retrain programs managers and academic staff on the basic principles of creating conceptual maps for the assessment of learning outcomes.



**General suggestions of the cluster:** Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

**Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any):** Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes

## Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 5.1 Internal Quality Evaluation	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Business Administration, level 6	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 Business Administration, level 7	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 Finance, level 6	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 Finance and Banking, level 7	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 Marketing, level 7	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 8 Public Administration, level 6	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### 5.2. External Quality Evaluation

Programme utilizes the results of external quality assurance on a regular basis.

#### Cluster and individual evaluation

#### Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The external quality evaluation mechanism for the university is the authorization and accreditation processes implemented by the National Center for Educational Quality Enhancement according the "Statute on Authorization of Educational Institutions" and "Statute of the Accreditation of Educational Programs of the Higher Educational Institutions". Authorization of a higher education institution is an obligatory external

mechanism for ensuring the quality of higher education, while accreditation serves as a mechanism for the external evaluation of educational programs' compliance with standards. BSU generally considers the recommendations received from experts during the authorization and accreditation processes and makes appropriate changes to the programs. For this purpose, the results of previous accreditation, along with the advice and recommendations of experts, are utilized in the development of programs.

The university also collaborates with local and international stakeholders and field experts to evaluate the programs. To develop educational programs, the university studies the requirements of the local labor market and identifies the needs of potential employers. The obtained results are reflected in educational programs objectives, learning outcomes, curricula and training courses. It is worth noting that the survey of employers and graduates highlighted the need to reduce theoretical hours, while increasing practical training, as well as increasing activities focused on the development of practical skills. Both issues are reflected in the curricula of the programs and the corresponding training courses.

According to the SER of the cluster submitted by the HEI, the documentation enclosed to it and the interviews conducted during the accreditation visit, the programs presented in the cluster were evaluated by Georgian and foreign external stakeholders from the academic fields and labour market. The external evaluator's recommendations and suggestions were carefully analyzed by the programs working groups. Relevant and useful recommendations are reflected in the curricula and syllabi of the programs.

#### **Evidences/Indicators**

- Self-Evaluation Report;
- Educational Programs;
- The Study Courses Syllabi;
- External evaluation reports;
- Interview Results.

**General recommendations of the cluster:** Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

**General suggestions of the cluster:** Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

**Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any):** Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes

#### **Evaluation**

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 5.2 External Quality Evaluation	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 Business Administration, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 Business Administration, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 Finance, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 Finance and Banking, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 Marketing, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 8 Public Administration, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

### 5.3. Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review

Programme monitoring and periodic evaluation is conducted with the involvement of academic, scientific, invited, administrative, supporting staff, students, graduates, employers and other stakeholders through systematic data collection, study and analysis. Evaluation results are applied for the programme improvement.

#### Cluster and individual evaluation

#### Summary and Analysis of the Compliance of the Educational Programmes Grouped in a Cluster with the Requirements of the Standard Component

The quality assurance processes at the university are led by the central and faculty quality assurance services, which participate in the development, monitoring, evaluation, and improvement of educational programs within the competencies outlined in the statute.

To ensure the ongoing evaluation and development of educational programs, the quality assurance service monitors the educational process, which includes collegial attendance at classroom sessions, evaluation of teaching and examination materials, monitoring of exams and analysis of results, determination and analysis of students' academic performance, evaluation of academic and scientific staff activities, and analysis of graduate and employer survey results. The monitoring and periodic evaluation of educational programs are facilitated by the student portal - an electronic system for processing student surveys and academic performance. This software ensures the smooth functioning of quality assurance mechanisms, specifically the collection and analysis of quantitative and qualitative data, information sharing, and the simplification of various bureaucratic processes. To evaluate the learning process, the quality assurance service conducts annual student surveys using this portal, during which students assess the content of the course, human and material resources, and other issues related to the administration of the learning process. To monitor new and existing programs presented in the cluster, the university has carried out the following activities:

- Conducted labor market research and analyzed employers' requirements and needs;
- Improved the goals and learning outcomes of the educational program;

- Enriched programs with practical components based on feedback from students, graduates, and employers (activities such as projects, case studies, and problem analysis were incorporated into syllabi);
- Conducted annual evaluations of the programs by the program heads, which included the analysis of various quantitative and qualitative indicators;
- Compared programs with other similar programs;
- Engaged external independent experts to study and evaluate the programs.
- Assessed the learning outcomes of active educational programs.

### Evidences/Indicators

- Self-Evaluation Report;
- Educational Programs;
- The Study Courses Syllabi;
- External evaluation reports;
- Regulations of Quality Assurance Service;
- BSU quality assurance policy;
- Survey results;
- Interview Results.

**General recommendations of the cluster:** Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

**General suggestions of the cluster:** Please, write the developed recommendations that apply equally to the educational programmes grouped in the cluster (if any)

**Recommendations and Suggestions according to the programmes (if any):** Please, write the developed recommendations and suggestions according to the individual programmes

### Evaluation

Please, evaluate the compliance of the programmes with this standard component

Component 5.3. Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
<b>Programme 1 Business Administration, level 6</b>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 2 Business Administration, level 7</b>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 3 Business Administration, level 8</b>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 4 Finance, level 6</b>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>Programme 5 Finance and Banking, level 7</b>	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Programme 6 Marketing, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 8 Public Administration, level 6	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

#### Compliance of the programmes with the standards

5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Partially complies with requirements	Does not comply with requirements
Programme 1 (Business Administration, level 6)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 2 (Business Administration, level 7)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 3 (Business Administration, level 8)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 4 (Finance, level 6)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 5 (Finance and banking, level7)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 6 (Marketing, level7)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 7 (Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level7)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Programme 8 (Public Administration, level 6)	x	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Attached documentation (if applicable):

Name of the higher education institution: **Batumi Shota Rustaveli State University**

Name of Higher Educational Programmes, Levels:

- Bachelor's educational programme in Business Administration, level 6
- Master's educational programme in Business Administration, level 7
- Doctoral educational programme in Business Administration, level 8
- Bachelor's educational programme in Finance, level 6
- Master's educational programme in Finance and Banking, level 7
- Master's educational programme in Marketing, level 7
- Master's educational programme in Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7
- Bachelor's educational programme in Public Administration, level 8

**Compliance of the programmes with the standards**

<b>Contents</b>  <b>Standard</b>	<b>1. Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme</b>	<b>2. Methodology and Organization of Teaching, Adequacy Evaluation of Programme Mastering</b>	<b>3. Student Achievements, Individual Work with them</b>	<b>4. Providing Teaching Resources</b>	<b>5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities</b>
Programme 1 (Business Administration name, level 6)	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Complies with requirements
Programme 2 (Business Administration, level 7)	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Complies with requirements
Programme 3 ( Business Administration, 8)	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Complies with requirements
Programme 4 (Finance, level 6)	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Complies with requirements
Programme 5 (Finance and Banking, level 7)	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Complies with requirements
Programme 6 ( Marketing, level 7)	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Complies with requirements
Programme 7 ( Accounting, Auditing, Taxation, level 7)	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Complies with requirements
Programme 8 ( Public Administration, level 6)	Complies with requirements	Complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Substantially complies with requirements	Complies with requirements

**Signatures**

**Chair of Accreditation Experts Panel**

Eugenia BUSMACHIU



**Of the member(s) of the Accreditation Experts Panel**

Ekaterine



ZAKARADZEEka

LEKASHVILI



Natia NOGHAIDELI



Kristine CHIKHLADZE



Beka BENDELIANI

