



განათლების ხარისხის განვითარების ეროვნული ცენტრი
NATIONAL CENTER FOR EDUCATIONAL QUALITY ENHANCEMENT

Accreditation Expert Group Report on Programme of Medicine

Tbilisi Humanitarian Teaching University

Date(s) of Evaluation - 07.09.2017

Report Submission Date

Tbilisi
2017

სსიპ-განათლების ხარისხის განვითარების ეროვნული ცენტრი
შემოსული № _____
_____ 20 ____ წ.
ღანაძიძე: _____

HEI's Information Profile

Name of Institution Indicating its Organizational Legal Form	LLC Tbilisi Humanitarian Teaching University Limited Liability Company
HEI's Identification Code	206046045
Type of Institution	Teaching University

Higher Education Programme Information Profile

Name of the Programme	Medicine
Level of Education	<i>One cycle</i>
Qualification Granted Indicating Qualification Code	Medical Doctor (MD) / 090101
Language of Instruction	English
Number of Credits	360
Programme Status (Authorized/ Accredited/New)	New

Expert Panel Members

Chair (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Prof. Aleksandar Jovanovic, University of Pristina/K.Mitrovica, Serbia
Member (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Prof. Zvonko Sosic, University of Zagreb, Croatia
Member (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Prof. Nato Alavidze, Faculty of Medicine, at Akaki Tsereteli State University, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Prof. Ivane Abiatari, Ilia State University, Georgia
Member (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Prof. Irakli Gagua, Employer/ a Head of Gagua Clinic
Member (Name, Surname, University/organization/Country)	Mr. Rudiko Rusia, Georgia Medical Student Association, Georgia

Accreditation Report Executive Summary

▪ **General information on the education programme**

The one cycle Higher Medical Educational Program "Medicine" with the English language of instruction is offered by THTU. The program aims at preparing internationally competitive and qualified Medical Doctors with relevant skills and practical experience, whose task is to protect human health with the help of internationally recognized standards and ethical norms.

The program consists of 360 credits, 60 credits – per year, 30 credits – per semester. 351 are appointed for courses (among them 30 (ECTS) credits for general courses; 98 (ECTS) credits basic medico-biological courses; 212 (ECTS) credits for clinical courses including; 27 (ECTS) credits for developing clinical skills. 11 (ECTS) credits for developing scientific skills) and 9 for elective courses.

The program is supported with the correspondent technical and human resources, the same program in Georgian language is accredited at THTU, though the first cohort of students is expected this year. The university has been running the program of Stomatology for 14 years, which means that academic staff and practical providers and clinicians are experienced.

The decision to establish this program was based on the university's own labor market research in Georgia and neighboring countries and the study conducted by the ministry of Education and Science of Georgia.

▪ **Brief overview of the accreditation site-visit**

The site-visit took place on the 7TH of September in accordance with the procedures and the agenda offered by NCEQE and agreed with the institution. During the site visit the following meetings took place- a meeting with the administration, self-evaluation team, faculty; invited teachers, internship supervisors; alumni; University and the Faculty QA Service representatives, Potential employers.

During the site visit there was the opportunity to observe the facilities.

▪ **Summary of education programme's compliance with the standards**

In general, the study program is compliant with the accreditation standards and Medicine Sector Benchmark requirements and NQF.

The aim of the program is clearly defined. The study program learning outcomes are well defined. The syllabi are well written, the learning outcomes, teaching methodology and assessment methods are aligned with each other. Study Program learning outcomes are aligned with the NQF descriptors.

The Program was designed based on Market research and aims to recruit both Georgian and foreign students specifically from Azerbaijan, Ukraine or other neighboring countries and not only.

Course learning outcomes were written in an acceptable manner; learning and assessment methodology are diverse and they are all already implemented in other study programs provided by the University. The admission criteria are clear, well-formed and transparent and comply with the legal requirements, as well as assessment / examination criteria for the students. All of those are publicly available and accessible. Course sequence is logical and no overlapping between courses and/or course topics occurs. The teaching staff, including invited lectures, fulfill legal criteria to become university teachers.

The introduction of the final thesis is a good step toward training medical students for future research in the field of medicine.

The expert panel found it difficult to evaluate students' achievements of learning outcomes and individual work, as the program does not yet have students though some other students from other medical programs within the same institution were interviewed and taken as evidence that the students' needs are met. The students were generally satisfied with their administrative and academic staff. They evaluated the staff as competent and helpful. The introduction of the final thesis is the good step towards training medical students in the fields of medical research.

While the facilities and classrooms are adequate, the library and laboratories need to be improved. Furthermore, the University have the signed operative agreements with several clinics and training institutions which guarantee a good practical skills training for the students of this Study Program.

Quality assurance unit is responsible for enhancing the quality of teaching and learning with corresponding mechanisms and procedures. The procedures are structured and followed.

▪ **Summary of Recommendations**

- Students should be provided with additional training in laboratory skills (not only demonstrations), they are important for a full and quality medical education. A system should also be put in place to evaluate students' laboratory skills.
- The Study program provides a proper set of competencies. However, the involvement of students in research projects should be further stimulated though the program. Students expressed their interest in it as well.
- Laboratories (chemical, microbiology, biochemistry) and library fund (e.g. printed books fund) should be improved.

▪ **Summary of Suggestions**

- The University should find a means to encourage and stimulate students' research. This includes small research competitive budget for the students, creation of students' peer reviewed journal for students' publications. The students' conference participations and

publications should be awarded with extra ECTS points. Invited lectures may greatly help in including students in research activities.

- The Study Program should increase the palette of the elective courses so they provide not only a deeper knowledge but also a wider knowledge. The list of free elective courses from other study programmes. The University should make the common electronic base of free choosing elective courses and make them available for the students from all study programs.
- The periodic review and constructive alignment of the learning outcomes should be introduced as an important quality assurance method.
- The number of elective courses might be increased.
- Student career support service should be formalized.
- The Students' and Graduates' Career Support should make a comprehensive database of all students and graduates, closely cooperate with alumni and follow-up the graduates' careers.
- The University may further define structural bodies responsible for the quality assurance, and development of study program and the procedures and manuals and documentation and make it publicly available; the students should be represented in those management and program development/evaluation bodies.
- The Study Program may benefit from bridging courses for the selected foreign students during the summer, based on the result of the post-admission initial test.
- The teachers would benefit from modern pedagogical courses organized by the University, dealing with student centered learning methodology.
- The bilateral and Erasmus exchange in order to train teachers in new learning/research methodologies should be planned and encouraged.
- In the future, it is desirable that the Study Program align each of the course learning outcomes with the specific teaching methodology used to achieve each learning outcome and the specific assessment method used to evaluate the achievement of this learning outcome.
- The students should be provided with a wider selection of elective courses, as this is important in developing the students in not only medical knowledge but also in fields they find interesting and may be involved in, in the future.
- Research/laboratory equipment may be further improved.
- The University should install and develop a comprehensive learning management system and put all the teaching/learning and examination preparation materials, and other formative achievements and results in a comprehensive electronic base, along with the evidence of students' attendance.

- The University should encourage the students to find national and international internships outside the partner facilities.
 - The Study Program should provide a list with the teachers' research areas so the students may become interested and participate in research.
 - The University should set strict criteria for promotions and re-elections in the teaching positions.
 - The data on students' representation in Quality Assurance and Management bodies should be better documented.
 - The feedback from the clinics and institution providing practice trainings to the faculty about the students practice and improvement of the study program should be institutionalized.
 - The University should form a comprehensive database of all alumni/graduates and follow their careers.
- **Summary of best practices (If Applicable)**
 - Individual work with students is encouraged and this could be seen as a strong pillar of learning within this HEI
- **In case of accredited programme, summary of significant accomplishments and/or progress (If Applicable)**

N/A

Compliance of the Programme with Accreditation Standards

1. Educational programme objectives, learning outcomes and their compliance with the programme

1.1 Programme objectives are clearly defined and achievable; they are consistent with the mission of the HEI and take into consideration labour market demands

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The aim of the one-cycle higher English language Medical educational program is to prepare internationally competitive and a qualified specialist and to prepare a qualified person with medical education, relevant skills and practical experience, whose task is to protect human health with the help of internationally recognized standards and ethical norms. The aim of the study program follows National Qualification Framework Descriptors for the second cycle of higher education and Medicine Sector Benchmark learning outcomes for one-cycle education program in medicine. Program objectives comply with the mission of the university and labour market demands. The analysis of Labor Market needs was provided by the THTU and program is in compliance with them.

The program learning outcomes provided in the Self – Evaluation Report (here and after – SER) are properly written. There are six categories of descriptors relevant to the second cycle of higher education: Knowledge and understanding, Applying knowledge, Making judgments, Communication skills, Learning skills and Values. Since the learning outcomes of the One-cycle Education Program in Medicine, as stated in the Medicine Sector Benchmark are already written in accordance with National Qualification Framework descriptors, it means that: a) they may be a good matrix for writing the learning outcomes of the study program, by addition some program-specific features for each category descriptor b) the future Study-Programs learning outcomes will be well aligned with NQF as well as Sector requirements at the same time.

Evidences/Indicators

- Self– evaluation report (SER)
- National Qualification Framework
- Medicine Sector Benchmark
- University mission
- (<http://thu.edu.ge/%E1%83%9B%E1%83%98%E1%83%A1%E1%83%98%E1%83%90/m283>)

Recommendations:

- N/A

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

- N/A

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

- N/A

Evaluation

○ Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the programmes compliance with this specific component of the standard.

- X Complies with requirements**
- Partially complies with requirements**
- Does not comply with requirements**

1.2 The content of a programme component (a course, a module, etc.) ensures the achievement of the objectives and student learning outcomes of the component, considering the number of credit hours allocated for it and teaching methods utilized

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The content of the educational courses at Tbilisi Humanitarian Teaching University ensures the achievements of learning outcomes of the courses and the program as a whole. The following methods: Verbal and written methods; Discussion/debates Collaborative work; Collaborative learning; Problem Based Learning; Heuristic method; Case study are applied, which is aligned with the students learning outcomes of the component.

The programs are approved by THTU Academic Council decision N 14.02.2017 №03/ and order by the rector of THTU issued on 14.02 N 28/01.

The Program structure is on the basis of ECTS system and covers 360 credits (1 credit accumulates 25 hours of study) – total 9000 hours. Program duration is 24 semesters. The ECTS credits allocation seems to be relevantly distributed.

In order to get the degree 360 ECTS credits are distributed as follows;

351 (ECTS) credits - Compulsory courses, including: 30 (ECTS) credits for general courses;

98 (ECTS) credits basic medico-biological courses;

212 (ECTS) credits for clinical courses including: 27 (ECTS) credits for developing clinical

skills. 11 (ECTS) credits for developing scientific skills. 9 (ECTS) credits – elective learning

courses, the program involves course with the scientific component, which could be considered as one of the strong points of the program, though while interviewing the students the need of encouraging them to participate in research was reflected.

- The students' creative competences - students' research capabilities should be encouraged, since the graduates should be involved in further scientific activities. At the moment, students may participate in the conferences, but are not awarded with any additional points for their efforts – indicating that students' research is viewed rather as some voluntary activity and personal interest than an organized activity supported by the faculty. The students may also benefit from the establishment of inter-university students' scientific journal where the best and articles could be published.

- (1) Educational Program with syllabi;
- (2) Site visit at THU 07.09.2017
- (3) The program structure, curriculum and learning outcomes map
- (4) Appendix N1, N2, N3; Appendix I

Recommendations

- N/A

Suggestions for programme development:

- The University should find a means to encourage and stimulate students' research. This includes small research competitive budget for the students, creation of students' peer reviewed journal for students' publications. The students' conference participations and publications should be awarded with extra ECTS points. Invited lectures may greatly help in including students in research activities.
- The Study Program should increase the pallette of the elective courses so they provide not only a deeper knowledge but also a wider knowledge. The list of free elective courses from other study programmes. The University should make the common electronic base of free choosing elective courses and make them available for the students from all study programs.

Best Practices (if applicable):

- N/A

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

- N/A

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

1.3 Programme components ensure the achievement of programme objectives and student learning outcomes of the appropriate level of qualification in the National Qualifications Framework

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The combination of the educational course envisaged by the one-cycle Higher Educational Medical program at Tbilisi Humanitarian Teaching University ensures the fulfilment of goals and results set by the program in compliance with requirements requested by the Higher Education Qualification Framework. for the one-cycle Higher Medical Educational program. The course learning outcomes are written in an acceptable manner.

The program develops the research skills by the different courses as well as research component. Also internship is provided within the curriculum which ensures the development of clinical/practical skills. The program includes elective courses, but it could be more diverse.

Evidences/indicators

- Educational Program with syllabi;
- Site visit at THU 07.09.2017

Recommendations:**Suggestions for programme development:**

- The number of elective courses might be increased.

Best Practices (if applicable):

- N/A

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

o N/A

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

1.4 Programme learning outcomes ensure the competitiveness of its graduates on educational (at the next level of education) and labour markets

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

According to the regulations the graduate of the program is eligible to: continue education at the third cycle of higher education – doctoral studies at higher educational universities of Georgia as well as at the universities of foreign countries or take professional development at the training program of residency (or equivalent training program abroad approved by the legislation of the country in concern) and after successfully passing the unified state certification exam be awarded the right of independent professional activity.

a) Take a course of postgraduate professional development and after successfully passing the state certification exam be awarded the right of independent professional activity.

b) Work as a junior physician.

c) the program graduate will be able to deal with the research and teaching activities in theoretical fields of medicine or other fields of health care that don't involve independent medical practice.

The University provides the Students' and Graduates' with Career Support for which should provide information on job vacancies, job requirements, necessary documentation for job applications helps international students with orientation and various documentations. However, this service is not formalized. It is also necessary to make a comprehensive database of all students and graduates, closely cooperate with alumni and follow-up the graduates' careers.

- o Additionally, students who are involved in international students' organizations think that they can compete for the international labor market after completing their education at this University.
- o The study about the employability and the interviews showed that employability is good. Most of the University students find job in the country.

Evidences/indicators

- Site visit at THTU 07.09.2017

Recommendations:

- N/A

Suggestions for programme development:

- Student career support service should be formalized.
- The Students' and Graduates' Career Support should make a comprehensive database of all students and graduates, closely cooperate with alumni and follow-up the graduates' careers.
- The students should be provided with a wider selection of elective courses, as this is important in developing the students in not only medical knowledge but also in fields they find interesting and may be involved in, in the future.

Best Practices (If applicable):

- N/A

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

N/A

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

1.5.The mechanism of stakeholders' (employers, academic staff, students, graduates) participation in the establishment of programme learning outcomes and programme development, is established and implemented

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

- The Study Program design, its aim and learning outcomes were based on research performed by the Ministry of Education and Science in the region within the initiative Study in Georgia. The design of the study program was also influenced by the employers from the Georgian health and education institutions. The University have several memoranda formed with the respective institutions which would contribute to the quality of the Program offering their service to the students having internships / rotations / practical classes. In addition, institutions that have signed memoranda with the University have expressed their willingness to pursue graduate internships with the prospect of their further employment.
- The mechanisms for engaging stakeholders in determining the program's learning outcomes and in the program development processes is ensured in the university: needs and demands of stakeholders (students, academic staff, and employers) are regularly surveyed. In addition, students' participation envisages determining student learning outcomes and conducting the student surveys in the process of designing the program. At the end of each semester the students fill out questionnaires that reveal their vision regarding strengths and weaknesses, expectations and needs of the program. Also, during the site-visit one employer was interviewed who mentioned that they or he/she was were involved in the program development. However, employers should be even more involved in the future periodic evaluations of the Study Program learning outcomes and the design of students' assessment (examination) process on the basis of the university regulations (Provisions of Quality Assurance Service), which is described in the Quality Assurance System of the university, with corresponding survey results and recommendations of QA Service.

Evidences/Indicators

- (1) Self-evaluation Report
- (2) Quality Assurance Service Provisions
- (3) Site-visit to THU 07.09.2017
- (4) Interviews with the employers', graduates, students, academic staff

Recommendations:

<p>Suggestions for programme development:</p> <p>The University may further define the structural bodies responsible for the quality assurance, and development of study program and the procedures and manuals and documentation and make it publicly available; the students should be represented in those management and program development/evaluation bodies.</p>
<p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ N/A
<p>In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ N/A
<p>Evaluation</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Educational programme objectives, learning outcomes and their compliance with the programme	X		

2. Teaching methodology and organization, adequate evaluation of programme mastering

2.1. Programme admission preconditions are transparent and ensure the admission of students of relevant knowledge, skills and values necessary to master programme learning outcomes

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

- There are several main prerequisites for the admission on the Study Program. 1. A person, who has complete, general education and possesses a document (certificate), certified by the state or an equivalent and passed the unified national exams according to the rule approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of Georgia has the right to study at one-cycle Certified Medical Doctor program at Tbilisi Humanitarian Educational University. In order to assist prospective students and promote student mobility, the study at the one-cycle Certified Medical Doctor program at Tbilisi Humanitarian Educational University is possible without passing the unified national exams according to the rules and within deadlines approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of Georgia: A) For foreign citizens and stateless persons, who have received full general or equivalent education in a foreign country; though there should be some requirements for the international students that proves there correspondence to the program B) For Georgian citizens who have received full general or equivalent education in a foreign country and have studied in a foreign country for the last 2 years of full general education; C) For persons (except students participating in joint higher education programs and exchange programs), who lived in a foreign country for the last one year or more, have learned/studied and received credits/qualifications in a foreign country's educational establishment. It is mandatory: knowledge of English language at B2 level; possession of the international certificate certifying knowledge of English Language at B2 level (if the prospective student does not have the English language certificate (FCE - First Certificate in English or/etc.), language competence is established through the university examination, minimum barrier - 60%). Prospective students wishing to study the single-level Certified Medical Doctor program shall pass the following exams in: Georgian Language and Literature, general skills and English Language (minimum margin 75%). From optional subjects, the applicant may pass the following elective subjects: Biology/Chemistry. Students who are transferred to the one-cycle Certified Medical Doctor program at Tbilisi Humanitarian Teaching University according to the procedure prescribed by the decree N 10/N of the Minister of Education and Science of Georgia and the University. As the University effort to attract foreign students who wish to study medicine without additional prerequisites aside from the general education and English skills is understandable and justified from the marketing and program sustainability point of view, it also means that the quality and previous competences of students will vary greatly. Therefore, the Study Program may benefit from bridging courses during the summer, based on the result of the initial test after the admission. During the visit, it has been emphasized that the Study Program management has no plans for the bridging courses.

The study Program admission criteria are publicly available, transparent and in accordance with the Georgian Law on Higher Education (article 52, paragraph 3).

Evidences/indicators

- (1) SER,
- (2) Site-visit to THU 07.09.2017

Recommendations:

There should be entrance requirements for international students;
 The Study Program may benefit from bridging courses for the selected foreign students during the summer, based on the result of the post-admission initial test.

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

- o N/A

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

- o N/A

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

2.2 Teaching methods utilized in various components of the programme ensure the achievement of programme learning outcomes

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

- The teaching methodology is diverse and uses a universal and recognized method of teaching, as well as the modern methods of teaching that are recognized internationally in certified medical education such as verbal and written work methods; Method of working on a book; Discussion/debates; Collaborative work; Problem-based learning; Cooperative learning; Heuristic method; Case study; Brainstorming; Demonstration Method. The interview with the students confirmed that most of the intended teaching methods listed in the report are already used in practice with the other study programs at the University. The teaching methods sound appropriate correspondent to learning outcomes. Though the expert panel decided that the teachers would benefit of modern

<p>pedagogical courses organized by the University, dealing with student centered learning methodology.</p>
<p>Evidences/Indicators</p> <p>(1) Program of THU, (2) Self Evaluation of THU (3) Site-visit to THU 07.09. 2017.</p>
<p>Recommendations:</p> <p>○</p>
<p>Suggestions for programme development:</p> <p>○ student centered learning methodology courses should be organized for the teachers in order to assure LOs are better achieved; ○ The bilateral and Erasmus exchange in order to train teachers in new learning/research methodologies should be planned and encouraged</p>
<p>Best Practices (if applicable):</p> <p>○ N/A</p>
<p>In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress</p> <p>○ N/A</p>
<p>Evaluation</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>
<p>2.3 The sequence and admission preconditions of programme components are logical</p>

<p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The sequence of the program of medicine at Tbilisi Humanitarian Educational University and prerequisites for accessing the following components are logical: the students start with general subjects, proceed with general medical subjects and complete the study with specialized clinical courses and clinical practice. During the site-visit, the expert team learned that the content of the courses is quite specified and no overlaps occur.
<p>Evidences/indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The program structure - Appendix N1
<p>Recommendations:</p>
<p>Suggestions for programme development:</p>
<p>Best Practices (If applicable):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ N/A
<p>In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ N/A
<p>Evaluation</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements</p>

2.4 The evaluation methods of each programme component ensures the achievement of student learning outcomes of this component, which is proved by evaluation results

<p>Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ While the primary attention in the SER and Program of Medicine of THU is focused on the summative forms of examination, the criteria of the grading system, the ratio between interim and final exam contribution to the grade (all of which are in accordance with Georgian Law on Higher Education) the experts team has learned that one part -
--

Activities (40% contribution to the final grade) takes in account the formative assessment during the semester, including the quality of the student engagement, their laboratory and clinical skills, quality of participation in debates, discussions, evaluation of clinical/practical skills, group and personal presentations, working in groups, case studies etc. Therefore, the assessment system is well founded, in accordance with legislation and accreditation requirements and takes diverse forms of assessment. Students are generally satisfied with their current examination system.

- In the future, it is desirable that the Study Program provides a comprehensive table of courses with three columns: first, the course learning outcomes, second – the specific teaching methodology used to achieve this learning outcome and third – the specific assessment method used to evaluate the achievement of each specific learning outcome. This way, the Program develops the exact methodology for measuring the achievement of the course learning outcomes via students' assessment/examination results.

Evidences/Indicators

Program of Medicine of THU
Site-visit to THU 07.09. 2017

Recommendations:

-

Suggestions for programme development:

- In the future, it is desirable that each of the course in the Study Program has clear connection of each learning outcomes, corresponding specific teaching methodology and assessment system, and it is clearly documented somewhere in the chart.

Best Practices (if applicable):

- N/A

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

- N/A

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements

Does not comply with requirements

2.5 Student evaluation criteria are transparent; students are informed about the achievement of learning outcomes, their gaps and ways for improvement

Student evaluation criteria are transparent, and clearly stated. The relevant teaching methods are used to assess clinical/ practical skills, Assessment for, rubrics, form is well defined. Students always receive the feedback from the teachers. The assessment system is standardized in the university but the methods of assessment is very specific for the medical education. The clinical practice skills are important and is evaluated properly.

Evidences/indicators

- (1) Program of Medicine of THU, p15
- (2) SER, p15
- (1) Site-visit to THU on Sep.05. 2017.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

- o N/A

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

- o N/A

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Teaching methodology and organization, adequate evaluation of programme mastering	X		

3. Student achievements and individual work with them

3.1 Students receive appropriate consultations and support regarding the determination of their profile, planning of learning process and improvement of their academic achievement

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

For all of the components of standard 3, students from other programs were interviewed due to the fact that the program being completely new.

Students were generally satisfied with the support they got from the university, citing high employability in their future careers and the quality of academic, invited and administrative staff. They deemed the staff as instrumental to their future development and some even retained close contacts with the administration and members of academic staff.

The student will receive information, consultation and assistance needed to determine his/her profile, plan the process and improve achievements, namely, the administration of the Faculty of Health Care, Quality Assurance Service, Training Process Service and Program Manager will systematically provide students with information about training programs, the credit system and will provide consultations.

The members of Academic staff said they were ready to assist their students in any way possible, and the academic staff also showed motivation to teach in the best of their ability. E-mail and telephone communication is also possible. Students can reinstate intermediate exams, conduct presentations; other learning components are evaluated by the criteria set out in the syllabus of the course.

There is a description of educational programs in the University that provides information about programs, qualifications to be awarded, goals, learning outcomes, credits and assessment rules of these educational programs.

The catalogue is published in printed and electronic form and is available to all interested persons at the University library website and University website (<http://thu.edu.ge/pdf/katalog.pdf>). Student have a personalized page (<http://thu.edu.ge/student/>),

where they can receive any necessary and interesting information independently (with a special personal password):

The student's personal profile contains personal information, training card, educational program, syllabus, examination and examination tables, information on financial debts, and his/her status.

The student constantly receives a notification via the mobile phone and necessary information on the learning process and other matters. Facebook became an effective communication and information tool recently – the Facebook page of the University (<https://www.facebook.com/pages/Tbilisi-Humanitarian-University/208171435865449?fref=ts>) has more than 1000 likes and is actively used by students, as well as the academic personnel for educational purposes.

Evidences/Indicators

- Academic Staff Survey Provided.
- Interviews with students and academic and administrative staff,
- University website
- University Facebook page

Recommendations:

N/A

Suggestions for programme development:

N/A

Best Practices (if applicable):

- N/A

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

- N/A

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

3.2 Academic staff workload scheme includes individual work with students

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

The work-load scheme of the University academic personnel envisages individual work. The syllabus contains contact details of the academic personnel (including telephone numbers and emails) and information about weekly consultation hours that are presented in the form of relevant tables.

According to the interviews with the Academic staff and administration individual work with the students is taken into account within the program itself and they are motivated to assist their students in any way possible because the individual working regime facilitates the improvement of communication between students and professors, quality of the education, and creating student-oriented learning environment.

This is backed-up by the Self-evaluation report provided by the university as well as interviews with the students. Students stated that they are satisfied with their individual work with their lecturers and that they may contact them directly after classes or from distance.

Individual work with students is particularly effective in implementing independent curriculum initiatives - preparing and processing topics for students' scientific conferences and publications.

Evidences/indicator

- SER
- Program Syllabi
- Interviews with academic staff and students.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (if applicable):

Individual work with students is encouraged and this could be seen as a strong pillar of learning within this THTU.

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements

Does not comply with requirements

3.3 The institution supports students' involvement in research projects and extra-curricular activities, and also offers them components developing practical skills

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

According to SER the University facilitates students' involvement in the research projects and the components that develop practical skills and initiatives independent from curricula. In order to promote diversity of the students' lives, the University also promotes leisure, cultural and sport events; the self-governance is functioning in the university according to the Law of Georgia on High Education, the University Statute and Self-Government Regulations.

Conferences, exhibitions, public lectures, trainings for students promoting their professional development and employment, scientific expeditions, hikes, expeditions, competitions "Where? What? When?", various projects are systematically organized at the University.

On the basis of a contract formed with the University, a representation of the world's largest youth student organization AIESEC (AECEC Georgia) is functioning at the University, which is the best international platform for young people. The platform helps the students to discover and develop their own potential and have a positive impact on the society. Within the scope of the agreement, AIESEC-Georgia ensures the involvement of 10 best University students in the international exchange programs.

According to the interview with the students they were satisfied with their extra-curricular activities. They've had the opportunity to participate in and host scientific conferences. Their presentations mostly consisted of retrospective reviews of literature, not their own scientific research or research done with their professors. As for practical skills, they are provided laboratory training, however the mechanisms by which these skills are tested and their sufficiency for the labor market are questionable.

The students have been provided the opportunity to participate in international mobility programs, some of the students reported taking part in ERASMUS+, however they said they were not selected for that particular program. They also actively participate in international students' organizations.

The research opportunities provided for the students were unclear.

Evidences/Indicators

- The documentation proving students participation in extra curricula activities;
- Interviews with students, administrative and academic staff;

Recommendations:

Students should be provided with additional training in laboratory skills (not only demonstrations), they are important for a full and quality medical education. A system should also be put in place to evaluate students' laboratory skills.

The inclusion of students in research projects may be further stimulated though; furthermore, students expressed their interest in it. The introduction of the final thesis would be a good step toward training medical students for future research in the field of medicine.

Suggestions for programme development:**Best Practices (if applicable):**

N/A

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress**Evaluation**

Please mark the checkbox which mostly describes your position related to the programmes compliance with this specific component of the standard

- Complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

3.4 The institution aims to internationalise its teaching and scientific work as well as the employability of its graduates

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

In order to internationalize the program, the University, with the recommendation and request of the Medical Faculty is authorized to invite foreign and/or foreign-language personnel to conduct lectures in foreign languages; One aspect of internationalization is guaranteed through teaching in English.

In addition, the University is focused on the internationalization of the learning process, the academic work and the employment of its graduates. Its priority is to prepare the competitive specialists that meet requirements of the employment markets.

The University has signed Memorandums of Understanding with leading foreign (European) universities, including: Lithuania State University, Warsaw Technological University and others. The students have the opportunity to travel for one or more semesters to these countries under terms and conditions determined by the contract and receive credits within the exchange program.

From 2015, the University is involved in the ERASMUS + exchange program and already 1 University student studied 1 semester at the State University of Lithuania and has undergone academic courses, which has been recognized by LEPL National Center for Quality Management and the University.

In May 2017, a professor from the State University of Lithuania visits the University for 3 weeks within the ERASMUS + Exchange Program and will deliver lectures in English.

In addition, University professors/teachers participate in various international conferences, trainings and seminars annually.

The willingness of the institution to internationalize is evident as it stands. The university already has over 250 international students, mainly from the neighboring country of Azerbaijan. Support mechanisms for these students are in place and functioning. The administration hopes that opening an English language medical program would attract even more international students from different parts of the world. They are also assured that they can provide adequate and quality medical education to these international students. The program is also adapted to comply and mimic the educational programs of European teaching Institutions.

Evidences/Indicators

- Interview with the Administrative staff
- SER;
- Memorandums

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practlees (if applicable):

The university should continue it's strong policy of attracting international students.

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress
Evaluation <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Student achievements and individual work with them	X		

4. Providing teaching resources

4.1 The infrastructure and technical equipment of the institution ensures the achievement of programme learning outcomes
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The capacity of the educational building is satisfactory. The cabinets and auditoria are equipped with computers and projectors / interactive whiteboards; the internet accessibility within the building. ○ The laboratories, however are equipped with only the basic laboratory equipment, with very few modern analyzers and devices. ○ The anatomy classroom and clinical skills laboratory are equipped with moulages and anatomical models and informative posters. ○ In the framework of the program, the university has signed memorandums with various clinical bases: Ltd. National Center of Dermatology and Venereology; Ltd. Medical Center MediMedi; National Institute of Endocrinology and others. However, it would be desirable step to establish international relationships and provide international internships.

- According to SER, the library is equipped with modern educational book fund, computers and e-library, with the latest print books and electronic textbooks uploaded to the University website. The students might have access to additional educational electronic-resources. During site-visit, accreditation team detected that teaching material complies with the materials given in the syllabi. However, book fund might be enriched.
- The University material-technical base is used for the implementation of the program, in particular, library, computers, projectors, as well as educational facilities, clinical skills laboratory, professor's room. The learning process of the educational program is provided with necessary training-methodological materials, namely the Library Funds (book, digital): modern textbooks, internet resources and other information materials.
- All students have possibility to use library funds, the database (OPEN BIBLIO) and the international library network (EBSCOHost - <http://search.epnet.com> (e-magazines and books). The link to the website of the National Parliamentary Library of Georgia is available at the University website: <http://www.nplg.gov.ge/eng/dlibrary2>, international library links: <http://fs.gallup.unm.edu>, [http:// www. . .questia.com / library](http://www. . .questia.com / library), <http://www.gutenberg.org/catalog/>
- It would be preferable to have an electronic platform to put all the teaching resources.
- The University should encourage the students to find national and international internships outside the partner facilities.

Evidences/Indicators

- (1) SER
- (2) Site-visit to THU on Sep.07. 2017.

Recommendations:

- Laboratories (chemical, microbiology, biochemistry) and library fund (e.g. printed books fund) should be improved.

Suggestions for programme development:

- Research/laboratory equipment may be further improved.
- The University should install and develop a comprehensive learning management system and put all the teaching/learning and examination preparation materials, and other formative achievements and results in a comprehensive electronic base, along with the evidence of students' attendance.

- The University should encourage the students to find national and international internships outside the partner facilities.

Best Practices (if applicable):

- The agreements with clinics and other educational institutions provides good conditions for the achievement of learning outcomes.

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

- N/A

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

4.2 Programme staff has necessary competences required for the achievement of intended learning outcomes of the component they teach, which is proved by- in case of academic staff- scientific papers written during the past 10 years (in arts field- creative projects) proving staff's competence in the relevant field; in case of invited staff -may be certified by practical experience

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

- The University academic personnel, as well as the invited personnel are involved in the implementation of the program. They have practical experience of implementing English-language programs and reading lectures/conducting practical exercises and clinical learning in English.
- The persons, involved in the implementation of the program possess competences necessary for the implementation of the relevant components of the program. The competences are established by academic publications published during the last 10 years, also by practical experience in the relevant field.
- Recruitment for the academic positions requires having relevant competent qualifications and is in line with the national and local regulations. The academic positions of the professor, the associated professor or the assistant professors are hold by persons with PhD degrees and the relevant scientific-pedagogical work experience, but

during the interview academic and invited professors could not name the specific criteria for taking their positions.

- Within the framework of existing human resources, the compliance of the individual components and the connection with this course (including proposed learning outcomes) is determined and confirmed by the qualification, the work/scientific-pedagogic experience and the experience in particular specialization. In addition, the content of the published publications is relevant.
- The academic personnel involved in the program systematically strive to raise their professional experience, participate in trainings, national and international conferences and symposia. The University promotes the professional advancement of its academic staff. Although the precise teachers' scientific achievements/publications within last 10 years were not provided within the SER and the additional materials for evaluation, the expert team could collect the necessary data during the site – visit.
- The quality of academic staff and invited teachers' is generally good; they are involved in creation of the syllabi and seem to be very engaged in the development of the program.
- Although the University evaluated here is not a research university, it is nevertheless crucial that the students are provided with the research competencies, since they are essential for the employment and their future careers. Therefore, it is very important that the teachers are periodically evaluated for their research results; the University should set and publicly provide the firm scientific criteria for positions and promotions into the higher teaching positions.
- The University already (partially) supports teachers'/researchers' publications in journals.
- The Study Program should provide a list with the teachers' research areas so the students may become interested and participate in research. Accordingly, the students do not have possibility to be involved in scientific projects, though they are taking part in individual researches of the professors.
- During the interview with the alumni, they expressed their satisfaction with teaching staff quality and student-centered learning methodologies during their studies.

Evidences/indicators

- (1) Interview with academic and invited staff Sep.07. 2017
- (2) Review of the CV
- (3) Program of Medicine of THU.

Recommendations:
Suggestions for programme development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The Study Program should provide a list with the teachers' research areas so the students may become interested and participate in research. ○ The University should set strict criteria for promotions and re-elections in the teaching positions.
Best Practices (if applicable): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ N/A
In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ N/A
Evaluation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

4.3 Programme implementation is ensured by the administrative and support staff of an appropriate competence
Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The competences of the administrative personnel involved in the implementation of undergraduate educational program: (Head of Quality Assurance Service, Librarians, Head of Computer Center, and Faculty Administration) are ensured through the several trainings organized by the University Human Resources section (1). The quality of the administrative staff is assessed twice in semester by the Quality Assurance Service. ○ During the site-visit, the administrative staff involved were well-informed, cooperative and provided all necessary data requested by the experts' team.

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ According to the SER, implementation of the program is facilitated by the competent administrative and support staff. The program will be implemented on the basis of the University's Faculty of Medicine and will serve future foreign students. ○ The University has a clearly and well-established structure and functions of its structural entities ensure the correct and efficient implementation of the educational process. ○ The structure of the Faculty and procedures of the work of the structural units are determined by the Faculty statute. The activities of the University are directed towards the implementation of the University Mission.
<p>Evidences/Indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (1) Interview with administrative staff Sep.07. 2017 (2) Review of the CV (3) Site-visit to THU on Sep.07. 2017.
<p>Recommendations:</p> <p>N/A</p>
<p>Suggestions for programme development:</p> <p>N/A</p>
<p>Best Practices (If applicable):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ N/A
<p>In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ N/A
<p>Evaluation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Partially complies with requirements <input type="checkbox"/> Does not comply with requirements

4.4 Teaching materials are based on the core achievements in the field and ensure the achievement of intended learning outcomes

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

Materials needed for teaching/learning process are available for the students at the library book fund, electronic and internet resources. However, it is desirable that printed book editions to be new and cover modern research findings.

The university continuously acquires the latest education literature that is available for students and supports deepening of their knowledge and education. Though there should be more copies of the books, and they could be more up-to-date.

The University library fund is filled up with foreign language special textbooks and other scientific literature.

Evidences/Indicators

- (1) SER;
- (2) Site-visit to THU on Sep.07. 2017.

Recommendations:

- N/A

Suggestions for programme development:

- At the University should be more copies of the books, and they could be more up-to-date.

Best Practices (If applicable):

- N/A

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

- N/A

Evaluation

- X Complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

4.5 Programme is financially sustainable

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

Implementation of the program is financed from the income of the University, investments made by its founders and other funds. Considering the number of students planned for admission (around 25 students, mostly from abroad), the tuition fees and the University budget, it was concluded that financial resources are adequate to cover salaries, material-technical equipment, expenditure, social spending necessary for the provision of the Study Program.

Evidences/indicators

- (1) Site-visit to THTU on Sep.07. 2017.
- (2) Accounting documentation

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

Best Practices (If applicable):

- o N/A

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

- o N/A

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Providing teaching resources	X		

5. Teaching quality enhancement opportunities

5.1 There is a publicly available quality assurance system which is based on the "Plan-Do-Check-Act" cycle

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

- The University has developed structured quality assurance system which is based on legislature and regulations and through the PDCA cycle ensures: Introduction of modern methods of learning, teaching and evaluation; preparation of the self-assessment for authorization/accreditation process; monitoring and modification of academic and professional curricula; analysis and assessment of the syllabi prepared by the academic staff; review of Diploma Supplements, self-assessment of the academic staff and etc.
- The students should be further represented in the University management and program development bodies. However, the students take part in the evaluation of the study program they should be involved in the self assessment report writing process.
- The mechanism for students' evaluations of the study program is already established and their results are used for the improvement of the study programs and its elements. The students' participation in evaluations is adequate.

Evidences/Indicators

- (1) SER,
- (2) Site-visit to THU on Sep.07. 2017.

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

- The data on students' representation in Quality Assurance and Management bodies should be better documented.
- The University should produce a publicly available QA Manual,
- The periodic review and constructive alignment of the learning outcomes should be introduced as an important quality assurance method.

Best Practices (if applicable):

- N/A

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

- N/A

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements

Does not comply with requirements

5.2 Internal and external quality assurance results are utilized to improve the achievement of programme learning outcomes

Descriptive summary and analysis of compliance with standard requirements

- This is second external evaluations of this Study Program. Because the university has the same accredited program in Georgian language. The English language Program is just starting. And the set of recommendations issued for Georgian analogue of the program, are taken into consideration while implementing the English one,
- According to the site visit The teachers may change course on their own, the methodology, assessment and learning outcomes with the consideration of recommendations, students' and employers' needs.
- The students' evaluations are already used for improvement of the University Programs.
- The teachers have the freedom to change methodology, assessment and learning outcomes of the courses depending on the students' results and achievements or due to the new research accomplishments in the respected area.
- Quality assurance service used different questionnaires for assessment of the academic staff, invited lecturers, course syllabi and administrative staff. For this purpose, the university created formalized QA manual which describes the mentioned procedures.
It is desirable to involve more structures in the process to ensure the quality of teaching and the product, and make more formalized mechanisms.

Evidences/Indicators

- (3) SER,
- (4) Site-visit to THU on Sep.07. 2017.
- (5) Educational Program Implementation Assessment System
- (6) Regulation of the Quality Assurance Service
- (7) Filled questionnaires
- (8) The University website

Recommendations:

Suggestions for programme development:

- The feedback from the clinics and institution providing practice trainings to the faculty about the students practice and improvement of the study program should be institutionalized.
- The University should form a comprehensive database of all alumni/graduates and follow their careers.

Best Practices (if applicable):

- N/A

In case of accredited programme, significant accomplishments and/or progress

- N/A

Evaluation

- Complies with requirements
- Partially complies with requirements
- Does not comply with requirements

Programme's Compliance with Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
Teaching quality enhancement opportunities	X		

Enclosed Documentation (If Applicable)

HEI's Name: Tbilisi Humanitarian Teaching University

Higher Education Programme Name: Medicine

Number of Pages of the Report: 39

Programme's Compliance with the Standard

Standard	Complies with Requirements	Partially Complies with Requirements	Does not Comply with Requirements
1. Programme objectives are clearly defined and achievable; they are consistent with the mission of the HEI and take into consideration labour market demands	X		
2. Teaching methodology and organization, adequate evaluation of programme mastering	X		
3. Student achievements and individual work with them	X		
4. Providing teaching resources	X		
5. Teaching quality enhancement opportunities	X		
Final Evaluation	X		

Expert Panel Chair's Signature:

Alexander Jorjania

[Signature]

G. Spangol

[Signature]

[Signature]

[Signature]