

Table. Alignment of the Accreditation Standards with Framework for Doctoral Education

№	Accreditation Standards	Framework for Doctoral Education
1.	Educational Programme Objectives, Learning Outcomes and their Compliance with the Programme	
1.1	<p>Programme Objectives</p> <p>Programme objectives consider the specificity of the field of study, level and an educational programme, and define the set of knowledge, skills and competences a programme aims to develop in graduate students. They also illustrate the contribution of the programme to the development of the field and society.</p>	<p>1. Doctoral Educational Programme</p> <p>1.1 Goal and Learning Outcomes</p> <p>Evaluation Criteria</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The goals of the PhD educational programme are focused on the creation of new knowledge and/or development of existing one, promotion of knowledge realization and dissemination through the implementation of original, modern and innovative researches; • The artistic-creative doctoral educational programme is a doctoral educational programme based on performing and/or creative practice, the goal of which is to create an original project of international level with a research component, which clearly shows the independent creative vision of the doctoral student, demonstrates his/her professional field competences and new knowledge obtained as a result of creative research; • The goal of the doctoral program is to promote the preparation of doctoral students for independent research and scientific activities by enhancing research skills, as well as cooperation using interdisciplinary approaches, taking into account the research topic; • The goals of the doctoral educational programme are in line with the implementation strategy of the scientific-research/creative research activities of the HEI/basic educational; <p>Indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Doctoral Education Programme, syllabi; • Implementation strategy/research policy document for the scientific-research/creative research activities of the HEI/basic educational unit; • Papers, creative/performing projects, and defended dissertations published in peer-reviewed journals and received feedbacks on them; • Interview results.
1.2	<p>Programme Learning Outcomes</p> <p>➤ The learning outcomes of the programme are logically related to the programme objectives and the specificity of the field of study.</p> <p>➤ Programme learning outcomes describe knowledge, skills, and/or sense of responsibility and autonomy which students gain upon completion of the programme.</p>	<p>1.1 Goal and Learning Outcomes</p> <p>Evaluation Criteria</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The learning outcomes of the doctoral educational programme are logically related to the goals of the educational programme and correspond to the classifier of the 8th level of qualification; • The results of the doctoral thesis, creative/performing project at the local and/or international level have scientific-research/creative-research significance, are innovative and have practical/theoretical value; <p>Indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Doctoral Education Programme, syllabi; • Papers, creative/performing projects, and defended dissertations published in peer-reviewed journals and received feedbacks on them; • Interview results.
1.3	<p>Evaluation Mechanism of the Programme Learning Outcomes</p> <p>➤ Evaluation mechanisms of the programme learning outcomes are defined. The programme learning outcomes assessment process consists of defining, collecting and analyzing data necessary to</p>	—

	<p>measure learning outcomes.</p> <p>➤ Programme learning outcomes assessment results are utilized for the improvement of the programme.</p>	
1.4	<p>Structure and Content of Educational Programme</p> <p>➤ The programme is designed according to HEI's methodology for planning, designing and developing of educational programmes.</p> <p>➤ The programme structure is consistent and logical.</p> <p>The content and structure ensure the achievement of the programme learning outcomes. The qualification to be awarded is corresponding to the programme content and learning outcomes.</p>	<p>1.2 Contents of Doctoral Educational Programme</p> <p>Evaluation Criteria</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The basis for the development of the doctoral educational programme is the research potential of the higher education institution, the existence of previous scientific-research activity experience in the relevant direction, successful practice and research results; • The doctoral educational programme contributes to the development of scientific-research activities at the HEI and the formation of field-related, scientific collaboration and professional connections; • The contents of the doctoral educational programme, depending on the peculiarities of the study area, ensures the intellectual, social, cultural, economic, technological, industrial and/or other types development of science/field, state and/or society; • The teaching component of the doctoral educational programme contributes to the implementation of the scientific-research component of the doctoral student in an appropriate degree through the development of transferable skills and/or by deepening the knowledge of the doctoral student on current issues/trends in the field. It also provides methodological guidelines for the proper planning and implementation of the research component; • The content of the doctoral educational programme leads to the formation of important innovative approaches, that will contribute to the development of cooperation between scientific fields using interdisciplinary approaches, taking into account the specifics of the research field; • To effectively implement the research component of the doctoral education programme, the HEI has developed: the mechanism for selecting and changing the research topic and implementing/presenting the scientific-research component, which, following the research field/fields of the educational programme and taking into account the interests of the doctoral students, ensures that the scientific-research component is performed by the doctoral student at an appropriate level, taking into account the adherence of academic integrity mechanisms; • The individual research plan of the doctoral student takes into account - research aim, the structure of the doctoral thesis and the estimated schedule/timetable of the research implementation, research methodology and so on. The research plan supports the doctoral student to conduct his/her activities in accordance with the research topic and to complete the doctoral thesis within the time limit established by the law; • The ethical norms of scientific-research activity are adhered to in the HEI, which take into account the local and international standards of research ethics in the relevant field; <p>Indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Doctoral Educational Programme, syllabi; • In the case of an ongoing programme, the indicator of career development of graduates/information at the local and/or international level; • Current and/or planned scientific-research activities/creative/performing activity projects related to the doctoral programme; • Analysis on the implementation of further activities of the doctoral programme graduates;

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Doctoral student's individual scientific research/creative research plan; • Methodology on planning, implementation and presentation of the research component; • Ethical norms and mechanisms of scientific-research activity; • Administrative procedure of the research ethics committee, or other relevant responsible structural unit; • Doctoral thesis defense procedure; • Interview results.
1.5	<p>Academic Course/Subject</p> <p>➤ The content of the academic course / subject and the number of credits ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes defined by this course / subject. The content and the learning outcomes of the academic course/subject of the main field of study ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme.</p> <p>➤ The study materials indicated in the syllabus ensure the achievement of the learning outcomes of the programme.</p>	
2. Methodology and Organization of Teaching, Adequacy of Evaluation of Programme Mastering		
2.1	<p>Programme Admission Preconditions</p> <p>The HEI has relevant, transparent, fair, public and accessible programme admission preconditions and procedures that ensure the engagement of individuals with relevant knowledge and skills in the programme to achieve learning outcomes.</p>	<p>1.3 Admission Requirements of the Programme</p> <p>Evaluation Criteria</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The admission requirements of the doctoral programme are public, they include information on the programme, admission deadlines and documentation to be submitted, as well as information on the research interests of supervisors and support/encouragement mechanisms for studies conducted by doctoral students and other information; • Admission requirements of the doctoral programme takes into consideration an assessment of the applicants' experience and capabilities, required for successful completion of the doctoral programme. • When enrolling in the doctoral education programme, the strategy of the scientific research/creative research activity of the HEI/basic educational unit is also taken into account; • Admission of doctoral students to the doctoral educational programme is ensured on a commission basis; • The HEI defines the rules for determining the composition, activities, and decision-making of the committee involved in the admission process of the doctoral education programme, which ensures the evaluation of the people wishing to be enrolled in the programme - in compliance with the principles of objectivity, fairness, and transparency; • A candidate wishing to enroll in a doctoral educational programme shall submit a research/creative research thesis/project to the Commission in accordance with the rules established by the HEI. A candidate is also required to have a previous paper/publication in the relevant field and/or to participate in scientific-research projects and events and/or to have at least 2 years of work experience in the relevant field. The established requirements should provide an opportunity to evaluate the candidate's research skills; • At the time of admission to the doctoral educational programme, the level of foreign language proficiency is determined. Taking into account the specifics of the field, the person in the programme must have knowledge of the English language at least B2 level or knowledge of one of the other Western European

		<p>foreign languages at least B2 level and English language knowledge at least B1 level;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Admission to the doctoral education programme takes into account the human, financial, and research resources available at the HEI, including the ratio of doctoral supervisors to doctoral students. Also, the results of the analysis on the timely completion of the programme by the doctoral students enrolled will be taken into account by the HEI. <p>Indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Admission procedures for the doctoral educational programme; Mechanisms for confirming foreign language competence established as a prerequisite for enrollment in the educational programme of doctoral students; Information on the research/creative research interests of scientific supervisors; The rule on determining the composition of the committee involved in the admission process of the doctoral education programme, its activities and decision-making; Composition of the committee involved in the admission process of the doctoral educational programme; Number of applications received for the doctoral programme and enrollment rate; supervisors' workload scheme, ratio of doctoral students to supervisors; The results of the analysis on the timely completion of the doctoral educational programme by the doctoral students; Research thesis/draft of the person wishing to be admitted to the doctoral education programme; Website of the HEI; Interview results.
2.2	<p>The Development of Practical, Scientific/Research/ Creative/ Performance and Transferable Skills</p> <p>Programme ensures the development of students' practical, scientific/research/creative/performing and transferable skills and/or their involvement in research projects, in accordance with the programme learning outcomes</p>	-
2.3	<p>Teaching and Learning Methods</p> <p>The programme is implemented by using student-centered teaching and learning methods. Teaching and learning methods correspond to the level of education, course/subject content, student learning outcomes and ensure their achievement.</p>	-
2.4	<p>Student Evaluation</p> <p>Student evaluation is conducted in accordance with the established procedures. It is transparent, reliable and complies with existing legislation.</p>	<p>1.4 Evaluation of a Doctoral Student</p> <p>Evaluation Criteria</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Doctoral students are evaluated according to the procedures established in the HEI, that are transparent, reliable and comply with the current legislation; The teaching component of the doctoral programme curriculum is assessed with the methods appropriate to the content of the teaching component and the requirements of the doctoral degree, which provides assessment of the student's knowledge and skills, including analytical and critical thinking, selection and

		<p>independent application of research methodology, substantiated expression of an opinion, and other skills;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The doctoral education programme provides the requirements for admission of a doctoral student to the defense of a dissertation/creative/performing work, or other research project/paper. This envisages periodic formative assessments of the student's progress; • Before submitting the dissertation/creative/performance work for the academic degree, the doctoral student is required to publish at least two scientific articles from the relevant research field, one of which must be published in a peer-reviewed journal with a foreign international index. • The supervisor periodically monitors the progress of consistent performance of a research component by the doctoral student, provides formative assessment, and feedback. • Requirements of the academic style of the doctoral thesis, methods and criteria for evaluating the doctoral thesis, which take into account the specifics of the field, are known in advance to the doctoral students and are taken into account during the evaluation of the doctoral theses. • While evaluating the scientific-research component, HEI uses the mechanisms of academic and research ethics, academic integrity, plagiarism prevention, detection and response mechanisms; • The defense of doctoral theses is performed in accordance with the HEI procedures of evaluation and defense of a doctoral thesis which is in compliance of the current legislation. • The evaluation of the doctoral thesis is carried out in a commission manner - by the commission/commissions; • The procedures for the evaluation and/or defense of the doctoral thesis provide for the conclusions of the competent institution (local and/or foreign university, scientific-research institute), local and international reviewer (the conclusion of the international reviewer is not mandatory for the following fields of study: Georgian philology, Abkhazian philology, also, if the doctoral candidate has an international supervisor), who evaluates the novelty of the scientific research/creative work of the dissertation and readiness for the defense of the dissertation; • A local reviewer is a staff member of a local university, scientific-research institute/center, or a person with emeritus status, who is equipped with the latest knowledge in the field, has actively participated in scientific research, and has published at least 1 scientific work (in artistic directions - creative/performance project) in a peer-reviewed journal with a foreign international index within the last 3 years. This work corresponds to the general topic/field of research of the doctoral student's doctoral work; • An international reviewer is a staff member of a foreign university, scientific-research institute/center, or a person with emeritus status, who is equipped with the latest knowledge in the field, has actively participated in scientific research, and has published at least 1 scientific work (in artistic directions - creative/performance project) in a peer-reviewed journal with a foreign international index within the last 3 years. This work corresponds to the general topic/field of research of the doctoral student's doctoral work; • Mechanisms and processes for the selection and appointment of doctoral thesis reviewers by the university should be transparent, impartial, and objective. When selecting reviewers, their anonymity¹ should be ensured, which contributes to the preparation of an unbiased, fair and objective conclusion; • The defense commission(s) consists of representatives of academic/scientific staff from the relevant field, whose competence allows for in-depth and thorough
--	--	--

¹ Anonymity refers to the confidentiality of the reviewer's identity for the doctoral student and/or his/her supervisor/co-supervisor until the review is made known.

		<p>evaluation of the paper and the originality of the research/creative research and its results;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participation of external evaluators is ensured in the composition of the defense commission(s); The supervisor/co-supervisor of the doctoral student does not participate in the work of the defense commission(s); • Considering the specifics of the field, the defense commission(s) includes (if necessary) an international evaluator(s) with relevant qualification and competence, and a representative(s) of the governmental/non-governmental sector and the labor market; • Defense of doctoral thesis is public and open; The abstract/summary of the doctoral thesis in Georgian, English and the languages of the programme implementation is public and available to everyone; • The doctoral educational programme provides the appeal of evaluation results of the doctoral students' enrollment to the programme as well as procedures of dissertation defense. The rules of appeal are publicly available in advance and ensure that an objective and fair decision is made; • Mechanisms for searching, and appointing reviewer and determining his/her activities are ensured by HEI; • Information about the topics of current theses and defended theses are published by the HEI on a unified electronic portal.² <p>Indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Doctoral Educational Programme, syllabi; • Regulatory document of evaluation system; • Mechanism on plagiarism prevention, detection and response; • Procedures of dissertation defense and evaluation; • Documents reflecting the progress of the doctoral student's scientific-research component; • The rule on determining the composition of the defense commission(s); • Composition of the defense commission(s); • Sheets/protocols of dissertation defenses; • Website of the HEI; • Interview results.
3.	Student Achievements and Individual Work with Them	
3.1	<p>Student Consulting and Support Services</p> <p>Students receive consultation and support regarding planning of the learning process, improvement of academic achievement, and career development from the people involved in the programme and/or structural units of the HEI. A student has an opportunity to have a diverse learning process and receive relevant information and recommendations from those involved in the programme.</p>	<p>2. Support Mechanisms and Supervision of Doctoral Students</p> <p>2.1 Support Services of Doctoral Students</p> <p>Evaluation Criteria</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Taking into account the specifics of the field, within the framework of the doctoral programme, the HEI cooperates with local and international scientific research institutes/centers/HEIs, doctoral schools, public and private sector/industry and other potential employers to implement a scientific- research component, to integrate graduates into the labour market and promote their career advancement; • The higher education institution creates appropriate conditions and environment for the doctoral educational programme to encourage international mobility and/or participation in international conferences, seminars and other scientific/creative activities, which aims to develop a strong and inclusive research environment and promotes the formation of best research practices, internationalization of the research, and implementation of joint research projects. • HEI provides doctoral students with additional support mechanisms in the form of extra-curricular events and activities aimed at the doctoral student's personal, professional and career development;

² The mentioned obligation for the HEI will come into function after the implementation of the unified national electronic portal.

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Within the framework of the doctoral educational programme, the higher education institution has developed supporting measures for doctoral students, which allows the doctoral student to complete the doctoral thesis within the timeframe established by the law; • HEI provides indicative information to the doctoral student about scientific publications/databases with an international index corresponding to the specificity of the field for the publication of an international scientific publication; in the artistic field it provides information about artistic and creative events (concert, festival, competition, master class, exhibition, biennial and others); • HEI periodically analyzes the indicators of career development of the graduates of the doctoral educational programme, the results of which are aimed at the development of the programme, resources and supporting mechanisms for doctoral students; • HEI provides doctoral students with information about support services. <p>Indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Internationalization policy of the HEI/basic educational unit and/or its structural unit/programme; • Research/projects conducted in cooperation with scientific-research institutes, centers, HEIs, and relevant agreements/documents; • Information about the involvement in international projects/performing/creative activities, as well as participation in international mobility and/or international conferences, seminars and other scientific activities; • Extra-curricular activities offered to doctoral students; • Employment and career development index and analysis document for doctoral programme graduates; • Website of the HEI; • Interview results.
3.2	<p>Master's and Doctoral Student Supervision</p> <p>A scientific supervisor provides proper support to master's and doctorate students to perform the scientific-research component successfully. Within master's and doctoral programmes, ratio of students and supervisors enables to perform scientific supervision properly.</p>	<p>2.2 Supervision of a Doctoral Student's Scientific-Research Work</p> <p>Evaluation Criteria</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The supervisor coordinates the performance of the scientific-research component of the doctoral student; • The HEI has developed the documents regulating the appointment and change of supervisor/co-supervisor of the doctoral student and implementation of supervision/co-supervision; • The HEI has developed a sample of agreement/contract to be signed between the doctoral student, his/her supervisor/co-supervisor and the HEI, which defines the rights and responsibilities of all parties; The supervision of the doctoral student is included in the overall university workload of the relevant academic/scientific staff; • The terms of the agreement/contract facilitate the effective implementation of the activities by the supervisor/co-supervisor and the completion of the thesis by the doctoral student within the timeframes; • During the research process the supervisor has regular consultations with doctoral students on methodological, structural, conceptual and other issues related to the research/creative research. The frequency of the consultations corresponds to the specifics of the research topic and the individual needs of the doctoral student. A supervisor provides consultations over the following topics during the research: research design and project management, research methodology, professional development, the process of writing a thesis/scientific-research work/dissertation, integration process within the local and international scientific/creative network, the processes of participation in

		<p>local and international scientific/creative events and presentation of the results; publication of scientific articles in peer-reviewed journals, etc.;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Co-supervisor (if any) supports the doctoral student in the implementation of the scientific-research component through the mutual agreement with the supervisor and the doctoral student; • Taking into account the specifics and needs of the research, the university promotes the involvement of the staff of a foreign university, scientific-research institute/center, or a person with emeritus status including a compatriot person living abroad, as a supervisor/co-supervisor in the research/creative research process of the doctoral candidate; • To ensure the doctoral programme sustainability, the HEI, when planning the number of the doctoral thesis supervisors, considers the workload of the supervisors, the amount of existing and future doctoral students, specifics of the programme and best international practices; • HEI has developed a methodology for the ratio of the doctoral thesis supervisors to doctoral students in the doctoral educational programme, thus ensuring the effective implementation of the supervision; • The ratio determined by the HEI between the supervisor and his/her active doctoral students does not exceed - 1:3, within the framework of one higher education institution; A ratio of 1:5 between the supervisor and his doctoral students with active status is allowed if a suspended doctoral student requires reinstatement of status to submit a thesis/creative/performance work to be awarded an academic degree. The mentioned ratio can be determined differently depending on the conditions of the scientific grant/project; • The HEI has developed mechanisms for evaluating the activities of the supervisor/co-supervisor of the doctoral thesis, which ensures the effective implementation of the supervision/co-supervision; <p>Indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A sample of labor agreement/contract of supervisors and co-supervisors; • Document defining the appointment, change and rights/responsibilities of the supervisor/co-supervisor; • Sample of the trilateral agreement/contract between HEI, supervisor/co-supervisor and doctoral student; • Methodology for determining the ratio between the supervisors and doctoral students in a doctoral education programme; • Ratio of supervisors to doctoral students with active status; • Doctoral thesis defense rate for the last 5 years in the doctoral education programme; • Rate of the studies completion by doctoral students; the results of the evaluation carried out; • Public information about the research interests and publications/participation in performing-creative projects of the supervisors; • Supervisor performance evaluation document/documents; • Interview results.
4	Providing Teaching Resources	
4.1	<p>Human Resources</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Programme staff consists of qualified persons, who have necessary competences in order to help students to achieve the programme learning outcomes. ➤ The number and workload of programme academic/scientific and invited staff ensures the sustainable running of the 	<p>3. Resources</p> <p>3.1 Staff of Doctoral Educational Programme</p> <p>Evaluation Criteria</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The doctoral education programme involves at least 5 affiliated academic staff of the relevant field, including at least 3 professors/associate professors. If available, the institution should involve scientific staff in the programme implementation; • The qualification of the academic/research staff of the doctoral educational programme is confirmed by a scientific paper published in the peer-reviewed journals with the international index during the last 3 years and/or a

	<p>educational process and also, proper execution of their research/creative/performance activities and other assigned duties. Quantitative indicators related to academic/scientific/invited staff ensure programme sustainability.</p> <p>➤ The Head of the Programme possesses necessary knowledge and experience required for programme elaboration, and also the appropriate competences in the field of study of the programme. He/she is personally involved in programme implementation.</p> <p>➤ Programme students are provided with an adequate number of administrative and support staff with relevant competence.</p>	<p>practical/creative/performing project, which confirms his/her competence in the relevant field;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • HEI promotes the participation of foreign university, scientific-research institute/center staff, or a person with emeritus status in the process of implementing the doctoral educational programme; • The director of the doctoral programme has the necessary knowledge and experience for the design and development of the programme, as well as the appropriate competence in the field of study of the programme. He/she is directly involved in the implementation of the programme and is the affiliated academic and/or scientific staff of the institution; <p>Indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Personal files of the staff, publications; documents proving involvement in practical/creative /performing projects; competition materials; • Functions of the programme director; • Interview results.
4.2	<p>Qualification of Supervisors of Master's and Doctoral Student</p> <p>Master's and Doctoral students have qualified supervisor/ supervisors and, if necessary, cosupervisor/ co-supervisors who have relevant scientific-research experience in the field of study.</p>	<p>3.2 Qualification of Scientific Supervisors</p> <p>Evaluation Criteria</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • HEI has developed qualification requirements for scientific supervisor/co-supervisor, which respond to the specifics of the programme and international best practice; • Due to the specifics and development of the field, the scientific supervisor of each doctoral student is equipped with the latest knowledge, has the academic degree in the relevant field, has experience • of supervision/co-supervision, or has completed a relevant activity (training, seminar, professional development course, etc.), as well as actively participated in scientific research and/or has published a scientific work (in the field of art - creative/performing project) which corresponds to the general topic/research field of the doctoral thesis; • Due to the specifics and development of the field, the doctoral student's supervisor has published at least 1 scientific paper (in the field of arts - creative/performing project) in the foreign peer-reviewed journal with the international index defined by the HEI during the last 3 years, and this paper corresponds to the general topic/research field of the doctoral student's doctoral thesis; • The supervisor of the doctoral student, as well as in the case of several supervisors, one of the supervisors, is an academic (professor, associate professor) and/or scientific staff of the HEI with doctoral degree or equivalent to the doctoral degree. The requirement in the section on holding an academic position does not apply to an international supervisor/co-supervisor; • The doctoral student's supervisor has professional connection with the local and international scientific/artistic community (joint researches/grants/projects, scientific associations/unions/educational/scientific institutions); • The qualification requirements of the co-supervisor correspond to the topic/research field of the doctoral student's doctoral thesis; • HEI periodically provides the doctoral thesis supervisor with such activities (training, seminar, workshop, etc.) that facilitate the effective implementation of supervision;

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • HEI has developed mechanisms to encourage doctoral students' supervisors in the doctoral education programme; <p>Indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Document reflecting the qualification requirements of the supervisors/co-supervisors; • Supervisors workload scheme and individual load rate; • Supervisors-doctoral students ratio; • Personal files of supervisors and co-supervisors and documents on conducted scientific researches/performing-creative projects; • Documents reflecting the professional development activities of doctoral thesis supervisors (training, colloquium, workshop, etc.); • Mechanisms of encouraging supervisors; • Interview results.
4.3	<p>Professional Development of Academic, Scientific and Invited Staff</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ The HEI conducts the evaluation of programme staff and analyzes evaluation results on a regular basis. ➤ The HEI fosters professional development of the academic, scientific and invited staff. Moreover, it fosters their scientific and research work. 	-
4.4	<p>Material Resources</p> <p>Programme is provided with necessary infrastructure, information resources relevant to the field of study and technical equipment required for achieving programme learning outcomes.</p>	<p>3.4 Material Resources</p> <p>Evaluation Criteria</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The doctoral education programme is equipped with the necessary research and artistic-creative infrastructure and technical equipment (scientific laboratory, computer resource, information resource, digital resource, individual working spaces for doctoral students, etc.), which are necessary for the implementation of the educational and scientific-research components of the educational programme and for the achievement of the learning outcomes; • Library book fund, latest scientific periodicals, international electronic library bases both from the university territory and from any other location are available for doctoral students, which allow them to have access and get to know the scientific resources of the relevant research field to achieve the learning outcomes of the programme; • In order to implement the scientific-research component, the HEI promotes the sharing of scientific- research infrastructure both within the institution and among other higher educational and scientific institutions outside it; • HEI constantly takes care of the renewal and development of scientific-research/creative research infrastructure. <p>Indicators:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Scientific-research infrastructure, material, information and digital resources; • Library resources; • Access to international electronic library databases and rate of their use; • Practice of sharing research resources; • Material resource renewal rates; • Interview results.

4.5	<p>Programme/Faculty/School Budget and Programme Financial Sustainability</p> <p>The allocation of financial resources stipulated in programme/faculty/school budget is economically feasible and corresponds to programme needs.</p>	<p>3.3 Financing of Doctoral Educational Programme</p> <p>Evaluation Criteria</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The budget of the HEI/faculty/school/programme provides support and funding mechanisms to the doctoral students for implementation of the teaching and research components of the doctoral education programme. • The budget of the HEI/faculty/school/programme provides sources/mechanisms of financial support to facilitate the implementation of research by academic and/or research staff, including funding for • publishing scientific articles in peer-reviewed journals with international index, for participation in scientific conferences, research trips and research/creative projects, for publication monographs and other research, creative/performing activities; • The budget of the HEI/faculty/school/programme for the effective implementation of the doctoral education programme envisages the development of scientific-research/artistic infrastructure; • The HEI facilitates the search for external funding sources for targeted research within the doctoral education programme. <p>Indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funding sources for the doctoral educational programme; • Funding for the implementation of scientific researches and/or creative/performing projects; • The dynamic of funding allocated in the budget for research, development and creative/performing activities in the doctoral education programme during the last 5 years; • Sources of external funding attracted for the doctoral education programme and conducted researches/activities/projects; • Interview results.
5	5. Teaching Quality Enhancement Opportunities	
5.1	<p>Internal Quality Evaluation</p> <p>Programme staff collaborates with internal quality assurance service(s)/staff available at the HEI when planning the process of programme quality assurance, creating assessment instruments, and analyzing assessment results. Programme staff utilizes quality assurance results for programme improvement.</p>	<p>4. Quality Assurance</p> <p>4.1 Internal and External Quality Assurance</p> <p>Evaluation Criteria</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Internal quality assurance mechanisms of the doctoral educational programme include the evaluation of the scientific-research component, resources, and support mechanisms of the doctoral student. Evaluation results are applied for the improvement of the HEI's activities and the doctoral programme. • The activities of the staff implementing the teaching and scientific components of the programme, including the supervisor/co-supervisor of the doctoral thesis are evaluated within the framework of the monitoring of the doctoral educational programme and the evaluation results are used to improve the staff performance; • The doctoral education programme regularly uses formative peer review to improve the doctoral programme and the research environment; • In order to develop a doctoral programme, all the interested parties (doctoral student, graduate, staff, doctoral student's supervisor, co-supervisor, employer, etc.) are involved in the evaluation of the doctoral programme implementation. <p>Indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tools for assessment and development of scientific research activities, resources, and research environment at the doctoral programme and the use of these tools to improve the programme, measures taken as a result of the analysis; • Indicators of completion/non-completion of the programme within the timeframe established by legislation and their analysis; • Assessment results of supervision/co-supervision, reports; • Formative peer review and measures taken as a result of the evaluation;

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Interview results.
5.2	<p>External Quality Evaluation</p> <p>Programme utilizes the results of external quality assurance on a regular basis.</p>	-
5.3	<p>Programme Monitoring and Periodic Review</p> <p>Programme monitoring and periodic evaluation is conducted with the involvement of academic, scientific, invited, administrative, supporting staff, students, graduates, employers and other stakeholders through systematically collecting and analyzing information. Evaluation results are applied for the programme improvement.</p>	-