



განათლების ხარისხის განვითარების ეროვნული ცენტრი
NATIONAL CENTER FOR EDUCATIONAL QUALITY ENHANCEMENT

Accreditation Expert Group Report on Higher Education Programme

Medicine
Tbilisi Open Teaching University

Date(s) of Evaluation:
06.09.2017

Report Submission Date

Tbilisi

HEI's Information Profile

Name of Institution Indicating its Organizational Legal Form	LLC Tbilisi Open University
HEI's Identification Code	202192643
Type of Institution	Teaching University

Higher Education Programme Information Profile

Name of the Programme	Medicine (English Language)
Level of Education	One Cycle
Qualification Granted Indicating Qualification Code	Medical Doctor (MD) 090101
Language of Instruction	English
Number of Credits	360
Programme Status (Authorized/ Accredited/New)	New

Expert Panel Members

Chair (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Prof. Dr Aleksandar Jovanovic, vice – rector University of Pristina / K.Mitrovica, Serbia
Member (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Prof. Dr.sc. Zvonko Sosic, University of Zagreb / Medical School, Andrija Stampar School of Public Health / Zagreb, Croatia
Member (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Prof. Dr. Nato Alavidze, Akaki Tsereteli State University / Faculty of Medicine / Kutaisi, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Prof. Dr. Ivane Abiatari, Ilia State University / Institute of Medical Research / Tbilisi, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Prof. Dr. Irakli Gagua, Employer / Head of Gagua Clinic / Tbilisi, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Mr. Rudiko Rusia, Medical Student / Georgia Medical Student Association / Tbilisi, Georgia

Accreditation Report Executive Summary

General information on the education programme

This is the very first accreditation of the Tbilisi Open Teaching University – Programme in Medicine. All activities relating to the study are preparatory and teaching activities have not taken place yet. Information about functioning of the Tbilisi Open Teaching University received here are coming from the experience of other programmes that are already going on and also from the staff, students and documents provided by University administration. According to the curriculum of the programme it seems that it ensures the achievement of the objectives and student learning outcomes of the given programme. The panel got from teachers who are going to have lectures very useful information. However, they should go through formal trainings on formulating objectives and student learning outcomes. It is also worth mentioning that the Self-evaluation Report, although comprehensive, in some parts was not informative enough. During the site visit, the expert panel found out that some information was missing from the SER. Therefore, the university administration (including quality assurance staff) and teaching staff should go through some trainings to be able to better complete self-evaluation report.

Brief overview of the accreditation site-visit

The panel of experts appreciated very friendly assistance and hospitality during the site visit at the Tbilisi Open Teaching University. The panel was impressed with huge, new, modern building the University owns. There is more than enough space for numerous lecture rooms, laboratories and library. All rooms are technically very well equipped, but we notice that there have been some preparatory work going on to fully prepare the building for the teaching process. It is obvious that there is a lot of work necessary to do to prepare facilities for expected students.

Summary of education programme's compliance with the standards

According to the mission of TOTU program of "medicine" has objectives with intentions to assure knowledge of basic natural as well as behavioral and social sciences. The outcome would also be clinical (diagnostic and therapeutic) skills, knowledge of the public health system and ethical and legal principles. The aim and the learning outcomes of the courses are sometimes incomplete and doesn't comply with NQF descriptors.

the distribution of ECTS through the subjects is adequate to content of the courses. There are no significant overlapping and duplications of contents among the courses. The sequence of courses appears logical with fundamental subjects at the beginning and clinical subjects in higher semesters. The number of free elective courses are not significant. Clinical rotation is provided within the curriculum, which can support development of clinical skills. However, assessment methods are not specific in some clinical disciplines and may not ensure achievement of course learning outcomes.

Overall the study program is comprehensive, and contains all necessary elements for medical training. Graduates of the program can have enough knowledge and skills to continue studies on the next level.

The educational program was developed by engagement of academic and invited personnel. The designed educational program was reviewed by the Quality Management and Strategic Development Service. The academic personnel and the students were actively involved in the development of study outcomes with participation of employers.

The university have several memoranda which would contribute to the quality of the programme offering partner institution service to the students having clinical or research rotations.

The admission criteria are adequate, transparent and publicly available. Courses in the study programme include traditional forms of teaching. Practical work will be carried out in specialized classrooms in the completely new building of the university and in hospital-type health institutions. The mechanisms for monitoring and follow up of medical students during the rotations are in place. Academic student support is adequate, detailed and diverse. Teachers do allocate consultation hours for students.

The responsible professors of the study program are involved in research projects. TOTU has a research center, which funds research and support students to present their results at the conferences. Nevertheless, student research involvement needs further stimulation, since invited teachers doesn't include students in their projects. The Department of International Relations of the University provides the students with a possibility to participate in international programs and projects

University is well equipped with modern teaching technology, computers and other teaching aids. The premises are new and provide more than enough room for the provision of the study program. All necessary educational materials have been purchased to ensure the proper implementation of the program and students can have access to modern literature and scientific research publications within this university.

Teachers of the TOTU are generally highly motivated. The workload of teachers is adequate but for some teachers is rather big, since they lead several courses. The university should hire more stuff. Teachers are experts of their field and make publications in relative scientific area. University is organizing meetings, trainings, as well as visits to foreign universities etc. to support staff's professional development, however teachers would benefit from modern pedagogical courses organized by the University, dealing with student centred learning methodology.

Structural units of the TOTU is monitoring implementation of the programs. The QA Service mechanisms and structure are well planned and follow the all standards and directives.

The program is sustainable, since the new, modern, well equipped building is the own property of university and considering its capacity and current state presented financial plan is feasible.

Summary of Recommendations

- The objectives of the study program are based on knowledge only and our recommendation is that these objectives should be reformulated.
- The objectives and the learning outcomes should be redefined and rewritten so that they match NQF descriptors.
- The staff need training on the significance, function and measurement of achievement of learning outcomes.
-
- Implementation of innovative clinical/practical skills assessment methods (e.g. OSCE) is recommended.
-
- University should hire more academic stuff to ensure successful realization of the programme.
- The staff should have training on establishing learning outcomes and preparing Self Evaluation Report.
- Teachers need formal education in teaching methodology organized by the University.

Summary of Suggestions

- The University should make a list of free elective courses throughout the study programs.
- It would be useful to make a comprehensive database of all students and graduates and follow-up the graduates' careers
-
- The university may further develop structure of quality assurance procedures and guidelines and make it publicly available, the students and employers should be represented in those management and program development/evaluation bodies.
- It would be useful to include test examples/assessment criteria of Chemistry, Biology and Physics on the web page for foreign students.
- Students' independent work under the mentor supervision should be emphasized and encouraged.
- Student centered learning methodology courses should be organized for the teachers in order to assure achievement of learning outcomes.
- To allow certain pre-orientation of students, the number of elective subjects need to be extended gradually on the long run.
- The students could not choose the free courses from other study programs. The University leaders may probably think about this issue.
- Syllabi of the courses should also include clear information about consultation schedule of the teacher.
- Inclusion of students in research projects should be better stimulated. University must find ways to increase engagement of invited personal in student research. Introduction of small thesis/research paper would be a good way to train students in medical research.
- The hope is that the building will be fully equipped until the beginning of the program.

Summary of best practices (If Applicable)

- They have the students' representative who is involved in the board;
- Learning Process Management Department has Open Door Days annually;
- The Tbilisi Open University have research center involving students;
- Excellent facilities and equipment;
- The SWOT analysis.

In case of accredited programme, summary of significant accomplishments and/or progress (If Applicable)

Not applicable

Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards

1. Educational programme objectives, learning outcomes and their compliance with the programme

1.1 Programme objectives are clearly defined and achievable; they are consistent with the mission of the HEI and take into consideration labour market demands
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ According to the mission of TOTU program of “medicine” has the following objectives... “to prepare a citizen equipped with education, skills, high civic self-consciousness, national consciousness and liberal values relevant for the global employment market, knowledge-based economy and civil society requirements”.... with intentions to assure knowledge of basic natural as well as behavioral and social sciences. University has considered labor market demands and objectives are achievable, however the outcome would also be clinical (diagnostic and therapeutic) skills, knowledge of the public health system and ethical and legal principles. The aim and the learning outcomes of the courses are sometimes incomplete and doesn't comply with NQF descriptors.
Evidences/indicators <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Program of the course ○ Self-evaluation report
Recommendations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The objectives of the study program are based on knowledge only and our recommendation is that they should be reformulated ○ The objectives and the learning outcomes should be redefined and rewritten so they match NQF descriptors. ○ The staff need training on the significance, function and measurement of achievement of learning outcomes.
Suggestions for programme development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
Best Practices (if applicable): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ They have the students' representative who is involved in the board
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
Evaluation <div style="margin-left: 20px;"> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements </div>

☒ Partly complies with requirements

☐ Does not comply with requirements

1.2 The content of a programme component (a course, a module, etc.) ensures the achievement of the objectives and student learning outcomes of the component, considering the number of credit hours allocated for it and teaching methods utilized

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

- Components of the program are aimed at achieving the goals set by the programme and forming competences. The logical sequence of the formation and the evolution of the competences defines the contents and structures of the programme. After analyzing of the syllabi and the table of ECTS distribution within teaching plan of Programme it seems that the ECTS points are equally distributed throughout the semesters, and that the distribution of ECTS through the subjects is adequate to content of the courses. There are no significant overlapping and duplications of contents among the courses.
- Teaching methods used are: Discussion / Debate, Demonstration method, Explanatory method, Case analysis, Cooperative training, etc. Assessment methods are not specific in some courses (especially in clinical disciplines) and may not ensure achievement of course learning outcomes. Assessment methods of clinical/practical skills should be more effectively introduced.

Evidences/indicators

- Program of Medicine Open Teaching University
- Medicine plan Open Teaching University
- Syllabi Open Teaching University
- Syllabi Electives Open Teaching University
- Site visit interviews

Recommendations:

- More effective assessment methods of clinical/practical skills must be used within clinical components of the program.

Suggestions for programme development:

- None

Best Practices (if applicable):

- Not applicable

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

- Not applicable

Evaluation

<input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partly complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements
1.3 Programme components ensure the achievement of programme objectives and student learning outcomes of the appropriate level of qualification in the National Qualifications Framework
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ In materials provided by TOTU there is comprehensive table of ECTS distribution. Distribution and arrangement of study courses in study plan of the program is sequential and chronological. Clinical rotation is provided within the curriculum, which can support development of clinical skills. According to the curriculum of the program it seems that it ensures the achievement of the objectives and student learning outcomes. Educational program in Medicine is divided in 12 semesters. The structure of the program is based on ECTS system, and includes 360 credits, out of what 310 credits are for mandatory components, 10 credits for Georgian language, 15 credits for free teaching courses, 10 for university mandatory training courses, and 5 for electives. The ECTS distribution is adequate. The course and ECTS distribution was done as a team effort at Medical Board meeting. Teachers have freedom to change the courses. ○ Overall the study program is comprehensive, and contains all necessary elements for medical training. However, the number of free elective courses is neglectable. Namely, student can choose only one out of four elective courses: Introduction in Philosophy, Introduction in Psychology, Introduction in Sociology, Introduction in Politology, but two of them, psychology and sociology are mandatory parts of almost every European curriculum in medicine. Suggestion than would be to find room in mandatory part of the program and offer some parts of specialized courses as electives for students who would like to learn more from some specific field. Then Philosophy and Politology one can offer as facultative courses. Term "facultative" is accepted for the courses one may take or not, and not usually bringing credits. Term "elective" is reserved for courses one has to choose among several available to earn certain number of credits.
Evidences/indicators <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Study plan of Open Teaching University ○ Syllabi Open Teaching University
Recommendations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
Suggestions for programme development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The University should make a list of free elective courses throughout the study programs.
Best Practices (if applicable):

<input type="radio"/> Not applicable
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
<input type="radio"/> Not applicable
Evaluation
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partly complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements
1.4 Programme learning outcomes ensure the competitiveness of its graduates on educational (at the next level of education) and labour markets
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements <ul style="list-style-type: none"> After completion of the one-cycle educational program the graduates have possibility to continue studies in residency or doctorate. Students can continue professional development at the training program of residency (or equivalent training program abroad approved by the legislation of the country in concern) and after successfully passing the unified state certification exam be awarded the right of independent professional activity. Program graduates can work as a junior physician or deal with the research and teaching activities in theoretical fields of medicine or other fields of health care that don't involve independent medical practice. Graduates of the program can have enough knowledge and skills to continue studies on the next level. The interviews with the students from other programs showed that employability of the university graduates is good and most of the university students find job in the country. The interviews with alumni showed that many graduates also continue study/work abroad. E.g. university has tight cooperation with Chinese university, which gives opportunities for students to study/work in China. University provides the students and graduates with career Support and closely cooperates with alumni. It is essential to make a comprehensive database of all students and graduates and follow-up the graduates' careers. The Center for Career Development consists with 5 members. They make the contacts between the employers, students and alumni and follow alumni careers after the graduation.
Evidences/indicators
<input type="radio"/> Self-evaluation report 1.4
Recommendations:
<input type="radio"/> None
Suggestions for programme development:
<input type="radio"/> It would be useful to make a comprehensive database of all students and graduates and

follow-up the graduates' careers
Best Practices (if applicable):
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
Evaluation
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

1.5. The mechanism of stakeholders' (employers, academic staff, students, graduates) participation in the establishment of programme learning outcomes and programme development, is established and implemented
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The educational program was developed by engagement of academic and invited personnel. The designed educational program was reviewed (compliance with legislation and internal university regulations) by the Quality Management and Strategic Development Service. The academic personnel and the students were actively involved in the development of study outcomes with participation of employers. Students, academic staff and employers are regularly surveyed in the university. Information about strengths and weaknesses, expectations and needs of the program is collected by this mean. During the site-visit employers were interviewed who confirmed their engagement in the program development. Nevertheless, employers should be even more involved in the future periodic evaluation of the study program learning outcomes and the results of the student assessment process on the basis of the university regulations. ○ The university have several memoranda formed with the respective institutions which would contribute to the quality of the programme offering their service to the students having clinical or research rotations. Additionally, employers that have signed memoranda with the university have expressed their willingness to pursue graduate internships with the prospect of their further employment.
Evidences/indicators <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Self-evaluation report ○ Site-visit Interviews with employers, graduates, students, academic staff.
Recommendations:

<input type="radio"/> None
Suggestions for programme development: <input type="radio"/> The university may further develop structure of quality assurance procedures and guidelines and make it publicly available, the students and employers should be represented in those management and program development/evaluation bodies.
Best Practices (if applicable): <input type="radio"/> Not applicable
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress <input type="radio"/> Not applicable
Evaluation <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partly complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Educational programme objectives, learning outcomes and their compliance with the programme		X	

2. Teaching methodology and organization, adequate evaluation of programme mastering

2.1. Programme admission preconditions are transparent and ensure the admission of students of relevant knowledge, skills and values necessary to master programme learning outcomes
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements <input type="radio"/> The admission criteria are adequate, transparent and publicly available. There are two criteria for the acceptance of students: For Georgian students, unified national examination. Foreign students are admitted after confirmation of English language knowledge which should comply with B2 level. Additionally students will be tested in the natural sciences (Physics, Chemistry, Biology) in which the person has to overcome a minimum competency level. The University website provides information about enrollment

<p>prerequisites, program goals, assessment methods, and names of the academic and invited personnel. Interested individuals can receive consultations from contact persons in the university or persons presented in the university catalogue, and can obtain additional information about employment prospects and perspectives for continuing education, etc. to make a choice. They expect 30 students from Georgia and 30 from abroad.</p>
<p>Evidences/Indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Self-evaluation report ○ Educational Program
<p>Recommendations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
<p>Suggestions for programme development:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ It would be usefull to include test examples/assessment criteria of Chemistry, Biology and Physics on the web page for foreing students.
<p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
<p>In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
<p>Evaluation</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>

2.2 Teaching methods utilized in various components of the programme ensure the achievement of programme learning outcomes

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

- Courses in the study programme carried out by the TOTU include lectures, seminars and exercises as traditional forms of teaching. Practical work will be carried out in specialized classrooms in the completely new building of the TOTU (laboratories, dissection rooms, classrooms with microscopes, computer labs, cabinets for clinical skills), in a clinical setting (hospital-type health institutions - contracted clinical sites of the University, health centres, departments of emergency medicine) and in the field. From student surveys and interviews with former students from programs other than Medicine, it was noticed a lack of independent students' work under the supervision of a mentor, as one of the methods of practical work which takes students even closer to the real task awaiting them upon the

<p>completion of the study programme. Teachers would also benefit from modern pedagogical courses organized by the University, dealing with student centred learning methodology. Otherwise, the University is up to standards in this regard, and it should continue to benchmark internationally.</p>
<p>Evidences/Indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Self-evaluation report ○ Site visit ○ Interviews
<p>Recommendations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
<p>Suggestions for programme development:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Students' independent work under the mentor supervision should be emphasized and encouraged. ○ Student centered learning methodology courses should be organized for the teachers in order to assure achievement of learning outcomes.
<p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
<p>In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
<p>Evaluation</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>

2.3 The sequence and admission preconditions of programme components are logical

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

- Curriculum composition is clear and precise. The sequence of courses appears logical with fundamental subjects such as physics, chemistry and biology at the beginning and more specialized (clinical) subjects in higher semesters with no overlapping. Five elective subjects are foreseen in the program out of what student has to choose one. Course prerequisites are set logically.

Evidences/indicators

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Medicine plan Open Teaching University ○ Program Medicine Open teaching University
Recommendations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
Suggestions for programme development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ To allow certain pre-orientation of students, the number of elective subjects need to be extended gradually on the long run.
Best Practices (if applicable): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

<p>2.4 The evaluation methods of each programme component ensures the achievement of student learning outcomes of this component, which is proved by evaluation results</p>
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ As learning outcomes are not properly stated it is very difficult to assess them properly. From discussion with students and teachers during site visit it became clear that assessment procedures are based more on assessment of knowledge, although the assessment system is detailed. Innovative approaches such as OSCE and others hasn't been mentioned.
Evidences/Indicators <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ SER ○ Interview ○ Site visit
Recommendations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Implementation of innovative clinical/practical skills assessment methods (e.g. OSCE) is recommended.
Suggestions for programme development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None

Best Practices (if applicable): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

2.5 Student evaluation criteria are transparent; students are informed about the achievement of learning outcomes, their gaps and ways for improvement
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The TOTU prepared information booklets on assessment system. Web site of the University provide students with information on enrolment in the study program, the application and classification procedure, the rights and obligations of students, teaching methods, examination methods, provisions on enrolment in the next year of study, grading and the right to appeals to grades, graduation and other provisions which are in accordance with standards. Also, manager is giving information about student achievement. Students think that the examination system is fair.
Evidences/indicators <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Program Medicine Open Teaching University ○ Interview ○ Site visit
Recommendations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
Suggestions for programme development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
Best Practices (if applicable): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Learning Process management Department has Open Door Days annually.
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable

Evaluation

- ☒ Complies with requirements
- ☐ Partially complies with requirements
- ☐ Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Teaching methodology and organization, adequate evaluation of programme mastering	X		

3. Student achievements and individual work with them

3.1 Students receive appropriate consultations and support regarding the determination of their profile, planning of learning process and improvement of their academic achievement

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

- The mechanisms for monitoring and follow up of medical students during the rotations are in place. Academic student support is adequate, detailed and diverse although there is no institutionalized Center and Students Services. Students can informally talk with the dean, administration, and professors. The managers are also having support for the students and the University provide support for the international students.
- At the meeting with students the group of students of the study programs different than Medicine were present. There was a mix between students at earlier and later stages of the study programs. All students gave a highly motivated and open-minded impression to the panel of experts. Although the workload for study program was considered to be high by the students, it was generally felt feasible to study the programs. All students were confident that they would find jobs immediately after graduation.

Evidences/Indicators

- Site visit
- Interviews

Recommendations:

- None

Suggestions for programme development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The students could not choose the free courses from other study programs. The University leaders may probably think about this issue.
Best Practices (if applicable): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

3.2 Academic staff workload scheme includes individual work with students
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ During the site visit and interviews we learned that teachers do allocate consultation hours for students. Contact information of the lecturers are indicated in syllabi, however the information regarding individual work scheme is not clearly given.
Evidences/Indicators <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Syllabi Open Teaching University ○ Syllabi Electives Open Teaching University ○ Site visit ○ Interview
Recommendations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
Suggestions for programme development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Syllabi of the courses should also include clear information about consultation schedule of the teacher.
Best Practices (if applicable): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable

<p>Evaluation</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>
<p>3.3 The institution supports students' involvement in research projects and extra-curricular activities, and also offers them components developing practical skills</p>
<p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The responsible professors of the study program are involved in research projects. The Tbilisi Open University has a research center. The Center funds research and support students to present their results at the conferences. Students are occasionally involved in these research activities but the student research is not stimulated enough yet, since invited teachers doesn't include students in research, especially not in clinical research. ○ According to the interview with the students they were satisfied with their extra-curricular activities. They participate in scientific conferences. ○ Students have been provided the opportunity to participate in international mobility programs, including bilateral exchange program with China.
<p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Self-Evaluation Report of the Tbilisi Open Teaching University ○ Site visit ○ Interviews
<p>Recommendations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
<p>Suggestions for programme development:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Inclusion of students in research projects should be better stimulated. University must find ways to increase engagement of invited personal in student research. Introduction of small thesis/research paper would be a good way to train students in medical research.
<p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The Tbilisi Open University have research center involving students also.
<p>In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
<p>Evaluation</p>

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements
3.4 The institution aims to internationalize its teaching and scientific work as well as the employability of its graduates
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The Tbilisi Open Teaching University has good international relations using some European (Polish, Romanian, Bulgarian, even Slovenian) as well as Chinese models in developing programs. ○ English medium of the program is guaranteeing at some extend internationalization of the studies. University plans to recruit international students. ○ The Department of International Relations of the University provides the students and the academic staff with a possibility to participate in international programs and projects.
Evidences/indicators <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Self-Evaluation Report of the Tbilisi Open Teaching University ○ Site visit ○ Interviews
Recommendations; <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
Suggestions for programme development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
Best Practices (if applicable): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
Evaluation <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Student achievements and individual work with them	X		

4. Providing teaching resources

4.1 The infrastructure and technical equipment of the institution ensures the achievement of programme learning outcomes
<p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The Tbilisi Open Teaching University just moved in the huge, completely new modern building. During the site visit the members of the expert panel were surprised with lecturer rooms very well equipped with modern teaching technology, plenty of computers and other teaching aids. The premises are new and provide more than enough room for the provision of the study program. The laboratory equipment, what panel of expert saw during the site visit was not complete (anatomy especially) and have to be further improved. Also, library was in the middle of moving. Agreement with clinics is there but some issues are still in process regarding quality assurance. The university rely on the infrastructure and highly qualified staff to attract the students. Clinics and laboratories with invited teachers are open for students, since there is agreement with the university. ○ Library of the Tbilisi Open Teaching University is located in a first floor of the university new building with user open space, open access to bookshelves and a reading room with a lot of seating positions that are equipped with computers connected to the integrated library system <i>openbiblio</i> (at http://www.openuni.edu.ge/openbiblio) and is available for any user. All necessary educational materials have been purchased to ensure the proper implementation of the program. In self-valuation report there is long list of journal collections, library associations and scientific bases university is contracted with. The panel experts saw the library in the process of moving in, not being in order yet. This will be improved when the university library is completely transferred from previous old building. The University has signed a memorandum with the Ilia Chavchavadze National Library of Parliament of Georgia. With this memorandum the University will benefit from the National Library's exhibition and conference rooms and the library interchange.
<p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Site visit ○ Interviews

Recommendations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="radio"/> None
Suggestions for programme development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="radio"/> The hope is that the building will be fully equipped until the beginning of the program.
Best Practices (if applicable): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="radio"/> Excellent facilities and equipment.
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="radio"/> Not applicable
Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

4.2 Programme staff has necessary competences required for the achievement of intended learning outcomes of the component they teach, which is proved by-in case of academic staff- scientific papers written during the past 10 years (in arts field- creative projects) proving staff's competence in the relevant field; in case of invited staff -may be certified by practical experience

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

- ☐ As it is seen from syllabi from the programme of Medicine of the Tbilisi Open University have altogether 20 employed teachers (11 full professors, 9 associate professors, and 2 assistant- professors), 1 visiting professor and 47 invited staff. During the site visit, the university administration stated that by law teaching staff should have PhD degree. Teachers of the TOTU are generally highly motivated. Lectures are generally judged as good and the didactic tools appropriate. The workload of teachers is adequate but for some teachers is rather big, since they lead 4-5 courses. Some of the staff have many courses not only in this university. The university should hire more staff.
- ☐ The University does not have strict criteria considering scientific production for promotions and re-elections in the same position. Currently, teachers are elected primarily based on teaching experience. Indicators of performance for teachers are in documentation.
- ☐ University Structural Units - International Relations Service - provides the involvement of the academic personnel in the international programs and projects. The university issues a scientific journal Intellect where the academic/invited personnel of the institution publish academic papers/work.
- ☐ Teachers are experts of their field and make publications in relative scientific area,

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The possibilities for teachers for further development and promotion are good and applicable also to other universities. Teachers haven't formal education in teaching methodology, except one of them, who was engaged in Medical Academy.
Evidences/Indicators <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Self-Evaluation Report Open Teaching University ○ Legal acts of the university
Recommendations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ University should hire more academic staff to ensure successful realization of the programme. ○ The staff should have training on learning outcomes and Self Evaluation Report. ○ Teachers need formal education in teaching methodology organized by the University
Suggestions for programme development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
Best Practices (if applicable): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

<p>4.3 Programme implementation is ensured by the administrative and support staff of an appropriate competence</p>
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Structural units of the Tbilisi Open Teaching University is monitoring implementation of the programs. University is organizing methodological meetings, trainings, as well as visits to foreign universities etc. to support staff's professional development. Also, the University has adequate agreements for the provisions of the study program, and the Board has to approve every major change. Between the university and the students here is provider to facilitate mutual communication. ○ During the site-visit, the administrative staff involved were well-informed, cooperative and

provided all necessary data requested by the experts team.
Evidences/Indicators <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Self-Evaluation Report Open Teaching University ○ University Structural Units ○ Interviews
Recommendations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
Suggestions for programme development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
Best Practices (if applicable): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

4.4 Teaching materials are based on the core achievements in the field and ensure the achievement of intended learning outcomes
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Materials needed for teaching/learning process are available for the students at the library book fund, electronic internet resources. University also provides students with hard copies of the electronic books. During the site visit we were convinced, that students can have access to modern literature and scientific research publications within this university.
Evidences/Indicators <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Self-Evaluation Report Open Teaching University ○ Site visit
Recommendations:

<input type="radio"/> None
Suggestions for programme development:
<input type="radio"/> None
Best Practices (if applicable):
<input type="radio"/> None
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
<input type="radio"/> Not applicable
Evaluation
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements
<input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements
<input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

4.5 Programme is financially sustainable
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements
<input type="radio"/> The program is sustainable, since the new, modern, well equipped building is their property. During the site visit the panel of experts received a summary of financial plan of the program for the year 2016-2027 based on 30+30 students. Some 3000 EU per student will give roughly 180000 EU what will be enough for the full implementation of the curriculum, salaries, scientific papers, extracurricular activities, buying books for the library, facilitating research activities and students' small-scale educational-scientific work, arranging student scientific conferences, publishing student conference papers. High quality teachers are contributing to stable situation.
<input type="radio"/> Considering capacity and current state of the university presented financial plan is feasible.
Evidences/indicators
<input type="radio"/> Self-Evaluation Report Open Teaching University
<input type="radio"/> Financial plan
Recommendations:
<input type="radio"/> None
Suggestions for programme development:
<input type="radio"/> None
Best Practices (if applicable):

<input type="radio"/> Not applicable
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
<input type="radio"/> Not applicable
Evaluation <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Providing teaching resources	X		

5. Teaching quality enhancement opportunities

5.1 There is a publicly available quality assurance system which is based on the "Plan-Do-Check-Act" cycle
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Quality Assurance Service ensures the quality of learning and the compliance with standards of the educational program and the learning courses. The unit conducts an assessment of the quality assurance mechanisms and structure are well planned and follow the all standards and directives same like those of ENQA (European Network for Quality Assurance). Monitoring of quality of the study process is carried out by Quality Assurance Service, using common PDCA principle. Collected data on educational program, the syllabus, the educational process and the university's material-technical resources, and anonymous inquiries of students, the academic personnel, alumni and employers of the educational program are used to continuously improve the quality of the program. The Open Teaching University has very good relations with former students, according to information from alumni of Management Program. They are typical example of what the university has to do with and for their alumni. One may only hope, that it will be the case with medical students too. The Quality Assurance Service was involved in development of educational program and ensures the quality of learning and the compliance with standards of the educational program and the learning courses. The unit conducts an assessment of the educational program, as well as the syllabus of the learning courses, the educational process and the

<p>university's material-technical resources via anonymous inquiries of students, the academic personnel, alumni and employers of the educational program.</p>
<p>Evidences/Indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="radio"/> Self-Evaluation Report Open Teaching University <input type="radio"/> Legal acts of the university <input type="radio"/> Interview
<p>Recommendations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="radio"/> None
<p>Suggestions for programme development:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="radio"/> None
<p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="radio"/> Not applicable
<p>In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="radio"/> Not applicable
<p>Evaluation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

<p>5.2 Internal and external quality assurance results are utilized to improve the achievement of programme learning outcomes</p>
<p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="radio"/> University administration did the SWOT analysis, showing possibilities and problems in running institution. One of the problems identified in the SWOT is the possibility of not getting enough Georgian students. Teachers are involved in quality assurance by self-evaluation or fill-in any kind of questionnaires. They discuss results with the board. Questionnaires for students, for teachers and for administrative personnel are provided two times in semester. <input type="radio"/> External quality assurance of the program did not take place up to date.

Evidences/indicators <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Self-Evaluation Report Open Teaching University ○ Legal acts of the university ○ Interview
Recommendations; <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
Suggestions for programme development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ None
Best Practices (if applicable): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The SWOT analysis
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Not applicable
Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Teaching quality enhancement opportunities	X		

Enclosed Documentation (If Applicable)

HEI's Name: Tbilisi Open Teaching University

Higher Education Programme Name: Medicine (English Language)

Number of Pages of the Report: 28

Programme's Compliance with the Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
1. Programme objectives are clearly defined and achievable; they are consistent with the mission of the HEI and take into consideration labor market demands		X	
2. Teaching methodology and organization, adequate evaluation of programme mastering	X		
3. Student achievements and individual work with them	X		
4. Providing teaching resources	X		
5. Teaching quality enhancement opportunities	X		
Final Evaluation	X		

Expert Panel Chair's Signature:

Aleksandar Jovanovic

HEI's Name: Tbilisi Open Teaching University

Higher Education Programme Name: Medicine (English Language)

Number of Pages of the Report: 28

Programme's Compliance with the Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
1. Programme objectives are clearly defined and achievable; they are consistent with the mission of the HEI and take into consideration labour market demands		X	
2. Teaching methodology and organization, adequate evaluation of programme mastering	X		
3. Student achievements and individual work with them	X		
4. Providing teaching resources	X		
5. Teaching quality enhancement opportunities	X		
Final Evaluation	X		

Expert Panel Member's Signature:

Aleksander Ivanov

guf

G. G. G. G.

guf

guf

guf